

# Argument

---

王老师 Argument 写作方法及所有题库

yingying

2015/10/26

## Argument 部分

### Argument 写作入门-开头段第一步：梳理结论、论据

相对于 issue 来说，argument 是比较好提高的。但是，很多同学的表现还是不太理想。这里我将分几个帖子来讨论 argument 的写作。每个帖子都有一些练习，希望对大家有帮助。首先，我们来学习如何概括一个 argument 的结论、证据。

以 argument 8 为例

The following appeared in a memo from the director of student housing at Buckingham College. "To serve the housing needs of our students, Buckingham College should build a number of new dormitories. Buckingham's enrollment is growing and, based on current trends, will double over the next 50 years, thus making existing dormitory space inadequate. Moreover, the average rent for an apartment in our town has risen in recent years. Consequently, students will find it increasingly difficult to afford off-campus housing. Finally, attractive new dormitories would make prospective students more likely to enroll at Buckingham."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

分析：

这个 argument 的结论是 Buckingham College should build a number of new dormitories. 前面还带了一个目的状语 To serve the housing needs of our students 解释目的。

而主要的论据包括：

- Buckingham's enrollment is growing and, based on current trends, will double over the next 50 years, thus making existing dormitory space inadequate.
- Moreover, the average rent for an apartment in our town has risen in recent years. Consequently, students will find it increasingly difficult to afford off-campus housing.
- Finally, attractive new dormitories would make prospective students more likely to enroll at Buckingham.

那么在第一段我们首先要做的一件事就是概括这个 argument。

According to the director, Buckingham College should commit to building new dorms given the projected enrollment over the next 5 decades, the expected shortage of dorm space. He also argues that new dorms can help students who cannot afford off-campus apartments that have become more expensive in average and attract more prospective students to study at Buckingham.

The director argues that more dorms should be built to meet the demand of housing among Buckingham students and to recruit more students to join the college.

另一个版本：

这里用了两句话才概括完整个论证。值得注意的是，在这里提到了 the director。很多同学喜欢用 arguer/author 来指代原作者。当题目提供了更具体信息时，还是应该用更具体、准确的称谓。

概括原题结论和论据是 argument 写作的第一步。写好这一步不仅关系到考官对你文章的第一印象，也关系到你能否准确把握题目的重点，因此应该多一点练习。建议版友自己在这里

回帖练习这个动作（抄写完整原题，列出结论，列出论据，写出开头段的第一部分，概括原题中的结论和主要论据）

### **Argument 写作入门-开头段第二步：根据题目要求写主旨句**

上一讲我们介绍了如何在 **argument** 开头段概括原题中的结论和主要论据。这里我们重点讨论开头段要完成的第二个动作，根据题目要求写主旨句。这里首先要关注 **argument** 题库中的四个主要题型（有人分作 8 种，但主要是 4 种）。

**evidence 类**：Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

**question 类**：Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

**assumption 类**："Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

**explanation 类**：Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument."

从这四种题目要求的措辞，我们可以看到两点：

第一，和老 G 不同，新 G 的重点已经不是批判谬误，因此在文字不宜出现 **flawed/dubious** 这类字眼。题目实际并没有预设这个 **argument** 是不成立的，而是要求我们指出需要什么证据或检验什么假设或问什么问题或提出其他解释来评估这个论证。虽然 OG 的范文中偶尔也会用到 **holes** 之类的词，但基本上不能再老 G 的措辞了。

第二，我们在写作时必须正面回应题目要求。**evidence** 的题目，就得不断的讨论需要哪些证据；**question** 的题目就要提出各种问题；等等。如果做不到这一点而拿到低分就太冤枉了。

本次练习的重点是写开头段的第二部分。这里需要对后面几段的内容进行综述，或者说写出一个主旨句来统领全文。这里介绍两种不同的写法。第一种适合那些只求 3.5 分的同学，基本上只需要根据题目要求来写，不必回应具体的 **argument** 内容。比如 **evidence** 可以写成：  
In order to assess the argument, we need to collect more information about a number of issues discussed above.

接下来的几种简版主旨句，请大家先自己练习一下再和我的参考答案比对：

To evaluate the soundness of the recommendation, we need to ask a number of questions related to different aspects of the arguments.

A number of assumptions have been made explicitly or implicitly throughout the argument and we need to examine such assumptions critically to decide if the argument is convincing.

There are a number of rival explanations that we need to explore before we can assess the strength of the argument.

这样写虽然也回应了题目的要求，但是没有具体讨论原题的内容，给人一种空话、套话的感觉。如果有同学觉得时间不够、造句能力有限，请务必自己写几个这种句子找人检查一下以后在考场上用，不要套用网上的版本。

接下来还是以 argument 8 为例，演示一下结合内容如何写主旨句

The following appeared in a memo from the director of student housing at Buckingham College.

"To serve the housing needs of our students, Buckingham College should build a number of new dormitories. Buckingham's enrollment is growing and, based on current trends, will double over the next 50 years, thus making existing dormitory space inadequate. Moreover, the average rent for an apartment in our town has risen in recent years. Consequently, students will find it increasingly difficult to afford off-campus housing. Finally, attractive new dormitories would make prospective students more likely to enroll at Buckingham."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

上一讲已经讨论，

这个 argument 的结论是 Buckingham College should build a number of new dormitories. 前面还带了一个目的状语 To serve the housing needs of our students 解释目的。而主要的论据包括

- Buckingham's enrollment is growing and, based on current trends, will double over the next 50 years, thus making existing dormitory space inadequate.
- Moreover, the average rent for an apartment in our town has risen in recent years. Consequently, students will find it increasingly difficult to afford off-campus housing.
- Finally, attractive new dormitories would make prospective students more likely to enroll at Buckingham.

那么写主旨句的时候其实已经要想好后面中间段主要写什么内容。这一点是很多同学面临的问题-也就是说，很多同学写文章是想到哪儿写到哪儿，或者说，写了第一句再想接下来怎么写，写着写着就可能写不下去了。而要想拿高分，必须在落笔前成竹在胸，在主旨句里将中间段的内容安排好。通常来说，我们可以按照原题的几个论据来安排。这里还是请大家自己先写然后再和我写的比对。

In order to evaluate the recommendation, we need more information about the enrollment trend of Buckingham College, the exact rents of the off-campus housing, students' financial background and how prospective students make their choices.

很明显，我在这里在 about 后面有四个宾语，其中三个是名词短语、最后一个是宾语从句。而我后面的中间段会按这四个点展开来写。有些同学觉得要在写开头的时候就想好中间写什么有难度。这里有两个解决方案，一是多写开头段、多练习，这样在考场上会遇到熟题的机会就会增加；二是可以把这句话留到最后再写。不过即使最后写，也还是需要写中间段的时候，每段都能集中一个问题或几个相关的问题讨论。

接下来，请大家做几个其他题型的练习。

The following appeared in a letter from a homeowner to a friend.

"Of the two leading real estate firms in our town—Adams Realty and Fitch Realty—Adams Realty is clearly superior. Adams has 40 real estate agents; in contrast, Fitch has 25, many of whom work only part-time. Moreover, Adams' revenue last year was twice as high as that of Fitch and included home sales that averaged \$168,000, compared to Fitch's \$144,000. Homes listed with Adams sell faster as well: ten years ago I listed my home with Fitch, and it took more than four months to sell; last year, when I sold another home, I listed it with Adams, and it took only one month. Thus, if you want to sell your home quickly and at a good price, you should use Adams

Realty.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted."

还是请大家先分一下结论和论据

结论 Of the two leading real estate firms in our town—Adams Realty and Fitch Realty—Adams Realty is clearly superior.

Thus, if you want to sell your home quickly and at a good price, you should use Adams Realty.

论据 Adams has 40 real estate agents; in contrast, Fitch has 25, many of whom work only part-time.

论据 Moreover, Adams' revenue last year was twice as high as that of Fitch and included home sales that averaged \$168,000, compared to Fitch's \$144,000.

论据 Homes listed with Adams sell faster as well: ten years ago I listed my home with Fitch, and it took more than four months to sell; last year, when I sold another home, I listed it with Adams, and it took only one month.

然后再写第一段，包括概括结论、论据和主旨句。

According to the friend of the homeowner, Adams is a better real estate firm and should be used in order to sell the home fast and get a good deal because it has more full-time agents, better home sales records. To assess this argument, we need to examine critically a number of assumptions about the workforce size and full-time or part-time mode, the average prices and the time required to sell a home.

#### **Argument 写作入门-中间段核心步骤：探索其他可能性**

前面两讲重点讨论了开头段的写法，包括如何梳理和概括结论、论据以及如何根据题目要求写主旨句。第三讲重点介绍中间段的写法。

其实中间段，无论哪一种题型最核心的步骤只有一个-探索其他可能性。几乎所有的中间段都是围绕着这个步骤展开的。

这里重点关注中间段。

1 The first piece of evidence that we would need in order to evaluate Dr. Karp's claims is information about whether or not Tertia and the surrounding island group have changed significantly in the past 20 years.

2 Dr. Field conducted his observational study 20 years ago, and it is possible that Tertia has changed significantly since then.

3 For example, if we had evidence that in the intervening years Westerners had settled on the island and they introduced a more typical Western-style family structure, it would certainly weaken Dr. Karp's argument.

4 In that case, the original study could have been accurate, and Dr. Karp's study could be correct, as well, though his conclusion that Dr. Field's method is ineffective would be seriously weakened.

1.提出需要哪方面的证据

2.指出和上句相关的某种可能性

3.具体举例展开讨论这种可能性

4.指出如果这种可能性成立会有什么结论

1 Another piece of evidence that might help us evaluate this claim involves the exact locations where Dr. Karp's interviews took place.

2 According to this article, Dr. Karp and his graduate students conducted interviews of “children living in the group of islands that includes Tertia.”

3 If we were to learn that they never interviewed a single Tertian child, it would significantly weaken the conclusion.

4 It could turn out to be the case, for example, that children on Tertia are raised communally, whereas children on other islands nearby are raised by their biological parents.

1. 提出需要哪方面的证据
2. 复述原题论证中的某个部分
3. 具体举例展开讨论这种可能性
4. 指出和上句相关的某种可能性

1 In order to fully evaluate this article, we would also need to learn more about the interview questions that Dr. Karp’s team used.

2 What exactly did they ask?

3 We don’t know, nor do we know what the children’s responses actually were.

4 What did they say about their biological parents?

5 The mere fact that they speak more frequently about their biological parents than they do about other adults does not mean that they are raised by their biological parents.

6 It would significantly undermine Dr. Karp’s argument if it turned out that the children said things like how much they missed their parents or how their parents had left them in a communal environment.

7 Without knowing WHAT the children said, it is hard to accept Dr. Karp’s conclusion.

1. 提出需要哪方面的证据
2. 以提问形式说明需要的证据
3. 指出相关信息的匮乏
4. 以提问形式说明需要的证据
5. 指出和上句相关的某种可能性
6. 指出如果这种可能性成立会有什么结论
7. 总结对论证的质疑

1 It is slightly more difficult to discuss the evidence we might need in order to evaluate the more interesting claims in Dr. Karp’s article, namely his extension of the results of his study to a conclusion that interview-centered methods are inherently more valid than observational-centered approaches.

2 In order to fully evaluate this claim, in fact, we would need to look at many more examples of interview-based and observation-based anthropological studies and we would also need to look into different study designs.

3 Perhaps Dr. Field did not conduct an effective observational study, but other observational approaches could be effective.

4 In order to make such grandiose claims, Dr. Karp really needs a lot of additional evidence (ideally a meta-analysis of hundreds of anthropological studies).

1. 复述原题论证中的某个部分
2. 提出需要哪方面的证据
3. 指出和上句相关的某种可能性
4. 具体说明需要的证据

## 干货干货：有洞见的论证需要题目未提及的核心概念为支撑

OG 中提到要有 insightful 的分析和论证，我个人的经验是，在讨论 issue 的时候，需要引用一些题目中未提及但是能帮助我们思考的概念作为工具。以 89 题为例，我运用的是法律的经济分析中的经典理论- incentive theory。当然这样说有点装，其实曼昆总结的十大经济学原理的其中一条就是人会回应激励。由此可见，要想在 issue 写作中构建一个内容丰富、令人信服的论证，必须借助我们平时积累的知识。

这里 Claret 写的 issue 6 的中间段就存在这个问题。由于没有恰当的概念（干货）作为支撑，中间段写得比较单薄。

小卉同学打算先准备作文素材，我觉得这种方法有风险，原因是不先根据题目想思路，用现成的例子来套题目很容易偏题。后来在互动讨论中涉及到提纲如何准备才充分的问题。我想这个问题还是要回到干货的问题上来。

写提纲的时候一定要想清楚每个点如何展开 包括用什么例子 因为很多想法好像很好 但是一旦写起来才发现不行 就是因为例子不合适 或者表达不清楚 所以通常我们写的提纲在实际操作中都会出问题 其实一个真正想明白了的提纲是不会那么容易忘记的 这里面涉及到干货

所谓干货就是在论证过程中用到的原题没有的概念，这些概念为我们的论述提供了有力的支撑。随便找一篇我写的范文里都会有这种干货。

我在上一部分有更详细的解释。

就拿前天有同学考到的 issue 38 来说

Issue 38

It is primarily through our identification with social groups that we define ourselves.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

For all human beings, identity is a complex and perplexing issue. Some argues that, to answer the question "Who am I?", we have to identify with different social groups. While I agree that we need to participate in different social communities in order to construct our identities, interacting with our parents, partners and children in private relationships is also an essential aspect of our identities.

One important identity marker is our nationality or citizenship. Although our nationality was determined at the time we were born, we have to participate in a number of specific social activities in order to express our identities as a citizen of a particular nation. One obvious thing is to speak the national language shared by all the people from that nation. Through speaking

the language fluently and write in that language competently we immediately identify ourselves with all the other fellow citizens of the nation. In addition, we also support the Constitution of our nation and participate in the democratic processes such as electing the president and the Congressmen. Such political acts we engaged in with other fellow citizens also define us as a member of the nation.

这道题中间第一段里的干货是什么？

首先就是 **social group** 这个概念具体化为 **nation** 这是写这道题的基础 没有这个具体化 这道题根本没法写下去

其次我们要将 **identification with social groups** 操作化 就是这个 **identify with** 的具体内涵是什么 怎么做到 基于前面的 **nation as a social group**

我们很自然地想到 **speak national language, support Constitution, participate in democratic processes** 这类更具体的行动

这就是干货

严格来说这不是具体的事例，但是却能起到支持论点的作用



再看一题

Issue 5:

Claim: Governments must ensure that their major cities receive the financial support they need in order to thrive.

Reason: It is primarily in cities that a nation's cultural traditions are preserved and generated.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

Due to the development of modern technology, many people are concerned about how to preserve their nations' cultural traditions and promote their national identities for the new generations who have been exposed to globalised culture with little local flavour. Since government resources are limited, it is argued that major cities should be the top priority for financial support because the cultural traditions are generated and preserved here. While I agree that major cities are important for preserving and generating cultural tradition, other areas are equally important in many countries. Since cultural programs in major cities can receive support from different financial sources such as advertising, donation of city residents and big corporations, government money should be invested to programs in small towns and rural regions where resources from private sectors are not available.

There is no doubt that major cities are important sites for celebrating cultural traditions. Take the well-known Statue of Liberty in New York City as an example. This giant copper statue was a gift of France to the US and has become a popular icon for freedom and democracy inspiring people all over the world. In late 19th century and early 20th century, Statue of Liberty had welcomed nearly 14 million immigrants who entered the United States through New York. For these immigrants and their descendants, the Statue of Liberty was a symbol of hope and freedom. For the rest of the United States, the Statue of Liberty celebrates diversity and tolerance, the core values that define the cultural tradition of a young republic.

Despite the importance of major cities for cultural traditions, government funding should not be heavily invested here because there are other funding sources available. The national park service that manages the Statue of Liberty in New York, for example, receive financial support in the form of admission ticket fares from thousands of tourists who come to visit everyday from all over the world. Major corporations and private citizens also donated large amount of money to the private foundation built for the Statue of Liberty. In addition, the cultural heritage site also attracts thousands of volunteers every year to donate their time to the daily operation of national park services for the Statue of Liberty. Therefore, as this example adequately illustrates, cultural traditions in major cities are not the top priorities for government funding given all the alternative sources for funding and support.

中间第一段以自由女神像作为 cultural tradition 的具体象征，也是运用了将抽象概念具体化的策略。然后通过讨论这个 statue 的历史故事和文化意义再回到抽象的层面。而第二段则是通过探索其他可能性，在讨论政府资助的基础上，谈到其他可能的支持包括门票收入、捐赠和义工。这些都是在考虑其他可能性的时候拍脑袋想出来的干货。没有这些干货，文章是不可能这么丰满的。

复杂、有层次的观点是 GRE 作文的骨架，而通过对文章的创意解读来到的干货则是 GRE 作文的血肉。5 月组的同学很多都已经掌握了骨架的构建，即将开启更加艰苦的探寻干货之旅。

## 一.关于 argument 的提纲和全文写作格式

1. 必须抄题，包括指引，并按要求写作。
2. 必须将原题的 argument 拆分成结论和论据
3. 在提纲或全文的中间段之前，请注明这段话要回应原题 argument 的哪一段话、哪一个点
4. 提纲不仅要写中间段的主题句，还要列出如何回应 argument 的论述
5. 如果这道题我已经写了范文，请务必对比你的文章和范文，结合范文自评并提出问题。
- 6.再次强调天下文章一大抄，对于一些关键的句型、关键的套路，要多借鉴 ETS 和我的范文。

## 二.关于 argument 写作中的称谓及时态情态动词、虚拟语气等问题

argument 写作中作者和读者之间的某种互动往往通过对作者自己和读者及原论证提出者的称谓和指代来完成。比如，要不要出现 I 或者 we? 要不要用 you? 对于原论证的作者应该用什么词指代? 这虽然不是什么大问题，但还是值得我们关注。

要不要用 I 或者 we? you?

一般来说用 I 可能不太好，给人比较主观的感觉；但是用 we 似乎没问题，将笔者和读者都包括在同一视角下。相反，you 一般是不用的，这样容易造成与读者的某种隔阂。例子晚点补充。

如何指代原论证的作者?

看到有些同学用 arguer 这个词，我看得很不顺眼。在谷歌里搜” according to the arguer”只有 18 个结果而且大部分都是网友 GRE 习作！其实这里用什么词关键要看题目提供的背景信息。如果是一封信就说 the author of the letter，再次提及直接说 the author，如果是 the manager 就直接提具体身份。另外也可以用 According to the letter, In the memo it is argued that 这类句型。

时态、情态动词、虚拟语气的使用

在 argument 写作中，时态的使用首先要考虑原 argument 里的时态。一般来说是一般过去时和一般现在时的混搭，谈到过去发生的事情用过去时，谈到将来的事情或者计划的事情用现在时。因此，我们的时态也不可避免的会混搭。这个需要通过研读范文来总结更多规律。我自己写作时对这个问题重视得不够，因此请更多的观察 ETS 范文。

由于 argument 的核心步骤是探索其他可能性，很多的讨论都不是讲过去或将来的事情，而是如果发生什么事就会怎样的情况。这个时候我们会在条件状语从句中使用过去时，而在主句中用 would 或者 could,might 等。

### 三.关于考场上的时间安排及尽快限时写作的重要性

考场上前 3 分钟的计划 and 安排尤为关键

我接触的部分 G 友在写作时会遇到写了一半写不下去的情况，这主要是因为写之前缺少计划和安排。理想的情况当然是题库里的每道题都充分准备，考场上回忆起之前准备的思路。即使做不到，也应该在动笔前想好整篇的基本思路、每段具体怎么写。

最好预留 2 分钟检查语法、拼写

最后两分钟还在写文章是一件很痛苦的事情。

综合以上两点，我们必须尽快开始限时写作，要求自己在 25-28 分钟完成全文。写之前可以先准备思路、查资料，一旦开始写一定要进入考试状态。如果自己在 25 分钟之内写不完或者写不好，那就要调整自己的预期，比原计划少写一些、句型简单些，这样反而更有机会拿到 4 分。

### 四.为什么大部分作文都是 3-3.5 分

1. 写作文前没有认真读题，根本没搞清楚题目里涉及的 issue 是什么，就凭感觉写。

比如这道题

Issue10) Nations should pass laws to preserve any remaining wilderness areas in their natural state, even if these areas could be developed for economic gain.

Write a response in which you discuss your views on the policy and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider the possible consequences of implementing the policy and explain how these consequences shape your position.

这里讲的很清楚是讨论要不要立法 preserve wilderness，但是互改中的同学想当然的写环保问题，这样不认真审题，写出来的文章自然不可能切题。

2. 误信某些参考书所提倡的正反正的写法，没有提出整合的观点，也没有按照题目的具体要求来写作。

Write a response in which you discuss your views on the policy and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider the possible consequences of implementing the policy and explain how these consequences shape your position.

比如这个要求讲明是讨论实施这个政策的后果，也就是整篇文章都要围绕着各种后果来写。

3. 写文章所使用的英语凭自己的想象将自己想的汉语翻译成英语，完全不考虑这个说法是否符合英语的习惯。可以这么说，由于母语不是英语，我们自己想出来的句子十有八九是不通的，只有通过大量阅读通顺的英语，熟悉各种地道的表达，力求自己的句型、表达是以前见过的，才有可能写出可以接受的句子。很多同学写出来的句子惨不忍睹不知所云，但更可怕的是还自我感觉良好，不知道自己的这种表达已经符合这里的 3 分条件：

Scores 3 and 2.5: Displays some competence in analytical writing, although the writing is flawed in at least one of the following ways: limited analysis or development; weak organization; weak control of sentence structure or language usage, with errors that often result in vagueness or lack of clarity.

4. 缺乏对真题的分析和思考，幼稚的幻想可以通过某种简便的模板来达到高分，或者只要字数写到一定篇幅就可以拿到高分。

由于很多同学语言表达能力有限，又缺乏对题目的深入思考，因此我希望通过先列提纲（英语）和用汉语展开讨论将语言表达和思想的问题分离开来。但这要求参与的组员愿意拿出时间和精力去思考问题，分析真题。

再看这位 4 分 G 友关于作文的分享

作文：issue 85 个 topic 中，60 个英文提纲，30 篇全文练习；argument 题目过两遍，85 个中文简要提纲，25 个高频全文练习。个人认为，GRE 最难的就是作文，提升非常困难。

但是，没有认真准备过 AW 的人，就没有完整地体会到 GRE 的真谛。如果你认真准备了，你才会懂我的意思。

作文的网络资源质量参差不齐，请大家谨慎对待。

60 个英语提纲、39 篇全文，虽然我没有每道题和她讨论，但是她的付出最终有了回报，考场上遇到的题目我们之前好像讨论过。在我目前辅导过的同学中，她是唯一投入这么多的考生，也是唯一拿到 4 分的，我不认为这两件事是巧合。

5. 大部分同学对 GRE 作文包括版面上的资料都很浮躁，希望一步登天。必须指出，很多理工科的申请人 GRE 作文其实并不重要，3 分也没什么大不了的。但是，如果你有心拿到 4 分或以上，就得沉下心来学习，扎扎实实的写提纲、思考问题、阅读写得好的文章、收集好的句型、表达，摒弃自己想怎么写就怎么写的陋习。我在我的 6 分经验帖上不断的回帖添加各种内容包括参与互改的指引，但是尽管很多同学表示有兴趣参加，但真正原因耐心了解我的教学思路和认真练习的人却屈指可数。少数同学参与的部分互动后，就没有了下文。我只能说这些同学最终只能拿到 3-3.5 分，因为他们不肯付出拿到 4 分或以上需要付出的努力。

evidence 的写作指导

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

范文全文:

It might seem logical, at first glance, to agree with the argument in Dr. Karp's article that children in Tertia actually are raised by their biological parents (and perhaps even, by implication, that an observation-centered approach to anthropological study is not as valid as an interview-centered one). However, in order to fully evaluate this argument, we need to have a significant amount of additional evidence. The argument could end up being much weaker than it seems, or it might actually be quite valid. In order to make that determination, we need to know more then analyze what we learn.

The first piece of evidence that we would need in order to evaluate Dr. Karp's claims is information about whether or not Tertia and the surrounding island group have changed significantly in the past 20 years. Dr. Field conducted his observational study 20 years ago, and it is possible that Tertia has changed significantly since then. For example, if we had evidence that in the intervening years Westerners had settled on the island and they introduced a more typical Western-style family structure, it would certainly weaken Dr. Karp's argument. In that case, the original study could have been accurate, and Dr. Karp's study could be correct, as well, though his conclusion that Dr. Field's method is ineffective would be seriously weakened.

Another piece of evidence that might help us evaluate this claim involves the exact locations where Dr. Karp's interviews took place. According to this article, Dr. Karp and his graduate students conducted interviews of "children living in the group of islands that includes Tertia." If we were to learn that they never interviewed a single Tertian child, it would significantly weaken the conclusion. It could turn out to be the case, for example, that children on Tertia are raised communally, whereas children on other islands nearby are raised by their biological parents.

In order to fully evaluate this article, we would also need to learn more about the interview questions that Dr. Karp's team used. What exactly did they ask? We don't know, nor do we know what the children's responses actually were. What did they say about their biological parents? The mere fact that they speak more frequently about their biological parents than they do about other adults does not meant hat they are raised by their biological parents. It would significantly undermine Dr. Karp's argument if it turned out that the children said things like how much they missed their parents or how their parents had left them in a communal environment. Without knowing WHAT the children said, it is hard to accept Dr. Karp's conclusion.

It is slightly more difficult to discuss the evidence we might need in order to evaluate the more interesting claims in Dr. Karp's article, namely his extension of the results of his study to a conclusion that interview-centered methods are inherently more valid than observational-centered approaches. In order to fully evaluate this claim, in fact, we would need to look at many more examples of interview-based and observation-based anthropological studies and we would also need to look into different study designs. Perhaps Dr. Field did not conduct an effective observational study, but other observational approaches could be effective.

In order to make such grandiose claims, Dr. Karp really needs a lot of additional evidence (ideally a meta-analysis of hundreds of anthropological studies).

Clearly, then, we need to have additional evidence in order to get a more complete understanding of the strengths and weaknesses of Dr. Karp's article. We need to know about Tertia and the surrounding islands, whether or not they have changed over the past 20 years. We also need to know about study design (Dr. Karp's and Dr. Field's). And we really need a lot more information if we want to extend the results of a study about one island culture to all anthropological fieldwork.

首先, 要说明需要哪些具体的证据。所谓具体, 可以说是越具体越好。比如你可以说:

- (1) 我需要一份对居民的调查
- (2) 我需要知道交通事故的地点, 起因
- (3) 作者应该告诉我们, 前 5 年的销售额如何

有时候, 举 evidence 是需要创造力的, 不是随便挑一挑逻辑错误就可以。

其次, 最重要的部分, 是说明这些证据会如何加强或削弱原论断, 比如:

假如前 5 年的销售额都比现在高, 那么论者的假设恐怕是站不住脚的。相反, 如果不是这样, 那么论者的说法就被有效支持了。

注意, 所谓加强和削弱, 不是简单地讲 if XXX, then weaken; otherwise, strengthen, 而是非常具体地把其中的逻辑关系说出来, 到底怎么加强和削弱了。

#### ◆ argument 的 1+3 模型及提纲写法 以 argument15 为例

1. 抄题包括 argument 和写作指引
2. 列出 argument 的结论和主要证据
3. 写完整的第一段(英语) 这段应包括两句话 第一概述原文的结论和主要论据 第二概述中间各段要写的几个方面

4. 写出中间段的主题句(英语) 用汉语解释主要讨论的点

提纲示范 (请严格遵循)

##### 1 抄题

15) The following memorandum is from the business manager of Happy Pancake House restaurants.

Recently, butter has been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. This change, however, has had little impact on our customers. In fact, only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers do not distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine.

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

##### 2 列出 argument 的结论和主要证据

claim 或结论: Recently, butter has been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. This change, however, has had little

impact on our customers.

证据 01 In fact, only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change.

证据 02

Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers do not distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine.

### 3 写第一段

In the memo, the manager argues that replacing butter with margarin would have little impact on the customers citing the evidence about the percentage of customers who complained. There are, in fact, different ways to interpret the facts with regard to complaints about the food in general and the replacement presented in the argument that may lead to alternative conclusions.

### 4. 写出中间段的主题句（英语）用汉语解释主要讨论的点

中间第一段

The manager believes that 98% of the customers are satisfied with the change given that only 2% of customers complained. Yet, there are different ways to explain the relatively small number of complaints.

接下来用汉语解释如何展开本段（略）

中间第二段

As far as the customers' ability to distinguish butter from margarine is concerned, we can also explore other rival explanations.

接下来用汉语解释如何展开本段（略）

中间第三段

We also look into explanation alternative to the usage of the term "butter".

接下来用汉语解释如何展开本段（略）

## Prepare for the Argument Task

The "Analyze an Argument" task assesses your ability to understand, analyze and evaluate arguments according to specific instructions and to convey your evaluation clearly in your writing. The task consists of a brief passage in which the author makes a case for some course of action or interpretation of events by presenting claims backed by reasons and evidence.

Your task is to discuss the logical soundness of the author's case by critically examining the line of reasoning and the use of evidence. This task requires you to read the argument and instructions carefully. You might want to read the argument more than once and make brief notes about points you want to develop more fully in your response. In reading the argument, you should pay special attention to:

- what is offered as evidence, support or proof
- what is explicitly stated, claimed or concluded
- what is assumed or supposed, perhaps without justification or proof
- what is not stated, but necessarily follows from or underlies what is stated

In addition, you should consider the *structure* of the argument — the way in which these elements are linked together to form a *line of reasoning*; i.e., you should recognize the separate, sometimes implicit steps in the thinking process and consider whether the movement from each step to the next is logically sound. In tracing this line, look for transition words and phrases that suggest the author is attempting to make a logical connection (e.g., *however, thus, therefore, evidently, hence, in conclusion*).

An important part of performing well on the Argument task is remembering what you are *not* being asked to do:

- You are not being asked to discuss whether the statements in the argument are true or accurate.
- You are not being asked to agree or disagree with the position stated.
- You are not being asked to express your own views on the subject being discussed (as you were in the Issue task).

Instead, you are being asked to evaluate the logical soundness of an argument of another writer and, in doing so, to demonstrate the critical thinking, perceptive reading and analytical writing skills that university faculty consider important for success in graduate school.

It is important that you address the argument according to the specific instructions. Each task is accompanied by one of the following sets of instructions:

- Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.



- Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions, and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.
- Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.
- Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the advice and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the advice.
- Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.
- Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.
- Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.
- Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be addressed in order to decide whether the conclusion and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to the questions would help to evaluate the conclusion.

"Analyze an Argument" is a critical thinking task requiring a written response.

Consequently, the analytical skills displayed in your evaluation carry great weight in determining your score; however, the clarity with which you convey ideas is also important to your overall score.

The purposes of the task are to see how well equipped you are to insightfully evaluate an argument written by someone else and to effectively communicate your evaluation in writing to an academic audience. Your audience consists of *GRE*® readers carefully trained to apply the scoring criteria identified in the [scoring guide for the "Analyze an Argument" task](#).

To get a clearer idea of how GRE readers apply the Argument scoring criteria to actual essays, you should review scored [sample Argument essay responses and reader commentary](#).

The sample responses, particularly at 5 and 6 score levels, will show you a variety of successful strategies for organizing and developing an insightful evaluation. The reader commentary discusses specific aspects of analytical writing, such as: cogency of ideas; development and support; organization; syntactic variety; and facility with language. The commentary points out aspects that are particularly effective and insightful as well as any that detract from the overall effectiveness of the responses.

Since the Argument task is meant to assess analytical writing and informal reasoning skills that you have developed throughout your education, it has been designed neither to require any specific course of study nor to advantage students with a particular type of training.

Many college textbooks on rhetoric and composition have sections on informal logic and critical thinking that might prove helpful, but even these might be more detailed and technical than the task requires. You will not be expected to know specific methods of analysis or technical terms.

For instance, in one topic an elementary school principal might conclude that new playground equipment has improved student attendance because absentee rates have declined since it was installed. You will not need to see that the principal has committed the *post hoc, ergo propter hoc* fallacy; you will simply need to see that there are other possible explanations for the improved attendance, to offer some common-sense examples and to suggest what would be necessary to verify the conclusion. For instance, absentee rates might have decreased because the climate was mild. This would have to be ruled out in order for the principal's conclusion to be valid.

Although you do not need to know special analytical techniques and terminology, you should be familiar with the directions for the Argument task and with certain key concepts, including the following:

- alternative explanation — a competing version of what might have caused the events in question that undercuts or qualifies the original explanation because it too can account for the observed facts
- analysis — the process of breaking something (e.g., an argument) down into its component parts in order to understand how they work together to make up the whole
- argument — a claim or a set of claims with reasons and evidence offered as support; a line of reasoning meant to demonstrate the truth or falsehood of something
- assumption — a belief, often unstated or unexamined, that someone must hold in order to maintain a particular position; something that is taken for granted but that must be true in order for the *conclusion* to be true
- conclusion — the end point reached by a line of reasoning, valid if the reasoning is sound; the resulting assertion
- counterexample — an example, real or hypothetical, that refutes or disproves a statement in the *argument*
- evaluation — an assessment of the quality of evidence and reasons in an argument and of the overall merit of an *argument*

An excellent way to prepare for the "Analyze an Argument" task is to practice writing on some of the published Argument topics. There is no one way to practice that is best for everyone. Some prefer to start practicing without adhering to the 30-minute time limit. If you follow this approach, take all the time you need to evaluate the argument. Regardless of the approach you take, consider the following steps:

- Carefully read the argument and the specific instructions — you might want to read them more than once.
- Identify as many of the argument's claims, conclusions and underlying assumptions as possible and evaluate their quality.
- Think of as many alternative explanations and counterexamples as you can.
- Think of what specific additional evidence might weaken or lend support to the claims.
- Ask yourself what changes in the argument would make the reasoning more sound.

Write down each of these thoughts. When you've gone as far as you can with your evaluation, look over the notes and put them in a good order for discussion (perhaps by numbering them). Then write an evaluation according to the specific instructions by fully developing each point that is relevant to those instructions. Even if you choose not to write a full essay response, you should find it helpful to practice evaluating a few of the arguments and sketching out your responses.

When you become quicker and more confident, you should practice writing some Argument responses within the 30-minute time limit so that you will have a good sense of how to pace yourself in the actual test. For example, you will not want to discuss one point so exhaustively or to provide so many equivalent examples that you run out of time to make your other main points.

You might want to get feedback on your response(s) from a writing instructor, philosophy teacher or someone who emphasizes critical thinking in his or her course. It can also be informative to trade papers on the same topic with fellow students and discuss each other's responses in terms of the scoring guide. Focus not so much on the "right scores" as on seeing how the responses meet or miss the performance standards for each score point and what you need to do to improve.

Some arguments contain numbers, percentages or statistics that are offered as evidence in support of the argument's conclusion. For example, an argument might claim that a certain community event is less popular this year than it was last year because only 100 people attended this year as compared with 150 last year, a 33-percent decline in attendance.

It is important to remember that you are not being asked to do a mathematical task with the numbers, percentages or statistics. Instead, you should evaluate these as evidence intended to support the conclusion. In the example above, the conclusion is that a community event has become less popular. You should ask yourself, "Does the difference between 100 people and 150 people support that conclusion?" In this case, there are other possible explanations, e.g., the weather might have been much worse this year, this year's event might have been held at an inconvenient time, the cost of the event might have gone up this year, or there might have been another popular event this year at the same time.

Any one of these could explain the difference in attendance and weaken the conclusion that the event was "less popular." Similarly, percentages might support or weaken a conclusion depending on what actual numbers the percentages represent. Consider the

claim that the drama club at a school deserves more funding because its membership has increased by 100 percent. This 100-percent increase could be significant if there had been 100 members and now there are 200 members, whereas the increase would be much less significant if there had been five members and now there are 10.

Remember that any numbers, percentages or statistics in Argument tasks are used only as evidence in support of a conclusion, and you should always consider whether they actually support the conclusion.

## **TIPS**

You are free to organize and develop your response in any way you think will effectively communicate your evaluation of the argument. Your response may, but need not, incorporate particular writing strategies learned in English composition or writing-intensive college courses. *GRE*® readers will not be looking for a particular developmental strategy or mode of writing. In fact, when GRE readers are trained, they review hundreds of Argument responses that, although highly diverse in content and form, display similar levels of critical thinking and analytical writing.

For example, readers will see some essays at the 6 score level that begin by briefly summarizing the argument and then explicitly stating and developing the main points of the evaluation. The readers know that a writer can earn a high score by developing several points in an evaluation or by identifying a central feature in the argument and developing that evaluation extensively. You might want to look at the [sample Argument responses](#), particularly at the 5 and 6 score levels, to see how other writers have successfully developed and organized their responses.

You should make choices about format and organization that you think support and enhance the overall effectiveness of your evaluation. This means using as many or as few paragraphs as you consider appropriate for your response, e.g., create a new paragraph when your discussion shifts to a new point of evaluation. You might want to organize your evaluation around the structure of the argument itself, discussing it line by line. Or you might want to first point out a central questionable assumption and then move on to discuss related weaknesses in the argument's line of reasoning.

Similarly, you might want to use examples to help illustrate an important point in your evaluation or move your discussion forward. However, remember that it is your critical thinking and analytical writing that is being assessed, not your ability to come up with examples. What matters is not the form your response takes, but how insightfully you evaluate the argument and how articulately you communicate your evaluation to academic readers within the context of the task.

Following is a sample Argument task that you might see on the test:

*In surveys Mason City residents rank water sports (swimming, boating and fishing) among their favorite recreational activities. The Mason River flowing through the city is rarely used for these pursuits, however, and the city park department devotes little of its budget to maintaining riverside recreational facilities. For years there have been complaints from residents about the quality of the river's water and the river's smell. In response, the state has recently announced plans to clean up Mason River. Use of the river for water sports is therefore sure to increase. The city government should for that reason devote more money in this year's budget to riverside recreational facilities.*

*Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on the assumptions and what the implications are if the assumptions prove unwarranted.*

### **Strategies for this Topic**

This argument cites a survey to support the prediction that the use of the Mason River is sure to increase and thus recommends that the city government should devote more money in this year's budget to the riverside recreational facilities.

In developing your evaluation, you are asked to examine the argument's stated and/or unstated assumptions and discuss what the implications are if the assumptions prove unwarranted. A successful response must discuss both the argument's assumptions AND the implications of these assumptions for the argument. A response that does not fully address the task may not receive a 5 or 6.

Though responses may well raise other points, some assumptions of the argument, and some ways in which the argument depends on those assumptions, include:

- The assumption that people who rank water sports "among their favorite recreational activities" are actually likely to participate in them. (It is possible that they just like to watch them.) This assumption underlies the claim that use of the river for water sports is sure to increase after the state cleans up the Mason River and that the city should for that reason devote more money to riverside recreational facilities.
- The assumption that what residents say in surveys can be taken at face value. (It is possible that survey results exaggerate the interest in water sports.) This assumption underlies the claim that use of the river for water sports is sure to increase after the state cleans up the Mason River and that the city should for that reason devote more money to riverside recreational facilities.
- The assumption that Mason City residents would actually want to do water sports in the Mason River. (As recreational activities, it is possible that water sports are regarded as pursuits for vacations and weekends away from the city.) This assumption underlies the claim that use of the river for water sports is sure to increase after the state cleans up the Mason River and that the city should for that reason devote more money to riverside recreational facilities.
- The assumption that the park department's devoting little of its budget to maintaining riverside recreational facilities means that these facilities are inadequately maintained.

This assumption underlies the claim that the city should devote more money in this year's budget to riverside recreational facilities. If current facilities are adequately maintained, then increased funding might not be needed even if recreational use of the river does increase.

- The assumption that the riverside recreational facilities are facilities designed for people who participate in water sports and not some other recreational pursuit. This assumption underlies the claim that the city should devote more money in this year's budget to riverside recreational facilities.
- The assumption that the dirtiness of the river is the cause of its being little used and that cleaning up the river will be sufficient to increase recreational use of the river. (Residents might have complained about the water quality and smell even if they had no desire to boat, swim or fish in the river.) This assumption underlies the claim that the state's plan to clean up the river will result in increased use of the river for water sports.
- The assumption that the complaints about the river are numerous and significant. This assumption motivates the state's plan to clean up the river and underlies the claim that use of the river for water sports is sure to increase. (Perhaps the complaints are coming from a very small minority; in which case cleaning the river might be a misuse of state funds.)
- The assumption that the state's clean-up will occur soon enough to require adjustments to this year's budget. This assumption underlies the claim that the city should devote more money in this year's budget to riverside recreational facilities.
- The assumption that the clean-up, when it happens, will benefit those parts of the river accessible from the city's facilities. This assumption underlies the claim that the city should devote more money to riverside recreational facilities.
- The assumption that the city government ought to devote more attention to maintaining a recreational facility if demand for that facility increases.
- The assumption that the city should finance the new project and not some other agency or group (public or private).

Should any of the above assumptions prove unwarranted, the implications are:

- that the logic of the argument falls apart or is invalid or is unsound
- that the state and city are spending their funds unnecessarily

For more information, see the ["Analyze an Argument" Sample Essay Responses and Reader Commentary](#).

**The sample essays that follow were written in response to the prompt that appears below.**

The rater commentary that follows each sample essay explains how the response meets the criteria for that score. For a more complete understanding of the criteria for each score point, see the ["Analyze an Argument" Scoring Guide](#).

*In surveys Mason City residents rank water sports (swimming, boating and fishing) among their favorite recreational activities. The Mason River flowing through the city is rarely used for these pursuits, however, and the city park department devotes little of its budget to maintaining riverside recreational facilities. For years there have been complaints from residents about the quality of the river's water and the river's smell. In response, the state has recently announced plans to clean up Mason River. Use of the river for water sports is therefore sure to increase. The city government should for that reason devote more money in this year's budget to riverside recreational facilities.*

*Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on the assumptions and what the implications are if the assumptions prove unwarranted.*

**Note:** All responses are reproduced exactly as written, including errors, misspellings, etc., if any.

### **Essay Response — Score 6**

While it may be true that the Mason City government ought to devote more money to riverside recreational facilities, this author's argument does not make a cogent case for increased resources based on river use. It is easy to understand why city residents would want a cleaner river, but this argument is rife with holes and assumptions, and thus, not strong enough to lead to increased funding.

Citing surveys of city residents, the author reports city resident's love of water sports. It is not clear, however, the scope and validity of that survey. For example, the survey could have asked residents if they prefer using the river for water sports or would like to see a hydroelectric dam built, which may have swayed residents toward river sports. The sample may not have been representative of city residents, asking only those residents who live upon the river. The survey may have been 10 pages long, with 2 questions dedicated to river sports. We just do not know. Unless the survey is fully representative, valid, and reliable, it cannot be used to effectively back the author's argument.

Additionally, the author implies that residents do not use the river for swimming, boating, and fishing, despite their professed interest, because the water is polluted and smelly. While a polluted, smelly river would likely cut down on river sports, a concrete connection between the resident's lack of river use and the river's current state is not effectively made. Though there have been complaints, we do not know if there have been numerous complaints from a wide range of people, or perhaps from one or two individuals who made numerous complaints. To strengthen his/her argument, the author would benefit from

implementing a normed survey asking a wide range of residents why they do not currently use the river.

Building upon the implication that residents do not use the river due to the quality of the river's water and the smell, the author suggests that a river clean up will result in increased river usage. If the river's water quality and smell result from problems which can be cleaned, this may be true. For example, if the decreased water quality and aroma is caused by pollution by factories along the river, this conceivably could be remedied. But if the quality and aroma results from the natural mineral deposits in the water or surrounding rock, this may not be true. There are some bodies of water which emit a strong smell of sulphur due to the geography of the area. This is not something likely to be affected by a clean-up. Consequently, a river clean up may have no impact upon river usage. Regardless of whether the river's quality is able to be improved or not, the author does not effectively show a connection between water quality and river usage.

A clean, beautiful, safe river often adds to a city's property values, leads to increased tourism and revenue from those who come to take advantage of the river, and a better overall quality of life for residents. For these reasons, city government may decide to invest in improving riverside recreational facilities. However, this author's argument is not likely significantly persuade the city government to allocate increased funding.

### **Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 6**

This insightful response identifies important assumptions and thoroughly examines their implications. The essay shows that the proposal to spend more on riverside recreational facilities rests on three questionable assumptions, namely:

- that the survey provides a reliable basis for budget planning
- that the river's pollution and odor are the only reasons for its limited recreational use
- that efforts to clean the water and remove the odor will be successful

By showing that each assumption is highly suspect, this essay demonstrates the weakness of the entire argument. For example, paragraph 2 points out that the survey might not have used a representative sample, might have offered limited choices, and might have contained very few questions on water sports.

Paragraph 3 examines the tenuous connection between complaints and limited use of the river for recreation. Complaints about water quality and odor may be coming from only a few people and, even if such complaints are numerous, other completely different factors may be much more significant in reducing river usage. Finally, paragraph 4 explains that certain geologic features may prevent effective river clean-up. Details such as these provide compelling support.



In addition, careful organization ensures that each new point builds upon the previous ones. For example, note the clear transitions at the beginning of paragraphs 3 and 4, as well as the logical sequence of sentences within paragraphs (specifically paragraph 4).

Although this essay does contain minor errors, it still conveys ideas fluently. Note the effective word choices (e.g., "rife with . . . assumptions" and "may have swayed residents"). In addition, sentences are not merely varied; they also display skillful embedding of subordinate elements. For example, note the sustained parallelism in the first sentence of the concluding paragraph.

Since this response offers cogent examination of the argument and conveys meaning skillfully, it earns a score of 6.

### **Essay Response — Score 5**

The author of this proposal to increase the budget for Mason City riverside recreational facilities offers an interesting argument but to move forward on the proposal would definitely require more information and thought. While the correlations stated are logical and probable, there may be hidden factors that prevent the City from diverting resources to this project.

For example, consider the survey rankings among Mason City residents. The thought is that such high regard for water sports will translate into usage. But, survey responses can hardly be used as indicators of actual behavior. Many surveys conducted after the winter holidays reveal people who list exercise and weight loss as a top priority. Yet every profession does not equal a new gym membership. Even the wording of the survey results remain ambiguous and vague. While water sports may be among the residents' favorite activities, this allows for many other favorites. What remains unknown is the priorities of the general public. Do they favor these water sports above a softball field or soccer field? Are they willing to sacrifice the municipal golf course for better riverside facilities? Indeed the survey hardly provides enough information to discern future use of improved facilities.

Closely linked to the surveys is the bold assumption that a cleaner river will result in increased usage. While it is not illogical to expect some increase, at what level will people begin to use the river? The answer to this question requires a survey to find out the reasons our residents use or do not use the river. Is river water quality the primary limiting factor to usage or the lack of docks and piers? Are people more interested in water sports than the recreational activities that they are already engaged in? These questions will help the city government forecast how much river usage will increase and to assign a proportional increase to the budget.

Likewise, the author is optimistic regarding the state promise to clean the river. We need to hear the source of the voices and consider any ulterior motives. Is this a campaign year and the plans a campaign promise from the state representative? What is the timeline for

the clean-up effort? Will the state fully fund this project? We can imagine the misuse of funds in renovating the riverside facilities only to watch the new buildings fall into dilapidation while the state drags the river clean-up.

Last, the author does not consider where these additional funds will be diverted from. The current budget situation must be assessed to determine if this increase can be afforded. In a sense, the City may not be willing to draw money away from other key projects from road improvements to schools and education. The author naively assumes that the money can simply appear without forethought on where it will come from.

Examining all the various angles and factors involved with improving riverside recreational facilities, the argument does not justify increasing the budget. While the proposal does highlight a possibility, more information is required to warrant any action.

### **Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 5**

Each paragraph in the body of this perceptive essay identifies and examines an unstated assumption that is crucial to the argument. The major assumptions discussed are:

- that a survey can accurately predict behavior
- that cleaning the river will, in itself, increase recreational usage
- that state plans to clean the river will actually be realized
- that Mason City can afford to spend more on riverside recreational facilities

Support within each paragraph is both thoughtful and thorough. For example, paragraph 2 points out vagueness in the wording of the survey: Even if water sports rank *among* the favorite recreational activities of Mason City residents, other sports may still be much more popular. Thus, if the first assumption proves unwarranted, the argument to fund riverside facilities — rather than soccer fields or golf courses — becomes much weaker. Paragraph 4 considers several reasons why river clean-up plans may not be successful (the plans may be nothing more than campaign promises or funding may not be adequate). Thus, the weakness of the third assumption undermines the argument that river recreation will increase and riverside improvements will be needed at all. Instead of dismissing each assumption in isolation, this response places them in a logical order and considers their connections. Note the appropriate transitions between and within paragraphs, clarifying the links among the assumptions (e.g., "Closely linked to the surveys ..." or "The answer to this question requires...").

Along with strong development, this response also displays facility with language. Minor errors in punctuation are present, but word choices are apt and sentences suitably varied in pattern and length. The response uses a number of rhetorical questions, but the implied answers are always clear enough to support the points being made.

Thus, the response satisfies all requirements for a score of 5, but its development is not thorough or compelling enough for a 6.

### **Essay Response — Score 4**

The problem with the argument is the assumption that if the Mason River were cleaned up, that people would use it for water sports and recreation. This is not necessarily true, as people may rank water sports among their favorite recreational activities, but that does not mean that those same people have the financial ability, time or equipment to pursue those interests.

However, even if the writer of the argument is correct in assuming that the Mason River will be used more by the city's residents, the argument does not say why the recreational facilities need more money. If recreational facilities already exist along the Mason River, why should the city allot more money to fund them? If the recreational facilities already in existence will be used more in the coming years, then they will be making more money for themselves, eliminating the need for the city government to devote more money to them.

According to the argument, the reason people are not using the Mason River for water sports is because of the smell and the quality of water, not because the recreational facilities are unacceptable.

If the city government allotted more money to the recreational facilities, then the budget is being cut from some other important city project. Also, if the assumptions proved unwarranted, and more people did not use the river for recreation, then much money has been wasted, not only the money for the recreational facilities, but also the money that was used to clean up the river to attract more people in the first place.

### **Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 4**

This competent response identifies two unstated assumptions:

- that cleaning up the Mason River will lead to increased recreational use
- that existing facilities along the river need more funding

Paragraph 1 offers reasons why the first assumption is questionable (e.g., residents may not have the necessary time or money for water sports). Similarly, paragraphs 2 and 3 explain that riverside recreational facilities may already be adequate and may, in fact, produce additional income if usage increases. Thus, the response is adequately developed and satisfactorily organized to show how the argument depends on questionable assumptions.

However, this essay does not rise to a score of 5 because it fails to consider several other unstated assumptions (e.g., that the survey is reliable or that the efforts to clean the river will be successful). Furthermore, the final paragraph makes some extraneous,

unsupported assertions of its own. Mason City may actually have a budget surplus so that cuts to other projects will not be necessary, and cleaning the river may provide other real benefits even if it is not used more for water sports.

This response is generally free of errors in grammar and usage and displays sufficient control of language to support a score of 4.

### **Essay Response — Score 3**

Surveys are created to speak for the people; however, surveys do not always speak for the whole community. A survey completed by Mason City residents concluded that the residents enjoy water sports as a form of recreation. If that is so evident, why has the river not been used? The blame can not be solely placed on the city park department. The city park department can only do as much as they observe. The real issue is not the residents use of the river, but their desire for a more pleasant smell and a more pleasant sight. If the city government cleans the river, it might take years for the smell to go away. If the budget is changed to accommodate the clean up of the Mason River, other problems will arise. The residents will then begin to complain about other issues in their city that will be ignored because of the great emphasis being placed on Mason River. If more money is taken out of the budget to clean the river an assumption can be made. This assumption is that the budget for another part of city maintenance or building will be tapped into to. In addition, to the budget being used to clean up Mason River, it will also be allocated in increasing riverside recreational facilities. The government is trying to appease its residents, and one can warrant that the role of the government is to please the people. There are many assumptions being made; however, the government can not make the assumption that people want the river to be cleaned so that they can use it for recreational water activities. The government has to realize the long term effects that their decision will have on the monetary value of their budget.

### **Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 3**

Even though much of this essay is tangential, it offers some relevant examination of the argument's assumptions. The early sentences mention a questionable assumption (that the survey results are reliable) but do not explain how the survey might have been flawed. Then the response drifts to irrelevant matters — a defense of the city park department, a prediction of budget problems and the problem of pleasing city residents.

Some statements even introduce unwarranted assumptions that are not part of the original argument (e.g., "The residents will then begin to complain about other issues" and "This assumption is that the budget for another part of city maintenance or building will be tapped into"). Near the end, the response does correctly note that city government should not assume that residents want to use the river for recreation. Hence, the proposal to increase funding for riverside recreational facilities may not be justified.

In summary, the language in this response is reasonably clear, but its examination of unstated assumptions remains limited and therefore earns a score of 3.

### **Essay Response — Score 2**

This statement looks like logical, but there are some wrong sentences in it which is not logical.

First, this statement mentions raking water sports as their favorite recreational activities at the first sentence. However, it seems to have a relation between the first sentence and the sentence which mentions that increase the quality of the river's water and the river's smell. This is a wrong cause and result to solve the problem.

Second, as a response to the complaints from residents, the state plan to clean up the river. As a result, the state expects that water sports will increase. When you look at two sentences, the result is not appropriate for the cause.

Third, the last statement is the conclusion. However, even though residents rank water sports, the city government might devote the budget to another issue. This statement is also a wrong cause and result.

In summary, the statement is not logical because there are some errors in it. The supporting sentences are not strong enough to support this issue.

### **Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 2**

Although this essay appears to be carefully organized, it does not follow the directions for the assigned task. In his/her vague references to causal fallacies, the writer attempts logical analysis but never refers to any unstated assumptions. Furthermore, several errors in grammar and sentence structure interfere with meaning (e.g., "This statement looks like logical, but there are some wrong sentences in it which is not logical").

Because this response "does not follow the directions for the assigned task" and contains errors in sentence structure and logical development, it earns a score of 2.

### **Essay Response — Score 1**

The statement assumes that everyone in Mason City enjoys some sort of recreational activity, which may not be necessarily true. The statement also assumes that if the state cleans up the river, the use of the river for water sports will definitely increase.

### **Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 1**

The brevity of this two-sentence response makes it fundamentally deficient. Sentence 1 states an assumption that is actually not present in the argument, and sentence 2 correctly states an assumption but provides no discussion of its implications. Although the

response may begin to address the assigned task, it offers no development. As such, it is clearly "extremely brief ... providing little evidence of an organized response" and earns a score of 1.

## **Score Guide**

### **Score 6 Outstanding**

In addressing the specific task directions, a 6 response presents a cogent, well-articulated examination of the argument and conveys meaning skillfully.

A typical response in this category:

- clearly identifies aspects of the argument relevant to the assigned task and examines them insightfully
- develops ideas cogently, organizes them logically and connects them with clear transitions
- provides compelling and thorough support for its main points
- conveys ideas fluently and precisely, using effective vocabulary and sentence variety
- demonstrates superior facility with the conventions of standard written English (i.e., grammar, usage and mechanics), but may have minor errors

### **Score 5 Strong**

In addressing the specific task directions, a 5 response presents a generally thoughtful, well-developed examination of the argument and conveys meaning clearly.

A typical response in this category:

- clearly identifies aspects of the argument relevant to the assigned task and examines them in a generally perceptive way
- develops ideas clearly, organizes them logically and connects them with appropriate transitions
- offers generally thoughtful and thorough support for its main points
- conveys ideas clearly and well, using appropriate vocabulary and sentence variety
- demonstrates facility with the conventions of standard written English, but may have minor errors

### **Score 4 Adequate**

In addressing the specific task directions, a 4 response presents a competent examination of the argument and conveys meaning with acceptable clarity.

A typical response in this category:

- identifies and examines aspects of the argument relevant to the assigned task, but may also discuss some extraneous points
- develops and organizes ideas satisfactorily, but may not connect them with transitions

- supports its main points adequately, but may be uneven in its support
- demonstrates sufficient control of language to convey ideas with reasonable clarity
- generally demonstrates control of the conventions of standard written English, but may have some errors

### **Score 3 Limited**

A 3 response demonstrates some competence in addressing the specific task directions, in examining the argument and in conveying meaning, but is obviously flawed.

A typical response in this category exhibits ONE OR MORE of the following characteristics:

- does not identify or examine most of the aspects of the argument relevant to the assigned task, although some relevant examination of the argument is present
- mainly discusses tangential or irrelevant matters, or reasons poorly
- is limited in the logical development and organization of ideas
- offers support of little relevance and value for its main points
- has problems in language and sentence structure that result in a lack of clarity
- contains occasional major errors or frequent minor errors in grammar, usage or mechanics that can interfere with meaning

### **Score 2 Seriously Flawed**

A 2 response largely disregards the specific task directions and/or demonstrates serious weaknesses in analytical writing.

A typical response in this category exhibits ONE OR MORE of the following characteristics:

- does not present an examination based on logical analysis, but may instead present the writer's own views on the subject
- does not follow the directions for the assigned task
- does not develop ideas, or is poorly organized and illogical
- provides little, if any, relevant or reasonable support for its main points
- has serious problems in language and sentence structure that frequently interfere with meaning
- contains serious errors in grammar, usage or mechanics that frequently obscure meaning

### **Score 1 Fundamentally Deficient**

A 1 response demonstrates fundamental deficiencies in analytical writing.

A typical response in this category exhibits ONE OR MORE of the following characteristics:

- provides little or no evidence of understanding the argument

- provides little evidence of the ability to develop an organized response (e.g., is disorganized and/or extremely brief)
- has severe problems in language and sentence structure that persistently interfere with meaning
- contains pervasive errors in grammar, usage or mechanics that result in incoherence

**Score 0**

Off topic (i.e., provides no evidence of an attempt to respond to the assigned topic), is in a foreign language, merely copies the topic, consists of only keystroke characters, or is illegible or nonverbal.

**Score NS**

The essay response is blank.



240 楼: Argument 1 示范 woven baskets uniqueness  
72 楼: Argument 2 习作 (这道题我也没有把握, 只能算习作)  
56 楼: Argument 3/171 示范  
241 楼: Argument 4 示范  
225 楼: Argument 5/159 173 restrict moped rentals to reduce accidents 示范  
452 楼: Argument 6 deer population drop 提纲示范  
227 楼: Argument 7/98/99 opening a cafe and reduce children's book in a bookstore 示范  
242 楼: Argument 8 build new dorms 示范  
243 楼: Argument 9/88/90 示范 predicted success of new franchise of health food  
473 楼: Argument 10/21/23  
294 楼: Argument 11 示范 limiting the use of farmland leads to housing price hike  
453 楼: Argument 12  
454 楼: Argument 13  
90 楼: Argument 14/118 示范及改写练习 (欢迎参与)  
50 楼: Argument 15/51/130/131/133 示范  
474 楼: Argument 16 ETS 范文  
412 楼: Argument 17/93 示范  
183 楼: Argument 18/20 示范 expand coverage of local news and weather  
71 楼: Argument 19 more call-in advice radio programs to gain more audience 示范  
183 楼: Argument 20/18 示范 expand coverage of local news and weather  
473 楼: Argument 10/21/23  
139 楼: Argument 22/119/120/138 Honor codes in Groveton College 示范  
473 楼: Argument 10/21/23  
155 楼: Argument 24/26/28 示范 use of salicylates as additives and reduction of headaches  
89 楼: Argument 25/100/102/164 Jazz club profitability 示范  
155 楼: Argument 26/28/24 示范 use of salicylates as additives and reduction of headaches  
455 楼: Argument 27/29  
155 楼: Argument 28/26/24 示范 use of salicylates as additives and reduction of headaches  
455 楼: Argument 29/27  
192 楼: Argument 30 reduce city budgets for education 示范  
456 楼: Argument 31 government spending and residents attitudes on public schools 分析及提纲 (101 楼)  
43 楼: Argument 32/104/105/106/167 示范  
457 楼: Argument 33  
439 楼: Argument 34/58/94  
246 楼: Argument 35 示范 (52/128/129)  
458 楼: Argument 36/163/166  
459 楼: Argument 37  
460 楼: Argument 38/95/96  
426 楼: Argument 174/39 示范  
461 楼: Argument 40  
475 楼: Argument 123/125/41  
462 楼: Argument 42  
463 楼: Argument 43

464 楼: Argument 44  
476 楼: Argument 45/49  
477 楼: Argument 46  
478 楼: Argument 47/111/112  
175 楼: Argument 48 Clearview: a top choice for retirement 示范  
476 楼: Argument 45/49  
295 楼: Argument 50 示范  
50 楼: Argument 51/15/130/131/133 示范  
246 楼: Argument 52 示范 (35/128/129)  
201 楼: Argument 53/144/151 healthful lifestyles 示范  
226 楼: Argument 54/165 humans responsible for large mammals extinction or not 示范  
419 楼: Argument 55 示范  
479 楼: Argument 56/57/82  
479 楼: Argument 56/57/82  
439 楼: Argument 58/34/94  
480 楼: Argument 59  
481 楼: Argument 60/79/145/146/150/154/155  
420 楼: Argument 61/139/141/143/162 提纲  
421 楼: Argument 62/121/122/124 示范  
482 楼: Argument 63  
483 楼: Argument 64  
417 楼: Argument 65 measures to promote a park 示范  
484 楼: Argument 66/107/108  
485 楼: Argument 67  
188 楼: Argument 68 adopt-a-dog program 示范  
486 楼: Argument 69/70/115  
486 楼: Argument 69/70/115  
328 楼: Argument 71 示范  
487 楼: Argument 72  
488 楼: Argument 73  
133 楼: Argument 74/147/148/149/156 Girls college Switches to co-education 示范  
189 楼: Argument 75 Regulation of retail milk prices  
489 楼: Argument 76  
422 楼: Argument 77/169  
171 楼: Argument 示范 78 114 116 117 Pest Control  
509 楼: Argument 79  
510 楼: Argument 80  
320 楼: Argument 81  
479 楼: Argument 56/57/82  
398 楼: Argument 83/84  
398 楼: Argument 84/83  
77 楼: Argument 85/87 reading habits (classics vs novel)示范与练习 (欢迎参与)  
490 楼: Argument 86/89  
77 楼: Argument 87/85 reading habits (classics vs novel)示范与练习 (欢迎参与)

243 楼: Argument 9/88/90 示范 predicted success of new franchise of health food  
490 楼: Argument 86/89  
243 楼: Argument 9/88/90 示范 predicted success of new franchise of health food  
466 楼: Argument 91 示范  
491 楼: Argument 92/101/103  
412 楼: Argument 17/93 示范  
439 楼: Argument 94/58/34  
460 楼: Argument 38/95/96  
460 楼: Argument 38/95/96  
314 楼: Argument 97 attract audience for Shakespeare theatre 示范  
227 楼: Argument 7/98/99 opening a cafe and reduce children's book in a bookstore 示范  
227 楼: Argument 7/98/99 opening a cafe and reduce children's book in a bookstore 示范  
89 楼: Argument 25/100/102/164 Jazz club profitability 示范  
491 楼: Argument 92/101/103 新增 argument 101 示范在博客 621 楼  
89 楼: Argument 25/100/102/164 Jazz club profitability 示范  
491 楼: Argument 92/101/103  
43 楼: Argument 32/104/105/106 示范  
43 楼: Argument 32/104/105/106 示范  
43 楼: Argument 32/104/105/106 示范  
484 楼: Argument 66/107/108  
484 楼: Argument 66/107/108  
492 楼: Argument 109/110  
492 楼: Argument 109/110  
478 楼: Argument 47/111/112  
478 楼: Argument 47/111/112  
493 楼: Argument 113/126/127/161  
171 楼: Argument 示范 78 114 116 117 Pest Control  
486 楼: Argument 69/70/115  
171 楼: Argument 示范 78 114 116 117 Pest Control  
171 楼: Argument 示范 78 114 116 117 Pest Control  
90 楼: Argument 14/118 示范及改写练习 (欢迎参与)  
139 楼: Argument 22/119/120/138 Honor codes in Groveton College 示范  
139 楼: Argument 22/119/120/138 Honor codes in Groveton College 示范  
421 楼: Argument 62/121/122/124 示范  
421 楼: Argument 62/121/122/124 示范  
475 楼: Argument 123/125/41  
421 楼: Argument 62/121/122/124 示范  
475 楼: Argument 123/125/41  
493 楼: Argument 113/126/127/161  
493 楼: Argument 113/126/127/161  
246 楼: Argument 128 示范 (52/128/129)  
246 楼: Argument 129 示范 (52/128/129)  
50 楼: Argument 130/131/133/15/51 示范  
50 楼: Argument 131/130/133/15/51 示范

181 楼: Argument 132/134/136 mandatory driving course to address problems of accidents 示范

50 楼: Argument 133/131/130/15/51 示范

181 楼: Argument 132/134/136 mandatory driving course to address problems of accidents 示范

494 楼: Argument 135/137/140

181 楼: Argument 132/134/136 mandatory driving course to address problems of accidents 示范

494 楼: Argument 135/137/140

139 楼: Argument 22/119/120/138 Honor codes in Groveton College 示范

420 楼: Argument 61/139/141/143/162 提纲; 未写全文

494 楼: Argument 135/137/140

420 楼: Argument 61/139/141/143/162 提纲; 未写全文

495 楼: Argument 142

420 楼: Argument 61/139/141/143/162 提纲; 未写全文

201 楼: Argument 53/144/151 healthful lifestyles 示范

481 楼: Argument 60/145/146/150/154/155

481 楼: Argument 60/145/146/150/154/155

133 楼: Argument 74/147/148/149/156 Girls college Switches to co-education 示范

133 楼: Argument 74/147/148/149/156 Girls college Switches to co-education 示范

133 楼: Argument 74/147/148/149/156 Girls college Switches to co-education 示范

481 楼: Argument 60/145/146/150/154/155

201 楼: Argument 53/144/151 healthful lifestyles 示范

496 楼: Argument 152/153

496 楼: Argument 152/153

481 楼: Argument 60/145/146/150/154/155

481 楼: Argument 60/145/146/150/154/155

133 楼: Argument 74/147/148/149/156 Girls college Switches to co-education 示范

497 楼: Argument 157/158

497 楼: Argument 157/158

225 楼: Argument 5/159 173 restrict moped rentals to reduce accidents 示范

498 楼: Argument 160/172

493 楼: Argument 113/126/127/161

420 楼: Argument 61/139/141/143/162 提纲

458 楼: Argument 36/163/166

89 楼: Argument 25/100/102/164 Jazz club profitability 示范

226 楼: Argument 54/165 humans responsible for large mammals extinction or not 示范

458 楼: Argument 36/163/166

43 楼: Argument 32/104/105/106/167 示范

499 楼: Argument 168

422 楼: Argument 77/169 示范

500 楼: Argument 170

56 楼: Argument 3/171 示范

498 楼: Argument 160/172

225 楼: Argument 5/159 173 restrict moped rentals to reduce accidents 示范

426 楼: Argument 174/39 示范

576 楼: Argument 176 提纲

575 楼: Argument 177 提纲

注:

题目第一行用蓝色荧光标注表示, 此题第一次出现有大纲或范文, 绿色荧光标注的是与前面题目有重复

## Argument topics

This page contains the Argument topics for the Analytical Writing section of the GRE® revised General Test. When you take the test, you will be presented with one Argument topic from this pool.

Each Argument topic consists of a passage that presents an argument followed by specific task instructions that tell you how to analyze the argument. The wording of some topics in the test might vary slightly from what is presented here. Also, because there may be multiple versions of some topics with similar or identical wording but with different task instructions, it is very important to read your test topic and its specific task directions carefully and respond to the wording as it appears in the actual test.

---

### 1. Woven baskets characterized by a particular distinctive pattern have previously been

found only in the immediate vicinity of the prehistoric village of Palea and therefore were believed to have been made only by the Palean people. Recently, however, archaeologists discovered such a "Palean" basket in Lithos, an ancient village across the Brim River from Palea. The Brim River is very deep and broad, and so the ancient Paleans could have crossed it only by boat, and no Palean boats have been found. Thus it follows that the so-called Palean baskets were not uniquely Palean.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

#### Outline

focus on whether the river could be crossed by people without any help: not so deep and broad; frozen in winter

discuss the possible bridges and boats which might not survive the time

explore the possibility of the baskets being carried by water

conclusion: Palean baskets were not uniquely Palean; other villages can produce similar baskets

key question: are the newly found baskets locally produced or transported from Palean

whether the river was that deep and broad at the time

boats from other villages? what materials were available for making boats; can they survive

possible bridge?

trading relationship?

示范:

According to this argument, the Palean baskets may have been made by people from areas other than Palea as the baskets have been found in the adjacent village. We need more evidence about geographical information of the area, the technologies of building boats and bridges and the characteristics of the baskets in order to evaluate the argument.

While the author assumes that the baskets could only have been carried by boats which had not been found, there are other possible scenarios. For example, maybe the river at the time was not as deep and broad as it is now. If the river was shallow and narrow, people in Palea and Lithos could be trading baskets by walking across the river. On the other hand, maybe the weather was extremely cold at the time and the river was frozen during the winter. Again the people from the two villages could simply walk across the river to trade. So we need more information about the geography and climate in the area at the time to assess how likely the scenarios discussed above were.

We also need to know more about the technologies of Palean and Lithoian people at the time for building boats and bridges. Specifically, we want to know whether they were able to build boats and bridges and if they could what materials they used. Maybe they could build boats or bridges to cross the river but the materials they used could not survive the time and left no traces for archaeologists to locate. The absence of any tangible traces of boats or bridges does not necessarily imply no boats or bridges were available then. More information regarding these issues is needed.

Another important piece of evidence we need is the materials being used to make the baskets. Specifically, we want to know whether the baskets could float in the water. It is possible that some of the baskets had been dumped by Palean people to the river and carried by the water to the other side of the river and then picked up by Lithoian people. To assess how likely this scenario is, we need to know the density of the materials of the baskets along with some other physical characteristics.

In conclusion, it is difficult to decide whether people from Lithos may have learned to make the baskets. More information about different issues discussed above has to be gathered to assess the strength of the argument.

---

## 2.The following appeared as part of a letter to the editor of a scientific journal.

"A recent study of eighteen rhesus monkeys provides clues as to the effects of birth order on an individual's levels of stimulation. The study showed that in stimulating situations (such as an encounter with an unfamiliar monkey), firstborn infant monkeys produce up to twice as much of the hormone cortisol, which primes the body for increased activity levels, as do their younger siblings. Firstborn humans also produce relatively high levels of cortisol in stimulating situations (such as the return of a parent after an absence). The study also found that during pregnancy, first-time mother monkeys had higher levels of cortisol than did those who had had several offspring."

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

示范:

In this letter to the editor, the author claims that birth order has direct effects on the stimulation levels of infants and pregnant mothers as manifested in the levels of cortisol. While being firstborn is correlated with high stimulation levels, there are a number of alternative explanations we need to take into account when evaluating the soundness of the argument.

First of all, we may explain the high stimulation levels of firstborn infants in terms of their relatively older ages. In both studies of monkeys and human infants, firstborn infants have to be compared with their younger siblings when being exposed to certain stimulating situations. Maybe the firstborn babies responded to the stimulation more actively simply because they were older and with better cognitive abilities they were more sensitive to potential danger of an unfamiliar monkey or the excitement of a returning parent. The higher level of cortisol could be the result of the intense emotional changes rather than being firstborn.

Related to age is the relatively larger body sizes of the firstborn babies which may lead to higher levels of cortisol being released. Assuming the amount of cortisol produced is proportional to the body size, the larger the babies are the more cortisol would be produced given the same level of stimulation. Therefore, we need to control the body size if we want to better understand the effects of birth order on stimulation level.

Although the siblings usually share similar genes, firstborn babies are not genetically identical to their younger brothers or sisters. Therefore, the different levels of stimulation could result from the different genes of the infants. Since the sample size was relatively small, it is possible that infants that are genetically geared towards releasing more cortisol



happen to be firstborn. Studies of larger random samples are necessary to tease out the effects of genes from the effects of birth order.

As for the first-time expecting mothers, birth order may not be the direct cause of high level of stimulation. Maybe the first-time mothers were more excited or nervous about being pregnant which lead to higher level of cortisol being released. Or the pregnant mothers with children were too busy taking care of their children to feel excited or nervous. Therefore the level of excitement or stress could be a better explanation for the level of stimulation.

In conclusion, a number of alternative explanations may be advanced for the high level of stimulation observed. Unless we could find concrete evidence to rule out such explanations, the argument is not very strong.

---

3. The following appeared as a letter to the editor from a Central Plaza store owner.

"Over the past two years, the number of shoppers in Central Plaza has been steadily decreasing while the popularity of skateboarding has increased dramatically. Many Central Plaza store owners believe that the decrease in their business is due to the number of skateboard users in the plaza. There has also been a dramatic increase in the amount of litter and vandalism throughout the plaza. Thus, we recommend that the city prohibit skateboarding in Central Plaza. If skateboarding is prohibited here, we predict that business in Central Plaza will return to its previously high levels."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

示范:

What are the reasons why people do not come to Central Plaza?

What are the reasons why the business decreased in Central Plaza?

What are the causes of litter and vandalism?

Can skateboarding be effectively prohibited? What will happen if it is prohibited.

In this letter, it is recommended that skateboarding should be prohibited in order to resume the popularity and business activities in Central Plaza. A number of questions about why people do not shop as much in Central Plaza as before, the causes of litter and vandalism and the feasibility and consequences of prohibiting skateboarding need to be answered in order to evaluate

The first question we need to investigate is why shoppers came to the Central Plaza less often and spent less money here. It is assumed in the argument that skateboarding was the main reason. But we need more information about shoppers' attitudes towards skateboarding and whether or not skateboarding had been a hassle to the shoppers and shop owners here. Maybe the decline of popularity and business was due to the relatively high prices of the goods sold in Central Plaza or the opening of a fancier shopping mall in the region. If that was the case, prohibiting skateboarding would not improve the situation.

It may be safe to assume that litter and vandalism compromise the shopping experiences at Central Plaza and partially lead to the reduction of business. But we need more evidence about who were responsible for such socially unacceptable or illegal activities. It is not fair to assume that skateboarders were the people engaged in littering and/or vandalism. Again, if littering and vandalism were done by a different group of people, the recommendation would not lead to desired outcome.

The final issue we need to address is whether skateboarding could be effectively prohibited and what would happen after prohibition. If the children engaged in skateboarding were so enthusiastic about the sports, prohibiting it may cost too much manpower and lead to conflicts between the skateboarders and the security guards that may drive away more shoppers. Also, even if skateboarding were successfully prohibited, we need to know what these people who used to skateboard would do in Central Plaza. Maybe they would do something even more annoying and disruptive than skateboarding.

In conclusion, since we do not know the real reasons why people did not come to Central Plaza as often as before and who were responsible for increasing litter and vandalism, it is not fair to blame the skateboarders. More efforts should be made to investigate the behaviour patterns of the skateboarders to decide whether prohibiting the sports is a feasible and desirable option.

---

4. The following appeared in a letter from a homeowner to a friend.

"Of the two leading real estate firms in our town—Adams Realty and Fitch Realty—Adams Realty is clearly superior. Adams has 40 real estate agents; in contrast, Fitch has 25, many of whom work only part-time. Moreover, Adams' revenue last year was twice as high as that of Fitch and included home sales that averaged \$168,000, compared to Fitch's \$144,000. Homes listed with Adams sell faster as well: ten years ago I listed my home with Fitch, and it took more than four months to sell; last year, when I sold another home, I listed it with Adams, and it took only one month. Thus, if you want to sell your home quickly and at a good price, you should use Adams Realty."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

示范:

According to the author of the letter, his friend should try to sell the home through Adams because the company has more full-time agents, sold more homes at higher average prices and had a record of selling homes faster. A number of assumptions had been made in the argument and we need to examine them critically to decide if the recommendation is reasonable.

To begin with, it is assumed that a real estate company with more full-time agents would always sell a home faster and better. It is true that with more staff members working full time, Adams will have more human resources available to sell different homes. But it is important to note that they also generate more revenue which means they will need to sell more homes. Therefore, the human efforts devoted to each home for sale are not necessarily greater in Adams. It is also assumed that full-time agents are always better in selling homes than part-time agents. But it is possible that selling a particular home requires the networking with a particular group of customers that only part-time agents with more time to spend with other people may have. In cases like this, using Fitch may even be more desirable.

It is further assumed that an agency that sells more homes at a higher average price can do the job better. For one thing, comparing average price of the homes sold could be a bit misleading as the company could have sold one home at an extremely high price that boost the average price while in reality most homes sold by the company were at a lower price. Meanwhile, it is also possible that the friend's home is at a relatively low price which Adams's agents are not very good at selling. It is more reasonable to look at the individual homes that Adams and Fitch had sold in the past to decide if the agents in either company would have the expertise or experience to sell the friend's home.

The author claimed that Adams sold homes faster than Fitch based on just two transactions that these two companies helped him with. It is unreasonable to assume that these two transactions that were ten years apart could accurately reflect the selling speed of each company. It is safer to assume that the time required to sell homes vary greatly across different types of homes, different prices and the individual agents that were responsible for the deals. Even assuming that factors such as demand and demographics remain unchanged in ten years, the fact that Adams sold one home faster than Fitch sold another home may simply suggest that the particular agent in Adams did a better job than the particular agent in Fitch. It remains unknown if Adams would do a better or faster job than Fitch in selling the friend's home.

Overall speaking, the author needs to present more evidence to support the assumptions that have been explicitly or implicitly made in the argument to convince his friend that Adams should be used. In its present form, the argument is not very strong.

---

5. The following appeared in a letter to the editor of the *Balmer Island Gazette*.

"On Balmer Island, where mopeds serve as a popular form of transportation, the population increases to 100,000 during the summer months. To reduce the number of accidents involving mopeds and pedestrians, the town council of Balmer Island should limit the number of mopeds rented by the island's moped rental companies from 50 per day to 25 per day during the summer season. By limiting the number of rentals, the town council will attain the 50 percent annual reduction in moped accidents that was achieved last year on the neighboring island of Seaville, when Seaville's town council enforced similar limits on moped rentals."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

范文:

In the letter to the editor, the author argues that, in order to reduce the number of accidents involving mopeds during the summer season, the moped rental companies should be restricted to rent only 25 mopeds per day. The author refers to the success in reducing accidents in Seaville where a similar policy was adopted as the evidence to support his recommendation. We need to answer questions about the sources of mopeds in Balmer, the causes of the accidents and the difference between Balmer and Seaville to evaluate the argument.

To begin with, we need to know where the people get mopeds from during the summer in Balmer. The rental companies may not be the only sources of mopeds. Maybe the local residents own mopeds privately and this policy will not reduce the number of such mopeds. Perhaps some tourists will bring their own mopeds along and the policy could not prevent them from doing so. In addition, if mopeds are really fun to ride, maybe people who could not rent the mopeds will buy one, a scenario the policy could not prevent, either. We need to ask whether the majority of mopeds in Balmer are from the rental company to decide if the policy will make any difference.

Another important question we need to ask is about the nature and the causes of the accidents. If the accidents were mainly due to the increasing number of mopeds on the street, the proposed policy for reducing the number of mopeds might be helpful. But what if the accidents were mainly due to the recklessness of a small number of mopeds riders. It makes no sense to restrict the supply for rentals when a small number of young people who rided the moped in an irresponsible way were the main causes of the accidents. Or perhaps, certain areas in Balmer were just too crowded to ride mopeds safely and banning mopeds in such area would be a much better solution than restricting the rentals.

It is understandable that the author would like Balmer to learn from the successful case of Seaville. But we need to answer a number of questions over how comparable Balmer and Seaville were and whether the restriction was the main cause of accident reduction. Since Balmer and Seaville are two different places with different local residents and different tourists, it is difficult to assume the policy used in Seaville will succeed in Balmer. Going back to the issue of the sources of mopeds, perhaps in Seaville most mopeds were provided by the rental companies and, as a result, the restriction on rentals was helpful. But this may not be the case for Balmer. Another possibility was that Seaville town council had launched a rigorous moped safety education campaign that was the real cause of accident reduction. Or maybe the accidents involving mopeds were reduced because fewer tourists visited Seaville last year. After all we did not have any information about the population in Seaville.

In general, in order to decide if the recommendation will help reduce the number of accidents, we need to collect more information to answer the questions raised above.

---

6. Arctic deer live on islands in Canada's arctic regions. They search for food by moving over ice from island to island during the course of the year. Their habitat is limited to areas warm enough to sustain the plants on which they feed and cold enough, at least some of the year, for the ice to cover the sea separating the islands, allowing the deer to travel over it. Unfortunately, according to reports from local hunters, the deer populations are declining. Since these reports coincide with recent global warming trends that have caused the sea ice to melt, we can conclude that the purported decline in deer populations is the result of the deer's being unable to follow their age-old migration patterns across the frozen sea.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

提纲:

P1: more evidence about the accuracy of the hunters' reports

- whether the hunters had scared away the deer with their guns
- whether the hunters had visited the area in a particular point in time when the deer were less active
- how many hunters had reported the deer population; the number was small- less reliable

P2: more evidence about the sea ice in arctic region

- whether the sea ice in arctic region had melted (global warming trend does not mean local warming)
- whether more food was available near the habitat due to the climate change (then no need to travel)

P3: evidence that may provide other explanations for the decline of deer population

- any pollution that may threaten the deer population
- overhunting



---

7. The following is a recommendation from the Board of Directors of Monarch Books.

"We recommend that Monarch Books open a café in its store. Monarch, having been in business at the same location for more than twenty years, has a large customer base because it is known for its wide selection of books on all subjects. Clearly, opening the café would attract more customers. Space could be made for the café by discontinuing the children's book section, which will probably become less popular given that the most recent national census indicated a significant decline in the percentage of the population under age ten. Opening a café will allow Monarch to attract more customers and better compete with Regal Books, which recently opened its own café."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

示范:

In this argument, it is recommended that Monarch should open a cafe in order to attract more customers for a number of reasons. Firstly, it is assumed that Monarch customers will find the cafe attractive. Moreover, based on the results of a national census, it is predicted that the demand of children's books will decline due to the demographic changes. Therefore, space can be made for a new cafe by cutting the children's book section. Finally, the move to build a new cafe is necessary for competing against Regal Books which has offered a cafe to its customers. To evaluate the recommendation, a number of questions need to be answered.

To begin with, research efforts need to be made to investigate the customers' attitudes towards a possible new cafe. If a large number of Monarch customers would indeed find the cafe interesting, the addition of the cafe will then enhance the customers' shopping experiences at Monarch. If this is the case, the recommendation would be considered stronger. Otherwise, if the marketing researches suggest that most of the Monarch customers prefer to shop at Monarch but read elsewhere, the new cafe will not make the store more attractive.

Another important issue to look into is the demographic structure of the Monarch customers. The results of national census are not useful in the analysis here unless the target customers of Monarch share the similar structure with the national population in terms of age. It is entirely possible that, despite the national trend of fewer children in the population, there will be more children in the areas where Monarch is in business. The timeliness of the national census is another concern as the most recent census may still be too old to reflect the demographic trend.

Furthermore, one has to examine other factors such as parents' preferences and school policies that may influence the demand for children's books. If the parents become more interested in improving their children's literacy skills through reading, more children's books are likely to be sold. Likewise, if the local schools introduce reading programs that encourage more children to read, more money will be available for purchasing books written for children.

As far as competing against Regal Books is concerned, the first question one needs to investigate is whether or not the new cafe at Regal has been successful in attracting more customers. If Regal's new cafe is not very attractive, there is little incentive for Monarch to follow the practice. Even if the Regal is successful in building an attractive cafe, one has to review the size of investment that is required for the project and decide whether Monarch can afford the same amount of financial commitment. Meanwhile, other options for attracting more customers, for example building an online shop, should also be explored.

---

8. The following appeared in a memo from the director of student housing at Buckingham College.

"To serve the housing needs of our students, Buckingham College should build a number of new dormitories. Buckingham's enrollment is growing and, based on current trends, will double over the next 50 years, thus making existing dormitory space inadequate. Moreover, the average rent for an apartment in our town has risen in recent years. Consequently, students will find it increasingly difficult to afford off-campus housing. Finally, attractive new dormitories would make prospective students more likely to enroll at Buckingham."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

示范:

The director of student housing argues that to meet the increasing housing needs of the students and to attract more students to study at Buckingham, the college should build some new dorms. To evaluate the argument, we need more evidence about the current and future demand of student dorms, the relative prices of dorm rooms and off-campus housing and the attitudes of prospective students.

The projection that the number of students will double in 50 years is not very useful for evaluating the argument because the new dorms, as planned, will be available in the next 5 years and to decide whether this is necessary we need data for the next 5 years rather than 50 years. Specifically, we want to know whether the number of students who need on-campus housing will exceed the number of dorm rooms available then. A related number we want to know is how many dorm rooms may be unoccupied at present which may tell us more about students' preference of dorm rooms over off-campus housing. If the expected demand of dorm rooms exceeds the current supply, maybe we need to build more dorms. Otherwise, the proposal is not reasonable.

We also need to know more about the rents of current dorm rooms, new dorm rooms as well as off-campus housing. The data about the average rent of the apartment in town is not very useful as it includes apartments that may be far away from the campus and therefore not available to Buckingham students. It would be more useful to look at the average rents of the off-campus apartments that Buckingham students usually chose to live in and see if these apartments will become increasingly expensive in future. In addition, it would help to compare the rents of the off-campus apartment with the current fees for the dorm rooms as well as the expected costs of new dorm rooms. If the dorm rooms will be more expensive than the off-campus apartments, it would be pointless to build new dorms to help ease the financial burden of Buckingham students.

A related issue is how the construction project would influence the prospective students' decisions on whether to study at Buckingham. We need more information about how important the prospective students consider new dorm rooms are to their decisions to join Buckingham. Also, we want to know if the new projects may affect the university budget and whether the university may have to charge higher tuition fees as a result. If the students have to pay more tuition or housing fees to finance the new project, it is unlikely that the project would attract more prospective students.

In conclusion, to decide whether the proposal is reasonable, we need more evidence about the rents of the off-campus apartments chosen by Buckingham students, the current and future rents of dorms and the attitudes of prospective students.

student need

- over the next 5 years
- relative prices of dorm rooms and off-campus housing
- occupation rate of current dorm rooms

prospective students preference

cost of new dorm

9. Nature's Way, a chain of stores selling health food and other health-related products, is opening its next franchise in the town of Plainsville. The store should prove to be very successful: Nature's Way franchises tend to be most profitable in areas where residents lead healthy lives, and clearly Plainsville is such an area. Plainsville merchants report that sales of running shoes and exercise clothing are at all-time highs. The local health club has more members than ever, and the weight training and aerobics classes are always full. Finally, Plainsville's schoolchildren represent a new generation of potential customers: these schoolchildren are required to participate in a fitness-for-life program, which emphasizes the benefits of regular exercise at an early age.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

示范:

The author predicts that the new franchise in Plainsville will be successful based on the fact that the residents here have bought many running shoes and exercise clothing, signed up for health club memberships and the requirement for schoolchildren to join a health-related program. A number of assumptions about these facts have been made and need to be examined critically to decide if the prediction is reasonable.

It is first assumed that the strong sale of running shoes and exercise garment necessarily means that the residents in the area are living a healthy life. There are different alternative explanations for the strong sale. For example, there might be an influx of tourists to Plainsville who are responsible for buying the running shoes and exercise garments. In addition, the residents might have bought the shoes and clothing as Christmas gifts for their relatives and friends in other cities. Even they bought the goods for themselves, they may not have the time and willpower to wear these shoes and clothes to exercise. Unless more evidence is available to suggest that the residents have actually exercised their bodies with these shoes and clothes, the assumptions made here do not hold.

The high membership of the health club and the full enrollment of the classes do not necessarily support the claim that the local residents live healthy life, either. It is one thing to pay for the health club memberships. It is quite another for the residents to actually show up for the health club activities regularly. The members may be too busy to actually participate in the club despite their payment for membership. Likewise, residents enrolled in those classes may not show up in all the classes when other commitments such as dating or parenting took away their time and energy. In addition, we do not know how big the health club and the classes are relative to the population size

of Painsville. If the club and class sizes are relatively small, the membership and enrollment cannot accurately reflect the overall lifestyle of Painsville residents. It is further assumed that the children in Painsville, after the mandatory school program, will lead a healthy life and become potential customers for the franchise. It is not clear how the children and their parents would respond to such a program. Maybe due to its compulsory nature, the children do not enjoy the program and could not internalize the idea of exercising regularly. Also, the program may not last due to the opposition of the parents. Moreover, even if the children learn to live a healthy life through such a program, they may leave the town for colleges or jobs by the time they reach the age of buying the products from the franchise.

Lastly, an implicit assumption being made in the argument is that the franchise will succeed in the competition against other similar products and the other substitute services such as sportswear and health care membership. Maybe in Painsville there is already a company selling health products similar to what the franchise has to offer. Also, maybe the Painsville residents do not need the products from the franchise after being active in the health clubs or having their children involved in the health program at schools. If the franchise could not attract the customers who have already had access to these health-related goods and services, it will not be very successful in Painsville.

Overall speaking, it is important to collect more evidence to evaluate the assumptions discussed above in order to decide if the prediction about the franchise's success is reasonable.

10. Twenty years ago, Dr. Field, a noted anthropologist, visited the island of Tertia. Using an observation-centered approach to studying Tertian culture, he concluded from his observations that children in Tertia were reared by an entire village rather than by their own biological parents. Recently another anthropologist, Dr. Karp, visited the group of islands that includes Tertia and used the interview-centered method to study child-rearing practices. In the interviews that Dr. Karp conducted with children living in this group of islands, the children spent much more time talking about their biological parents than about other adults in the village. Dr. Karp decided that Dr. Field's conclusion about Tertian village culture must be invalid. Some anthropologists recommend that to obtain accurate information on Tertian child-rearing practices, future research on the subject should be conducted via the interview-centered method.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

"The following appeared in an article written by Dr. Karp, an anthropologist.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

Twenty years ago, Dr. Field, a noted anthropologist, visited the island of Tertia and concluded from his observations that children in Tertia were reared by an entire village rather than by their own biological parents. However, my recent interviews with children living in the group of islands that includes Tertia show that these children spend much more time talking about their biological parents than about other adults in the village. This research of mine proves that Dr. Field's conclusion about Tertian village culture is invalid and thus that the observation-centered approach to studying cultures is invalid as well. The interview-centered method that my team of graduate students is currently using in Tertia will establish a much more accurate understanding of child-rearing traditions there and in other island cultures."

It might seem logical, at first glance, to agree with the argument in Dr. Karp's article that children in Tertia actually are raised by their biological parents (and perhaps even, by implication, that an observation-centered approach to anthropological study is not as valid as an interview-centered one). However, in order to fully evaluate this argument, we need to have a significant amount of additional evidence. The argument could end up being much weaker than it seems, or it might actually be quite valid. In order to make that determination, we need to know more than analyze what we learn.

The first piece of evidence that we would need in order to evaluate Dr. Karp's claims is information about whether or not Tertia and the surrounding island group have changed significantly in the past 20 years. Dr. Field conducted his observational study 20 years ago, and it is possible that Tertia has changed significantly since then. For example, if we had evidence that in the intervening years Westerners had settled on the island and they

introduced a more typical Western-style family structure, it would certainly weaken Dr. Karp's argument. In that case, the original study could have been accurate, and Dr. Karp's study could be correct, as well, though his conclusion that Dr. Field's method is ineffective would be seriously weakened.

Another piece of evidence that might help us evaluate this claim involves the exact locations where Dr. Karp's interviews took place. According to this article, Dr. Karp and his graduate students conducted interviews of "children living in the group of islands that includes Tertia." If we were to learn that they never interviewed a single Tertian child, it would significantly weaken the conclusion. It could turn out to be the case, for example, that children on Tertia are raised communally, whereas children on other islands nearby are raised by their biological parents.

In order to fully evaluate this article, we would also need to learn more about the interview questions that Dr. Karp's team used. What exactly did they ask? We don't know, nor do we know what the children's responses actually were. What did they say about their biological parents? The mere fact that they speak more frequently about their biological parents than they do about other adults does not mean that they are raised by their biological parents. It would significantly undermine Dr. Karp's argument if it turned out that the children said things like how much they missed their parents or how their parents had left them in a communal environment. Without knowing WHAT the children said, it is hard to accept Dr. Karp's conclusion.

It is slightly more difficult to discuss the evidence we might need in order to evaluate the more interesting claims in Dr. Karp's article, namely his extension of the results of his study to a conclusion that interview-centered methods are inherently more valid than observation-centered approaches. In order to fully evaluate this claim, in fact, we would need to look at many more examples of interview-based and observation-based anthropological studies and we would also need to look into different study designs. Perhaps Dr. Field did not conduct an effective observational study, but other observational approaches could be effective. In order to make such grandiose claims, Dr. Karp really needs a lot of additional evidence (ideally a meta-analysis of hundreds of anthropological studies).

Clearly, then, we need to have additional evidence in order to get a more complete understanding of the strengths and weaknesses of Dr. Karp's article. We need to know about Tertia and the surrounding islands, whether or not they have changed over the past 20 years. We also need to know about study design (Dr. Karp's and Dr. Field's). And we really need a lot more information if we want to extend the results of a study about one island culture to all anthropological fieldwork.



**11. The council of Maple County, concerned about the county's becoming overdeveloped,**

is debating a proposed measure that would prevent the development of existing farmland in the county. But the council is also concerned that such a restriction, by limiting the supply of new housing, could lead to significant increases in the price of housing in the county. Proponents of the measure note that Chestnut County established a similar measure ten years ago, and its housing prices have increased only modestly since. However, opponents of the measure note that Pine County adopted restrictions on the development of new residential housing fifteen years ago, and its housing prices have since more than doubled. The council currently predicts that the proposed measure, if passed, will result in a significant increase in housing prices in Maple County.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

**提纲:**

Conclusion: The council currently predicts that the proposed measure, if passed, will result in a significant increase in housing prices in Maple County.

Fact: The council of Maple County, concerned about the county's becoming overdeveloped, is debating a proposed measure that would prevent the development of existing farmland in the county. - the measure will prevent the development of existing farmland in the county

Proponents of the measure note that Chestnut County established a similar measure ten years ago, and its housing prices have increased only modestly since.

However, opponents of the measure note that Pine County adopted restrictions on the development of new residential housing fifteen years ago, and its housing prices have since more than doubled.

land supply - the proportion of farmland in the county- how important is farmland as a source of land for housing

other

overall economic development

demand side - population (demographic structure/ people who move in)

=====

**范文:**

Maple county council predicts that, after introducing the proposed policy on land use, the housing price will increase significantly. Considering the cases that may support or challenge the prediction, it is important to answer a number of questions about the land supply for housing, overall trend of economic development and the population growth of Maple county to decide if the prediction is reasonable.

In order to assess the impact of limiting the development of farmland to housing prices, it is critical to look into how important the farmland is as a source of land for housing. If the real estate developers in Maple had been relied on farmland in the past to build houses, as the case of Pine County may be, the prices of houses may increase significantly as the developers may face a shortage of land for building new houses. On the other hand, if the developers could obtain land from other sources, e.g. reclaim the land from the sea or build houses in forest parks, which might be the case of Chestnut, the policy would only have a modest impact of the housing prices as the supply of land and houses will not be affected.

Of course, the supply of land is not the only factor that will influence the housing prices. We also need to ask what the economy of Maple will be like in the next 10 or 15 years. If the Maple economy is expected to grow significantly in the next decade with a number of investment projects on the horizon, the housing price may increase as a result. This is because when the economy is strong people will enjoy higher income and can afford more expensive houses. This could be the main reason why after a similar policy was introduced in Pine, the housing prices had doubled. We need to examine more closely the cases of the housing price increase in Pine and see whether Maple is similar to Pine in terms of the trend of economic development. Alternatively, if the economic outlook of Maple is more similar to Chestnut, where the housing prices had changed very little, the prediction may not be accurate.

Another important factor we need to consider when predicting housing prices is population. Maybe the population size of Pine had grown exponentially in the past 15 years due to the booming economy creating more job opportunities and attracting more people moving over here. Or perhaps, the average age of Pine county residents is relatively low leading to the natural growth of population size in the next 15 years. If the demographic structure of Maple resembles that of Pine or Maple expects a large number of people moving in, the housing prices may increase in the next few years, not necessarily a result of the proposed policy. On the other hand, if Maple has the similar demographic structure as Chestnut and does not attract people from other areas, it is less likely that the housing prices will increase.

Overall speaking, it is important to bear in mind that predicting housing prices of an area is very difficult as there are a variety of factors in play and the proposed policy may or may not be the decisive factor. We need to ask questions about the land supply in Maple and see if it is similar to the case of Pine or Chestnut. More importantly, we also need to ask questions about other factors that may not be related to the proposed policy if we are to make a reasonable prediction of the housing price.

---

12. Fifteen years ago, Omega University implemented a new procedure that encouraged students to evaluate the teaching effectiveness of all their professors. Since that time, Omega professors have begun to assign higher grades in their classes, and overall student grade averages at Omega have risen by 30 percent. Potential employers, looking at this dramatic rise in grades, believe that grades at Omega are inflated and do not accurately reflect student achievement; as a result, Omega graduates have not been as successful at getting jobs as have graduates from nearby Alpha University. To enable its graduates to secure better jobs, Omega University should terminate student evaluation of professors.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

提纲:

need more information to determine the reason why the professors assign higher grades  
- maybe the evaluation scheme has improved the quality of teaching and learning

need more evidence to decide if the employers are correct about grade inflation  
- maybe the grades have been correct; the employers need more information and education

need more information about why Omega graduates are less employable than their counterparts from Alpha  
- maybe the majors do not match  
- Alpha graduates have better alumni network or internship opportunities  
- or Alpha university is more prestigious

---

13. In an attempt to improve highway safety, Prunty County last year lowered its speed limit from 55 to 45 miles per hour on all county highways. But this effort has failed: the number of accidents has not decreased, and, based on reports by the highway patrol, many drivers are exceeding the speed limit. Prunty County should instead undertake the same kind of road improvement project that Butler County completed five years ago: increasing lane widths, resurfacing rough highways, and improving visibility at dangerous intersections. Today, major Butler County roads still have a 55 mph speed limit, yet there were 25 percent fewer reported accidents in Butler County this past year than there were five years ago.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

提纲:

the reason why many drivers exceed the speed limit

- whether the drivers are fully informed about the change
- whether the fines and other punishments for speeding were efficient

the reason why Butler County had fewer accidents

- maybe fewer cars were on the road due to the receding economy
- a driver education program has worked

whether the proposed road improvement would reduce the accidents in Prunty

- the road condition in Prunty
- the causes of accidents in Prunty (related to poor road condition or not)

---

14.The following appeared as part of an article in a business magazine.

"A recent study rating 300 male and female Mertian advertising executives according to the average number of hours they sleep per night showed an association between the amount of sleep the executives need and the success of their firms. Of the advertising firms studied, those whose executives reported needing no more than 6 hours of sleep per night had higher profit margins and faster growth. These results suggest that if a business wants to prosper, it should hire only people who need less than 6 hours of sleep per night."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

以下是 14 的范文，请大家读完后，将它改写为 argument 118

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

注意尽管题目要求不同但是结构和内容基本一致 只需要在措辞上进行调整

范文：

The article argues that companies should hire people who need less sleep because these employees are more likely to succeed based on a survey of 300 advertising executives. A number of assumptions have been made about the generalisability of the survey result, the reliability of the reported need of sleep and other related issues. We need to examine the assumptions carefully in order to assess the argument.

To begin with, the assumption that the survey results can be applied more broadly may not hold true. The subjects of the survey are all from a single industry, namely, advertising. Maybe it is important for people in this field to burn the midnight's oil to prosper. But this rule may not apply to other industries, for example, insurance or manufacturing. In addition, the survey only asks the executives who may have to work extra hours to lead the companies. But for employees at lower level sleeping less may not be very helpful for achieving success.

In addition, it is assumed that the executives actually need little sleep as reported in the survey. In other words, the assumption is that the subjects were telling the truth about their lifestyles during the survey. It is possible that the survey respondents just want to impress others or show their attitudes towards sleep when answering the questions.

Without further data to verify the reliability of the survey results, it is not reasonable to apply the finding in the hiring processes.

Another assumption being made is that the need of less sleep is the main reason why the executives were successful. As we all know, correlation does not necessarily imply causation. A host of other factors unrelated to sleep may have caused the success of the executives. For example, they might happen to have a good team of people working efficiently towards their goals. Or they were lucky enough to meet some clients who were willing to pay higher fees which boosted the profit margins and the growth rates. Without looking into how they achieved success, it is too hasty to attribute their accomplishments to their sleep patterns.

Finally, it is also assumed that executives with less need for sleep can succeed in the long term. Maybe they manage to accomplish more than their peers with their abilities to sleep less. But we do not know how the relatively small amount of sleep would have any negative impact on their health and their performance in the long term. We also do not know how their lifestyles may affect the overall job satisfaction of themselves and their co-workers. If their abilities to sleep less would enable them to work overtime, maybe they would also force their colleagues to work overtime, which may not benefit the long-term success of a company.

In conclusion, it is not reasonable to recommend hiring people who need less sleep based on this survey on a relatively small group of executives from a single industry. More information is needed before we can check the assumptions discussed above and make a more reasonable hiring policy.

---

15. The following memorandum is from the business manager of Happy Pancake House restaurants.

"Recently, butter has been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. This change, however, has had little impact on our customers. In fact, only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers do not distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine."

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

Argument 51/15 两篇示范（包括其他解释类型题）

### **Argument 51**

*The following memorandum is from the business manager of Happy Pancake House restaurants.*

*Butter has now been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. Only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers cannot distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine. Thus, to avoid the expense of purchasing butter and to increase profitability, the Happy Pancake House should extend this cost-saving change to its restaurants in the southeast and northeast as well.*

范文：

The business manager argues that HPH restaurants in southeast and northeast should follow the practice of replacing butter with margarine as customers in southwest seemed to be happy with the arrangement which can save costs for the company. We need to ask a number of questions about how the replacement affected the food at HPH, how the customers felt about the replacement and what difference there might be between southwest customers and the customers in the other regions in order to evaluate the soundness of the argument.

To begin with, we need to know what percentages of the food and the customers have been affected by the replacement to better understand what it means to have 2% of customers complaining. If, for example, only half of the food items on the menu were prepared with butter (or margarine after replacement) or about 30% of customers actually

ordered anything with butter replaced by margarine, the fact that 2% of customers complained would be far more significant than the number suggested. In other words, the customers who ordered pancake without butter to begin with or the food items that do not include butter should be excluded from the data if we want any meaningful information.

In addition, we need to know the real attitudes of customers towards the replacement of butter with margarine. The fact that most customers being given margarine did not complain does not mean that these customers were completely satisfied with the new arrangement. Complaining about the food in a restaurant can be a stressful experience for many customers who do not want to ruin the time they spent with their friends or family members. They may choose to vote against the restaurant by feet by not coming to the restaurant next time instead of making a complaint right away. Therefore, we need to investigate how customers felt about the change through other means such as focus group, interviewing or simply monitoring the number of returning customers.

Moreover, it is not safe to assume that what works in one region would necessarily do the trick in a different region. Therefore, we need to ask if the customers in the other regions have the same preferences when it comes to butter vs. margarine. We need to carefully compare the demographic information of the different regions and investigate how different ages, income, gender and educational levels may affect customers' preferences for butter in a pancake restaurant. Such information is vital for the company to make decisions about adopting this new policy in other areas.

Finally, it is important to ask whether it is ethical to keep the customers in the dark with regard to the use of butter versus margarine. The company needs to know what the customers really want when they use the term "butter" rather than simply assuming that butter can mean both real butter and the cheaper substitute. Offering the customers something cheaper than what the customers expect and taking advantages of the ambiguity in the naming of food may be unethical practices that would harm the restaurant's reputation and long-term profitability and may even carry legal consequences.

Overall speaking, it is understandable that the company looks for ways to save costs and increase profits and replacing butter with something cheaper seems to be smart move. But this arrangement should not be extended to more restaurants in other regions unless the questions raised above are answered and the information collected clearly suggests that this arrangement is a desirable move.



Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

提纲:

claim: to avoid the expense of purchasing butter and to increase profitability, the Happy Pancake House should extend this cost-saving change to its restaurants in the southeast and northeast as well.

data: Butter has now been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States.

data: Only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change.

data: Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead.

data: Clearly, either these customers cannot distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine.

warrant: only 2% have complained about the replacement suggesting that the rest of them are satisfied with the change

warrant: customers who are given margarine did not complain, therefore, it is ok to replace it

warrant: customers cannot distinguish or do not distinguish; therefore, it is OK to replace

Questions should be asked about what percentages of the customers are affected by the replacement; the attitudes of the customers being given margarine instead of butter; the preferences of the customers in southeast and northeast

### **Argument 15**

The following memorandum is from the business manager of Happy Pancake House restaurants.

"Recently, butter has been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. This change, however, has had little impact on our customers. In fact, only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers do not distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine."

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

提纲:

First we have to identify the observations made and the explanations proposed  
we can then discuss how the observations could be explained in alternative ways

fact- only 2% complained

explanation: an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change

fact- many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead

explanation: Clearly, either these customers do not distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine.

范文:

The business manager of HPH argues that replacing butter with margarine had little influence on their customers based on his interpretations and explanations of two observations: 1) only 2% of customers complained; 2) customers did not complain about the replacement according to the servers. To evaluate the argument critically, we need to explore other alternative explanations for the facts observed and presented.

Given the fact that only 2% of the customers complained about margarine used to replace butter, the manager believes that 98% of the customers are OK with the replacement. But there might be other reasons why complaint rate was only 2%. For example, perhaps the only way for the customers to complain about the change was to speak to the restaurant staff directly, which the customers may feel reluctant to do for fear of embarrassment or confrontation. If the restaurant had a Facebook page accepting complaints from the customers, the complaint rate might be much higher. Indeed, the customers may have already complained about the change in social networking sites such as Facebook and Twitter, which the restaurant is not fully aware of.

Another possible explanation for the relatively low complaint rate is that the restaurant has done a decent job overall serving the customers. The food was generally delicious and the service was very good. As a result, the customers chose not to complain about the change of butter. But the lack of complaints should not be interpreted as the customers being satisfied with the change without stronger evidence to support such an interpretation.

As for the servers' report of few complaints after failing to deliver the order, there are also a number of alternative explanations we need to consider. Maybe the servers chose to withhold information about the complaints they received from the customers in order to look good to the management of HPH. More systematic and independent investigation into the customer satisfaction about the change of ingredient is necessary to settle this

issue. Such investigation would help determine whether the customers could not distinguish butter from margarine or used the term “butter” more loosely.

Meanwhile, for the lack of complaints in both cases, we also need to consider the possibility that customers decided not to come to HPH for dinner again after the change about butter. They simply voted against HPH by their feet without taking the trouble to lodge a complaint. We need to track the customer returning rate before and after the change about butter to decide if the change has cost the restaurant some customers. Indeed, such loss of customers may be more threatening to the restaurant than complaints as it is harder for the manager to recognize the problems when the customers just gave up the restaurant silently.

In conclusion, we need more information about customers' attitudes towards the change and a number of other issues to decide which explanations were the most appropriate for the observed facts.

---

**16. In surveys Mason City residents rank water sports (swimming, boating, and fishing)**

among their favorite recreational activities. The Mason River flowing through the city is rarely used for these pursuits, however, and the city park department devotes little of its budget to maintaining riverside recreational facilities. For years there have been complaints from residents about the quality of the river's water and the river's smell. In response, the state has recently announced plans to clean up Mason River. Use of the river for water sports is, therefore, sure to increase. The city government should for that reason devote more money in this year's budget to riverside recreational facilities.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

**ETS 官方范文:**

While it may be true that the Mason City government ought to devote more money to riverside recreational facilities, this author's argument does not make a cogent case for increased resources based on river use. It is easy to understand why city residents would want a cleaner river, but this argument is rife with holes and assumptions, and thus, not strong enough to lead to increased funding.

Citing surveys of city residents, the author reports city resident's love of water sports. It is not clear, however, the scope and validity of that survey. For example, the survey could have asked residents if they prefer using the river for water sports or would like to see a hydroelectric dam built, which may have swayed residents toward river sports. The sample may not have been representative of city residents, asking only those residents who live upon the river. The survey may have been 10 pages long, with 2 questions dedicated to river sports. We just do not know. Unless the survey is fully representative, valid, and reliable, it can not be used to effectively back the author's argument.

Additionally, the author implies that residents do not use the river for swimming, boating, and fishing, despite their professed interest, because the water is polluted and smelly. While a polluted, smelly river would likely cut down on river sports, a concrete connection between the resident's lack of river use and the river's current state is not effectively made. Though there have been complaints, we do not know if there have been numerous complaints from a wide range of people, or perhaps from one or two individuals who made numerous complaints. To strengthen his/her argument, the author would benefit from implementing a normed survey asking a wide range of residents why they do not currently use the river.

Building upon the implication that residents do not use the river due to the quality of the river's water and the smell, the author suggests that a river clean up will result in

increased river usage. If the river's water quality and smell result from problems which can be cleaned, this may be true. For example, if the decreased water quality and aroma is caused by pollution by factories along the river, this conceivably could be remedied. But if the quality and aroma results from the natural mineral deposits in the water or surrounding rock, this may not be true. There are some bodies of water which emit a strong smell of sulphur due to the geography of the area. This is not something likely to be affected by a clean-up. Consequently, a river clean up may have no impact upon river usage. Regardless of whether the river's quality is able to be improved or not, the author does not effectively show a connection between water quality and river usage.

A clean, beautiful, safe river often adds to a city's property values, leads to increased tourism and revenue from those who come to take advantage of the river, and a better overall quality of life for residents. For these reasons, city government may decide to invest in improving riverside recreational facilities. However, this author's argument is not likely significantly to persuade the city government to allocate increased funding.

---

17. The following appeared in a memorandum from the manager of WWAC radio station.

"To reverse a decline in listener numbers, our owners have decided that WWAC must change from its current rock-music format. The decline has occurred despite population growth in our listening area, but that growth has resulted mainly from people moving here after their retirement. We must make listeners of these new residents. We could switch to a music format tailored to their tastes, but a continuing decline in local sales of recorded music suggests limited interest in music. Instead we should change to a news and talk format, a form of radio that is increasingly popular in our area."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

提纲:

whether targeting the retired people is the right strategy

the potential of music program

the potential of news and talk format

范文:

The manager argues that WWAC should switch to news and talk to boost the size of the audience. He refers to the fact that population has grown due to more retired people moving in, the decline in sales of recorded music and the increasing popularity of news and talk in the area. We need to collect more evidence about these issues in order to evaluate his argument.

To begin with, we need more evidence to decide if targeting the retired people is the right strategy for attracting more listeners. More information is needed about the general interest of the retired people in radio programs. If these people do not like to listen to radio programs but spend most of their time watching TV or surfing the Internet, attempts to make listeners out of them will not be successful. On the other hand, we need to look into the reasons why the listener numbers had decreased. Perhaps the radio station has recently lost a large number of young listeners due to the resignation of a popular DJ. If this is the case, WWAC should focus more on young listeners rather than retired people.

We also need to collect more information about the potential of music radio programs for attracting more listeners. More efforts should be made to investigate why the sales of recorded music have declined and decide whether the reason is related to the popularity of music. Perhaps people are not willing to buy recorded music because of the declining disposable income as a result of poor performance of local economy. Then the radio programs featuring music may be attractive as listening to radio is free. Also, maybe the

decline in sales is due to fewer young people buying the recorded music, a fact unrelated to the retired people.

Finally, we also have to evaluate the likelihood of news and talk programs successfully attracting more listeners. The manager mentions that such programs have become more popular in the area. Maybe a rival radio program has been offering such programs that attracted a large number of listeners. We need to investigate if an additional news and talk program will attract more listeners who are already enjoying an existing one. We also need to know if the retired people, the group targeted by WWAC, would find the news and talk programs interesting.

In conclusion, several issues about this argument have to be addressed by collecting information discussed above in order to decide if the argument is reasonable.

---

18. The following is a memorandum from the business manager of a television station.

"Over the past year, our late-night news program has devoted increased time to national news and less time to weather and local news. During this period, most of the complaints received from viewers were concerned with our station's coverage of weather and local news. In addition, local businesses that used to advertise during our late-night news program have canceled their advertising contracts with us. Therefore, in order to attract more viewers to our news programs and to avoid losing any further advertising revenues, we should expand our coverage of weather and local news on all our news programs."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

范文:

According to the business manager, in order to boost the number of viewers and increase advertising revenue, the station should increase the coverage of weather and local news. A number of assumptions have been made in this argument which we need to examine critically to decide if the argument is valid.

To begin with, it is assumed that local businesses cancel their advertising because of the reduction of time for weather and local news. There are many other possible reasons why they have done so. Maybe the overall economy is in recession and the businesses have to reduce their expenses by cancelling the advertising. Or maybe they are not happy with the design of the advertising or find the advertising rather ineffective. If this is the case, the quality of the advertising has to be improved to address the problem. In other words, if the assumption does not hold true, expanding the relevant sections would not help increase the advertising revenue.

Another assumption is that the complaints about local news and weather are necessarily about the relatively short coverage of these topics. Maybe the viewers are unhappy about the inaccuracy of the weather forecast on certain days and complain about it. Or perhaps the viewers do not like the reporting style of the anchors for local news. In fact, the complaints can be filed against many different aspects of the local news or weather reports and have nothing to do with the duration. If the assumption about the complaints is incorrect, the argument would not be very strong.

The final assumption made in this argument is about the reason why the station has lost viewers. It is implicitly assumed that viewers are lost because of the reduction in local news and weather coverage. But there could be other reasons why the viewers stop watching the programs from the station. Maybe the quality of national news from the



station is not very good or other sources of national news from the Internet are more informative or comprehensive. Even if the viewers are interested in national news, they may follow national news via other means. Again if the station lost viewers for reasons other than local news or weather, the proposed change would not make a difference.

In conclusion, more information needs to be gathered to examine the assumptions discussed above in order to evaluate the validity of the argument.

---

19. Two years ago, radio station WCQP in Rockville decided to increase the number of call-in advice programs that it broadcast; since that time, its share of the radio audience in the Rockville listening area has increased significantly. Given WCQP's recent success with call-in advice programming, and citing a nationwide survey indicating that many radio listeners are quite interested in such programs, the station manager of KICK in Medway recommends that KICK include more call-in advice programs in an attempt to gain a larger audience share in its listening area.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

范文:

The KICK manager suggests that the station should introduce more call-in advice programs in order to attract more listeners given the fact that WCQP has increased its share of audience after a similar move and a nationwide survey indicated that many listeners were interested in such programs. We need to answer questions about why WCQP achieved the increased share of audience, whether it is feasible to include more call-in programs for KICK and whether the call-in programs will attract more listeners for KICK.

The first question we need to investigate is whether the inclusion of more call-in programs really caused the increase of audience share for WCQP. While it is true that WCQP managed to attract more listeners after more call-in programs were introduced, it does not follow that the introduction of such program directly caused the increasing popularity of WCQP. There are other possible reasons why WCQP won more listeners. For example, maybe the quality of other programs of the station had improved significantly which was the real cause of the increase of the number of listeners. Also, maybe WCQP has recently hired a new DJ who was very popular and helped attract more listeners. If WCQP attracted more listeners for reasons other than the call-in program, the recommendation would not help KICK to produce the desired effect.

In addition, we need to know if it is feasible for KICK to include more call-in programs. For example, we need to know how many call-in programs KICK currently has and whether the station has enough staff to introduce more call-in programs. If KICK already has many hours of call-in programs, it makes little sense to introduce more as it would take away the space of other important programs. Also call-in advice programs may require staff with specialised training in fields such as counselling. If KICK does not have enough staff with such training or cannot afford extra funding to hire such personnels, this recommendation may not work very well.

Finally, we need to ask whether KICK listeners would actually tune in for the call-in advice programs that would be added. The nationwide survey results may or may not apply to the KICK listeners who are primarily residents in Medway. We need to compare the demographic information about Medway listeners with the samples used in the nationwide survey to decide how useful the nationwide survey is for making the decision. Meanwhile, we need to know if the Medway residents interested in the call-in programs will actually listen to the programs. Maybe when the programs are broadcast, the residents do not have the time to listen to the radio or find some other radio programs that are even more interesting than the call-in advice programs. If that is the case, the recommendation would not be very helpful.

In conclusion, it is understandable that KICK manager is interested in following the example of WCQP to invest more time and efforts on call-in advice programs. But we need to collect more information to answer the questions discussed above in order to decide if the proposed move would help the station to attract more listeners.

---

**20. The following is a memorandum from the business manager of a television station.**

"Over the past year, our late-night news program has devoted increased time to national news and less time to weather and local news. During this time period, most of the complaints received from viewers were concerned with our station's coverage of weather and local news. In addition, local businesses that used to advertise during our late-night news program have just canceled their advertising contracts with us. Therefore, in order to attract more viewers to the program and to avoid losing any further advertising revenues, we should restore the time devoted to weather and local news to its former level."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

**21. The following appeared in an article written by Dr. Karp, an anthropologist.**

"Twenty years ago, Dr. Field, a noted anthropologist, visited the island of Tertia and concluded from his observations that children in Tertia were reared by an entire village rather than by their own biological parents. However, my recent interviews with children living in the group of islands that includes Tertia show that these children spend much more time talking about their biological parents than about other adults in the village. This research of mine proves that Dr. Field's conclusion about Tertian village culture is invalid and thus that the observation-centered approach to studying cultures is invalid as well. The interview-centered method that my team of graduate students is currently using in Tertia will establish a much more accurate understanding of child-rearing traditions there and in other island cultures."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

22. According to a recent report, cheating among college and university students is on the rise. However, Groveton College has successfully reduced student cheating by adopting an honor code, which calls for students to agree not to cheat in their academic endeavors and to notify a faculty member if they suspect that others have cheated. Groveton's honor code replaced a system in which teachers closely monitored students; under that system, teachers reported an average of thirty cases of cheating per year. In the first year the honor code was in place, students reported twenty-one cases of cheating; five years later, this figure had dropped to fourteen. Moreover, in a recent survey, a majority of Groveton students said that they would be less likely to cheat with an honor code in place than without. Thus, all colleges and universities should adopt honor codes similar to Groveton's in order to decrease cheating among students.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

提纲:

students agree not to cheat  
students agree to notify faculty  
replace teacher monitor- report 30 per year

21 cases under honor code  
5 years later- drop to 14  
survey- less likely to cheat

all colleges and universities

范文:

It is argued that all universities and colleges should follow the example of Groveton College to adopt an honor code in order to reduce the cases of cheating. A number of questions about the cheating cases, the reasons why fewer cases of cheating were reported and how representative Groveton is among universities have to be answered in order to decide if the recommendation and the argument are reasonable.

To begin with, we need to know more about the details of the cheating cases among Groveton students to decide if the honor code is likely to be effective. For example, we need to know if students are likely to keep their promises not to cheat during their studies given the pressure of performing well. If the students are under great pressure to do well academically, they may cheat despite their promises under the honor code. In addition, we need to know if students are more likely to detect the cases of cheating than teachers. For example, in close-book exams, maybe students can discover cheating cases of their

peers around them more easily; but in paper-based assignments, teachers will detect cheating more easily with anti-plagiarism software such as Turnitin.

In addition, we also need to know why the number of reported cases of cheating was reduced after the adoption of honor code. We need more evidence about how likely students are to report their peers' cheating cases. Maybe the students are reluctant to report the cases under peer pressure, thereby reducing the number of reported cases when the actual number of cheating cases was higher. If the decrease of reported cases is a result of the students' reluctance to report, the honor code would actually be ineffective in deterring cheating. Another possible reason for the decline of cheating cases could be the reduction of enrolments of the college, which we need to explore with more evidence.

Finally, it is important to ask to what extent the other universities and colleges are comparable to Groveton and the honor code would be acceptable among the students and faculty members. Maybe the honor code is effective in Groveton as students there are not under great pressure to perform well or most of them are strongly motivated and well prepared for the assessments. This may not be the case for students in other universities or colleges. Moreover, for the honor code to work, both students and faculty members need to accept it as a legitimate and viable system. Groveton students and faculty may find the system acceptable but those from other universities and colleges may not.

In conclusion, we do not know whether the recommendation would be effective and whether the argument is reasonable until we can gather more information to answer the questions discussed above.

---

23. The following appeared in an article written by Dr. Karp, an anthropologist.

"Twenty years ago, Dr. Field, a noted anthropologist, visited the island of Tertia and concluded from his observations that children in Tertia were reared by an entire village rather than by their own biological parents. However, my recent interviews with children living in the group of islands that includes Tertia show that these children spend much more time talking about their biological parents than about other adults in the village. This research of mine proves that Dr. Field's conclusion about Tertian village culture is invalid and thus that the observation-centered approach to studying cultures is invalid as well. The interview-centered method that my team of graduate students is currently using in Tertia will establish a much more accurate understanding of child-rearing traditions there and in other island cultures."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

#### 24. A recently issued twenty-year study on headaches suffered by the residents of Mentia

investigated the possible therapeutic effect of consuming salicylates. Salicylates are members of the same chemical family as aspirin, a medicine used to treat headaches. Although many foods are naturally rich in salicylates, food-processing companies also add salicylates to foods as preservatives. The twenty-year study found a correlation between the rise in the commercial use of salicylates and a steady decline in the average number of headaches reported by study participants. At the time when the study concluded, food-processing companies had just discovered that salicylates can also be used as flavor additives for foods, and, as a result, many companies plan to do so. Based on these study results, some health experts predict that residents of Mentia will suffer even fewer headaches in the future.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

范文:

It is predicted that Mentia residents will suffer fewer headaches because the food companies are expected to use salicylates as flavor additives. A number of questions about the nature of the chemical, its relation to headache, the preferences of Mentia residents and the plans of the food companies have to be answered in order to evaluate the predictions.

To begin with, we need to know whether salicylates can treat headache in a way similar to aspirin. The mere fact that both chemicals belong to the same family does not mean that both chemicals would have same therapeutic effects for headache. If there is no direct evidence to prove that salicylates can treat headache, the prediction would become groundless.

The study has found a correlation between the use of salicylates and the reduction in headaches being reported. The first question we need to ask about the study is whether the self-report method is reliable, i.e. whether or not the study participants can accurately recall the incidents of headaches they experienced. If the data is not reliable, the results cannot be taken seriously. In addition, we need to see if there are other factors that might lead to the reduction of reported headache cases. For example, over the past 20 years, had aspirin or other drugs of similar effects become increasingly available and popular among the study participants? Did the participants change their diet or lifestyle that might have helped reduce headache? As we all know, correlation does not imply causal relation. More attention has to be paid to other related factors.



Now let's assume salicylates may in fact help reduce headache. The next question is this: will Mentia residents benefit from the chemicals in the future. Since the chemical has been used as preservatives, we need to ask if Mentia residents enjoy food that contain such preservatives. Maybe people in Mentia prefer to eat fresh food; if this is the case, they may not have access to the chemical as food preservatives.

Another possible source of salicylates is food with salicylates as the flavor additives. We do not know whether the food company would actually use the chemical as flavor additives despite their plans. We need to know whether they can get approval from government authorities such as FDA to use the chemicals. We also need to take into account the costs of the chemical relative to other alternative additives. Finally, we have to ask questions about consumers' taste to decide if the food with such additives will become popular, especially among Mentia residents. Answers to all these questions may influence the companies' decisions on whether to use the chemical as flavor additives and ultimately affect the accessibility of salicylates for Mentia residents.

A final question we need to address is about the demographics and the health conditions of Mentia residents. Maybe the chemical can help treat headache to some extent. But no chemical can magically cure all headaches. If Mentia residents are ageing or suffer from certain disease conditions that cause headache, having the chemical food may not reduce the cases of headache in the long run.

In conclusion, a number of gaps in reasoning have to be filled in the prediction that fewer Mentia residents will suffer headache. To evaluate the prediction, we need to answer all the questions discussed above by gathering more information about this issue.

---

25. The following was written as a part of an application for a small-business loan by a group of developers in the city of Monroe.

"A jazz music club in Monroe would be a tremendously profitable enterprise. Currently, the nearest jazz club is 65 miles away; thus, the proposed new jazz club in Monroe, the C-Note, would have the local market all to itself. Plus, jazz is extremely popular in Monroe: over 100,000 people attended Monroe's annual jazz festival last summer; several well-known jazz musicians live in Monroe; and the highest-rated radio program in Monroe is 'Jazz Nightly,' which airs every weeknight at 7 P.M. Finally, a nationwide study indicates that the typical jazz fan spends close to \$1,000 per year on jazz entertainment."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

范文:

In this loan application, the developers argue that the proposed jazz club C-note would make profit considering the lack of competition, the popularity of Jazz in the Monroe and the study about how jazz fans spend money. We need to collect more evidence about all these issues in order to better evaluate the argument.

To begin with, we need more information about whether the proposed jazz club will meet with any competition. While the nearest jazz club is 65 miles away, the jazz fans in Monroe may still go over there if there is highway or subway that allow the people to travel conveniently. Therefore, we need to know if the jazz fans have access to cars and whether there is highway or subway in place. In addition, we also need to know if there is other competition from sources like radio program 'Jazz Nightly' or jazz bands that may perform on the streets in Monroe that may threaten the profitability of C-note.

In addition, we need more evidence to decide if Jazz is indeed popular in Monroe and if such popularity can lead to the prosperity of C-note. We need to know how many people among the 100,000 people in the jazz festivals are local, hardcore jazz fans who would go to a jazz club like C-note. Maybe a significant portion of the people in the festival are tourists who are not living in Monroe and will not go to C-note regularly. Or a good number of people found in festivals are schoolchildren who will not have time to go to the club during the school year. Likewise, unless we know for sure the radio listeners who enjoy jazz program would actually go to jazz club, the popularity of Jazz Nightly would not necessarily mean C-note will be attractive as well. As far as the jazz musicians living in Monroe are concerned, we need to know if their choice to live here has anything to do with the popularity of Jazz at all. Maybe they live here for reasons totally unrelated to Jazz.

Finally, we need more evidence about how jazz fans in Monroe spend money on Jazz entertainment. The nationwide study is useful only if the jazz fans in Monroe are similar to the samples collected for the study. Therefore, we need to know more about how the samples were collected for the study and the demographic information of jazz fans in Monroe to decide if the study results are relevant. Also, we have to look into how much money a typical jazz fan in Monroe would spend on a jazz club like C-note. Maybe the jazz fans would prefer to spend money on Jazz CDs or related musical instruments. If C-note could not generate enough revenue, it will not make profits.

Overall speaking, to decide whether the proposed C-note club will make profits, we need to collect evidence about the issues discussed above.

---

26. The following appeared in the summary of a study on headaches suffered by the residents of Mentia.

"Salicylates are members of the same chemical family as aspirin, a medicine used to treat headaches. Although many foods are naturally rich in salicylates, for the past several decades, food-processing companies have also been adding salicylates to foods as preservatives. This rise in the commercial use of salicylates has been found to correlate with a steady decline in the average number of headaches reported by participants in our twenty-year study. Recently, food-processing companies have found that salicylates can also be used as flavor additives for foods. With this new use for salicylates, we can expect a continued steady decline in the number of headaches suffered by the average citizen of Mentia."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

27. The following appeared in a letter to the editor of a local newspaper.

"Commuters complain that increased rush-hour traffic on Blue Highway between the suburbs and the city center has doubled their commuting time. The favored proposal of the motorists' lobby is to widen the highway, adding an additional lane of traffic. But last year's addition of a lane to the nearby Green Highway was followed by a worsening of traffic jams on it. A better alternative is to add a bicycle lane to Blue Highway. Many area residents are keen bicyclists. A bicycle lane would encourage them to use bicycles to commute, and so would reduce rush-hour traffic rather than fostering an increase."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

提纲:

the reason why the traffic jam worsened in Green Highway and whether history would repeat itself in Blue Highway

- maybe drivers switched to Green from other highways after the widening
- more people use Green due to the booming economy of a town connected by Green
- whether the same things would happen to Blue Highway

whether it is feasible to commute by bikes

- it may not be healthy to bike due to the heavy air/ noise pollution caused by the cars
- it may be too exhausting to bike over long distance

whether the residents are willing to commute by bikes

- not all residents own bikes (they may be unwilling to buy new bikes)
- they'd like to bike for exercises (not for commuting)
- they already own cars/ they do not want to waste the cars
- they need the car at work

---

28. The following appeared in the summary of a study on headaches suffered by the residents of Mentia.

"Salicylates are members of the same chemical family as aspirin, a medicine used to treat headaches. Although many foods are naturally rich in salicylates, for the past several decades, food-processing companies have also been adding salicylates to foods as preservatives. This rise in the commercial use of salicylates has been found to correlate with a steady decline in the average number of headaches reported by participants in our twenty-year study. Recently, food-processing companies have found that salicylates can also be used as flavor additives for foods. With this new use for salicylates, we can expect a continued steady decline in the number of headaches suffered by the average citizen of Mentia."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

29. The following appeared in an editorial in a local newspaper.

"Commuters complain that increased rush-hour traffic on Blue Highway between the suburbs and the city center has doubled their commuting time. The favored proposal of the motorists' lobby is to widen the highway, adding an additional lane of traffic. Opponents note that last year's addition of a lane to the nearby Green Highway was followed by a worsening of traffic jams on it. Their suggested alternative proposal is adding a bicycle lane to Blue Highway. Many area residents are keen bicyclists. A bicycle lane would encourage them to use bicycles to commute, it is argued, thereby reducing rush-hour traffic."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

30. The following appeared as a recommendation by a committee planning a ten-year budget for the city of Calatrava.

"The birthrate in our city is declining: in fact, last year's birthrate was only one-half that of five years ago. Thus the number of students enrolled in our public schools will soon decrease dramatically, and we can safely reduce the funds budgeted for education during the next decade. At the same time, we can reduce funding for athletic playing fields and other recreational facilities. As a result, we will have sufficient money to fund city facilities and programs used primarily by adults, since we can expect the adult population of the city to increase."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

范文:

The committee recommends reducing budget for education and athletic fields in order to finance facilities and programs for adults based on the observation that the birthrate is declining and the projection that the enrollments in public schools will decrease. We need more evidence about birthrates of the city and other demographic information, the public schools, the playing fields and the facilities and programs for adults in order to evaluate the recommendation.

First of all, it is difficult to confirm that the birthrate of Calatrava has indeed declined just based on the comparison of the current year data with the data five years ago. Maybe the birth rate five years ago was unusually high due to some extraneous factors and excluding that data the birthrates have steadily increased or remain stable over the past 5 years. We need more comprehensive data about the birth rates in each year in the past 5 years to recognize the trend accurately.

It is also immature to predict that the enrollment in public schools will drop dramatically and the need of funding for education will decrease even if the birthrates have decreased. Maybe there would be students from other cities or even abroad who would study in the public schools here. If so, the enrollment may not decrease that much. Also, the public schools may also need money to upgrade their infrastructure and equipment or introduce new teacher training programs to improve the quality of education. The committee should gather more information about what the public schools need in the next 10 years before making any decisions about the education budgets.

The decision to cut funding for playing fields needs to be justified with more evidence about the demand for the facilities and the cost of maintaining them. The assumption here is that the fields are mainly for school children and with the expected decrease in

enrollment, there would be no need to put more money to them. But maybe adults also enjoy the playing fields and other recreational facilities. If this is the case, the fields and facilities would deserve additional funding. Also, we need to take into account the maintenance and staffing cost for the fields and facilities. Funding should not be reduced if doing so would affect the normal operation of the facilities.

The committee also suggests that the money can be saved to finance programs and facilities for adults. But it is not clear on what basis it anticipates the increase of adult population in the city. It is possible that in the next 10 years some adults may choose to leave the city and reduce the demand for the facilities and programs. In fact, if the city reduces the funding for education and children's facilities, the families with young children may have more incentives to join other cities where better education and facilities for children are available.

Overall speaking, we need more evidence about the issues discussed above to evaluate the recommendation of the committee.

31. The following appeared in a letter to the editor of Parson City's local newspaper.

"In our region of Trillura, the majority of money spent on the schools that most students attend—the city-run public schools—comes from taxes that each city government collects. The region's cities differ, however, in the budgetary priority they give to public education. For example, both as a proportion of its overall tax revenues and in absolute terms, Parson City has recently spent almost twice as much per year as Blue City has for its public schools—even though both cities have about the same number of residents. Clearly, Parson City residents place a higher value on providing a good education in public schools than Blue City residents do."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

分析:

这道题大概怎么写

首先结论是 Parson City residents place a higher value on providing a good education in public schools than Blue City residents do

注意结论里讲的是 residents 而前面花钱是政府 政府和居民是不同的

事实: the majority of money spent on the schools that most students attend—the city-run public schools—comes from taxes that each city government collects.

事实: The region's cities differ, however, in the budgetary priority they give to public education. For example, both as a proportion of its overall tax revenues and in absolute terms, Parson City has recently spent almost twice as much per year as Blue City has for its public schools—even though both cities have about the same number of residents. 这个可以看做一个整体 后一句基本上是为前一句提供例证

上面这句话里有两点要注意

- P 比 B 政府花的钱多一倍 这里已经排除了税收总量的差别
- 注意是居民人数相同 而不是在校学生的人数相同

所以这道题可以从三方面来讨论

首先是 P 比 B 政府花多一倍钱的原因是什么 以及是不是一直都这样 需要了解过去 3-5 年的记录以及未来几年的计划等等 也许今年比较特殊 有一些长期的投资 或者说非经常性的开支 总之仅仅看一年是不够的



其次要了解老百姓对政府这样花钱是否满意以及有没有足够的影响力 比如说制订预算的官员是不是民选的 他们的决定是否受欢迎 因为最终结论是关于居民对教育的态度 因此要看居民的态度和政府的行动之间的关系

这里还可以顺便了解一下当地人对公共学校的其他形式支持 比如捐款、义工等等

最后要了解两地学生数量的对比 以及平均每个学生的投入

**提纲：**

Conclusion: Parson City residents value good public school education more than Blue city residents

information about the spending records in the past 10 years

- maybe Parson spent much less in the past but increased its spending only more recently
- the money spent by Parson was for infrastructure that would not be recurrent (the expense will decrease once the projects are completed)

information about spending per student and spending per teacher

- maybe the demographic structures of the two cities are different
- Blue may spend more money per student

to what extent the quality of education depends on the amount of money

- maybe Blue's funding is sufficient; extra money may not be helpful
- other factors may be more relevant; parents' participation in PTA; libraries and other facilities for students

to what extent the residents could influence how money is spent

- maybe the residents are not heavily involved in negotiating the budgets

---

32.The following appeared in a memo from a vice president of Quiot Manufacturing.

"During the past year, Quiot Manufacturing had 30 percent more on-the-job accidents than at the nearby Panoply Industries plant, where the work shifts are one hour shorter than ours. Experts say that significant contributing factors in many on-the-job accidents are fatigue and sleep deprivation among workers. Therefore, to reduce the number of on-the-job accidents at Quiot and thereby increase productivity, we should shorten each of our three work shifts by one hour so that employees will get adequate amounts of sleep."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

范文:

The vice president recommended shortening the work shifts in order to reduce accidents and increase productivity with the belief that the measure could help the workers to get more sleep. A number of assumptions about the causes of fewer accidents in Panoply, the link among work hours, fatigue, sleep deprivation and accidents have to be reexamined in order to evaluate the argument.

第一段我习惯先概括一下 argument 的结论以及相关的目的和理由

这里的句型 recommended ... ing ... in order to ... with the belief that ...是可以借鉴的  
然后根据题目要求列出几个需要讨论哪几个方面的 assumptions

To begin with, it is assumed that the shorter work shifts for workers are the main reason why Panoply had 30% fewer accidents. This assumption has to be carefully examined as there might be other reasons why fewer accidents occurred in Panoply. For example, there could be fewer workers working in Panoply than in Quiot. Or the working conditions in Quiot are simply more dangerous leading to higher risks of accidents. If these are the main reasons leading to the gap in the number of accidents, the recommendation would not help close the gap as reducing the shift hours would neither change the size of workforce in Quiot nor make the working conditions safer.

这一段先提出一个假设 然后探索其他的可能挑战这个假设的可能性 最后总结在什么情况下这个结论不成立

It is also assumed that by shortening the shifts, the Quiot workers would necessarily get more sleep and not feel tired during the work. There are many factors that may affect the amount of sleep and the energy level of the workers. For example, some workers may prefer certain lifestyles that lead to sleep deprivation, such as staying up watching TV or

hanging out with friends in the bars until mid-nights. Or some workers may have to take other part-time jobs to earn more money due to the low salary paid by Quiot, which will reduce the sleeping time and energy level of the workers. If sleep deprivation and fatigue are caused by factors other than long hours, then adopting the proposal would not achieve the desired objectives.

提出另一个假设 然后探索其他的可能挑战这个假设的可能性 最后总结在什么情况下这个结论不成立

The third assumption implicitly made is that helping the workers get enough sleep would necessarily reduce the number of accidents. Even if reducing work shift hours can get the workers to sleep more, the recommended measure may not reduce the number of accidents. There could be other factors that cause the accidents at Quiot. For example, the workers may not receive enough training about the safety protocols or the supervisors are not competent in enforcing the rules about safe operation. Or the machinery in Quiot needs upgrading to improve the safety and reduce risk of accidents. If the assumption that addressing sleep deprivation and fatigue would reduce accidents does not hold, the recommendation should not be accepted.

提出第三个假设 然后探索其他的可能挑战这个假设的可能性 最后总结在什么情况下这个结论不成立

Despite the good intention of this recommendation, we need more information about why Quiot had more accidents, what factors caused the accidents in Quiot and how shortening work shifts would affect the sleep amount and energy level of Quiot workers in order to examine the assumptions discussed above and evaluate the soundness of the argument.

33. The following appeared in a memorandum from the planning department of an electric power company.

"Several recent surveys indicate that home owners are increasingly eager to conserve energy. At the same time, manufacturers are now marketing many home appliances, such as refrigerators and air conditioners, that are almost twice as energy efficient as those sold a decade ago. Also, new technologies for better home insulation and passive solar heating are readily available to reduce the energy needed for home heating. Therefore, the total demand for electricity in our area will not increase—and may decline slightly. Since our three electric generating plants in operation for the past twenty years have always met our needs, construction of new generating plants will not be necessary."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

提纲:

Assumption 1: the survey results could accurately predict the decisions made by the homeowners

- people may say one thing in the survey but behave differently when making decisions
- they may pay lip service to environmental protection
- other factor such as disposable income and prices of the appliances would be relevant

Assumption 2: the new home appliances are attractive enough for the homeowners

- twice efficient than a decade ago- but what about the appliances bought last year
- the new home appliances are affordable
- willingness to buy new appliances

Assumption 3: the new technologies for heating would be widely adopted and good enough to save energy

- maybe these technologies are too expensive
- maybe the homeowners do not want to try the new technologies (do not know enough)
- maybe the weather would be very cold and electric heaters are still needed

Assumption 4: only home residents need electricity

- what about the office buildings and the shopping malls
- what about the manufacturing factories
- what about the subway system

---

34. The vice president of human resources at Climpson Industries sent the following recommendation to the company's president.

"In an effort to improve our employees' productivity, we should implement electronic monitoring of employees' Internet use from their workstations. Employees who use the Internet from their workstations need to be identified and punished if we are to reduce the number of work hours spent on personal or recreational activities, such as shopping or playing games. By installing software to detect employees' Internet use on company computers, we can prevent employees from wasting time, foster a better work ethic at Climpson, and improve our overall profits."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

范文:

The vice president argued that the company could reduce the amount of time wasted by employees and improve work ethic and profits by monitoring the employees' use of Internet. The argument is based on a number of assumptions about the efficacy of the system, the effects of monitoring and punishing employees as well as the cost of implementing the system. It is important to examine these assumptions critically in order to evaluate the soundness of the argument.

It is first assumed that the proposed system can necessarily reduce the time of the employees wasted on personal and recreational activities. Yet, a system focusing on the online activities on the workstations may not serve the purpose well. As we know, nowadays most people can surf the Internet with personal mobile devices such as smartphones and tablet computers that may connect to the Internet via mobile Internet service providers. In addition, employees may also waste time through face-to-face chatting or even daydreaming alone that do not require access to the Internet. Obviously, the proposed system would not be able deal with such online activities via personal devices or offline activities that could also waste a lot of time. Without addressing such scenarios, the system may not achieve the desired results.

Another assumption made in the argument is that better work ethics and productivity could be achieved by monitoring and punishing employees. It is true that certain behaviours may be reduced through punishment as negative incentive. Nevertheless, it is doubtful that employees would feel satisfied and motivated when they are constantly being watched by the proposed system and facing punishment for doing some personal stuff online. The employees may become demoralised and their work ethic and productivity

may even deteriorate as a result of implementing such system as they feel that the company does not trust them.

Finally, it is also assumed that the benefits of implementing and maintaining such a system would necessarily outweigh the costs. Here we need to consider both the explicit costs and the hidden costs. Developing and installing the software to all the workstations in the company would certainly cost a large amount of money, especially when the software has to be made robust enough against the hacking of the employees. More importantly, the company may lose some valuable employees who might choose to leave the company feeling offended by such monitoring software. Therefore, the company has to carefully assess the potential benefits and costs of the proposed system before making decisions.

In conclusion, the proposed system may be able to reduce the online shirking among the employees through monitoring and punishing certain behaviours. Nevertheless, it may or may not successfully reduce the waste of time and improve work ethic. Whether the system can improve the overall profits of the company also depends on the benefits and costs of the system. More information has to be collected to examine the assumptions discussed above in order to reach a more accurate and reliable conclusion.

35. The following appeared in a letter from the owner of the Sunnyside Towers apartment complex to its manager.

"One month ago, all the showerheads in the first three buildings of the Sunnyside Towers complex were modified to restrict maximum water flow to one-third of what it used to be. Although actual readings of water usage before and after the adjustment are not yet available, the change will obviously result in a considerable savings for Sunnyside Corporation, since the corporation must pay for water each month. Except for a few complaints about low water pressure, no problems with showers have been reported since the adjustment. I predict that modifying showerheads to restrict water flow throughout all twelve buildings in the Sunnyside Towers complex will increase our profits even more dramatically."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

拿到这道题首先要搞清楚前提和结论是什么。这里的结论是在所有的公寓里改装花洒头可以显著提高利润。而前提和证据则包括前三栋公寓改装后没有收到投诉、尚无水表读数以及公司需要每月付水费。这里需要知道利润是由收入和开支决定的，因此可以从这两方面展开讨论。其中开支主要包括水费以及改装的费用，而收入则主要是租金收入。因此需要讨论的问题包括

- 水费是不是真的会节省
- 改装的费用会不会影响利润
- 改装会否赶走现有的和潜在的租客

范文：

In the letter, it is argued that all the showerheads in Sunnyside Towers should be modified to restrict water flow in order to save water and increase profits. While the modification of the showerheads in the three buildings has not led to many complaints, a number of questions about whether water can be saved, the cost of modification and its effects on the leasing business have to be answered to decide if the proposal will lead to the increase of profits.

To begin with, we need to know if the modification has indeed saved significant amount of water. In the absence of water usage data before and after the adjustment, it is necessary to look into different possible scenarios. For example, with restricted water flow, the residents may spend more time showering; as a result, the total water usage may not be reduced. In fact, with more time spent showering, more electricity might be consumed leading to the increase of expense in other area as well. Also, in response to the modification, residents may choose to bath instead of shower, which would also use more

water. More information about how the residents behave differently is required to evaluate the proposal.

Another important question to be addressed is how much it would cost to modify the showerheads. Obviously it takes money to hire skilled workers to modify the showerheads. The labor cost for modifying all the showerheads could be quite significant and affect the cash flow and income statement of the company. If the labor cost exceeds the amount that can be saved through reducing water usage, this proposal would not increase the profits significantly, at least not in the short term. Another hidden cost of modification is the disruption it may cause to the residents who may not be happy with the work. If the residents are not happy with the disruption, they may choose to live in other apartment complex, leading to the loss of rental revenue of the company.

In fact, a more pressing issue is whether the current and prospective tenants of the apartment complex will be dissatisfied with the restricted water flow and vote against the company by their feet. It is reasonable to believe that there are other apartment complex in town which the tenants can choose and enjoy normal water flow from showerheads. If the proposed modification lead to significant loss of tenants and rental revenue, the company would be unlikely to increase its profits.

In conclusion, while it is understandable that the company tries to save money by restricting the water flow, more information has to be gathered to answer the questions discussed above in order to decide if the proposed modification will help the company to make more profits.



---

36. The following report appeared in the newsletter of the West Meria Public Health Council.

"An innovative treatment has come to our attention that promises to significantly reduce absenteeism in our schools and workplaces. A study reports that in nearby East Meria, where fish consumption is very high, people visit the doctor only once or twice per year for the treatment of colds. Clearly, eating a substantial amount of fish can prevent colds. Since colds represent the most frequently given reason for absences from school and work, we recommend the daily use of Ichthaid—a nutritional supplement derived from fish oil—as a good way to prevent colds and lower absenteeism."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

提纲:

The reasons why East Meria people saw doctors for treating colds infrequently

- maybe the people there cannot afford seeing the doctor and take some OTC medicine for colds (track the sales of OTC medicine for colds)
- perhaps there are fewer children and elderly people vulnerable to colds in EM
- maybe EM people exercise more or take vitamin C everyday

The real causes of absences from school and work

- whether medical certificates have been produced for the absences
- the attitudes of students towards learning in school
- the motivation levels of workers and the working conditions/ compensation in WM

The effects of taking Ichthaid on a daily basis relative to eating fish

- fish as a healthy substitute of pork and beef
- the direct effects of Ichthaid on preventing cold (control experiment)
- the potential harm of overdosage of Ichthaid

37. The following appeared in a recommendation from the planning department of the city of Transopolis.

"Ten years ago, as part of a comprehensive urban renewal program, the city of Transopolis adapted for industrial use a large area of severely substandard housing near the freeway. Subsequently, several factories were constructed there, crime rates in the area declined, and property tax revenues for the entire city increased. To further revitalize the city, we should now take similar action in a declining residential area on the opposite side of the city. Since some houses and apartments in existing nearby neighborhoods are currently unoccupied, alternate housing for those displaced by this action will be readily available."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

提纲:

- Whether the investors would be interested in building factories in the new area
  - suitable manufacturing projects (market with strong demand for the products)
  - supply of inexpensive skilled labor
  - safe environment for operating factories
- other reasons why crime rates declined and property tax revenue increased
  - maybe a new police chief was assigned to improve the efficiency of the police
  - the installation of surveillance cameras
  - funded NGO projects to engage the youth at risk
- whether the unoccupied houses and apartment could accommodate the displaced residents
  - whether the residents are willing to relocate
  - the ownership of the houses and apartment
  - the conditions of the houses and apartment and the cost of renovation

---

38. The following appeared in a memo from the new vice president of Sartorian, a company that manufactures men's clothing.

"Five years ago, at a time when we had difficulties in obtaining reliable supplies of high quality wool fabric, we discontinued production of our alpaca overcoat. Now that we have a new fabric supplier, we should resume production. This coat should sell very well: since we have not offered an alpaca overcoat for five years and since our major competitor no longer makes an alpaca overcoat, there will be pent-up customer demand. Also, since the price of most types of clothing has increased in each of the past five years, customers should be willing to pay significantly higher prices for alpaca overcoats than they did five years ago, and our company profits will increase."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

提纲:

the demand for alpaca coat

- the reason why competitors do not produce alpaca overcoat (maybe the customers are less interested)
- the availability of close substitute (the prices, the fashion)
- the animal protection groups

the willingness to pay higher prices

- the sales of other types of clothes after the price spike (maybe the customers bought less clothes)
- how elastic the demand for alpaca coats is relative to other clothes

the stability of the supply and the costs

- the cost of the raw materials
- the cost of labor and machinery
- how stable the supply would be

---

**39. A recent sales study indicates that consumption of seafood dishes in Bay City**

restaurants has increased by 30 percent during the past five years. Yet there are no currently operating city restaurants whose specialty is seafood. Moreover, the majority of families in Bay City are two-income families, and a nationwide study has shown that such families eat significantly fewer home-cooked meals than they did a decade ago but at the same time express more concern about healthful eating. Therefore, the new Captain Seafood restaurant that specializes in seafood should be quite popular and profitable.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be addressed in order to decide whether the conclusion and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to the questions would help to evaluate the conclusion.

范文:

According to the author, since there are no restaurants in Bay City specializing in seafood but people in the city seem to like seafood, a new restaurant with a focus on seafood should attract many guests and be profitable. We need to ask questions about the Bay City residents' interest in seafood, the nationwide study and the two-income couples' eating habits and views on healthful eating to decide if the conclusion is reasonable. More questions about the proposed seafood restaurant have to be addressed as well.

First of all, we need to ask questions about how and why more seafood dishes were consumed and whether the increase was caused by the Bay City people's increasing appetite for seafood. It is possible that over the past five years the population of Bay City had grown or more tourists had come to the area. As a result, the consumption of all types of food had increased. Or perhaps, the increase of seafood consumption was driven by a decrease of prices in the seafood market. In cases like these, the increase in consumption does not mean that people become more interested in seafood and a new seafood restaurant may not be very popular.

Another important question to ask is whether the results from nationwide study can be used to predict the preference of Bay City residents. Specifically, we need to ask if the samples used in the nationwide study can represent the Bay City residents in terms of their ages, income level and family backgrounds. If the demographics of Bay City people are markedly different from the general population of the nation, the results of nationwide study would not be very useful for making decisions in Bay City.

Assuming that the study results are useful, we also need to ask where the two-income couples usually have their meals and gather more information on their views on healthful

eating. Maybe the two-income couples are all very busy during the weekdays and usually have their lunches and dinners in fast food restaurants near the offices. If they do not have time for elaborate lunches and meals, the seafood restaurants will not be attractive to them. In the meantime, we need to know if they consider seafood as healthful food. Perhaps many of them believe that vegetarian diet is more healthful or prefer to have food rich in dietary fibres. If they do not consider seafood as particularly healthful, the proposed restaurant would not appeal to them.

Finally, it is important to ask if the proposed restaurant can generate profit even if it turns out to be popular. Many factors have to be taken into account when projecting the future profits of a business. For example, the cost of the raw materials, the rent of the premise and the salary of the staff can all affect the overall profitability of the business. Therefore, we need to ask more questions about these issues to decide if the restaurant is likely to make profits.

In conclusion, investing in a seafood restaurant requires significant amount of money and resources. Questions discussed above have to be investigated carefully in order to decide the proposed project is a good idea.

---

40. Milk and dairy products are rich in vitamin D and calcium—substances essential for building and maintaining bones. Many people therefore say that a diet rich in dairy products can help prevent osteoporosis, a disease that is linked to both environmental and genetic factors and that causes the bones to weaken significantly with age. But a long-term study of a large number of people found that those who consistently consumed dairy products throughout the years of the study have a higher rate of bone fractures than any other participants in the study. Since bone fractures are symptomatic of osteoporosis, this study result shows that a diet rich in dairy products may actually increase, rather than decrease, the risk of osteoporosis.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

**Outline:**

whether the people with bone fractures actually have osteoporosis

- bone fractures may also be caused by trauma or falls
- bone fractures as symptoms of other conditions (certain cancer)

whether the participants who consume dairy products are more vulnerable to osteoporosis

- age, gender and lifestyles
- occupation
- genetic makeup

The isolated effects of taking more dairy products

- people who are vulnerable may take more dairy products
- set up control group who do not take much dairy products
- factors mentioned above have to be controlled

---

41. The following appeared in a health newsletter. ( 123/125/41)

"A ten-year nationwide study of the effectiveness of wearing a helmet while bicycling indicates that ten years ago, approximately 35 percent of all bicyclists reported wearing helmets, whereas today that number is nearly 80 percent. Another study, however, suggests that during the same ten-year period, the number of bicycle-related accidents has increased 200 percent. These results demonstrate that bicyclists feel safer because they are wearing helmets, and they take more risks as a result. Thus, to reduce the number of serious injuries from bicycle accidents, the government should concentrate more on educating people about bicycle safety and less on encouraging or requiring bicyclists to wear helmets."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

**Outline:**

how accurate are the survey results

- do the respondents represent the bicyclists nationwide (maybe one survey focuses more on young people who tend to take more risk)
- how are the questions phrased (whether they wear helmets vs. how often they wear)

the change of accident rates and the causes of the accidents

- maybe more people bike now
- maybe more pedestrians shared the road with bicyclists
- road condition get worse
- the percentage of accidents caused by careless cycling

the causes of accidents involving serious injuries and whether education can address the causes

- maybe serious injuries in some accidents could be prevented by wearing helmets
- maybe accidents involving serious injuries are caused by bad weather for which the education campaign would not be very helpful
- maybe accidents were caused by cycling under the influence of drug (then education is helpful)

---

42. The following is a letter to the head of the tourism bureau on the island of Tria.

"Erosion of beach sand along the shores of Tria Island is a serious threat to our island and our tourist industry. In order to stop the erosion, we should charge people for using the beaches. Although this solution may annoy a few tourists in the short term, it will raise money for replenishing the sand. Replenishing the sand, as was done to protect buildings on the nearby island of Batia, will help protect buildings along our shores, thereby reducing these buildings' risk of additional damage from severe storms. And since beaches and buildings in the area will be preserved, Tria's tourist industry will improve over the long term."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

**Outline:**

the short-term and long-term effects of charging beach visitors

- whether people would still use the beaches; if few people use it, little money can be raised
- whether tourists will keep coming after the beach is not free
- the loss of tax revenue due to the decline of tourist industry

how useful the program was for the buildings of Batia

- the original conditions of the buildings
- protect the buildings against what? (severe storm?)
- the cost of the program

whether the proposed program can preserve beaches and buildings

- the usefulness of the program for protection against severe storm
- the cost and the affordability of the program
- other factors that may affect the conditions of the beaches and the buildings

other factors that may affect Tria's tourist industry in the long term

- the reputation of Tria
- the infrastructure
- the quality and cost of services here (labor cost)



43. The following appeared in a memorandum written by the chairperson of the West Egg Town Council.

"Two years ago, consultants predicted that West Egg's landfill, which is used for garbage disposal, would be completely filled within five years. During the past two years, however, the town's residents have been recycling twice as much material as they did in previous years. Next month the amount of recycled material—which includes paper, plastic, and metal—should further increase, since charges for pickup of other household garbage will double. Furthermore, over 90 percent of the respondents to a recent survey said that they would do more recycling in the future. Because of our town's strong commitment to recycling, the available space in our landfill should last for considerably longer than predicted."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

**Outline:**

the amount of garbage reduced due to the recycling programs

- the amount of materials recycled have doubled but the amount is relatively small compared to the amount of garbage
- the amount of garbage may have increased over the last two years due to the increase of population and economic activities
- need to calculate the percentage of garbage reduced due to recycling

whether the growth in recycling would be sustainable

- maybe the initial amount of recycled materials was small and it is easy to double
- whether the respondents could represent the people who actually handle the waste
- whether the respondents will walk the walk

how sensitive are the residents to the charge increase

- maybe the charge for garbage is really small relative to disposable income
- doubling the charge may create little incentive to further recycle
- the cost or trouble of further recycling may be higher than the money that could be saved

whether the residential waste is the main source of garbage

- maybe the tourists produce a substantial amount of garbage
- the manufacturing and construction industries may generate a lot of waste
- the restaurants

---

44. The following appeared in a letter to the editor of a journal on environmental issues.

"Over the past year, the Crust Copper Company (CCC) has purchased over 10,000 square miles of land in the tropical nation of West Fredonia. Mining copper on this land will inevitably result in pollution and, since West Fredonia is the home of several endangered animal species, in environmental disaster. But such disasters can be prevented if consumers simply refuse to purchase products that are made with CCC's copper unless the company abandons its mining plans."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

Outline:

assumption 1: mining operations will necessarily cause pollution and environmental disaster

- maybe the pollution can be reduced or even eliminated with advanced technology
- the pollution under control may not threaten the endangered animals
- the animals may be spared due to the distance or conservation programs

assumption 2: consumers can easily refuse to purchase products made of CCC copper

- the manufacturers of the products may not provide such information (difficult to tell)
- the products made of CCC copper may not have close substitutes (consumers have no choice)

assumption 3: the company rely on the domestic consumer market for its revenue and profits

- maybe CCC's main revenue comes from transaction with large corporations
- maybe CCC mainly exports its copper abroad

---

45. The following is part of a memorandum from the president of Humana University.

(45/49)

"Last year the number of students who enrolled in online degree programs offered by nearby Omni University increased by 50 percent. During the same year, Omni showed a significant decrease from prior years in expenditures for dormitory and classroom space, most likely because instruction in the online programs takes place via the Internet. In contrast, over the past three years, enrollment at Humana University has failed to grow, and the cost of maintaining buildings has increased along with our budget deficit. To address these problems, Humana University will begin immediately to create and actively promote online degree programs like those at Omni. We predict that instituting these online degree programs will help Humana both increase its total enrollment and solve its budget problems."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

**Outline:**

Conclusion

if Humana develops and promotes online degree programs, the enrollment will increase and the problem of budget deficits will be solved.

Relevant data or premises:

Omni university has 50% more students enrolled in online degree programs

Omni reduced the expenditure on dorm and classroom space

enrollment at Humana did not grow in the past 3 years

cost of maintaining buildings has increased

Humana has a budget deficit

now think about what to focus on in each middle paragraph in terms of assumptions

Enrollment

- the impact of online program on the overall student enrollment (it is assumed that the impact would be significant; only if Omni has a large number of online students to begin with; otherwise, 50% increase may not increase the total student population)

- what are the reasons why the enrollment failed to grow and whether these reasons would affect the success of online program

assumed that the reasons would not affect the online programs

### Cost

- assume that the cost of building maintenance will necessarily decrease with the introduction of online programs; maybe some of the maintenance cost is fixed regardless of usage
  - why Humana has a budget deficit and would the root problems be addressed through online programs
  - would the reduction in physical space expenditure be offset by additional expense for online programs (development and maintenance of the online platform; development of materials; marketing costs)
- assumption that the overall expense would be reduced

### Comparability

- whether or not Onmi and Humana are comparable in terms of reputation, the students' interest in online programs, whether the disciplines are suitable for teaching online

---

### 46. The following appeared in a health magazine published in Corpora.

"Medical experts say that only one-quarter of Corpora's citizens meet the current standards for adequate physical fitness, even though twenty years ago, one-half of all of Corpora's citizens met the standards as then defined. But these experts are mistaken when they suggest that spending too much time using computers has caused a decline in fitness. Since overall fitness levels are highest in regions of Corpora where levels of computer ownership are also highest, it is clear that using computers has not made citizens less physically fit. Instead, as shown by this year's unusually low expenditures on fitness-related products and services, the recent decline in the economy is most likely the cause, and fitness levels will improve when the economy does."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

#### **Outline:**

assumption 1: the decreasing percentage of physically fit citizens is not related to the changing standards or the ageing of the population

- perhaps the standards have become higher resulting in fewer people identified as fit
- perhaps people become less physically fit simply because of ageing

assumption 2: levels of ownership of computers accurately reflect the time spent on computers

- maybe people spend more time using computers at work

- maybe people who own computers can better afford time and money for exercises and medical care (ownership of computers indicate socioeconomic classes rather than time spent on computers)

assumption 3: the low expenditures of fitness-related products are results of declining economy and the use of such products is necessary for keeping fit

- the low expenditure may be a result of high expenditure in the previous years (the products are durable goods)
- people spent less money on the products probably because a new fitness center is opened (substitute for the fitness products)
- the products may not be necessary for keeping fit (people could simply jog on the roads)

---

47. The following appeared in a memorandum from the owner of Movies Galore, a chain of movie-rental stores. (47/111/112)

"Because of declining profits, we must reduce operating expenses at Movies Galore's ten movie-rental stores. Raising prices is not a good option, since we are famous for our low prices. Instead, we should reduce our operating hours. Last month our store in downtown Marston reduced its hours by closing at 6:00 p.m. rather than 9:00 p.m. and reduced its overall inventory by no longer stocking any DVD released more than five years ago. Since we have received very few customer complaints about these new policies, we should now adopt them at all other Movies Galore stores as our best strategies for improving profits."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

**Outline:**

the reason why the profits have declined

- maybe the decline is caused by the decrease in revenue (measures should be taken to increase revenue)
- if the expenses have increased, what are the causes? (labor cost or overhead?)

whether raising the price would hurt the reputation and the revenue

- maybe the price is still competitive after the price increase
- how sensitive the customers are to the price change (maybe the revenue will increase)

the business records during 6pm to 9pm in the other 9 stores

- maybe more revenue has been generated during these hours
- look into the labor and overhead costs during these 3 hours

the business records related to the older movies

- compare the stocking expense and the revenue generated

---

48. The following appeared in a magazine article about planning for retirement.

"Clearview should be a top choice for anyone seeking a place to retire, because it has spectacular natural beauty and a consistent climate. Another advantage is that housing costs in Clearview have fallen significantly during the past year, and taxes remain lower than those in neighboring towns. Moreover, Clearview's mayor promises many new programs to improve schools, streets, and public services. And best of all, retirees in Clearview can also expect excellent health care as they grow older, since the number of physicians in the area is far greater than the national average."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

**Model Essay:**

According to the article, Clearview is an ideal place for retirement for a number of reasons. We need more information about Clearview to decide if this is indeed the case.

To begin with, more evidence is needed to decide if the natural beauty and the consistent climate are suitable for retired people. For one thing, we need to know how accessible the natural beauty is in Clearview. If the natural beauty can only be enjoyed through hiking trips that are physically demanding, the place would not be very attractive for senior citizens. Also, being consistent in climate may not be good enough for life after retirement. As the elderly are often vulnerable to colds and common flu, it is important to have a mild climate. If Clearview has consistently inclement winters, one has to think twice before choosing it for retirement.

The author points out that the housing prices have fallen and taxes are lower than towns nearby. But we also need to know the exact prices of the kinds of housing suitable for retired people and the tax rates that are applicable for people who are about to retire. Maybe the housing prices, despite the recent fall, are still unaffordable for the elderly. Or perhaps, even though the average housing prices in Clearview have decreased, the apartments for elderly had not become inexpensive. Also, it is possible that taxes in Clearview are particularly heavy for retired people living on pension. Therefore, we need more detailed information about Clearview tax system to decide if it is financially reasonable to move to Clearview for retirement.

The promises made by Clearview Mayor have to be regarded with some skepticism. It is easy for politicians to make all sorts of promises. But when it comes to materialize the promises, the mayor may have to persuade the local legislators for the funding. We need to know if the mayor has a good relationship with the local legislator and whether the city government can afford the proposed new programs. Of course, we also need to look

into the programs to see if they are actually relevant to the retired people. If the programs are oriented to children or young people, Clearview would not be very attractive, either.

Finally, the above-average number of physicians is meaningless unless we take into account the number of people living in the region. We need to calculate the physician-patient ratio to assess the availability of physicians. In addition, to better evaluate the quality of health care for retirees in Clearview, we need to look beyond the number of physicians in the area. We need information about a host of factors that would affect what level of health care a retiree can expect in Clearview. For example, among the physicians in the region, how many are experts in areas that the elderly are more likely to need care. If more physicians in Clearview are paediatricians or gynaecologist, it would not be very helpful. On the other hand, if Clearview has a large number of gerontologists, maybe it is worth considering. Also, we need to know how expensive it is to see the doctors. It is pointless to have a large number of physicians if their services are not affordable.

In conclusion, information about Clearview as discussed above has to be collected to decide if the argument is convincing or not.

---

**49. The following is part of a memorandum from the president of Humana University.**

"Last year the number of students who enrolled in online degree programs offered by nearby Omni University increased by 50 percent. During the same year, Omni showed a significant decrease from prior years in expenditures for dormitory and classroom space, most likely because online instruction takes place via the Internet. In contrast, over the past three years, enrollment at Humana University has failed to grow and the cost of maintaining buildings has increased. Thus, to increase enrollment and solve the problem of budget deficits at Humana University, we should initiate and actively promote online degree programs like those at Omni."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

50. An ancient, traditional remedy for insomnia—the scent of lavender flowers—has now been proved effective. In a recent study, 30 volunteers with chronic insomnia slept each night for three weeks on lavender-scented pillows in a controlled room where their sleep was monitored electronically. During the first week, volunteers continued to take their usual sleeping medication. They slept soundly but awakened feeling tired. At the beginning of the second week, the volunteers discontinued their sleeping medication. During that week, they slept less soundly than the previous week and felt even more tired. During the third week, the volunteers slept longer and more soundly than in the previous two weeks. Therefore, the study proves that lavender cures insomnia within a short period of time.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

示范:

conclusion: lavender cures insomnia

what would happen in week 4 and the long term

how the lack of sleep in week 2 affect sleep in week 3

controlled room? what about going back to their own homes  
placebo effect?

Insomnia is a medical condition a great many people suffer from and wish for a quick cure. The conclusion that lavender remedy cures insomnia seems too good to be true. We need evidence about the long-term effect of the remedy, how the lack of sleep in week 2 might affect sleep in week 3 as well as how the experiment conditions might influence the volunteers' sleep in order to evaluate the argument.

To begin with, the results suggested that volunteers seemed to sleep better in week 3 after using the pillow but we need more information about how well they sleep in week 4 and in the long term to decide if insomnia was cured. It is important to note that the volunteers suffered from chronic insomnia which might be alleviated temporarily by the remedy. Yet, the volunteers may have trouble sleeping again once the human bodies get used to levanda smell and the remedy becomes less effective. Therefore, we need to track the long-term development of the medical condition in order to evaluate the effectiveness of the remedy.

Another issue that deserves further investigation is whether the volunteers slept better in week 3 because of the remedy. Given the fact that they did not sleep very well in week 2 after terminating the use of sleeping pills, the volunteers may have slept soundly in week 3



simply because they felt too tired. After enjoying some sound sleep in week 3, their insomnia conditions may come back again. The point here is similar to the concern over long-term effect discussed in the previous paragraph. But the focus here is whether the remedy was actually effective during the three week experiment.

A final issue that we need to consider is how the controlled environment might contribute to the improvement of sleep quality. Since the volunteers have been sleeping in a controlled room where their sleep was monitored electronically, it is safe to assume that the environment is almost free from distraction that the volunteers are normally subject to. When they participate in the study, they may forget about all the problems that bother them in their daily life. In other words, the lab environment might help them sleep better. It would be helpful if the volunteers could continue using the remedy at home and more data could be collected about their sleep in a more natural environment. After all, the remedy would be useless if the volunteers can only sleep well in a controlled room.

The experiments with the lavender remedy are certainly very interesting and it is tempting to accept the conclusion that the remedy can cure insomnia. But we need more evidence about the issues discussed above in order to decide if the argument is reasonable.

---

51. The following memorandum is from the business manager of Happy Pancake House restaurants.

"Butter has now been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. Only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers cannot distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine. Thus, to avoid the expense of purchasing butter and to increase profitability, the Happy Pancake House should extend this cost-saving change to its restaurants in the southeast and northeast as well."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

示范: The business manager argues that HPH restaurants in southeast and northeast should follow the practice of replacing butter with margarine as customers in southwest seemed to be happy with the arrangement which can save costs for the company. We need to ask a number of questions about how the replacement affected the food at HPH, how the customers felt about the replacement and what difference there might be between southwest customers and the customers in the other regions in order to evaluate the soundness of the argument.

To begin with, we need to know what percentages of the food and the customers have been affected by the replacement to better understand what it means to have 2% of customers complaining. If, for example, only half of the food items on the menu were prepared with butter (or margarine after replacement) or about 30% of customers actually ordered anything with butter replaced by margarine, the fact that 2% of customers complained would be far more significant than the number suggested. In other words, the customers who ordered pancake without butter to begin with or the food items that do not include butter should be excluded from the data if we want any meaningful information.

In addition, we need to know the real attitudes of customers towards the replacement of butter with margarine. The fact that most customers being given margarine did not complain does not mean that these customers were completely satisfied with the new arrangement. Complaining about the food in a restaurant can be a stressful experience for many customers who do not want to ruin the time they spent with their friends or family members. They may choose to vote against the restaurant by feet by not coming to the restaurant next time instead of making a complaint right away. Therefore, we need to

investigate how customers felt about the change through other means such as focus group, interviewing or simply monitoring the number of returning customers.

Moreover, it is not safe to assume that what works in one region would necessarily do the trick in a different region. Therefore, we need to ask if the customers in the other regions have the same preferences when it comes to butter vs. margarine. We need to carefully compare the demographic information of the different regions and investigate how different ages, income, gender and educational levels may affect customers' preferences for butter in a pancake restaurant. Such information is vital for the company to make decisions about adopting this new policy in other areas.

Finally, it is important to ask whether it is ethical to keep the customers in the dark with regard to the use of butter versus margarine. The company needs to know what the customers really want when they use the term "butter" rather than simply assuming that butter can mean both real butter and the cheaper substitute. Offering the customers something cheaper than what the customers expect and taking advantages of the ambiguity in the naming of food may be unethical practices that would harm the restaurant's reputation and long-term profitability and may even carry legal consequences.

Overall speaking, it is understandable that the company looks for ways to save costs and increase profits and replacing butter with something cheaper seems to be smart move. But this arrangement should not be extended to more restaurants in other regions unless the questions raised above are answered and the information collected clearly suggests that this arrangement is a desirable move.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

claim: to avoid the expense of purchasing butter and to increase profitability, the Happy Pancake House should extend this cost-saving change to its restaurants in the southeast and northeast as well.

data: Butter has now been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States.

data: Only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change.

data: Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead.

data: Clearly, either these customers cannot distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine.

warrant: only 2% have complained about the replacement suggesting that the rest of them are satisfied with the change

warrant: customers who are given margarine did not complain, therefore, it is ok to replace it

warrant: customers cannot distinguish or do not distinguish; therefore, it is OK to replace

Questions should be asked about what percentages of the customers are affected by the replacement; the attitudes of the customers being given margarine instead of butter; the preferences of the customers in southeast and northeast

The following memorandum is from the business manager of Happy Pancake House restaurants.

#### **Argument 15**

"Recently, butter has been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. This change, however, has had little impact on our customers. In fact, only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers do not distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine."

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

First we have to identify the observations made and the explanations proposed  
we can then discuss how the observations could be explained in alternative ways

fact- only 2% complained

explanation: an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change

fact- many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead

explanation: Clearly, either these customers do not distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine.

The business manager of HPH argues that replacing butter with margarine had little influence on their customers based on his interpretations and explanations of two

observations: 1) only 2% of customers complained; 2) customers did not complain about the replacement according to the servers. To evaluate the argument critically, we need to explore other alternative explanations for the facts observed and presented.

Given the fact that only 2% of the customers complained about margarine used to replace butter, the manager believes that 98% of the customers are OK with the replacement. But there might be other reasons why complaint rate was only 2%. For example, perhaps the only way for the customers to complain about the change was to speak to the restaurant staff directly, which the customers may feel reluctant to do for fear of embarrassment or confrontation. If the restaurant had a Facebook page accepting complaints from the customers, the complaint rate might be much higher. Indeed, the customers may have already complained about the change in social networking sites such as Facebook and Twitter, which the restaurant is not fully aware of.

Another possible explanation for the relatively low complaint rate is that the restaurant has done a decent job overall serving the customers. The food was generally delicious and the service was very good. As a result, the customers chose not to complain about the change of butter. But the lack of complaints should not be interpreted as the customers being satisfied with the change without stronger evidence to support such an interpretation.

As for the servers' report of few complaints after failing to deliver the order, there are also a number of alternative explanations we need to consider. Maybe the servers chose to withhold information about the complaints they received from the customers in order to look good to the management of HPH. More systematic and independent investigation into the customer satisfaction about the change of ingredient is necessary to settle this issue. Such investigation would help determine whether the customers could not distinguish butter from margarine or used the term "butter" more loosely.

Meanwhile, for the lack of complaints in both cases, we also need to consider the possibility that customers decided not to come to HPH for dinner again after the change about butter. They simply voted against HPH by their feet without taking the trouble to lodge a complaint. We need to track the customer returning rate before and after the change about butter to decide if the change has cost the restaurant some customers. Indeed, such loss of customers may be more threatening to the restaurant than complaints as it is harder for the manager to recognize the problems when the customers just gave up the restaurant silently.

In conclusion, we need more information about customers' attitudes towards the change and a number of other issues to decide which explanations were the most appropriate for the observed facts.

---

52. The following appeared in a letter from the owner of the Sunnyside Towers apartment building to its manager. (35/128/129)

"One month ago, all the showerheads on the first five floors of Sunnyside Towers were modified to restrict the water flow to approximately one-third of its original flow. Although actual readings of water usage before and after the adjustment are not yet available, the change will obviously result in a considerable savings for Sunnyside Corporation, since the corporation must pay for water each month. Except for a few complaints about low water pressure, no problems with showers have been reported since the adjustment. Clearly, restricting water flow throughout all the twenty floors of Sunnyside Towers will increase our profits further."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

53. The following appeared in a health magazine.

"The citizens of Forsythe have adopted more healthful lifestyles. Their responses to a recent survey show that in their eating habits they conform more closely to government nutritional recommendations than they did ten years ago. Furthermore, there has been a fourfold increase in sales of food products containing kiran, a substance that a scientific study has shown reduces cholesterol. This trend is also evident in reduced sales of sulia, a food that few of the most healthy citizens regularly eat."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

示范: The article makes the argument that Forsythe citizens' lifestyles have become more healthful based on a recent survey and sales records of two types of food. To evaluate this optimistic conclusion, we need more evidence about how the survey was designed and conducted and the reasons why the sales of different food have changed.

We need more information about the survey to decide if the results can support the conclusion. For one thing, how the survey was designed and conducted would affect the reliability of the data collected. Did the survey ask the respondents about their eating habits now as well as ten years ago? For their current eating habits, did the survey designers include questions phrased in different ways to check the consistency of the respondents? For the eating habits of people ten years ago, did the survey ask the respondents to recall their eating habits or consider the data collected a decade earlier? Answers to these questions would provide evidence for us to decide if the survey itself

was well-designed and could produce useful and reliable data. Another issue is the representativeness of the respondents. We need to evaluate the sampling methods of the survey critically to see if the respondents sampled can truly represent the Forsythe citizens. If the respondents were mainly from a particular socioeconomic class or age group, for example, the survey results could not be generalized to the entire population in Forsythe.

More information is also required to understand the nature of Kiran and the reasons why the sales have increased. According to the magazine article, Kiran can help reduce cholesterol. But that does not mean the substance is necessarily healthful. Maybe it is a mood booster that can help the people to feel good but may become addictive in the long term. We need more information about Kiran to determine whether having more of this is healthful. Also, we need to consider the food products that contain kiran. Maybe the food products, in addition to having kiran, also have other unhealthy ingredients such as sugar or grease. This is related to another question: why are the food products so popular? Maybe they are popular for reasons unrelated to kiran such as the delicious taste as a result of sugar or grease or effective marketing strategies of the manufacturers and retailers. If this is the case, the data would not support the claim that Forsythe citizens are leading a more healthful life.

Similarly, we need more information about sulia and why its sales has been reduced. It is not reasonable to assess the health value of sulia simply based on the eating habits of the most healthy citizens. The citizens's health conditions may or may not relate to their habits of eating or not eating a particular food. We need more data about why the "most healthy citizens" are so healthy to decide if it is related to not eating sulia. Of course, information about sulia itself such as its nutrition value and impact on people's health would be very helpful. Meanwhile, it is also useful to know why the sales of sulia has declined. It could be caused by factors that are completely unrelated to people's lifestyle and health, Maybe the sales were reduced because the change of global market that increased the price of sulia as raw materials. With the increase of the price, people would certainly buy less of the food. If this is the case, we would then need to consider the substitute of sulia that people turn to and see if the substitute is healthful or not.

Overall speaking, evaluating the healthfulness of people's lifestyles is an important but complicated undertaking. Looking at the eating habits and the sales of particular food products is helpful but may not lead to comprehensive and reliable data that is required to make any valid conclusion. To evaluate the argument, we need more information about the survey designs, the nature of the food products and why the sales have changed.

---

54. Humans arrived in the Kaliko Islands about 7,000 years ago, and within 3,000 years

most of the large mammal species that had lived in the forests of the Kaliko Islands had become extinct. Yet humans cannot have been a factor in the species' extinctions, because there is no evidence that the humans had any significant contact with the mammals. Further, archaeologists have discovered numerous sites where the bones of fish had been discarded, but they found no such areas containing the bones of large mammals, so the humans cannot have hunted the mammals. Therefore, some climate change or other environmental factor must have caused the species' extinctions.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

示范: The author argues that climate changes and environmental factors instead of human activities are responsible for the extinctions of the large mammals. A number of assumptions have been made about the absence of evidence of contact between human and large mammals, the sites where fish bones were discarded and the climate changes. We need to examine these assumptions carefully to decide if the argument is reasonable.

To begin with, it is assumed that the absence of evidence for human-mammal contact means that there is no such contact. Since the possible contact would have occurred from 7000 years ago to 4000 years ago, many traces left for the contact might have simply disappeared over the long period of time. For example, humans could have set up traps to hunt and kill the mammals but after many years of geological movement and climate changes, it is not possible for archaeologists to find such traps. Some ancient humans could have been killed during their fight against the large mammals, but without the abilities or technologies to keep written records, their stories could not be passed to the present generations. In other words, we cannot assume there is no contact between humans and mammals simply because there is no evidence found yet.

The lack of bones of mammals in the site where fish bones were discarded could be interpreted in different ways. It cannot be assumed without further evidence that humans would discard the mammals' bones after killing and eating them. Maybe ancient humans had learned to make tools out of the bones. Or the bones had been used in certain religious ceremonies. And after being used as tools or for religious purposes, the bones could have been discarded in other places or buried somewhere that archaeologists nowadays had not yet discovered.

Another assumption being made here is that climate changes and other changes in environmental factors that may cause the extinctions are not related to human activities. Maybe the human settlement in the Islands was the main cause of the dramatic changes



in the habitat and the ecosystem that would ultimately lead to the extinctions of the large mammals. If human activities have caused the climate or environmental changes, the arrival of humans would still be considered as a significant factor for the extinctions of large mammals even there was no significant contact between humans and large mammals.

In conclusion, a number of assumptions have been made in the argument. We need more evidence to examine the evidence. If these assumptions do not hold true, the argument would not stand.

---

55. The following appeared in an editorial in a business magazine.

"Although the sales of Whirlwind video games have declined over the past two years, a recent survey of video-game players suggests that this sales trend is about to be reversed. The survey asked video-game players what features they thought were most important in a video game. According to the survey, players prefer games that provide lifelike graphics, which require the most up-to-date computers. Whirlwind has just introduced several such games with an extensive advertising campaign directed at people ten to twenty-five years old, the age-group most likely to play video games. It follows, then, that the sales of Whirlwind video games are likely to increase dramatically in the next few months."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

示范: According to this editorial, the sales of WW video games are about to increase due to the recent introduction of lifelike graphics to its products and its rigorous marketing campaign targeted to active game players. A number of assumptions have been made implicitly in this prediction which need to be examined critically to assess the soundness of the argument.

To begin with, it is assumed that the excitement of lifelike graphics is the most influential and decisive factor when the consumers make decisions about which games to choose. While it is reasonable to believe that lifelike graphics would enhance the user experiences of the games, further investigation about user preference is needed before we know how important this factor is relative to a host of other factors that make affect the sales of the game, e.g. the storylines, the characters and the interface. If it turns out that the quality of the graphics does not carry significant weight in the decision-making process, the prediction may not be accurate.

Moreover, it is also assumed that WW products are competitive in other areas which I have briefly mentioned above when compared to major rival products. For a video game

to succeed in the market, it has to offer arresting storylines, attractive characters and extraordinary user interface. If the WWW video game is as good as its rivals in all these areas and superior in graphics, its sales may stand out. Otherwise, the prediction may not hold true.

Since the WW video game requires most advanced hardware to display its lifelike graphics, an important question that remains unanswered is whether the game users have access to the required hardware or are willing to buy the hardware just for the game. Obviously the game is no good if the users do not have the hardware needed. So here we have to check the assumption about the availability of the advanced computers among the users.

With regard to the rigorous advertising campaign, it is assumed that the campaign will be effective in promoting the sales of the new game. However, given the diverse age groups (10-25) being targeted, it is natural to raise doubt about how appealing the campaign would be to the entire group. Obviously, a ten-year-old child and a 25-year-old young man would have different preferences in advertising. In addition, the advertising campaign will cost considerable amount of financial resources, which will increase the price of the product, another factor influencing the sales. So it is important to assess the cost-effectiveness of the advertising campaigns.

Finally, we do not know if the targeted group at the ages of 10-25 can actually afford the new games. Even if the teenage consumers find the product attractive, they still need to persuade their parents to buy it for them or use their skimpy pocket money. For consumers in their early 20s, most of them just start working and may not have much spare money for a new video game.

Overall speaking, the editorial author has made a number of assumptions about the relative importance of graphics, the overall quality of the game, the availability of hardware, the effectiveness of the advertising campaign and the purchasing power of the target consumers when making the prediction. If any of the assumptions do not hold true, the prediction about the sales is unlikely to be correct.

56. The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of marketing at Dura-Sock, Inc.

"A recent study of our customers suggests that our company is wasting the money it spends on its patented Endure manufacturing process, which ensures that our socks are strong enough to last for two years. We have always advertised our use of the Endure process, but the new study shows that despite our socks' durability, our average customer actually purchases new Dura-Socks every three months. Furthermore, our customers surveyed in our largest market, northeastern United States cities, say that they most value Dura-Socks' stylish appearance and availability in many colors. These findings suggest that we can increase our profits by discontinuing use of the Endure manufacturing process."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

提纲:

how long the customers expect to use the socks

- they buy new ones every three months probably because they find socks of new styles attractive
- but they may expect to use the socks for 2 years
- they may donate their old socks to Salvation Army and count on the fact that such socks last for 2 years

to what extent the survey results reflect the overall customers' attitudes

- how about the city customers in the South who are in general less wealthy
- how about the customers from rural areas who may care less about appearance and colors

the impact of using other tech on costs and profits

- maybe the patented process has other advantages such as lower manufacturing costs
- perhaps the patent fee is really small when it is shared by each pair of socks
- switching to another technology may cost money in training and machinery replacement

---

57. The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of marketing at Dura-Sock, Inc.

"A recent study of our customers suggests that our company is wasting the money it spends on its patented Endure manufacturing process, which ensures that our socks are strong enough to last for two years. We have always advertised our use of the Endure process, but the new study shows that despite our socks' durability, our average customer actually purchases new Dura-Socks every three months. Furthermore, our customers surveyed in our largest market, northeastern United States cities, say that they most value Dura-Socks' stylish appearance and availability in many colors. These findings suggest that we can increase our profits by discontinuing use of the Endure manufacturing process."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

58. The vice president for human resources at Climpson Industries sent the following recommendation to the company's president. ( 58/34/94)

"In an effort to improve our employees' productivity, we should implement electronic monitoring of employees' Internet use from their workstations. Employees who use the Internet inappropriately from their workstations need to be identified and punished if we are to reduce the number of work hours spent on personal or recreational activities, such as shopping or playing games. Installing software on company computers to detect employees' Internet use is the best way to prevent employees from wasting time on the job. It will foster a better work ethic at Climpson and improve our overall profits."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

59. The following appeared in a memo from the president of Bower Builders, a company that constructs new homes.

"A nationwide survey reveals that the two most-desired home features are a large family room and a large, well-appointed kitchen. A number of homes in our area built by our competitor Domus Construction have such features and have sold much faster and at significantly higher prices than the national average. To boost sales and profits, we should increase the size of the family rooms and kitchens in all the homes we build and should make state-of-the-art kitchens a standard feature. Moreover, our larger family rooms and kitchens can come at the expense of the dining room, since many of our recent buyers say they do not need a separate dining room for family meals."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

提纲: assumption 1: the results of the survey accurately reflect the preference of the customers

- the respondents in the nationwide survey are different from the local buyers in terms of taste, purchasing power and lifestyle
- the most desired home features are not necessarily the decisive factors when buying homes (other factor such as affordability and practical use)

assumption 2: the two features are the reasons why Domus sold homes faster and at higher prices

- maybe their homes have other attractive features such as convenient location and low per-square-foot price (or the homes are fully furnished)
- Domus has a better marketing and sales teams
- Domus offers extra mortgage

assumption 3: the extra space in family room and kitchens with better kitchen facilities can attract more buyers to pay higher prices

- maybe the buyers already believe that the current family room and kitchens are spacious enough
- the extra cost of the features may not be affordable for the buyers
- the profit margin may be reduced

assumption 4: the anecdotal evidence is reliable and the buyers do not need separate dining rooms for other purposes

- it is not clear how many buyers say that and how reliable the evidence is
- they may need a separate dining room to host a banquet or throw a party

60. The following appeared in a letter from a firm providing investment advice for a client.

"Most homes in the northeastern United States, where winters are typically cold, have traditionally used oil as their major fuel for heating. Last heating season that region experienced 90 days with below-normal temperatures, and climate forecasters predict that this weather pattern will continue for several more years. Furthermore, many new homes are being built in the region in response to recent population growth. Because of these trends, we predict an increased demand for heating oil and recommend investment in Consolidated Industries, one of whose major business operations is the retail sale of home heating oil." (60/79/145/146/150/154/155)

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

150 提纲: question 1: how reliable are the weather prediction

- maybe the model is flawed overlooking some latest data
- how about predictions made by other researchers

question 2: will the residents switch to other energy sources for heating or adopt other solutions?

- maybe they would use electricity
  - maybe they would install more insulation to conserve heat
  - some people may travel to the south to spend the winter (especially the elderly)
- all would reduce the demand for heating oil

question 3: will the new homes be occupied using heating oil

- maybe the homes will remain vacant (poor housing market)
- the homes use electricity
- the homes are better insulated (need less oil)

question 4: retail of heating oil is necessarily profitable and the company is worth investing

- maybe the cost of heating oil will also increase eating away the profits
- maybe the increase in labor and operating cost will reduce the profits
- perhaps the company is poorly managed and financially troubled

---

61. The following appeared in an article in the *Grandview Beacon*.

"For many years the city of Grandview has provided annual funding for the Grandview Symphony. Last year, however, private contributions to the symphony increased by 200 percent and attendance at the symphony's concerts-in-the-park series doubled. The symphony has also announced an increase in ticket prices for next year. Given such developments, some city commissioners argue that the symphony can now be fully self-supporting, and they recommend that funding for the symphony be eliminated from next year's budget." (61/139/141/143/162)

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

162 提纲: claim: It is time for the city of Grandview to stop funding the Grandview Symphony Orchestra  
the symphony will flourish in the years to come even without funding from the city.

Data: It is true that the symphony struggled financially for many years,  
but last year private contributions to the symphony increased by 200 percent  
and attendance at the symphony's concerts-in-the-park series doubled.  
the symphony has just announced an increase in ticket prices for next year.

Warrant

- private contribution increased by 200%, therefore the symphony will have enough funding to flourish
- attendance of a series of events doubled - the symphony can increase ticket revenue
- increase in ticket prices - increase revenue

three main issues or points

about contribution

- the importance of private contribution relative to the overall financial support received by the symphony including the government funding
- will the contribution increase or decrease or remain the same next year
- would the elimination of government funding discourage private contribution (some private organisations consider government funding as some sort of endorsement)

about attendance

- how important are the park series relative to other events of the symphony
- how are the attendance of all the other events of the symphony this year

- how will the elimination of government funding affect the attendance of the symphony events (e.g. funding has been used to promote the events; subsidise the price tickets)

about ticket prices

- how sensitive are the audience to the price change ( how the increase of ticket prices affect the attendance and the revenue)
- how would the increase of ticket prices affect the private contribution
- the increase of price tickets will limit the public access to the symphony (to what extent is this desirable or acceptable to the government's policy about music and education)

建议每个中间段集中讨论一个大的方面 在每个中间段的开头第一句要对这一段提出的问题做一个概括

你提的大部分问题都是相关的 但是不要做过多细致的假设如五十周年、庆祝活动等要考虑单个事件在整体中占的比例 (比如私人捐献占乐队总预算的比例)

下一步

可以考虑用英语写出开头段及中间三段的开头句

---

## 62.The following appeared in a memo from the director of a large group of hospitals.

"In a laboratory study of liquid antibacterial hand soaps, a concentrated solution of UltraClean produced a 40 percent greater reduction in the bacteria population than did the liquid hand soaps currently used in our hospitals. During a subsequent test of UltraClean at our hospital in Workby, that hospital reported significantly fewer cases of patient infection than did any of the other hospitals in our group. Therefore, to prevent serious patient infections, we should supply UltraClean at all hand-washing stations throughout our hospital system." (62/121/122/124)

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

示范: According to the director of the hospital group, the hand soap UltraClean should be supplied in order to reduce cases of serious patient infections. Citing the lab report and the test results in some hospitals, the director argues that doing so can produce the desired results. A number of assumptions have been made in the argument about the lab results, the hospital and the patient infection. These assumptions need to be scrutinized critically to assess the strength of the argument.

To begin with, it is assumed that the lab results of the UltraClean solution accurately reflects the performance of the hand soap in bacteria reduction in the hospitals. While the UltraClean solution was superior in reducing bacteria in the lab, it does not follow that the UltraClean hand soap would necessarily outperform the hand soap currently used in



the hospitals. Maybe the concentration of the active ingredient is higher in the lab samples but the UltraClean hand soap may become less effective when being used when washing hands. If the UltraClean is not effective in reducing the bacteria population, the recommendation may not be helpful.

In addition, we also need to check the assumption that the reduction of infection cases in the hospital in Workby was really a result of using UltraClean. Maybe the hospital has recently launched a campaign to teach hospital staff and patients to wash hands thoroughly which has helped reduce infection. Or perhaps the hospital has admitted fewer patients who are vulnerable to infection. If other factors have contributed to the reduction of infection cases, it may not matter which brands of hand soap would be used to wash hands.

Another important assumption is that further reduction in bacteria via hand washing will necessarily reduce the number of serious infection cases. As we all know, there are a great amount of bacteria in our hands and it is not possible to wash away all of them. Whether or not the extra 40% bacteria reduction would actually make a difference in infection control remains an open question. Since the director is specifically concerned with serious infection cases, we need to know the real causes of the serious infection cases in the past. We cannot simply assume that these cases were due to bacteria in hands. Maybe the hand soap currently used has already kept the amount of bacteria at a level for which infection is unlikely.

In conclusion, it is difficult to confirm that UltraClean would effectively reduce the cases of serious infection in the hospitals. The assumptions discussed above have to be critically examined by taking into account more relevant information on issues such as the importance of washing hand to infection control, the similarity between UltraClean sample in the lab and the hand soap and the situation of Workby relative to other members of the hospital group.

---

63. The following appeared in a letter to the editor of the *Parkville Daily* newspaper.

"Throughout the country last year, as more and more children below the age of nine participated in youth-league sports, over 40,000 of these young players suffered injuries. When interviewed for a recent study, youth-league soccer players in several major cities also reported psychological pressure exerted by coaches and parents to win games. Furthermore, education experts say that long practice sessions for these sports take away time that could be used for academic activities. Since the disadvantages outweigh any advantages, we in Parkville should discontinue organized athletic competition for children under nine."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

提纲:

Assumption 1: the injuries are severe enough to justify discontinuing

- perhaps many of the injury cases are minor
- maybe better training and supervision could reduce the number of injuries
- perhaps the injury rate is not very high compared to other activities

Assumption 2: the injured players are evenly distributed across age groups, sport categories and cities

- maybe players of certain age groups are more vulnerable to injury (attention should be focused on such age group; not to discontinue players of all ages under 9)
- perhaps players of certain sports are more likely to get injured
- maybe injuries are not common in Parkville

Assumption 3: the interview studies could represent all the youth league players and the pressure is necessarily bad

- only a dozen of players are interviewed (are they randomly selected from all the players)
- can soccer players's experience represent players of other sports
- is situation in Parkville similar to the major cities
- pressure could be useful

Assumption 4: all players practice for long sessions that only influence academic activities negatively

- maybe many players do not practice very long sessions
- perhaps the exercises can improve the health and the learning efficiency
- the competitive spirit could motivate the students to study harder

**64. Collectors prize the ancient life-size clay statues of human figures made on Kali Island**

but have long wondered how Kalinese artists were able to depict bodies with such realistic precision. Since archaeologists have recently discovered molds of human heads and hands on Kali, we can now conclude that the ancient Kalinese artists used molds of actual bodies, not sculpting tools and techniques, to create these statues. This discovery explains why Kalinese miniature statues were abstract and entirely different in style: molds could be used only for life-size sculptures. It also explains why few ancient Kalinese sculpting tools have been found. In light of this discovery, collectors predict that the life-size sculptures will decrease in value while the miniatures increase in value.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

提纲:

Question 1: Were molds of actual bodies used to create the statues without using any sculpting tools and techniques

- molds might be made at a time different from the time when the clay statues were made (advanced timing techniques could be used)
- maybe the molds were used but sculpting tools and techniques were also used to polish the products

Question 2: what materials might be used to make sculpting tools by ancient Kalinese and what might happen to the tools

- perhaps the tools are made of some material that could not survive the time
- maybe the tools are later converted to other tools and could not be recognized
- the tools are buried with the dead and had not yet been discovered

Question 3: why were the miniature statues abstract and different in styles

- maybe the statues were made for different purposes such as decoration, worshipping or other rituals
- perhaps certain artists prefer the more abstract styles even if the molds are available

Question 4: how do collectors determine the value of the sculptures

- do collectors really care whether the mold was used
- perhaps the value is influenced by the number of statues available in the market

---

65. When Stanley Park first opened, it was the largest, most heavily used public park in

town. It is still the largest park, but it is no longer heavily used. Video cameras mounted in the park's parking lots last month revealed the park's drop in popularity: the recordings showed an average of only 50 cars per day. In contrast, tiny Carlton Park in the heart of the business district is visited by more than 150 people on a typical weekday. An obvious difference is that Carlton Park, unlike Stanley Park, provides ample seating. Thus, if Stanley Park is ever to be as popular with our citizens as Carlton Park, the town will obviously need to provide more benches, thereby converting some of the unused open areas into spaces suitable for socializing.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

示范: It is argued that, in order to increase the popularity of Stanley Park, more benches should be provided following the example of Carlton Park. A number of assumptions about the camera recordings and the effects of seating availability to the attractiveness of both parks have been made and need further investigation in order to assess the argument.

To begin with, it is assumed that the video camera's recordings of the number of cars in one month can accurately reflect the popularity of Stanley Park. This assumption may not hold true for a number of reasons. First of all, the data collected in just one month may not be sufficient to reveal the trend of popularity of the park. More data over a number of months will be helpful to decide if Stanley Park was indeed less popular. Moreover, it is not clear why the number of cars recorded in the camera is a reliable indicator of the park's popularity. Given the fact that the number of visitors were counted to assess the popularity of Carlton Park, it seems to make more sense to count the number of visitors to Stanley Park as well. If the data from the camera could not accurately indicate the popularity of the Park, the argument would be significantly weakened due to its specious premise about the popularity of the park.

Another assumption being made is that the availability of ample seating was the main reason why Carlton Park was popular. To check this assumption, we may have to analyze the camera recordings more closely to see if the visitors spent a lot of their time socializing while sitting on the benches. On the other hand, there could be other factors that contributed to the popularity of Carlton Park. For example, the geographical location (being at the heart of the business district) could be the main reason for more visitors. If the ample seating was not the main factor related to park popularity, it would be groundless to recommend Stanley Park to provide more seats.

Finally, it is also assumed that the lack of seating reduced the attractiveness of Stanley Park among its prospective visitors. Yet other issues may be the main causes of the declining popularity. For example, perhaps the crime rates have increased in the area due to the increasing unemployment or the corruption of local police. If the local people do not feel safe in Stanley Park, they would not use the park even more seats are provided. Or maybe the weather was inclement in the month of the camera recordings and, as a result, few people showed up in the park. Again, in case of bad weather, more seats will not help attract more visitors.

In conclusion, despite the good intention of the recommendation, more investigation is necessary to check the assumptions made in the argument before decisions can be made about how to improve the popularity of Stanley Park.

---

66. The following appeared in a memo from the owner of a chain of cheese stores located throughout the United States. (66/107/108)

"For many years all the stores in our chain have stocked a wide variety of both domestic and imported cheeses. Last year, however, all of the five best-selling cheeses at our newest store were domestic cheddar cheeses from Wisconsin. Furthermore, a recent survey by *Cheeses of the World* magazine indicates an increasing preference for domestic cheeses among its subscribers. Since our company can reduce expenses by limiting inventory, the best way to improve profits in all of our stores is to discontinue stocking many of our varieties of imported cheese and concentrate primarily on domestic cheeses."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

提纲:

Need to know more about the sales records of different cheeses in all the stores

- cannot look at newest stores alone; need to consider the sales records of all the stores
- need to consider the sales records of all cheeses (maybe the top best selling cheese only amount to less than half of total sales)

Need to see if the subscribers of the magazines are similar to the target customers of the cheese stores

Need to see if the customers like to mix domestic and imported cheese when they shop

- maybe they value diversity and choice
- they may buy more domestic cheese but also order a bit of imported cheese

Need to analyze the profit margins of different cheeses

- maybe the profit margin of foreign cheese is higher than domestic cheese
- compare the contribution of the foreign cheese sale to the profits with the inventory expense

---

67. The following appeared as part of a business plan developed by the manager of the Rialto Movie Theater.

"Despite its downtown location, the Rialto Movie Theater, a local institution for five decades, must make big changes or close its doors forever. It should follow the example of the new Apex Theater in the mall outside of town. When the Apex opened last year, it featured a video arcade, plush carpeting and seats, and a state-of-the-art sound system. Furthermore, in a recent survey, over 85 percent of respondents reported that the high price of newly released movies prevents them from going to the movies more than five times per year. Thus, if the Rialto intends to hold on to its share of a decreasing pool of moviegoers, it must offer the same features as Apex."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

提纲:

Question 1: why did Rialto lose customers in downtown?

- maybe the downtown economy is declining and people have moved out to the suburbs
- maybe the disposable income of the downtown residents have declined
- maybe the movies featured in Rialto are not popular enough

Question 2: Did the features in Apex succeed in attracting customers and why?

- it is not clear if the features successfully attracted more customers
- perhaps customers went to Apex simply because it is new or its location is more convenient

Question 3: what features do customers in downtown want?

- perhaps customers in downtown do not like the features especially when they have to pay more
- perhaps they want to see other features or improvement in Rialto such as "no smoking" rules and more female restrooms

Question 4 how useful are the survey results to Rialto

- to what extent do the respondents represent the customers of Rialto
- in average how many times do a customer go to Rialto per year
- do customers in Rialto find the movies too expensive

---

68.A recent study reported that pet owners have longer, healthier lives on average than do people who own no pets. Specifically, dog owners tend to have a lower incidence of heart disease. In light of these findings, Sherwood Hospital should form a partnership with Sherwood Animal Shelter to institute an adopt-a-dog program. The program would encourage dog ownership for patients recovering from heart disease, which should reduce these patients' chance of experiencing continuing heart problems and also reduce their need for ongoing treatment. As a further benefit, the publicity about the program would encourage more people to adopt pets from the shelter. And that will reduce the incidence of heart disease in the general population.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

示范: The author argues that the hospital should introduce the program to promote dog ownership among patients with heart disease and the general public based on the study suggesting that pet owners tend to live long and healthy lives. A number of assumptions have been made about the effects of dog ownership in general, the consequences of adopting dogs by patients as well as how the public would respond to the program. We need to examine such assumptions critically to decide if the argument is acceptable.

To begin with, it is assumed that dog ownership necessarily helped the people to enjoy longer and healthier lives. The study merely suggested that dog ownership is correlated with healthy and longer lives. But correlation does not necessarily imply causal relationship. Maybe pet owners (dog owners in particular) tend to have higher income and enjoy more leisure time, which mean that they will have access to better health care, healthier food and health-related amenities such as gyms. If this is the case, dog ownership is not the main reason why the dog owners enjoy better health. Promoting dog ownership would not achieve the proposed goals.

In addition, it is assumed that the patients would necessarily benefit from such a program. For one thing, we do not know if the patients would be interested in owning a dog. Maybe some of them are afraid of dogs or had unpleasant experiences with dogs in the past. For such patients, the program would not work. In addition, we do not know if the patients who join the program would get any health benefits from it. The study cited is concerned with dog owners who have lower chance of having heart disease. It does not focus on people who are recovering from the condition. Maybe the patients recovering from heart condition need more rest and would not benefit from rigorous activities such as walking a dog regularly. Also it is hard to believe the assumption that the program would make the ongoing treatment unnecessary. The health professionals will have to be consulted over this matter.

The author also predicts that with more publicity about the program the shelter would attract more people from the general public to adopt pets. But the assumption here is that the program would be successful and the participants would say nice things about the program. Based on the discussion above, it is far from clear that the program would actually benefit the patients. If the patients do not find the program helpful, it would be unreasonable to expect them to promote the program and the media would be critical of the program. If the publicity is negative, the shelter would not be able to have more people to adopt pets there.

The final assumption that has been implicitly made is that the patients and the general public can afford the time, the money and the space to own pets (or dogs). This issue relates back to the problem of socioeconomic class that I discussed earlier. We do not know if the patients and the general public in Sherwood would have enough money and time to own dogs. Nor do we know if their homes would have enough space to keep dogs. If Sherwood is a low-income neighborhood where people struggle to make ends meet, it would be inconceivable for them to find such adopt-a-dog program appealing.

In conclusion, a number of assumptions have been made in this argument about the adopt-a-dog program. More studies have to be conducted to investigate the issues discussed above to decide if the assumptions hold true. If not, the recommendation may not be acceptable.

---

69. The following appeared in a memo from a vice president of a large, highly diversified company. (69/70/115)

"Ten years ago our company had two new office buildings constructed as regional headquarters for two regions. The buildings were erected by different construction companies—Alpha and Zeta. Although the two buildings had identical floor plans, the building constructed by Zeta cost 30 percent more to build. However, that building's expenses for maintenance last year were only half those of Alpha's. In addition, the energy consumption of the Zeta building has been lower than that of the Alpha building every year since its construction. Given these data, plus the fact that Zeta has a stable workforce with little employee turnover, we recommend using Zeta rather than Alpha for our new building project, even though Alpha's bid promises lower construction costs."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

第一段总结 **argument** 提出需要在几个方面讨论

第二段 重点讨论成本问题 指出可能受到多方面的因素影响 比如区域的劳动力成本 原材料价格 要问 **Zeta** 成本低是公司的技术管理好 还是一些非公司本身的因素



第三段 关于维护成本 去年的数据不够 要看过去多年的数据 要看使用的量

第四段 关于能耗 要看使用量以及气候环境

第五段 关于员工稳定性 要看这样对经营成本的影响 会不会影响劳动力成本和工人积极性

第六段 副总裁为什么会忽略 Alpha 公司更低成本的承诺 指出通常这种承诺是基于细致计算的 需要专家来评估 不能仅仅因为以前的记录而忽略

第七段 总结

assumption 1: the higher building cost and maintenance expenses are due to the less competence of Zeta

- maybe the labor cost is higher
- maybe the building was more heavily used
- perhaps the raw materials are more expensive due to the transportation costs

assumption 2: Alpha's buildings always consume less energy

- maybe Alpha do not have better green technology
- the climate helps save energy
- the building is less heavily used

assumption 3: the stable workforce necessarily work more efficiently and effectively

- job security may provide less motivation for workers
- no opportunity for the company to hire new talents
- the HR of the company may be incompetent

---

70. The following appeared in a memo from a vice president of a large, highly diversified company.

"Ten years ago our company had two new office buildings constructed as regional headquarters for two regions. The buildings were erected by different construction companies—Alpha and Zeta. Although the two buildings had identical floor plans, the building constructed by Zeta cost 30 percent more to build. However, that building's expenses for maintenance last year were only half those of Alpha's. Furthermore, the energy consumption of the Zeta building has been lower than that of the Alpha building every year since its construction. Such data indicate that we should use Zeta rather than Alpha for our contemplated new building project, even though Alpha's bid promises lower construction costs."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

71. The following is a letter to the editor of the *Waymarsh Times*.

"Traffic here in Waymarsh is becoming a problem. Although just three years ago a state traffic survey showed that the typical driving commuter took 20 minutes to get to work, the commute now takes closer to 40 minutes, according to the survey just completed. Members of the town council already have suggested more road building to address the problem, but as well as being expensive, the new construction will surely disrupt some of our residential neighborhoods. It would be better to follow the example of the nearby city of Garville. Last year Garville implemented a policy that rewards people who share rides to work, giving them coupons for free gas. Pollution levels in Garville have dropped since the policy was implemented, and people from Garville tell me that commuting times have fallen considerably. There is no reason why a policy like Garville's shouldn't work equally well in Waymarsh."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

全文示范

部分同学写这篇的时候问题较多。有同学希望我讲一下 argument 的中间段如何展开。我在这里试下分析这篇示范。

According to the letter, Waymarsh should introduce a policy similar to that of Garville to encourage more drivers to share rides with others to solve a perceived traffic problem. This policy will be better than the road building project proposed by the city council. To evaluate this argument, we need more evidence about the surveys indicating the traffic problem, the policy implemented in Garville that is now proposed for Waymarsh, as well as its strengths and weaknesses relative to the road construction plan.

首先主旨句用 we need more evidence about A, B as well as C 的句型 分别呼应中间三段

To begin with, we need to examine the surveys more critically to decide if there is indeed a traffic problem in Waymarsh. We need to know more about how participants were recruited in the two respective surveys to determine if the results are comparable. Maybe one survey focused more on one group of people who go to work at 6 am and the other on those travelling at 8 am. Under such circumstances, the difference in commute time does not mean the traffic in Waymarsh had turned worse. Also, it is important to look into how reliable the self-reported data about commute time was in both surveys. Drivers do not necessarily recall how much time they spent commuting accurately and their estimation can deviate considerably from the reality. If the survey authors did not collect other data to verify the results, the conclusion based on the surveys would be

questionable. If Waymarsh traffic has no problem, there is no need to introduce the proposed policy.

主题句这里提出关注的重点在于究竟交通有没有问题

We need to know more about how participants were recruited in the two respective surveys to determine if the results are comparable. 这句话是回应题目的要求 需要什么证据 其实就是需要什么信息

Maybe one survey focused more on one group of people who go to work at 6 am and the other on those travelling at 8am. 接下来提出某种可能性

Under such circumstances, the difference in commute time does not mean the traffic in Waymarsh had turned worse. 然后指出这种情况下 会发生什么 往往是和原题相反或矛盾的情况

Also, it is important to look into how reliable the self-reported data about commute time was in both surveys. 再回应题目 另一种需要的信息

Drivers do not necessarily recall how much time they spent commuting accurately and their estimation can deviate considerably from the reality. 再提出其他可能性

If the survey authors did not collect other data to verify the results, the conclusion based on the surveys would be questionable. 指出这种可能性下 结论不成立 If Waymarsh traffic has no problem, there is no need to introduce the proposed policy. 最后呼应主题句, 指出这个点和原文论证某个基础的关系

由此可见本段基本上就是

- 1 提出需要的证据
- 2 提出其他可能性
- 3 指出这种可能性成立对原论证的影响

这样一个三步循环

我想我大部分的 argument 都是依照这个套路的 具体还要再找些文章来验证一下

In addition, we need to collect more information about how the policy has changed the traffic in Garville and how a similar policy will affect people's behaviors in Waymarsh.

The fact that pollution levels dropped does not necessarily imply that the policy had reduced the traffic and the amount of exhaust in Garville. Maybe when the policy was introduced more draconian measures were also taken to reduce pollution caused by factories in Garville. Also, it was not clear that the commuting time have decreased for most of Garville drivers and passengers based on the anecdotal evidence that the author of the letter collected through casual conversation with some people in Garville. More systematic data collection is necessary to evaluate the effectiveness of the policy in

Garville. Meanwhile, we do not know how attractive the coupons would seem to the Waymarsh drivers. Maybe the income level is much higher among Waymarsh residents that the small amount of saving from the coupons would not create enough incentives for them to give up their privacy and share rides with strangers. Likewise, maybe Waymarsh drivers and passengers are more concerned with safety and reluctant to share rides despite the financial rewards. Unless we know more about Waymarsh drivers and commuters' attitudes towards the policy, we cannot be sure whether the policy will work in Waymarsh.

In addition, we need to collect more information about how the policy has changed the traffic in Garville and how a similar policy will affect people's behaviors in Waymarsh. 这句话还是回应题目要求指出需要哪方面的证据或信息

注意主旨句中说的是 the policy implemented in Garville that is now proposed for Waymarsh

这里就更细致的展开 但是还是围绕 policy 来说的

The fact that pollution levels dropped does not necessarily imply that the policy had reduced the traffic and the amount of exhaust in Garville. 这句话有同学觉得读起来有些复杂 主要是主语和宾语都是从句 然后 imply 这个词可能不太熟悉

但这个 The fact that ... does not necessarily imply that ... 的句型还是挺有用的

这里是质疑原题对某个事实潜在的诠释

Maybe when the policy was introduced more draconian measures were also taken to reduce pollution caused by factories in Garville.

这句提出其他可能性

Also, it was not clear that the commuting time have decreased for most of Garville drivers and passengers based on the anecdotal evidence that the author of the letter collected through casual conversation with some people in Garville.

这里质疑原题中的证据的可靠性

More systematic data collection is necessary to evaluate the effectiveness of the policy in Garville.

提出需要更多的数据

Meanwhile, we do not know how attractive the coupons would seem to the Waymarsh drivers.

提出另一个问题 开始回应主题句中 how a similar policy will affect people's behaviors in Waymarsh.

Maybe the income level is much higher among Waymarsh residents that the small amount of saving from the coupons would not create enough incentives for them to give up their privacy and share rides with strangers.

提出其他可能性

Likewise, maybe Waymarsh drivers and passengers are more concerned with safety and reluctant to share rides despite the financial rewards.

再提出其他可能性

Unless we know more about Waymarsh drivers and commuters' attitudes towards the policy, we cannot be sure whether the policy will work in Waymarsh.

总结第二点

Finally, we need to compare the cost and benefits of the ride sharing policy with the proposed road construction project. It is true that some neighborhood will have to live with noise and disruption for a few months when the road is built. But this disruption can be measured quantitatively by offering the affected residents some monetary compensation. On the other hand, the gas coupons will also cost money, not to mention the extra police forces that might be necessary to ensure the safety of people who share rides with strangers. Ultimately, we need to calculate the total costs of both proposals and compared them with the benefits of each in terms of time that can be saved for commuting. Unless we have more quantitative data about the cost and benefit of both solutions, it is difficult for us to decide which one is more desirable.

Finally, we need to compare the cost and benefits of the ride sharing policy with the proposed road construction project.

这里已经看不到 we need more information about 的句型 但是提出要比较其实也需要收集数据或证据

It is true that some neighborhood will have to live with noise and disruption for a few months when the road is built.

先对原题的事实作出回应和让步

But this disruption can be measured quantitatively by offering the affected residents some monetary compensation.

这里是经济学的思考方式 所有的东西都换算成货币

这个写法可能稍微有点难 不过 argument 有不少内容和经济学还是有关系的

On the other hand, the gas coupons will also cost money, not to mention the extra police forces that might be necessary to ensure the safety of people who share rides with strangers.

指出另一个方案的成本 除了明显的成本 还有隐形成本 呼应前面提到的安全问题

Ultimately, we need to calculate the total costs of both proposals and compared them with the benefits of each in terms of time that can be saved for commuting.

基于前面对两种方案成本的分析 提出需要计算总的成本进行比较

Unless we have more quantitative data about the cost and benefit of both solutions, it is difficult for us to decide which one is more desirable.

最后总结 提出需要定量数据

(其实这也是文科越来越不值钱的原因 大数据时代 磨嘴皮已经没什么意思 建模 写代码才是王道)

我的提纲里提到 50 年 但实际示范中并没有写这个点 具体怎么写大家自己决定

In conclusion, while the proposed policy seems useful, we need to collect more information to address the issues discussed above to evaluate the soundness of the argument.

---

## 72.The following appeared as a letter to the editor of a national newspaper.

"Your recent article on corporate downsizing\* in Elthyria maintains that the majority of competent workers who have lost jobs as a result of downsizing face serious economic hardship, often for years, before finding other suitable employment. But this claim is undermined by a recent report on the Elthyrian economy, which found that since 1999 far more jobs have been created than have been eliminated, bringing the unemployment rate in Elthyria to its lowest level in decades. Moreover, two-thirds of these newly created jobs have been in industries that tend to pay above-average wages, and the vast majority of these jobs are full-time."

\*Downsizing is the process whereby corporations deliberately make themselves smaller, reducing the number of their employees.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

提纲:

Information about who get the new jobs created and the skills required for the new jobs

- maybe the new jobs require new skills that the laid-off workers do not have
- perhaps the new jobs have been taken by newcomers or immigrants

Information about the actual pay of the new jobs taken by the laid-off workers

- maybe the new jobs pay less despite the fact that the industry tends to pay above the average wages
- what about the other one-third

- maybe the laid-off workers end up with the part-time jobs

Information about the employment and economic situation of the workers who have been laid off

- the best way to test the claim made in the article is to look at what happened to the workers who had been laid off
- how long did it take for them to get new jobs
- how well paid were they compared to earlier jobs

---

73. The following appeared on the Mozart School of Music Web site.

"The Mozart School of Music should be the first choice for parents considering enrolling their child in music lessons. First of all, the Mozart School welcomes youngsters at all ability and age levels; there is no audition to attend the school. Second, the school offers instruction in nearly all musical instruments as well a wide range of styles and genres from classical to rock. Third, the faculty includes some of the most distinguished musicians in the area. Finally, many Mozart graduates have gone on to become well-known and highly paid professional musicians."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

提纲:

Assumption 1: the diversity of the student body and the absence of audition are necessarily good for the children

- maybe audition can help children decide which program should be chosen or whether music courses are suitable for the children
- perhaps the school may end up with children not suitable for learning music and the quality of learning may be compromised

Assumption 2: the school offers quality instructions on all instruments and genres including the one that the particular child needs

- perhaps the school has faculty that is very good at piano and classical music but not so good at guitar or rock music
- what if a child needs instructions on guitar or rock music

Assumption 3: distinguished musicians are necessarily good teachers that children need

- maybe they are not experienced in teaching children
- perhaps they only show up a few times each semester
- maybe their expertise does not match the need of the children

Assumption 4: all the children are interested in becoming famous and rich musicians

- maybe some children just want to learn music for fun

- perhaps not all children are talented enough to pursue a career in music

---

74. The president of Grove College has recommended that the college abandon its century-old tradition of all-female education and begin admitting men. Pointing to other all-female colleges that experienced an increase in applications after adopting coeducation, the president argues that coeducation would lead to a significant increase in applications and enrollment. However, the director of the alumnae association opposes the plan. Arguing that all-female education is essential to the very identity of the college, the director cites annual surveys of incoming students in which these students say that the school's all-female status was the primary reason they selected Grove. The director also points to a survey of Grove alumnae in which a majority of respondents strongly favored keeping the college all female. (74/147/148/149/156)

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

示范: According to the president of Grove College, admitting male students will increase the number of applicants and enrolled students. On the other hand, the alum association director uses data from survey of incoming students and alumnae to oppose the recommendation. Questions have to be answered regarding how comparable Grove is to other all-female colleges, the attitudes of prospective students, current students, faculty members and alumnae in order to evaluate the argument.

We do not know for sure if switching to a co-educational college will indeed increase both applications and enrolment. It may or may not be useful to compare Grove to other all-female colleges which recently made the move. Maybe the other colleges have introduced certain changes, e.g. hiring more first-rate faculty members or building new dorms, that have attracted more applicants. The increase of applications under such circumstances would have nothing to do with the change to co-education. We also need to know how attractive Grove is to the male prospective students compared to other colleges. If other colleges have some attractive features for male students that Grove does not share, the data from the other colleges would not be relevant for making decisions at Grove.

To address the director's claim that all-female education essentially defines Grove college, we need more information about the attitudes of not just incoming students and alumnae but also current students, faculty members, employers and the entire society. Of course, the survey on incoming students and alumnae over this issue need some improvement in terms of sampling and question design. It is important to get a sufficiently large sample



of randomly selected respondents in order to gather valid and reliable data. In addition, we also need to know what current students, faculty members, employers and other members of the society associated with the college think of Grove being an all-female college. Their attitudes and values about single-sex education are important for deciding if Grove can afford losing the status of an all-female college.

Finally, it is also important to review the capacity of the college and the quality of prospective male applicants that Grove would expect if switching to a co-educational college. If the college does not have extra space and teaching capacity to accommodate more students in the near future, expected increase in enrolment would not be desirable for Grove and could not be used to justify the recommendation. Meanwhile, we may have to predict how strong the applications of male students are compared to their female counterparts. If for whatever reasons, the male applicants for Grove would not be as competitive as females, the change would unlikely increase the enrolment, either.

In sum, in order to evaluate the arguments for and against the recommendation, we need to answer the questions about the validity of the survey, the attitudes of other stakeholders, the specific circumstances of Grove college with respect to admission applications.

---

**75. The following appeared in a letter to the editor of a Batavia newspaper.**

"The department of agriculture in Batavia reports that the number of dairy farms throughout the country is now 25 percent greater than it was 10 years ago. During this same time period, however, the price of milk at the local Excello Food Market has increased from \$1.50 to over \$3.00 per gallon. To prevent farmers from continuing to receive excessive profits on an apparently increased supply of milk, the Batavia government should begin to regulate retail milk prices. Such regulation is necessary to ensure fair prices for consumers."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

**提纲:**

Information about the customers of Old Dairy

- maybe the Old Dairy serve a group of people that are not surveyed
- perhaps the customers only buy the products for special events such as birthday or wedding

actual sales records of low-fat products and Old Dairy products

- respondents may behave differently from their answers

- do low-fat products sell well
- do Old Dairy products sell well

whether Old Dairy plan to or is able to introduce low-fat products

- maybe the company had recognized the problem and planned to introduce low-fat products
- or the company is flexible enough to respond to the change of market

whether the stock price necessarily reflects the value of the company

- maybe the overall economy is good and the investors are optimistic
- perhaps the government is manipulating the stock market

---

#### 76. The following appeared in a newsletter offering advice to investors.

"Over 80 percent of the respondents to a recent survey indicated a desire to reduce their intake of foods containing fats and cholesterol, and today low-fat products abound in many food stores. Since many of the food products currently marketed by Old Dairy Industries are high in fat and cholesterol, the company's sales are likely to diminish greatly and company profits will no doubt decrease. We therefore advise Old Dairy stockholders to sell their shares, and other investors not to purchase stock in this company."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the advice and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the advice.

提纲:

Information about the customers of Old Dairy

- maybe the Old Dairy serve a group of people that are not surveyed
- perhaps the customers only buy the products for special events such as birthday or wedding

actual sales records of low-fat products and Old Dairy products

- respondents may behave differently from their answers
- do low-fat products sell well
- do Old Dairy products sell well

whether Old Dairy plan to or is able to introduce low-fat products

- maybe the company had recognized the problem and planned to introduce low-fat products
- or the company is flexible enough to respond to the change of market

whether the stock price necessarily reflects the value of the company

- maybe the overall economy is good and the investors are optimistic
- perhaps the government is manipulating the stock market

---

77. The following recommendation appeared in a memo from the mayor of the town of Hopewell. (77/169)

"Two years ago, the nearby town of Ocean View built a new municipal golf course and resort hotel. During the past two years, tourism in Ocean View has increased, new businesses have opened there, and Ocean View's tax revenues have risen by 30 percent. Therefore, the best way to improve Hopewell's economy—and generate additional tax revenues—is to build a golf course and resort hotel similar to those in Ocean View."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

169) The following appeared in a memo from the mayor of Brindleburg to the city council. Two years ago, the town of Seaside Vista opened a new municipal golf course and resort hotel. Since then, the Seaside Vista Tourism Board has reported a 20% increase in visitors. In addition, local banks reported a steep rise in the number of new business loan applications they received this year. The amount of tax money collected by Seaside Vista has also increased, allowing the town to announce plans to improve Seaside Vista's roads and bridges. We recommend building a similar golf course and resort hotel in Brindleburg. We predict that this project will generate additional tax revenue that the city can use to fund much-needed public improvements.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

示范: The mayor recommends the construction of a golf course and a resort hotel in town to generate more tax revenue for financing infrastructure improvements. By citing the example of the town Seaside Vista who made similar moves, he argues that the projects will attract more visitors, stimulate local business activities and help the local government collect more money. We need to answer a number of questions about the resources for tourism, the economic structure and the taxation policies of Brindleburg to evaluate the argument.

To begin with, we do not know whether the golf course and resort hotel will attract many visitors to Brindleburg. The success of Seaside Vista may be closely related to some

characteristics of the town, e.g. the beautiful scenery and the geographical proximity to sea. Whether or not Brindleburg has the similar resources for tourism to attract the visitors is an important question for further investigation. Without such resources, it may be difficult for Brindleburg to attract tourists relying on the golf course and resort hotel alone. Other factors such as infrastructure, safety and climate of the town also need to be taken into account to see whether tourists would find the new golf course and resort appealing. Another important question we want to ask is whether the 20% increase in visitors can actually be attributed to the construction of golf course and resort. If the increase is more associated with some conferences held in the town, for example, the argument would be severely undermined.

The mayor seems to reason that the increase in the number of loan applications must be strong evidence of economic growth which may then increase the tax revenue. The reasoning may or may not be valid depending on answers to the following questions. First, what are the main reasons why businesses apply for loan? If they need money to expand their businesses in response to higher demand from more visitors, maybe the government can collect more taxes from increased business activities. Alternatively, the business loans may be more closely related to economic recession as local businesses need more money to survive the poorly performing economy. Or the loans are for businesses completely unrelated to tourism. In addition, we may need to ask questions about the tax laws applicable to the local government. Specifically, can the government levy taxes on the expected increased business activities related to booming tourism and precisely how much more tax money can be collected? If the tax laws do not give the government the authorities to collect taxes on certain activities, then the prediction will not be accurate.

The final question we need to ask: where did Seaside Vista government collect the extra tax money? While tax revenue increased after the construction of golf course and resort, it does not follow that these two events were casually related. Maybe the government has got more tax money from sources other than tourism, e.g. a new manufacturing factory has been built that generated more tax money.

To sum up, we need to investigate more deeply the questions discussed above and get more information about the project in order to evaluate the recommendation.

---

The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of a food distribution company with food storage warehouses in several cities. (78/114/116/117)

"Recently, we signed a contract with the Fly-Away Pest Control Company to provide pest control services at our fast-food warehouse in Palm City, but last month we discovered that over \$20,000 worth of food there had been destroyed by pest damage. Meanwhile, the Buzzoff Pest Control Company, which we have used for many years, continued to service our warehouse in Winterville, and last month only \$10,000 worth of the food stored there had been destroyed by pest damage. Even though the price charged by Fly-Away is considerably lower, our best means of saving money is to return to Buzzoff for all our pest control services."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

示范: In the memo, it is argued that Buzzoff should be selected over Fly-away as the pest control service provider to reduce pest damage. In order to assess the conclusion, we need more evidence about the past performance of the two companies, the two warehouses and detailed costs of pest control and projected loss.

It is over simplistic to conclude that Buzzoff is more effective in pest control than Fly-away based on the fact that the loss at Buzzoff site is smaller than the warehouse served by Fly-away. One important factor to consider is the total value of the goods stored in the two warehouses. With this information, we can then calculate the percentage of loss relative to the total value and assess the effectiveness of the two pest control services. Another issue we need to consider is the different kinds of pests and food found in the two warehouses. Maybe Fly-away has lost more goods simply because the pests they need to handle are more challenging or the food is more vulnerable. More detailed comparative analysis is needed before drawing a conclusion.

In addition, it is inadequate to compare just one month's record of servicing one warehouse. To get a more comprehensive picture of the competence of the two companies, we need to review the pest control records of the two companies in the past 10-20 years. We should get as much data as possible about how the two companies performed in pest control in order to predict the loss of food caused by pest if a given company is hired.

Finally, we also need more precise information about the pricing of the two companies and other costs such as human resources required to cooperate with the companies. With more detailed information about the prices and other costs, along with the predicted loss, we can then decide which company could provide the least costly services.

---

79. Since those issues of *Newsbeat* magazine that featured political news on their front cover were the poorest-selling issues over the past three years, the publisher of *Newsbeat* has recommended that the magazine curtail its emphasis on politics to focus more exclusively on economics and personal finance. She points to a recent survey of readers of general interest magazines that indicates greater reader interest in economic issues than in political ones. *Newsbeat's* editor, however, opposes the proposed shift in editorial policy, pointing out that very few magazines offer extensive political coverage anymore.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

提纲: the reasons why the issues featuring political news did not sell well

- maybe the editorial and writing staff did not do a good job
- perhaps the particular issue are not interesting
- the front cover was poorly designed (not attractive enough)

the usefulness of the survey results in making decisions

- whether *Newsbeat* is considered a general interest magazine
- whether the survey respondents could represent the target readers of *Newsbeat*
- whether the line between economic and political issues could be clearly drawn in readers' minds

the reasons why extensive political coverage is not popular anymore

- other magazines do not have the experts on these issues (maybe *Newsbeat* has some advantages to occupy the niche)
- readers switch to other channels such as social media for such information (maybe *Newsbeat* should give up this topic as well)

---

80. The following is taken from a memo from the advertising director of the Super Screen Movie Production Company.

"According to a recent report from our marketing department, during the past year, fewer people attended Super Screen-produced movies than in any other year. And yet the percentage of positive reviews by movie reviewers about specific Super Screen movies actually increased during the past year. Clearly, the contents of these reviews are not reaching enough of our prospective viewers. Thus, the problem lies not with the quality of our movies but with the public's lack of awareness that movies of good quality are available. Super Screen should therefore allocate a greater share of its budget next year to reaching the public through advertising."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

提纲: the reasons why fewer attended the movies

- maybe the number of movies produced last year was smaller than earlier years
- perhaps some movies have been distributed online without authorization
- the audience found the movies last year not attractive

audience care about what reviewers have to say

- perhaps the reviewers evaluated the movies from perspectives that are not shared by the general audience
- general audience are interested in a different set of features (good-looking movie stars; romance; thrilling plot)

more money on advertising can help spread the words

- maybe it is not the amount of money that matters, rather where the money should be spent (social media rather than newspaper)
- the advertising agent should be fired (not doing a good job)

---

81. The following appeared in a business magazine.

"As a result of numerous complaints of dizziness and nausea on the part of consumers of Promofoods tuna, the company requested that eight million cans of its tuna be returned for testing. Promofoods concluded that the canned tuna did not, after all, pose a health risk. This conclusion is based on tests performed on samples of the recalled cans by chemists from Promofoods; the chemists found that of the eight food chemicals most commonly blamed for causing symptoms of dizziness and nausea, five were not found in any of the tested cans. The chemists did find small amounts of the three remaining suspected chemicals but pointed out that these occur naturally in all canned foods."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be addressed in order to decide whether the conclusion and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to the questions would help to evaluate the conclusion.

示范: conclusion: canned tuna did not pose a health risk

evidence: samples of the recalled cans

8 food chemicals blamed for dizziness and nausea (5 not found)

3 chemicals found in small amount (naturally ; natural level)

The company argued that the tuna in question was safe based on the results of chemical analysis of the sample. While the conclusion is what the company wished for, there are a number of questions about the impartiality of the chemists, the sampling method, the amount of the 3 chemicals and other possible causes of symptoms that we need to investigate before we could accept the conclusion.

To begin with, we need to know if the chemists from the company were able to conduct the tests independently and professionally. Since the company's reputation is at stake, it is important to look into whether the chemists conducting the tests may have the incentives to manipulate the tests to help produce results that are in favor of the company. It is important to check, for example, if the chemists had received any pecuniary benefits from the company. Or maybe they are under the pressure from the top management to release a report that would relieve the company from any liability.

We also need to know more about the sampling methodology to evaluate the validity of the result. The key issue here is each can recalled must have the equal opportunity to be sampled. If certain groups of cans are more likely than other groups to be selected for testing, the results would not accurately reflect the condition of all cans. Various sampling methods could be chosen to ensure the validity of the test, e.g. systematic sampling. But we need to know the proper measures have been taken to collect the samples in a professional way.



Another question we need to ask is whether there are chemicals other than the group of 8 that might lead to the symptoms of dizziness and nausea. There might be some chemicals that are less well known but will cause the said symptoms. Focusing on the 8 chemicals alone, the chemists may overlook the other potential causes of the symptoms. In addition, the symptoms of dizziness and nausea may be a result of some more serious medical conditions, e.g. Hepatitis A, which might be caused by some contaminated cans. If this is the case, it would be inadequate to focus on the chemicals known for causing the symptoms directly. A more thorough medical check-up would help better understand the conditions of the victims and help pinpoint the source of the problems.

The final question to ask is about the amount of the 3 chemicals found in the samples. It may be true that such chemicals “occur naturally in all canned foods”. But what really matters is whether the amount of the chemicals have exceeded the threshold of safety. Even if the amount of each individual chemical may be within the safe zone, we need to know whether the cumulative harm caused by all three chemicals may reach a tipping point leading to the symptoms. More in-depth analyses of the 3 chemicals, both quantitative and qualitative, are necessary to determine if they are related to the accidents.

In conclusion, it is probably more reasonable to commission a group of independent analyst to study the canned food in question following the proper measures of random sampling. The questions discussed above will have to be answered to determine if the conclusion is reasonable.

---

**82. The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of marketing at Dura-Socks, Inc. (56/57/82)**

"A recent study of Dura-Socks customers suggests that our company is wasting the money it spends on its patented Endure manufacturing process, which ensures that our socks are strong enough to last for two years. We have always advertised our use of the Endure process, but the new study shows that despite the socks' durability, our customers, on average, actually purchase new Dura-Socks every three months. Furthermore, customers surveyed in our largest market—northeastern United States cities—say that they most value Dura-Socks' stylish appearance and availability in many colors. These findings suggest that we can increase our profits by discontinuing use of the Endure manufacturing process."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

**83. The following is a letter to the editor of an environmental magazine.**

"In 1975 a wildlife census found that there were seven species of amphibians in Xanadu National Park, with abundant numbers of each species. However, in 2002 only four species of amphibians were observed in the park, and the numbers of each species were drastically reduced. There has been a substantial decline in the numbers of amphibians worldwide, and global pollution of water and air is clearly implicated. The decline of amphibians in Xanadu National Park, however, almost certainly has a different cause: in 1975, trout—which are known to eat amphibian eggs—were introduced into the park."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

**84. The following is a letter to the editor of an environmental magazine.**

"Two studies of amphibians in Xanadu National Park confirm a significant decline in the numbers of amphibians. In 1975 there were seven species of amphibians in the park, and there were abundant numbers of each species. However, in 2002 only four species of amphibians were observed in the park, and the numbers of each species were drastically reduced. One proposed explanation is that the decline was caused by the introduction of trout into the park's waters, which began in 1975. (Trout are known to eat amphibian eggs.)"

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

In the letter, the author cited the two studies conducted in 1975 and 2002 suggesting that the numbers of amphibians had decreased significantly and proposed that such decrease was caused by the introduction of trout. There are a number of alternative explanations for the two different results and the decrease of amphibian population involving issues such as study settings, environmental changes and other possible scenarios.

To begin with, the contrasting results of the two studies may not necessarily be due to the decline of amphibian population in the park. Maybe the 1975 study was conducted in the spring when the amphibians were more active and, as a result, a large number of amphibians of seven species were observed. On the other hand, perhaps the 2002 study was conducted during the winter when many amphibians disappeared due to hibernation or were difficult to spot due to inactivity. The different study settings might explain the gap between the number of species and amphibians observed in the two studies.

Even if there were a significant decline of amphibians in the park from 1975 to 2002, such decline may not result from the introduction of trout. The deterioration of the local environment (e.g. the contamination of water and the worsening of air quality caused by factories nearby) might be responsible for the amphibian population decline. Also the global climate change might also alter the park ecosystem where the amphibians found it not as friendly as back in 1975. Such factors other than the introduction of trout could be the real causes of the reduction of the amphibian population.

More directly related to the proposed explanation about trout is the possibility of cannibalism among the amphibians. Researches have suggested that, under certain circumstances such as space limitation and food shortage, animals of different species including amphibians may be engaged in cannibalism, i.e. eating members of the same or similar species. Maybe due to the fierce competition for living space and food, some amphibians ate their weaker counterparts or their eggs, leading to the significant decline of amphibian population and the number of amphibian species.

In conclusion, the argument has to be evaluated by taking into account the alternative explanations discussed above. Specifically, we need to look into why the results of the two studies were different and, if there were a decline of amphibian population, the different possible causes of such a decline.

---

85. In a study of the reading habits of Waymarsh citizens conducted by the University of Waymarsh, most respondents said that they preferred literary classics as reading material. However, a second study conducted by the same researchers found that the type of book most frequently checked out of each of the public libraries in Waymarsh was the mystery novel. Therefore, it can be concluded that the respondents in the first study had misrepresented their reading habits. (85/87)

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

The author of the argument concludes that the respondents in the first study must have lied about their reading habits as the public library records suggested that mystery novels were more frequently borrowed. We need more information about the library records, the Waymarsh citizens' reading habits and the design of the first survey in order to evaluate the soundness of the argument.

试分析第一段的两句话分别做了什么。

其中第二句话如何与后面的中间段呼应？

To begin with, we need to know more about the records and other aspects of public libraries to see if the reasoning is acceptable. For example, we want to know if the public libraries feature a large collection of literary classics available for the Waymarsh people.

If this genre is simply not available, it would be no surprise that library patrons would turn to mystery novels. Meanwhile, focusing on the frequency of the books being checked out is not sufficient. And maybe the patrons would prefer to keep the literary classics for a longer period of time, thereby reducing the frequency of the books being loaned. We also need to see if patrons have chosen to read literary classics in the reading rooms in the libraries instead of checking the books out.

这个中间段可分为几个点，请分别列出。

这几个点之间是如何过渡的？

In addition, it is also important to look into the reading habits of the people in Waymarsh. Public libraries are by no means the only source of literary classics. Waymarsh people could buy many of the books from the local bookstores or order them online via Amazon or Border. In fact, since a great many of literary classics have become part of the public domain without the restriction of copyright, Waymarsh people can even download e-copies of the books from the Internet for free. So a more comprehensive study of whether Waymarsh people access the literary classics through the above-mentioned sources is necessary to get the information we need to evaluate the argument.

这一段的论述结构和上一段有什么不同？

Finally, we need to scrutinise the first study more critically. For example, how were the respondents sampled for the study and how representative were the respondents relative to the population at Waymarsh? If the study were conducted at high schools or university, which was quite convenient for such study, the respondents would be predominantly young people and the older people at Waymarsh would have been underrepresented in the study. Moreover, was the survey questionnaire carefully designed to include all genres including mystery novel? If the respondents were not given the option mystery novel, it would be unfair to claim that they had misrepresented themselves. After all the respondents could only provide the information requested by the questionnaire.

这一段的论述结构和上面那一段更接近？

In conclusion, to see if the respondents have misrepresented their reading habits, we need more evidence about the public libraries, the reading habits of the Waymarsh residents and the design of the first study.

试根据本文总结出 Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument. 这类题型的写作讨论。

---

86. The following appeared in a memo at XYZ company. (86/90)

"When XYZ lays off employees, it pays Delany Personnel Firm to offer those employees assistance in creating résumés and developing interviewing skills, if they so desire. Laid-off employees have benefited greatly from Delany's services: last year those who used Delany found jobs much more quickly than did those who did not. Recently, it has been proposed that we use the less expensive Walsh Personnel Firm in place of Delany. This would be a mistake because eight years ago, when XYZ was using Walsh, only half of the workers we laid off at that time found jobs within a year. Moreover, Delany is clearly superior, as evidenced by its bigger staff and larger number of branch offices. After all, last year Delany's clients took an average of six months to find jobs, whereas Walsh's clients took nine."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

提纲:

The reasons why employees receiving help from Delany get jobs more quickly

- do their services really make a difference (did their resume look better; interview skills improved)
- or other factors such as motivation, job skills

the reasons why employees working with Walsh could not find jobs within a year

- the overall economy was doing poorly at the time
- the skills of the employees were obsolete

the effect of staff size and branch network on the quality of service

- could employees have more choices over whom to work with (from different branches)
- do the staff members work harder in order to compete against more colleagues
- do the staff members cooperate with one another in a large team to offer better services
- do the staff get more information for finding jobs with a larger network

the reasons why Delany's clients could find jobs more quickly

- maybe their clients are more skilful
- maybe their clients are more committed (willing to pay more)
- perhaps Delany focuses more on the industries where jobs are easier to be found

---

**87. In a study of the reading habits of Waymarsh citizens conducted by the University of**

Waymarsh, most respondents said they preferred literary classics as reading material. However, a second study conducted by the same researchers found that the type of book most frequently checked out of each of the public libraries in Waymarsh was the mystery novel. Therefore, it can be concluded that the respondents in the first study had misrepresented their reading preferences.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

**88. The following appeared in a memorandum written by the vice president of Health**

Naturally, a small but expanding chain of stores selling health food and other health-related products.

"Our previous experience has been that our stores are most profitable in areas where residents are highly concerned with leading healthy lives. We should therefore build one of our new stores in Plainsville, which clearly has many such residents. Plainsville merchants report that sales of running shoes and exercise equipment are at all-time highs. The local health club, which nearly closed five years ago due to lack of business, has more members than ever, and the weight-training and aerobics classes are always full. We can even anticipate a new generation of customers: Plainsville's schoolchildren are required to participate in a program called Fitness for Life, which emphasizes the benefits of regular exercise at an early age." ( 9/88/90)

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

89. The following appeared in a memo at XYZ company. (86/89)

"When XYZ lays off employees, it pays Delany Personnel Firm to offer those employees assistance in creating résumés and developing interviewing skills, if they so desire. Laid-off employees have benefited greatly from Delany's services: last year those who used Delany found jobs much more quickly than did those who did not. Recently, it has been proposed that we use the less expensive Walsh Personnel Firm in place of Delany. This would be a mistake because eight years ago, when XYZ was using Walsh, only half of the workers we laid off at that time found jobs within a year. Moreover, Delany is clearly superior, as evidenced by its bigger staff and larger number of branch offices. After all, last year Delany's clients took an average of six months to find jobs, whereas Walsh's clients took nine."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

90. The following appeared in a memorandum written by the vice president of Health

Naturally, a small but expanding chain of stores selling health food and other health-related products.

"Our previous experience has been that our stores are most profitable in areas where residents are highly concerned with leading healthy lives. We should therefore build one of our new stores in Plainsville, which clearly has many such residents. Plainsville merchants report that sales of running shoes and exercise equipment are at all-time highs. The local health club, which nearly closed five years ago due to lack of business, has more members than ever, and the weight-training and aerobics classes are always full. We can even anticipate a new generation of customers: Plainsville's schoolchildren are required to participate in a program called Fitness for Life, which emphasizes the benefits of regular exercise at an early age." ( 9/88/90)

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

91. Three years ago, because of flooding at the Western Palean Wildlife Preserve, 100

lions and 100 western gazelles were moved to the East Palean Preserve, an area that is home to most of the same species that are found in the western preserve, though in larger numbers, and to the eastern gazelle, a close relative of the western gazelle. The only difference in climate is that the eastern preserve typically has slightly less rainfall. Unfortunately, after three years in the eastern preserve, the imported western gazelle population has been virtually eliminated. Since the slight reduction in rainfall cannot be the cause of the virtual elimination of western gazelle, their disappearance must have been caused by the larger number of predators in the eastern preserve.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

示范: The author argues that the large number of predators must be the main cause of the elimination of western gazelle since the the climate difference is negligible. We need to collect more evidence about three main issues that may affect the fate of western gazelle: the food sources, the predators and the environment.

There is no doubt that western gazelle, like other animals, need abundant food to supply. While the new environment only has slightly less rainfall, it may not sustain the kind of food that western gazelles need to survive. Perhaps western gazelles rely on a kind of vegetation that needs more rainfall or other nourishment that could only be found in the west. Therefore, we need more information about the food supply for western gazelles to better understand the causes of its elimination.

Another important factor we need to consider is the predators that might threaten the western gazelles. It is true that a greater number of lions and other wild carnivores could be the predators of the western gazelles. But it is important to bear in mind that there might be other smaller animals that are easier preys for the predators. If the predators could obtain food from other sources, the western gazelles might be spared.

On the other hand, we also need to look into environmental factors that might cause the elimination of the animals. Maybe the water and air pollution were more severe in the new environment which the western gazelles found difficult to withstand. Or there might be certain germs or virus that wiped out western gazelles. Or perhaps the preserve has been so overcrowded that the western gazelles simply could not establish their own territory to survive.

In order to determine the causes of the disappearance of western gazelles, it is important to collect more information about its food supply, the potential predators and other environmental factors that may affect their livelihood.



92. Workers in the small town of Leeville take fewer sick days than workers in the large city of Masonton, 50 miles away. Moreover, relative to population size, the diagnosis of stress-related illness is proportionally much lower in Leeville than in Masonton. According to the Leeville Chamber of Commerce, these facts can be attributed to the health benefits of the relatively relaxed pace of life in Leeville. (92/101/103)

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

提纲:

Fact 1: Workers in the small town of Leeville take fewer sick days than workers in the large city of Masonton, 50 miles away.

Fact 2: Moreover, relative to population size, the diagnosis of stress-related illness is proportionally much lower in Leeville than in Masonton.

proposed explanation: these facts can be attributed to the health benefits of the relatively relaxed pace of life in Leeville.

explanation related to the environment

- maybe the air quality is much worse in the city which contributes to more conditions in respiratory systems
- perhaps the noise pollution is the main cause of stress-related illnesses

explanation related to the company rules and culture

- maybe the companies in the small town are more lenient about absences (no need to take sick days)
- perhaps workers in the city take more fake sick days

explanation related to health care system

- workers in the city have better access to health care (more are diagnosed with the illness)
- workers in the city have better awareness of mental health (get help and get diagnosed)

---

**93. The following appeared in a memorandum from the manager of WWAC radio station.**

"WWAC must change from its current rock-music format because the number of listeners has been declining, even though the population in our listening area has been growing. The population growth has resulted mainly from people moving to our area after their retirement, and we must make listeners of these new residents. But they seem to have limited interest in music: several local stores selling recorded music have recently closed. Therefore, just changing to another kind of music is not going to increase our audience. Instead, we should adopt a news-and-talk format, a form of radio that is increasingly popular in our area." (17/93)

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

**94. The vice president of human resources at Climpson Industries sent the following recommendation to the company's president. (94/58/34)**

"A recent national survey found that the majority of workers with access to the Internet at work had used company computers for personal or recreational activities, such as banking or playing games. In an effort to improve our employees' productivity, we should implement electronic monitoring of employees' Internet use from their workstations. Using electronic monitoring software is the best way to reduce the number of hours Climpson employees spend on personal or recreational activities. We predict that installing software to monitor employees' Internet use will allow us to prevent employees from wasting time, thereby increasing productivity and improving overall profits."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

---

95. The following appeared in a memo from the new vice president of Sartorian, a company that manufactures men's clothing. (38/95/96)

"Five years ago, at a time when we had difficulty obtaining reliable supplies of high-quality wool fabric, we discontinued production of our popular alpaca overcoat. Now that we have a new fabric supplier, we should resume production. Given the outcry from our customers when we discontinued this product and the fact that none of our competitors offers a comparable product, we can expect pent-up consumer demand for our alpaca coats. This demand and the overall increase in clothing prices will make Sartorian's alpaca overcoats more profitable than ever before."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

96. The following appeared in a memo from the new vice president of Sartorian, a company that manufactures men's clothing. (38/95/96)

"Five years ago, at a time when we had difficulty obtaining reliable supplies of high-quality wool fabric, we discontinued production of our popular alpaca overcoat. Now that we have a new fabric supplier, we should resume production. Given the outcry from our customers when we discontinued this product and the fact that none of our competitors offers a comparable product, we can expect pent-up consumer demand for our alpaca coats. Due to this demand and the overall increase in clothing prices, we can predict that Sartorian's alpaca overcoats will be more profitable than ever before."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

---

97. The following appeared in an e-mail sent by the marketing director of the Classical Shakespeare Theatre of Bardville.

"Over the past ten years, there has been a 20 percent decline in the size of the average audience at Classical Shakespeare Theatre productions. In spite of increased advertising, we are attracting fewer and fewer people to our shows, causing our profits to decrease significantly. We must take action to attract new audience members. The best way to do so is by instituting a 'Shakespeare in the Park' program this summer. Two years ago the nearby Avon Repertory Company started a 'Free Plays in the Park' program, and its profits have increased 10 percent since then. If we start a 'Shakespeare in the Park' program, we can predict that our profits will increase, too."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

reduced audience 是否利润下降的主要原因

Free play in the Park 是不是 Avon 利润上升的主要原因

Shakespeare in the Park 能否取得类似 Avon FPIP 的效果

The marketing director argues that the theatre should introduce a new program known as "Shakespeare in the Park" (SP) in order to increase the profits. We need to ask a number of questions about the causes of decline of profits for CS Theatre, the reasons why Avon's profits increased and whether the proposed program will be as successful as the program of Avon.

To begin with, we are not sure the decline of audience size is the main reason why the profits had decreased. We need to investigate other issues that may affect the profitability of the operation. For example, did the increase of advertising expenses cause the decrease of profits? Or maybe the overhead expenses of the CS theatre were out of control. If these are the cases, more efforts should be made to reduce expenses rather than introducing new program to attract audience.

In the meantime, we need to ask if Free Play in the Park (FPP) program actually led to the increase of profits for Avon. The name "Free Play in the Park" seems to imply that the program would offer free admission to the plays in order to attract more audience. It is not clear how a program like this can directly increase the profits. Maybe Avon had taken other measures to boost its profit level while the program was introduced. For example, they might hire a new manager to effectively control different expenses. Or maybe they had reduced the advertising expenses by switching from more expensive traditional media marketing to less costly new media marketing. If Avon had achieved

profit increase through other methods, then the proposal to adopting a similar program may not produce desirable outcome.

Finally, even if FPP has increased the profits for Avon in a somewhat mysterious way, we need to ask if the proposed program SP is similar enough to FPP to help the CS theatre to increase the profit. Again, the name of FPP suggests that the program may feature a variety of plays of different themes, which may appeal to a broader group of audiences. Shakespeare in the Park, on the other hand, will offer a limited range of programs based on works by Shakespeare. Of course, we need to take into account the extra cost of the new program that can further affect the balance sheet. If SP program cannot attract more audience and increase profits as FPP did, the recommendation would not be reasonable.

In conclusion, it is not clear attracting more audience is the key for profitability of the CS theatre. Nor is it certain that the FPP program was the main reason why Avon increased the profits. Moreover, we do not know if SP could be as successful as FPP. In order to evaluate the recommendation, therefore, the questions discussed above have to be answered through further investigation.

---

**98. The following is a recommendation from the business manager of Monarch Books.**

"Since its opening in Collegeville twenty years ago, Monarch Books has developed a large customer base due to its reader-friendly atmosphere and wide selection of books on all subjects. Last month, Book and Bean, a combination bookstore and coffee shop, announced its intention to open a Collegeville store. Monarch Books should open its own in-store café in the space currently devoted to children's books. Given recent national census data indicating a significant decline in the percentage of the population under age ten, sales of children's books are likely to decline. By replacing its children's books section with a café, Monarch Books can increase profits and ward off competition from Book and Bean." (7/98/99)

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

**99. The following is a recommendation from the business manager of Monarch Books.**

"Since its opening in Collegeville twenty years ago, Monarch Books has developed a large customer base due to its reader-friendly atmosphere and wide selection of books on all subjects. Last month, Book and Bean, a combination bookstore and coffee shop, announced its intention to open a Collegeville store. Monarch Books should open its own in-store café in the space currently devoted to children's books. Given recent national

census data indicating a significant decline in the percentage of the population under age ten, sales of children's books are likely to decline. By replacing its children's books section with a café, Monarch Books can increase profits and ward off competition from Book and Bean."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

100. The following was written as a part of an application for a small-business loan by a group of developers in the city of Monroe. (25/100/102/164)

"Jazz music is extremely popular in the city of Monroe: over 100,000 people attended Monroe's annual jazz festival last summer, and the highest-rated radio program in Monroe is 'Jazz Nightly,' which airs every weeknight. Also, a number of well-known jazz musicians own homes in Monroe. Nevertheless, the nearest jazz club is over an hour away. Given the popularity of jazz in Monroe and a recent nationwide study indicating that the typical jazz fan spends close to \$1,000 per year on jazz entertainment, a jazz music club in Monroe would be tremendously profitable."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

**101. There is now evidence that the relaxed pace of life in small towns promotes better**

health and greater longevity than does the hectic pace of life in big cities. Businesses in the small town of Leeville report fewer days of sick leave taken by individual workers than do businesses in the nearby large city of Masonton. Furthermore, Leeville has only one physician for its one thousand residents, but in Masonton the proportion of physicians to residents is five times as high. Finally, the average age of Leeville residents is significantly higher than that of Masonton residents. These findings suggest that people seeking longer and healthier lives should consider moving to small communities. (92/101/103)

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

The conclusion that people should move to small towns for longer and healthier lives is based on the comparison of two cases- Leeville and Masonton. A number of assumptions about why Leeville businesses reported fewer instances of sick leave, Leeville has fewer physicians and residents of older ages have been made and need to be examined critically in order to decide if the argument is valid.

It seems to be assumed in the argument that fewer days of sick leave taken by workers in Leeville indicate that people there enjoy better health. Yet, there might be other interpretations of the fact. For example, perhaps the businesses in the small town have more relaxing attendance policies. As result, workers could take a few days off when they are sick without formally applying for sick leaves. If this is the case, the number of sick leave reported by the businesses in Leeville may not accurately reflect the general health conditions of the Leeville residents. Also, due to the fact that fewer physicians are available in Leeville per resident, it probably takes more time and money to see a doctor, thereby deterring some people from taking sick leaves. Workers in Masonton might take more sick leaves simply because the businesses Masonton provided better health insurance coverage for its employees.

It is further assumed that Leeville has lower physician-to-residents ratio because people there are healthier and do not need as many physicians. This assumption may not hold as other explanations for the lower ratio might be more reasonable. As mentioned earlier, it is possible that Masonton businesses spend more money on health insurance for employees, thereby creating a stronger demand for physicians in the city. On the supply side, perhaps more physicians choose to work in Masonton due to the higher income level, higher standard of living and better infrastructure for health care. With better access to physicians and other health care resources, perhaps Masonton residents would enjoy better health and longer lives than those in Leeville.

The third assumption is that the higher average age of Leeville residents necessarily means that residents there can live longer lives. Perhaps Leeville is a town more friendly to older people for a number of reasons. For one thing, it is possible that the town offers cheaper nursing homes for the elderly, thereby attracting more older people to move in. It is also possible that due to limited job opportunities available in Leeville, most younger people have left the town, leaving behind the older residents and driving up the average age. We need to collect more information about why the average age of Leeville residents is older to decide if Leeville offers a better environment for living long lives.

The final assumption made in the argument is that Leeville and Masonton are typical communities that can represent the small towns and large cities that the readers have to choose for where to live. This assumption may not hold true as large cities and small towns across the US can be very different in terms of environment, infrastructure and economic development. The characteristics of Leeville and Masonton in terms of age of population, physician-to-resident ratio and number of sick leaves may not be found in other small towns and big cities. A comparison of two cases can hardly support the general conclusion reached at the end of the argument.

Overall speaking, the assumptions discussed above should be carefully examined in light of more evidence and information to decide if the conclusion is reasonable.

---

102. The following was written as a part of an application for a small-business loan by a group of developers in the city of Monroe. (25/100/102/164)

"Jazz music is extremely popular in the city of Monroe: over 100,000 people attended Monroe's annual jazz festival last summer, and the highest-rated radio program in Monroe is 'Jazz Nightly,' which airs every weeknight. Also, a number of well-known jazz musicians own homes in Monroe. Nevertheless, the nearest jazz club is over an hour away. Given the popularity of jazz in Monroe and a recent nationwide study indicating that the typical jazz fan spends close to \$1,000 per year on jazz entertainment, we predict that our new jazz music club in Monroe will be a tremendously profitable enterprise."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.



---

103. There is now evidence that the relaxed pace of life in small towns promotes better

health and greater longevity than does the hectic pace of life in big cities. Businesses in the small town of Leeville report fewer days of sick leave taken by individual workers than do businesses in the nearby large city of Masonton. Furthermore, Leeville has only one physician for its one thousand residents, but in Masonton the proportion of physicians to residents is five times as high. Finally, the average age of Leeville residents is significantly higher than that of Masonton residents. These findings suggest that the relaxed pace of life in Leeville allows residents to live longer, healthier lives. (92/101/103 新增 argument 101 示范在博客 621 楼)

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

---

104. The following appeared in a memo from a vice president of a manufacturing company. (32/104/105/106)

"During the past year, workers at our newly opened factory reported 30 percent more on-the-job accidents than workers at nearby Panoply Industries. Panoply produces products very similar to those produced at our factory, but its work shifts are one hour shorter than ours. Experts say that fatigue and sleep deprivation among workers are significant contributing factors in many on-the-job accidents. Panoply's superior safety record can therefore be attributed to its shorter work shifts, which allow its employees to get adequate amounts of rest."

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

---

105. The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of Butler Manufacturing.

"During the past year, workers at Butler Manufacturing reported 30 percent more on-the-job accidents than workers at nearby Panoply Industries, where the work shifts are one hour shorter than ours. A recent government study reports that fatigue and sleep deprivation among workers are significant contributing factors in many on-the-job accidents. If we shorten each of our work shifts by one hour, we can improve Butler Manufacturing's safety record by ensuring that our employees are adequately rested."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument. (32/104/105/106)

---

106. The following appeared in a memo from the Board of Directors of Butler Manufacturing. (32/104/105/106)

"During the past year, workers at Butler Manufacturing reported 30 percent more on-the-job accidents than workers at nearby Panoply Industries, where the work shifts are one hour shorter than ours. A recent government study reports that fatigue and sleep deprivation among workers are significant contributing factors in many on-the-job accidents. Therefore, we recommend that Butler Manufacturing shorten each of its work shifts by one hour. Shorter shifts will allow Butler to improve its safety record by ensuring that its employees are adequately rested."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

107. The following appeared in a memo from the business manager of a chain of cheese stores located throughout the United States. (66/107/108)

"For many years all the stores in our chain have stocked a wide variety of both domestic and imported cheeses. Last year, however, all of the five best-selling cheeses at our newest store were domestic cheddar cheeses from Wisconsin. Furthermore, a recent survey by *Cheeses of the World* magazine indicates an increasing preference for domestic cheeses among its subscribers. Since our company can reduce expenses by limiting inventory, the best way to improve profits in all of our stores is to discontinue stocking many of our varieties of imported cheese and concentrate primarily on domestic cheeses."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

108. The following appeared in a memo from the owner of a chain of cheese stores located throughout the United States. (66/107/108)

"For many years all the stores in our chain have stocked a wide variety of both domestic and imported cheeses. Last year, however, all of the five best-selling cheeses at our newest store were domestic cheddar cheeses from Wisconsin. Furthermore, a recent survey by *Cheeses of the World* magazine indicates an increasing preference for domestic cheeses among its subscribers. Since our company can reduce expenses by limiting

inventory, the best way to improve profits in all of our stores is to discontinue stocking many of our varieties of imported cheese and concentrate primarily on domestic cheeses."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

109. The following appeared in a memorandum from the general manager of KNOW radio station.

"Several factors indicate that radio station KNOW should shift its programming from rock-and-roll music to a continuous news format. Consider, for example, that the number of people in our listening area over fifty years of age has increased dramatically, while our total number of listeners has declined. Also, music stores in our area report decreased sales of recorded music. Finally, continuous news stations in neighboring cities have been very successful. The switch from rock-and-roll music to 24-hour news will attract older listeners and secure KNOW radio's future."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

提纲:

Assumption 1: the decline of number of listeners is the result of increasing number of older people who do not like rock and roll music

- maybe fewer people listen to the station because they now spend more time on new media such as Spotify
- older listeners may actually enjoy rock-and-roll music by the stars they knew earlier (featuring some old rock-and-roll music may be helpful)

Assumption 2: the decreased sales of recorded music means that people have lost interest in rock-and-roll music

- maybe the recorded music has become too expensive with the decline of disposable income due to poor economy
- people now turn to the Internet for music (radio station needs to design their programs differently to attract more audience)
- perhaps people prefer free music which is good news for the radio station

Assumption 3: the success of the news station can be replicated

- maybe the people in neighboring cities are very different in terms of age, income level and taste

- maybe there is a good news station in KNOW's listening area
- maybe these stations have expertise for news that KNOW does not have

---

110. The following appeared in a memorandum from the manager of KNOW radio station.

"Several factors indicate that KNOW radio can no longer succeed as a rock-and-roll music station. Consider, for example, that the number of people in our listening area over fifty years of age has increased dramatically, while our total number of listeners has declined. Also, music stores in our area report decreased sales of rock-and-roll music. Finally, continuous news stations in neighboring cities have been very successful. We predict that switching KNOW radio from rock-and-roll music to 24-hour news will allow the station to attract older listeners and make KNOW radio more profitable than ever."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

---

111. The following appeared in a memorandum from the owner of Movies Galore, a chain of movie-rental stores. (47/111/112)

"In order to stop the recent decline in our profits, we must reduce operating expenses at Movies Galore's ten movie-rental stores. Since we are famous for our special bargains, raising our rental prices is not a viable way to improve profits. Last month our store in downtown Marston significantly decreased its operating expenses by closing at 6:00 P.M. rather than 9:00 P.M. and by reducing its stock by eliminating all movies released more than five years ago. By implementing similar changes in our other stores, Movies Galore can increase profits without jeopardizing our reputation for offering great movies at low prices."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

112. The following appeared in a memorandum from the owner of Movies Galore, a chain of movie-rental stores. (47/111/112)

"In order to reverse the recent decline in our profits, we must reduce operating expenses at Movies Galore's ten movie-rental stores. Since we are famous for our special bargains, raising our rental prices is not a viable way to improve profits. Last month our store in downtown Marston significantly decreased its operating expenses by closing at 6:00 p.m.

rather than 9:00 p.m. and by reducing its stock by eliminating all movies released more than five years ago. Therefore, in order to increase profits without jeopardizing our reputation for offering great movies at low prices, we recommend implementing similar changes in our other nine Movies Galore stores."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

113. The following is a recommendation from the personnel director to the president of Acme Publishing Company. (113/126/127/161)

"Many other companies have recently stated that having their employees take the Easy Read Speed-Reading Course has greatly improved productivity. One graduate of the course was able to read a 500-page report in only two hours; another graduate rose from an assistant manager to vice president of the company in under a year. Obviously, the faster you can read, the more information you can absorb in a single workday. Moreover, Easy Read would cost Acme only \$500 per employee—a small price to pay when you consider the benefits. Included in this fee is a three-week seminar in Spruce City and a lifelong subscription to the Easy Read newsletter. Clearly, to improve productivity, Acme should require all of our employees to take the Easy Read course."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the advice and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the advice.

提纲:

Question 1: to what extent Acme is similar to the other companies in terms of job nature of the employees and whether speed reading is important for Acme productivity

- maybe the other companies are in other industries where speed reading is more useful such as auditing firms
- whether speed reading is important for Acme employees

Question 2: Can this course really increase the speed of absorbing information

- the graduate who can read 500 pages in 2 hours (how much information does she/he absorb or understand)
- what kinds of materials (similar to those usually read by the staff in a publishing company)

Question 3: is the reading speed really crucial for being promoted and improving productivity for all job positions

- other factors may be more important for someone to get promoted
- other factors may be more important for improving productivity for certain job positions
- money should be spent on these factors

Question 4: will the seminar and newsletter help the employees to improve productivity

- will the employees have the time to attend the seminar
- how useful are the seminar
- how useful are the newsletter
- how long will the newsletter last

---

**114. The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of a food distribution company with food storage warehouses in several cities. (78 114 116 117)**

"Recently, we signed a contract with the Fly-Away Pest Control Company to provide pest control services at our warehouse in Palm City, but last month we discovered that over \$20,000 worth of food there had been destroyed by pest damage. Meanwhile, the Buzzoff Pest Control Company, which we have used for many years in Palm City, continued to service our warehouse in Winterville, and last month only \$10,000 worth of the food stored there had been destroyed by pest damage. Even though the price charged by Fly-Away is considerably lower, our best means of saving money is to return to Buzzoff for all our pest control services."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

**115. The following appeared in a memo from a vice president of a large, highly diversified company. (69/70/115)**

"Ten years ago our company had two new office buildings constructed as regional headquarters for two different regions. The buildings were erected by two different construction companies—Alpha and Zeta. Even though the two buildings had identical floor plans, the building constructed by Zeta cost 30 percent more to build, and its expenses for maintenance last year were twice those of the building constructed by Alpha. Furthermore, the energy consumption of the Zeta building has been higher than that of the Alpha building every year since its construction. Such data, plus the fact that Alpha has a stable workforce with little employee turnover, indicate that we should use Alpha rather than Zeta for our contemplated new building project."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

**116.** The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of a food distribution company with food storage warehouses in several cities. (78 114 116 117)

"Recently, we signed a contract with the Fly-Away Pest Control Company to provide pest control services at our warehouse in Palm City, but last month we discovered that over \$20,000 worth of food there had been destroyed by pest damage. Meanwhile, the Buzzoff Pest Control Company, which we have used for many years in Palm City, continued to service our warehouse in Winterville, and last month only \$10,000 worth of the food stored there had been destroyed by pest damage. This difference in pest damage is best explained by the negligence of Fly-Away."

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

---

**117.** The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of a food distribution company with food storage warehouses in several cities. (78 114 116 117)

"Recently, we signed a contract with the Fly-Away Pest Control Company to provide pest control services at our warehouse in Palm City, but last month we discovered that over \$20,000 worth of food there had been destroyed by pest damage. Meanwhile, the Buzzoff Pest Control Company, which we have used for many years in Palm City, continued to service our warehouse in Winterville, and last month only \$10,000 worth of the food stored there had been destroyed by pest damage. Even though the price charged by Fly-Away is considerably lower, our best means of saving money is to return to Buzzoff for all our pest control services."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

**118. The following appeared as part of an article in a business magazine.** (14/118)

"A recent study rating 300 male and female advertising executives according to the average number of hours they sleep per night showed an association between the amount of sleep the executives need and the success of their firms. Of the advertising firms studied, those whose executives reported needing no more than six hours of sleep per night had higher profit margins and faster growth. On the basis of this study, we recommend that businesses hire only people who need less than six hours of sleep per night."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

**119. Evidence suggests that academic honor codes, which call for students to agree not to**

cheat in their academic endeavors and to notify a faculty member if they suspect that others have cheated, are far more successful than are other methods at deterring cheating among students at colleges and universities. Several years ago, Groveton College adopted such a code and discontinued its old-fashioned system in which teachers closely monitored students. Under the old system, teachers reported an average of thirty cases of cheating per year. In the first year the honor code was in place, students reported twenty-one cases of cheating; five years later, this figure had dropped to fourteen. Moreover, in a recent survey, a majority of Groveton students said that they would be less likely to cheat with an honor code in place than without. (22/119/120/138)

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

---

**120. Several years ago, Groveton College adopted an honor code, which calls for students**

to agree not to cheat in their academic endeavors and to notify a faculty member if they suspect that others have cheated. Groveton's honor code replaced a system in which teachers closely monitored students. Under that system, teachers reported an average of thirty cases of cheating per year. The honor code has proven far more successful: in the first year it was in place, students reported twenty-one cases of cheating; five years later, this figure had dropped to fourteen. Moreover, in a recent survey, a majority of Groveton students said that they would be less likely to cheat with an honor code in place than without. Such evidence suggests that all colleges and universities should adopt honor



codes similar to Groveton's. This change is sure to result in a dramatic decline in cheating among college students.( 22/119/120/138)

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

121.The following appeared in a memo from the director of a large group of hospitals.

"In a controlled laboratory study of liquid hand soaps, a concentrated solution of extra strength UltraClean hand soap produced a 40 percent greater reduction in harmful bacteria than did the liquid hand soaps currently used in our hospitals. During our recent test of regular-strength UltraClean with doctors, nurses, and visitors at our hospital in Worktown, the hospital reported significantly fewer cases of patient infection (a 20 percent reduction) than did any of the other hospitals in our group. Therefore, to prevent serious patient infections, we should supply UltraClean at all hand-washing stations, including those used by visitors, throughout our hospital system."( 62/121/122/124)

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

122.The following appeared in a memo from the director of a large group of hospitals.

"In a controlled laboratory study of liquid hand soaps, a concentrated solution of extra strength UltraClean hand soap produced a 40 percent greater reduction in harmful bacteria than did the liquid hand soaps currently used in our hospitals. During our recent test of regular-strength UltraClean with doctors, nurses, and visitors at our hospital in Worktown, the hospital reported significantly fewer cases of patient infection (a 20 percent reduction) than did any of the other hospitals in our group. The explanation for the 20 percent reduction in patient infections is the use of UltraClean soap."( 62/121/122/124)

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

---

123. The following appeared in a health newsletter. (123/125/41)

"A ten-year nationwide study of the effectiveness of wearing a helmet while bicycling indicates that ten years ago, approximately 35 percent of all bicyclists reported wearing helmets, whereas today that number is nearly 80 percent. Another study, however, suggests that during the same ten-year period, the number of accidents caused by bicycling has increased 200 percent. These results demonstrate that bicyclists feel safer because they are wearing helmets, and they take more risks as a result. Thus, there is clearly a call for the government to strive to reduce the number of serious injuries from bicycle accidents by launching an education program that concentrates on the factors other than helmet use that are necessary for bicycle safety."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

124. The following appeared in a memo from the director of a large group of hospitals.

"In a controlled laboratory study of liquid hand soaps, a concentrated solution of extra strength UltraClean hand soap produced a 40 percent greater reduction in harmful bacteria than did the liquid hand soaps currently used in our hospitals. During our recent test of regular-strength UltraClean with doctors, nurses, and visitors at our hospital in Worktown, the hospital reported significantly fewer cases of patient infection (a 20 percent reduction) than did any of the other hospitals in our group. Therefore, to prevent serious patient infections, we should supply UltraClean at all hand-washing stations, including those used by visitors, throughout our hospital system." (62/121/122/124)

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

125. The following appeared in a health newsletter. (123/125/41)

"A ten-year nationwide study of the effectiveness of wearing a helmet while bicycling indicates that ten years ago, approximately 35 percent of all bicyclists reported wearing helmets, whereas today that number is nearly 80 percent. Another study, however, suggests that during the same ten-year period, the number of accidents caused by bicycling has increased 200 percent. These results demonstrate that bicyclists feel safer because they are wearing helmets, and they take more risks as a result. Thus there is clearly a call for the government to strive to reduce the number of serious injuries from

bicycle accidents by launching an education program that concentrates on the factors other than helmet use that are necessary for bicycle safety."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

126. The following is a recommendation from the personnel director to the president of Acme Publishing Company. (113/126/127/161)

"Many other companies have recently stated that having their employees take the Easy Read Speed-Reading Course has greatly improved productivity. One graduate of the course was able to read a 500-page report in only two hours; another graduate rose from an assistant manager to vice president of the company in under a year. Obviously, the faster you can read, the more information you can absorb in a single workday. Moreover, Easy Read would cost Acme only \$500 per employee—a small price to pay when you consider the benefits. Included in this fee is a three-week seminar in Spruce City and a lifelong subscription to the Easy Read newsletter. Clearly, Acme would benefit greatly by requiring all of our employees to take the Easy Read course."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

127. The following is a recommendation from the personnel director to the president of Acme Publishing Company. (113/126/127/161)

"Many other companies have recently stated that having their employees take the Easy Read Speed-Reading Course has greatly improved productivity. One graduate of the course was able to read a 500-page report in only two hours; another graduate rose from an assistant manager to vice president of the company in under a year. Obviously, the faster you can read, the more information you can absorb in a single workday. Moreover, Easy Read would cost Acme only \$500 per employee—a small price to pay when you consider the benefits. Included in this fee is a three-week seminar in Spruce City and a lifelong subscription to the Easy Read newsletter. Clearly, to improve overall productivity, Acme should require all of our employees to take the Easy Read course."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

128. The following appeared in a letter from the owner of the Sunnyside Towers apartment complex to its manager. (52/128/129)

"One month ago, all the showerheads in the first three buildings of the Sunnyside Towers complex were modified to restrict maximum water flow to one-third of what it used to be. Although actual readings of water usage before and after the adjustment are not yet available, the change will obviously result in a considerable savings for Sunnyside Corporation, since the corporation must pay for water each month. Except for a few complaints about low water pressure, no problems with showers have been reported since the adjustment. Clearly, modifying showerheads to restrict water flow throughout all twelve buildings in the Sunnyside Towers complex will increase our profits further."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

129. The following appeared in a letter from the owner of the Sunnyside Towers apartment complex to its manager. (52/128/129)

"Last week, all the showerheads in the first three buildings of the Sunnyside Towers complex were modified to restrict maximum water flow to one-third of what it used to be. Although actual readings of water usage before and after the adjustment are not yet available, the change will obviously result in a considerable savings for Sunnyside Corporation, since the corporation must pay for water each month. Except for a few complaints about low water pressure, no problems with showers have been reported since the adjustment. Clearly, modifying showerheads to restrict water flow throughout all twelve buildings in the Sunnyside Towers complex will increase our profits further."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

130. The following memorandum is from the business manager of Happy Pancake House restaurants. (130/131/133/15/51)

"Butter has now been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. Only about 2 percent of customers have filed a formal complaint, indicating that an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers cannot distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine. Thus, to avoid the expense of purchasing butter, the Happy Pancake House should extend this cost-saving change to its restaurants throughout the rest of the country."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

131. The following memorandum is from the business manager of Happy Pancake House restaurants. (130/131/133/15/51)

"Butter has now been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. Only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers cannot distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine. Thus, we predict that Happy Pancake House will be able to increase profits dramatically if we extend this cost-saving change to all our restaurants in the southeast and northeast as well."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

---

132. The following appeared in a letter to the school board in the town of Centerville.

"All students should be required to take the driver's education course at Centerville High School. In the past two years, several accidents in and around Centerville have involved teenage drivers. Since a number of parents in Centerville have complained that they are too busy to teach their teenagers to drive, some other instruction is necessary to ensure that these teenagers are safe drivers. Although there are two driving schools in Centerville, parents on a tight budget cannot afford to pay for driving instruction. Therefore an effective and mandatory program sponsored by the high school is the only solution to this serious problem." ( 132/134/136)

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

示范: The author of the letter argues that the only way to solve the problem of accidents involving teenage drivers is to introduce a compulsory program funded by Centerville High School. We need to gather more information to examine a number of assumptions about the accidents, the parents, the driving schools and the high school in order to decide whether the argument is reasonable.

It is assumed that the problem of accidents involving teenage drivers is serious enough to justify the resources required to run the proposed program. The author mentioned that there were several accidents involving teenage drivers. But we do not know how serious the accidents were. Were there people killed or severely injured? Were automobiles involved completely destroyed? If the accidents were not serious enough, maybe it is not worthwhile to run an education program for all teenage drivers. In addition, we need to know the actual causes of the accidents in order to decide whether teenage drivers should be blamed. Maybe the accidents were due to the mistakes made by adult drivers in the accidents. Or they were due to mechanical failure. In such scenarios, the education programs would not be helpful.

Another assumption is that most parents were too busy to teach their children how to drive safely. According to the letter, some parents complained that they did not have the time. But we do not know how widespread the problem is among all the parents in Centerville. We need more information about how much time, in average, parents of teenage drivers in Centerville can afford to teach their children in order to assess the claim that parents could not help solve the problem.

With regard to the driving schools, it is assumed that parents could not afford the instructions due to their tight budgets. To examine this assumption, more information is

required about the parents' budget and how they perceive the needs to educate their children about driving safely. If the parents consider it essential to offer their children the instruction, maybe they will pay for the courses of the driving schools despite their tight budgets.

When the program is proposed, it is further assumed that Centerville school has the authority to require all students to take the course and the capabilities and funding to run an effective course. Since driving may not be part of the school curriculum, it is not clear whether the school has the authority or power to make it compulsory for all students to take the course. In addition, we do not know if the school would have enough experience and human resources to run an effective program. Also, the Centerville school may not have enough funding to finance such a program. Therefore, we need more information about all these issues to check the assumptions.

Finally, it is assumed that the proposed program is the only solution to the problem. There are alternative solutions that need to be explored. For example, maybe the school could outsource the teaching jobs to one of the two driving schools in Centerville as they are more experienced in running such programs and may do so at lower costs. And if the problem is due to some specific behavior issues such as drink and drive or speeding, more rigorous law enforcement could be another solution. Without thoroughly investigating other possible solutions, it is unwise to accept the proposed program as the only solution.

In conclusion, this mandatory program may be helpful for addressing the problem. But we need to scrutinize the assumptions discussed above with more empirical data to evaluate the validity of the argument.

---

133. The following memorandum is from the business manager of Happy Pancake House restaurants. (133/131/130/15/51)

"Butter has now been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. Only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers cannot distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine. Thus, to avoid the expense of purchasing butter and to increase profitability, the Happy Pancake House should extend this cost-saving change to its restaurants in the southeast and northeast as well."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

134. The following appeared in a letter to the school board in the town of Centerville.

"All students should be required to take the driver's education course at Centerville High School. In the past two years, several accidents in and around Centerville have involved teenage drivers. Since a number of parents in Centerville have complained that they are too busy to teach their teenagers to drive, some other instruction is necessary to ensure that these teenagers are safe drivers. Although there are two driving schools in Centerville, parents on a tight budget cannot afford to pay for driving instruction. Therefore an effective and mandatory program sponsored by the high school is the only solution to this serious problem." (132/134/136)

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.



---

135. The data from a survey of high school math and science teachers show that in the district of Sanlee many of these teachers reported assigning daily homework, whereas in the district of Marlee, most science and math teachers reported assigning homework no more than two or three days per week. Despite receiving less frequent homework assignments, Marlee students earn better grades overall and are less likely to be required to repeat a year of school than are students in Sanlee. These results call into question the usefulness of frequent homework assignments. Most likely the Marlee students have more time to concentrate on individual assignments than do the Sanlee students who have homework every day. Therefore teachers in our high schools should assign homework no more than twice a week. (135/137/140)

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

140 提纲: the usefulness of the survey results

- whether the self-reported data is reliable (teachers may have incentive to lie)
- whether the science and math teachers could represent all the teachers

the amount of homework, the teaching and the feedback

- how much homework is assigned each time
- whether the homework is carefully designed to support the teaching
- whether feedback was carefully given

the other factors that may affect the learning outcome

- the requirement for repeating may be different
- Marlee students may be smarter
- Marlee teachers may be better trained or better paid

---

**136. The following appeared in a letter to the school board in the town of Centerville.**

"All students should be required to take the driver's education course at Centerville High School. In the past two years, several accidents in and around Centerville have involved teenage drivers. Since a number of parents in Centerville have complained that they are too busy to teach their teenagers to drive, some other instruction is necessary to ensure that these teenagers are safe drivers. Although there are two driving schools in Centerville, parents on a tight budget cannot afford to pay for driving instruction. Therefore an effective and mandatory program sponsored by the high school is the only solution to this serious problem." (132/134/136)

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

**137. While the Department of Education in the state of Attra recommends that high school**

students be assigned homework every day, the data from a recent statewide survey of high school math and science teachers give us reason to question the usefulness of daily homework. In the district of Sanlee, 86 percent of the teachers reported assigning homework three to five times a week, whereas in the district of Marlee, less than 25 percent of the teachers reported assigning homework three to five times a week. Yet the students in Marlee earn better grades overall and are less likely to be required to repeat a year of school than are the students in Sanlee. Therefore, all teachers in our high schools should assign homework no more than twice a week. (135/137/140)

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

138. The following appeared as an editorial in the student newspaper of Groveton College.

"To combat the recently reported dramatic rise in cheating among college students, colleges and universities should adopt honor codes similar to Groveton's, which calls for students to agree not to cheat in their academic endeavors and to notify a faculty member if they suspect that others have cheated. Groveton's honor code replaced an old-fashioned system in which teachers closely monitored students. Under that system, teachers reported an average of thirty cases of cheating per year. The honor code has proven far more successful: in the first year it was in place, students reported twenty-one cases of cheating; five years later, this figure had dropped to fourteen. Moreover, in a recent survey conducted by the Groveton honor council, a majority of students said that they would be less likely to cheat with an honor code in place than without."

(22/119/120/138)

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

139. The following appeared in a memo from a budget planner for the city of Grandview.

"Our citizens are well aware of the fact that while the Grandview Symphony Orchestra was struggling to succeed, our city government promised annual funding to help support its programs. Last year, however, private contributions to the symphony increased by 200 percent, and attendance at the symphony's concerts-in-the-park series doubled. The symphony has also announced an increase in ticket prices for next year. Such developments indicate that the symphony can now succeed without funding from city government and we can eliminate that expense from next year's budget. Therefore, we recommend that the city of Grandview eliminate its funding for the Grandview Symphony from next year's budget. By doing so, we can prevent a city budget deficit without threatening the success of the symphony." (61/139/141/143/162)

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

140. While the Department of Education in the state of Attra suggests that high school

students be assigned homework every day, the data from a recent statewide survey of high school math and science teachers give us reason to question the usefulness of daily homework. In the district of Sanlee, 86 percent of the teachers reported assigning homework three to five times a week, whereas in the district of Marlee, less than 25 percent of the teachers reported assigning homework three to five times a week. Yet the students in Marlee earn better grades overall and are less likely to be required to repeat a year of school than are the students in Sanlee. Therefore, we recommend that all teachers in our high schools should assign homework no more than twice a week.

(135/137/140)

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

提纲:

the usefulness of the survey results

- whether the self-reported data is reliable (teachers may have incentive to lie)
- whether the science and math teachers could represent all the teachers

the amount of homework, the teaching and the feedback

- how much homework is assigned each time
- whether the homework is carefully designed to support the teaching
- whether feedback was carefully given

the other factors that may affect the learning outcome

- the requirement for repeating may be different
- Marlee students may be smarter
- Marlee teachers may be better trained or better paid

---

**141. The following appeared in a memo to the board of the Grandview Symphony.**

"The city of Grandview has provided annual funding for the Grandview Symphony since the symphony's inception ten years ago. Last year the symphony hired an internationally known conductor, who has been able to attract high-profile guest musicians to perform with the symphony. Since then, private contributions to the symphony have doubled and attendance at the symphony's concerts-in-the-park series has reached new highs. Now that the Grandview Symphony is an established success, it can raise ticket prices. Increased revenue from larger audiences and higher ticket prices will enable the symphony to succeed without funding from the city government." (61/139/141/143/162)

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

**142. Hospital statistics regarding people who go to the emergency room after roller-skating**

accidents indicate the need for more protective equipment. Within that group of people, 75 percent of those who had accidents in streets or parking lots had not been wearing any protective clothing (helmets, knee pads, etc.) or any light-reflecting material (clip-on lights, glow-in-the-dark wrist pads, etc.). Clearly, the statistics indicate that by investing in high-quality protective gear and reflective equipment, roller skaters will greatly reduce their risk of being severely injured in an accident.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

提纲:

Assumption 1: all the victims should have worn protective clothing

- some of the victims may be pedestrians or onlookers who do not anticipate such risk
- other measures should be taken to protect pedestrians and onlookers

Assumption 2: not wearing light-reflecting material is a main cause of accidents

- maybe the accidents occurred during the day and there is no need to wear such material
- perhaps the accidents were caused by reckless or drunk drivers in a well-lit parking lot

Assumption 3: serious injuries could be prevented by wearing protective and reflective materials

- maybe people with less serious injuries were also sent to the ER
- serious injuries caused by accidents in which the materials are not helpful (victims are pedestrians/ onlookers)

---

**143. The following appeared in a memo from a budget planner for the city of Grandview.**

"When the Grandview Symphony was established ten years ago, the city of Grandview agreed to provide the symphony with annual funding until the symphony became self-sustaining. Two years ago, the symphony hired an internationally known conductor, who has been able to attract high-profile guest musicians to perform with the symphony. Since then, private contributions to the symphony have tripled and attendance at the symphony's outdoor summer concert series has reached record highs. Now that the symphony has succeeded in finding an audience, the city can eliminate its funding of the symphony." (61/139/141/143/162)

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

**144. The citizens of Forsythe have adopted more healthful lifestyles. Their responses to a**

recent survey show that in their eating habits they conform more closely to government nutritional recommendations than they did ten years ago. Furthermore, there has been a fourfold increase in sales of food products containing kiran, a substance that a scientific study has shown reduces cholesterol. This trend is also evident in reduced sales of sulia, a food that few of the healthiest citizens regularly eat. (53/144/151)

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

**145. The following appeared in a memo to the board of directors of a company that specializes in the delivery of heating oil.** (60/145/146/150/154/155)

"Most homes in the northeastern United States, where winters are typically cold, have traditionally used oil as their major fuel for heating. Last heating season, that region experienced 90 days with below-normal temperatures, and climate forecasters predict that this weather pattern will continue for several more years. Furthermore, many new homes are being built in the region in response to recent population growth. Because of these trends, we can safely predict that this region will experience an increased demand for heating oil during the next five years."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

---

**146.** The following appeared in a memo to the board of directors of a company that specializes in the delivery of heating oil. (60/145/146/150/154/155)

"Most homes in the northeastern United States, where winters are typically cold, have traditionally used oil as their major fuel for heating. Last heating season, that region experienced 90 days with below-normal temperatures, and climate forecasters predict that this weather pattern will continue for several more years. Furthermore, many new homes are being built in the region in response to recent population growth. Because of these trends, we can safely predict that this region will experience an increased demand for heating oil during the next five years."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

**147.** The following recommendation was made by the president and administrative staff of Grove College, a private institution, to the college's governing committee. (74/147/148/149/156)

"We recommend that Grove College preserve its century-old tradition of all-female education rather than admit men into its programs. It is true that a majority of faculty members voted in favor of coeducation, arguing that it would encourage more students to apply to Grove. But 80 percent of the students responding to a survey conducted by the student government wanted the school to remain all female, and over half of the alumnae who answered a separate survey also opposed coeducation. Keeping the college all female will improve morale among students and convince alumnae to keep supporting the college financially."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

**148.** The following recommendation was made by the president and administrative staff of Grove College, a private institution, to the college's governing committee. (74/147/148/149/156)

"We recommend that Grove College preserve its century-old tradition of all-female education rather than admit men into its programs. It is true that a majority of faculty members voted in favor of coeducation, arguing that it would encourage more students to apply to Grove. But 80 percent of the students responding to a survey conducted by the student government wanted the school to remain all female, and over half of the alumnae who answered a separate survey also opposed coeducation. Keeping the college all

female will improve morale among students and convince alumnae to keep supporting the college financially."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

149. The following recommendation was made by the president and administrative staff of

Grove College, a private institution, to the college's governing committee.

(74/147/148/149/156)

"We recommend that Grove College preserve its century-old tradition of all-female education rather than admit men into its programs. It is true that a majority of faculty members voted in favor of coeducation, arguing that it would encourage more students to apply to Grove. But 80 percent of the students responding to a survey conducted by the student government wanted the school to remain all female, and over half of the alumnae who answered a separate survey also opposed coeducation. Keeping the college all female will improve morale among students and convince alumnae to keep supporting the college financially."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.



150. The following appeared in a letter from a firm providing investment advice to a client.

"Homes in the northeastern United States, where winters are typically cold, have traditionally used oil as their major fuel for heating. Last year that region experienced 90 days with below-average temperatures, and climate forecasters at Waymarsh University predict that this weather pattern will continue for several more years. Furthermore, many new homes have been built in this region during the past year. Because these developments will certainly result in an increased demand for heating oil, we recommend investment in Consolidated Industries, one of whose major business operations is the retail sale of home heating oil." (60/145/146/150/154/155)

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

提纲:

Question 1: how reliable are the weather prediction

- maybe the model is flawed overlooking some latest data
- how about predictions made by other researchers

Question 2: will the residents switch to other energy sources for heating or adopt other solutions?

- maybe they would use electricity
  - maybe they would install more insulation to conserve heat
  - some people may travel to the south to spend the winter (especially the elderly)
- all would reduce the demand for heating oil

Question 3: will the new homes be occupied using heating oil

- maybe the homes will remain vacant (poor housing market)
- the homes use electricity
- the homes are better insulated (need less oil)

Question 4: retail of heating oil is necessarily profitable and the company is worth investing

- maybe the cost of heating oil will also increase eating away the profits
- maybe the increase in labor and operating cost will reduce the profits
- perhaps the company is poorly managed and financially troubled

---

**151. Benton City residents have adopted healthier lifestyles. A recent survey of city**

residents shows that the eating habits of city residents conform more closely to government nutritional recommendations than they did ten years ago. During those ten years, local sales of food products containing kiran, a substance that a scientific study has shown reduces cholesterol, have increased fourfold, while sales of sulia, a food rarely eaten by the healthiest residents, have declined dramatically. Because of these positive changes in the eating habits of Benton City residents, we predict that the obesity rate in the city will soon be well below the national average. (53/144/151)

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

---

**152. The following appeared in a memo to the board of directors of Bargain Brand Cereals.**

"One year ago we introduced our first product, Bargain Brand breakfast cereal. Our very low prices quickly drew many customers away from the top-selling cereal companies. Although the companies producing the top brands have since tried to compete with us by lowering their prices and although several plan to introduce their own budget brands, not once have we needed to raise our prices to continue making a profit. Given our success in selling cereal, we recommend that Bargain Brand now expand its business and begin marketing other low-priced food products as quickly as possible." (152/153)

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

**153. The following appeared in a memo to the board of directors of Bargain Brand Cereals.**

"One year ago we introduced our first product, Bargain Brand breakfast cereal. Our very low prices quickly drew many customers away from the top-selling cereal companies. Although the companies producing the top brands have since tried to compete with us by lowering their prices and although several plan to introduce their own budget brands, not once have we needed to raise our prices to continue making a profit. Given our success in selling cereal, we recommend that Bargain Brand now expand its business and begin marketing other low-priced food products as quickly as possible." (152/153)

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

**154. The following appeared in a letter from a firm providing investment advice to a client.**

"Homes in the northeastern United States, where winters are typically cold, have traditionally used oil as their major fuel for heating. Last year that region experienced twenty days with below-average temperatures, and local weather forecasters throughout the region predict that this weather pattern will continue for several more years. Furthermore, many new homes have been built in this region during the past year. Based on these developments, we predict a large increase in the demand for heating oil. Therefore, we recommend investment in Consolidated Industries, one of whose major business operations is the retail sale of home heating oil." (60/145/146/150/154/155)

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

**155. The following appeared in a letter from a firm providing investment advice to a client.**

"Homes in the northeastern United States, where winters are typically cold, have traditionally used oil as their major fuel for heating. Last year that region experienced twenty days with below-average temperatures, and local weather forecasters throughout the region predict that this weather pattern will continue for several more years. Furthermore, many new homes have been built in this region during the past year. Because of these developments, we predict an increased demand for heating oil and recommend investment in Consolidated Industries, one of whose major business operations is the retail sale of home heating oil." (60/145/146/150/154/155)

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

**156. The following recommendation was made by the president and administrative staff of Grove College, a private institution, to the college's governing committee.**  
(74/147/148/149/156)

"Recently, there have been discussions about ending Grove College's century-old tradition of all-female education by admitting male students into our programs. At a recent faculty meeting, a majority of faculty members voted in favor of coeducation, arguing that it would encourage more students to apply to Grove. However, Grove students, both past and present, are against the idea of coeducation. Eighty percent of the students responding to a survey conducted by the student government wanted the school to remain all female, and over half of the alumnae who answered a separate survey also opposed

coeducation. Therefore, we recommend maintaining Grove College's tradition of all-female education. We predict that keeping the college all-female will improve morale among students and convince alumnae to keep supporting the college financially."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

157. The following appeared in a memo from the marketing director of Top Dog Pet Stores.

"Five years ago Fish Emporium started advertising in the magazine *Exotic Pets Monthly*. Their stores saw sales increase by 15 percent after their ads began appearing in the magazine. The three Fish Emporium stores in Gulf City saw an even greater increase than that. Because Top Dog Pet Stores is based in Gulf City, it seems clear that we should start placing our own ads in *Exotic Pets Monthly*. If we do so, we will be sure to reverse the recent trend of declining sales and start making a profit again."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

158. The following appeared in a memo from the marketing director of Top Dog Pet Stores.

"Five years ago, Fish Emporium started advertising in the magazine *Exotic Pets Monthly*. Their stores saw sales increase by 15 percent. The three Fish Emporium stores in Gulf City saw an even greater increase than that. Because Top Dog has some of its largest stores in Gulf City, it seems clear that we should start placing our own ads in *Exotic Pets Monthly*. If we do so, we will be sure to reverse the recent trend of declining sales and start making a profit again."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

提纲: evidence about why Fish Emporium increased sales by 15% at the time and in what ways the increase was related to the advertising

- maybe at the time the economy was growing stronger and the demand increased
- perhaps at the time the company introduced some new products that were very attractive
- maybe the company hired a new sales director that are extremely competent
- if the increase in sales was not due to the advertising, ...

evidence about why Fish Emporium had greater increase in sales in Gulf City and in what ways the increase was related to advertising

- maybe the customers in Gulf City had a traditional loyalty to the brand
- perhaps the sales director or other staff in Gulf City were particularly well trained
- maybe Exotic Pets Monthly was very popular in Gulf City at the time

evidence about whether the stores in Gulf City would benefit from the advertising and how important are the benefits of the advertising for Gulf City stores relative to other stores

- perhaps the sale volume of Top Dog in Gulf City has been pretty good and there is little room for further improvement (then the marginal return of further advertising would be limited)
- perhaps the sale was very poor in Gulf City due to issues that could not be addressed through advertising (poor services; incompetent sales teams)
- maybe there is a better advertising agent in Gulf City

---

159. The following appeared in a letter to the editor of the *Balmer Island Gazette*. (5/159/173)

"The population on Balmer Island increases to 100,000 during the summer months. To reduce the number of accidents involving mopeds and pedestrians, the town council of Balmer Island plans to limit the number of mopeds rented by each of the island's six moped rental companies from 50 per day to 30 per day during the summer season. Last year, the neighboring island of Torseau enforced similar limits on moped rentals and saw a 50 percent reduction in moped accidents. We predict that putting these limits into effect on Balmer Island will result in the same reduction in moped accidents."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

---

160. The following appeared in a recommendation from the President of the Amburg Chamber of Commerce.

"Last October, the city of Belleville installed high-intensity lighting in its central business district, and vandalism there declined almost immediately. The city of Amburg, on the other hand, recently instituted police patrols on bicycles in its business district. However, the rate of vandalism here remains constant. Since high-intensity lighting is clearly the most effective way to combat crime, we recommend using the money that is currently being spent on bicycle patrols to install such lighting throughout Amburg. If we install this high-intensity lighting, we will significantly reduce crime rates in Amburg."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

提纲: why vandalism declined immediately and whether or not it will rebound

- maybe the criminals were not used to the lighting and stopped vandalizing temporarily
- once they get used to the change they might start vandalizing again (need to track the long-term effects)

whether the vandalism rate was high in Amburg and the issue needs to be tackled

- perhaps vandalism rate was really low and there is little room for improvement
- and the reason why police patrol had little effects might be that the issue was not serious

how effective are lighting and police patrols for treating the other crimes in Amburg

- perhaps the crime rates could be more significantly reduced by focusing on other crimes such as theft and robbery
- maybe police patrols are more effective for such crimes

---

**161.** The following is a recommendation from the personnel director to the president of Acme Publishing Company. (113/126/127/161)

"Many other companies have recently stated that having their employees take the Easy Read Speed-Reading Course has greatly improved productivity. One graduate of the course was able to read a 500-page report in only two hours; another graduate rose from an assistant manager to vice president of the company in under a year. Obviously, the faster you can read, the more information you can absorb in a single workday. Moreover, Easy Read would cost Acme only \$500 per employee—a small price to pay when you consider the benefits. Included in this fee is a three-week seminar in Spruce City and a lifelong subscription to the Easy Read newsletter. Clearly, Acme would benefit greatly by requiring all of our employees to take the Easy Read course."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

**162.** The following appeared in a memo from a budget planner for the city of Grandview.

"It is time for the city of Grandview to stop funding the Grandview Symphony Orchestra. It is true that the symphony struggled financially for many years, but last year private contributions to the symphony increased by 200 percent and attendance at the symphony's concerts-in-the-park series doubled. In addition, the symphony has just announced an increase in ticket prices for next year. For these reasons, we recommend that the city eliminate funding for the Grandview Symphony Orchestra from next year's budget. We predict that the symphony will flourish in the years to come even without funding from the city." (61/139/141/143/162)

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

163. The following memo appeared in the newsletter of the West Meria Public Health Council.

"An innovative treatment has come to our attention that promises to significantly reduce absenteeism in our schools and workplaces. A study reports that in nearby East Meria, where consumption of the plant *beneficia* is very high, people visit the doctor only once or twice per year for the treatment of colds. Clearly, eating a substantial amount of *beneficia* can prevent colds. Since colds are the reason most frequently given for absences from school and work, we recommend the daily use of nutritional supplements derived from *beneficia*. We predict this will dramatically reduce absenteeism in our schools and workplaces." (36/163/166)

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

164. The following was written by a group of developers in the city of Monroe.  
(25/100/102/164)

"A jazz music club in Monroe would be a tremendously profitable enterprise. At present, the nearest jazz club is over 60 miles away from Monroe; thus, our proposed club, the C Note, would have the local market all to itself. In addition, there is ample evidence of the popularity of jazz in Monroe: over 100,000 people attended Monroe's jazz festival last summer, several well-known jazz musicians live in Monroe, and the highest-rated radio program in Monroe is 'Jazz Nightly.' Finally, a nationwide study indicates that the typical jazz fan spends close to \$1,000 per year on jazz entertainment. We therefore predict that the C Note cannot help but make money."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.



---

**165. Humans arrived in the Kaliko Islands about 7,000 years ago, and within 3,000 years**

most of the large mammal species that had lived in the forests of the Kaliko Islands were extinct. Previous archaeological findings have suggested that early humans generally relied on both fishing and hunting for food; since archaeologists have discovered numerous sites in the Kaliko Islands where the bones of fish were discarded, it is likely that the humans also hunted the mammals. Furthermore, researchers have uncovered simple tools, such as stone knives, that could be used for hunting. The only clear explanation is that humans caused the extinction of the various mammal species through excessive hunting. (54/165)

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

---

**166. The following memo appeared in the newsletter of the West Meria Public Health Council. (36/163/166)**

"An innovative treatment has come to our attention that promises to significantly reduce absenteeism in our schools and workplaces. A study reports that in nearby East Meria, where fish consumption is very high, people visit the doctor only once or twice per year for the treatment of colds. This shows that eating a substantial amount of fish can clearly prevent colds. Furthermore, since colds are the reason most frequently given for absences from school and work, attendance levels will improve. Therefore, we recommend the daily use of a nutritional supplement derived from fish oil as a good way to prevent colds and lower absenteeism."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

167. The following appeared in a memo from a vice president of Alta Manufacturing.

"During the past year, Alta Manufacturing had thirty percent more on-the-job accidents than nearby Panoply Industries, where the work shifts are one hour shorter than ours. Experts believe that a significant contributing factor in many accidents is fatigue caused by sleep deprivation among workers. Therefore, to reduce the number of on-the-job accidents at Alta, we recommend shortening each of our three work shifts by one hour. If we do this, our employees will get adequate amounts of sleep." (32/104/105/106/167)

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

168. The following is a letter that recently appeared in the *Oak City Gazette*, a local newspaper.

"The primary function of the Committee for a Better Oak City is to advise the city government on how to make the best use of the city's limited budget. However, at some of our recent meetings we failed to make important decisions because of the foolish objections raised by committee members who are not even residents of Oak City. People who work in Oak City but who live elsewhere cannot fully understand the business and politics of the city. After all, only Oak City residents pay city taxes, and therefore only residents understand how that money could best be used to improve the city. We recommend, then, that the Committee for a Better Oak City vote to restrict its membership to city residents only. We predict that, without the interference of non-residents, the committee will be able to make Oak City a better place in which to live and work."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

提纲: are the objections raised by non-resident members foolish and whether the failure to make decisions was bad for the city

- perhaps the authors of the letters are biased or their interests were negatively influenced by the objections
- maybe the non-resident committee members's objection was actually beneficial for the city in the long term
- maybe postponing the decision was not necessarily a bad thing (more thorough discussion could be helpful)

why the exp of living in the city was important for understanding the business or politics of the city

- maybe city's business and politics are quite similar to other cities and some general principle and research methods can be usefully applied to understand (if the non-resident members are experienced in these principles and methods, then ...)
- or maybe by reading about the documents and reports from consulting firms can help people to understand the business and politics of the city adequately (then no need to live there)
- perhaps not living there could help develop fresh perspective that can be useful

whether the resident members are competent and whether other issues need to be fixed to make the city a better place

- maybe the current resident members and the future resident members that will replace the non-residents are corrupted or ill-informed
- perhaps the real problem with the city is that the tax code should be reformed to generate more tax revenue

---

**169. The following appeared in a memo from the mayor of Brindleburg to the city council.**

"Two years ago, the town of Seaside Vista opened a new municipal golf course and resort hotel. Since then, the Seaside Vista Tourism Board has reported a 20% increase in visitors. In addition, local banks reported a steep rise in the number of new business loan applications they received this year. The amount of tax money collected by Seaside Vista has also increased, allowing the town to announce plans to improve Seaside Vista's roads and bridges. We recommend building a similar golf course and resort hotel in Brindleburg. We predict that this project will generate additional tax revenue that the city can use to fund much-needed public improvements." (77/169)

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

170. The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of a company that builds shopping malls around the country.

"The surface of a section of Route 101, paved just two years ago by Good Intentions Roadways, is now badly cracked with a number of dangerous potholes. In another part of the state, a section of Route 40, paved by Appian Roadways more than four years ago, is still in good condition. In a demonstration of their continuing commitment to quality, Appian Roadways recently purchased state-of-the-art paving machinery and hired a new quality-control manager. Therefore, I recommend hiring Appian Roadways to construct the access roads for all our new shopping malls. I predict that our Appian access roads will not have to be repaired for at least four years."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

提纲: the reason why Route 101 was badly cracked

- maybe the route was more heavily used
- perhaps the overweight trucks were allowed to use the route due to the incompetent management and law enforcement agent
- maybe the potholes were caused by some accidents that are unrelated to the construction company

the reason why Route 40 was in good conditions for more than 4 years

- maybe the road was less heavily used due to the poor economy in the area
- maybe the toll for the route was more expensive and therefore fewer vehicles used the route
- perhaps the route was better maintained with more money spent

whether the new paving machinery and the new manager could help improve the quality of the road

- maybe the new machinery was more energy efficient but would not make the road more robust
- perhaps the new machinery could add to the cost of the projects
- maybe the new manager was not as competent as the old one and are better paid (more costly)

whether Appian Roadways has better expertise in building access roads than Good Intentions

- maybe Good Intentions are more experienced in building access roads
- perhaps the staff of GI are better trained to build access roads

---

171. The following appeared as a letter to the editor from the owner of a skate shop in Central Plaza. (3/171)

"Two years ago the city voted to prohibit skateboarding in Central Plaza. They claimed that skateboard users were responsible for the litter and vandalism that were keeping other visitors from coming to the plaza. In the past two years, however, there has only been a small increase in the number of visitors to Central Plaza, and litter and vandalism are still problematic. Skateboarding is permitted in Monroe Park, however, and there is no problem with litter or vandalism there. In order to restore Central Plaza to its former glory, then, we recommend that the city lift its prohibition on skateboarding in the plaza."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

172. The following appeared in a recommendation from the president of Amburg's Chamber of Commerce. (160/172)

"Last October the city of Belleville installed high-intensity lighting in its central business district, and vandalism there declined within a month. The city of Amburg has recently begun police patrols on bicycles in its business district, but the rate of vandalism there remains constant. We should install high-intensity lighting throughout Amburg, then, because doing so is a more effective way to combat crime. By reducing crime in this way, we can revitalize the declining neighborhoods in our city."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

---

173. The following appeared in a letter to the editor of the *Balmer Island Gazette*. (5/159/173)

"The population on Balmer Island doubles during the summer months. During the summer, then, the town council of Balmer Island should decrease the maximum number of moped rentals allowed at each of the island's six moped and bicycle rental companies from 50 per day to 30 per day. This will significantly reduce the number of summertime accidents involving mopeds and pedestrians. The neighboring island of Torseau actually saw a 50 percent reduction in moped accidents last year when Torseau's town council enforced similar limits on moped rentals. To help reduce moped accidents, therefore, we should also enforce these limitations during the summer months."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

---

**174. A recent sales study indicates that consumption of seafood dishes in Bay City**

restaurants has increased by 30 percent during the past five years. Yet there are no currently operating city restaurants whose specialty is seafood. Moreover, the majority of families in Bay City are two-income families, and a nationwide study has shown that such families eat significantly fewer home-cooked meals than they did a decade ago but at the same time express more concern about healthful eating. Therefore, the new Captain Seafood restaurant that specializes in seafood should be quite popular and profitable.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be addressed in order to decide whether the conclusion and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to the questions would help to evaluate the conclusion. (174/39)

---

**175. The following appeared as a letter to the editor from the owner of a skate shop in**

Central Plaza.

"Two years ago the city council voted to prohibit skateboarding in Central Plaza. They claimed that skateboard users were responsible for litter and vandalism that were keeping other visitors from coming to the plaza. In the past two years, however, there has been only a small increase in the number of visitors to Central Plaza, and litter and vandalism are still problematic. Skateboarding is permitted in Monroe Park, however, and there is no problem with litter or vandalism there. In order to restore Central Plaza to its former glory, then, we recommend that the city lift its prohibition on skateboarding in the plaza."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

---

176. The following appeared as part of an article in a Dillton newspaper.

"In an effort to bring new jobs to Dillton and stimulate the city's flagging economy, Dillton's city council voted last year to lower the city's corporate tax rate by 15 percent; at the same time, the city began offering generous relocation grants to any company that would move to Dillton. Since these changes went into effect, two new factories have opened in Dillton. Although the two factories employ more than 1,000 people, the unemployment rate in Dillton remains unchanged. The only clear explanation for this is that the new factories are staffed with out-of-town workers rather than Dillton residents."

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

分析+提纲:

fact to be explained: unemployment rate remains unchanged

explanation: new factories hire out-of-town workers

other facts: corporate tax rate lowered; relocation grants

other alternative explanations

unemployment rate is the number of workers out of job over the total workforce

Job loss due to tax cut

- as a result of tax cut, the city government may have to reduce its expenditure; as a result, fewer jobs are available in the government and other organisations relying on government funding
- the job loss in public sector may lead to less consumption which reduces the jobs available in the private sector

Job loss due to relocation grants

- relocation grants may attract factories that compete against the local factories for resources, business opportunities and workers
- local factories may have to lay off some workers
- part of the 2000 workers hired by the new factories may come from the local factories

lack of skills of the local workers

- the local workers especially those that are jobless may not have the appropriate skills demanded by the new factories
- which explains why the factories are staffed by out-of-town workers
- hiring out-of-town workers is not the ultimate reason

increasing number of people seeking jobs

- due to the poor economy, more people seek for jobs
- stay home mums need to work as the husbands could not make enough money
- students did not get offers to graduate schools and join the workforce

---

177. The following appeared in a memo from New Ventures Consulting to the president of HobCo, Inc., a chain of hobby shops.

"Our team has completed its research on suitable building sites for a new HobCo hobby Shop in the city of Grilldon. We discovered that there are currently no hobby shops in southeastern Grilldon. When our researchers conducted a poll of area residents, 88 percent of those who responded indicated that they would welcome the opening of a hobby shop in southeastern Grilldon. Grilldon is in a region of the nation in which the hobby business has increased by 300 percent during the past decade. In addition, Grilldon has a very large population of retirees, a demographic with ample time to devote to hobbies. We therefore recommend that you choose southeastern Grilldon as the site for your next HobCo Hobby Shop. We predict that a shop in this area will draw a steady stream of enthusiastic new HobCo customers."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

分析+提纲:

ground/ data: no hobby shop in the area according to the research

g/d: 88% of those who responded - welcome the opening of a hobby shop

g/d: in the area the hobby business has increased by 300%

g/d: large number of retirees with ample time for hobbies

claim: choose Grilldon as the site

questions about the attitudes of the residents

- response rate (if the rate is low, the attitudes of those who do not respond remain unknown)
- will they spend money in the hobby shop (welcome <> consume)
- what about residents in adjacent areas (are they interested)

questions about the hobby business growth in the region

- is the increase related to residents that the proposed hobby shop can serve
- is the business growth related to hobby shops (perhaps the online hobby business is the main driver)
- what was the increase in the past 2-3 years (will the trend continue)

questions about the retirees



- are the retirees willing to spend money in the hobby shop (perhaps they have other hobbies that do not require a visit to a hobby shop)
- do they really have a lot of spare time (maybe they need to babysit their grandchildren or they attend community colleges for continuing education)
- are they physically fit to visit the shop