

CSCI 5525 – Advanced Machine Learning (Fall 2023)
Project Proposal Peer Review Rubric

Please use the following rubric as you do your peer review. For the proposal, please provide at least 4 pieces of feedback. The feedback must be from each of the following 4 main areas (rows) below. For each piece of feedback, provide the corresponding symbol and one or more lines of text describing your feedback (this can be in the form of a question, suggestion, or pointing out what was missing). For the symbol, replace the “X” with the column number corresponding to your feedback. For example, “PD-2”, “M-0”, “ML-1”, “DCT-2”, etc. (See additional examples below.)

Main Area	Symbol	0	1	2
High-level problem description	PD-X	No problem described	Problem described but not high-level or in an understandable way	Clear description of problem
Motivation, i.e., “why do we care?”	M-X	No motivation given	Some motivation provided but is weak or unclear	Strong motivation given
How to use ML to solve problem, Do we need ML?, Are the methods reasonable/make sense?	ML-X	No ML described to solve problem	Some ML mentioned but not clear how they would solve the problem	Clear description of why ML is needed and how it solves the problem
What data/compute/tools will be needed?	DCT-X	No data, compute, or tools mentioned	One or more of data, compute, and tools mentioned but not clear what they are and why they are needed	One or more of data, compute, and tools identified (with links, name, etc.)

In addition to providing 4 pieces of feedback using the table above, please provide at least 3 things you would like the student to consider about their project. This can be anything from the algorithms to use, to the type of data, to digging into an area more, or answering a specific question. Describe each with one or more lines of text.

Please provide feedback that you think is useful to the student. Simple saying they did a good/bad job in all areas is not sufficient. We will grade based on the quality of the feedback.

Examples:

1. If the proposal provided some motivation but it was not clear, write “M-1” by the corresponding paragraph (or mention the paragraph number) with, for example, the text “You mention solving this problem will improve prediction accuracy but for which applications will it be useful?”
2. An example thing you would like the student to consider could be something like “The dataset you’ve identified is limited to a small subgroup of people which could bias your model. We would like to see you consider using additional datasets to get better data representation which may help your model perform better when you deploy it in practice.”