EdX and its Members use cookies and other tracking technologies for performance, analytics, and marketing purposes. By using this website, you accept this use. Learn more about these technologies in the <u>Privacy Policy</u>.



2. Posterior Statistics and Coin

Course > Unit 5 Bayesian statistics > Homework 9: Bayesian Statistics > Flipping

# 2. Posterior Statistics and Coin Flipping Setup:

In this problem, we consider an application of posterior statistics. Suppose that we have five loaded coins; the probability of each landing heads is 0.2, 0.4, 0.6, and 0.8. The coins are placed in a bag, and one coin is drawn completely at random. Let the probability that the coin drawn comes up heads on a given toss be  $\lambda_0$ . Our goal is to infer something about the probability that the coin picked will land heads, and we would extract information by flipping the coin n times and recording the outcomes of the tosses.

# (a) Preliminary Ingredients

2.0/2 points (graded)

In a Bayesian model, given the description of the situation, what is the prior distribution of the parameter of interest  $\lambda$ , which we define as probability that the coin chosen lands heads?

Enter the prior probabilities for  $\lambda=0.2$ ,  $\lambda=0.4$ ,  $\lambda=0.6$ ,  $\lambda=0.8$ , as a vector  $(\mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.2) \quad \mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.4) \quad \mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.6) \quad \mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.8)$ ). For example, if  $\mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.2)=0.5$ ,  $\mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.4)=0.1$ ,  $\mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.6)=0.1$ ,  $\mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.8)=0.3$ , then enter **[0.5,0.1,0.1,0.3]**. Note the components are separated by commas, and the vector is enclosed by square brackets.

$$\left( \ \mathbf{P} \left( \lambda = 0.2 \right) \quad \mathbf{P} \left( \lambda = 0.4 \right) \quad \mathbf{P} \left( \lambda = 0.6 \right) \quad \mathbf{P} \left( \lambda = 0.8 \right) \right) = \quad \left[ 0.2, 0.4, 0.2, 0.2 \right]$$

Let the observations be  $X_1, X_2, \cdots, X_n$ , which are modelled as Bernoulli random variables indicating whether a head was tossed on each of the n tosses. Find a general expression for the likelihood function  $L_n(X_1, X_2, \cdots, X_n | \lambda)$  in terms of  $\lambda$ , n, and  $\sum_{i=1}^n X_i$ .

(Enter  $\mathbf{Sigma_i(X_i)}$  for  $\sum_{i=1}^n X_i$ . Do not worry if the parser does not render properly; the grader works independently. If you wish to have proper rendering, enclose  $\mathbf{Sigma_i(X_i)}$  by brackets. )

For this problem, write your answer in proportionality notation such that when  $\lambda=0.5$ , the value of the likelihood function is  $0.5^n$  regardless of the value of the  $X_i$ 's.

STANDARD NOTATION

#### **Solution:**

Converting the coin frequencies into probabilities, we get that

$$\mathbf{P}\left(\lambda=0.2
ight)=rac{1}{5},$$

$$\mathbf{P}\left(\lambda=0.4
ight)=rac{2}{5},$$

$$\mathbf{P}\left(\lambda=0.6
ight)=rac{1}{5},$$

and

$$\mathbf{P}\left(\lambda=0.8
ight)=rac{1}{5}.$$

 $L\left(X_{i}|\lambda
ight)$  is a Bernoulli distribution with expected value  $\lambda$ , so its pmf is

$$L\left(X_i|\lambda
ight) = \lambda^{X_i}(1-\lambda)^{1-X_i}.$$

Note that this form of the Bernoulli distribution pmf makes it especially easy to multiply; indeed, we could write

$$egin{aligned} L_n\left(X_1,\ldots,X_n|\lambda
ight) &= L\left(X_1|\lambda
ight)\ldots L\left(X_n|\lambda
ight) \ &\propto (\lambda^{X_1}(1-\lambda)^{1-X_1})\ldots \lambda^{X_n}(1-\lambda)^{1-X_n} \ &\propto (\lambda^{X_1}\ldots\lambda^{X_n})\left((1-\lambda)^{1-X_1}\ldots(1-\lambda)^{1-X_n}
ight) \ &\propto \lambda^{\sum X_i}(1-\lambda)^{n-\sum X_i}. \end{aligned}$$

Submit

You have used 2 of 3 attempts

**1** Answers are displayed within the problem

## (b) Bayes' Theorem and the Posterior Distribution

4.0/4 points (graded)

Use Bayes' theorem to calculate the posterior distribution if n=6 and our observations are  $X_1=0$ ,  $X_2=X_3=1$ ,  $X_4=0$ ,  $X_5=X_6=1$ . In this problem, the notational shorthand  $X_i$  refers to the vector of observations  $X_1,\ldots,X_6$ . (Formatting a neat table in Excel may help in this.)

(Enter the posterior probabilities for  $\lambda=0.2$ ,  $\lambda=0.4$ ,  $\lambda=0.6$ ,  $\lambda=0.8$ , as a vector  $\frac{(\mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.2|X_i)}{\mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.2|X_i)} \mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.4|X_i) \mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.6|X_i) \mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.8|X_i)).$  For example if  $\frac{\text{Generating Speech Output}}{0.2|X_i} 0.2|X_i) = 0.5, \ \mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.4|X_i) = 0.1, \ \mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.6|X_i) = 0.1, \ \mathbf{P}(\lambda=0.8|X_i) = 0.2$  then enter **[0.5,0.1,0.1,0.2]**. Note the

components are separated by commas, and the vector is enclosed by square brackets.)

**Note:** Enter at least three decimal digits of your answer.

$$\left( \left. \mathbf{P} \left( \lambda = 0.2 | X_i 
ight) \right. \left. \mathbf{P} \left( \lambda = 0.4 | X_i 
ight) \right. \left. \mathbf{P} \left( \lambda = 0.6 | X_i 
ight) \right. \left. \left. \mathbf{P} \left( \lambda = 0.8 | X_i 
ight) 
ight) = \right. \right| \left[ 0.01809955, 0.32579186, 0.3665158 \right]$$

**Answer:** [0.018, 0.326, 0.367, 0.290]

From the posterior distribution, compute the posterior mean, mode, and median.

**Note:** For the following, enter at least two decimal digits of your answer.

Posterior mode: 0.6 **✓ Answer**: 0.60

Posterior median: 0.6 ✓ Answer: 0.60

### **Solution:**

By Bayes' theorem,  $\pi(\lambda|X_i) \propto \pi(\lambda) L_n(X_i|\lambda)$ . We recall the values (0.2,0.4,0.2,0.2) for  $\pi(0.2)$ ,  $\pi(0.4)$ ,  $\pi(0.6)$ , and  $\pi(0.8)$ . From the formula

$$L_n\left(X_i|\lambda
ight) = \lambda^{\sum X_i} (1-\lambda)^{n-\sum X_i},$$

noting that  $\sum X_i = 4$  and  $n - \sum X_i = 2$  , we can calculate

$$\left(L_{n}\left(X_{i}|0.2\right),L_{n}\left(X_{i}|0.4\right),L_{n}\left(X_{i}|0.6\right),L_{n}\left(X_{i}|0.8\right)=\left(0.2^{4}0.8^{2},0.4^{4}0.6^{2},0.6^{4}0.4^{2},0.8^{4}0.2^{2}\right)\\ =\left(0.001024,0.009216,0.020736,0.016384\right).$$

Multiplying this with  $\pi\left(\lambda\right)$  gives the un-normalized posterior distribution

$$\pi(X_i|\lambda) \propto (0.2 \cdot 0.001024, 0.4 \cdot 0.009216, 0.2 \cdot 0.020736, 0.2 \cdot 0.016384)$$
  
= (0.0002048, 0.0036864, 0.0041472, 0.0032768)

Normalizing, this gives

$$(\pi(\lambda=0.2|X_i),\pi(\lambda=0.4|X_i),\pi(\lambda=0.6|X_i),\pi(\lambda=0.8|X_i))=(0.0181,0.3258,0.3665,0.2896)$$
 .

From this, we could compute the posterior mean to be

$$\sum_{j \in \{0.2, 0.4, 0.6, 0.8\}} \pi\left(\lambda = j | X_i\right) \lambda = \left(0.0181\right) \left(0.2\right) + \left(0.3258\right) \left(0.4\right) + \left(0.3665\right) \left(0.6\right) + \left(0.2896\right) \left(0.8\right) = 0.5855.$$

To compute the median, notice that

$$\pi(\lambda = 0.2|X_i) + \pi(\lambda = 0.4|X_i) = 0.0181 + 0.3258 = 0.4439 < 0.5000$$

and that

$$\pi\left(\lambda=0.2|X_i
ight)+\pi\left(\lambda=0.4|X_i
ight)+\pi\left(\lambda=0.6|X_i
ight)=0.0181+0.3258+0.3665=0.8104>0.5000,$$

meaning that the median is at 0.6. From the posterior distribution, we could also see that the  $\lambda$  with the highest mass is  $\lambda=0.6$  with frequency 0.3665, so the mode is 0.6.

Submit

You have used 3 of 3 attempts

Generating Speech Output wers are displayed within the problem

# (c) Choosing Between Estimators

2/2 points (graded)

The estimator we choose depends on the situation. If we are only allowed to name one estimate for the parameter  $\lambda_0$  as our "best guess" incorporating our observations, which among the three statistics named in the previous problem may be used for sure, regardless of our observations (i.e. it is always uniquely defined)? You should pick the estimator(s) that would always produce a unique value.

(Choose all that apply.)



Posterior median





Consider the general case with n observations. Suppose that the coin we picked is known to a certain observer, and we are to state an estimate  $\lambda_0$  of the probability that the coin we picked lands heads at a given toss. The observer will reward a certain amount of money depending on both our estimate and the actual value, which will be one of the three systems below.

- 1. We will be rewarded \$100 for the correct value (i.e.  $\lambda_0=\lambda^*$ ) and \$0 otherwise.
- 2. We will be rewarded  $(100 100|\lambda_0 \lambda^*|)$ .
- 3. We will be rewarded  $(100 \frac{(\lambda_0 \lambda^*)^2}{100})$ .

For each of the three systems, identify the most appropriate estimator among the posterior mean, median, or mode. Select the choice corresponding to your answer in order (first, second, then third item).

mean, median, mode

mean, mode, median

| median, mean, mode |  |
|--------------------|--|
| median, mode, mean |  |
| mode, mean, median |  |
| mode, median, mean |  |



#### **Solution:**

#### **Unique Value-Producing Estimators**

- The posterior mean will always produce a unique estimate for  $\lambda_0$  as it's defined as the weighted average of the distribution, and has thus has an arithmetic formula.
- The posterior median is not necessarily uniquely defined because it's possible say for exactly half the weight in the posterior distribution to lie on the left half (0.2, 0.4) and half on the right half (0.6, 0.8). In this case, the median can be any real number from [0.4, 0.6], so it's not uniquely defined.
- The posterior mode is not necessarily uniquely defined because it's possible for the posterior distribution to be bimodal.

**Estimators and Reward Functions** This question is intended as a review of some concepts from M-estimation.

- In this case, we wish to optimize for probability that we pick the correct value. As we have a discrete set of observations, we have to pick the coin with the largest probability of being the correct coin. This is thus the **posterior mode**.
- In this case, we are optimizing for the minimum expected absolute distance. We have shown <a href="here">here</a> that the median minimizes the expected absolute distance, and because our distribution is based on the posterior distribution, we have to pick the **posterior median**. Intuitively, one could reason that we could pair up equivalent areas starting from the left and right of the posterior distribution. Then we have the property that as long as we're inside the interval formed by these two points, the total absolute distance is equal, and strictly greater once we're outside the interval. It is then optimal to pick the median so that we're never outside the interval.
- In this case, we are minimizing the minimum expected square distance. Again, we have shown here that the mean minimizes the expected formula for the posterior distribution, we have to pick the posterior distribution, we have to pick the posterior mean. Indeed, we are effectively minimizing  $\mathbb{E}\left[(\lambda_0 \lambda^*)^2\right]$ , which can be written as a quadratic in  $\lambda_0$ :

$$\lambda_0^2 - 2 \mathbb{E}\left[\lambda^*
ight] \lambda_0 + \mathbb{E}\left[\left(\lambda^*
ight)^2
ight].$$

The coefficients of this quadratic are 1,  $-2\mathbb{E}\left[\lambda^*\right]$  and  $\mathbb{E}[\lambda^*)^2$ ], so its minimum is at  $\mathbb{E}\left[\lambda^*\right]$ , indeed the mean.

Submit

You have used 2 of 2 attempts

• Answers are displayed within the problem

## Discussion

**Hide Discussion** 

**Topic:** Unit 5 Bayesian statistics:Homework 9: Bayesian Statistics / 2. Posterior Statistics and Coin Flipping

#### Add a Post

| Sh              | how all posts ▼ by recent acti                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | vity ▼ |
|-----------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------|
| 9,              | Solutions in Julia ### 9.2 pDice = [0.2,0.4,0.6,0.8] p0v = [1/5,2/5,1/5,1/5] Ln(p,Σx=4,n=6) = p^Σx * (1-p)^(n-Σx) Post(p0,p,Σx=4,n=6) = p0 * Ln(p,Σx,n) postValues = map((p0,p) -> Post(p0,p), p0v, pD                                                | 1      |
| €               | median formula What is algorithm to obtain the median? I used the common approach (a+b)/2 for two nearest values a and b to median but got a red cross.                                                                                               | 12     |
| 2               | <u>C</u> without giving away an incorrect answer **MW-CTA**, but my answer wasn't accepted so I'm at a loss. Hints? Also idek where to begin with the second part. Ideas?                                                                             | 2      |
| 2               | [Staff] - Can you please check my answer for question- b and tell whether i am getting wrong answer because of my rounding [Staff] - Can you please check my answer for question- b and tell whether i am getting wrong answer because of my rounding | 2      |
| 2               | Not giving the answer to a1) isn't fair  Lgot a2) right, but there goes 4 points in b) because of a minor misunderstanding.                                                                                                                           | 4      |
| ?               | (b) Bayes' Theorem and the Posterior Distribution  I have attained the posterior distribution (beta) and have tried to use the mean formula for the beta distribution to attain the posterior mean but the grader is saying its incor                 | 3      |
| ating Speech Ou | [Staff] Can I please get a request for why part b) is all incorrect  utput ve tried with and without combinatorics to a high level of precision and always marked wrong. Don't shoot me down, am I using too high a level of precision and therefore  | 4      |

| ? | Typo on A  In the question: In this problem, we consider an application of posterior statistics. Suppose that we have five loaded coins; the probability of each landing heads is 0.2, 0.4, 0                                            | 4 |
|---|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---|
| 2 | Show Answers once attempts are exhausted  Dear Staff, As parts (b) and (c) of this question depend on getting part (a) correct, may I please request you to enable 'Show Answers' once the candidate has exhausted his att               | 4 |
| 2 | Pard (c): undertanding what the problem wants  Should we use a logic of "What estimate will give me the most money?" or "The observer waits to see which estimate i will use and he/she will try to pay me as less as possible           | 3 |
| € | PartB  I created a table with my likelihood function for each lambda value taking the SumX based on the data and then given that I also have my prior probability for each of the la                                                     | 4 |
| ? | What is Xi? part b  Ljust want to check my understanding of the question. The 6 observation refers to the drawing right? So Xi = 1 refers to a coin picked that lands on a head? Xi = 0 refers to a coi                                  | 2 |
| 2 | [Staff] Please add rounding instructions for exercises In my second attempt I solved exercise B, and the mistake was due to an incorrect rounding. Please add a hint there, and in all the exercises involving results with fractional p | 2 |

© All Rights Reserved