

Peer Effects from the Exit of High-Ability Students to Private and Charter Schools

To clarify from TJHS paper

Why does the author look at elementary school and not middle school?

Why is σ underlined in the top equation and not bottom?

Non-rivalry may not hold in public schools because same budget, additional student doesn't bring in more money

Assume allocation of resources across schools is the same

Might be useful to interact s and L variables

May only affect 2nd quartile and not bottom quartile

Understand how/why author did her estimates and decide if you want to do it the same way

Project STAR

Did not re-randomize small classrooms?

For simulation, need parameter estimates of what peer effects are from the beginning

- Econometrics simulation: mathematical model - given assumptions in this model, we can map distribution this way
- You are doing more of a prediction, but you still need a basic regression on what is happening in order to predict what will happen in another way

Know who students are but don't know where they left to → does it matter where they left to?

- Measure cream skimming effects
- What if they went to a magnet school, would they still be in the public school testing system?

What characteristics are you using to determine if someone looks like a private school system?

Classify based on test scores? (Race, parent's income)

Suggestions

Ryan: K-nearest neighbors may not be best → Use Gaussian finite distribution

Ki: Regress on performance of students who are leaving

Connolly:

Attrition will be interesting even if you don't know where they're going

First is to show there is impact of attrition

Then, is there differential effect if they're going to private or a different public school

Look at where private schools are located within Tennessee (certain geographic distance - most likely schools someone is shifting their kids to)

Even school without experiment gets attrition

Compare summary statistics of experimental public schools and regular public schools + their attrition rates

Peer effects well established already - not trying to prove peer effects exist,

If attrition rates were higher because of experiment, how does the experiment negatively affect?
Or if attrition rates were lower

Cream skimming - that's why teachers are against magnet schools, private schools, vouchers for private schools, they worry about kids left behind, vouchers cause money to get removed

Check where private schools are geographically located, if any charter/magnet schools nearby
Assign a reasonable probability if someone who left went to private or magnet depending on what's available around them

What is the most common age range for kids to shift over to private school?
Find out what earliest class for private school is (ex: If only offer from 1st grade on, may see differential attrition in that year)
There is a lot of information you can add to data to make better estimates

Nobody is sorted into peer groups
All the classrooms stay together after being randomized into
This paper has individual student tracking as opposed to quartiles