## Supplementary Report: Results of GM-EDA and HGM-EDA for Taillard's PFSP instances with Makespan criterion

Josu Ceberio, Ekhine Irurozki, Alexander Mendiburu, and Jose A. Lozano (*Member, IEEE*) \*†

February 22, 2013

## Abstract

In this report we extend the experimental results presented in the paper A Distance-based Ranking Model Estimation of Distribution Algorithm for Flowshop Scheduling Problem submitted to the journal IEEE Transactions on Evolutionary Computation, by introducing the results of the GMEDA and HGMEDA over Taillard's PFSP instances with the makespan criterion. Experimentation parameters, maximum number of evaluations and the final results of the experimentation are extensively introduced.

## 1 Parameters

In this section, we introduce the  $\theta_{upper}$  parameters used for each configuration type in the GM-EDA and HGM-EDA (see table 1), and the maximum number of evaluations performed by the algorithms when optimizing (see table 2).

<sup>\*</sup>J. Ceberio, E. Irurozki and J. A. Lozano are with the Intelligent Systems Group, Department of Computer Science and Artificial Intelligence, University of the Basque Country UPV/EHU, Gipuzkoa 20018, Spain {e-mail: jceberio001@ikasle.ehu.es}

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>†</sup>A. Mendiburu is with the Intelligent Systems Group, Department of Computer Architecture and Technology, University of the Basque Country UPV/EHU, Gipuzkoa 20018, Spain

Table 1: Upper  $\theta$  values for Taillard's PFSP instances. Note the first instance of each set was selected for the experimentation. The  $\theta$  that provided the best fitness average of 10 repetitions was selected.

| Instance        | $\theta$ range | $\theta_{upper}$ |
|-----------------|----------------|------------------|
|                 |                |                  |
| $20 \times 05$  | 1.0 - 3.0      | 1.5              |
| $20 \times 10$  | 1.0 - 3.0      | 1.4              |
| $20 \times 20$  | 1.0 - 3.0      | 1.4              |
| $50 \times 05$  | 2.5 - 5.5      | 3.7              |
| $50 \times 10$  | 2.5 - 5.5      | 2.8              |
| $50 \times 20$  | 2.5 - 5.5      | 3.0              |
| $100 \times 05$ | 3.5 - 6.0      | 4.9              |
| $100 \times 10$ | 3.5 - 6.0      | 3.7              |
| $100 \times 20$ | 3.5 - 6.0      | 4.7              |
| $200 \times 10$ | 4.0 - 6.0      | 5.3              |
| $200 \times 20$ | 4.0 - 6.0      | 5.5              |
| $500 \times 20$ | 4.0 - 7.0      | 4.4              |
|                 |                |                  |

Table 2: Maximum number of evaluations for Taillard's PFSP instances. Note that the first instance of each set was selected for the experimentation. The evaluation numbers reported are the average of 20 repetitions of the evaluations performed by AGA algorithm running  $n \times m \times 0.4$  seconds.

Instance Evaluations

| $20 \times 05$  | 182224100 |
|-----------------|-----------|
| $20 \times 10$  | 224784800 |
| $20 \times 20$  | 256896400 |
| $50 \times 05$  | 220712150 |
| $50 \times 10$  | 256208100 |
| $50 \times 20$  | 275954150 |
| $100 \times 05$ | 235879800 |
| $100 \times 10$ | 266211000 |
| $100 \times 20$ | 283040000 |
| $200 \times 10$ | 272515500 |
| $200 \times 20$ | 287728850 |
| $500 \times 20$ | 260316750 |

## 2 Results

In Table 3 we introduce the results obtained by GM-EDA and HGM-EDA for Taillard's PFSP instances with makespan criterion.

Table 3: Best and average results for Taillard's PFSP instances with the makespan criterion. 10 repetitions of each algorithm-instance pair were carried out.

| ried out.      |               | ~                   |                     | *****               |                     |                 |        | ~ .                   |                | *****          |                  |
|----------------|---------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|-----------------|--------|-----------------------|----------------|----------------|------------------|
| Instance       | ID            | GM-<br>Best         | EDA<br>Avg          | HGM<br>Best         | -EDA<br>Avg         | Instance        | ID     | GM-<br>Best           | EDA<br>Avg     | HGM<br>Best    | I-EDA<br>Avg     |
|                |               | Dest                | Avg                 | Dest                | Avg                 |                 |        | Dest                  | Avg            | Dest           | Avg              |
|                |               |                     |                     |                     |                     |                 |        |                       |                |                |                  |
| $20 \times 5$  | 1             | 1278                | 1278                | 1278                | 1278                | $100 \times 5$  | 1      | 5493                  | 5495           | 5493           | 5493             |
|                | 2             | 1359                | 1360                | 1359                | 1359                |                 | 2      | 5280                  | 5285           | 5268           | 5268             |
|                | 3             | 1081                | 1085                | 1081                | 1081                |                 | 3      | 5175                  | 5188           | 5175           | 5175             |
|                | 4             | 1293                | 1295                | $\frac{1293}{1235}$ | 1293                |                 | 4      | 5018                  | 5026           | 5014           | 5014             |
|                | 5<br>6        | $\frac{1235}{1195}$ | $\frac{1236}{1208}$ | $\frac{1235}{1195}$ | $\frac{1235}{1195}$ |                 | 5<br>6 | $5255 \\ 5137$        | $5255 \\ 5145$ | $5250 \\ 5135$ | $5250 \\ 5135$   |
|                | 7             | 1251                | 1208 $1251$         | 1234                | 1237                |                 | 7      | 5246                  | 5258           | 5135<br>5246   | 5135<br>5246     |
|                | 8             | 1206                | 1208                | 1204                | 1206                |                 | 8      | 5098                  | 5105           | 5094           | 5094             |
|                | 9             | 1230                | 1237                | 1230                | 1230                |                 | 9      | 5472                  | 5473           | 5448           | 5448             |
|                | 10            | 1108                | 1108                | 1108                | 1108                |                 | 10     | 5334                  | 5338           | 5322           | 5322             |
|                |               |                     |                     |                     |                     |                 |        |                       |                |                |                  |
| $20 \times 10$ | 1             | 1585                | 1590                | 1582                | 1582                | $100 \times 10$ | 1      | 5800                  | 5815           | 5770           | 5770             |
|                | 2             | 1660                | 1670                | 1659                | 1659                |                 | 2      | 5377                  | 5387           | 5349           | 5352             |
|                | 3             | 1496                | 1513                | 1496                | 1496                |                 | 3      | 5679                  | 5680           | 5676           | 5678             |
|                | 4             | 1385                | 1391                | 1377                | 1377                |                 | 4      | 5820                  | 5848           | 5781           | 5795             |
|                | 5             | 1419                | 1426                | 1419                | 1419                |                 | 5      | 5498                  | 5509           | 5467           | 5483             |
|                | 6             | 1397                | 1404                | 1397                | 1397                |                 | 6      | 5308                  | 5325           | 5308           | 5308             |
|                | 7             | 1484                | 1488                | 1484                | 1484                |                 | 7      | 5622                  | 5640           | 5596           | 5598             |
|                | 8             | 1544                | 1552                | 1538                | 1539                |                 | 8      | 5651                  | 5675           | 5623           | 5636             |
|                | 9             | 1594                | 1611                | 1593                | 1593                |                 | 9      | 5922                  | 5926           | 5875           | 5875             |
|                | 10            | 1598                | 1607                | 1591                | 1591                |                 | 10     | 5881                  | 5892           | 5848           | 5848             |
| 20.220         | 1             | 2200                | 9214                | 2207                | 2207                | 100 × 20        | 1      | 6379                  | 6401           | 6268           | 6901             |
| $20\times20$   | $\frac{1}{2}$ | $\frac{2298}{2105}$ | 2314 $2123$         | $\frac{2297}{2099}$ | $\frac{2297}{2099}$ | $100 \times 20$ | 2      | 6280                  | 6401 $6324$    | 6231           | $6281 \\ 6251$   |
|                | 3             | $\frac{2103}{2329}$ | $\frac{2123}{2342}$ | 2326                | 2326                |                 | 3      | 6391                  | 6421           | 6316           | 6331             |
|                | 4             | $\frac{2329}{2233}$ | $\frac{2342}{2241}$ | $\frac{2320}{2223}$ | $\frac{2320}{2223}$ |                 | 4      | 6369                  | 6388           | 6291           | 6321             |
|                | 5             | 2302                | 2308                | 2291                | 2292                |                 | 5      | 6465                  | 6497           | 6364           | 6385             |
|                | 6             | 2226                | 2238                | 2226                | 2226                |                 | 6      | 6487                  | 6525           | 6437           | 6454             |
|                | 7             | 2277                | 2291                | 2273                | 2273                |                 | 7      | 6369                  | 6407           | 6318           | 6332             |
|                | 8             | 2204                | 2214                | 2200                | 2200                |                 | 8      | 6545                  | 6585           | 6469           | 6485             |
|                | 9             | 2242                | 2253                | 2237                | 2237                |                 | 9      | 6383                  | 6424           | 6314           | 6343             |
|                | 10            | 2184                | 2196                | 2178                | 2178                |                 | 10     | 6542                  | 6582           | 6478           | 6499             |
|                |               |                     |                     |                     |                     |                 |        |                       |                |                |                  |
| $50 \times 5$  | 1             | 2724                | 2732                | 2724                | 2724                | $200 \times 10$ | 1      | 10878                 | 10908          | 10872          | 10872            |
|                | 2             | 2838                | 2846                | 2834                | 2834                |                 | 2      | 10531                 | 10540          | 10493          | 10496            |
|                | 3             | 2621                | 2628                | 2621                | 2621                |                 | 3      | 10973                 | 11010          | 10922          | 10922            |
|                | 4             | 2753                | 2768                | 2751                | 2751                |                 | 4      | 10893                 | 10917          | 10889          | 10890            |
|                | 5<br>6        | $2864 \\ 2832$      | $2864 \\ 2833$      | $2863 \\ 2829$      | $\frac{2863}{2829}$ |                 | 5<br>6 | $10535 \\ 10372$      | 10537 $10383$  | 10527 $10330$  | 10527            |
|                | 7             | $\frac{2632}{2725}$ | $\frac{2633}{2736}$ | $\frac{2629}{2725}$ | $\frac{2629}{2725}$ |                 | 7      | 10900                 | 10913          | 10350          | $10331 \\ 10857$ |
|                | 8             | 2694                | $\frac{2730}{2702}$ | 2683                | 2683                |                 | 8      | 10789                 | 10797          | 10731          | 10733            |
|                | 9             | 2554                | 2561                | 2552                | 2552                |                 | 9      | 10465                 | 10477          | 10438          | 10441            |
|                | 10            | 2782                | 2782                | 2782                | 2782                |                 | 10     | 10727                 | 10732          | 10676          | 10678            |
|                |               |                     |                     |                     |                     |                 |        |                       |                |                |                  |
| $50 \times 10$ | 1             | 3041                | 3062                | 3025                | 3025                | $200 \times 20$ | 1      | 11378                 | 11407          | 11270          | 11306            |
|                | 2             | 2913                | 2929                | 2877                | 2890                |                 | 2      | 11424                 | 11448          | 11296          | 11314            |
|                | 3             | 2871                | 2896                | 2852                | 2864                |                 | 3      | 11491                 | 11547          | 11412          | 11431            |
|                | 4             | 3071                | 3089                | 3063                | 3063                |                 | 4      | 11471                 | 11496          | 11350          | 11380            |
|                | 5             | 3011                | 3025                | 2979                | 2996                |                 | 5      | 11419                 | 11448          | 11302          | 11325            |
|                | 6             | 3026                | 3058                | 3006                | 3007                |                 | 6      | 11359                 | 11395          | 11260          | 11298            |
|                | 7             | 3140                | 3162                | 3098                | 3106                |                 | 7      | 11536                 | 11556          | 11436          | 11450            |
|                | 8             | 3046                | 3062                | 3038                | 3041                |                 | 8      | 11478                 | 11528          | 11412          | 11435            |
|                | 9             | 2910                | 2933                | 2902                | 2902                |                 | 9      | 11380                 | 11422          | 11294          | 11320            |
|                | 10            | 3091                | 3121                | 3078                | 3083                |                 | 10     | 11420                 | 11474          | 11353          | 11379            |
| 50.220         | 1             | 3939                | 3953                | 3870                | 3889                | 500×20          | 1      | 26875                 | 27066          | 26200          | 26241            |
| $50 \times 20$ | 2             | 3798                | 3829                | 3715                | 3721                | 300 X 20        | 2      | $\frac{20875}{27151}$ | 27000 $27456$  | 26735          | 26764            |
|                | 3             | 3734                | 3769                | 3667                | 3678                |                 | 3      | 27333                 | 27478          | 26506          | 26577            |
|                | 4             | 3793                | 3817                | 3744                | 3755                |                 | 4      | $\frac{27333}{27094}$ | 27408          | 26561          | 26602            |
|                | 5             | 3675                | 3695                | 3625                | 3639                |                 | 5      | 26776                 | 26987          | 26412          | 26452            |
|                | 6             | 3765                | 3792                | 3698                | 3710                |                 | 6      | 27042                 | 27377          | 26584          | 26613            |
|                | 7             | 3772                | 3803                | 3720                | 3731                |                 | 7      | 27065                 | 27261          | 26474          | 26542            |
|                | 8             | 3778                | 3803                | 3720                | 3728                |                 | 8      | 27112                 | 27349          | 26691          | 26733            |
|                | 9             | 3812                | 3837                | 3754                | 3773                |                 | 9      | 26630                 | 26928          | 26164          | of 246196        |
|                | 10            | 3833                | 3868                | 3768                | 3783                |                 | 10     | 27020                 | 27384          | 26570          | 26608            |