

# On the feasibility for the system of quadratic equations, explanations

TODO: fix basis issue in 2 (with  $(x, y) = x^T \Gamma y$ ), fix  $S$  issue  $S^T A_c S = I$ , check gradient equation.

## 1. Theorem 3.2 (Sufficient condition)

Consider  $f: \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m$ , s.t.  $f_i(x) = x^T A_i x + 2b_i^T x$ ,  $A_i = A_i^T$ . Define  $F = f(\mathbb{R}^n)$ .  
Then why  $A = \inf_{y \in F} (c, y) = \inf_{y \in \text{conv } F} (c, y) = B$ ?

1. First,  $F \subseteq \text{conv } F$ , therefore,  $B \leq A$ .

2. Secondly, let  $y_k \in \text{conv } F$  be a sequence s.t.  $g_k = (c, y_k) \xrightarrow{k \rightarrow \infty} B$ .  $y_k = \sum_{i=1}^{n_k} \alpha_i^k y_i^k$ .

$g_k(c, y_k) = \sum_{i=1}^{n_k} \alpha_i^k (c, y_i^k) = \sum_{i=1}^{n_k} \alpha_i^k g_i^k$ . Define  $g_0^k = \min_{i \in \{1, \dots, n_k\}} g_i^k$ . Then  $B \leq g_0^k \leq g^k$ . Therefore,  $g_0^k \rightarrow B$  also. This way, we have constructed a sequence  $y_0^k \in F$  s.t.  $(c, y_0^k) \rightarrow B$ , therefore,  $A \leq B$ .

## 2. Minimum of $f(x)$

Consider  $f: \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m$ .  $f_i(x) = x^T A_i x + 2b_i^T x$ .  $A_i^T = A_i$ . Let  $c \in \mathbb{R}^m$ .  
We want to find  $g(c) = \inf_{x \in \mathbb{R}^n} (c, f(x))$ .

Define  $A_c \equiv c \cdot A = \sum_{i=1}^m c_i A_i$ ,  $b_c = c \cdot b = \sum_{i=1}^m c_i b_i$ .

$(c, f(x)) = \sum_{i=1}^m c_i f_i(x) = \sum_{i=1}^m c_i (x^T A_i x + 2b_i^T x) = x^T A_c x + 2b_c^T x$ .

If  $\exists v: -\alpha = v^T A_c v < 0$  then  $g(c) = -\infty$ :  $g(\beta v) = -\beta^2 \alpha + \beta 2b_c^T v \rightarrow -\infty$ ,  $\beta \rightarrow +\infty$ .

From this point on, we assume  $A_c \geq 0$ . Let  $R_0$  be a zero eigenspace (=kernel) of  $A_c$ :  $R_0 = \{v: A_c v = 0\} = \ker A_c$ .

If  $\exists v \in R_0: v^T b_c \neq 0$  then  $g(c) = -\infty$ : Consider  $f(\beta v) = \beta^2 v^T \overset{0}{A_c v} + 2\beta \underbrace{b_c^T v}_{\neq 0} \rightarrow -\infty$ ,  $\beta \rightarrow \infty$

Then  $R_0 \subseteq \{b_c\}^\perp$

Consider  $A = \sum_{i=1}^n \lambda_i s_i s_i^T = S \Lambda S^T$ ,  $S = \|s_1 \dots s_n\|$ ,  $S^T S = E$ ,  $s_i^T s_j = \delta_{ij}$ .

$f$  is differentiable, then for finding  $g(c)$  the gradiend  $\nabla(c, f(x)) = 2A_c x + 2b_c = 0$ .

$$S \Lambda S^T x = -b_c \Leftrightarrow \Lambda S^T x = -S^T b_c (*)$$

Let  $x$  be  $x = x^\parallel + x^\perp$ ,  $x^\parallel \in R_0$ ,  $x^\perp \perp R_0$ .

Then neither  $f(x)$  nor  $\Lambda S^T x$  depend on  $x^\parallel$ . This means that the  $x$  minimizing  $g(c)$  is defined in terms of  $x^\perp$  and  $x^\parallel$  is arbitrary.

Define  $\lambda_i^g = \begin{cases} 0, & \lambda_i = 0 \\ 1/\lambda_i, & \lambda_i \neq 0 \end{cases}$ . Define  $\Lambda^g = \text{diag}(\lambda_1^g, \dots, \lambda_n^g)$ . Then  $\Lambda \Lambda^g = \delta_{ij} [\lambda_i \neq 0]$ . Then  $S \Lambda^g \Lambda S^T$  is a projector on  $R_0^\perp$ .

Consider  $(*) \Leftrightarrow \Lambda^g \Lambda S^T (x^\parallel + x^\perp) = -\Lambda^g S^T b_c$ . But  $\Lambda S^T x^\parallel = 0$ , therefore,  $\underbrace{S \Lambda^g \Lambda S^T}_{\text{projector}} x^\perp = -S \Lambda^g S^T b_c$ .

But  $x^\perp$  is already in  $R_0^\perp$ , therefore,  $x^\perp = -\underbrace{S \Lambda^g S^T}_{A_c^g} b_c$ . Here  $A_c^g$  is a pseudoinverse of  $A_c$ .

Therefore,  $\boxed{x = -A_c^g b_c + x^\parallel}$ , where  $x^\parallel \in R_0$ .

Consider  $(c, f(x)) = (c, f(x^\perp)) = b_c^T A_c^g A_c A_c^g b_c - 2b_c^T A_c^g b_c$ . Consider  $A_c A_c^g b_c = S \Lambda S^T S^{\nearrow E} \Lambda^g S^T b_c$ . Because  $R_0 \subseteq \{b_c\}^\perp$ ,  $\Lambda \Lambda^g S^T b_c = S^T b_c$ . Therefore,  $A_c A_c^g b_c = b_c$ . Then  $(c, f(x)) = b_c^T A_c^g b_c - 2b_c^T A_c^g b_c = \boxed{-b_c^T A_c^g b_c}$ .

### 3. Finding $c$ provided $d$

Let  $H: \mathbb{R}^{n+1, n+1} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$  be a map s.t.  $H_i(X) = \text{Tr}(H_i X)$ ,

$$H_i = \left\| \begin{array}{cc} A_i & b_i \\ b_i^T & 0 \end{array} \right\|^\square$$

Consider a boundary point  $X$ , which is a solution of (main article, (4)):

$$\boxed{\begin{array}{c} \sup \quad t \\ \left\{ \begin{array}{l} H(X) = y^0 + td \\ X \geq 0 \\ X_{n+1, n+1} = 1 \end{array} \right. \end{array}}$$

Define  $f(t, X) = t$ ,  $D_0 = \{(t, X) | X \geq 0, X_{n+1, n+1} = 1\}$ ,  $D_1 = \{(t, X) | H(X) = y^0 + td\}$ . Then supremum is equivalent to

$$\sup_{(t, X) \in D_0 \cap D_1} f(t, X)$$

Define a Lagrange function  $L(c, t, X) = \underbrace{t}_{f(t, X)} + \sum_{i=1}^m c_i (y_i^0 + td_i - H_i(X))$ .

Here we divided the constraints into two parts:  $D_1$  goes to the Lagrange function,  $D_0$  goes to the inner supremum. *Stephen Boyd, Lieven Vandenberghe. Convex Optimization. Page ??? . Cambridge University Press*

Then the dual function is  $g(c) = \sup_{(t, X) \in D_0} L(c, t, X)$ .

Because  $L = t(1 + \sum_{i=1}^m c_i d_i) + \sum_{i=1}^n c_i (y_i^0 - H_i(X))$ ,  $g = +\infty$  when  $(c, d) \neq -1$ . From this point we assume that  $\boxed{(c, d) = -1}$ .

Now,  $g(c) = \sup_{X_{n+1, n+1}=1, X \geq 0} (c, y^0 - H(X)) = (c, y^0) + \sup_{y \in \text{conv } F} -(c, y) = (c, y^0) - \inf_{y \in \text{conv } F} (c, y)$ .

Then the dual problem is

$$g(c) \rightarrow \inf_{(c, d) = -1}$$

Let us prove that  $\inf_{y \in \text{conv } F} (c, y) = \inf_{H = \left\| \begin{array}{cc} A_c & b_c \\ b_c^T & \gamma \end{array} \right\| \geq 0} (-\gamma)$

Via Schur complement  $H \geq 0 \Leftrightarrow \begin{cases} A_c \geq 0 \\ \gamma - b_c^T A_c^g b_c \geq 0 \\ (E - A_c A_c^g) b_c = 0 \end{cases}$ .

$A_c \geq 0$  is a necessary condition for  $\exists g(c) \in \mathbb{R}$  (see part 2).

$(E - A_c A_c^g) b_c = 0$  is another necessary condition for  $\exists g(c) \in \mathbb{R}$ .

Statement  $\gamma \geq b_c^T A_c b_c$  means  $-\gamma \leq -b_c^T A_c b_c = \inf_{y \in \text{conv } F} (c, y)$ , which means that  $-\gamma$  is a lower bound

for  $\inf_{y \in \text{conv } F} (c, y)$ .

Then  $H \geq 0 \Leftrightarrow -\gamma \leq \inf_{y \in \text{conv } F} (c, y)$ .

Then  $g(c) = (c, y^0) - \inf_{H \geq 0} -\gamma$ .

Then the dual problem is:

$$\inf_{(c,d)=-1} g(c) \Leftrightarrow \inf_{(c,d)=-1} \left[ (c, y^0) - \inf_{H \geq 0} (-\gamma) \right] \Leftrightarrow \inf_{(c,d)=-1} \inf_{H \geq 0} (c, y^0) + \gamma = \boxed{\begin{cases} \inf & \gamma + (c, y^0) \\ H \geq 0 \\ (c, d) = -1 \end{cases}}.$$

This problem is exactly (5) from main article ■.

#### 4. What is $z_{\max}$ ?

Consider  $f: \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m$ ,  $f_i(x) = x^T A_i x + 2b_i^T x$ ,  $A_i = A_i^T$ .

Let  $c_+ \in \mathbb{R}^m$  s.t.  $A_+ = \sum c_i A_i > 0$ . Then the minimum  $\inf_x (c, f(x))$  is obtained at a single point  $x_0 = -A_+^{-1} b_+$ ,  $b_+ = \sum c_i b_i$ .

Consider  $S_\varepsilon^+ = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n \mid (x - x_0)^T A_+ (x - x_0) = \varepsilon^2\}$ . Then  $f(S_\varepsilon^+) = \{y \in \mathbb{R}^m \mid (c_+, y) = (c_+, f(x_0)) + \varepsilon^2\}$ .

Indeed, if  $\begin{cases} P = (c_+, f(x) - f(x_0)) \\ Q = (x - x_0)^T A_+ (x - x_0) \end{cases}$  then  $P - Q = \underline{x^T A_+ x} - x_0^T A_+ x_0 + 2b_+^T x - 2b_+^T x_0 - \underline{x^T A_+ x} - x_0^T A_+ x_0 + 2x^T A_+ x_0 = /x_0 = -A_+^{-1} b_+ / = 2x_0^T b_+ + 2b_+^T x - 2b_+^T x_0 - 2x^T b_+ = 0$ .

Therefore, the image of  $B_\varepsilon^+$  is a *convex cut*  $\{y \mid (c_+, y) \in (c_+, f(x_0)) + [0, z_{\max}]\}$

#### 5. Variables s.t. $c \cdot A = I$ , $c \cdot b = 0$

Given: the map  $f: \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m$ ,  $f_i(x) = x^T A_i x + 2b_i^T x$ ,  $A_i = A_i^T$ , vector  $c \in \mathbb{R}^m : c \cdot A > 0$

We need to find a new pair of bases s.t.  $\begin{cases} \tilde{c} \cdot \tilde{A} = I & (1) \\ \tilde{c} \cdot \tilde{b} = 0 & (2) \end{cases}$  *Problem here:  $c \cdot A = \Lambda$*

1. Condition (1). Changing variables in the  $x$  space:  $x = S\tilde{x} \Leftrightarrow \tilde{x} = S^{-1}x$ . Then  $f_i(x) = x^T A_i x + 2b_i^T x = \tilde{x}^T S^T A_i S \tilde{x} + 2\tilde{b}_i^T \tilde{x}$ .  $\tilde{A}_i = S^T A_i S$ .  $c\tilde{A} = \sum c_i \tilde{A}_i = \sum c_i S^T A_i S = S^T A_c S$ . Therefore, condition (1) is equal to diagonalising  $A_c$ . Consider  $\|c \cdot \tilde{b}\| = \|\sum c_i S^T b_i\| = \|S^T \sum c_i b_i\| = \|\sum c_i b_i\|$ . Therefore, a change of variables in the  $x$  space does not affect on the value of  $c \cdot b$

2. Condition (2). New variables:  $\tilde{x}, \tilde{y}$ ,

$$\begin{cases} x = \tilde{x} + x^0 \\ y = \tilde{y} + y^0 \end{cases}$$

Function  $y_i(x) = \tilde{y}_i(\tilde{x}) + y_i^0$ . Consider  $y_i(x) = x^T A_i x + 2b_i^T x = (\tilde{x} + x^0)^T A_i (\tilde{x} + x^0) + 2b_i^T (\tilde{x} + x^0) = \tilde{x}^T A_i \tilde{x} + 2x^{0T} A_i \tilde{x} + x^{0T} A_i x^0 + 2b_i^T x^0 + 2b_i^T \tilde{x} = \tilde{x}^T A_i \tilde{x} + 2\underbrace{(b_i + A_i x^0)^T}_{\tilde{b}_i} \tilde{x} + \underbrace{x^{0T} A_i x^0 + 2b_i^T x^0}_{y_i^0}$ .

Consider  $\sum c_i \tilde{b}_i = c \cdot b + (c \cdot A)x^0$ . Therefore,  $x^0 = -(c \cdot A)^{-1}(c \cdot b)$

The algorithm:

1. Compute  $S$  via the eigenbasis of  $c \cdot A$ ,  $S^T(c \cdot A)S = I$
2. Compute  $\tilde{A}_i = S^T A_i S$ ,  $\tilde{b}_i = S^T b_i$
3. Compute  $\tilde{x}^0 = -(c \cdot \tilde{b})$ ,  $y_i^0 = (\tilde{x}^0)^T \tilde{A}_i \tilde{x}^0 + 2\tilde{b}_i^T \tilde{x}^0$
4. Compute  $\hat{A}_i = \tilde{A}_i$ ,  $\hat{b}_i = \tilde{b}_i + \tilde{A}_i \tilde{x}^0$

Then  $\hat{y}_i = \hat{x}^T \hat{A}_i \hat{x} + 2\hat{b}_i^T \hat{x}$ ,  $x = S(\hat{x} + \tilde{x}^0)$ ,  $y = \hat{y} + \tilde{y}^0$

#### 6. $z(c) = ?$

Given: the map  $f: \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m$ ,  $f_i(x) = x^T A_i x + 2b_i^T x$ ,  $A_i = A_i^T$ , two vectors  $c, c_+ \in \mathbb{R}^m$ .  $c_+ A = I$ ,  $c_+ b = 0$ . Find:  $z(c) = \inf_{y \in Y} (c_+, y)$  where  $Y$  is an intersection of  $f(\mathbb{R}^n)$  with a tangent hyperplane defined by its normal vector  $c$ .

Define  $\sigma(Q) = \{\lambda \mid \dim \text{Ker}(Q - \lambda E) > 0\}$ . Define  $\lambda_{\min}(Q) = \min \sigma(Q)$  — minimal eigenvalue of  $Q$ .

1. If  $\lambda_{\min}(c \cdot A) < 0$  then the tangent hyperplane does not exist, and  $z(c) = +\inf$

2. Then  $\lambda_{\min}(c \cdot A) > 0$ , then there is no nonconvexity, and  $z(c) = \inf$
3. For  $\lambda_{\min} = 0$  in part 2  $Y$  was found explicitly:  $Y = \{f(x) | x = x^{\parallel} - A_c^g b_c, x^{\parallel} \in \text{Ker } A_c\}$ . Then for  $y \in Y$   $(c_+, y) = x^T (c_+ \xrightarrow{A^I} x) + 2(c_+ \xrightarrow{b^0})^T x = \boxed{x^T x}$
4.  $x^T x = \|x\|^2 = \|x^{\parallel}\|^2 + \|A_c^g b_c\|^2$ . We want to minimize  $(c_+, y)$ , therefore, we choose  $x^{\parallel} = 0$ . Then  $z(c) = \|A_c^g b_c\|^2 = \boxed{|(c \cdot A)^g(c \cdot b)|^2}$
5. Consider  $\inf_{x \in \mathbb{R}^n} (c_+, f(x)) = -(c_+ \xrightarrow{b^0})(A_{c_+}^I)^{-1}(c_+ \cdot b) = 0$ . Therefore,  $z(c) = \inf_{y \in Y} (c_+, y) - \inf_{y \in F} (c_+, y)$

Now consider  $z(c) = \begin{cases} |(c \cdot A)^g(c \cdot b)|^2, & \lambda_{\min}(c \cdot A) = 0 \\ +\infty, & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$

Consider  $z(c + \alpha c_+) = |(c \cdot A + \alpha c_+ \xrightarrow{A^I})^g b_c|^2 = |(c \cdot A + \alpha I)^g b_c|^2$ . We need  $\alpha$  s.t.  $\lambda_{\min}(c \cdot A + \alpha I) = 0$ , therefore,  $\alpha = -\lambda_{\min}(c \cdot A)$ .

Define  $\hat{z}(c) = |(c \cdot A - \lambda_{\min}(A))^g(c \cdot b)|^2$ . Consider  $\mathbb{R}^m \ni c = c^{\parallel} + c^{\perp}$ ,  $c^{\parallel} \parallel c_+$ ,  $(c_+, c^{\perp}) = 0$ .

Then  $\hat{z}(c) = \hat{z}(c^{\perp})$ , i.e.  $\hat{z}$  does not depend on  $c^{\parallel}$ . It depends only on  $c^{\perp}$ , and  $c^{\parallel}$  is chosen in a way that  $\lambda_{\min}(c \cdot A) = 0$ .

## 7. Theorem 3.4 (Nonconvexity certificate)

Given.

1. The map  $f: \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^m$ ,  $f_i(x) = x^T A_i x + 2b_i^T x$ ,  $A_i = A_i^T$ ,  $m, n \geq 3$ . The vector  $c \in \mathbb{R}^m$ .
2.  $A_c \geq 0$ ,  $\dim \text{Ker } A_c = 1$  (=simple zero eigenvalue),  $\text{Ker } A_c = \text{Lin}\{e\}$
3.  $b_c \perp \text{Ker } A_c$
4.  $b \perp \text{Ker } A_c$ ,  $e^0 = -A_c^g b_c$
5.  $f(\alpha e + e^0) = f^0 + 2\alpha f^1 + \alpha^2 f^2$ ,  $f^1 \nparallel f^2$

Then  $F = \text{Im } f$  is nonconvex.

Consider  $\inf_{y \in F} (c, y)$  (part 2).  $x = \underbrace{x^{\parallel}}_{\alpha e} + \underbrace{(-A_c^g b_c)}_{e^0}$ . Then

$$f_i(\alpha e + e^0) = \alpha^2 \underbrace{e^T A_i e}_{f_i^2} + 2\alpha \underbrace{(b_i^T e + e^T A_i e^0)}_{f_i^1} + \underbrace{2b_i^T e^0 + e^{0T} A_i e^0}_{f_i^0}$$

If  $f^1 \nparallel f^2$ , then  $\{f(\alpha e + e^0) | \alpha \in \mathbb{R}\} = F \cap \{y | (c, y) = \inf_{y \in F} (c, y)\}$  is nonconvex. Then  $F$  is nonconvex.

## 8. Equations (0.18)-(0.21)

Consider  $A(t): n \times n$ ,  $\exists \dot{A}$ ,  $A^T = A$ ,  $A \geq 0$ ,  $A$  has a simple zero eigenvalue:  $\forall t$   $A(t)x_0(t) = 0$ ,  $x_0^T x_0 = 0$ .

Then  $A = S \Lambda S^T$ ,  $S^T S = E$ ,  $A^g = S \Lambda^g S^T$ . Define  $\lambda_i = \Lambda_{ii}$ .  $\Lambda_{ii}^g = \begin{cases} \frac{1}{\lambda_i}, & \lambda_i \neq 0 \\ 0, & \lambda_i = 0 \end{cases}$ .

Then  $AA^g = A^g A = S \Lambda S^T S \Lambda^g S^T = S \Lambda \Lambda^g S^T = \sum_{\lambda_i \neq 0} s_i s_i^T = 1 - x_0 x_0^T$  (0.20)

Consider  $\frac{d}{dt} A x_0 = \dot{A} x_0 + A \dot{x}_0$ . Multiplying by  $A^g$  from the left:  $A^g \dot{A} x_0 + A^g A \dot{x}_0 = 0$ . Consider  $A^g A \dot{x}_0 = (1 - x_0 x_0^T) \dot{x}_0 = \dot{x}_0 - x_0 x_0^T \dot{x}_0$ . Since  $\|x_0\|^2 = x_0^T x_0 = 1$ ,  $x_0^T \dot{x}_0 = 0$ . Then  $-A^g \dot{A} x_0 = \dot{x}_0$  (0.19).

Consider  $\dot{A} x_0 + A \dot{x}_0 = 0$ . Multiplying by  $x_0^T$  from the left:  $x_0^T \dot{A} x_0 + \cancel{x_0^T A^0} \dot{x}_0 = 0$ . Then  $x_0^T \dot{A} x_0 = 0$  (0.18)

Consider  $AA^g = 1 - x_0 x_0^T$ . Then  $\dot{A} A^g + A \dot{A}^g = -\dot{x}_0 x_0^T - x_0 \dot{x}_0^T = A^g \dot{A} x_0 x_0^T + x_0 x_0^T \dot{A} A^g$  (a)

Consider  $A^g x_0 = S \Lambda^g S^T x_0 = 0$ .

Multiplying (a) by  $x_0$  from the right:  $A \dot{A}^g x_0 = A^g \dot{A} x_0$ . Multiplying by  $A^g$  from the left:  $A A^g \dot{A}^g x_0 = A^g A^g \dot{A} x_0$ . Then  $(1 - x_0 x_0^T) \dot{A}^g x_0 = A^g A^g \dot{A} x_0$ . Then  $\dot{A}^g x_0 = A^{-2} \dot{A} x_0 + x_0 x_0^T \dot{A}^g x_0$ .

Let's multiply (a) by  $A^g$  from the left:  $A^g \dot{A} A^g + A^g A \dot{A}^g = A^{-2} \dot{A} x_0 x_0^T + \cancel{A^g x_0^0} x_0^T \dot{A} A^g$ .

Consider  $A^g A \dot{A}^g = \dot{A}^g - x_0 x_0^T \dot{A}^g = \dot{A}^g - x_0 x_0^T \dot{A} A^{-2} - x_0 x_0^T \dot{A}^g x_0 x_0^T$ .

Consider  $x_0^T \dot{A}^g x_0 = x_0^T (\dot{S} \Lambda^g S^T + S \dot{\Lambda}^g S^T + S \Lambda^g \dot{S}^T) x_0 = x_0^T \dot{S} \Lambda^g S^T x_0 = 0$ .

Then  $\frac{d}{dt} A^{-1} = -A^{-1} \dot{A} A^{-1} + x_0 x_0^T \dot{A} A^{-2} + A^{-2} \dot{A} x_0 x_0^T$  (0.21).

Case  $\text{Rg} A < n - 1$  is not considered since probability of such event is small.

## 9. Gradient descent

1. (0.5):  $\underbrace{(c \cdot A - \lambda_{\min}(c \cdot A))}_{Q} x_0 = 0$ , then  $\dot{x}_0 = -Q^{-1} \dot{Q} x_0$ .  $\frac{d}{dt} \lambda_{\min} = \frac{d}{dt} x_0^T (c \cdot A) x_0 = 2 \dot{x}_0^T \underbrace{(c \cdot A) x_0}_{\lambda_{\min} x_0} + x_0^T (\dot{c} \cdot A) x_0 = 2 \lambda_{\min} \underbrace{\dot{x}_0^T x_0}_0 + x_0^T (\dot{c} \cdot A) x_0$ .  
Then  $\dot{x}_0 = -(A_c - \lambda_{\min}(A_c))^{-1} (\dot{c} \cdot A - x_0^T (\dot{c} \cdot A) x_0) x_0$  (correct).
2. (0.6).  $x_0^T (c \cdot b) = 0$ , use (0.5) (correct).
3. (0.7).  $\frac{\partial}{\partial t} \|v(c)\|^2 = \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \sum_j v_j^2(c) = 2 \sum_j v_j \frac{\partial}{\partial t} v_j = 2 v^T(c) \frac{d}{dt} v(c(t))$  (correct).  $v(c) = \underbrace{(c \cdot A - \lambda_{\min}(c \cdot A))^{-1}}_Q (c \cdot b) = Q^{-1}(c \cdot b)$ .
4. (0.8) Define  $Q = c \cdot A - \lambda_{\min}(c \cdot A)$ . Define  $v = Q^{-1}(c \cdot b)$ . Then  $z(c) = \|v\|^2$  and  $\dot{z} = 2 v^T \dot{v}$ .  
 $\dot{v} = \dot{Q}^{-1}(c \cdot b) + Q^{-1}(\dot{c} \cdot b)$ .  
Consider (0.21)  $\dot{Q}^{-1} = -Q^{-1} \dot{Q} Q^{-1} + x_0 x_0^T \dot{Q} Q^{-2} + Q^{-2} \dot{Q} x_0 x_0^T$ .  
Then  $\dot{z} = 2 v^T \left( Q^{-1}(\dot{c} \cdot b) + (-Q^{-1} \dot{Q} Q^{-1} + x_0 x_0^T \dot{Q} Q^{-2} + Q^{-2} \dot{Q} x_0 x_0^T)(c \cdot b) \right) \boxed{=}$   
 $\boxed{= 2 v^T Q^{-1}(\dot{c} \cdot b) - 2 v^T Q^{-1} \dot{Q} Q^{-1}(c \cdot b) + 2 \cancel{v^T x_0^T} x_0^T \dot{Q} Q^{-2}(c \cdot b) + 2 v^T Q^{-2} \dot{Q} x_0 \cancel{x_0^T (c \cdot b)}} \boxed{=}$   
Since  $x_0 \in \text{Ker } Q \perp (c \cdot b)$ , we have  $x_0^T (c \cdot b) = 0$ .  
Since  $Q x_0 = 0$ ,  $Q^{-1} x_0 = 0$ :  $Q^{-1} x_0 = S \Lambda^{-1} S^T x_0 = S * 0 = 0$ . Since  $v^T = (c \cdot b)^T Q^{-1}$ . Then  $v^T x_0 = 0$   
 $\boxed{= 2 v^T Q^{-1}(\dot{c} \cdot b) - 2 v^T Q^{-1} \dot{Q} \underbrace{Q^{-1}(c \cdot b)}_v} = 2 v^T Q^{-1}(\dot{c} \cdot b) - 2 v^T Q^{-1} \dot{Q} v = \boxed{\dot{z} = 2 v^T Q^{-1}(\dot{c} \cdot b - \dot{Q} v)}$ ,  
 $\dot{Q} = \dot{c} \cdot A - x_0^T (\dot{c} \cdot A) x_0$   
Since  $\dot{z} = \sum \frac{\partial z}{\partial c_i} \frac{\partial c_i}{\partial t}$ ,  $\frac{\partial z}{\partial c_i}$  can be found as a coefficient at  $\dot{c}_i$  in  $\dot{z}$   
 $\dot{z} = 2 v^T Q^{-1} \sum_i (\dot{c}_i b_i - \dot{c}_i A_i v + x_0^T \dot{c}_i A_i x_0 v) = \sum_i \dot{c}_i [2 v^T Q^{-1} (b_i - (A_i - x_0^T A_i x_0) v)]$   
Thus,  $\boxed{\frac{\partial z}{\partial c_i} = 2 v^T Q^{-1} (b_i - (A_i - x_0^T A_i x_0) v)}$ ,  $Q = c \cdot A - \lambda_{\min}(c \cdot A)$ ,  $v = Q^{-1}(c \cdot b)$ ,  $x_0 \in \text{Ker } Q$ ,  $\|x_0\| = 1$   
**not the same as (0.8) in draft.pdf:**  
 $\dot{z}_{(0.8)} = 2 \underbrace{(c \cdot b)^T Q^{-2}(\dot{c} \cdot b)}_{v^T Q^{-1}} - v^T (Q^{-1} \dot{Q} + \dot{Q} Q^{-1}) v = 2 v^T Q^{-1}(\dot{c} \cdot b) - v^T Q^{-1} \dot{Q} v - v^T \dot{Q} Q^{-1} v$
5. (0.10). If  $\dot{c} = \beta c_+$ , then  $\dot{z} = 2 v^T Q^{-1}(\dot{c} \cdot b - \dot{Q} v) = \boxed{=}$ . Since  $c_+ \cdot b = 0$ ,  $c_+ \cdot A = I$ ,  $\dot{Q} = c_+ \cdot A - x_0^T (c_+ \cdot A) x_0 = I - x_0^T x_0 = I - 1 = 0$ . And  $\boxed{= 0}$  (correct with new  $\dot{z}$ ).
6. (0.14)  $n_i = (b_i^T - v^T (A_i - x_0^T A_i x_0)) x_0$
7. (0.16)  $P(\lambda) = Q^{-1} Q = S \Lambda^g S^T S \Lambda S^T = S \Lambda \Lambda^g S^T = 1 - x_0 x_0^T$  — projector on  $(\text{Ker } Q)^\perp$  (correct)
8. (0.15)  $P(\lambda)(c(\lambda) \cdot b) = c(\lambda) \cdot b \Leftrightarrow \underbrace{(c(\lambda) \cdot b) \perp \text{Ker } Q}_{\Leftrightarrow c(\lambda) \in c_{\text{bad}}} \Leftrightarrow c(\lambda) \cdot b \in \text{Im } Q \Leftrightarrow \exists \hat{x}: Q \hat{x} = c(\lambda) \cdot b$  (0.17)  
(correct)

## 10. Gradient descent. Projection

We have  $c \in \mathbb{R}^m$ ,  $c \in c_{\text{bad}} = \{c \mid \|c\| = 1, \text{Ker } Q(c) \perp (c \cdot b)\}$ .  $Q = c \cdot A - \lambda_{\min}(c \cdot A)$ ,  $v = Q^{-1}(c \cdot b)$ ,  $x_0 \in \text{Ker } Q$ ,  $\|x_0\| = 1$

1. Calculate  $\frac{\partial z}{\partial c_i} = 2v^T Q^{-1}(b_i - (A_i - x_0^T A_i x_0)v)$ . Define  $\Delta c = -\nabla z(c)$
2. Calculate  $\hat{n}_i = (b_i^T - v^T(A_i - x_0^T A_i x_0))x_0$ , define  $n_i = \frac{\hat{n}_i}{|\hat{n}|}$
3. Define  $c' = c + \Delta c - n(\Delta c, n)$
4. Define  $c(\lambda) = c' + \lambda n$ . Define  $x_0(\lambda)$  s.t.  $x_0(\lambda) \in \text{Ker } Q(\lambda)$ ,  $x_0(\lambda)^T x_0 > 0$ ,  $\|x_0(\lambda)\| = 1$ . Define  $m(\lambda) = (c(\lambda) \cdot b)^T x_0(\lambda)$ . Beware of  $\text{Rg } Q < n - 1$ .
5. Find root of  $m(\lambda)$  using binary search on  $[-\lambda^0, \lambda^0]$ ,  $\lambda^0 = \|c - c'\|$ .
6. Next  $c$ :  $c(\lambda)$

$$m(\lambda) = 0 \Leftrightarrow (c(\lambda) \cdot b) \perp \{x_0\} = \text{Ker } Q \text{ if } \text{Rg } Q = n - 1.$$