

# Runge Kutta Optimizers

Raghav K. Singhal

## 1 Introduction

In this paper we present a new optimization method, which is based on the idea that Gradient Descent is a Euler Approximation to the solution of the following Ordinary Differential Equation:

$$\dot{x}_t = -\nabla_x f(x_t) \quad (1)$$

The Euler Approximation to this Ordinary Differential Equation is of the following form:

$$x_{n+1} = x_n - \alpha \nabla_x f(x_n)$$

where  $\alpha$  is the step-size which is the learning rate for optimization.

### Look up Literature for continuous gradient descent

We explore the idea that the solution trajectory for (1), which also has the critical points of the loss function  $L(\theta)$  as its  $\omega$ -limit point.

## 2 ODE Ideas - Lyupanov Function

Here we provide certain properties of the solution of (1), when  $f \in \mathcal{S}_{\beta}^{2,1}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ , that is  $f$  is strongly convex and twice differentiable with  $\|\nabla f(x) - \nabla f(y)\| \leq \beta\|x - y\|$ , for all  $x, y \in \mathbb{R}^n$ . Define  $r_t = f(x_t) - f(x^*)$ , then note that

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{d}{dt} r_t &= \langle \nabla f(x_t), \dot{x}_t \rangle \\ &= -\|\nabla f(x_t)\|_2^2 \end{aligned} \quad (2)$$

Now, note that  $\|\nabla f(x)\| \leq \beta\|x - x^*\|$ , which implies that

$$\begin{aligned} -\beta^2\|x_t - x^*\|^2 &\leq -\|\nabla f(x_t)\|_2^2 = \frac{d}{dt}(f(x_t) - f(x^*)) \\ \frac{d}{dt}(f(x_t) - f(x^*)) &\geq \beta\|x_t - x^*\|^2 \end{aligned} \quad (3)$$

But, as  $f(x_t) - f(x^*)$  is continuously decreasing we have that

### 3 RK2 - Ralston Method

Change this

**for**  $t$  in  $[0, T]$  **do** **do**

$k_1 \leftarrow \nabla f(x_t)$

$k_2 \leftarrow \nabla f(x_t - \frac{2\alpha}{3}k_1)$

$x_{t+1} \leftarrow x_t - \frac{\alpha}{4}(k_1 + 3k_2)$

**end for**

#### 3.1 Proof 1

**Theorem 1.** Let  $f(x) \in C_{\beta}^{2,2}(\mathbb{R}^n) \cap C_{\beta}^{2,1}(\mathbb{R}^n)$  and  $f$  is bounded below, then the RK2-Ralston Method gap between  $x_t$  and some local minima  $x^*$  is given by :

$$f(x_t) - f(x^*) \leq \frac{8}{3\beta} \frac{\|x_1 - x^*\|_2^2}{t-1}$$

To prove the above proposition we need the following lemmas:

**Lemma 1.** Let  $f : \mathbb{R}^d \rightarrow \mathbb{R} \in C_{\beta}^{2,2}(\mathbb{R}^n) \cap C_{\beta}^{2,1}(\mathbb{R}^n)$  . Let  $\Delta x = \frac{1}{4\beta}(k_1 + 3k_2)$  and  $y = x - \Delta x$ , then we show that, for some  $c_1 = \frac{8\beta}{3} > 0$ ,

$$f(x - \Delta x) - f(x) \leq -\frac{3}{8\beta} \|\nabla f(x)\|^2 \quad (4)$$

$$(5)$$

*Proof.* Let  $\Delta x = \frac{1}{4\beta}(k_1 + 3k_2)$ , then

$$\begin{aligned} f(x - \Delta x) - f(x) &\leq \nabla f(x)^T(x - \Delta x - x) + \frac{\beta}{2} \|x - x - \Delta x\|^2 \\ &= -\nabla f(x)^T(\Delta x) + \frac{1}{32\beta} \|\Delta x\|^2 \\ &= -\frac{1}{4\beta} \nabla f(x)^T(k_1 + 3k_2) + \frac{1}{32\beta} \|\Delta x\|^2 \\ &= -\frac{1}{4\beta} \nabla f(x)^T k_1 - \frac{3}{4\beta} \nabla f(x)^T k_2 + \frac{1}{32\beta} \|k_1\|_2^2 + \frac{9}{32\beta} \|k_2\|_2^2 + \frac{6}{32\beta} \langle k_1, k_2 \rangle \\ &= -\frac{1}{4\beta} \nabla f(x)^T k_1 + \frac{1}{32\beta} \|k_1\|_2^2 - \frac{3}{4\beta} \nabla f(x)^T k_2 + \frac{9}{32\beta} \|k_2\|_2^2 + \frac{6}{32\beta} \langle k_1, k_2 \rangle \\ &= -\frac{7}{32\beta} \|k_1\|_2^2 - \frac{1}{32\beta} k_2^T (24\nabla f(x) - 9k_2) + \frac{6}{32\beta} \langle k_1, k_2 \rangle \\ &= -\frac{7}{32\beta} \|k_1\|_2^2 - \frac{24}{32\beta} k_2^T k_1 + \frac{6}{32\beta} \langle k_1, k_2 \rangle + \frac{9}{32\beta} \|k_2\|_2^2 \\ &= -\frac{7}{32\beta} \|k_1\|_2^2 - \frac{18}{32\beta} \langle k_1, k_2 \rangle + \frac{9}{32\beta} \|k_2\|_2^2 \end{aligned} \quad (6)$$

Now, using a Taylor Series approximation for  $\nabla f(x - \frac{2}{3\beta}k_1)$ , we get that :

$$\begin{aligned}
\nabla f(x - \frac{2}{3\beta}k_1) &= \nabla f(x) - \frac{2}{3\beta}\nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x) + \mathcal{O}(|\frac{2}{3\beta}|^2) \\
\implies k_2^T k_1 &= \nabla f(x - \frac{2}{3\beta}k_1)^T \nabla f(x) \\
&= \nabla f(x - \frac{2}{3\beta}\nabla f(x))^T \nabla f(x) \\
&= \|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 - \frac{2}{3\beta}\nabla f(x)^T \nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x)
\end{aligned} \tag{7}$$

And, using (7),

$$\begin{aligned}
\|k_2\|_2^2 &= \|\nabla f(x) - \frac{2}{3\beta}\nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 \\
&= \|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{4}{9\beta}\|\nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 - \frac{4}{3\beta}\nabla f(x)^T \nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x)
\end{aligned} \tag{8}$$

Hence, using (7) and (8)

$$\begin{aligned}
f(x - \Delta x) - f(x) &\leq -\frac{7}{32\beta}\|k_1\|_2^2 - \frac{18}{32\beta}\langle k_1, k_2 \rangle + \frac{9}{32\beta}\|k_2\|_2^2 \\
&= -\frac{7}{32\beta}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 - \frac{18}{32\beta}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{12}{32\beta^2}\nabla f(x)^T \nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x) \\
&\quad + \frac{9}{32\beta}(\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{4}{9\beta}\|\nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 - \frac{4}{3\beta}\nabla f(x)^T \nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x)) \\
&= -\frac{16}{32\beta}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{1}{8\beta^2}\|\nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 \\
&= -\frac{1}{2\beta}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{1}{8\beta^2}\|\nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x)\|_2^2
\end{aligned}$$

Using the lipschitz property of the Hessian of  $f$ ,  $\|\nabla^2 f(x)u - \nabla^2 f(x)v\|_2^2 \leq \beta\|u - v\|_2^2$ , we get that,

$$\begin{aligned}
f(x - \Delta x) - f(x) &\leq -\frac{1}{2\beta}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{1}{8\beta^2}\|\nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 \\
&\leq -\frac{4}{8\beta}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{\beta}{8\beta^2}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 \\
&= -(\frac{4}{8\beta} - \frac{\beta}{8\beta^2})\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 \\
&= -\frac{3}{8\beta}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2
\end{aligned} \tag{9}$$

□

(Theorem 1) Proof. Using Lemma 1, we have  $f(x_{t+1}) - f(x) \leq -\frac{3}{8\beta}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2$ . Now, let  $\delta_t = f(x_t) - f(x^*)$ , then note that:

$$\delta_{t+1} \leq \delta_t - \frac{3}{8\beta}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2$$

Now, by convexity of  $f(x)$  we have:

$$\delta_t \leq \nabla f(x_t)^T (x_t - x^*) \quad (10)$$

$$\leq \|x_t - x^*\|_2 * \|\nabla f(x_t)\|_2 \quad (11)$$

$$\frac{1}{\|x_t - x^*\|} \delta_t^2 \leq \|\nabla f(x_t)\|_2^2 \quad (12)$$

$$(13)$$

Now, note that  $\|x_t - x^*\|_2^2$  is decreasing, using the following

$$(\nabla f(x) - \nabla f(y))^T (x - y) \geq \frac{1}{\beta} \|\nabla f(x) - \nabla f(y)\|_2^2$$

Using the above and the fact that  $\nabla f(x^*) = 0$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} \|x_{t+1} - x^*\|_2^2 &= \|x_t - \Delta x_t - x^*\|_2^2 \\ &= \|x_t - x^*\|_2^2 + \|\Delta x_t\|_2^2 - 2\Delta x_t^T (x_t - x^*) \\ &= \|x_t - x^*\|_2^2 - \frac{1}{2\beta} (k_1 + 3k_2)^T (x_t - x^*) + \frac{1}{16\beta^2} \|k_1 + 3k_2\|_2^2 \\ &= \|x_t - x^*\|_2^2 - \frac{1}{2\beta} k_1^T (x_t - x^*) + \frac{1}{16\beta^2} \|k_1\|_2^2 \\ &\quad - \frac{3}{2\beta} k_2^T (x_t - x^*) + \frac{9}{16\beta^2} \|k_2\|_2^2 + \frac{6}{16\beta^2} k_1^T k_2 \\ &= \|x_t - x^*\|_2^2 - \frac{4}{16\beta^2} \|k_1\|_2^2 + \frac{1}{16\beta^2} \|k_1\|_2^2 \\ &\quad - \frac{12}{16\beta^2} \|k_2\|_2^2 + \frac{9}{16\beta^2} \|k_2\|_2^2 + \frac{6}{16\beta^2} k_1^T k_2 \\ &= \|x_t - x^*\|_2^2 - \frac{3}{16\beta^2} \|k_1\|_2^2 - \frac{3}{16\beta^2} \|k_2\|_2^2 + \frac{6}{16\beta^2} k_1^T k_2 \\ &= \|x_t - x^*\|_2^2 - \frac{3}{16\beta^2} \|k_1 - k_2\|_2^2 \\ &\leq \|x_t - x^*\|_2^2 \end{aligned}$$

We will show that,

$$\delta_{t+1} \leq \delta_t - \frac{3}{8\beta \|x_1 - x^*\|_2^2} \delta_t^2 \quad (14)$$

Now, let  $\omega = \frac{3}{8\beta \|x_1 - x^*\|_2^2}$ , then note that: (Proof in Bubeck page - 269)

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{1}{\delta_t} &\geq \omega(t-1) \\ \implies f(x_t) - f(x^*) &\leq \frac{8}{3\beta} \frac{\|x_1 - x^*\|_2^2}{t-1} \xrightarrow{t \rightarrow \infty} 0 \end{aligned}$$

□

### 3.2 Order of Convergence

## 4 RK2 - Heun's Method

Heun's Method is a second order method to solving  $\dot{x}_t = -\nabla f(x_t)$ , and its updates are given as follows:

```

Change this
for  $t$  in  $[0, T]$  do do
     $k_1 \leftarrow \nabla f(x_t)$ 
     $k_2 \leftarrow \nabla f(x_t - \alpha k_1)$ 
     $x_{t+1} \leftarrow x_t - \frac{\alpha}{2}(k_1 + k_2)$ 
end for

```

### 4.1 Proof 1

Let  $\Delta x = \frac{1}{2\beta}(k_1 + k_2)$ ,

$$\begin{aligned}
 f(x - \Delta x) - f(x) &\leq \nabla f(x)^T(-\Delta x) + \frac{\beta}{2}\|\Delta x\|_2^2 \\
 &\leq -\nabla f(x)^T \Delta x + \frac{1}{8\beta}\|k_1 + k_2\|_2^2 \\
 &\leq -\frac{1}{2\beta}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 - \frac{1}{2\beta}\nabla f(x)^T k_2 + \frac{1}{8\beta^2}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{1}{8\beta}\|k_2\|_2^2 \\
 &\leq -\frac{3}{8\beta}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 - \frac{1}{2\beta}\nabla f(x)^T k_2 + \frac{1}{8\beta}k_2^T k_2 \\
 &\leq -\frac{3}{8\beta}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 - \frac{1}{8\beta}k_2^T(4\nabla f(x) - k_2) \\
 &\leq -\frac{3}{8\beta}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 - \frac{1}{2\beta}k_2^T(\nabla f(x) - k_2) + \frac{3}{8\beta}k_2^T k_2 \\
 &\leq -\frac{3}{8\beta}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 - \frac{1}{2\beta}k_2^T(\nabla f(x) - \nabla f(x - \frac{1}{\beta}\nabla f(x))) + \frac{3}{8\beta}\|k_2\|_2^2 \\
 &\leq -\frac{3}{8\beta}\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{3}{8\beta}\|k_2\|_2^2 - \frac{1}{2\beta}k_2^T(\nabla f(x) - \nabla f(x - \frac{1}{\beta}\nabla f(x)))
 \end{aligned} \tag{15}$$

Now, note that using a Taylor Series approximation, we get that:

$$\begin{aligned}
 \nabla f(x - \frac{1}{\beta}\nabla f(x)) &= \nabla f(x) - \frac{1}{\beta}\nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x) + \mathcal{O}(\|c\|^2) \\
 \implies \nabla f(x) - \nabla f(x - \frac{1}{\beta}\nabla f(x)) &= \frac{1}{\beta}\nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x) \\
 \implies k_2^T \frac{1}{\beta}\nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x) &= \frac{1}{\beta}\nabla f(x - \frac{1}{\beta}\nabla f(x))^T \nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x) \\
 &= \frac{1}{\beta}\nabla f(x)^T \nabla f(x) - \frac{1}{\beta^2}\nabla f(x)^T \nabla^2 f(x)\nabla f(x)
 \end{aligned} \tag{16}$$

Now, combining (12) and (13), we get that:

$$\begin{aligned}
\nabla f(x - \Delta x) - \nabla f(x) &\leq -\frac{3}{8\beta} \|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{3}{8\beta} \|k_2\|_2^2 - \frac{1}{2\beta} k_2^T (\nabla f(x) - \nabla f(x - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x))) \\
&\leq -\frac{3}{8\beta} \|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{3}{8\beta} \|k_2\|_2^2 - \frac{1}{2\beta} \|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{1}{2\beta^2} \nabla f(x)^T \nabla^2 f(x) \nabla f(x) \\
&\leq -\frac{7}{8\beta} \|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{3}{8\beta} (\|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{1}{\beta} \|\nabla^2 f(x) \nabla f(x)\|_2^2) + \frac{1}{2\beta^2} \nabla f(x)^T \nabla^2 f(x) \nabla f(x) \\
&\leq -\frac{1}{8\beta} \|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{1}{2\beta^2} \nabla f(x)^T \nabla^2 f(x) \nabla f(x) \\
&\leq -\frac{1}{8\beta} \|\nabla f(x)\|_2^2 + \frac{1}{2\beta^2}
\end{aligned} \tag{17}$$

## 4.2 Order Of Convergence

*Proof.* Let  $r_k = \|x_k - x^*\|$ , the note that

$$\begin{aligned}
x_{k+1} - x^* &= x_k - x^* - \frac{1}{2\beta} (\nabla f(x_k) + \nabla f(x_k - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k))) \\
&= x_k - x^* - \frac{1}{2\beta} (\nabla f(x_k) - \nabla f(x^*)) - \frac{1}{2\beta} (\nabla f(x_k - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k)) - \nabla f(x^*)) \\
&= x_k - x^* - \frac{1}{2\beta} \int_0^1 \nabla^2 f(x^* + t(x_k - x^*)) (x_k - x^*) dt \\
&\quad - \frac{1}{2\beta} \int_0^1 \nabla^2 f(x^* + t(x_k - x^* - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k))) (x_k - x^* - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k)) dt
\end{aligned} \tag{18}$$

Now, let  $z_k = x_k - x^*$ , then note that

$$\begin{aligned}
y_{k+1} &= y_k - \frac{1}{2\beta} \int_0^1 \nabla^2 f(x^* + ty_k) y_k dt - \frac{1}{2\beta} \int_0^1 \nabla^2 f(x^* + t(y_k - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k))) (y_k - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k)) dt \\
&= (I - \frac{1}{2\beta} \int_0^1 \nabla^2 f(x^* + ty_k) + \nabla^2 f(x^* + t(y_k - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k))) dt) y_k \\
&\quad + \frac{1}{2\beta} \int_0^1 \nabla^2 f(x^* + t(y_k - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k))) \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k) dt \\
&= (I - \frac{1}{2\beta} \int_0^1 \nabla^2 f(x^* + ty_k) + \nabla^2 f(x^* + t(y_k - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k))) dt) y_k \\
&\quad + \frac{1}{2\beta^2} \int_0^1 \nabla^2 f(x^* + t(y_k - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k))) (\nabla f(x_k) - \nabla f(x^*)) dt
\end{aligned} \tag{19}$$

Now, define the following operators:

$$\begin{aligned}
H_k &= (I - \frac{1}{2\beta} \int_0^1 \nabla^2 f(x^* + ty_k) + \nabla^2 f(x^* + t(y_k - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k))) dt) \\
G_k &= \frac{1}{2\beta^2} \int_0^1 \nabla^2 f(x^* + t(y_k - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k))) dt
\end{aligned} \tag{20}$$

Then note that as  $f \in C_{\beta}^{2,2}(\mathbb{R}^n) \cap C_{\beta}^{2,1}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ ,

$$\|\nabla^2 f(x)\| \leq \beta \quad (21)$$

$$\|\nabla f(x)\| = \|\nabla f(x) - \nabla f(x^*)\| \leq \beta \|x - x^*\| \quad (22)$$

Now, using (21) and (22), we have:

$$\begin{aligned} \|G_k(\nabla f(x_k) - \nabla f(x^*))\| &\leq \|G_k\| * \|\nabla f(x_k) - \nabla f(x^*)\| \\ &\leq \frac{1}{2\beta^2} \int_0^1 \|\nabla^2 f(x^* + t(y_k - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k)))\| * \|\nabla f(x_k) - \nabla f(x^*)\| dt \\ &\leq \frac{1}{2\beta^2} \int_0^1 \beta^2 \|x_k - x^*\| dt = \frac{1}{2} \|x_k - x^*\| = \frac{1}{2} r_k \end{aligned} \quad (23)$$

Note that if  $\|x - y\| = r$ , then for  $f \in C_{\beta}^{2,2}(\mathbb{R}^n)$ ,

$$\nabla^2 f(x) - \beta r I \preceq \nabla^2 f(y) \preceq \nabla^2 f(x) + \beta r I \quad (24)$$

And, a similar inequality can be derived for  $H_k$ , and assuming that  $lI \preceq \nabla^2 f(x^*)$

$$\begin{aligned} H_k &= I - \frac{1}{2\beta} \int_0^1 \nabla^2 f(x^* + ty_k) + \nabla^2 f(x^* + t(y_k - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k))) dt \\ &\leq I + \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla^2 f(x^*) - \frac{1}{2\beta} \int_0^1 \nabla^2 f(x^* + ty_k) - \nabla^2 f(x^*) + \nabla^2 f(x^* + t(y_k - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k))) - \nabla^2 f(x^*) dt \\ \|H_k\| &\leq \|I + \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla^2 f(x^*)\| + \frac{1}{2\beta} \int_0^1 \|ty_k\| dt + \frac{1}{2\beta} \int_0^1 \|ty_k - \frac{t}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k)\| dt \\ &\leq \|I + \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla^2 f(x^*)\| + \frac{r_k}{4\beta} + \frac{1}{2\beta} \int_0^1 \|ty_k - \frac{t}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k)\| dt \\ &\leq \|I + \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla^2 f(x^*)\| + \frac{r_k}{4\beta} + \frac{1}{2\beta} \int_0^1 t \|y_k - \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla f(x_k)\| dt \\ &\leq \|I + \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla^2 f(x^*)\| + \frac{r_k}{4\beta} + \frac{1}{2\beta} \int_0^1 \|ty_k\| dt \\ &\leq \|I + \frac{1}{\beta} \nabla^2 f(x^*)\| + \frac{r_k}{2\beta} \\ &\leq \frac{1}{\beta} \lambda_{\max}(\nabla^2 f) + 1 + \frac{r_k}{4\beta} \end{aligned} \quad (25)$$

Using, the above inequalities we get:

$$\begin{aligned} y_{k+1} &= H_k y_k + G_k \\ r_{k+1} &\leq \|H_k\| r_k + \|G_k\| \\ &\leq \left( \frac{1}{\beta} \lambda_{\max}(\nabla^2 f) + \frac{3}{2} \right) r_k + \frac{r_k^2}{4\beta} \\ r_{k+1} &\leq \mu_1 r_k + \mu_2 r_k^2 \end{aligned} \quad (26)$$

□

## 5 Notes

**Lemma 2.** *Let  $f : \mathbb{R}^d \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be convex and satisfy  $\|\nabla f(x) - \nabla f(y)\| \leq \beta\|x - y\|$  for all  $x, y \in \mathbb{R}^d$ . Then  $\forall x, y \in \mathbb{R}^d$  the following are true:*

$$0 \leq f(x) - f(y) - \nabla f(y)^T(x - y) \leq \frac{\beta}{2}\|x - y\|^2 \quad (27)$$

$$f(x) - f(y) \leq \nabla f(x)^T(x - y) - \frac{1}{2\beta}\|\nabla f(x) - \nabla f(y)\|^2 \quad (28)$$

$$\frac{1}{\beta}\|\nabla f(x) - \nabla f(y)\|^2 \leq (\nabla f(x) - \nabla f(y))^T(x - y) \quad (29)$$

### 5.1 Comparison to GD