

Example: Using LEM, show that $p \rightarrow q \vdash \neg p \vee q$ as valid.

$1.p \rightarrow q$	premise
$2.p \vee \neg p$	LEM
<div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between; padding: 5px 0;"> $3.p$ assumption </div> <div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between; padding: 5px 0;"> $4.q$ $\rightarrow e$ 3,1 </div> <div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between; padding: 5px 0;"> $5.\neg p \vee q$ \vee_{i2} 4 </div>	
<div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between; padding: 5px 0;"> $6.\neg p$ assumption </div> <div style="display: flex; justify-content: space-between; padding: 5px 0;"> $7.\neg p \vee q$ \vee_i 6 </div>	
$8.\neg p \vee q$	\vee_e 2,3-5,6-7

9 Provable Equivalence

- ϕ and ψ are provable equivalent if and only if the sequents $\phi \vdash \psi$ and $\psi \vdash \phi$ are valid.
- It is denoted by $\phi \dashv\vdash \psi$.
- Ultimately we could define the $\phi \dashv\vdash \psi$ as $\vdash (\phi \rightarrow \psi) \wedge (\psi \rightarrow \phi)$.

$$\neg(p \rightarrow q) \vdash p \wedge \neg q$$

$1. \neg(p \rightarrow q)$	premise																				
<tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$2. \neg(p \wedge \neg q)$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">assumption</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2" style="border: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$3. p$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">assumption(3)</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2" style="border: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$4. \neg q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">assumption</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$5. p \wedge \neg q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">\wedge_i 3,4</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$6. \perp$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">$\neg e$ 2,5</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$7. q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">PBC 4-6</td> </tr> </td></tr> </td></tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$8. p \rightarrow q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">$\rightarrow i$ 3-7</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$9. \perp$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">$\neg e$ 8,1</td> </tr>		$2. \neg(p \wedge \neg q)$	assumption	<tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$3. p$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">assumption(3)</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2" style="border: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$4. \neg q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">assumption</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$5. p \wedge \neg q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">\wedge_i 3,4</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$6. \perp$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">$\neg e$ 2,5</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$7. q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">PBC 4-6</td> </tr> </td></tr>		$3. p$	assumption(3)	<tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$4. \neg q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">assumption</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$5. p \wedge \neg q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">\wedge_i 3,4</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$6. \perp$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">$\neg e$ 2,5</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$7. q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">PBC 4-6</td> </tr>		$4. \neg q$	assumption	$5. p \wedge \neg q$	\wedge_i 3,4	$6. \perp$	$\neg e$ 2,5	$7. q$	PBC 4-6	$8. p \rightarrow q$	$\rightarrow i$ 3-7	$9. \perp$	$\neg e$ 8,1
$2. \neg(p \wedge \neg q)$	assumption																				
<tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$3. p$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">assumption(3)</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2" style="border: 1px solid black; padding: 5px;"> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$4. \neg q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">assumption</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$5. p \wedge \neg q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">\wedge_i 3,4</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$6. \perp$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">$\neg e$ 2,5</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$7. q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">PBC 4-6</td> </tr> </td></tr>		$3. p$	assumption(3)	<tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$4. \neg q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">assumption</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$5. p \wedge \neg q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">\wedge_i 3,4</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$6. \perp$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">$\neg e$ 2,5</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$7. q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">PBC 4-6</td> </tr>		$4. \neg q$	assumption	$5. p \wedge \neg q$	\wedge_i 3,4	$6. \perp$	$\neg e$ 2,5	$7. q$	PBC 4-6								
$3. p$	assumption(3)																				
<tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$4. \neg q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">assumption</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$5. p \wedge \neg q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">\wedge_i 3,4</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$6. \perp$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">$\neg e$ 2,5</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">$7. q$</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">PBC 4-6</td> </tr>		$4. \neg q$	assumption	$5. p \wedge \neg q$	\wedge_i 3,4	$6. \perp$	$\neg e$ 2,5	$7. q$	PBC 4-6												
$4. \neg q$	assumption																				
$5. p \wedge \neg q$	\wedge_i 3,4																				
$6. \perp$	$\neg e$ 2,5																				
$7. q$	PBC 4-6																				
$8. p \rightarrow q$	$\rightarrow i$ 3-7																				
$9. \perp$	$\neg e$ 8,1																				
$10. p \wedge \neg q$	PBC 2-9																				