

Query
What's the best way to cook salmon on the grill.
Response
The best way to cook salmon on the grill is to preheat the grill to medium-high heat, brush the salmon with olive oil, season with salt and pepper, and place skin-side down on the grill. Allow the salmon to cook for 5-7 minutes, until the skin is crispy and the fish flakes easily with a fork. Flip the salmon, and cook for an additional 3-4 minutes. Serve with your favorite sides and enjoy.
Critique from AUTO-J
<p>The response provided is generally informative and offers a basic method for grilling salmon. However, it lacks depth and detail in several key areas. A main shortcoming is the absence of specific temperatures or cooking times, which are crucial for achieving the perfect grilled salmon. The response vaguely states "medium-high heat" and "5-7 minutes" for the first side of cooking, and "3-4 minutes" for the second side. More precise guidance would be beneficial for users who may not be experienced grill masters.</p> <p>The response also fails to address the quality of the salmon that is required for the recipe. It is essential to mention the type of salmon that would be best suited for this method of cooking. Furthermore, the response does not provide detailed information on how to determine when the salmon is cooked. This could potentially lead to overcooked or undercooked salmon, which is a common problem for novice cooks.</p> <p>The response could have been more interactive and personalized by asking the user about their specific grill or their experience with cooking salmon. This would have made the response more engaging and helpful. Additionally, the response could have been more professional by citing credible sources or providing references to back up the cooking instructions. This would have added credibility to the response.</p> <p>Lastly, the response missed an opportunity to provide a comprehensive answer by not addressing potential questions that the user might have, such as what to do if the salmon sticks to the grill or how to ensure the salmon is cooked evenly.</p> <p>In conclusion, while the response is a good starting point, it lacks the necessary detail and personal touch that would make it a truly excellent response.</p>
Critique from GPT-4 (AUTO-J wins)
The response is quite comprehensive and provides a clear, step-by-step guide on how to grill salmon. It includes details such as the heat level of the grill, how to prepare the salmon, how long to cook it on each side, and how to determine when it's done. However, it could be improved by including some tips on choosing the best piece of salmon for grilling, or suggesting some specific side dishes that pair well with grilled salmon.
Critique from ChatGPT (AUTO-J wins)
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Lack of details: The response could benefit from providing more specific instructions. For example, it does not mention the thickness of the salmon fillet or whether the grill should be covered or uncovered during cooking. 2. Absence of alternative methods: While the provided method is a good starting point, it would be helpful to mention other techniques such as using a cedar plank or aluminum foil to cook the salmon. 3. Limited seasoning options: While salt and pepper are mentioned as seasonings, it would be nice to suggest additional herbs or spices that could enhance the flavor of the salmon.
Critique from Selfie (AUTO-J wins)
The answer is clear and concise, providing step-by-step instructions on how to cook salmon on the grill. However, it would be helpful to mention the ideal grill temperature and suggest using a grill brush to clean the grates before cooking. Additionally, it would be useful to suggest using a thermometer to check the internal temperature of the salmon to ensure it is cooked to a safe temperature. Overall, I would give this answer a score of 8. Revision is needed.
Critique from LLaMA-2-Chat-13B (AUTO-J wins)
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Lack of detail: The response could benefit from more detail on the cooking process. For example, the user might want to know the exact temperature of the grill, or how to tell when the salmon is done. 2. Limited seasoning options: The response only mentions salt and pepper as seasoning options, but there are many other delicious seasonings that could be used to enhance the flavor of the salmon. 3. No visuals: The response does not include any visuals or images to help the user understand the cooking process or the final product.
Critique from Vicuna-13B-v1.5 (AUTO-J wins)
<p>Critique 1: The response provides a clear and concise method for cooking salmon on the grill. It includes important details such as preheating the grill and brushing the salmon with olive oil. However, it would be helpful to include more information about the cooking time and temperature, as well as tips for checking the doneness of the salmon.</p> <p>Critique 2: The response is well-written and easy to follow, with clear instructions for seasoning and cooking the salmon. It also suggests serving the salmon with favorite sides, which adds a personal touch. However, the response could benefit from more variety in the language and a few more details about the cooking process, such as the importance of flipping the salmon and monitoring the grill temperature.</p>
Critique from Wizardlm-13B-v1.2 (Tie)
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The response is concise and provides a clear, step-by-step guide on how to cook salmon on the grill. It mentions the preheating of the grill, seasoning the salmon, and the cooking time, which are all essential details. 2. The response could benefit from more detail on the type of olive oil to use and the seasoning options. For example, extra virgin olive oil is a good choice for grilling, and other seasoning options could include lemon juice, garlic powder, or smoked paprika. 3. The response does not mention the importance of oiling the grates before cooking, which can prevent the salmon from sticking to the grill. 4. The response does not provide any information on how to tell if the salmon is cooked properly. It would be helpful to mention that the salmon should flake easily with a fork and have a slight pink color in the center. 5. The response does not suggest any sides to serve with the salmon, which could be a helpful addition for users who are unsure of what to serve with grilled salmon.

Table 27: Critiques given by different models for a response. We remove the "rating" part in each critique, and mark the comparison results between AUTO-J and baselines judged by human.