

## Varieties of Freedom\*

Mondays 11:20am – 1:50pm

Professor Shimon Edelman  
Department of Psychology  
Cornell University  
Ithaca, NY 14853  
<http://shimon-edelman.github.io>

We are not free to cease being free.

*Being and Nothingness*  
— JEAN-PAUL SARTRE

At fifteen I set my heart on learning. At thirty I could stand. At forty I had no doubts. At fifty I knew the Decree of Heaven. At sixty I was already obedient [to this Decree]. At seventy I could follow the desires of my mind without overstepping the boundaries [of what is right].

*Analects*  
— CONFUCIUS

## 1 Motivation and overview

It should not be surprising that humans, as individually self-aware members of an ultrasocial species, are deeply conflicted by the concept of freedom. Being free means different things to different people; moreover, people often disagree about how much freedom can, or should, be had by their conspecifics, or even by themselves. In this advanced seminar, we shall discuss some of the questions that arise with regard to freedom, sampling from a range of disciplines, including philosophy, evolution and psychology, history and geography, anthropology, politics, and education.

---

\*Version 2, August 3, 2022.

## 2 Notes for participants

This section contains essential information for participants: format description, inclusion statement,<sup>1</sup> ground rules for discussion, and credit requirements.

### 2.1 Format

#### 2.1.1 The prerequisites

At least one course in a social science (psychology, sociology, anthropology), or permission of instructor.

### 2.2 Diversity, inclusion, and ground rules for discussion

Unlike in a large-enrollment lecture-based course, in which some students may choose, and succeed, to remain virtually anonymous, in a small-class seminar setting you are required to speak in front of the class (when presenting) and are expected to contribute to the discussion on other occasions. Because *your* informed opinion on every aspect of the material is unique and valuable, I shall strive to facilitate the conversation so as to make all voices heard. In this, I'll be counting on your help, and on the help of your classmates.

Even matters of “consensus” are not always easy to talk about, as the rare dissenters who dare voice their opposition know full well; how then should we approach potentially controversial topics? With care and compassion, diligence, openness, and daring: care for our shared humanity; diligence with regard to the relevant knowledge and findings; openness to informed dissent; and daring to venture into uncharted territory, as befits good education.

If at any point during the semester (no matter whether in class or after hours) you feel that you need to talk about any of these things, please let me know immediately — doing so will be my top priority.

### 2.3 Credit and grading

There are three components to getting credit for this course:

1. Attend and contribute to the discussion during the **weekly meetings**. During the **closing discussion** at the last meeting of the semester (December 5), offer brief (5 min or so) remarks summing up your impressions and lessons from the semester.
2. By 9am on the Monday for which readings have been assigned, post on the Canvas discussion board **questions** on the material (at least 10 questions should be submitted by the end of the semester). Be prepared to raise these questions in class.
3. By Labor Day (September 5, no class), **choose** the dates of your **two presentations**.

A typical presentation should include

- a brief introduction to the topic and an overview of the background to the paper(s) and the relevant methodology;

---

<sup>1</sup>The remarks in section 2.2, which are specific to this course, are intended to supplement the official Cornell statement on diversity and inclusion, which covers dimensions such as gender, race, socio-economic background, etc., and which can be found here: <http://diversity.cornell.edu/>.

- the paper's findings / arguments;
- a critique of the approach;
- a summary of the conclusions and their significance for the seminar's theme.

It is recommended that the presenting teams meet/Zoom with the instructor ahead of their presentations, to address any questions and coordinate the details.

**Final grade components** (for reference only; no numerical assessment of anything will be made in this seminar):—

Weekly questions	30%
Participation in the discussions:	10%
Presentations:	60%

### 3 Weekly topics and readings

- **(August 22) OVERVIEW. PRELIMINARIES.**

1. Frankfurt, H. G. (1971). Freedom of the will and the concept of a person. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 68(1), 5–20.
2. Edelman, S. (2008). *Computing the mind: how the mind really works*. Oxford University Press, New York, NY, section 10.1: Selfhood and Freedom.
3. Bidney, D. (1963). The varieties of human freedom. In D. Bidney, editor, *The Concept of Freedom in Anthropology*, Studies in General Anthropology, 1, pages 11–34. De Gruyter Mouton, The Hague.

- **(August 29) FREEDOM: A EUROPEAN PHILOSOPHICAL PERSPECTIVE**

1. Berlin, I. (1969). Two concepts of liberty. In *Four Essays on Liberty*, pages 121–154, 169–172. Clarendon Press, Oxford, UK.
2. Arendt, H. (2017). The freedom to be free. *New England Review*, 38(2), 56–69. A lecture delivered in 1966-7.
3. Graeber, D. (2013). Two notions of liberty revisited or, How to disentangle liberty and slavery. Open Democracy Forum. Available online at <https://theanarchistlibrary.org/library/david-graeber-two-notions-of-liberty-revisited?v=1642976432>.
4. [OPTIONAL] McBride, W. L. (1990). “Two Concepts of Liberty” thirty years later: A Sartre-inspired critique. *Social Theory and Practice*, 16(3), 297–322.

- (September 5) [Labor Day — no class]

- **(September 12) FREEDOM: A CHINESE PHILOSOPHICAL PERSPECTIVE.**

1. Wu, G. (2006). On the idea of freedom and its rejection in Chinese thought and institutions. *Asian Philosophy*, 16(3), 219–235.
2. Li, C. (2014). The Confucian conception of freedom. *Philosophy East and West*, 64(4), 902–919. Special issue: Tenth East-West philosophers' conference, “Value and Values: Economics and Justice in an Age of Global Interdependence”.

- **(September 19) FREEDOM: AN AFRICAN PHILOSOPHICAL PERSPECTIVE.**

1. Metz, T. (2017). Confucianism and African philosophy. In A. Afolayan and T. Falola, editors, *The Palgrave handbook of African philosophy*, chapter 14, pages 207–221. Palgrave Macmillan, New York, NY.
2. Kayange, G. M. (2020). Capitalism and freedom in African communitarianism. In *Capitalism and Freedom in African Political Philosophy*, chapter 3, pages 45–72. Springer, Cham, Switzerland.

- **(September 26) FREEDOM AND CAPITALISM.**

1. Ci, J. (1999). Justice, freedom, and the moral bounds of capitalism. *Social Theory and Practice*, 25(3), 409–438.
2. Brighouse, H. (2021). If you're a socialist you need the Real Utopias Project, whether you like it or not. Paper presented at the conference “Engaging Erik Wright: Between Class Analysis and Real Utopias,” October 9, 2021.
3. [OPTIONAL] Wright, E. O. (2013). Transforming capitalism through real utopias. *American Sociological Review*, 78, 1–25.

- **(October 3) FREEDOM, CAPITALISM, AND THE STATE.**

1. Graeber, D. (2006). Turning modes of production inside out or, Why capitalism is a transformation of slavery. *Critique of Anthropology*, 26(1), 61–85.
2. Jun, N. (2018b). The state. In B. Franks, N. Jun, and L. Williams, editors, *Anarchism: A Conceptual Approach*, chapter 1, pages 27–45. Routledge, New York, NY.
3. [OPTIONAL] Scott, J. C. (2009). *The Art of Not Being Governed*. Yale University Press, New Haven, CT.
4. [OPTIONAL] Harman, C. (2010). *Zombie Capitalism: Global Crisis and the Relevance of Marx*. Haymarket Books, Chicago, IL.

- (October 11) [Fall break — no class]

- **(October 17) FREEDOM, THE STATE, AND THE CASE FOR ANARCHISM.**

1. Wolff, R. P. (1970). *In Defense of Anarchism*. Harper and Row, New York, NY. Available online at <https://theanarchistlibrary.org/library/robert-paul-wolff-in-defense-of-anarchism.pdf>.
2. Wiśniewski, J. B. (2020). Is statism an amoral philosophy? *Studia Humana*, 9(2), 121–126.

- **(October 24) FREEDOM AND COOPERATION: EVOLUTION.**

1. Gowdy, J. and Krall, L. (2016). The economic origins of ultrasociality. *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, 39, e92.
2. Henrich, J. and Muthukrishna, M. (2021). The origins and psychology of human cooperation. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 72(24), 1–34.

- **(October 31) FREEDOM AND COOPERATION: ANTHROPOLOGY.**

1. Lee, D. (1963). Freedom and social constraint. In D. Bidney, editor, *The Concept of Freedom in Anthropology*, Studies in General Anthropology, 1, pages 61–73. De Gruyter Mouton, The Hague.
2. Maslow, A. H. and Honigsmann, J. J. (1970). Synergy: some notes of Ruth Benedict. *American Anthropologist*, 72, 320–333.
3. Boehm, C., Barclay, H. B., Dentan, R. K., Dupre, M.-C., Hill, J. D., Kent, S., Knauff, B. M., Otterbein, K. F., and Rayner, S. (1993). Egalitarian behavior and reverse dominance hierarchy [and comments and reply]. *Current Anthropology*, 34(3), 227–254.

- **(November 7) FREEDOM AND COOPERATION: ANTHROPOLOGY AND HISTORY.**

1. Graeber, D. (2004). *Fragments of an Anarchist Anthropology*. Prickly Paradigm Press, Chicago, IL. Available online at <https://www.prickly-paradigm.com/titles/fragments-anarchist.html>.
2. Graeber, D. and Wengrow, D. (2018). How to change the course of human history (at least, the part that’s already happened). Eurozine. Available online at <https://www.eurozine.com/change-course-human-history/>.
3. [OPTIONAL] Graeber, D. and Wengrow, D. (2021). *The Dawn of Everything: A New History of Humanity*. Macmillan, London, UK.

- **(November 14) ANARCHISM: FREEDOM, PREFIGURATION, EDUCATION**

1. Jun, N. (2018a). Freedom. In B. Franks, N. Jun, and L. Williams, editors, *Anarchism: A Conceptual Approach*, chapter 3, pages 44–59. Routledge, New York, NY.
2. Franks, B. (2018). Prefiguration. In B. Franks, N. Jun, and L. Williams, editors, *Anarchism: A Conceptual Approach*, chapter 2, pages 28–43. Routledge, New York, NY.
3. Suissa, J. (2001). Anarchism, utopias and philosophy of education. *Journal of Philosophy of Education*, 35(4), 627–646.
4. [OPTIONAL] Suissa, J. (2019). Anarchist education. In C. Levy and M. S. Adams, editors, *The Palgrave Handbook of Anarchism*, chapter 29, pages 511–529. Palgrave Macmillan, Cham, Switzerland.

- **(November 21) ANARCHIST PRAXIS: CHIAPAS.**

1. Anderson, J. K. and Springer, N. J. (2018). Zapatismo as a resonant public pedagogy. *Latin American Perspectives*, 45(3), 151–170.
2. Maldonado-Villalpando, E., Paneque-Gálvez, J., Demaria, F., and Napoletano, B. M. (2022). Grassroots innovation for the pluriverse: evidence from Zapatismo and autonomous Zapatista education. *Sustainability Science*, 17, 1301–1316.

- **(November 28) ANARCHIST PRAXIS: ROJAVA.**

1. Dirik, D. (2022). Stateless citizenship: ‘radical democracy as consciousness-raising’ in the Rojava revolution. *Identities*, 29(1), 27–44.
2. Piccardi, E. G. and Barca, S. (2022). Jin-jîyan-azadi. Matristic culture and Democratic Confederalism in Rojava. *Sustainability Science*, 17, 1273–1285.
3. [OPTIONAL] Gerber, D. and Brincat, S. (2021). When Öcalan met Bookchin: The Kurdish freedom movement and the political theory of democratic confederalism. *Geopolitics*, 26(4), 973–997.

- **(December 5) CLOSING GENERAL DISCUSSION.**

1. [OPTIONAL] Le Guin, U. K. (1974). *The Dispossessed*. Harper & Row, New York, NY.
2. [OPTIONAL] Doctorow, C. (2017). *Walkaway*. Tor Books, New York, NY.
3. [OPTIONAL] Graeber, D. and Wengrow, D. (2021). *The Dawn of Everything: A New History of Humanity*. Macmillan, London, UK.

— — —

## References

- Anderson, J. K. and Springer, N. J. (2018). Zapatismo as a resonant public pedagogy. *Latin American Perspectives*, 45(3), 151–170.
- Arendt, H. (2017). The freedom to be free. *New England Review*, 38(2), 56–69. A lecture delivered in 1966-7.
- Berlin, I. (1969). Two concepts of liberty. In *Four Essays on Liberty*, pages 121–154, 169–172. Clarendon Press, Oxford, UK.
- Bidney, D. (1963). The varieties of human freedom. In D. Bidney, editor, *The Concept of Freedom in Anthropology*, Studies in General Anthropology, 1, pages 11–34. De Gruyter Mouton, The Hague.
- Boehm, C., Barclay, H. B., Dentan, R. K., Dupre, M.-C., Hill, J. D., Kent, S., Knauff, B. M., Otterbein, K. F., and Rayner, S. (1993). Egalitarian behavior and reverse dominance hierarchy [and comments and reply]. *Current Anthropology*, 34(3), 227–254.
- Brighouse, H. (2021). If you’re a socialist you need the Real Utopias Project, whether you like it or not. Paper presented at the conference “Engaging Erik Wright: Between Class Analysis and Real Utopias,” October 9, 2021.
- Ci, J. (1999). Justice, freedom, and the moral bounds of capitalism. *Social Theory and Practice*, 25(3), 409–438.
- Dirik, D. (2022). Stateless citizenship: ‘radical democracy as consciousness-raising’ in the Rojava revolution. *Identities*, 29(1), 27–44.

- Doctorow, C. (2017). *Walkaway*. Tor Books, New York, NY.
- Edelman, S. (2008). *Computing the mind: how the mind really works*. Oxford University Press, New York, NY.
- Frankfurt, H. G. (1971). Freedom of the will and the concept of a person. *The Journal of Philosophy*, 68(1), 5–20.
- Franks, B. (2018). Prefiguration. In B. Franks, N. Jun, and L. Williams, editors, *Anarchism: A Conceptual Approach*, chapter 2, pages 28–43. Routledge, New York, NY.
- Gerber, D. and Brincat, S. (2021). When Öcalan met Bookchin: The Kurdish freedom movement and the political theory of democratic confederalism. *Geopolitics*, 26(4), 973–997.
- Gowdy, J. and Krall, L. (2016). The economic origins of ultrasociality. *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, 39, e92.
- Graeber, D. (2004). *Fragments of an Anarchist Anthropology*. Prickly Paradigm Press, Chicago, IL. Available online at <https://www.prickly-paradigm.com/titles/fragments-anarchist-anthropology.html>.
- Graeber, D. (2006). Turning modes of production inside out or, Why capitalism is a transformation of slavery. *Critique of Anthropology*, 26(1), 61–85.
- Graeber, D. (2013). Two notions of liberty revisited or, How to disentangle liberty and slavery. Open Democracy Forum. Available online at <https://theanarchistlibrary.org/library/david-graeber-two-notions-of-liberty-revisited?v=1642976432>.
- Graeber, D. and Wengrow, D. (2018). How to change the course of human history (at least, the part that’s already happened). Eurozine. Available online at <https://www.eurozine.com/change-course-human-history/>.
- Graeber, D. and Wengrow, D. (2021). *The Dawn of Everything: A New History of Humanity*. Macmillan, London, UK.
- Harman, C. (2010). *Zombie Capitalism: Global Crisis and the Relevance of Marx*. Haymarket Books, Chicago, IL.
- Henrich, J. and Muthukrishna, M. (2021). The origins and psychology of human cooperation. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 72(24), 1–34.
- Jun, N. (2018a). Freedom. In B. Franks, N. Jun, and L. Williams, editors, *Anarchism: A Conceptual Approach*, chapter 3, pages 44–59. Routledge, New York, NY.
- Jun, N. (2018b). The state. In B. Franks, N. Jun, and L. Williams, editors, *Anarchism: A Conceptual Approach*, chapter 1, pages 27–45. Routledge, New York, NY.
- Kayange, G. M. (2020). Capitalism and freedom in African communitarianism. In *Capitalism and Freedom in African Political Philosophy*, chapter 3, pages 45–72. Springer, Cham, Switzerland.
- Le Guin, U. K. (1974). *The Dispossessed*. Harper & Row, New York, NY.

- Lee, D. (1963). Freedom and social constraint. In D. Bidney, editor, *The Concept of Freedom in Anthropology*, Studies in General Anthropology, 1, pages 61–73. De Gruyter Mouton, The Hague.
- Li, C. (2014). The Confucian conception of freedom. *Philosophy East and West*, 64(4), 902–919. Special issue: Tenth East-West philosophers’ conference, “Value and Values: Economics and Justice in an Age of Global Interdependence”.
- Maldonado-Villalpando, E., Paneque-Gálvez, J., Demaria, F., and Napoletano, B. M. (2022). Grassroots innovation for the pluriverse: evidence from Zapatismo and autonomous Zapatista education. *Sustainability Science*, 17, 1301–1316.
- Maslow, A. H. and Honigmann, J. J. (1970). Synergy: some notes of Ruth Benedict. *American Anthropologist*, 72, 320–333.
- McBride, W. L. (1990). “Two Concepts of Liberty” thirty years later: A Sartre-inspired critique. *Social Theory and Practice*, 16(3), 297–322.
- Metz, T. (2017). Confucianism and African philosophy. In A. Afolayan and T. Falola, editors, *The Palgrave handbook of African philosophy*, chapter 14, pages 207–221. Palgrave Macmillan, New York, NY.
- Piccardi, E. G. and Barca, S. (2022). Jin-jiyan-azadi. Matristic culture and Democratic Confederalism in Rojava. *Sustainability Science*, 17, 1273–1285.
- Scott, J. C. (2009). *The Art of Not Being Governed*. Yale University Press, New Haven, CT.
- Suissa, J. (2001). Anarchism, utopias and philosophy of education. *Journal of Philosophy of Education*, 35(4), 627–646.
- Suissa, J. (2019). Anarchist education. In C. Levy and M. S. Adams, editors, *The Palgrave Handbook of Anarchism*, chapter 29, pages 511–529. Palgrave Macmillan, Cham, Switzerland.
- Wiśniewski, J. B. (2020). Is statism an amoral philosophy? *Studia Humana*, 9(2), 121–126.
- Wolff, R. P. (1970). *In Defense of Anarchism*. Harper and Row, New York, NY. Available online at <https://theanarchistlibrary.org/library/robert-paul-wolff-in-defense-of-anarchism.pdf>.
- Wright, E. O. (2013). Transforming capitalism through real utopias. *American Sociological Review*, 78, 1–25.
- Wu, G. (2006). On the idea of freedom and its rejection in Chinese thought and institutions. *Asian Philosophy*, 16(3), 219–235.