Supplementary Material: Multi-Task Learning for Sequence Tagging: An Empirical Study

Soravit Changpinyo, Hexiang Hu, and Fei Sha

Department of Computer Science University of Southern California Los Angeles, CA 90089

schangpi, hexiangh, feisha@usc.edu

A Comparison between different MTL approaches

Settings	Method	UPOS	XPOS	CHUNK	NER	MWE	SEM	SEMTR	SUPSENSE	COM	FRAME	HYP	Average
S	STL	95.4	95.04	93.49	88.24	53.07	72.77	74.02	66.81	72.71	62.04	46.73	74.58
(Average)	MULTI-DEC	94.97	94.65	93.37	87.67	57.21	72.63	74.38	67.39	72.12	61.3	47.99	74.88
Pairwise	TE⊕DEC	95.0	94.77	93.4	87.72	56.67	72.48	74.25	67.19	71.84	58.65	47.45	74.49
	TE⊕ENC	95.0	94.66	93.32	87.65	55.99	72.49	74.24	67.09	72.09	61.62	47.37	74.68
	MULTI-DEC	95.04	94.31	93.44	86.38	61.43	71.53	74.26	68.1	74.54	59.71	51.41	75.47
All	TE⊕DEC	94.95	94.42	93.64	86.8	61.97	71.72	74.36	67.98	74.61	58.14	51.31	75.44
	TE⊕ENC	94.94	94.3	93.7	86.01	59.57	71.58	74.35	68.02	74.61	61.83	49.5	75.31
(Average)	MULTI-DEC	94.91	94.43	93.65	86.15	61.82	71.09	73.75	68.2	74.42	59.66	50.9	75.36
All-but-one	TE ⊕ D EC	94.83	94.4	93.64	86.39	60.55	70.95	73.74	67.81	74.47	58.66	50.86	75.12
	TE⊕ENC	94.77	94.35	93.53	85.96	60.23	70.83	73.64	68.15	74.05	61.23	50.15	75.17

Table 1: Comparison between MTL approaches

In Table 1, we summarize the results of different MTL approaches. We observe no significant differences between those methods.

B Additional results on All-but-one settings

Table 2 and Table 3 compare All and All-but-one settings for TE⊕DEC and TE⊕ENC, respectively. We show similar results for MULTI-DEC in the main text.

	UPOS	XPOS	CHUNK	NER	MWE	SEM	SEMTR	SUPSENSE	COM	FRAME	HYP	#↑	#↓
All	94.95	94.42	93.64	86.8	61.97	71.72	74.36	67.98	74.61	58.14	51.31		
All - UPOS		94.06↓	93.44	86.47	60.48	71.08 ↓	73.79	68.1	74.69	58.32	50.83	0	2
All - XPOS	94.38 ↓		93.6	86.68	60.09	70.98 ↓	73.78 ↓	67.9	74.26	58.31	50.6	0	3
All - CHUNK	94.6↓	94.29		86.08	60.6	70.39 ↓	73.36 ↓	68.07	74.47	58.73	51.1	0	3
All - NER	94.69 ↓	94.31	93.69		60.48 ↓	70.64 ↓	73.59 ↓	67.51	74.49	58.19	50.44	0	4
All - MWE	94.93	94.46	93.72	86.21 ↓		71.11 ↓	74.04	67.38	74.49	57.6	50.5	0	2
All - SEM	94.86	94.41	93.6	85.97↓	59.94↓		72.26↓	67.35	74.34	59.08	50.48	0	3
All - SEMTR	94.8	94.28	93.56	86.23 ↓	61.23	69.62↓		68.16	74.36	58.85	51.5	0	2
All - SUPSENSE	94.82	94.4	93.67	86.49	59.11	71.02 ↓	73.76↓		74.69	58.28	51.96	0	2
All - COM	95.19↑	94.76↑	93.79	86.25 ↓	62.02	72.32	74.92 ↑	67.62		60.72 ↑	50.0 ↓	4	2
All - FRAME	95.03	94.6	93.64	86.68	60.52 ↓	71.11 ↓	73.9	67.69	74.49		51.23	0	2
All - HYP	94.94	94.45	93.69	86.86	61.07	71.22	74.04 ↓	68.32	74.4	58.55		0	1
#↑	1	1	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	1	0		
#↓	3	1	0	4	3	8	6	0	0	0	1		

Table 2: F1 scores for $TE \oplus DEC$. We compare All with All-but-one settings (All - $\langle TASK \rangle$). We test on each task in the columns. Beneficial settings are in green. Harmful setting are in red.

C Detailed results separated by the tasks being tested on

In Table 4-14, we provide F1 scores with standard deviations in all settings. Each table corresponds to a task we test our models on. Rows denote training settings and columns denote MTL approaches.

	UPOS	XPOS	CHUNK	NER	MWE	SEM	SEMTR	SUPSENSE	СОМ	FRAME	HYP	#↑	#↓
All	94.94	94.3	93.7	86.01	59.57	71.58	74.35	68.02	74.61	61.83	49.5		
All - UPOS		94.0	93.36↓	85.98	59.58	70.68	73.66	68.19	74.07	60.51	50.23	0	1
All - XPOS	94.24 ↓		93.29↓	85.8	59.81	70.57 ↓	73.64 ↓	68.47	73.94	60.13	50.39	0	4
All - CHUNK	94.66	94.3		85.73	61.58	70.78	73.65	67.87	73.67 ↓	61.73	50.18	0	1
All - NER	94.71	94.25	93.5		59.05	70.58 ↓	73.4 ↓	67.95	74.16	59.96	49.95	0	2
All - MWE	94.94	94.5	93.63	86.1		71.12	73.75	69.0	74.28	61.51	49.81	0	0
All - SEM	94.76	94.32	93.45	85.58	59.47		72.21 ↓	67.77	74.2	61.76	50.15 ↑	1	1
All - SEMTR	94.68	94.25	93.54	86.02	60.59	69.86↓		67.96	73.81 ↓	61.31	51.72 ↑	1	2
All - SUPSENSE	94.8	94.27	93.56	86.04	59.25	70.53 ↓	73.27 ↓		74.3	59.98	50.01	0	2
All - COM	95.25 ↑	94.72 ↑	93.82	86.23	60.63	72.38 ↑	75.06 ↑	67.94		63.55	48.77	4	0
All - FRAME	94.84	94.39	93.51 ↓	85.99	61.21	70.78	73.69	68.13	74.3		50.35	0	1
All - HYP	94.86	94.45	93.59	86.1	61.09	71.03 ↓	74.09	68.17	73.78 ↓	61.91		0	2
#↑	1	1	0	0	0	1	1	0	0	0	2		
#↓	1	0	3	0	0	5	4	0	3	0	0		

Table 3: F1 scores for $TE \oplus ENC$. We compare All with All-but-one settings (All - $\langle TASK \rangle$). We test on each task in the columns. Beneficial settings are in green. Harmful setting are in red.

Trained with		Tested on UPOS					
		MULTI-DEC	TE⊕DEC	TE⊕Enc			
	UPOS only		95.4 ± 0.08				
	+XPOS	95.38 ± 0.03	95.4 ± 0.04	95.42 ± 0.07			
	+CHUNK	95.43 ± 0.11	95.57 ± 0.02 ↑	95.4 ± 0.0			
	+NER	95.38 ± 0.1	95.32 ± 0.03	95.29 ± 0.04			
	+MWE	$95.15 \pm 0.05 \downarrow$	$95.11 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$	$95.05 \pm 0.05 \downarrow$			
se	+SEM	95.23 ± 0.14	$95.2 \pm 0.05 \downarrow$	95.27 ± 0.08			
2	+SEMTR	95.17 ± 0.15	$95.21 \pm 0.03 \downarrow$	95.23 ± 0.13			
Pairwise	+SUPSENSE	$95.08 \pm 0.08 \downarrow$	$95.05 \pm 0.04 \downarrow$	95.27 ± 0.08			
	+COM	$93.04 \pm 0.77 \downarrow$	$94.03 \pm 0.42 \downarrow$	$93.6 \pm 0.15 \downarrow$			
	+FRAME	$94.98 \pm 0.13 \downarrow$	$94.79 \pm 0.09 \downarrow$	$95.0 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$			
	+HYP	$94.84 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$	$94.35 \pm 0.21 \downarrow$	$94.43 \pm 0.15 \downarrow$			
	Average	94.97	95.0	95.0			
	All - XPOS	$94.57 \pm 0.12 \downarrow$	94.38 ± 0.05 ↓	94.24 ± 0.24 ↓			
	All - CHUNK	$94.84 \pm 0.01 \downarrow$	$94.6 \pm 0.1 \downarrow$	$94.66 \pm 0.15 \downarrow$			
	All - NER	$94.81 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$	$94.69 \pm 0.05 \downarrow$	$94.71 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$			
ne	All - MWE	$94.93 \pm 0.01 \downarrow$	$94.93 \pm 0.08 \downarrow$	$94.94 \pm 0.04 \downarrow$			
All-but-one	All - SEM	$94.82 \pm 0.17 \downarrow$	$94.86 \pm 0.08 \downarrow$	$94.76 \pm 0.15 \downarrow$			
휵	All - SEMTR	$94.83 \pm 0.12 \downarrow$	$94.8 \pm 0.03 \downarrow$	$94.68 \pm 0.17 \downarrow$			
4	All - SUPSENSE	$94.97 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$	$94.82 \pm 0.03 \downarrow$	$94.8 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$			
•	All - COM	$95.19 \pm 0.05 \downarrow$	$95.19 \pm 0.04 \downarrow$	$95.25 \pm 0.02 \downarrow$			
	All - FRAME	$95.15 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$	95.03 ± 0.17	$94.84 \pm 0.1 \downarrow$			
	All - HYP	$94.93 \pm 0.18 \downarrow$	$94.94 \pm 0.11 \downarrow$	$94.86 \pm 0.04 \downarrow$			
	All	95.04 ± 0.03 ↓	94.95 ± 0.08 ↓	94.94 ± 0.1 ↓			
	Oracle	95.4 ± 0.08	95.57 ± 0.02	95.4 ± 0.08			

Table 4: F1 score tested on the task upos in different training scenarios

Trained with		Tested on CHUNK					
		MULTI-DEC	TE⊕DEC	TE⊕ENC			
	CHUNK only		93.49 ± 0.01				
	+UPOS	94.18 ± 0.02 ↑	94.02 ± 0.08 ↑	94.0 ± 0.15 ↑			
	+XPOS	$93.97 \pm 0.16 \uparrow$	94.18 ± 0.01 ↑	93.98 ± 0.13 ↑			
	+NER	93.47 ± 0.1	93.64 ± 0.03 ↑	93.54 ± 0.1			
	+MWE	93.54 ± 0.13	93.59 ± 0.2	93.33 ± 0.2			
Pairwise	+SEM	$93.63 \pm 0.02 \uparrow$	93.45 ± 0.07	93.52 ± 0.13			
Ž	+SEMTR	93.61 ± 0.07	93.47 ± 0.03	93.45 ± 0.07			
Pai	+SUPSENSE	93.2 ± 0.21	93.25 ± 0.15	$93.13 \pm 0.13 \downarrow$			
	+COM	$91.94 \pm 0.4 \downarrow$	$92.29 \pm 0.27 \downarrow$	$91.86 \pm 0.09 \downarrow$			
	+FRAME	$93.22 \pm 0.16 \downarrow$	$93.23 \pm 0.04 \downarrow$	93.29 ± 0.13			
	+HYP	$92.96 \pm 0.08 \downarrow$	$92.86 \pm 0.08 \downarrow$	$93.13 \pm 0.04 \downarrow$			
	Average	93.37	93.4	93.32			
	All - UPOS	93.59 ± 0.13	93.44 ± 0.17	93.36 ± 0.17			
	All - XPOS	93.57 ± 0.19	93.6 ± 0.05 ↑	93.29 ± 0.21			
	All - NER	93.59 ± 0.09	93.69 ± 0.14	93.5 ± 0.23			
All-but-one	All - MWE	$93.71 \pm 0.11 \uparrow$	93.72 ± 0.13 ↑	93.63 ± 0.04 ↑			
7	All - SEM	93.63 ± 0.08	93.6 ± 0.11	93.45 ± 0.13			
4	All - SEMTR	93.58 ± 0.08	93.56 ± 0.14	93.54 ± 0.06			
Ŧ	All - SUPSENSE	$93.67 \pm 0.08 \uparrow$	93.67 ± 0.12	93.56 ± 0.12			
	All - COM	93.67 ± 0.12	93.79 ± 0.14 ↑	93.82 ± 0.05 ↑			
	All - FRAME	93.7 ± 0.09 ↑	93.64 ± 0.11	93.51 ± 0.06			
	All - HYP	93.78 ± 0.12 ↑	93.69 ± 0.05 ↑	93.59 ± 0.07			
	All	93.44 ± 0.09	93.64 ± 0.21	93.7 ± 0.06 ↑			
	Oracle	94.01 ± 0.13	94.07 ± 0.25	93.93 ± 0.16			

Table 6: F1 score tested on the task CHUNK in different training scenarios

Trained with		Tested on XPOS					
		MULTI-DEC	TE⊕D EC	TE⊕ENC			
	XPOS only	95.04 ± 0.06					
	+UPOS	95.01 ± 0.04	94.99 ± 0.03	94.94 ± 0.05			
	+CHUNK	95.1 ± 0.02	$95.21 \pm 0.02 \uparrow$	95.1 ± 0.04			
	+NER	94.98 ± 0.12	95.09 ± 0.07	95.05 ± 0.13			
	+MWE	$94.7 \pm 0.16 \downarrow$	$94.8 \pm 0.08 \downarrow$	$94.66 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$			
ise	+SEM	$94.77 \pm 0.08 \downarrow$	94.82 ± 0.15	94.93 ± 0.08			
Pairwise	+SEMTR	$94.86 \pm 0.02 \downarrow$	$94.8 \pm 0.09 \downarrow$	94.97 ± 0.09			
Pai	+SUPSENSE	94.75 ± 0.15	$94.81 \pm 0.06 \downarrow$	95.0 ± 0.12			
	+COM	$93.19 \pm 0.75 \downarrow$	$93.94 \pm 0.21 \downarrow$	$93.12 \pm 0.44 \downarrow$			
	+FRAME	$94.64 \pm 0.06 \downarrow$	$94.66 \pm 0.05 \downarrow$	$94.55 \pm 0.06 \downarrow$			
	+HYP	$94.46 \pm 0.3 \downarrow$	$94.56 \pm 0.09 \downarrow$	$94.26 \pm 0.18 \downarrow$			
	Average	94.65	94.77	94.66			
	All - UPOS	$94.03 \pm 0.13 \downarrow$	$94.06 \pm 0.09 \downarrow$	94.0 ± 0.26 ↓			
	All - CHUNK	$94.46 \pm 0.09 \downarrow$	$94.29 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$	$94.3 \pm 0.12 \downarrow$			
	All - NER	$94.3 \pm 0.03 \downarrow$	$94.31 \pm 0.02 \downarrow$	$94.25 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$			
ne	All - MWE	$94.45 \pm 0.05 \downarrow$	$94.46 \pm 0.12 \downarrow$	$94.5 \pm 0.09 \downarrow$			
All-but-one	All - SEM	$94.34 \pm 0.09 \downarrow$	$94.41 \pm 0.09 \downarrow$	$94.32 \pm 0.17 \downarrow$			
与	All - SEMTR	$94.35 \pm 0.08 \downarrow$	$94.28 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$	$94.25 \pm 0.12 \downarrow$			
Ŧ	All - SUPSENSE	$94.54 \pm 0.02 \downarrow$	$94.4 \pm 0.08 \downarrow$	$94.27 \pm 0.03 \downarrow$			
	All - COM	$94.69 \pm 0.1 \downarrow$	$94.76 \pm 0.08 \downarrow$	$94.72 \pm 0.06 \downarrow$			
	All - FRAME	$94.57 \pm 0.12 \downarrow$	$94.6 \pm 0.19 \downarrow$	$94.39 \pm 0.08 \downarrow$			
	All - HYP	$94.53 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$	$94.45 \pm 0.1 \downarrow$	$94.45 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$			
	All	94.31 ± 0.15 ↓	94.42 ± 0.07 ↓	94.3 ± 0.2 ↓			
	Oracle	95.04 ± 0.06	95.21 ± 0.02	95.04 ± 0.06			

Table 5: F1 score tested on the task xpos in different training scenarios

E⊕ENC $3 \pm 0.11 \downarrow$ $1 \pm 0.08 \downarrow$ 07 ± 0.16
$1 \pm 0.08 \downarrow 0.06 \pm 0.16$
$1 \pm 0.08 \downarrow 0.06 \pm 0.16$
07 ± 0.16
02 ± 0.36
$9 \pm 0.25 \downarrow$
$9 \pm 0.17 \downarrow$
92 ± 0.16
$5 \pm 0.45 \downarrow$
99 ± 0.32
82 ± 0.31
87.65
8 ± 0.29 ↓
$3 \pm 0.27 \downarrow$
$73 \pm 0.2 \downarrow$
$1\pm0.37\downarrow$
$8 \pm 0.04 \downarrow$
$2 \pm 0.39 \downarrow$
$4 \pm 0.14 \downarrow$
$3 \pm 0.33 \downarrow$
$99 \pm 0.3 \downarrow$
1 ± 0.56 ↓
$0.1 \pm 0.4 \downarrow$

Table 7: F1 score tested on the task NER in different training scenarios

	Trained with	1	Tested on MWE	
		MULTI-DEC	TE⊕DEC	TE⊕ENC
	MWE only		53.07 ± 0.12	
	+UPOS	59.99 ± 0.36 ↑	60.28 ± 0.24 ↑	57.61 ± 0.2 ↑
	+XPOS	58.87 ± 0.78 ↑	60.32 ± 0.3 ↑	58.26 ± 0.25 ↑
	+CHUNK	59.18 ± 0.03 ↑	57.61 ± 1.53 ↑	58.06 ± 0.88 ↑
	+NER	55.4 ± 0.52 ↑	55.17 ± 0.44 ↑	53.4 ± 0.98
se	+SEM	60.16 ± 1.23 ↑	58.21 ± 0.09 ↑	58.62 ± 0.61 ↑
Pairwise	+SEMTR	58.84 ± 1.45 ↑	58.55 ± 0.28 ↑	58.31 ± 2.24 ↑
Pai	+SUPSENSE	58.81 ± 1.01 ↑	58.75 ± 0.33 ↑	58.05 ± 0.72 ↑
	+COM	53.89 ± 1.41	51.72 ± 1.01	51.71 ± 1.05
	+FRAME	53.88 ± 0.76	53.05 ± 1.32	53.3 ± 1.15
	+HYP	53.08 ± 1.72	52.98 ± 1.66	52.59 ± 1.98
	Average	57.21	56.67	55.99
	All - UPOS	61.28 ± 0.78 ↑	60.48 ± 0.93 ↑	59.58 ± 1.14 ↑
	All - XPOS	61.91 ± 1.56 ↑	60.09 ± 0.9 ↑	59.81 ± 0.83 ↑
	All - CHUNK	61.01 ± 1.61 ↑	60.6 ± 1.52 ↑	61.58 ± 1.05 ↑
ne	All - NER	62.69 ± 0.26 ↑	60.48 ± 0.15 ↑	59.05 ± 0.4 ↑
All-but-one	All - SEM	61.17 ± 0.86 ↑	59.94 ± 0.85 ↑	59.47 ± 0.04 ↑
4	All - SEMTR	63.04 ± 0.85 ↑	$61.23 \pm 2.05 \uparrow$	$60.59 \pm 0.59 \uparrow$
Ŧ	All - SUPSENSE	60.51 ± 0.25 ↑	59.11 ± 2.02 ↑	59.25 ± 0.74 ↑
	All - COM	61.95 ± 0.97 ↑	62.02 ± 1.73 ↑	60.63 ± 0.73 ↑
	All - FRAME	62.62 ± 0.85 ↑	60.52 ± 0.47 ↑	61.21 ± 0.99 ↑
	All - HYP	62.04 ± 0.6 ↑	$61.07 \pm 0.51 \uparrow$	61.09 ± 1.06 ↑
	All	61.43 ± 1.94 ↑	61.97 ± 0.5 ↑	59.57 ± 0.64 ↑
	Oracle	62.76 ± 0.63	61.74 ± 1.49	61.92 ± 0.66

Table 8: F1 score tested on the task $\ensuremath{\mathtt{MWE}}$ in different training scenarios

$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	05 ↑ .2 ↑ 13 ↑
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$.2 ↑ 13 ↑
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$.2 ↑ 13 ↑
+CHUNK 74.79 \pm 0.13 \uparrow 74.73 \pm 0.12 \uparrow 74.77 \pm 0. +NER 74.34 \pm 0.08 \uparrow 74.01 \pm 0.05 74.04 \pm 0	13 ↑
+NER $74.34 \pm 0.08 \uparrow$ 74.01 ± 0.05 74.04 ± 0.05	
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	J.U /
$\frac{1}{2}$ +SEM 74.73 ± 0.1 ↑ 74.72 ± 0.14 ↑ 74.41 ± 0. +SUPSENSE 74.61 ± 0.24 ↑ 74.52 ± 0.05 ↑ 74.94 ± 0.	21 ↑
+SUPSENSE $74.61 \pm 0.24 \uparrow$ $74.52 \pm 0.05 \uparrow$ $74.94 \pm 0.$	01 ↑
	22 ↑
+COM 72.6 \pm 0.95 71.76 \pm 0.88 \downarrow 71.35 \pm 0.	95↓
+FRAME 74.18 ± 0.19 74.21 ± 0.37 $74.63 \pm 0.$	11 ↑
+HYP 74.23 ± 0.27 74.19 ± 0.45 74.14 ± 0	
Average 74.38 74.25 74.24	
All - UPOS 73.54 ± 0.54 73.79 ± 0.46 73.66 ± 0.46).97
All - XPOS 74.03 ± 0.11 73.78 ± 0.28 $73.64 \pm 0.$	07 ↓
All - CHUNK 73.97 \pm 0.22 73.36 \pm 0.05 \downarrow 73.65 \pm 0).39
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$.9↓
$\frac{2}{4}$ All - MWE $73.61 \pm 0.2 \downarrow$ 74.04 ± 0.18 73.75 ± 0.09).24
주 All - SEM $71.97 \pm 0.3 \downarrow$ $72.26 \pm 0.28 \downarrow$ $72.21 \pm 0.$	48↓
All - SUPSENSE 73.86 \pm 0.09 73.76 \pm 0.19 73.27 \pm 0	.2↓
All - COM $74.75 \pm 0.22 \uparrow$ $74.92 \pm 0.1 \uparrow$ 75.06 ± 0.1	12 ↑
All - Frame 74.24 ± 0.37 73.9 ± 0.29 73.69 ± 0.29).32
All - HYP 74.02 ± 0.12 74.04 ± 0.17 74.09 ± 0.09	
All $74.26 \pm 0.1 \uparrow 74.36 \pm 0.03 \uparrow 74.35 \pm 0.03 \uparrow$).29
Oracle 75.23 ± 0.06 75.24 ± 0.13 75.09 ± 0.06	

Table 10: F1 score tested on the task SEMTR in different training scenarios

Trained with		Tested on SEM					
		MULTI-DEC	TE⊕D EC	TE⊕ENC			
	SEM only		72.77 ± 0.04				
	+UPOS	73.23 ± 0.06 ↑	$73.17 \pm 0.08 \uparrow$	73.11 ± 0.01 ↑			
	+XPOS	$73.34 \pm 0.12 \uparrow$	$73.21 \pm 0.04 \uparrow$	73.04 ± 0.21			
	+CHUNK	$73.16 \pm 0.05 \uparrow$	$73.02 \pm 0.05 \uparrow$	$73.13 \pm 0.07 \uparrow$			
	+NER	72.88 ± 0.08	72.77 ± 0.19	72.91 ± 0.08			
ise	+MWE	72.75 ± 0.09	72.66 ± 0.18	72.83 ± 0.07			
Pairwise	+SEMTR	$72.5 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$	$72.5 \pm 0.05 \downarrow$	$72.17 \pm 0.06 \downarrow$			
Pai	+SUPSENSE	72.81 ± 0.04	72.71 ± 0.03	$73.09 \pm 0.08 \uparrow$			
	+COM	$70.39 \pm 0.46 \downarrow$	$70.37 \pm 0.28 \downarrow$	$70.18 \pm 0.54 \downarrow$			
	+FRAME	72.76 ± 0.16	$72.26 \pm 0.21 \downarrow$	72.49 ± 0.23			
	+HYP	$72.47 \pm 0.02 \downarrow$	$72.15 \pm 0.1 \downarrow$	71.95 ± 1.22			
	Average	72.63	72.48	72.49			
	All - UPOS	$70.87 \pm 0.19 \downarrow$	$71.08 \pm 0.19 \downarrow$	$70.68 \pm 0.76 \downarrow$			
	All - XPOS	$71.12 \pm 0.1 \downarrow$	$70.98 \pm 0.24 \downarrow$	$70.57 \pm 0.13 \downarrow$			
	All - CHUNK	$71.07 \pm 0.27 \downarrow$	$70.39 \pm 0.39 \downarrow$	$70.78 \pm 0.35 \downarrow$			
All-but-one	All - NER	$70.82 \pm 0.41 \downarrow$	$70.64 \pm 0.15 \downarrow$	$70.58 \pm 0.03 \downarrow$			
7	All - MWE	$71.01 \pm 0.14 \downarrow$	$71.11 \pm 0.17 \downarrow$	$71.12 \pm 0.29 \downarrow$			
-b	All - SEMTR	$69.72 \pm 0.27 \downarrow$	$69.62 \pm 0.37 \downarrow$	$69.86 \pm 0.36 \downarrow$			
₽	All - SUPSENSE	$71.22 \pm 0.29 \downarrow$	$71.02 \pm 0.16 \downarrow$	$70.53 \pm 0.19 \downarrow$			
	All - COM	$72.38 \pm 0.08 \downarrow$	$72.32 \pm 0.23 \downarrow$	$72.38 \pm 0.17 \downarrow$			
	All - FRAME	$71.48 \pm 0.51 \downarrow$	$71.11 \pm 0.16 \downarrow$	$70.78 \pm 0.44 \downarrow$			
	All - HYP	$71.22 \pm 0.25 \downarrow$	$71.22 \pm 0.33 \downarrow$	$71.03 \pm 0.07 \downarrow$			
	All	$71.53 \pm 0.28 \downarrow$	$71.72 \pm 0.21 \downarrow$	$71.58 \pm 0.24 \downarrow$			
	Oracle	73.32 ± 0.04	73.1 ± 0.03	73.14 ± 0.06			

Table 9: F1 score tested on the task sem in different training scenarios

Trained with | Tested on SUPSENSE

,	Trained with	Tested on SUPSENSE				
		MULTI-DEC	TE⊕DEC	TE⊕ENC		
SU	JPSENSE only	66.81 ± 0.22				
	+UPOS	68.25 ± 0.42 ↑	67.8 ± 0.29 ↑	67.76 ± 0.14 ↑		
	+XPOS	67.78 ± 0.4 ↑	68.3 ± 0.71 ↑	$67.77 \pm 0.15 \uparrow$		
	+CHUNK	67.39 ± 0.15 ↑	67.29 ± 0.33	67.36 ± 0.29		
	+NER	68.06 ± 0.16 ↑	67.25 ± 0.21	$67.57 \pm 0.27 \uparrow$		
Pairwise	+MWE	66.88 ± 0.14	66.88 ± 0.24	66.26 ± 0.9		
Ž	+SEM	68.29 ± 0.21 ↑	68.46 ± 0.38 ↑	$68.1 \pm 0.59 \uparrow$		
Pai	+SEMTR	68.6 ± 0.81 ↑	68.18 ± 0.39 ↑	67.64 ± 0.92		
	+COM	$65.57 \pm 0.17 \downarrow$	$64.98 \pm 0.34 \downarrow$	$65.55 \pm 0.18 \downarrow$		
	+FRAME	66.59 ± 0.07	$66.2 \pm 0.16 \downarrow$	66.75 ± 0.22		
	+HYP	66.47 ± 0.24	66.52 ± 0.59	66.16 ± 0.43		
	Average	67.39	67.19	67.09		
	All - UPOS	68.27 ± 0.33 ↑	68.1 ± 0.28 ↑	68.19 ± 0.55 ↑		
	All - XPOS	67.99 ± 0.5 ↑	67.9 ± 0.54	$68.47 \pm 0.18 \uparrow$		
	All - CHUNK	$68.26 \pm 0.48 \uparrow$	$68.07 \pm 0.28 \uparrow$	$67.87 \pm 0.32 \uparrow$		
All-but-one	All - NER	68.16 ± 0.26 ↑	67.51 ± 0.4	$67.95 \pm 0.24 \uparrow$		
7	All - MWE	68.18 ± 0.62 ↑	67.38 ± 0.22	$69.0 \pm 0.45 \uparrow$		
ᅾ	All - SEM	67.36 ± 0.42	67.35 ± 0.18	$67.77 \pm 0.28 \uparrow$		
₽	All - SEMTR	$68.17 \pm 0.15 \uparrow$	$68.16 \pm 0.47 \uparrow$	67.96 ± 0.73		
	All - COM	$68.67 \pm 0.37 \uparrow$	67.62 ± 0.6	$67.94 \pm 0.22 \uparrow$		
	All - FRAME	68.47 ± 0.72 ↑	67.69 ± 0.95	$68.13 \pm 0.39 \uparrow$		
	All - HYP	68.46 ± 0.37 ↑	68.32 ± 0.18 ↑	68.17 ± 0.36 ↑		
	All	68.1 ± 0.54 ↑	67.98 ± 0.29 ↑	68.02 ± 0.21 ↑		
	Oracle	68.53 ± 0.09	68.22 ± 0.61	69.04 ± 0.44		

Table 11: F1 score tested on the task Supsense in different training scenarios

Trained with		Tested on COM					
		MULTI-DEC	TE⊕DEC	TE⊕Enc			
	COM only	72.71 ± 0.75					
	+UPOS	72.46 ± 0.34	72.86 ± 0.12	72.09 ± 0.36			
	+XPOS	72.83 ± 0.16	72.87 ± 0.56	72.41 ± 0.51			
	+CHUNK	72.44 ± 0.11	73.3 ± 0.15	72.88 ± 0.26			
	+NER	70.93 ± 0.73	$71.08 \pm 0.31 \downarrow$	$70.78 \pm 0.27 \downarrow$			
se	+MWE	71.31 ± 0.31	$70.93 \pm 0.43 \downarrow$	71.36 ± 0.42			
2	+SEM	72.72 ± 0.22	73.14 ± 0.08	72.25 ± 0.07			
Pairwise	+SEMTR	71.96 ± 0.16	71.74 ± 0.46	72.15 ± 0.5			
	+SUPSENSE	72.24 ± 0.27	$69.13 \pm 0.19 \downarrow$	72.12 ± 0.66			
	+FRAME	72.47 ± 0.08	72.89 ± 0.22	72.1 ± 0.93			
	+HYP	71.82 ± 0.97	70.47 ± 0.81	72.79 ± 0.97			
	Average	72.12	71.84	72.09			
	All - UPOS	74.42 ± 0.24 ↑	74.69 ± 0.26 ↑	74.07 ± 0.19			
	All - XPOS	$74.36 \pm 0.14 \uparrow$	74.26 ± 0.64	73.94 ± 0.3			
	All - CHUNK	74.2 ± 0.13 ↑	$74.47 \pm 0.26 \uparrow$	73.67 ± 0.23			
ne	All - NER	$74.08 \pm 0.07 \uparrow$	$74.49 \pm 0.38 \uparrow$	74.16 ± 0.48			
All-but-one	All - MWE	$74.7 \pm 0.14 \uparrow$	$74.49 \pm 0.13 \uparrow$	$74.28 \pm 0.16 \uparrow$			
후	All - SEM	74.31 ± 0.1 ↑	74.34 ± 0.42	74.2 ± 0.28			
₹	All - SEMTR	74.2 ± 0.24 ↑	74.36 ± 0.36	73.81 ± 0.16			
	All - SUPSENSE	74.24 ± 0.44	74.69 ± 0.52 ↑	74.3 ± 0.13 ↑			
	All - FRAME	75.03 ± 0.24 ↑	74.49 ± 0.2 ↑	74.3 ± 0.19 ↑			
	All - HYP	$74.62 \pm 0.14 \uparrow$	74.4 ± 0.06 ↑	73.78 ± 0.05			
	All	74.54 ± 0.53	74.61 ± 0.24 ↑	74.61 ± 0.32 ↑			
	Oracle	72.71 ± 0.75	72.71 ± 0.75	72.71 ± 0.75			

Table 12: F1 score tested on the task com in different training scenarios

Trained with Tested on HYP

S

$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c } \hline & MULTI-DEC & TE \oplus DEC \\ \hline \hline & 46.73 \pm 0.55 \\ \hline \\ + UPOS & 48.02 \pm 0.31 & 49.36 \pm 0.36 \uparrow & 48.27 \pm \\ + XPOS & 48.81 \pm 0.36 \uparrow & 49.23 \pm 0.55 \uparrow & 48.06 \pm 0 \\ + CHUNK & 47.85 \pm 0.2 \uparrow & 48.43 \pm 0.3 \uparrow & 47.13 \pm \\ + NER & 47.9 \pm 0.67 & 48.24 \pm 0.65 & 48.64 \pm \\ \hline & + MWE & 47.32 \pm 0.29 & 45.83 \pm 0.46 & 46.71 \pm \\ \hline & + SEM & 48.15 \pm 0.21 \uparrow & 47.95 \pm 0.75 & 47.12 \pm \\ \hline & + SEMTR & 47.74 \pm 0.57 & 46.96 \pm 0.85 & 46.1 \pm 1 \\ \hline \end{array} $	0.68 .02 ↑ 0.35 1.17 0.64 0.43
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$.02 ↑ 0.35 1.17 0.64 0.43
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$.02 ↑ 0.35 1.17 0.64 0.43
+CHUNK $47.85 \pm 0.2 \uparrow$ $48.43 \pm 0.3 \uparrow$ $47.13 \pm$ +NER 47.9 ± 0.67 48.24 ± 0.65 $48.64 \pm$	0.35 1.17 0.64 0.43 0.11
+NER 47.9 ± 0.67 48.24 ± 0.65 $48.64 \pm$	1.17 0.64 0.43 0.11
	0.64 0.43 0.11
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	0.43 0.11
\geq +SEM $ 48.15 \pm 0.21 \uparrow 47.95 \pm 0.75 47.12 \pm $	0.11
+SEMTR 47.74 ± 0.57 46.96 ± 0.85 46.1 ± 0.00	
+SUPSENSE $49.23 \pm 0.13 \uparrow 47.29 \pm 0.41 47.24 \pm$	0.43
+COM 47.41 \pm 1.18 45.24 \pm 0.46 47.81 \pm	0.8
+FRAME 47.5 ± 0.46 46.0 ± 0.53 $46.66 \pm$	
Average 47.99 47.45 47.33	/
All - UPOS $51.13 \pm 0.94 \uparrow$ $50.83 \pm 0.65 \uparrow$ $50.23 \pm 0.65 \uparrow$.73 ↑
All - xpos $51.65 \pm 0.63 \uparrow$ $50.6 \pm 0.44 \uparrow$ 50.39 ± 1	
All - Chunk $50.27 \pm 0.76 \uparrow$ $51.1 \pm 0.28 \uparrow$ $50.18 \pm 0.08 \uparrow$.81 ↑
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$.38 ↑
2 All - MWE $50.83 \pm 0.61 \uparrow$ $50.5 \pm 0.9 \uparrow$ $49.81 \pm 0.00 \uparrow$.44 ↑
주 All - SEM 50.93 ± 0.27 ↑ 50.48 ± 0.53 ↑ 50.15 ± 0	.11 ↑
All - SEMTR $51.27 \pm 0.5 \uparrow$ $51.5 \pm 0.46 \uparrow$ $51.72 \pm 0.46 \uparrow$.15 ↑
All - SUPSENSE $ 50.86 \pm 1.85 \uparrow 51.96 \pm 0.29 \uparrow 50.01 \pm 1$.13 ↑
All - COM $50.28 \pm 1.02 \uparrow$ $50.0 \pm 0.11 \uparrow$ $48.77 \pm 0.01 \uparrow$.54 ↑
All - Frame $50.89 \pm 0.64 \uparrow$ $51.23 \pm 1.01 \uparrow$ $50.35 \pm 0.00 \uparrow$	
All $51.41 \pm 0.25 \uparrow$ $51.31 \pm 0.55 \uparrow$ $49.5 \pm 0.65 \uparrow$	
Oracle 50.0 ± 0.42 50.15 ± 0.25 $48.06 \pm$	0.02

Table 14: F1 score tested on the task HYP in different training scenarios

Trained with		Tested on FRAME			
		MULTI-DEC	TE⊕D EC	TE⊕E NC	
FRAME only		62.04 ± 0.74			
Pairwise	+UPOS	62.14 ± 0.35	61.54 ± 0.53	62.27 ± 0.33	
	+XPOS	60.77 ± 0.39	61.44 ± 0.06	61.62 ± 1.01	
	+CHUNK	62.67 ± 0.47	61.39 ± 0.78	62.98 ± 0.5	
	+NER	62.39 ± 0.37	$59.25 \pm 0.52 \downarrow$	63.02 ± 0.39	
	+MWE	61.75 ± 0.21	56.77 ± 2.79	60.61 ± 0.91	
	+SEM	61.74 ± 0.27	$60.09 \pm 0.48 \downarrow$	62.17 ± 0.36	
	+SEMTR	62.03 ± 0.41	59.77 ± 0.81	62.79 ± 0.19	
	+SUPSENSE	61.94 ± 0.43	$55.68 \pm 0.61 \downarrow$	61.96 ± 0.18	
	+COM	$56.52 \pm 0.27 \downarrow$	$55.25 \pm 2.29 \downarrow$	57.65 ± 2.42	
	+HYP	61.02 ± 0.62	$55.35 \pm 0.5 \downarrow$	61.14 ± 1.77	
	Average	61.3	58.65	61.62	
All-but-one	All - UPOS	$58.47 \pm 1.0 \downarrow$	$58.32 \pm 0.35 \downarrow$	$60.51 \pm 0.1 \downarrow$	
	All - XPOS	$60.16 \pm 0.42 \downarrow$	$58.31 \pm 0.8 \downarrow$	60.13 ± 1.38	
	All - CHUNK	60.01 ± 0.65	$58.73 \pm 0.68 \downarrow$	61.73 ± 0.48	
	All - NER	$59.17 \pm 0.27 \downarrow$	$58.19 \pm 0.89 \downarrow$	$59.96 \pm 0.52 \downarrow$	
	All - MWE	$59.23 \pm 0.33 \downarrow$	$57.6 \pm 0.82 \downarrow$	61.51 ± 0.43	
	All - SEM	$58.73 \pm 0.67 \downarrow$	$59.08 \pm 0.84 \downarrow$	61.76 ± 0.52	
	All - SEMTR	$59.49 \pm 0.79 \downarrow$	$58.85 \pm 0.51 \downarrow$	61.31 ± 1.16	
	All - SUPSENSE	$59.23 \pm 0.64 \downarrow$	$58.28 \pm 0.19 \downarrow$	59.98 ± 1.23	
	All - COM	62.37 ± 0.37	60.72 ± 0.73	63.55 ± 0.31	
	All - HYP	$59.69 \pm 0.41 \downarrow$	$58.55 \pm 0.29 \downarrow$	61.91 ± 0.59	
All		59.71 ± 0.85	$58.14 \pm 0.23 \downarrow$	61.83 ± 0.98	
Oracle		62.04 ± 0.74	62.04 ± 0.74	62.04 ± 0.74	

Table 13: F1 score tested on the task FRAME in different training scenarios