

STATE OF NEW YORK
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH

REQUEST: June 5, 2018

AGENCY: MAP
FH #: 7769318Y

In the Matter of the Appeal of	:
	: DECISION
	AFTER
	: FAIR
	HEARING
from a determination by the New York City	:
Department of Social Services	:

JURISDICTION

Pursuant to Section 22 of the New York State Social Services Law (hereinafter Social Services Law) and Part 358 of Title 18 NYCRR, (hereinafter Regulations), a fair hearing was held on July 3, 2018, in New York City, before an Administrative Law Judge. The following persons appeared at the hearing:

For the Appellant



For the Plan (Centers Plan For Healthy Living DBA Advantage Home Care)

Agency appearance waived by the Office of Administrative Hearings

ISSUE

Was the Appellant's Managed Long Term Care Plan's, Centers Plan For Healthy Living's, determination to partially deny the Appellant's request for an increase in Personal Care Services (CDPAP) from 5 hours daily, 7 days per week (35 hours weekly) to 7 hours daily, 7 days per week (49 hours weekly), correct?

FINDINGS OF FACT

An opportunity to be heard having been afforded to all interested parties and evidence having been taken and due deliberation having been had, it is hereby found that:

1. The Appellant (age eighty), has been in receipt of Medical Assistance benefits through a Managed Long Term Care ("MLTC") health care plan ("the Plan") Centers Plan For Healthy Living DBA Advantage Home Care.

2. From April 1, 2018 to May 31, 2018 the Appellant had received CDPAP hours 4 hours daily, 7 days per week (28 hours weekly).

3. On May 15, 2018 the Plan conducted a new Uniform Assessment System (UAS) which was finalized on May 15, 2018. The May 15, 2018 assessment found some small changes in level of ADL performance but only deemed the changes sufficiently medically necessary to increase Personal Care Service hours from the 4 hours daily, 7 days per week (28 hours weekly) to 4.5 hours daily, 7 days per week (31.5 hours weekly).

4. On May 17, 2018 the Appellant via his Representative requested an increase in CDPAP Personal Care Services from 4 hours daily, 7 days per week (28 hours weekly) to 7 hours daily, 7 days per week (49 hours weekly).

5. By Initial Adverse Determination dated May 24, 2018 the Plan partially denied the Appellant's request for an increase in Personal Care Services:

"On 05/22/2018, Centers Plan for Healthy Living decided to partially approve this service based on the NYS Department of Health Uniform Assessment System (UAS-NY) and the plan's tasking tool."

"A comprehensive NYS Department of Health Uniform Assessment System (UAS-NY) was conducted on 05/15/18. A comparison of the UAS-NY assessments completed on November 16, 2017 and 05/15/2018 showed that you have demonstrated some changes in your abilities to perform your Activities of Daily Living (ADL's) and Instrumental Activities of Daily Living (IADL's). The UAS-NY assessment produces a Nursing Facility Level of Care (NFLOC) Score. Your NFLOC scores changed from 18 on 11/16/2017 to 20 on 05/15/2018."

"You have been receiving CDPAS services four (4) hours per day, seven (7) days per week (totaling twenty-eight (28) hours per week). You requested to increase your PCA services to seven (7) hours per day, seven days per week (totaling forty-nine (49) hours per week). The NYS Department of Health Uniform Assessment system (UAS-NY) conducted on 05/15/2018 and the plan's client tasking tool showed that you need CDPAS services four and one half (4.5) hours per day, seven days (7) days per week (totaling thirty-one and one half (31.5) hours per week). Based on the nursing assessment on March 2, 2018, an increase in hours is not necessary for you. There is no change in your condition. You do not need more hours for personal care. Companionship is not a covered benefit of the Medicaid Managed Long Term Care program. Your request for an increase in hours is denied. Your hours will remain at 84 hours per week. The new authorization period is starting on 3/01/2018 and ending on 8/31/2018. The next review date will be no later than 08/30/18."

"Therefore, your CDPAP services will be increased to four and one half (4.5) hours per day, seven (7) days per week, (totaling thirty-one and one half (31.5) hours per week).

This is a sufficient amount of time to complete the above-mentioned tasks and adequately meet your needs.”

“Your services will be reassessed in November 2018 or earlier if any significant changes reported.”

6. On May 29, 2018 the Appellant appealed the Plan’s May 24, 2018 determination.

7. By Final Adverse Determination Denial Notice dated June 24, 2018 the Plan advised the Appellant that the Plan had changed its decision and will partially grant the increase request.

“You were receiving CDPAP 28 hours per week and requested 49 hours per week. On May 24, 2018 you were partially approved for 31.5 hours per week. On May 29, 2018, you appealed the decision.

On June 1, 2018, we decided we are changing our decision and will partially approve your request.

From 5/25/2018 to 11/30/2018, the plan approved: CDPAP: 4.5 hours/day, 7 days per week, a total of 31.5 hours per week.

On 5/29/2018 you or your provider requested approval for: CDPAP: 7 hours/day, 7 days per week, a total of 49 hours per week.

On 5/24/18 the plan approved CDPAP:4.5 hours/day, 7 days per week, a total of 31.5 hours per week.

On 6/4/18, the plan approved changes to: CDPAP:5 hours/day, 7 days per week, a total of 35 hours per week from 6/4/2018 to 11/30/2018.”

8. The Plan’s change, was explained by the Plan in pertinent part as follows:

“The Medical Director on behalf of Centers Plan for Healthy Living decided to partially approve this service because the service is medically necessary.”

“The New York State Uniform Assessment (UAS-NY) of May 15, 2018 was reviewed and compared with that of November 16, 2017. The following was noted: You 1) continue to require to require maximal assistance for shopping, meal preparation, and housework; 2) Locomotion and walking declined from limited assistance to extensive assistance. Your ability to complete a four meter walk on your own declined from 17 seconds to not at all. As per the May 15, 2018 evaluation, you were able to ambulate 15-149 feet using a cane with assistance; 3) continue to require extensive assistance for toilet transfers, bathing, finances, stairs and dressing lower body; 4) continue to require limited assistance for toilet use, hygiene, dressing upper body, eating and bed mobility; 5) remain independent for phone use; 5) remain alert and oriented to person, place, and time without significant cognitive, communication, or mood disturbance; 6) your bladder declined from continent to occasionally incontinent. You remain continent of bowel; 7) You had one fall in March 2018 for which were evaluated in the Emergency Room. No injuries were found, and you were given medication for the dizziness.”

“Based upon review of the record, will partially rescind denial. Will authorize 5 hours of CDPAP services/7 days per week. Seven hours of CDPAP services/7 days per week, are not medically necessary.”

9. On June 5, 2018 the Appellant requested this fair hearing.

APPLICABLE LAW

Section 365-f of the Social Services Law pertains to the Consumer Directed Personal Assistance Program ("CDPAP") and provides:

1. Purpose and intent. The consumer directed personal assistance program is intended to permit chronically ill and/or physically disabled individuals receiving home care services under the medical assistance program greater flexibility and freedom of choice in obtaining such services. The department shall, upon request of a social services district or group of districts, provide technical assistance and such other assistance as may be necessary to assist such districts in assuring access to the program.

2. Eligibility. All eligible individuals receiving home care shall be provided notice of the availability of the program and shall have the opportunity to apply for participation in the program. On or before October first, nineteen hundred ninety-six each social services district shall file an implementation plan with the commissioner of the department of health. An "eligible individual", for purposes of this section is a person who:

(a) is eligible for long term care and services provided by a certified home health agency, long term home health care program or AIDS home care program authorized pursuant to article thirty-six of the public health law, or is eligible for personal care services provided pursuant to this article;

(b) is eligible for medical assistance;

(c) has been determined by the social services district, pursuant to an assessment of the person's appropriateness for the program, conducted with an appropriate long term home health care program, a certified home health agency, or an AIDS home care program or pursuant to the personal care program, as being in need of home care services or private duty nursing and is able and willing or has a legal guardian able and willing to make informed choices, or has designated a relative or other adult who is able and willing to assist in making informed choices, as to the type and quality of services, including but not limited to such services as nursing care, personal care, transportation and respite services; and

(d) meets such other criteria, as may be established by the commissioner, which are necessary to effectively implement the objectives of this section.

3. Division of responsibilities. Eligible individuals who elect to participate in the program assume the responsibility for services under such program as mutually agreed to by the eligible individual and provider and as documented in the eligible individual's record. Such individuals shall be assisted as appropriate with service coverage, supervision, advocacy and management. Providers shall not be liable for fulfillment of responsibilities agreed to be undertaken by the eligible individual. This subdivision, however, shall not diminish the participating provider's liability for failure to exercise reasonable care in properly carrying out its responsibilities under this program, which shall include monitoring such individual's continuing ability to fulfill those

FH# 7769318Y

responsibilities documented in his or her records. Failure of the individual to carry out his or her agreed to responsibilities may be considered in determining such individual's continued appropriateness for the program....

Local Commissioners Memorandum 95 LCM-102 pertains to the Consumer Directed Personal Assistance Program (CDPAP) and, states in part:

Section 91 of Chapter 81 of the Laws of 1995 added a new Section 367-f to the Social Services Law. This Section states that "...each local district shall ensure access to a consumer directed personal assistance program operated pursuant to section three hundred sixty-five-f of this title is available in the district to allow persons receiving home care pursuant to this title to directly arrange and pay for such care."

The purpose of CDPAP is to allow chronically ill and/or physically disabled individuals receiving home care services under the Medical Assistance program greater flexibility and freedom of choice in obtaining such services while reducing administrative costs....

Eligible individuals who elect to participate in CDPAP assume the responsibility for services under the program as mutually agreed to by the eligible individual and the provider as documented in the individual's record. Such responsibilities may include:

1. Recruit workers
2. Hire workers
3. Train workers
4. Supervise workers
5. Fire workers
6. Arrange for back-up coverage when necessary
7. Arrange/coordinate provision of other services
8. Maintain records for processing of payroll and benefits.

Providers shall not be liable for fulfillment of responsibilities agreed to be undertaken by individuals participating in CDPAP. This does not, however, diminish the provider's liability for failure to exercise reasonable care in properly carrying out its responsibilities under this program. Such responsibilities include monitoring the individual's continuing ability to fulfill those responsibilities documented in his or her record. An individual's failure to carry out the agreed responsibilities may be considered in determining that person's continued appropriateness for the program.

The New York State Department of Health released a statement entitled "Policy for the Transition of Consumer Directed Personal Assistance Services into Managed Care." This announces, in part, the CDPAP is to be covered by Managed Care Plans and MLTC Plans commencing November 1, 2012.

MLTC Policy 16.02: Chapter 511 of the Laws of 2015 Amends the Consumer Directed Personal Assistance Service (CDPAS), March 29, 2016, clarifies that:

1. The new law prohibits persons from being hired as CDPAS personal assistants if they are legally responsible for the eligible individual's care and support. This means that an adult who is not legally responsible for the eligible individual's care and support may be a CDPAS personal assistant for that eligible individual. In particular, this means that a parent of an adult child (21 years of age or older) may serve as that adult child's

CDPAS personal assistant. Parents of children who are younger than 21 cannot be hired as that minor child's CDPAS personal assistant. Consistent with current regulations, spouses and designated representatives also cannot be hired as CDPAS personal assistants.

2. Any other adult relative of the CDPAS eligible individual may serve as the individual's CDPAS personal assistant. In all cases, the CDPAS authorization is based on the eligible individual's assessed needs. This applies regardless of whether the CDPAS personal assistant is a parent or other adult relative of the individual or not related to the individual.

18 NYCRR 505.14(g) provides, in part:

Case management.

(1) All patients receiving personal care services must be provided with case management services according to this subdivision...

(3) Case management includes the following activities... arranging for the delivery of personal care services according to subdivision (c) of this section.... monitoring personal care services to ensure that such services are provided according to the authorization and that the patient's needs are appropriately met...

Part 438 of 42 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) pertains to provision of Medicaid medical care, services and supplies through Managed Care Organizations (MCOs), Prepaid Inpatient Health Plans (PIHPs), Prepaid Ambulatory Health Plans (PAHPs) and Primary Care Case Managers (PCCMs), and the requirements for contracts for services so provided.

Section 438.210 of 42 CFR Subpart D provides, in pertinent part:

(a) Coverage - Each contract with an MCO, PIHP, or PAHP must do the following:

(1) Identify, define, and specify the amount, duration, and scope of each service that the MCO, PIHP, or PAHP is required to offer.

(2) Require that the services identified in paragraph (a)(1) of this section be furnished in an amount, duration, and scope that is no less than the amount, duration, and scope for the same services furnished to beneficiaries under fee-for-service Medicaid, as set forth in Sec. 440.230.

(3) Provide that the MCO, PIHP, or PAHP--

(i) Must ensure that the services are sufficient in amount, duration, or scope to reasonably be expected to achieve the purpose for which the services are furnished.

(ii) May not arbitrarily deny or reduce the amount, duration, or scope of a required service solely because of diagnosis, type of illness, or condition of the beneficiary;

(iii) May place appropriate limits on a service

(A) On the basis of criteria applied under the State plan, such as medical necessity; or

FH# 7769318Y

(B) For the purpose of utilization control, provided the services furnished can reasonably be expected to achieve their purpose, as required in paragraph (a)(3)(i) of this section; and

FH# 7769318Y

- (4) Specify what constitutes “medically necessary services” in a manner that:
- (i) Is no more restrictive than that used in the State Medicaid program as indicated in State statutes and regulations, the State Plan, and other State policy and procedures; and
 - (ii) Addresses the extent to which the MCO, PIHP, or PAHP is responsible for covering services related to the following:
 - (A) The prevention, diagnosis, and treatment of health impairments.
 - (B) The ability to achieve age-appropriate growth and development.
 - (C) The ability to attain, maintain, or regain functional capacity.
- (b) Authorization of services. For the processing of requests for initial and continuing authorizations of services, each contract must require:
- (1) That the MCO, PIHP, or PAHP and its subcontractors have in place, and follow, written policies and procedures.
 - (2) That the MCO, PIHP, or PAHP:
 - (i) Have in effect mechanisms to ensure consistent application of review criteria for authorization decisions; and
 - (ii) Consult with the requesting provider when appropriate.
 - (3) That any decision to deny a service authorization request or to authorize a service in an amount, duration, or scope that is less than requested, be made by a health care professional who has appropriate clinical expertise in treating the enrollee's condition or disease....

Section 438.236 of 42 CFR Subpart D provides, in pertinent part:

- (a) Basic rule: The State must ensure, through its contracts, that each MCO and, when applicable, each PIHP and PAHP meets the requirements of this section.
- (b) Adoption of practice guidelines. Each MCO and, when applicable, each PIHP and PAHP adopts practice guidelines that meet the following requirements:
 - (1) Are based on valid and reliable clinical evidence or a consensus of health care professionals in the particular field.
 - (2) Consider the needs of the MCO's, PIHP's, or PAHP's enrollees.
 - (3) Are adopted in consultation with contracting health care professionals.
 - (4) Are reviewed and updated periodically as appropriate.
- (c) Dissemination of guidelines. Each MCO, PIHP, and PAHP disseminates the guidelines to all affected providers and, upon request, to enrollees and potential enrollees.
- (d) Application of guidelines. Decisions for utilization management, enrollee education, coverage of services, and other areas to which the guidelines apply are consistent with the guidelines.

Section 438.400 of 42 CFR Subpart F provides in part:

FH# 7769318Y

(a) Statutory basis. This subpart is based on sections 1902(a)(3), 1902(a)(4), and 1932(b)(4) of the Act.

(1) Section 1902(a)(3) requires that a State plan provide an opportunity for a fair hearing to any person whose claim for assistance is denied or not acted upon promptly.

(2) Section 1902(a)(4) requires that the State plan provide for methods of administration that the Secretary finds necessary for the proper and efficient operation of the plan.

(3) Section 1932(b)(4) requires Medicaid managed care organizations to establish internal grievance procedures under which Medicaid enrollees, or providers acting on their behalf, may challenge the denial of coverage of, or payment for, medical assistance.

(b) Definitions. As used in this subpart, the following terms have the indicated meanings:

In the case of an MCO or PIHP-“Action” means--

(1) The denial or limited authorization of a requested service, including the type or level of service;

(2) The reduction, suspension, or termination of a previously authorized service;

(3) The denial, in whole or in part, of payment for a service...

Section 438.402 of 42 CFR Subpart F provides in part:

The grievance system. Each MCO [Managed Care Organization] and PIHP [Prepaid Inpatient Health Plan] must have a system in place, for enrollees, that includes a grievance process, an appeal process, and access to the State's fair hearing system...

Section 505.14(a)(1) of the Regulations defines "Personal Care Services" to mean some or total assistance with personal hygiene, dressing and feeding and nutritional and environmental support functions. Such services must be essential to the maintenance of the patient's health and safety in his or her own home..."

Section 505.14(a) of the Regulations provides in part that:

(2) Some or total assistance shall be defined as follows:

(i) Some assistance shall mean that a specific function or task is performed and completed by the patient with help from another individual.

(ii) Total assistance shall mean that a specific function or task is performed and completed for the patient.

(3) Continuous personal care services means the provision of uninterrupted care, by more than one person, for more than 16 hours per day for a patient who, because of the patient's medical condition and disabilities, requires total assistance with toileting, walking, transferring or feeding at times that cannot be predicted.

(5) Live-in 24-hour personal care services means the provision of care by one person for a patient who, because of the patient's medical condition and disabilities, requires some or total assistance with one or more personal care functions during the day and night and whose need for assistance during the night is infrequent or can be predicted.

FH# 7769318Y

(6) Personal care services shall include the following two levels of care, and be provided in accordance with the following standards:

(i) Level I shall be limited to the performance of nutritional and environmental support functions.

Note: Effective April 1, 2011 Social Services Law §365-a(2)(e)(iv), which is reflected in this regulation, was amended to provide that personal care services pursuant to this paragraph shall not exceed eight hours per week for individuals whose needs are limited to nutritional and environmental support functions.

(ii) Level II shall include the performance of nutritional and environmental support functions and personal care functions.

(a) Personal care functions shall include some or total assistance with the following:

- (1) bathing of the patient in the bed, the tub or in the shower;
- (2) dressing;
- (3) grooming, including care of hair, shaving and ordinary care of nails, teeth and mouth;
- (4) toileting; this may include assisting the patient on and off the bedpan, commode or toilet;
- (5) walking, beyond that provided by durable medical equipment, within the home and outside the home;
- (6) transferring from bed to chair or wheelchair;
- (7) preparing meals in accordance with modified diets, including low sugar, low fat, low salt and low residue diets;
- (8) feeding;
- (9) administration of medication by the patient, including prompting the patient as to time, identifying the medication for the patient, bringing the medication and any necessary supplies or equipment to the patient, opening the container for the patient, positioning the patient for medication and administration, disposing of used supplies and materials and storing the medication properly;
- (10) providing routine skin care;
- (11) using medical supplies and equipment such as walkers and wheelchairs; and
- (12) changing of simple dressings.

Section 505.14(a)(4)(iii) of the regulations provides personal care services shall not be authorized if the patient's need for assistance can be met by either or both of the following:

(a) voluntary assistance available from informal caregivers including, but not limited to, the patient's family, friends or other responsible adult; or formal services provided by an entity or agency; or

(b) adaptive or specialized equipment or supplies including, but not limited to, bedside commodes, urinals, walkers and wheelchairs, when such equipment or supplies can be provided safely and cost-effectively.

General Information Service message 97 MA 033 includes a reminder concerning "statements of understanding". The GIS Message advises that the contribution of family members or friends to the care of a Personal Care Services applicant or recipient is voluntary and cannot be coerced or required in any manner whatsoever. A district may choose to implement so-called "statements of understanding" to reflect a family member's or friend's voluntary agreement to provide hours of care to a recipient whom the district has determined is medically eligible for split shift or live-in services. (See 95 LCM-76, section III, issued July 18, 1995, for a description of statements of understanding.) In New York City, the form statement of understanding is entitled "Agreement of Friend or Relative."

12 OHIP/ADM-1 states, in part:

With regard to informal caregivers, such support cannot be required but should be evaluated and discussed with the patient and the potential caregivers.

GIS 12 MA/026 provides as follows concerning the availability of 24 hour, split-shift personal care services in connection with the case of Strouchler v. Shah:

It is the Department's policy that 24-hour split-shift care should be authorized only when a person's nighttime needs cannot be met by a live-in aide or through either or both of the following:

- (1) adaptive or specialized equipment or supplies including, but not limited to, bedside commodes, urinals, walkers, wheelchairs, and insulin pens, when the social services district determines that such equipment or supplies can be provided safely and cost-effectively; and
- (2) voluntary assistance available from informal caregivers or formal services provided by an entity or agency.

When a person's nighttime needs cannot be met by the use of adaptive or specialized equipment or supplies or voluntary assistance from informal caregivers or formal services, a determination must be made whether the person needs 24-hour split-shift care (included within the regulatory definition of "continuous personal care services") or live-in 24-hour personal care services. Under Section 505.14, this depends on whether the person needs "some" or "total" assistance with toileting, walking, transferring, or feeding, and whether these needs are "frequent" or "infrequent", and able to be "scheduled" or "predicted".

The intent of the regulation is to allow the identification of situations in which a person's needs can be met by a live-in aide and still allow the aide to have an uninterrupted five hours for sleeping. The Department is considering changes to the regulations to better achieve this goal.

In the meantime, the Department provides the following clarifications:

1. The fact that a person's needs are predictable does not preclude the receipt of 24-hour split-shift care, if the person has a documented medical need for the tasks to be performed with a frequency that would not allow a live-in aide to perform them and still obtain an uninterrupted five hours of sleep.

2. The need for turning and positioning and/or the need for diaper changes, by themselves, neither preclude nor justify the receipt of 24-hour split-shift care. In order to receive 24-hour split-shift care, the person must have a documented medical need for those tasks to be performed so frequently that a live-in aide cannot provide them and still obtain an uninterrupted five hours of sleep.

3. A person with a documented medical need for turning and positioning may, if otherwise appropriate, qualify for either 24-hour split-shift care or live-in care depending on the frequency at which turning and positioning is required at night, regardless of whether the person has a nighttime need for transferring.

4. When determining whether a person requires 24-hour split-shift care or live-in care, the local professional director must consider whether the physician's order and other required assessments document the following:

- The existence of a medical condition that directly causes the person to need frequent assistance with personal care services tasks during the night;

FH# 7769318Y

- The specific task or tasks with which the person requires frequent assistance during the night;
- The frequency at which the person requires assistance with these tasks during the night;
- Whether the person requires similar assistance with these tasks during the daylight hours and, if not, why not;
- The informal supports or formal services that are willing, able and available to provide assistance with the person's nighttime tasks;
- The person's ability to use adaptive or specialized equipment or supplies to meet his or her documented medical need for assistance with nighttime tasks; and whether the person's physician has documented that, due to the person's medical condition, he or she could not safely use the equipment or supplies; and
- Whether a live-in aide would likely be able to obtain an uninterrupted five hours of sleep were live-in services to be authorized.

Regulations at 18 NYCRR 358-3.7(a) provide that an appellant has the right to examine the contents of the case record at the fair hearing. At the fair hearing, the agency is required to provide complete copies of its documentary evidence to the hearing officer. In addition, such documents must be provided to the appellant and appellant's authorized representative where such documents were not provided otherwise to the appellant or appellant's authorized representative in accordance with 18 NYCRR 358-3.7. 18 NYCRR 358-4.3(a). In addition, a representative of the agency must appear at the hearing along with the case record and a written summary of the case and be prepared to present evidence in support of its determination. 18 NYCRR 358-4.3(b).

Section 358-5.9 of the Regulations provides in part:

(a) At a fair hearing regarding the denial of an application for or the adequacy of public assistance, medical assistance, HEAP, SNAP benefits or services, the appellant must establish that the agency's denial of assistance or benefits was not correct or that the appellant is eligible for a greater amount of assistance or benefits.

DISCUSSION

The record establishes the relevant facts as stated above. The sole issue in contention at this hearing is a two-hour block of services which the Appellant contends is medically necessary to be provided in the mornings. The record, including the Appellant's testimony and the Plan's actual findings regarding the deterioration in the Appellant's ability to perform ADL's and IADL's including bathing dressing both lower and upper body and mobility, all point to no other conclusion that the Appellant does require a two-hour block to meet his dressing, bathing and hygiene issues in the morning hours.

The evidence having been duly considered, the Plan's determination to only partially approve an increase in the Appellant's Personal Care Service hours cannot be sustained.

DECISION AND ORDER

The determination by the Appellant's Managed Long Term Care Plan, Centers Plan For Healthy Living's, determination to partially deny the Appellant's request for an increase in Personal Care Services (CDPAP) from 5 hours daily, 7 days per week (35 hours weekly) to 7 hours daily, 7 days per week (49 hours weekly) is not correct.

1. The Plan is directed to cancel its Notice of Denial dated May 24, 2018.
2. The Plan is directed to authorize the Appellant for 7 hours daily, 7 days per week (49 hours weekly) to be arranged as per mutual agreement between the Appellant and the Plan.

As required by 18 NYCRR 358-6.4 the Plan must comply immediately with the directives set forth above.

DATED: Albany, New York
12/18/2018

NEW YORK STATE
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH

By

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Al Chomey", with a large, stylized loop at the end.

Commissioner's Designee