

# Review stages

## Table of contents

Title review stage .....	1
Abstract review stage .....	4
Reading stage .....	7
Data extraction .....	7
Writing stage .....	7
Bibliography .....	7

## Title review stage

During the first stage of the reviewing, we only looked at titles. Below is the code to extract the titles we each individually reviewed, so we can show some details about how many were included, excluded, and which titles we agreed on or disagreed on.

In the title screening stage, the number of titles we kept are listed in Table 1.

```
targets::tar_read(titles_kept) |>
  map(\(df) count(df, name = "Articles
kept")) |>
  list_rbind(names_to = "Reviewers") |>
  # TODO: Include percent of total
  articles.
knitr::kable()
```

Table 1: Number of articles each reviewer kept after the first screening of the titles.

Reviewers	Articles kept
Daniel	75
Mario	161
Luke	53

We want to know how many of these titles we all agreed on between the three reviewers:

```
common_titles <-
targets::tar_read(titles_agreed_on)
```

We seemed to agree on 24 titles, with the full title list shown in Table 2.

```
common_titles |>
  select("Article title" = title) |>
  knitr::kable()
```

Table 2: The 24 article titles we all agreed on and kept during the title screening stage.

Article title
UKRN ORCC Primer on Working in Open Research
Accelerating addiction research via Open Science and Team Science
The State of Open Science Practices in Psychometric Studies of Suicide: A Systematic Review
Eleven Strategies for Making Reproducible Research and Open Science Training the Norm at Research Institutions
Biomedical supervisors' role modeling of open science practices
Exploring Open Science Practices in Behavioural Public Policy Research
UKRN Open Research Training Resources and Priorities Working Paper
(Why) Are Open Research Practices the Future for the Study of Language Learning?
Inclusive, open, and reproducible developmental science
Modernizing authorship criteria and transparency practices to facilitate honest, open, and equitable team science
The potential of inclusive and collaborative Open Research processes at the science-policy interface
Knowledge and practices of open science among scholars and researchers in Tanzania
Reducing Barriers to Open Science by Standardizing Practices and Realigning Incentives
Open and reproducible neuroimaging: From study inception to publication
Reducing barriers to open science by standardizing practices and realigning incentives
Lessons Learned: A Neuroimaging Research Center's Transition to Open and Reproducible Science
Ten strategies to foster open science in psychology and beyond
Open and reproducible practices in developmental psychology research: The workflow of the WomCogDev lab as an example
Open and reproducible science practices in psychology research: new opportunities to foster significant progress
Contributions to Open projects in the Design Field

One person will review the titles and flag any paper that might be relevant but are not in agreement to keep.

```
targets::tar_read(titles_disagreed_on) |
>
  select("Article titles" = title) |>
  knitr::kable()
```

Table 3: Article titles **not** kept between all reviewers during the title screening stage.

Article titles
Using open and collaborative data to improve the Brazilian topographic mapping in protected areas
Special Issue: Open, Digital, Collaborative Project Preservation in the Humanities
How Openness Could Strengthen Academia's Partnerships with the Intelligence Community
Open Source Software in the Public Sector: 25 Years and Still in Its Infancy
Open sharing of government data and enterprise decision making
Open-Source Software –Benefits and Drawbacks
What knowledge does ChatGPT have regarding open science, and can it provide good advice about it?
Wide open? Creative industries and open strategizing challenges
Open Institute of the African BioGenome Project: Bridging the gap in African biodiversity genomics and bioinformatics
Regional Open Science Dialogue in Southern Africa
Open science in health psychology and behavioral medicine: A statement from the Behavioral Medicine Research Council.
Towards Reproducible and Respectful Autism Research: Combining Open and Participatory Autism Research Practices
Open Data and transparency in artificial intelligence and machine learning: A new era of research
Accelerating Social Science Knowledge Production with the Coordinated Open-Source Model
Response to responsible research assessment I and II from the perspective of the DGPs working group on open science in clinical psychology
A Review on the Use of Open Source Technologies and Soft-Ware Applied to Precision Agriculture Practices
'Conditional Acceptance' (additional experiments required): A scoping review of recent evidence on key aspects of Open Peer Review
Supporting Open Science with frictionless publication workflows: the Tree of Life project as well come Open Research
Open Science on Education Practices, Production

We saved a new csv file with all the disagreements and then made a copy of that list in the file resolved.csv. This file contains some titles that we disagreed on but that were briefly reviewed by one reviewer, discussed, and included in the end.

The titles we agreed on were:

```
targets::tar_read(titles_resolved_path)
|>
  read_csv() |>
  select("Article title" = title) |>
  knitr::kable()
```

Article title
Special Issue: Open, Digital, Collaborative Project Preservation in the Humanities
Coopetition as a driver of success for community initiatives in open research
Open and collaborative tools for disaster management and risk reduction
Promoting FAIR Data Through Community-driven Agile Design: the Open Data Commons for Spinal Cord Injury (odc-sci.org)
Collaboration and Open Science Initiatives in Primate Research
The Pandemic as a Portal: Reimagining Psychological Science as Truly Open and Inclusive
Collaborative open science as a way to reproducibility and new insights in primate cognition research
Agile Mechanisms for Open Data Process Innovation in Public Sector Organizations
Open Communitition

The final list of titles we selected, between the agreed on ones as well as the resolved ones, are:

```
targets::tar_read(titles_selected) |>
  select("Article title" = title) |>
  knitr::kable()
```

Article title
UKRN ORCC Primer on Working in Open Research
Accelerating addiction research via Open Science and Team Science

Article title
The State of Open Science Practices in Psychometric Studies of Suicide: A Systematic Review
Eleven Strategies for Making Reproducible Research and Open Science Training the Norm at Research Institutions
Biomedical supervisors' role modeling of open science practices
Exploring Open Science Practices in Behavioural Public Policy Research
UKRN Open Research Training Resources and Priorities Working Paper
(Why) Are Open Research Practices the Future for the Study of Language Learning?
Inclusive, open, and reproducible developmental science
Modernizing authorship criteria and transparency practices to facilitate honest, open, and equitable team science
The potential of inclusive and collaborative Open Research processes at the science-policy interface
Knowledge and practices of open science among scholars and researchers in Tanzania
Reducing Barriers to Open Science by Standardizing Practices and Realigning Incentives
Open and reproducible neuroimaging: From study inception to publication
Reducing barriers to open science by standardizing practices and realigning incentives
Lessons Learned: A Neuroimaging Research Center's Transition to Open and Reproducible Science
Ten strategies to foster open science in psychology and beyond
Open and reproducible practices in developmental psychology research: The workflow of the WomCogDev lab as an example
Open and reproducible science practices in psychoneuroendocrinology: opportunities to foster scientific progress
Performing Open Science Culture
No Better Time to Practice Open Science Than Now

Article title
Ten simple rules for helping newcomers become contributors to open projects
Privacy, Anonymity, and Perceived Risk in Open Collaboration
Open Source, Collaboration, and Access: A Critical Analysis of "Openness" in the Design Field
Special Issue: Open, Digital, Collaborative Project Preservation in the Humanities
Coopetition as a driver of success for community initiatives in open research
Open and collaborative tools for disaster management and risk reduction
Promoting FAIR Data Through Community-driven Agile Design: the Open Data Commons for Spinal Cord Injury (odc-sci.org)
Collaboration and Open Science Initiatives in Primate Research
The Pandemic as a Portal: Reimagining Psychological Science as Truly Open and Inclusive
Collaborative open science as a way to reproducibility and new insights in primate cognition research
Agile Mechanisms for Open Data Process Innovation in Public Sector Organizations
Open Communitition

## Abstract review stage

- all will review the abstracts of the included papers
- this will create our final list of included papers

The second phase of the review is looking over the abstracts. In Table 4 below are the number of articles each reviewer kept after this second screening.

```
targets::tar_read(abstracts_kept) |>
  map(\(df) count(df, name = "Articles
kept")) |>
  list_rbind(names_to = "Reviewers") |>
  # TODO: Include percent of total
  articles.
knitr::kable()
```

Table 4: Number of articles each reviewer kept after the second screening of the articles.

Reviewers	Articles kept
Daniel	20
Mario	19
Luke	14

Based on the abstract review, we want to know how many of these titles we all agreed on between the three reviewers:

```
common_abstracts
targets::tar_read(abstracts_agreed_on) <-
```

We seemed to agree on 10 abstracts, with the full article list shown in Table 5.

```
targets::tar_read(abstracts_agreed_on) |
>
  select("Article titles" = title) |>
  knitr::kable()
```

Table 5: The 10 article abstracts we all agreed on and kept during the abstract screening stage.

#### Article titles

Open and reproducible neuroimaging: From study inception to publication

Ten simple rules for helping newcomers become contributors to open projects

Collaborative open science as a way to reproducibility and new insights in primate cognition research

UKRN Open Research Training Resources and Priorities Working Paper

Eleven Strategies for Making Reproducible Research and Open Science Training the Norm at Research Institutions

Open and reproducible practices in developmental psychology research: The workflow of the WomCogDev lab as an example

UKRN ORCC Primer on Working in Open Research

Open and collaborative tools for disaster management and risk reduction

Ten strategies to foster open science in psychology and beyond

Lessons Learned: A Neuroimaging Research Center's Transition to Open and Reproducible Science

One person will review the titles and flag any paper that might be relevant but are not in agreement to keep.

```
targets::tar_read(abstracts_disagreed_on)
|>
  select("Article titles" = title) |>
  knitr::kable()
```

Table 6: Article abstracts **not** kept between all reviewers during the title screening stage.

Article titles
Privacy, Anonymity, and Perceived Risk in Open Collaboration
The potential of inclusive and collaborative Open Research processes at the science-policy interface
Exploring Open Science Practices in Behavioural Public Policy Research
Open Source, Collaboration, and Access: A Critical Analysis of “Openness” in the Design Field
Collaboration and Open Science Initiatives in Primate Research
Reducing barriers to open science by standardizing practices and realigning incentives
Knowledge and practices of open science among scholars and researchers in Tanzania
Coopetition as a driver of success for community initiatives in open research
Reducing Barriers to Open Science by Standardizing Practices and Realigning Incentives
Open Communitition
Collaboration and Open Science Initiatives in Primate Research
(Why) Are Open Research Practices the Future for the Study of Language Learning?
Accelerating addiction research via Open Science and Team Science
Special Issue: Open, Digital, Collaborative Project Preservation in the Humanities
Open and reproducible science practices in psychoneuroendocrinology: opportunities to foster scientific progress
Performing Open Science Culture
Promoting FAIR Data Through Community-driven Agile Design: the Open Data Commons for Spinal Cord Injury (odc-sci.org)
The State of Open Science Practices in Psychometric Studies of Suicide: A Systematic Review

Like with the title review, we saved a new csv file with all the disagreements and then made a copy of that list in the file `resolved.csv`. This file contains some articles that we disagreed on but that were

briefly reviewed by one reviewer, discussed, and included in the end.

The abstracts we agreed on were:

```
targets::tar_read(abstracts_resolved_path)
|>
  read_abstract_yaml() |>
  select("Article title" = title) |>
  knitr::kable()
```

#### Article title

Collaboration and Open Science Initiatives in Primate Research

Accelerating addiction research via Open Science and Team Science

Promoting FAIR Data Through Community-driven Agile Design: the Open Data Commons for Spinal Cord Injury (odc-sci.org)

The final list of titles we selected, between the agreed on ones as well as the resolved ones, are:

```
targets::tar_read(abstracts_selected) |>
  select("Article title" = title) |>
  knitr::kable()
```

#### Article title

Open and reproducible neuroimaging: From study inception to publication

Ten simple rules for helping newcomers become contributors to open projects

Collaborative open science as a way to reproducibility and new insights in primate cognition research

UKRN Open Research Training Resources and Priorities Working Paper

Eleven Strategies for Making Reproducible Research and Open Science Training the Norm at Research Institutions

Open and reproducible practices in developmental psychology research: The workflow of the WomCogDev lab as an example

UKRN ORCC Primer on Working in Open Research

Open and collaborative tools for disaster management and risk reduction

## Article title

---

Ten strategies to foster open science in psychology and beyond

Lessons Learned: A Neuroimaging Research Center's Transition to Open and Reproducible Science

Collaboration and Open Science Initiatives in Primate Research

Accelerating addiction research via Open Science and Team Science

Promoting FAIR Data Through Community-driven Agile Design: the Open Data Commons for Spinal Cord Injury ([odc-sci.org](http://odc-sci.org))

## Reading stage

- first skimming the papers and group by themes, writing a basic free-hand summary
- then read a few papers from each theme to decide on what information to extract
- then discuss together the themes to group by and information to extract

## Data extraction

- we make a data extraction template
- extract data and read the papers

## Writing stage

- how to visualize?

## Bibliography