## Modes of convergence : Theorems, Examples and Counterexamples

## Shrivathsa Pandelu

October 16, 2020

These notes are mostly from [1]. All our functions are going to be measurable, so we will not explicitly specify that. Let  $(X, \mathcal{B}, \mu)$  be a measured space and  $f_n$  be real or complex valued measurable functions on X and f be another such function. Often, when the measure is clear (we will anyway not need more than one measure), we write  $\int_X f$  for  $\int_X f d\mu$ . We say

- Pointwise convergence:  $f_n \to f$  pointwise almost everywhere (abbreviated a.e.) if for almost all  $x \in X$ ,  $f_n(x)$  converges to f(x).
- Convergence in  $L^p$ :  $f_n$  converge to f in  $L^p$  if the  $L^p$  norm  $||f_n f||_p = (\int_X |f_n f|^p d\mu)^{1/p}$  converges to zero. Here  $p \in [1, \infty)$ .
- Convergence in  $L^{\infty}$ : This is similar to the previous convergence. If g is a function on X, it is essentially bounded by M > 0 if  $\{x : |g(x)| > M\}$  has measure zero. The  $L^{\infty}$  norm is defined as  $\|g\|_{\infty} = \inf\{M : g \text{ is essentially bounded by } M\}$ .
- Almost uniform convergence: This is a generalization of uniform convergence.  $f_n$  converge almost uniformly to f if for every  $\epsilon > 0$  there is a measurable set E of measure at most  $\epsilon$  such that  $f_n$  converge to f uniformly on  $X \setminus E$ .
- Convergence in measure:  $f_n$  converge in measure to f if for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , the measures  $\mu(\{x : |f_n(x) f(x)| > \epsilon\}$  converge to zero as  $n \to \infty$ .

**Theorem 1.** (Monotone Convergence Theorem) Let  $f_n$  be a non decreasing sequence of non negative measurable functions. Define  $f(x) = \lim_{n \to \infty} f_n(n) = \sup_{n \to \infty} f_n(n) = \sup_{n \to \infty} f_n(n)$ . Then f is measurable and

$$\int_{X} f d\mu = \lim_{n \to \infty} f_n d\mu.$$

**Theorem 2.** (Fatou's lemma) Let  $f_n$  be a sequence of non negative measurable functions, then

$$\int_{X} \liminf_{n \to \infty} f_n d\mu \le \liminf_{n \to \infty} \int_{X} f_n d\mu.$$

In particular, if  $f_n \to f$  pointwise a.e., then  $\int_X f d\mu \leq \liminf \int_X f_n d\mu$ .

**Theorem 3.** (Dominated Convergence Theorem) Let  $f_n$  be a sequence of real or complex valued functions on X convergine pointwise a.e. to a function f. Then f is measurable. Further suppose  $g \in L^1(\mu)$  is a non negative function dominating all  $f_n$ , i.e.,  $|f_n(x)| \leq g(x)$  a.e., then f is in  $L^1(\mu)$  and  $\int_X f d\mu = \lim \int_X f_n d\mu$ . Additionally,  $f_n$  converge to f in  $L^1$ .

Some counter-examples:

• Pointwise convergence does not imply  $L^1$  convergence: (Escape to vertical infinity) Consider the sequence  $n\chi_{[0,1/n]}$  on [0,1] converging pointwise to 0 almost everywhere, but all the integrals are 1, not converging to zero.

We also have width infinity, consider  $\chi_{[0,n]}/n$  converging pointwise to 0 on  $\mathbb{R}$ , but not in  $L^1$  and escape to infinity with  $1\chi_{[n,n+1]}$  converging to zero pointwise but not in  $L^1$ .

•  $L^1$  converged does not imply pointwise a.e. convergence: Consider the typewriter sequence  $\chi_{[0,1/n]}, \chi_{[1/n,2/n]}, \ldots, \chi_{[1-1/n,1]}$  which converge to zero in  $L^1$  norm, but not pointwise because at every point the sequence is 1 and 0 infinitely often.

Some implications:

- Clearly uniform convergence implies almost uniform convergence, and pointwise convergence.
- If  $f_n$  converge almost uniformly to f, then obtain the set  $E_m$  of measure at most  $1/2^m$  outside which  $f_n$  converge uniformly, hence pointwise, to f. If  $x \notin \bigcap_{N \ge 1} \bigcup_{n \ge N} E_n$ , then  $f_n(x) \to f(x)$  and it is clear that this exception set has measure zero, therefore  $f_n$  converge a.e. to f.
- If  $f_n$  converge uniformly to f, then clearly  $f_n$  converge in  $L^{\infty}$  to f. Conversely, suppose they converge in  $L^{\infty}$ . Given 1/m, there is an integer  $N_m$ , such that for  $n \geq N_m$ ,  $|f_n f|$  is essentially bounded by 2/m, i.e., for each  $n \geq N_m$ , there is a measure zero set  $E_{n,m}$  such that  $|f_n(x) f(x)| < 1/m$  for  $x \notin E_{n,m}$ . Take  $E = \bigcup_{m \geq 1} \bigcup_{n \geq N_m} E_{n,m}$ , then  $\mu(E) = 0$  and it is clear that  $f_n$  converge uniformly to f outside E. Therefore,  $f_n$  converge almost uniformly and uniformly outside a null set to f.
- If  $f_n$  converge to f almost uniformly, then it converges in measure for fix  $\epsilon > 0$ . Given any 1/m, find a set E of measure at most 1/m such that  $f_n$  converge uniformly outside E. Then for some large N,  $\{x: |f_n(x) f(x)| > \epsilon\} \subseteq E \,\forall \, n \geq N$ , hence  $\limsup \mu\{x: |f_n(x) f(x)| > \epsilon\} \leq 1/m$ .

**Theorem 4.** (Uniqueness) Suppose a sequence of measureable real/complex valued functions  $f_n$  on X converge to f along one of the modes above and to g along another, then f = g a.e.

*Proof.* The proof can be reduced to specific modes of convergence using the implications above. For a proof, see [1].

**Theorem 5.** (Chebyshev-Markov inequality) Let  $(X, \mu)$  be a measured space and f a measurable function. Then

$$\mu(\{x: |f(x)| \ge \epsilon\}) \le \frac{1}{\epsilon} \|f\|_1$$

for every  $\epsilon > 0$ .

*Proof.* This is a really simple inequality. Let  $A = \{x : |f(x)| \ge \epsilon\}$ , then A is measurable and

$$\mu(A) = \int_{Y} \chi_{A} d\mu \le \int_{Y} \frac{1}{\epsilon} |f| d\mu = \frac{1}{\epsilon} \|f\|_{1}.$$

Corollary 1. If  $f_n$  converge in  $L^1$  to f, then they converge in measure as well.

**Theorem 6.** (Egorov's theorem) Let  $(X, \mu)$  be a finite measure space and  $f_n$  converge pointwise a.e. to f, then they converge almost uniformly to f.

*Proof.* In order to show uniform convergence, we need to show that  $|f_n - f|$  can be made uniformly small. Given N, m set

$$E_{N,m} = \{x | \exists n \ge N : |f_n(x) - f(x)| > 1/m \}.$$

Observe that for a fixed  $m, E_{1,m} \supseteq E_{2,m} \supseteq \ldots$  Moreover, by a.e. pointwise convergence, the set  $\cap_n E_{n,m}$  has measure zero. Since X is a finite measure space,  $\mu(\cap_n E_{n,m}) = \lim_n \mu(E_{n,m}) = \inf_n E_{n,m}$ . Given  $\epsilon > 0$ , for every m, choose  $N_m$  such that for  $n \ge N_m, \mu(E_{n,m}) \le \epsilon/2^m$ , and take  $E = \bigcup_{m \ge 1} E_{N_m,m}$ . Then,  $\mu(E) \le \epsilon$  and if  $x \notin E$ , then it is not in every  $E_{N_m,m}$ , hence for  $n \ge N_m, |f_n(x) - f(x)| \le 1/m$  and this  $N_m$  doesn't depend on x, therefore  $f_n$  converges uniformly to f outside A.

*Remark.* Note that the purpose of finite measure was to obtain a downward monotone convergence. If there were other ways to obtain  $N_m$ , then the proof above holds.

Here is another implication under the assumption of finite measure.

**Theorem 7.** (Comparision of  $L^p$  spaces) Suppose  $(X, \mu)$  is a finite measure space. Then, for any  $1 \le p_2 \le p_1 \le \infty$ , there is a continuous inclusion  $L^{p_1}(\mu) \hookrightarrow L^{p_2}(\mu)$  with  $\|f\|_{p_2} \le \mu(X)^{1/p_2-1/p_1} \|f\|_{p_1}$ .

*Proof.* We borrow the proof from [2]. First, if  $p_2 = \infty$ , then there is nothing to prove, so we may take  $p_2 < \infty$ . If  $p_1 = \infty$ , then suppose  $f \in L^{\infty}(\mu)$  and  $||f||_{\infty} = M < \infty$ . Then, given any  $\epsilon > 0$ , we have

$$\int_X |f|^{p_2} \le \int_X (M + \epsilon) = \mu(X)(\|f\|_{\infty} + \epsilon) < \infty.$$

Hence,  $f \in L^{p_2}(\mu)$  and  $||f||_{p_2} \le \mu(X)^{1/p_2}(||f||_{\infty} + \epsilon)$ . Since  $\epsilon > 0$  was arbitrary, we see that the inequality in the statement holds. Now we can take  $p_1 < \infty$ .

Given  $p \in [1, \infty]$ , let q be its dual exponent, i.e., a solution to 1/p + 1/q = 1. Then, by Holder's inequality for any  $f \in L^{p_1}(\mu)$ ,

$$\int_X |f|^{p_2} d\mu \le \|f^{p_2}\|_p \|1\|_q = \mu(X)^{1/q} \|f^{p_2}\|_p.$$

Take  $p = p_1/p_2 \ge 1$ , then  $q = 1 - p_2/p_1$  and the inequality above becomes

$$||f||_{p_2}^{p_2} \le ||f||_{p_1}^{p_2} \mu(X)^{1-p_2/p_1}$$

which finishes the proof.

Corollary 2. With the setup as above, if  $f_n$  converge in  $L^{p_1}$  to f, then they converge in  $L^{p_2}$  as well.

**Theorem 8.** (Lusin's theorem) Let  $f: \mathbb{R}^d \to \mathbb{C}$  be absolutely integrable and let  $\epsilon > 0$ . Then there is a measurable  $E, \lambda(E) \leq \epsilon$  such that  $f|_{\mathbb{R}^d \setminus E}$  is continuous (here  $\lambda$  is the Lebesgue measure on  $\mathbb{R}^d$ ).

*Proof.* Using approximations theorems, one can find compactly supported continuous functions  $f_n$  such that  $||f - f_n|| \le \epsilon/4^n$ . By Chebyshev-Markov inequality,

$$\lambda(\{x: |f_n(x) - f(x)| > 1/2^{n+1}\}) \le \epsilon/2^{n+1}$$

so,  $|f(x) - f_n(x)| \le 1/2^{n-1}$  except on a set  $E_n$  of measure  $\le \epsilon/2^{n+1}$ .

Let  $E = \bigcup E_n$ , then  $\lambda(E) \leq \epsilon/2$ . Again, outside E, we have uniform convergence. The uniform limit of continuous functions is continuous, therefore the restriction of f is continuous outside E.  $\square$ 

*Remark.* This theorem says that the restriction is continuous, not f being continuous at points outside E. So, when  $f = 1_{\mathbb{Q}}$ , then  $E = \mathbb{Q}$  and the restriction of f is continuous on  $\mathbb{R} \setminus E$ .

**Lemma 1.** (Urysohn subsequence principle) A sequence  $\{x_n\}$  in  $\mathbb{R}$  converges to  $x \in \mathbb{R}$  if and only if every subsequence has a further subsequence converging to x.

*Proof.* Our proof applies more generally to Hausdorff spaces. If  $x_n$  converge to x, then it is clear that every subsequence converges to x. Next, suppose that  $x_n$  doesn't converge to x, then there is some open set U around x such that for every N, there is an  $n_N \geq N$  such that  $x_n \notin U$ . We can obtain an infinite sequence  $x_{n_k}$  not lying in U, therefore no subsequence of this subsequence converges to x for it cannot enter U.

**Lemma 2.** (First extension of DCT) On a measured space  $(X, \mu)$  suppose  $f_n, g_n$  are measureable and converging pointwise a.e. to f, g respectively and that  $|f_n| \leq g_n, n \geq 1$ . Further suppose  $g_n \in L^1 \forall n \geq 1$  and  $g \in L^1$  with  $\int g_n \to \int g$ . Then  $f_n$  converges to f in  $L^1$ .

*Proof.* Because  $|f_n| \leq g_n$ , we have  $|f| \leq g$  a.e., therefore  $f \in L^1$ . We have  $|f_n - f| \leq g_n + g$ , so define the nonnegative function  $h_n = g_n + g - |f_n - f|$ . Applying Fatou's lemma, we get

$$\int_{X} \liminf h_{n} \le \liminf \int_{X} h_{n}$$

$$= \liminf \int_{X} g_{n} + \int_{X} g - \limsup \int_{X} |f_{n} - f|$$

Now,  $h_n$  converges pointwise to 2g and by assumption  $\int g_n \to \int g$ , therefore,  $\limsup \int_X |f_n - f| = 0$ , hence  $f_n$  converges to f in  $L^1$ .

**Theorem 9.** Suppose on a measured space  $(X, \mu)$ , the sequence  $f_n$  converges in measure to a function f, then there is a subsequence  $f_{n_k}$  converging to f pointwise.

*Proof.* Define  $E_{n,m} = \{x : |f_n(x) - f(x)| > 1/m\}$ . If we look at the sequence  $\{f_n\}$ , then

$$\{x: f_n(x) \not\to f(x)\} = \cup_{m>1} \cap_{N>1} \cup_{n>N} E_{n,m}.$$

By convergence in measure,  $\mu(E_{n,m}) \to 0$  as  $n \to \infty$  for any fixed m. For each  $k \ge 1$ , choose  $n_k$  such that

$$\mu(\lbrace x : |f_n(x) - f(x)| \ge 1/2^k \rbrace) < 1/2^k \, \forall \, n \ge n_k.$$

We may take  $n_1 < n_2 < \dots$  We claim that  $f_{n_k}$  is the subsequence we are looking for.

Given an  $x, f_{n_k}(x)$  doesn't converge to f(x) if and only if  $\epsilon_0 > 0$  (depending on x) such that infinitely many  $f_{n_k}(x)$  are outside  $f(x) \pm \epsilon_0$ . Choosing  $2^{-N} < \epsilon_0$ , we see that  $x \in \cap_{N \ge 1} \cup_{k \ge N} E_k$  where  $E_k = \{x : |f_{n_k}(x) - f(x)| > 1/2^k\}$ . We have

$$\mu(\cap_{N\geq 1} \cup k \geq NE_k) \leq \mu(\cup_{k\geq N} E_k) \leq \sum_{k>N} \frac{1}{2^k} = \frac{1}{2^{N-1}}.$$

Therefore, outside a set of measure zero,  $f_{n_k}$  converges pointwise to f.

**Corollary 3.** On a measured space  $(X, \mu)$ , suppose functions  $f_n$  converge in measure to f and that each  $f_n$  is dominated by an absolutely integrable g, then  $\int f_n \to \int f$  and  $f \in L^1(\mu)$ .

*Proof.* By going to a subsequence if necessary, we may assume that  $f_n \to f$  pointwise a.e., in which case by dominated convergence,  $f \in L^1(\mu)$ . Now, every subsequence of  $f_n$  converges in measure to f, hence has a subsequence converging pointwise a.e., and by dominated convergence theorem, we see that every subsequence of  $\{\int_X f_n\}$  has a further subsequence converging to  $\int_X f$ . By Urysohn's subsequence principle,  $\int_X f_n$  converges to  $\int_X f$ . In fact, the same argument shows that  $f_n$  converge to f in  $L^1$ .

**Lemma 3.** (Second extension of DCT; almost dominated convergence) On a measured space  $(X, \mu)$ , let  $f_n$  be measurable functions converging pointwise a.e. to f and let  $G, g_1, g_2, \ldots$  be absolutely integrable functions  $X \to [0, \infty]$  such that  $|f_n| \le G + g_n$  a.e. and  $\int_X g_n \to 0$ . Then  $f_n$  converge to f in  $L^1$ .

*Proof.* By Chebyshev-Markov inequality, it is clear that  $g_n$  converge to 0 in measure. Given a subsequence  $\{f_{n_k}\}$  obtain a subsequence  $\{g_{n_{k_l}}\}$  from  $\{g_{n_k}\}$  that converges pointwise a.e. to 0. Then  $f_{n_{k_l}}$  are bounded by  $G + g_{n_{k_l}} \in L^1(\mu)$  and  $\int_X (G + g_{n_{k_l}}) \to \int_X G$ . By the first extension of DCT,  $\{f_{n_{k_l}}\}$  converge in  $L^1$  to f. Therefore, for every subsequence of  $\{\int_X |f_n - f|\}$ , there is a further subsequence converging to 0, hence by Urysohn's subsequence principle,  $f_n$  converge in  $L^1$  to f.  $\square$ 

**Theorem 10.** (Fast  $L^1$  convergence) Suppose  $f_n$ , f are measurable real/complex valued function on a measured space  $(X, \mu)$  such that  $\sum_{n\geq 1} \|f_n - f\|_1 < \infty$ , then  $f_n$  converge pointwise a.e. and almost uniformly to f.

Proof. Set  $E_{N,m} = \{x | \exists n \geq N : |f_n(x) - f(x)| \geq 1/m \}$ , then  $E_{N,m} \subseteq \bigcup_{n \geq N} \{x : |f_n(x) - f(x)| \geq 1/m \}$ , hence  $\mu(E_{N,m}) \leq \sum_{n \geq N} m \|f_n - f\|_1 < \infty$ . By fast convergence, this measure can be made arbitrarily small. Now we repeat the argument in the proof of Egorov's theorem.

Given  $\epsilon > 0$ , for every m, choose  $N_m$  such that for  $n \geq N_m, \mu(E_{n,m}) \leq \epsilon/2^m$  and take  $E = \bigcup_{m \geq 1} E_{N_m,m}$ . Then,  $\mu(E) \leq \epsilon$  and if  $x \notin E$ , then it is not in every  $E_{N_m,m}$ , hence for  $n \geq N_m, |f_n(x) - f(x)| \leq 1/m$  and this  $N_m$  doesn't depend on x, therefore  $f_n$  converges uniformly to f outside A.

**Theorem 11.** On a measured space  $(X, \mu)$ , let  $f_n$ , f be measurable real/complex valued functions. Then  $f_n$  converge in measure to f if and only if every subsequence  $f_{n_k}$  has a further subsequence converging almost uniformly to f.

*Proof.* First suppose  $f_n$  converge in measure to f. In this case, it suffices to show that there is a subsequence converging almost uniformly to f because every subsequence also converges in measure to f. For each m, obtain  $n_m$  such that

$$\forall n \ge n_m, \mu(\{x : |f_n(x) - f(x)| > 1/m\}) \le 1/2^m.$$

We may take  $n_1 < n_2 < \dots$  Set  $E_m = \{x : |f_{n_m}(x) - f(x)| > 1/m\}$ , then  $\mu(E_m) < 1/2^m$ . We claim that  $f_{n_k}$  converge almost uniformly to f.

Now, given  $\epsilon > 0$ , choose M large enough such that  $\sum_{n \geq M} \mu(E_n) < \epsilon$ , such an M exists because the sum  $\sum 2^{-n}$  converges. Set  $E = \bigcup_{n \geq M} E_n$ . Given any  $\eta > 0$ , choose  $N \geq M$  such that  $1/N < \eta$ . If  $x \notin E$ , then  $x \notin E_k$  for k > N, hence  $|f_{n_k}(x) - f(x)| < 1/k < \eta$ , therefore  $f_{n_k}$  converge uniformly outside E, and E has measure at most  $\epsilon$ . Thus a subsequence converges almost uniformly.

Conversely suppose every subsequence  $f_{n_k}$  has a further subsequence converging almost uniformly to f. If  $f_n$  doesn't converge to f in measure, then there is some  $\epsilon_0 > 0$  such that  $\mu(\{x : |f_n(x) - f(x)| > \epsilon_0\}) \neq 0$ , so there is some  $\epsilon_1 > 0$  such that for infinitely many  $n, \mu(\{x : |f_n(x) - f(x)| > \epsilon_0\}) > \epsilon_1$ . Obtain a subsequence  $\{f_{n_k}\}$  satisfying this condition, then there is a further subsequence  $\{f_{n_{k_l}}\}$  converging almost uniformly to f.

Then, we can obtain a set E of measure at most  $\epsilon_1/2$  such that  $f_{n_{k_l}}$  converges uniformly outside E, hence there is some L such that for  $l \geq L$ ,  $|f_{n_{k_l}}(x) - f(x)| < \epsilon_0/2 \,\forall \, x \notin E$ . However, by the construction of the initial subsequence,

$$\{x: |f_{n_{k_l}}(x) - f(x)| > \epsilon_0\} \subseteq E \text{ and } \mu(\{x: |f_{n_{k_l}}(x) - f(x)| > \epsilon_0\}) > \epsilon_1$$

which is a contradiction. Therefore,  $f_n$  converge in measure to f.

The domination condition plays an important role in going from one mode of convergence to another as seen above. There is a more general condition called uniform integrability. For simplicity, suppose we have a sequence of functions that we want to say converge to zero. The problem comes when the convergence happens because the  $f_n$  escape to infinity in one of the ways mentioned earlier. We can control this escape by the condition of uniform integrability.

**Definition 1.** Let  $(X, \mu)$  be a measured space. A sequence  $\{f_n\}$  of absolutely integrable measurable functions is said to be uniformly integrable if

- $\sup \|f_n\|_1 < \infty.$
- $\sup_n \int_{|f_n|>M} |f| \to 0$  as  $M \to \infty$ . This condition prevents f from escaping vertically.
- $\sup_n \int_{|f_n| < \delta} |f| \to 0$  as  $\delta \to 0$ . This condition prevents f from spreading horizontally.

**Lemma 4.** If a sequence of absolutely integrable function  $f_n$  is dominated by a  $g \in L^1$ , then  $\{f_n\}$  is uniformly integrable.

*Proof.* We have  $|f_n| \leq g$ , so  $\sup ||f_n||_1 \leq ||g||_1 < \infty$ . Next, given M, we have

$$\int_{|f_n| > M} |f_n| \le \int_{|f_n| > M} g \le \int_{g > M} g$$

and the sequence  $g\chi_{g\leq M}$  increases to g pointwise, so by dominated convergence theorem,  $\int_{g\leq M}g\to \int_X g$  as  $M\to\infty$ , hence  $\int_{g>M}g\to 0$  as  $M\to\infty$ .

 $\int_{|f_n|<\delta} |f_n| \le \int_{|f_n|<\delta} \min(g,\delta) \le \int_X \min(g,\delta)$ 

and the sequence  $\min(g, \delta)$  converges to 0 pointwise, so by dominated convergence theorem the right side goes to 0 as  $\delta \to 0$ . Therefore,  $\{f_n\}$  is uniformly integrable.

For some other sufficient conditions for uniform integrability, see [1].

**Lemma 5.** Suppose  $f_n$  are uniformly integrable on a measured space  $(X, \mu)$ , then for every  $\epsilon > 0$  there is a  $\delta > 0$  such that

$$\int_{E} |f_n| d\mu \le \epsilon$$

whenever  $n \geq 1$  and E is a measurable set with  $\mu(E) \leq \delta$ .

*Proof.* let E be any measurable set, then

$$\int_{E} |f_n| d\mu = \int_{E \cap |f_n| > M} |f_n| d\mu + \int_{E \cap |f_n| \le M} |f_n| d\mu$$

$$\leq \int_{|f_n| > M} d\mu + M\mu(E)$$

Given  $\epsilon > 0$ , by uniform integrability, we may choose M large enough such that the first term is  $< \epsilon/2$ . We can suitably choose a  $\delta > 0$  such that  $M\delta < \epsilon/2$ , then for any measurable E we have  $\int_E |f_n| \le \epsilon$  as required.

**Theorem 12.** (Uniform integrable convergence in measure) On a measured space X, let  $f_n$  be a sequence of uniformly integrable functions and f another measurable function. Then  $f_n$  converge in  $L^1$  to f if and only if they converge in measure.

*Proof.* If it converges in  $L^1$ , then we know that it converges in measure by Chebyshev-Markov inequality. Assume it converges in measure. By uniform integrability, there is an A>0 such that  $\|f_n\|_1 \leq A \forall n \geq 1$ . We know from a previous theorem that there is a subsequence of  $f_n$  converging pointwise a.e. to f, hence by Fatou's lemma, we conclude that  $\|f\|_1 \leq A$ , therefore f is absolutely integrable.

We need to show that  $||f_n - f||_1$  converges to 0. To show that, we will divide the integral  $\int_X |f_n - f|$  into two parts as

$$\int_X |f - f_n| d\mu = \int_{|f_n - f| \ge \kappa} |f_n - f| d\mu + \int_{|f_n - f| < \kappa} |f_n - f| d\mu$$

for some suitable  $\kappa > 0$  such that both terms on the right can be made small.

Next, given  $\epsilon > 0$ , by uniform integrability, there is a  $\delta > 0$  such that

$$\int_{|f_n| < \delta} |f_n| d\mu \le \epsilon \, \forall \, n.$$

Since f is absolutely integrable, applying the dominated convergence theorem to  $f\chi_{|f|<\delta}$  and shrinking  $\delta$  if necessary, we also have

$$\int_{|f|<\delta} |f| d\mu \le \epsilon.$$

Let  $0 < \kappa < \delta/2$  be a small quantity which we will choose appropriately later. We then have

$$\int_{|f_n - f| < \kappa; |f| \le \delta/2} |f_n| d\mu \le \epsilon \text{ and } \int_{|f_n - f| < \kappa; |f| \le \delta/2} |f| d\mu \le \epsilon$$

hence by the triangle inequality,

$$\int_{|f_n - f| < \kappa; |f| < \delta/2} |f - f_n| d\mu \le 2\epsilon.$$

Lastly, by Chebyshev-Markov inequality,

$$\int_{|f_n - f| < \kappa; |f| > \delta/2} |f_n - f| d\mu \le \frac{A}{\delta/2} \kappa.$$

Shrinking  $\kappa$  if necessary, we may make the right side  $\leq \epsilon$ . Combining everything above, we get

$$\int_{|f_n - f| < \kappa} |f_n - f| \le 3\epsilon.$$

Next we tackle the region where  $|f_n - f| \ge \kappa$ . Here we use the fact that  $f_n$  converge in measure to f, so there is an  $N \ge 1$  such that for  $n \ge N$ ,  $\mu(\{x : |f_n(x) - f(x)| \ge \kappa\}) \le \kappa$ . Using the lemma above and shrinking  $\kappa$  if necessary, we have for  $n \ge N$ 

$$\int_{f_n - f| \ge \kappa} |f_n| d\mu \le \epsilon \text{ and } \int_{f_n - f| \ge \kappa} |f| d\mu \le \epsilon$$

hence by triangle inequality.

$$\int_{|f_n - f| \ge \kappa} |f_n - f| \le 2\epsilon.$$

Therefore, for  $n \geq N$ ,  $||f_n - f||_1 \leq 5\epsilon$  and hence  $f_n$  converge in  $L^1$  to f.

We have considered five main modes of convergence, pointwise a.e. (AE), almost uniformly (AU), uniformly (U), in measure (M) and in  $L^p$  norm. Under various hypothesis, we have various relations between these modes of convergences. We summarize them below.

Under no additional hypothesis:

- U  $\Longrightarrow$  AU  $\Longrightarrow$  AE
- U  $\implies L^{\infty} \implies$  AU and U outside a null set
- $\bullet$  AU  $\Longrightarrow$  M
- $L^1 \implies M$  (Chebyshev-Markov)

Under finite measure:

- AE  $\implies$  AU (Egorov's theorem)
- $L^{p_1} \implies L^{p_2}$  when  $1 \le p_2 \le p_1 \le \infty$ .

Different domination conditions; subsequences:

- $f_n, g_n$  converge a.e. to f, g respectively and  $|f_n| \leq g_n$  a.e. and  $\int g_n \to \int g$  with  $g_n, g \in L^1$ , then  $f_n \to f$  in  $L^1$
- M  $\implies$  subsequence converging AE
- M+dominated by absolutely integrable  $\implies L^1$
- AE+fast convergence  $\implies$  AU
- M  $\iff$  every sybsequence has a further subsequence converging AU
- Under uniform integrability,  $L^1 \iff M$

There are many more modes of convergence. For example, we haven't discussed convergence in distribution which is defined in the context of probability spaces or the relation various  $L^p$  modes of convergence have with other modes. However, what we have discussed is quite general and interesting enough to merit this discussion.

## References

- [1] An Introduction to Measure Theory, Terence Tao
- [2] Measure and integral (PDF), E. Kowalski