

Arab Women, Social Media, and the Arab Spring: Applying the framework of digital reflexivity to analyze gender and online activism

By Victoria A. Newsom¹ and Lara Lengel²

Abstract

This essay analyzes the engagement of Arab feminist activisms online, most notably during the citizen revolutions in Tunisia and Egypt, and, specifically, women's use of online social networking to aid social change. Building on research examining how Arab activists and activist organizations, including feminist organizations, mobilize, produce knowledge, and develop and share resources online and, in particular, drawing from research on Arab activisms and social media this study aims to understand how online activist discourses function, both locally and globally. To do so, we utilize a schema of information production and consumption devised to analyze activist engagement and citizen journalism, particularly the negotiation of communication messages by various agents through multiple stages of transmission and dissemination (Newsom, Lengel, & Cassara, C, 2011). We look at the ideal of local knowledge as it is transformed into global knowledge, and how the messages are open to manipulation and bias through the various stages of mediation and gatekeeping cited in the framework. Through the application of this framework, we can see how gendered messages are constructed, essentialized, reconstructed, and made invisible by the consumer media system.

Keywords: Arab countries, History, Arab Spring Uprisings, 2011, Activism; Democracy; Feminism; Online social networks; Tunisia; Egypt; Protest movements; Symbolic Interactionism; Revolution, Social Media, Social conditions

Introduction

Sahar Khamis (2011) argues, "The prolific online and offline political activities of Arab women over the last several months have contributed a new chapter to the history of both Arab feminism and the region" (p 748). Building on research examining how Arab activists and activist organizations, including feminist organizations, mobilize, produce knowledge, and develop and share resources online (see, for instance, Al Jaber, 2009; Alkhailifa, 2008; Danitz & Strobel, 1999; Fandy, 1999; Faris, 2008a; Faris, 2008b; Earl & Kimport, 2008; Illia, 2003; Jansen, 2010; Tatarchevskiy, 2011; Vegh, 2003; Wheeler, 2009) and, in particular, research on Arab activisms and social media (Eltantawy & Wies, 2011; Jansen, 2010; Lotan, et al., 2011), this study aims to understand how online activist discourses function, both locally and globally.

International focus on the Arab world has increased during the "Arab Spring," and recognition of individual women's involvement in the conflicts and demonstrations has risen (Khamis, 2011; Marzouki, 2011). Yet, simultaneously, both traditional and social media cite the absence of gendered revolution or gender-based social change. (UPF Office of Peace and

¹ Professor, Department of Communication Studies, Social Sciences and Humanities Division, Olympic College.
Email: vnewsom@olympic.edu

² Professor, Department of Communication, School of Media and Communication, Bowling Green State University.
Email: lengell@bgsu.edu

Security Affairs, 2012, February 12). We hope to interrogate mediated discourses of women's roles in the Arab Spring based on what Lila Abu-Lughod and Rabab El-Mahdi (2011) assert are "Orientalist understandings of Arab and Muslim women" (p. 683).

To do so, we utilize a schema for what we call *digital reflexivity* (Newsom & Lengel, forthcoming) to analyze the information production and consumption devised to analyze activist engagement and citizen journalism, particularly the negotiation of communication messages by various agents through multiple stages of transmission and dissemination (Newsom, Lengel, & Cassara, 2011). We look at the ideal of local knowledge as it is transformed into global knowledge, and how the messages are open to manipulation and bias through the various stages of mediation and gatekeeping cited in the framework. We argue that the processes of digital reflexivity restrict the message flow from local to global audiences by encouraging the alteration of the initial activist message to fit global needs and values. While messages have always been construed to reach particular audiences, the speed with which digital media transmits current messages, and the treatment of social media messages as "organic" and "native" by contemporary professional news sources distorts recognition of those persuasive and propaganda techniques utilized, thus restricting and containing the empowering potential of activist voices. Hence, the BBC claims that "Facebook Changed the World" by becoming a tool for the "Arab Spring," laying the focus of that message on the global media form, while minimizing and even silencing the powerful voices of Arab activists themselves.

Through the application of this framework, we can see how gendered messages are constructed, essentialized, reconstructed, and made invisible by western corporate media. We see how these messages function as a form of contained empowerment, functioning within their initial social media and localized spaces but losing power as they are translated into the global stage. We see how the processes of digital reflexivity, whereby the messages themselves become reflections of the media forms they exist within as the constant copying and recopying of the messages distorts and blurs their impact. And we can see how this plays into the conflict between the mediated representations of the empowering roles of women during the social changes happening in the Arab world and the absence of gender-based social change.

Locating Online Activism

Online activism, while often tied to offline activist organizations and efforts, differs from conventional activism in several key ways. Online activism affords opportunities for issue-focused efforts that allow activists to identify with and support specific efforts, for promotion of goals and activities that can reach further and more quickly than is the case with traditional activism, potentially reaching beyond its contained status. In addition, online activism occurs in a liminal "third space", a place where traditional rules governing society can be set aside (New Media Consortium, 2007). Rooted in theories of space as constructed by the material needs of its inhabitants, the concept of the third space assumes that space is not empty, socially defined by the contrast between what is experienced in them and what can be imagined for them (Bhabha, 1990; de Certeau, 1984; Lefebvre, 1991; Soja, 1996).

Building on this concept, this study locates the online activist third space between the concepts and experiences of power, revealing a space of contained empowerment, specifically in the context of women's role and agency in the revolutions in Tunisia, December, 2010 – January, 2011 and Egypt, January - February 2011. The essay is part of a larger research program on civil society and communication technology in North Africa. Specifically, it examines women's use of online social networking to aid social change in these countries. To

interrogate the impact of the revolutions on enhancing gender equality we draw upon extensive field research in Tunisia, collaboration with North African women colleagues, and participant-observation during technology-focused events in the region, most notably the UN World Summit on the Information Society in Tunis. The study also employs discourse analysis to analyze online spaces created specifically for political engagement and agency, and for challenging hegemonic and patriarchal norms and political oppression.

Online activism provides the potential for empowerment to marginalized voices, provides the opportunity for cross-boundary dialogue, and provides an impetus for social change. Online feminist activist spaces attempt to provide the possibility for enacting the ideas of gendered dialogue. Therefore, online feminist activist spaces are an excellent starting point to build a discussion of gendered identity and dialogue online. However, with the relatively low internet penetration in the Middle East and North Africa, online populations consist mostly of women academics and other privileged women. In addition, up until the demise of the Ben Ali and Mubarek regimes citizens self-censored and silenced public political discourse. Such self-silencing occurred more intensively in Tunisia under Ben Ali's rule (Lengel, 2004) and its "harsh offline oppression" (Jansen, 2010, p. 37).

Therefore, we question whether these spaces can in fact provide voice to marginalized persons, or if they are re-creating digital, gender, and political divides. We suggest they are simultaneously empowering and restrained by hegemony, that they provide an impetus if not the means for altering hegemony. As media perpetuates stories, it copies itself in such a way that the content becomes watered down, altered, and taken out of context.

How local voices are reconstructed for global audiences

Online activism at its ideal best is a tool to generate an increase of knowledge about social reform topics, and to engender a positive response toward the reform goals by an increasing audience. However, local knowledge presented as online activism is self-containing if an awareness of a social reform need is a prerequisite to exposure. To break this cycle, local voices must reach an audience outside of their normal range. The "citizen journalism" and other related efforts evident in Arab Spring activism have been reconstructed and re-created by global institutions and power brokers that act as gatekeepers of information flow so that the message can reach a wide audience. To better understand how this process works, the authors constructed a framework (Newsom, Lengel, & Cassara, 2011) that highlights the stages of information flow required. In the framework, first, individuals speak out. Second, resistance leaders may reframe individual voices to suit their needs. Resistance rhetoric is then disseminated into the local area. Next, government may access the resistance rhetoric, reframing or erasing it to their needs. Reframed rhetoric may then be disseminated on a larger scale. Then, the West receives rhetoric and reframes it to suit itself. The framework was designed to determine the movement of information through digital and social media, and how the messages must be negotiated and manipulated at each stage.

Adding a gender component to this framework for this study complicates the process of message production and consumption further, because the Web itself reflects a gendered nature, and, moreover, individual web sites have taken on gendered performances. The technology of the web carries a number of patriarchal and male connotations that function as gatekeeping barriers for information flow at each level of the process. In this study, we look at how these barriers restrict the possibilities of gender-based reform while they encourage other social reform efforts in the Arab Spring.

In the framework of the stages of information flow, first we analyze individual voices speaking out. Many Arab women who became active in the recent uprisings and protests were active as part of a group effort, not uncommon in that area of the world. The concerns voiced by the groups were issues of democratic reform, calls to gain the right for free and open elections, and attacks upon long-held dictatorships. These political issues were themselves not focused on gendered rights. Issues of gender equality in the Arab Spring were largely contained to Tahrir Square in Cairo and to the various Tunisian cities where street protests occurred during the protests in Egypt and Tunisia.

At the second stage of the framework, individual voices may be reframed to suit the needs of others and other organizations. This stage is of particular interest when analyzing gender differences in the Arab World. Such analysis, generally, and the understanding of Arab women and their use of social media in the Tunisian and Egyptian revolutions, specifically, presents considerable challenges. Mazrui and Mazrui note "Muslim societies have assumed that there were two different doors of knowledge, one for each gender" (p. 54). They argue "individual Muslim men and women are real actors in the information revolution and not merely objects, and that they are producers of knowledge and not merely consumers of knowledge" (p. 55). Also, the many ways in which gender is understood cannot be underestimated. As socially constructed local ideologies of gender are enacted as "normalized" dichotomized male and female performances are presented as natural and salutary rather than artificial and prescriptive (Lengel & Martin, 2010). Foucault (1980) warns of the limitations of negotiating power as a binary opposition of "present" (in the case of the presence of male power and, most notably to this study, the "maleness" inherent in traditionally patriarchal cultures) or "absent" (the disempowered Arab woman) (Bhabha, 2002; Gedalof, 1999; Schroven, 2006). Intersections of gender, agency, power, and activism create even greater disparities, as discussed by Mohanty (1988; 2003), who argues Western feminisms view third world women as victims to be rescued by Western values and feminist motives. Basarudin (2002) suggests "there is an urgent need for a cross-cultural dialogue between Western and Arab feminisms in order to create space that allows differences to be recognized and examined, and crafting a meeting point for women to relate across their differences" (p. 62).

Resistance rhetoric in practice: The case of *lijan sha'abiyya* (popular committees)

Local knowledge, once it is presented to a larger audience, becomes a target for appropriation. There are several reasons why this occurs. First, local knowledge is predominantly temporal, thus its recognition and acceptance is not often clear outside of the original locality until it is restructured and represented to enhance meaning for a larger audience. Second, the aspects of local knowledge and local activism that are deemed significant within a larger world view are often separated from their initial contexts, thus separated from other aspects not deemed as significant outside of their original circumstance. Still another reason for the appropriation of local knowledge is the ability to apply the label of "authenticity" even while the authentic, local ideal is itself being reallocated and contained. The label itself earns a type of activist capital in contemporary society, and encourages a belief on the part of a larger audience that "real" people are being positively and directly witnessed. However, those "real" people are actually limited and restricted by the contained empowerment they are enacting.

This challenge is, in part, methodological. Langlois, Elmer, McKelvey & Devereaux (2009) suggest “instances of political activism point to the growing importance of Facebook as a space where a public can be reached and informed and can enter into a dialogue to discuss issues of common interest and influence political decision-making” (p. 416). The authors (2009) note the “tremendous difficulties in tracking information on private online spaces” and the challenge of “understanding the uniqueness of social networking sites as assemblages where software processes, patterns of information circulation, communicative practices, social practices, and political contexts are articulated with and redefined by each other in complex ways” (p. 416).

The complexity of civil society, either online or offline, under authoritarian regimes adds an additional layer of difficulty, both in the technical (access to social media networks in Tunisia and Egypt), and the conceptual (an understanding of agency under authoritarianism). This is particularly the case for Arab women, who are often essentialized as powerless by Western discourses (Lengel, 1997; Newsom & Lengel, 2003; Newsom, Cassara, and Lengel, 2011). Arab women are faced with additional challenges as their traditional social roles and invisibility within the public spheres of their cultures can easily mask contemporary detainment and disappearance. In Bahrain, a number of women protestors have disappeared or been seized by authorities. In Damascus activists reported that men and women were both afraid for women protestors’ safety. Such essentializing is exacerbated by the lack of a wide body of research on Arab women and their role in civil society, although there are notable exceptions (Al-Mughni & Tétreault, 2000; al-Ali, 2000; al-Ali, 2003; Ammar & Lababidy, 1999; Badran, 2001; Mernissi, 1992/2002; Rabo, 1997).

Bayat (2010) explains that under repressive regimes women may not be able to organize in the way the West looks for, but non-movement resistance goes on, particularly outside the public sphere and often unnoticed in Western press. While there was vast media coverage of the citizen activists and protesters in Tahrir Square, there was little to no attention to the efforts in communities across Cairo. For example, at the Organizers Forum in Cairo, held seven months after the fall of the Mubarek regime, Egyptian women activists reported citizen efforts that went nearly unknown in the West. Four days into the uprising, when the Mubarek regime was reported to having withdrew police from the Square, it also withdrew police protection of every neighborhood in Cairo. Communities immediately organized *lagan shaabiyya* [popular committees] who served as volunteer neighborhood watch patrols (Brooks & Jaunzems, 2011). The *lagan shaabiyya* “offer an important opportunity to document the emergence of genuine collective action organizations at the local level in Egypt” (Bremer, 2011, para. 6). While many *lagan shaabiyya* “disbanded when order returned, others have drawn together to create new federations at the district, city, governorate, and national level. This development...holds tremendous promise for the emergence of genuine civil society activism in Egyptian localities” (Bremer, 2011, para. 7). The *lagan shaabiyya* used social media to organize and mobilize within their own communities, across communities, across Egypt, and to other activists outside the nation, most notably in Tunisia, where Tunisian activists advised those in Egypt based on their own experiences several weeks prior (Bremer, 2011).

Later stages of information flow

Returning to our framework for information flow, it is imperative to analyze how governmental power can get hold of rhetoric, reframe and erase to its needs. In the early stages of the Tunisian demonstrations women were clearly visible to the global audience. However, this

pattern is changing as the revolutions continue and women's issues conflict with views of the incoming regimes that support traditional women's roles. Cole and Cole (2011) explain:

But with such bold gestures go fears. As women look to the future, they worry that on the road to new, democratic parliamentary regimes, their rights will be discarded in favor of male constituencies, whether patriarchal liberals or Muslim fundamentalists. The collective memory of how women were in the forefront of the Algerian revolution for independence from France from 1954 to 1962, only to be relegated to the margins of politics thereafter, still weighs heavily.

At this point in the framework for information flow, the West receives and reframes the rhetoric espoused by the activists in its own terms. For example, more than a year after the removal of Mubarak from Egyptian rule, revolutions resulted in the election of a member of the Muslim Brotherhood as President, and his wife as the country's new "First Lady", which Naglaa Ali Mahmoud herself refuses to take as her title. Ms. Mahmoud herself is now a visible woman in the Arab World, and her own preferences appear to be to live the life of a traditional Muslim woman and wife. As reported in the *New York Times*, "But to some in the westernized elite, she stands for a backwardness and provincialism that they fear from the Islamists of the Muslim Brotherhood" and goes on to explain that "Ms. Mahmoud, a homemaker, became an instructor in [The Brotherhood's] parallel women's auxiliary,[the Muslim Sisters] teaching young girls about marriage. 'Men are designed to lead and women to follow,' the group's curriculums explain." (El Sheikh & Kirkpatrick, 2012, June 27). A western feminist voice, one that is critical of Naglaa Ali Mahmoud's choices and opinions, is clear in this 'global' media coverage.

The impact of the Arab Spring revolutions on enhancing gender equality in the Middle East and North Africa has been challenged by multiple feminist scholars and activists, including Arab feminists (Bibars, cited in Bohn & Lynch, 2011, March 2; Brown, 2011, March 8; Fathi, 2011, June 12; Nazra for Feminist Studies, 2011, February 24; and Younis, 2011, March 9). To have a more nuanced understanding of the impact of the Arab Spring on Arab women, transnational and western feminist scholars must interrogate their role in contributing to essentialism and must enhance their awareness of the authenticity of local knowledge (Newsom, Cassara, & Lengel, 2011). Broad attempts to "empower" women as a monolithic category both essentializes and contains women, and fails to recognize social, cultural, and intellectual traditions and experiences of women outside of the dominant position. Failure to reach a global audience means failure to secure the aid of systemic power.

In historically patriarchal regions, values often do not match the values of global feminism, therefore the need for recognition of local values is particularly strong (Lengel, 1997; Newsom, Cassara, & Lengel, 2011; Newsom & Lengel, 2003). Western assumptions of Arab women's complicity have been critiqued by Arab feminist scholars for decades (Kandiyoti, 1988; Lengel, 1997; Lengel, 2004; Muslim Media Watch, 2010), and re-interpreted from local and post-colonial perspectives as using Western standards to interpret something that has to be understood from the Othered point of view (Abouzeid, 2008; Abu Lughod, 2001; Mohanty, 1986; Said, 1978). Activisms and women's movements are likewise disassociated from Western understandings.

Agreement on defining women's movements has been challenging. The UN World Summit on the Information Society (UN WSIS) Gender Caucus, for example, works hard to legitimize women in developing regions within the technology industry, by tying it to

traditional forms of women's work. However, one woman argues, "this reliance on the WSIS GC to speak on behalf of 'gender' is part of the problem perhaps." (Kee, 2005). The critique implies that the individual voices the Caucus seeks to represent in diverse local contexts may be easily lost in political rhetoric. In essence, civil society promotion precludes autonomy on the part of the people who are theoretically the beneficiaries since it "translates into the imposition of norms, values, or institutions that do not fit the ways in which a given civil society would like to imagine itself" (Challand, 2008, p. 399).

This can be seen in the role of women in the revolutions (Tansim, 2011). Both online and in the streets, Marzouki (2011) commended the "impressive visibility of women" in the Tunisian demonstrations and how the recent acts are situated in contrast to "stereotypes about the 'Arab street' that propagate the image of a male-dominated public space" (p. 37). Similarly, Khamis and Vaughn (2011) argue "social media's horizontal and non-hierarchical structure was empowering for women, who not only engaged in online activism and citizen journalism through social media, but also effectively and courageously participated in demonstrations and protests" (p. 12). Thus, these women of the revolutions were made visible on the larger global stage because of their use of social media, reflecting again the idea espoused by the BBC that social media changed the world.

Women's use of social media was not the only movement by women into men's spheres of influence. Reclaiming the public space were Mannoubia and Samia Bouazizi, the mother and sister, respectively, of Mohammed Bouazizi, whose self-immolation in the Tunisian town of Sidi Bouzid triggered the protests throughout the nation (Labidi, 2011). April 6 Youth Movement activist Asmaa Mahfouz also positioned herself in the public sphere when, early on in the mobilization efforts in Egypt, she announced on her Facebook wall that she was headed to Tahrir Square and urged others to join her there to save Egypt (Tansim, 2011, February 21). Again, the actions of these women utilizing tools and space generally reserved for masculine norms brought them into global recognition, and in many ways equated them to Western feminist heroines and placed them in globally understood narratives.

The Outcome: Re-visioned Voices Transcend Containment

This analysis illustrates that Arab women's efforts in recent years have been most noticeable and globally recognized when they fit within global and Western narrative norms. Compare this to the global depiction of non-westernized Arab women, such as Egypt's Naglaa Ali Mahmoud, and we can see how Arab women's activism functions as a type of contained empowerment; localized power restricted by social norms yet flourishing in a space customized for and welcoming that power (Newsom, 2004). This functions within the current dynamic as the means by which global powers are attracted to and become involved in the situation. In the specific case of women's issues in the Middle East and North Africa, this means that local arguments are reconstituted to reach Western women. The power in these spaces is neither patriarchal nor completely removed from patriarchy, hence it is betwixt and between these potential states. While such contained empowerment provides the potential to generate new types and concepts of power transferable into hegemonic space, this power limited temporally, only capable of indirectly impacting hegemonic structures. Therefore it must be negotiated with formal, systemic power structures to gain recognition and acceptance as a form of agency.

The contained nature of women's voices is further complicated because Arab women seek spaces where they can be heard separately from the more mainstream understanding of feminism, as well as outside of patriarchal structures. Online, raised as calls for actions, Arab

women's voices resonate as powerful. However, agency in these online spaces is temporally situated in the sites and defined from and within the spaces themselves. This type of power is restricted to the gendered space created specifically for that type of power to operate. The agency inherent in social media may not translate offline. Therefore, these gendered online spaces are examples of contained empowerment: liminal sites where normative rules are suspended in favor of generating alternative norms.

The internet's key resource is information. The technology of the world wide web is an information-based technology. Cyberspace is built from information, and operates as a mechanism for transmitting information. Information and the value of information is often mediated by historically powerful entities, though social media can sometimes change that hierarchy. However, the metanarrative structures inherent in the social media act in much the same role as the gatekeepers of that historical power. While historically women have not been active as in the construction of the web as men, they have also not been viewed as the producers of meaning in web-spaces. However, feminists have determined it is possible to build identities online, masked in patriarchal characteristics so as to access power, that generate feminist ideals.

Ultimately, it is important to understand that for many repressed and isolated voices, social media are a primary way that needs and goals can be recognized to gain support from global institutions. There is a need to engage in more research on the role of women and their use of online social networking in and since the Arab Spring. Activist efforts toward social change in Tunisia, Egypt, and elsewhere in the region will continue, and the role of social media in these processes is still unfolding. Still unfolding, too, is the distinctive nature of the governance structures that will emerge from the revolutions and how social media will continue to enhance the building of civil society.

References

- Abouzeid, O. (2008). *Projects of Arab women empowerment: Current status and future prospects*. Cairo, Egypt: Arab Women Organization.
- Abu Lughod, L. (2001). Orientalism and Middle East feminism. *Feminist Studies*, 27(1), 101-113.
- Abu-Lughod, L., & El-Mahdi, R. (2011). Beyond the "woman question" in the Egyptian revolution. *Feminist Studies*, 37(3), 683-691.
- Al Jaber, H. (2009). Opening remarks. Advancing Arab women in technology leadership workshop. Retrieved from <http://www.scribd.com/doc/34512014/Advancing-Arab-Women-in-Technology>
- al-Ali, Nagje (2000). *Secularism, gender, and the state in the Middle East: The Egyptian women's movement*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.
- . (2003). Gender and civil society in the Middle East. *International Feminist Journal of Politics*, 5(2), 216-232.
- Al-Mughni, H., & Tétreault, M. A. (2000). Citizenship, gender, and politics of quasi states. In S. Joseph (ed.), *Gender and citizenship in the Middle East* (pp. 237-260). Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press.
- Alkhalfa, E. (2008). Influencing the self-efficacy of Middle Eastern women through the use of a bulletin board. *Association for the Advancement of Computing in Education Journal*, 16(2), 95-114.

- Alqudsi-ghabra, T. (2012). Creative use of social media in the revolutions of Tunisia, Egypt & Libya. *International Journal of Interdisciplinary Social Sciences*, 6(6), 147-158.
- Ammar, N. H., & Lababidy, L. S. (1999). Women's grassroots movements and democratization in Egypt. In J. M. Bystydzienski & J. Sekhon (eds.), *Democratization and women's grassroots movements* (pp. 150-172). Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.
- Ammar, M. (2011). Egyptian woman activist announces presidential candidacy. *Bikyamas*. Retrieved from <http://bikyamasr.com/wordpress/?p=31776>
- Anabtawi, s. (2012, June 14). Saudi women petition for right to drive. Retrieved from <http://m.arabianbusiness.com/saudi-women-petition-for-right-drive-462159.html>
- Andoni, L. (2010). The rebirth of Arab activism. *Al Jazeera (Opinion.)* Retrieved from <http://www.aljazeera.com/indepth/opinion/2010/12/20101231161958792947.html>
- Barabasi, A. (2011). Keynote to a networked self. In Z. Papacharissi (ed.), *A networked self: Identity, community, and culture on social network sites* (pp. 1-14). London, England: Routledge.
- Badran, M. (2001). Gender activism: Feminists and Islamists in Egypt. In V. M. Moghadam (ed.), *Identity politics and women* (pp. 202-227). Boulder, CO: Westview.
- Basarudin, A. (2002). Dismantling bridges, building solidarity: Reconciling Western and Arab feminisms. *Al-Raida*, XIX (97-98), 62- 65.
- Bayat, A. (2010) *Life as politics: How ordinary people change the Middle East*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.
- BBC. (2011, June 21). Hillary Clinton praises 'brave' Saudi women drivers. Retrieved from <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-middle-east-13865033>
- Beinin, J., & Vairel, F. (2011). *Social movements, mobilization, and contestation in the Middle East and North Africa*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Bellin, E. (2012). Reconsidering the robustness of authoritarianism in the Middle East. *Comparative Politics*, 44(2), 127-149.
- Benn, T. (2011). The flowers of the Arab spring grow from buds of free information. *New Statesman*, 140(5048), 12.
- Bennett, W., & Segerberg, A. (2011). Digital media and the personalization of collective action. *Information, Communication & Society*, 14(6), 770-799.
- Bhabha, H. (2002). Postcolonial authority and postmodern guilt. In L. Grossberg, C. Nelson & P.A. Treichler (eds.), *Cultural studies* (pp. 56-68). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Biggs, C. (2011, February 14). Women make their power felt in Egypt's revolution. Abu Dhabi, the UAE: *The National*. Retrieved from <http://www.thenational.ae/news/worldwide/middle-east/women-make-their-power-felt-in-egypt-revolution>
- Bohn, L. E., & Lynch, S. (2011, March 2). Women and the revolution: What does the new democratic future hold for Egyptian women? *Foreign Policy, the Middle East Channel*. Retrieved from http://www.foreignpolicy.com/articles/2011/03/02/women_and_the_revolution?page=0,1
- Brooks, F., & Jaunzems, T. (2011). Community organizing in Egypt during and the after the revolution. Special report from the Organizers' Forum on the International Dialogue in Egypt. *Social Policy* (Winter 2011), 58-61.

- Broomhall, E. (2011, June 9). More Arab women on Facebook, but figures still low. Retrieved from <http://www.arabianbusiness.com/more-arab-women-on-facebook-but-figures-still-low-404540.html>
- Brown, W. (2011, March 8). Is the Egyptian revolution sidelining women? *Notebook, The Independent blogs*. Retrieved from <http://blogs.independent.co.uk/2011/03/08/egyptian-revolution-sidelining-women>
- Bunt, G. (2000). *Virtually Islamic*. Cardiff, Wales: University of Wales Press.
- Campbell, S. W., & Kwak, N. (2010). Mobile communication and civic life: Linking patterns of use to civic and political engagement. *Journal of Communication*, 60(3), 536-555.
- Carstensen, T. (2009). Gender trouble in Web 2.0: Gender relations in social network sites, wikis, and weblogs. *International Journal of Gender, Science, and Technology*, 1 (1), 105-127.
- Carr, J. (2011). In Tunisia, cyberwar precedes revolution. *Frontlines of Revolutionary Struggle*. Retrieved from <http://revolutionaryfrontlines.wordpress.com/2011/01/15/in-tunisia-cyberwar-precedes-revolution/>
- Challand, B. (2008). The evolution of Western aid for Palestinian civil society: The bypassing of local knowledge and resources. *Middle Eastern Studies*, 44(3), 397-417.
- Charrad, M. (2001). State and gender in the Magrib. In S. Joseph & S. Slyomovics (eds.), *Women and power in the Middle East* (pp. 61-71). Philadelphia, PA: Pennsylvania University Press.
- Chaudhury, A. (2011). Saudi Women's Driving Movement Gains Momentum. Retrieved from http://www.desiclub.com/community/culture/culture_article.cfm?id=615
- Chick, K. (2011). In town at center of Tunisia uprising, 23 years of repressed emotions burst forth. *Christian Science Monitor*. Retrieved from <http://www.csmonitor.com/World/Middle-East/2011/0119/In-town-at-center-of-Tunisia-uprising-23-years-of-repressed-emotions-burst-forth>
- China, W. (2011). The Facebook revolution. *New African*, 503, 24.
- Cole, J., & Cole, S. (2011, April 26). An Arab spring for women. *CBS News*. Retrieved from <http://www.cbsnews.com/stories/2011/04/26/opinion/main20057432.shtml>
- Cook, J. (2011). Palestinian social media campaigns unlike Egyptian, Tunisian counterparts. *Washington Report on Middle East Affairs*, 30(4), 22-23.
- Correa, T., Hinsley, A. W., & de Zúñiga, H. G. (2010). Who interacts on the Web?: The intersection of users' personality and social media use. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 26 (2), 247-253.
- Dahlgren, P. (2009). *Media and political engagement: Citizens, communication and democracy*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.
- Dalton, R. J. (2008). Citizenship norms and the expansion of political participation. *Political Studies*, 56, 76-98.
- Danitz, T., & Strobel, W. P. (1999). The Internet's impact on activism. *Studies in Conflict and Terrorism*, 22(3), 257-269.
- Derbes, D. (2011). Social media as a revolutionary force. *Foreign Service Journal*, 88(4), 9-10.
- Denzin, N. K. (1983). Interpretive interactionism. In G. Morgan (ed.), *Beyond Method* (pp. 129-146). Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Donelan, H., Herman, C., Kear, K., and Kirkup, C. (2008). Patterns of online networking for women's career development. *Gender in Management: An International Journal*, 24 (2), 92-111.

- Duddy, J. (2008). How can Western and Arab feminism(s) be reconciled? Association for Women's Rights in Development. Retrieved from <http://www.awid.org/eng/Issues-and-Analysis/Library/How-can-Western-and-Arab-feminism-s-be-reconciled2>
- El-Mahdi, R. (2010). Does political Islam impede gender-based mobilization? The case of Egypt. *Totalitarian Movements and Political Religions*, 11, (3–4), 379–396.
- Eltantawy, N., & Wies, J. B. (2011). Social media in the Egyptian revolution: Reconsidering resource mobilization theory. *International Journal of Communication*, 5, 1207–1224.
- Estes, A. C. (2011). How Occupy influenced Egypt's Arab Spring (and vice versa). *The Atlantic Wire*. Retrieved from <http://www.theatlanticwire.com/global/2011/12/how-occupy-influenced-egypts-arab-spring-vice-versa/46334/#>
- Etling, B., Kelly, J., Faris, R. and Palfrey, J. (2009). *Mapping the Arabic blogosphere: politics, culture, and dissent*. Berkman Center Research Publication No. 2009-06.
- “Facebook Action”. (2011). *America*, 204(3), 8.
- Fandy, M. (1999). ‘CyberResistance: Saudi opposition between globalization and localization. *Comparative Study of Society and History*, 41(1), 124–147.
- Faris, D. (2008a). Revolutions without revolutionaries? Network theory, Facebook, and the Egyptian blogosphere. *Arab Media & Society*, 6, 1-11.
- _____. (2008b). The Web, the cell phone, and the Mubarak death crisis of 2007. In Institute for Politics, Democracy and the Internet (ed.), *Politics and technology review* (pp. 51–57). Washington D.C.: The George Washington University.
- Fathi, Y. (2011, June 12). After the revolution: Egyptian women yet to win equality. *Ahram Online*. Retrieved from <http://english.ahram.org.eg/NewsContent/1/2/14071/Egypt/Society/After-the-revolution-Egyptian-women-yet-to-win-equ.aspx>
- Fernback, J. (2007). Beyond the diluted community concept: A symbolic interactionist perspective on online social relations. *New Media & Society*, 9(1), 49-69.
- Filkins, D. (2011, October 7). Tawakkol Karman’s Moral Vision. *The New Yorker*. Retrieved from <http://www.newyorker.com/online/blogs/newsdesk/2011/10/tawakkol-karmans-moral-vision.html>
- Foot, K. A. (2005). Cyberactivism: Online Activism in Theory and Practice. *Journal of Communication*, 55(2), 404-406.
- Forbes, M. (September 28, 2011). Is it time for an Arab Spring for Saudi Women? *Forbes*. Retrieved from <http://www.forbes.com/sites/moiraforges/2011/09/28/is-it-time-for-an-arab-spring-for-saudi-women/>
- Foucault, M. (1980). *Power/knowledge: Selected interviews and other writings, 1972-77* (trans. Colin Gordon). New York, NY: Pantheon.
- _____. (1988). *Madness and civilization: A history of insanity in the age of reason*. London: Vintage.
- Gajjala, R., Yahui, Z., & Dako-Gyeke, P. (2010). Lexicons of women's empowerment online. *Feminist Media Studies*, 10(1), 69-86. doi:10.1080/14680770903457139
- Ghosh, B., Hauslohner, A., Abouzeid, R., Walt, V., & Baker, A. (2011). The revolutionaries. *Time*, 177(6), 36-40.
- Giglio, M. (2011). The Facebook freedom fighter. *Newsweek*, 157(8), 14-17.
- Garfinkle, H. (1967). *Studies in ethnomethodology*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- Gaworecki, M. (2011). Organizing tool and a “space of liberty” in post-revolution Egypt? *Social Policy*, 41(4), 66-69.

- Gladwell, M., & Shirky, C. (2011). *From innovation to revolution: Do social media make protests possible?* Retrieved from <http://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/67325/malcolm-gladwell-and-clay-shirky/from-innovation-to-revolution>
- Goffman, E. (1959). *The presentation of self in everyday life*. New York, NY: Doubleday.
- . (1974). *Frame analysis: An essay on the organization of experience*. London, England: Harper & Row.
- Guardian*. (2011, June 21). Hillary Clinton backs Saudi Arabia women's right-to-drive campaign. Retrieved from <http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2011/jun/21/hillary-clinton-saudi-female-drivers>
- Habermas, J. (1962). *The structural transformation of the public sphere: An inquiry into a category of bourgeois society*. London, England: Polity Press.
- Hackett, S. (2004). Clash of civilization for the Gender Caucus (L. Jeffrey, Trans.). Retrieved from <http://wsis.ecommons.ca/node/view/450>
- Hafez, S. (2003). The terms of empowerment: Islamic women activists in Egypt. *Papers in Social Science*, 24(4). Cairo: Egypt: American University in Cairo Press.
- Hargittai, E., & Hsieh, Y. P. (2010). Predictors and consequences of differentiated practices on social network sites. *Information, Communication, & Society*, 13(4), 515-536.
- Hasso, F. (2001). Feminist generations? The long-term impact of social movement involvement on Palestinian women's lives. *The American Journal of Sociology*, 107(3), 586-611.
- Hauslohner, A. (2011). On the Arab street, rage is contagious. *Time*, 177(5), 36-39.
- Hogan, B. (2010). The presentation of self in the age of social media: Distinguishing performances and exhibitions online. *Bulletin of Science, Technology & Society*, 30(6), 377-386.
- Houssain, A. (2012, January 24). Princess Amira al-Taweel: Challenging women's roles around the world. Retrieved from http://www.huffingtonpost.com/anushay-hossain/princess-amira-al-taweel_b_1227876.html
- Illia, L. (2003). Passage to cyberactivism: How dynamics of activism change. *Journal of Public Affairs*, 3(4), 326-337.
- Isis International (2011). The other Tahrir Square: Attacks continue on women human rights defenders in Iraq. Retrieved from <http://awid.org/News-Analysis/Friday-Files/The-Other-Tahrir-Square-Attacks-Continue-on-Women-Human-Rights-Defenders-in-Iraq>
- Jad, I. (2008). Local feminism: Between Islamism and liberal universalism. *IDS Bulletin*, 39(6), 34-41.
- Jansen, F. (2010). Digital activism in the Middle East: Mapping issue networks in Egypt, Iran, Syria and Tunisia. *Knowledge Management for Development Journal*, 6(1), 37-52. doi:10.1080/19474199.2010.493854
- Juris, J. S. (2004). Networked social movements: Global movements for global justice. In M. Castells (ed.), *The network society: A cross-cultural perspective* (pp. 341-362). Cheltenham, England: Edward Elgar.
- Kendall, L. (1998). Meaning and identity in "cyberspace": The performance of gender, class, and race online. *Symbolic Interaction*, 21, 129-53.
- Kandiyoti, D. (1988). Bargaining with patriarchy. *Gender and Society* 2(3), 274-290.

- Khamis, S. (2001). The transformative Egyptian media landscape: Changes, challenges and comparative perspectives. *International Journal of Communication*, 5, 1159–1177.
- Khamis, S. (2011). The Arab “feminist” spring? *Feminist Studies*, 37(3), 692-695,748.
- Khamis, S., & Vaughn, K. (2011). Cyberactivism in the Egyptian revolution: How civic engagement and citizen journalism tilted the balance. *Arab Media and Society*, 14. Retrieved from <http://www.arabmediasociety.com/?article=769>
- Kirkpatrick, D. D., El-Naggar, M., & Goodman, J. (2011, January 13). Protests spread to Tunisia's capital, and a curfew is decreed. *New York Times*, p. 4.
- Kirkpatrick, D. D., Sanger, D. E., Fahim, K., El-Naggar, M., & Mazzetti, M. (2011, February 14). A Tunisian-Egyptian Link That Shook Arab History. *New York Times*, p. 1.
- Labidi, I. (2011, January 31). Mothers of the jasmine revolution. *Foreign Policy in Focus*. Retrieved from http://www.fpi.org/articles/mothers_of_the_jasmine_revolution
- Ladhani, N. (2011). Egypt: First cut off the Internet!. *Social Policy*, 41(1), 54.
- Langlois, G., Elmer, G., McKelvey, F., & Devereaux, Z. (2009). Networked publics: The double articulation of code and politics on Facebook. *Canadian Journal of Communication*, 34(3), 415-434.
- Lengel, L. (1997). *Identity, representation and disempowerment: Arab women and the media*. Paper presented at the National Communication Association Convention, Chicago.
- . (2004, April). *The UN World Summit on the Information Society: Implications for phase II of the summit in Tunisia*. Paper presented at the Union for Democratic Communications, St. Louis.
- Lengel, L., & Martin, S.C. (2010). Situating gender in critical intercultural communication studies. In R. Halualani & T. Nakayama (Eds.), *The handbook of critical intercultural communication*. Oxford, England: Blackwell.
- Lotan, G., Graeff, E., Ananny, M., Gaffney, D., Pearce, I., & Boyd, D. (2011). The revolutions were tweeted: Information flows during the 2011 Tunisian & Egyptian revolutions. *International Journal of Communication*, 5, 1375–1405.
- MacFarquhar, M., & Bakri, N. (2011, September 26). Saudi Monarch Grants Women Right to Vote. *New York Times*. p. 1.
- Marquand, R. (2011, January 28). Among France's Tunisians, elation and worry. *Christian Science Monitor*. p. N.PAG.
- Marya, R. (2011, June 21). Hillary Clinton throws support behind Saudi Women2Drive movement. Retrieved from <http://mashable.com/2011/06/21/hillary-clinton-throws-support-behind-saudi-women2drive-movement/>
- Massoud, K., & Moghadam, V.M. (2005). *Social policy in the Middle East: Economic, political and gender dynamics*. Geneva: UN RISD.
- Mazrui, A., & Mazrui, A. (2001). The digital revolution and the new reformation: Doctrine and gender in Islam. *Harvard International Review*, 23(1).
- Mernissi, F. (1992/2002). *Islam and democracy: Fear of the modern world* (revised edition). New York, NY: Addison-Wesley.
- . (2006). Digital scheherazades in the Arab World. *Current History*, 105(689), 121-126.
- Moghadam, V. (2003). Engendering citizenship, feminizing civil society: The case of the Middle East and North Africa. *Women & Politics*, 25(1/2), 63–87.
- Mohanty, C.T. (1986). Under western eyes: Feminist scholarship and colonial discourses. *Boundary 2*, 12(3), 333-358.

- _____. (2003). *Under western eyes* revisited: Feminist Solidarity through anticapitalist struggles. *Signs*, 28(2), 499-535.
- Motadel, D. (2011). Waves of revolution. *History Today*, 61(4), 3-4.
- Muslim Media Watch. (2010). Define yourself: Discussions of women, feminism, and the Arab World. Retrieved from <http://muslimahmediawatch.org/2010/01/define-yourself-discussions-of-women-feminism-and-the-arab-world/>
- Nasawiya. (2010a). What is feminism? Retrieved from <http://www.nasawiya.org/web/what-is-feminism/>
- _____. (2010b). Projects and initiatives. Retrieved from <http://www.nasawiya.org/web/how-we-work/projects-and-initiatives/>
- New Media Consortium. (2003). *Social networking, the “third place,” and the evolution of communication*. Austin, TX: New Media Consortium.
- Newsom, V. (2004). *Theorizing contained empowerment: A critique of activism and power in third wave feminist spaces*. Dissertation Abstracts International (UMI No. 0496051229).
- Newsom, V., Cassara, C., & Lengel, L. (2011). Discourses in Technology Policy in the Middle East and North Africa: Gender Mainstreaming v. Local Knowledge. *Communication Studies*, 62, 1, 74-89.
- Newsom, V., Lengel, L., & Cassara, C. (2011). Local Knowledge and the Revolutions: A Framework for Social Media Information Flow. *International Journal of Communication*, 5, 1303-1312.
- Newsom, V., & Lengel, L. (forthcoming). Mutable Selves and Digital Reflexivities: Social media for social change in the Middle East and North Africa. *Studies in Symbolic Interaction*.
- _____. (2003). The power of the weblogged word: Contained empowerment in the Middle East North Africa region. *Feminist Media Studies*, 3(3), 360-363.
- North Africa United. (2012, February 1). The role of social media in Arab women's empowerment. Retrieved from http://www.northafricaunited.com/The-Role-of-Social-Media-in-Arab-Women-s-Empowerment_a709.html
- Pearce, K. E., & Kendzior, S. (2012). Networked authoritarianism and social media in Azerbaijan. *Journal of Communication*, 62(2), 283-298.
- Preston, J. (2011, February 15). While Facebook plays a star role in the revolts, its executives stay offstage. *New York Times*, p. 10.
- Rabo, A. (1997). *Organizing women: Formal and informal women's groups in the Middle East*. Oxford, England: Berg.
- Ratnesar, R. (2011). Not just the Facebook Revolution. *Bloomberg Businessweek*, (4232), 62-66.
- Robinson, L. (2007). The cyberself: The selfing project goes online, symbolic interaction in the digital age. *New Media & Society*, 9(1), 93-110.
- Sabar, A. (2011, March 21). Why the tweet will never replace the street. *Christian Science Monitor*. p. N.PAG.
- Sadiki, L. (2011, October 12). A Nobel for the Arab Spring. *Aljazeera*. Retrieved from <http://english.aljazeera.net/indepth/opinion/2011/10/2011101075817463598.html>
- Said, E. (1978). *Orientalism: Western conceptions of the Orient*. New York, NY: Pantheon.
- Shane, S. (2011, January 30). Push Comes To Shove: Technology helps ignite change (as in Tunisia). Except when it bolsters oppression (as in Iran). *New York Times*, p. 1.

- Sharma, K. (October 29, 2011). The other half: Women and the Arab Spring. *The Hindu*. Retrieved from http://www.thehindu.com/opinion/columns/Kalpana_Sharma/article2573489.ece.
- Suárez, S. L. (2011). Social media and regime change in Egypt. *Campaigns & Elections*, 32(300), 30-31.
- Spivak, G. C. (1988). Can the subaltern speak? In C. Nelson and L. Grossberg, (Eds.). *Marxism and the interpretation of culture*. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press, pp. 271-313.
- Tansim. (2011, January 17). Women in Tunisia's revolution. *Muslimah Media Watch*. Retrieved from <http://muslimahmediawatch.org/2011/01/women-in-tunisia-revolution>
- Tansim. (2011, February 21). Women's voices in the revolution sweeping the Middle East. *Muslimah Media Watch*. Retrieved from <http://muslimahmediawatch.org/2011/02/womens-voices-in-the-revolutions-sweeping-the-middle-east>
- Tatarchevskiy, T. (2011). The 'popular' culture of internet activism. *New Media & Society*, 13(2), 297-313. doi:10.1177/1461444810372785
- Thelwall, M. (2008). Social networks, gender, and friending: An analysis of MySpace member profiles. *Journal of the American Society for Information Science and Technology*, 59 (8), 1321-1330.
- Tufekci, Z. (2011). New media and the people-powered uprisings. *Technology Review*. Retrieved from <http://www.technologyreview.com/blog/guest/27122>
- "Tunisia Seethes". (2011, January 13). *New York Times*. p. 28.
- Vegh, S. (2003). Classifying forms of online activism. In M. McCaughey & M. D. Ayers (eds.), *Cyberactivism* (pp. 71–95). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Walker, C., & Orttung, R. W. (2011, April 23). Lies and videotape. *New York Times*. p. 19.
- Wheeler, D. (2009). Working around the state: Internet use and political identity in the Arab world. In A. Chadwick & P. Howard (eds.), *Handbook of internet politics* (pp. 305- 320). Abington, England: Routledge.
- Wilson, C., & Dunn, A. (2011). Digital media in the Egyptian revolution: Descriptive analyses from the Tahrir data sets. *International Journal of Communication*, 5, 1248–1272.
- Younis, J. (2011, March 9). Egypt's revolution means nothing if its women are not free. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from <http://www.guardian.co.uk/commentisfree/2011/mar/09/egypt-revolution-women>