

Answers:

$$\begin{aligned}
 1. \text{ Dual 2: } & \max \sum_{j \in C} \alpha_j - \lambda k \\
 & \text{s.t. } \alpha_j - \beta_{ij} \leq c(i, j), \forall j \in C, i \in F \\
 & \sum_{j \in C} \beta_{ij} \leq \lambda, \forall i \in F \\
 & \alpha_j \geq 0, \forall j \in C \\
 & \beta_{ij} \geq 0, \forall j \in C, i \in F
 \end{aligned}$$

$$2. 3\lambda|S| + \sum_{\text{cluster } C_0} \sum_{j \in C_0} c(i_{C_0}, j) \leq 3 \cdot \sum_{j \in C} \alpha_j$$

$$3. 3\lambda k + \sum_{\text{cluster } C_0} \sum_{j \in C_0} c(i_{C_0}, j) \leq 3 \cdot \sum_{j \in C} \alpha_j$$

$$\Rightarrow \sum_{\text{cluster } C_0} \sum_{j \in C_0} c(i_{C_0}, j) \leq 3(\sum_{j \in C} \alpha_j - \lambda k) \leq 3 \text{OPT Dual 2}$$

$$4. \lambda = \lambda_1 = 0$$

In this case, the dual 2 objective function is maximized when the algorithm opens as many facilities as possible (since we have no penalty). Now S contains exactly k facilities, so at least k of them would be opened by the algorithm.

$$\lambda = \lambda_2 = \sum_{j \in C} \sum_{i \in F} c((i, j))$$

In this case, the cost of opening a new facility is large, so the algorithm should open as less facility as possible, but it should open at least 1 facility. Hence, only one facility would be opened by the algorithm.

5. From question 2 & 3, we have the following bounds:

$$\text{cost}(S_1) = \sum_{\text{cluster } C_0 \in S_1} \sum_{j \in C_0} c((i, j)) \leq 3(\sum_{j \in C} \alpha_j^1 - \lambda_1 k).$$

$$\text{cost}(S_2) = \sum_{\text{cluster } C_0 \in S_2} \sum_{j \in C_0} c((i, j)) \leq 3(\sum_{j \in C} \alpha_j^2 - \lambda_2 k).$$

6. We have the following:

$$\lambda_2 - \lambda_1 \leq \epsilon_{\min} / (3|F|), \text{ for some fixed } \epsilon > 0. \quad (\text{Given})$$

$$\Rightarrow -\lambda_1 \leq -\lambda_2 + \epsilon_{\min} / (3|F|), \text{ for some fixed } \epsilon > 0.$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 \text{From question 5, } \text{cost}(S_1) & \leq 3 \sum_{j \in C} \alpha_j^1 - 3\lambda_1 |S_1| \leq 3(\sum_{j \in C} \alpha_j^1 - \lambda_1 |S_1|) \\
 & \leq 3(\sum_{j \in C} \alpha_j^1 - \lambda_2 |S_1|) + \frac{\epsilon_{\min} |S_1|}{|F|} \\
 & \leq 3(\sum_{j \in C} \alpha_j^1 - \lambda_2 |S_1|) + \epsilon_{\min} \quad (\text{Since } |S_1| \leq |F|) \\
 & \leq 3(\sum_{j \in C} \alpha_j^1 - \lambda_2 |S_1|) + \epsilon_{\text{OPT}}
 \end{aligned}$$

7. Proof of lemma 1

Lemma 1. $\delta_1 \text{cost}(S_1) + \delta_2 \text{cost}(S_2) \leq (3 + \delta_1 \epsilon) \text{OPT}$.

Proof: From question 6, we have,

$$\begin{aligned}
 \delta_1 \text{cost}(S_1) + \delta_2 \text{cost}(S_2) &\leq 3\delta_1 \left(\sum_{j \in C} \alpha_j^1 - \lambda_2 |S_1| \right) + \delta_1 \epsilon \text{OPT} + 3\delta_2 \left(\sum_{j \in C} \alpha_j^2 - \lambda_2 |S_2| \right) \\
 &= 3 \left(\sum_{j \in C} ((\delta_1 \alpha_j^1 + \delta_2 \alpha_j^2) - \lambda_2 (\delta_1 |S_1| + \delta_2 |S_2|)) \right) + \delta_1 \epsilon \text{OPT} \\
 &= 3 \left(\sum_{j \in C} \tilde{\alpha}_j - \lambda_2 k \right) + \delta_1 \epsilon \text{OPT} \\
 &= 3 \text{OPT} + \delta_1 \epsilon \text{OPT} \\
 &= (3 + \delta_1 \epsilon) \text{OPT}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\Rightarrow \delta_1 \text{cost}(S_1) + \delta_2 \text{cost}(S_2) \leq (3 + \delta_1 \epsilon) \text{OPT}.$$

8. Proof of the fact that

S_2 is a solution of cost at most $2(3 + \epsilon) \text{OPT}$

$$\begin{aligned}
 \text{cost}(S_2) &\leq 2\delta_2 \text{cost}(S_2) \quad \text{Since } \delta_2 \geq \frac{1}{2} \\
 &\leq 2(\delta_1 \text{cost}(S_1) + \delta_2 \text{cost}(S_2)) \leq 2(3 + \delta_1 \epsilon) \text{OPT} \quad \text{by question 7} \\
 &\leq 2(3 + \epsilon) \text{OPT}.
 \end{aligned}$$

9. The probability that the randomized algorithm opens $f_1 = \frac{\binom{k - |S_2|}{1}}{\binom{|S_1| - |S_2|}{1}} = \frac{k - |S_2|}{|S_1| - |S_2|} = \delta_1$

10. Since i is the facility closest to f_2 (by assumption), we have,

$$c((i, f_2)) \leq c((f_1, f_2))$$

11. Proof:

$$\begin{aligned}
 c((i, j)) &\leq c((f_1, f_2)) + c((f_2, j)) \\
 &\leq c((f_1, j)) + c((f_2, j)) + c((f_2, j)) \quad \text{Since } c((f_1, f_2)) \leq c((f_1, j)) + c((f_2, j)) \\
 &= c_j^1 + 2c_j^2.
 \end{aligned}$$

12. The expected cost for client $j = \Pr(j \text{ assigned to } f_1) \cdot c_j^1 + \Pr(j \text{ assigned to } i) \cdot c((i, j))$

$$\begin{aligned}
 &= \delta_1 c_j^1 + (1 - \delta_1) c((i, j)) \quad \text{the probability that the randomized algorithm opens } f_1 \text{ is } \delta_1 \\
 &\quad \text{the probability that the randomized algorithm does not open } f_1 \text{ is } 1 - \delta_1 = \delta_2. \\
 &\leq \delta_1 c_j^1 + \delta_2 (c_j^1 + 2c_j^2). \quad \text{(by question 11)}
 \end{aligned}$$

13. The expected cost for client $j \leq \delta_1 c_j^1 + \delta_2 (c_j^1 + 2c_j^2) \leq 2(\delta_1 c_j^1 + \delta_2 c_j^2)$, since $\delta_2 \leq \frac{1}{2} \leq \delta_1$.

Hence, we have,

$$\begin{aligned}
 & \text{Total cost of } S \\
 & \leq 2(\delta_1 \text{cost}(S_1) + \delta_2 \text{cost}(S_2)) \\
 & \leq 2(3 + \epsilon \delta_1) OPT \quad \text{from question 7} \\
 & \leq 2(3 + \epsilon) OPT
 \end{aligned}$$