

3. $Y_1, Y_2 \sim \text{Bernoulli}$

a) Given: X - discrete random variable
 Y_1, Y_2 - conditionally iid given X
 $g(x) = P(Y_1=1|X=x) = P(Y_2=1|X=x)$ - ①

i) Given: $P(Y_1=1, Y_2=1) = \sum_x P(Y_1=1, Y_2=1|X=x) P(X=x)$ [by law of total probability]

Show that:

$$P(Y_1=1, Y_2=1) = 0 \text{ implies } g(x) = 0 \quad \forall x \text{ s.t. } P(X=x) > 0$$

Solution:

$$\begin{aligned} P(Y_1=1, Y_2=1) &= \sum_x P(Y_1=1, Y_2=1|X=x) \cdot P(X=x) \quad [\because \text{Law of total probability}] \\ &= \sum_x P(Y_1=1|X=x) \cdot P(Y_2=1|X=x) \cdot P(X=x) \quad [Y_1, Y_2 \text{ conditionally iid given } X] \\ &= \sum_x g(x) \cdot g(x) \cdot P(X=x) \quad [Y_1, Y_2 \text{ identically dist. given } X] \\ &= \sum_x [g(x)]^2 \cdot P(X=x) \end{aligned}$$

For all x s.t. $P(X=x) > 0$, the above expression equals 0

$$\text{when } \sum_x [g(x)]^2 \cdot P(X=x) = 0$$

positive

$$\Rightarrow [g(x)]^2 = 0 \text{ for all } x \text{ s.t. } P(X=x) > 0$$

$$\Rightarrow g(x) = 0 \quad \forall x \text{ s.t. } P(X=x) > 0$$

ii) Show that:

$$g(x) = 0 \text{ for all } x \text{ s.t. } P(X=x) > 0 \text{ implies}$$

$$P(Y_1=1) = P(Y_2=1) = 0$$

Solution:

$$\begin{aligned} P(Y_1=1) &= \sum_x P(Y_1=1|X=x) \cdot P(X=x) \\ &= \sum_x g(x) \cdot P(X=x) \quad [\because g(x)=0] \\ &= \sum_x 0 \cdot P(X=x) \Rightarrow P(Y_1=1) = 0 \end{aligned}$$

similarly,

$$\begin{aligned} P(Y_2=1) &= \sum_x P(Y_2=1|X=x) \cdot P(X=x) \\ &= \sum_x g(x) \cdot P(X=x) \\ &= \sum_x 0 \cdot P(X=x) \Rightarrow P(Y_2=1) = 0 \end{aligned}$$

b) Given: $P(Y_1=1, Y_2=0) = P(Y_1=0, Y_2=1) = 1/2$ - ②

i) Y_1 & Y_2 are exchangeable because reordering the indices do not change their joint distribution i.e.

$$P(Y_1=1, Y_2=0) = P(Y_1=0, Y_2=1) = 1/2$$

where $Y_i \sim \text{Bernoulli}$, $i = \{0, 1\}$

ii) Show there cannot exist any discrete random variable X s.t. Y_1, Y_2 are conditionally iid given X .

From ②, $P(Y_1=1, Y_2=1) = 0$

Let $g(x) = P(Y_1=1|X=x) = P(Y_2=1|X=x)$ [$\because Y_1, Y_2$ are exchangeable]

From a) i), $P(Y_1=1, Y_2=1) = 0 \Rightarrow g(x) = 0 \quad \forall x \text{ s.t. } P(X=x) > 0$

From a) ii), $g(x) = 0 \quad \forall x \text{ s.t. } P(X=x) > 0 \Rightarrow P(Y_1=1) = P(Y_2=1) = 0$

$$\begin{aligned} P(Y_1=1, Y_2=0) &= \sum_x P(Y_1=1|X=x) \cdot P(Y_2=0|X=x) \cdot P(X=x) \quad [\because Y_1, Y_2 \text{ are conditionally iid}] \\ &= \sum_x 0 \cdot P(Y_2=0|X=x) \cdot P(X=x) \end{aligned}$$

$$P(Y_1=1, Y_2=0) = 0 \quad \text{CONTRADICTION!!} \quad \text{③}$$

From ②, we know $P(Y_1=1, Y_2=0) = 1/2$ but ③ gives a contradiction.

\Rightarrow So, we can't have X s.t. $\forall x \quad P(X=x) > 0$

\Rightarrow No such random variable X can exist.

Problem 1

1(a)i)

```
Y <- read.csv("lifexpdiff.csv", row.names=1)
years = c(1960, 1970, 1980, 1990, 2000, 2010)
data = list(Y = Y, X = years, Xbar = mean(years))
```

1(a)ii)

```
# Univariate prior formulation
model1 <- textConnection("
data {
  dim.Y <- dim(Y)
}
model {
  for(i in 1:dim.Y[1]) {
    for(j in 1:dim.Y[2]) {
      Y[i,j] ~ dnorm(mu[i,j], tauusq.y)
      mu[i,j] <- alpha[i,1] + alpha[i,2] * (X[j] - Xbar)
    }
    alpha[i,1] ~ dnorm(beta1, 1 / sigma.alpha1^2)
    alpha[i,2] ~ dnorm(beta2, 1 / sigma.alpha2^2)
  }
  beta1 ~ dnorm(0.0, 1.0E-6)
  beta2 ~ dnorm(0.0, 1.0E-6)
  tauusq.y ~ dgamma(0.001, 0.001)
  sigma.alpha1 ~ dexp(0.001)
  sigma.alpha2 ~ dexp(0.001)
  sigma.y <- 1 / sqrt(tausq.y)
}
```

1(b)

1

```
library(rjags)
```

```
## Loading required package: coda
```

```
## Linked to JAGS 4.3.1
```

```
## Loaded modules: basemod,bugs
```

```
inits = list(list(tausq.y=1, beta1=0, beta2=0,
                 sigma.alpha1=1, sigma.alpha2=1),
             list(tausq.y=0.1, beta1=10, beta2=10,
                 sigma.alpha1=0.1, sigma.alpha2=0.1),
             list(tausq.y=0.01, beta1=10, beta2=10,
                 sigma.alpha1=0.01, sigma.alpha2=0.01))
```

```
uni.model = jags.model(model1, data, inits, n.chains=3)
```

```
## Compiling data graph
## Resolving undeclared variables
## Allocating nodes
## Initializing
## Reading data back into data table
## Compiling model graph
## Resolving undeclared variables
## Allocating nodes
## Graph information:
## Observed stochastic nodes: 300
## Unobserved stochastic nodes: 105
## Total graph size: 1031
## Initializing model
```

```
uni.model.run <- coda.samples(uni.model, c("beta1","beta2","sigma.y","sigma.alpha1","sigma.alpha2"),
                              n.iter=100000, n.burnin = 1000)
```

```
#summary statistic table
```

```
summary(window(uni.model.run, 400))
```

```
##
## Iterations = 1001:101000
## Thinning interval = 1
## Number of chains = 3
## Sample size per chain = 1e+05
##
## 1. Empirical mean and standard deviation for each variable,
## plus standard error of the mean:
##
##      Mean      SD Naive SE Time-series SE
## beta1    0.116953 0.190292 3.474e-04    3.502e-04
## beta2    -0.005431 0.003676 6.712e-06    7.595e-06
```

2

```
## sigma.alpha1 1.329254 0.141000 2.574e-04    3.754e-04
## sigma.alpha2 0.024224 0.002891 5.278e-06    8.571e-06
## sigma.y      0.382485 0.019200 3.509e-05    5.022e-05
##
## 2. Quantiles for each variable:
##
##      2.5%      25%      50%      75%      97.5%
## beta1    -0.25814 -0.009938 0.117273 0.24353 0.49150
## beta2    -0.01268 -0.007877 -0.005426 -0.00299 0.00181
## sigma.alpha1 1.08731 1.229695 1.317602 1.41553 1.63366
## sigma.alpha2 0.01919 0.022198 0.024004 0.02601 0.03051
## sigma.y    0.34700 0.369147 0.381696 0.39495 0.42238
```

1(c)

```
# 95% confidence interval for beta1
quantile(unlist(uni.model.run[, "beta1"]), c(0.025, 0.975))
```

```
##      2.5%      97.5%
## -0.2581416 0.4914958
```

```
# 95% confidence interval for beta2
quantile(unlist(uni.model.run[, "beta2"]), c(0.025, 0.975))
```

```
##      2.5%      97.5%
## -0.012683478 0.001809773
```

Considering a flat prior, we can see that the posterior distribution for beta has same shape as the likelihood of the prior. This implies that as the likelihood has a 0 mean, we have 0 in the confidence intervals as well.

Problem 2

2(a)

```
x <- coda.samples(bi.model, c("beta","sigma.y","Omega","rho","pb"), n.iter=1000)
# autocorr.diag(2), ask=TRUE
# gelman.diag(2, autoburnin=FALSE, multivariate=FALSE)
# gelman.plot(2, autoburnin=FALSE, ask=TRUE, ylim=c(0.9, 1.1))
## Since the plots don't show convergence in case of some parameters, we run it longer.
```

```
# Bivariate prior formulation
model2 <- textConnection("
data {
  dim.Y <- dim(Y)
}
model {
  for(i in 1:dim.Y[1]) {
```

3

```
for(j in 1:dim.Y[2]) {
  Y[i,j] ~ dnorm(mu[i,j], tauusq.y)
  mu[i,j] <- alpha[i,1] + alpha[i,2] * (X[j] - Xbar)
}
alpha[i,1:2] ~ dnmorm(betas, Omega.inv)

tausq.y ~ dgamma(0.001, 0.001)
beta ~ dnmorm(mu0, Sigma.inv)
Omega.inv ~ dwhish(2*Omega0, 2)
Omega <- inverse(Omega.inv)
sigma.y <- 1 / sqrt(tausq.y)

rho <- Omega[1,2] / sqrt(Omega[1,1] * Omega[2,2])
pb <- rho > 0
}
```

2(b)

```
inits_new <- list(list(tausq.y=1, beta=c(0,0),
                     Omega.inv=diag(2)),
                 list(tausq.y=10, beta=c(10,10),
                     Omega.inv=diag(2)),
                 list(tausq.y=100, beta=c(-10,-10),
                     Omega.inv=diag(2)))
```

```
bi.model <- jags.model(model2, data_new, inits_new, n.chains=3)
```

```
## Compiling data graph
## Resolving undeclared variables
## Allocating nodes
## Initializing
## Reading data back into data table
## Compiling model graph
## Resolving undeclared variables
## Allocating nodes
## Graph information:
## Observed stochastic nodes: 300
## Unobserved stochastic nodes: 53
## Total graph size: 1096
## Initializing model
```

```
x = coda.samples(bi.model, c("beta","sigma.y","Omega","rho","pb"), n.iter=1000)
## Assess convergence
# autocorr.diag(2), ask=TRUE
# gelman.diag(2, autoburnin=FALSE, multivariate=FALSE)
# gelman.plot(2, autoburnin=FALSE, ask=TRUE, ylim=c(0.9, 1.1))
## Since the plots don't show convergence in case of some parameters, we run it longer.
```

```
bi.model.run <- coda.samples(bi.model, c("beta","sigma.y","Omega","rho","pb"),
                              n.iter=100000)
summary(window(bi.model.run, 1300))
```

```
##
## Iterations = 6001:106000
## Thinning interval = 1
## Number of chains = 3
## Sample size per chain = 1e+05
##
## 1. Empirical mean and standard deviation for each variable,
## plus standard error of the mean:
##
##      Mean      SD Naive SE Time-series SE
## Omega[1,1] 5.915215 1.234430 2.254e-03    2.325e-03
## Omega[2,1] 0.005535 0.024821 4.532e-05    4.629e-05
## Omega[1,2] -0.043464 -0.010289 -0.005351 0.021071 0.055678
## Omega[2,2] 0.003275 0.004157 0.004748 0.004556 0.007252
## beta[1]    0.117128 0.345805 6.314e-04    6.340e-04
## beta[2]    -0.005440 0.009948 1.816e-05    1.834e-05
## pb         0.591933 0.491476 8.973e-04    9.133e-04
## rho        0.032256 0.140000 2.856e-04    2.621e-04
## sigma.y    0.381470 0.019100 3.487e-05    4.922e-05
```

2(c)

```
# posterior probability
mean(unlist(bi.model.run[, "pb"])) > 0)
```

```
## [1] 0.5919333
```