University of Texas at Dallas

Data Collection of Disparity in Social Media Coverage of Black Lives Matter

An Analysis of Twitter Data and Metadata

Sarah Lee

EPPS 6302

Dr. Karl Ho

December 3, 2020

Background

The Black Lives Matter (BLM) movement started with the hashtag #BlackLivesMatter in 2013 following the acquittal of George Zimmerman in the murder of Trayvon Martin.[1] The movement garnered national attention in 2014 following the deaths of (and the ensuing protests against the deaths of) Eric Garner, Michael Brown, and Tamir Rice.[2] While the BLM movement is most visible in its actions against police brutality, the BLM movement also seeks to eradicate white supremacy and systemic racism in all aspects of American society and uplift the Black community.[3] The BLM movement established itself as an international movement following the death of George Floyd on May 25, 2020, sparking protests in all 50 states and in various countries.[4, 5] Such attention was reflected in social media activity: The use of the #BlackLivesMatter hashtag was used approximately 47.8 million times on Twitter from May 26 to June 7, with the daily use of the hashtag soaring from 218,000 tweets on May 26, when the video of George Floyd's death was first posted online, to 8.8 million tweets on May 28.[6] Due to the heightened racial tension following protests and riots, police brutality during such demonstrations, media attention towards other unjust deaths or injuries (e.g. Breonna Taylor, Jacob Blake, and Elijah McClain), and the popularization of the All Lives Matter and Blue Lives Matter movement, Americans were increasingly polarized on the issue of racial issues and justice

[1] Day, E. (2015, July 19). #BlackLivesMatter: the birth of a new civil rights movement. Retrieved November 30, 2020, from https://bit.ly/3o7SlPJ.

[2] Black Lives Matter Movement. Retrieved November 30, 2020, from https://bit.ly/3ml6zfz.

[3] Ibid.

[4] Burch, A., Cai, W., Gianordoli, G., McCarthy, M., & Patel, J. (2020, June 13). How Black Lives Matter Reached Every Corner of America. Retrieved November 30, 2020 from https://nyti.ms/3lrYzYV.

[5] Kirby, J. (2020, June 12). "Black Lives Matter" has become a global rallying cry against racism and police brutality. Retrieved November 30, 2020 from https://bit.ly/36mNQL6.

[6] Anderson, M., Barthel, M., Perrin, A., & Vogels, E. (2020, June 10). #BlackLivesMatter surges on Twitter after George Floyd's death. Retrieved November 30, 2020 from https://pewrsr.ch/3lym0Qx.

in the United States along party lines. The growing polarization is evident: In June, Ipsos found that 84 percent of those who identify with the Democratic Party and 44 percent of individuals whose beliefs align with the Republican Party showed support for BLM demonstrations, while 50 percent of those who identify as Republicans opposed BLM protests, whereas in September, Ipsos found that 75 percent of individuals who identify as Democrats have shown to support BLM demonstrations and only 7 percent of those identify as Republicans have shown to support BLM demonstrations, with 77 percent of Republicans opposing BLM demonstrations.[7, 8]

Purpose

This study seeks to observe the differences in the discourse of BLM, police brutality, and systemic racism on Twitter among individuals of various political beliefs across the spectrum. The sample consists of tweets produced by Twitter users of sociopolitical influence in their respective political sect. Twitter accounts of traditional news media (e.g. CNN, FOX, New York Times) were excluded from the sample as to represent the views of individuals, rather than of media entities. This study uses Twitter time-series metadata to compare significant dates in the Twitter coverage of racial issues in the United States and Twitter data to draw distinction in the mannerisms that racial issues are discussed on Twitter by individuals of various political beliefs. Political beliefs were bisected into the left and the right and further divided along the spectrum.

---

[7] Americans split on the right to protest versus law and order. Retrieved on November 30, 2020, from https://bit.ly/3oeFE5s.

[8] Rose, R. (2020, September 3). Americans Increasingly Polarized When It Comes to Racial Justice Protests, Poll Finds. Retrieved on November 30, 2020, from https://n.pr/39v67b1.

Sample Selection

This study focuses on Twitter data and metadata of various notable, politically influential Twitter accounts (with over 10,000 followers on Twitter) that discuss BLM, police brutality, or systemic racism at least once since May 25, 2020. The date May 25, 2020 was selected as the beginning of the time frame of interest in the study due to its significance in the Black Lives Matter movement and general awareness and discourse on race issues in the United States. Well-known, politically influential Twitter accounts, rather than a random sample of Twitter accounts, are selected as the unit of interest for several reasons:

1. Social media accounts of well-known figures are usually public, and social media profiles of well-known, socio-politically active individuals or organizations tend to keep their social media account public to allow for their messages to be spread. Upon personal examination, Twitter API did not allow for data collection from private Twitter accounts.

2. As this study seeks to specifically look into active, sociopolitical discourse on BLM, police brutality, and racial relations, well-known, politically influential Twitter accounts were assumed to provide the most amount of tweets regarding the topic of interest. Due to the presumably substantial number of inactive Twitter accounts, Twitter bot accounts, and accounts that do not engage in any political discourse, a random selection among all Twitter accounts to analyze the coverage of BLM, police brutality, and racial issues on the individual-level is inappropriate.

3. Twitter accounts of well-known figures can easily be found, as compared to Twitter accounts of the average individual. This allowed for an easy process of gathering

individuals and organizations to include in the sample and searching for the Twitter

account of each individual and organization.

Socio-politically active and influential Twitter accounts were non-randomly selected and the

political affiliation of each Twitter account was determined based on their influence in their

respective political faction using the article "The Most Influential Political Identities from Left to

Right" by Nathan Allebach and personal knowledge and experience on Twitter.[9] Most Twitter

accounts in the sample was verified by individual searches to have discussed BLM or racial issues

in the United States at least once since May 25, 2020 until November 24, 2020, when the data

was collected. The few exceptions to the individual verification only occurred for accounts that

are shadow-banned on Twitter, by which tweets by the user are not discoverable through the

search function, but are highly influential in their given political sect (e.g. Charlie Kirk, a general

conservative) or part of a small sample (e.g. Ian Miles Cheong, a member of the alt-right). The

sample data, as provided by Twitter API, only includes tweets produced on or after May 25,

2020—the date of George Floyd's death—as the date marked a watershed in the BLM

movement: when the sociopolitical movement became an international phenomenon, and

tweets by each individual or organization were filtered using words relevant to BLM, police

brutality, and systemic racism in the United States. The sample consists of 64,119 tweets that

discuss BLM, police brutality, and racial issues in the United States produced by 312 Twitter

users of sociopolitical influence. The general classification of left/left-leaning or liberal political

beliefs, as outlined by Nathan Allebach, consist of anarchist, far leftist, moderate leftist, left-

---

[9] Allebach, N. (2019, April 15). The Most Influential Political Identities from Left to Right. Retrieved on November 30, 2020, from https://medium.com/discourse/the-most-influential-political-identities-from-left-to-right-a488bb6a4f19.

leaning progressive, social media progressive, establishment Democrat, general liberal, and centrist liberal beliefs, and the classification of right/right-leaning and conservative political beliefs include centrist conservatives, libertarians, general conservatives, establishment Republicans, far-right conservatives, far-right conspiracy theorists, the alt-right, and white nationalists and supremacists.

Data Collection and Manipulation

Twitter's RESTful API, accessed using the Twitter developer portal, was used to access and analyze social media data from Twitter. Data was collected and manipulated using R. The packages "dplyr," which provides grammar for dataset manipulation; "lubridate," which allows for manipulation of date-time data; and "rtweet," which allows for data collection through interaction with Twitter API, were used in the process of data collection and manipulation. One limitation in the data collection of Twitter coverage of and discourse on BLM, police brutality, and racial issues through Twitter occurs arises when an account is suspended. Twitter API does not allow for the collection of data of suspended Twitter accounts. Censorship on social media platforms, namely Facebook and Twitter, has long been a contentious topic among the right, as right-wing social media users claim to be disproportionately affected by censorship, either through warnings attached to tweets with inaccurate or suspensions for breaking the terms of service, than those on the left.[10] Such alleged censorship has led many conservatives to leave Twitter and Facebook for Parler, a conservative social media platform which touts itself on the

---

[10] Guynn, J. (2020, November 17). 'You're the ultimate editor,' Twitter's Jack Dorsey and Facebook's Mark Zuckerberg accused of censoring conservatives. Retrieved on December 3, 2020, from https://www.usatoday.com/story/tech/2020/11/17/facebook-twitter-dorsey-zuckerberg-donald-trump-conservative-bias-antitrust/6317585002/.

ability to express oneself freely without censorship or restrictions. While POLITICO found that "conservative media outlets and other GOP supporters dominate online discussions around two of the election's hottest issues, the Black Lives matter movement and voter fraud," Twitter searches for well-known, socio-politically active individuals who specifically identify with the far and alt-right returned many results of suspended accounts, likely due to the fact that Twitter banned over 7,000 accounts that produce and promote QAnon content in July.[11, 12] Such actions may impact the findings for far-right conservatives, far-right conspiracy theorists, the alt-right, and white supremacists and nationalists as their time-series and text data may not accurately represent the interests of those on the fringe. While searches for notable Twitter accounts of those who identify with the far left also returned some results of suspended accounts, suspended accounts were overwhelmingly found among those in the far or alt-right.

Data on individual Twitter users and accounts were collected using *get_timeline()*, a function available through the package "rtweet," as follows:

twitter_user <- get_timeline("twitter_username, n = 5000, lang = "en")

One limitation in using the function, *get_timeline()*, is that the function returns up to 3,200 most recent Tweets created by each individual user of interest. This causes an issue in the data collection process is the user of interest has tweeted over 3,200 times since May 25, 2020. An example of such Twitter account is President Donald Trump. On November 24, 2020, the date of data collection, President Trump had tweeted over 3,200 times since September 13, 2020 on his

[11] Scott, M. (2020, October 26). Despite cries of censorship, conservatives dominate social media. Retrieved on December 3, 2020, from https://www.politico.com/news/2020/10/26/censorship-conservatives-social-media-432643.

[12] Collins, B. & Zadrozny, B. (2020, July 21). Twitter Bans 7,000 QAnon accounts, limits 150,000 others as part of broad crackdown. Retrieved on December 3, 2020, from https://www.nbcnews.com/tech/tech-news/twitter-bans-7-000-qanon-accounts-limits-150-000-others-n1234541.

personal account, @realDonaldTrump. As this study seeks to analyze the coverage of and discourse on BLM, police brutality, and systemic racism by individual Twitter users of various political beliefs, missing data on key dates in the findings, such as June 2, 2020, amidst of BLM protests, when President Trump threatened to deploy the U.S. military to localities due to protesters and Jake Gardner, a bar owner who shot James Scurlock in a protest in Omaha, dodged charges; August 27, 2020, the day the police officer who shot Jacob Blake was identified and the day after the arrest of Kyle Rittenhouse; September 24, 2020, the day Brett Hankison was charged with wanton endangerment; and September 30, 2020, the day President Trump refused to condemn white supremacists and right-wing militia during the presidential debate, may lead for the data to not accurately represent the interest of frequent Tweeters. However, most Twitter accounts in the sample did not tweet over 3,200 times since May 25, 2020.

Individual-level data collected using *get_timeline()* is aggregated into each political faction using *rbind()*, to combine all 3,200 observations from each Twitter user into a dataset pertaining to their political beliefs. This dataset is then established as a data frame, and text data are converted into lower-case:

political_faction <- rbind(twitter_user1, twitter_user2, twitter_user3, …, twitter_user)

political_faction = as.data.frame(aspply(political_faction, tolower)

A logical vector is then created using words pertaining to BLM, police brutality, and systemic racism in the United States using *grepl()*. The vector will return TRUE for each individual tweet that uses the relevant words as defined by *grepl()*:

political_faction_logical <- grepl("black lives matter", political_faction$text)|…|

grepl("police", political_faction$text) |…| grepl("protest," political)_faction$text)

The words used to create the logical vector across all political beliefs are (in lower-case): Black lives matter, all lives, ALM, George Floyd, Chauvin, police, cops, pigs, qualified immunity, racism, racist, racists, white supremacist, white supremacists, Breonna, Mattingly, Kenneth Walker, Elijah, Ahmaud, Antifa, protest, protests, protester, protesters, protesting, riot, riots, rioter, rioters, rioting, looter, looters, looting, curfew, demonstration, demonstrations, tear gas, baton, rubber bullet, rubber bullets, autonomous zone, unmarked, peaceful, violent, violence, vandalize, vandalized, vandalizing, confederate, monument, and statue. While this list is not comprehensive and is likely to not include every single tweet that discusses BLM, police brutality, or racial issues in the United States, the list was deemed comprehensive enough for the scope of the study. Moreover, while the inclusion of words relating to, for example, protests or violence may include some tweets about protests that do not pertain to BLM, police violence, and racial issues in the United States, as text data is solely used to identify most-frequently used words by each political faction and successfully identified words pertaining to such topics, and as such words are integral in the conversation of fight against racist oppression in the United States, they were included in the list of words used to identify tweets relating to BLM, police brutality, and systemic racism in the United States.

The datasets *political_faction* and *political_faction_logical* are then combined into one dataset using *cbind*(). Afterwards, the argument *political_faction_logical == TRUE* is used to only include tweets including the key words in the sample dataset, *political_faction_blm*:

political_faction_tweets <- cbind(political_faction, political_faction_logical)

political_faction_blm <- political_faction %>% filter(political_faction_logical == "TRUE")

The column *created_at*, which denotes the year, date, and time each tweet was

published, was manipulated from a factor variable to a calendar date format to allow for it to be

used to filter out tweets published before May 25, 2020. As such, the dataset

political_faction_blm_gf would only include tweets that contain the key words that were created

on and after May 25, 2020:

political_faction_blm$created_at <- as.POSIXct(political_faction_blm$created_at)

political_faction_blm_gf <- political_faction_blm %>% filter(created_at > ymd("2020-05-25"))

The arguments *"twitter_user"*, *"twitter_username"*, *"political_faction"*,

"political_faction_logical", *"political_faction_blm"*, and *"political_faction_blm_gf"* are used to

represent various individuals and political beliefs included in the dataset. Each code was

repeated for each political faction with appropriate names used for each Twitter account and

political faction. The data, collected and manipulated by the aforementioned code, was then

used to produce frequency plots to identify significant dates, defined as the days with the most

number of tweets created in one day among each political faction, and word clouds to identify

the most frequently used words among individuals of various political beliefs. Such graphics can

be found in "Disparity in Social Media Coverage of BLM" on https://github.com/sarah-

slee/project.

Sample:

Anarchists. The sample of tweets by anarchist Twitter accounts consists of 2,461 tweets

by 8 Twitter accounts. The Twitter accounts used in this study include Jamie Elizabeth

(@jamie_elizabeth), Anarchist Federation (@AnarchistFed), Indigenous Anarchist Federation

(@IAF__FAI), BlackRose/Rosa Negra (@BRRN_Fed), Socialist Rifle Association (@SocialistRA),

Black Socialists of America (@BlackSocialists), RevAbolitionNYC (@RevAbolitionNYC), and Zoe Samudzi (@ztsamudzi).

Far Leftists. The sample of tweets created by far-leftist Twitter accounts include 4,064 tweets from 27 Twitter users. Far-leftist Twitter accounts in the sample include Oliver Thorn (@PhilosophyTube), Harris Brewis (@Hbomberguy), Cody Johnston (@drmisttercody), Richard Wolff (@profwolff), Cornel West (@CornelWestt), Benjamin Dixon (@BenjaminPDixon), Matt Bors (@MattBors), Isra Hirsi (@israhirsi), Katie Halper (@kthalps), Owen Jones (@OwenJones84), Ben Burgis (@BenBurgis), Hasan Piker (@hasanthehun), Vaush (@VaushV), Timothy Faust (@crulge), Briahna Joy Greene (@briebriejoy), Nathan Bernard (@nathanTbernard), Rob Delaney (@robdelaney), Phoenix Calida (@uppitynegress), Bhaskar SUnkara (@sunraysunray), David Klion (@DavidKlion), Vic Berger IV (@VicBergerIV), Krang Nelson (@Krang T. Nelson), Wild Geerters (@classiclib3ral), Rob Rousseau (@robrousseau), Will Menaker (@willmenaker), Matt Christman (@cushbomb), and Felix Biederman (@ByYourLogic).

Moderate Leftists. The sample of tweets produced by moderate-leftist Twitter accounts include 2,548 observations from 14 Twitter users. Notable moderate-leftist Twitter accounts include Glenn Greenwald (@ggreenwald), Lee Fang (@lhfang), Our Revolution (@OurRevolution), Kyle Kulinski (@KyleKulinski), Natalie Wynn (@ContraPoints), Bernie Sanders (@BernieSanders), Alexandria Ocasio-Cortez (@AOC), Ilhan Omar (@Ilhan), Rashida Tlaib (@RashidaTlaib), Ayanna Pressley (@AyannaPressley), Krystal Ball (@krystalball), Malaika Jabali (@MalaikaJabali), Jordan Uhl (@jordanuhl), and the Gravel Institute (@GravelInstitute).

Left-Leaning Progressives. The sample of Tweets created by left-leaning progressive Twitter users and accounts consists of 5,313 observations from 31 Twitter accounts. The Twitter

accounts used in this study are Cenk Uygur (@cenkygur), Ana Kasparian (@AnaKasparian), Emma Vigeland (@EmmaVigeland), Kevin (@the1janitor), Pod Save America (@PodSaveAmerica), The Young Turks (@TheYoungTurks), June Lapine (@shoe0nhead), Christoph (@Halalcoholism), Anthony Fantano (@theneedledrop), Mark Ruffalo (@MarkRuffalo), George Soros (@georgesoros), Stacey Abrams (@staceyabrams), Susan Sarandon (@SusanSarandon), Tulsi Gabbard (@TulsiGabbard), Nina Turner (@ninaturner), Ken Klippenstein (@kenklippenstein), Paul Krugman (@paulkrugman), Michael Tracey (@mtracey), Michael Moore (@MMFlint), Ann Applebaum (@anneapplebaum), Nicholas Kristof (@NickKristof), John Fugelsang (@JohnFugelsang), Duncan Black (@Atrios), Elizabeth Warren (@ewarren), Ro Khanna (@RoKhanna), Joy Reid (@JoyAnnReid). Rachel Maddow (@maddow), Ezra Klein (@ezraklein), Juan Cole (@jricole), Andrew Yang (@AndrewYang), and Charles Booker (@Booker4KY).

Social Justice Progressives. The sample of tweets produced by social justice progressives on Twitter consisted of 13,187 tweets from 52 Twitter users. The social media progressive Twitter accounts used in this study include the National LGBTQ Task Force (@TheTaskForce), GLAAD (@glaad), Association on American Indian Affairs (@IndianAffairs), ACLU (@ACLU), Southern Poverty Law Center (@splcenter), Clint Smith (@ClintSmithIII), Roxane Gay (@rgay), Kathy Griffin (@kathygriffin), Jelani Cobb (@jelani9), John Lewis (@repjohnlewis), Arthur Chu (@arthur_affect), Brianna Wu (@BriannaWu), Michael Eric Dyson (@MichaelEDyson), Samuel Sinyangwe (@samswey), Dan Savage (@fakedansavage), Philip Lewis (@Phil_Lewis_), Michael Skolnik (@MichaelSkolnik), Emma Gonzalez (@Emma4Change), David Hogg (@davidhogg111), Ijeoma Oluo (@Ijeoma_Oluo), Tariq Nasheed (@tariqnasheed), Tarana Burke (@TaranaBurke), Alyssa Milano (@Alyssa_Milano), Alicia Garza (@aliciagarza), Opal Tometi (@opalayo), Jamil

Smith (@JamilSmith), Bernice King (@BerniceKing), Deray McKesson (@deray), Shaun King (@shaunking), Ashley Ford (@iSmashFizzle), Carol Anderson (@ProfCAnderson), Cameron Kasky (@cameron_kasky), Lauren Duca (@laurenduca), Michael Dyson (@MichaelEDyson), Parker Molloy (@ParkerMolloy), Sally Kohn (@sallykohn), Shannon Watts (@shannonrwatts), Colin Kaepernick (@Kaepernick7), Kat Blaque (@kat_blaque), Al Sharpton (@TheRevAl), Imani Gandy (@AngryBlackLady), Riley Dennis (@RileyJayDennis), Nikole Hanna Jones (@nhannahjones), Jamelle Boouie (@jbouie), Tim Wise (@timjacobwise), Franklin Leonard (@franklinleonard), Jesse Jackson Sr. (@RevJJackson), Brittany Packnett (@MsPackyetti), Eddie Glaude Jr. (@esglaude), Linda Sarsour (@lsarsour), Jordan Peele (@Jordan Peele), and Laurie Penny (@PennyRed).

Establishment Democrats. The sample of tweets produced by establishment Democrat Twitter users consists of 2,061 tweets from 22 Twitter users. Establishment Democrat Twitter accounts in the sample includes Hillary Clinton (@HillaryClinton), Barack Obama (@BarackObama), Michelle Obama (@MichelleObama), Joe Biden (@JoeBiden), Kamala Harris (@KamalaHarris), Cory Booker (@CoryBooker), Amy Klobuchar (@amyklobuchar), Nancy Pelosi (@SpeakerPelosi), Beto O'Rourke (@BetoORourke), Maxine Waters (@RepMaxineWaters), Ted Lieu (@tedlieu), Chuck Schumer (@SenSchumer), Andrew Cuomo (NYGovCuomo), Tim Kaine (@timkaine), Bob Casey (@SenBobCasey), Kirsten Gillibrand (@SenGillibrand), Adam Schiff (@RepAdamSchiff), Diane Feinstein (@SenFeinstein), Mazie Hirono (@maziehirono), Dick Durbin (@SenatorDurbin), Chris Murphy (@ChrisMurphyCT), and Richard Blumenthal (@SenBlumenthal).

General Liberals. The sample of tweets produced by general liberal Twitter users include 2,557 tweets from 19 Twitter users. General liberal Twitter accounts included in the sample are Nate Silver (@NateSilver538), James Fallows (@JamesFallows), Andrea Mitchell (@mitchellreports), Bill Maher (@billmaher), Democratic Coalition (@TheDemCoalition), Center for American Progress (@amprog), Max Blumenthal (@MaxBlumenthal), Brian Tyler Cohen (@briantylercohen), Jake Tapper (@jaketapper), Jim Acosta (@Acosta), Judd Legum (@JuddLegum), George Takei (@GeorgeTakei), Van Jones (@VanJones68), Oprah Winfrey (@Oprah), John Legend (@johnlegend), Stephen King (@StephenKing), Rob Reiner (@robreiner), The Daily Show (@TheDailyShow), and Jimmy Kimmel (@jimmykimmel).

Centrist Liberals. The sample of tweets included in the study by centrist liberal Twitter accounts include 1,457 tweets from 14 Twitter users. Centrist liberal Twitter accounts used in this study include the Brookings Institution (BrookingsInst), Sam Harris (@SamHarrisOrg), Dan Carlin (@dccommonsense), Steven Pinker (@sapinker), Sarah Haider (@SarahTheHaider), Fareed Zakaria (@FareedZakaria), Ethan Klein (@h3h3productions), Philip DeFranco (@PhillyD), Ian Bremmer (@ianbremmer), Eric Weinstein (@EricRWeinstein), Bret Weinstein (@BretWeinstein), Robert Reich (RBReich), Noah Smith (@Noahpinion), and Heather Heying (@HeatherEHeying).

Centrist Conservatives. The sample of tweets produced by centrist conservatives consists of 2,657 tweets from 14 Twitter users. Centrist conservative Twitter accounts used in this study include Amy Alkon (@amyalkin), Hoover Institution (@HooverInst), Gad Saad (@GadSaad), Melissa Chen (@MsMelChen), Christina Sommers (@CHSommers), Tim Pool (@Timcast), Nick DiPaolo (@NickDiPaolo), Rich Lowry (@RichLowry), Conor Friedersdorf (@conor64), Josh Barro

(@jbarro), Tom Nichols (@RadioFreeTom), Alex Berenson (@AlexBerenson), Lauren Chen (@TheLaurenChen), Noah Blum (@neontaser), and Yeyo (@RealYeyoZa).

Libertarians. The sample of tweets by libertarian Twitter users in the tudy consists of 3,011 tweets from 14 Twitter accounts. Libertarian Twitter accounts used in this study include Nick Gillespie (@nickgillespie), Matt Welch (@MattWelch), Elizabeth Nolan Brown (@ENBrown), Cato Institute (@CatoInstitute), Dave Rubin (@RubinReport), Kmele Foster (@kmele), Rand Paul (@RandPaul), Michael Shermer (@michaelshermer), Cathy Young (@CathyYoung63), Jesse Ventura (@GovJVentura), Larry Elder (@larryelder), Glenn Beck (@glennbeck), Greg Gutfeld (@greggutfeld), Dave Weigel (@daveweigel), and Tarl Warwick (@Styx666Official).

General Conservatives. The sample of tweets by individuals whose political beliefs align with general conservatism consists of 12,956 tweets produced by 48 Twitter users. General conservative Twitter accounts used in the study include The Western Journal (@WestJournalism), Ben Shapiro (@benshapiro), PragerU (@prageru), Campus Reform (@campusreform), MacIver Institute (@MacIverWisc), Media Research Center (@theMRC), Young America's Foundation (@yaf), Michelle Malkin (@michellemalkin), Bill O'Reilly (@BillOReilly), Sean Hannity (@seanhannity), Tucker Carlson (@TuckerCarlson), Mark Levin (@marklevinshow), Sebastian Gorka (@SebGorka), Ana Navarro-Cardenas (@ananavarro), Rick Wilson (@TheRickWilson), Hugh Hewitt (@hughhewitt), Dana Loesch (@DLoesch), Bill Kristol (@BillKristol), John Cardillo (@johncardillo), Amy Kremer (@AmyKremer), Allie Beth Stuckey (@conservmillen), Joe Walsh (@WalshFreedom), Michael Knowles (@michaeljknowles), Keemstar (@KEEMSTAR), Turning Point USA (@TPUSA), Charlie Kirk (@CharlieKirk11), Ryan Fournier (@RyanAFournier), Scott Presler (@ScottPresler), Candace Owens (@RealCandaceO),

Steven Crowder (@scrowder), Tomi Lahren (@TomiLahren), Anthony Brian Logan (@ANTHONYBLOGAN), Stephen Miller (@redsteeze), Kaitlin Bennett (@KaitMarieox), Chad Felix Greene (@chadfelixg), Max Boot (@MaxBoot), David Webb (@davidwebbshow), Benny Johnson (@bennyhohnson), Andrew Klavan (@andrewklavan), James Woods (@RealJamesWoods), Mollie Hemingway (@MZHemingway), Rod Dreher (@roddreher), Steve Schmidt (@SteveSchmidtSES), Ezra Levant (@ezralevant), Katie Pavlich (@KatiePavlich), Buck Sexton (@BuckSexton), Ryan Saavedra (@RealSaavedra), Neal Boortz (@Talkmaster), and Shashank Tripathi (@ComfortablySmug).

Establishment Republicans. The sample of tweets by establishment Republican Twitter accounts consists of 1,775 tweets from 12 Twitter users. Establishment Republican Twitter accounts in the sample include Donald Trump (@realDonaldTrump), Laura Ingraham (@IngrahamAngle), Meghan McCain (@MeghanMcCain), Mike Huckabee (@GovMikeHuckabee), Mitt Romney (@MittRomney), Ted Cruz (@tedcruz), Mitch McConnell (@senatemajleader), Marco Rubio (@marcorubio), Jeanine Pirro (@Judge Jeanine), Newt Gingrich (@newtgingrich), Evan McMullin (@EvanMcMullin), and Lindsey Graham (@LindseyGrahamSC).

Far-Right Conservatives. The sample of tweets created by far-right conservative Twitter users includes 2,398 tweets from 11 Twitter accounts. Far-right conservatives included in the study include John Birch Society (@The_JBS), Pamela Geller (@PamelaGeller), Robert Spencer (jihadwatchRS), Kevin Shipp (@Kevin Shipp), Stephen Miller (@redsteeze), Ann Coulter (@AnnCoulter), Jesse Lee Peterson (@JLPtalk), ACT for America (@ACTforAmerica), Brigitte Gabriel (@ACTBrigitte), Dinesh D'Souza (@DineshDSouza), and Bill Cunningham (@Willie700WLW).

Far-Right Conspiracy Theorists. The sample of tweets by far-right conspiracy theorists on Twitter consist of 3,491 tweets from 15 Twitter users. Far-right conspiracy theorists on Twitter included in the sample consist of Paul Joseph Watson (@Prison Planet), Q-Anon (@Qanon76), Mark Dice (@MarkDice), Curt Schilling (@gehrig38), Crux (@Crux41507251), Grace Elizabeth (@reallygraceful), Patriot1776 (@John_F_Kennnedy), Praying Medic (@prayingmedic), Enoch (@elenochle), Martin Geddes (@martingeddes), Michael Savage (@ASavageNation), David Knight (@libertytarian), Hotep Jesus (@HotepJesus), Tracy Beanz (@tracybeanz), andHenry Makow (@HenryMakow).

The Alt-Right. The sample of tweets produced by the members of the alt-right consists of 2,005 tweets from 5 alt-right Twitter accounts. Alt-right Twitter accounts used int his study include Mike Cernovich (@Cernovich), Brittany Sellner (@BrittPettibone), Jack Posobiec (@JackPosobiec), Andy Ngo (@MrAndyNgo), and Ian Miles Cheong (@stillgray).

White Supremacists and Nationalists. The sample of tweets by white supremacists and nationalists on Twitter includes 1,178 tweets from 6 accounts. The Twitter accounts of those who identify as white supremacists or nationalists that are included in this study consist of Peter Brimelow (@peterbrimelow), Nicholas Fuentes (@NickJFuentes), Lana Lokteff (@LanaLokteff), Xounter-Currents (@NewRightAmerica), Faith Goldy (@FaithGoldy), and Richard Spencer (@RichardBSpencer).