TEXAS A&M UNIVERSITY

UIN - 928001157

LINEAR PROGRAMMING

ISEN 622 PROJECT

The Maximum Clique Problem

Author: Surya Narayan Santhana Krishnan

Supervisor: Dr. Sergiy Butenko

December 12, 2018



The Maximum Clique Problem

Surya Narayan Santhana Krishnan UIN : 928001157 narayan $@tamu.edu^1$

¹Industrial & Systems Engineering, Texas A&M University, College Station, Texas 77840, United States

12/12/2018

Abstract

This article discusses the maximum clique problem and its relationship with the maximum independent set problem, their formulations and an implementation to solve them by Constraint Programming using Linear Relaxation through a Column-Generation approach.

1 Introduction

The maximum clique and maximum independent set problems are classical NP-Hard problems in combinatorial optimization. These problems are also closely associated with graph coloring and minimum clique partitioning problems. Due to their important role in several theoretical fields and applicability in a wide variety of practical settings, these problems have been extensively studied from different perspectives by mathematicians, computer scientists, operations researchers, engineers, biologists, and social scientists.

Clique-like structures frequently arise in many other applications, where one is interested in detecting large groups of elements that are all closely related to each other in some sense. Depending on the application of interest, such structures are often referred to as clusters, modules, complexes or cohesive subgroups. If the elements in the application of interest are represented as vertices (nodes) and the relationships between the elements are represented as edges (links, arcs), then clusters can be naturally modeled as cliques in this graph-theoretic representation.

Throughout this article, G = (V, E) is an arbitrary undirected and unweighted graph. $V = \{1, 2, ..., n\}$ is the vertex set of G and $E \subseteq V \times V$. $A_G = (a_{ij})_{n \times n}$ is the adjacency matrix of G, where $a_{ij} = 0$ if $(i,j) \notin E$. A clique is a subset of vertices $C \subseteq V$, if $i,j \in E$ for any $i,j \in C$. An independent set is a subset of vertices $C \subseteq V$, if $i,j \notin E$ for any $i,j \in C$. A clique (independent set) is called maximal if it is not a subset of a larger clique (independent set) in G, and maximum if there is no larger clique (independent set) in G. The cardinality of a of a maximum clique in G is denoted G0 and is called the clique number of G1. It is also known as the fractional clique number.

2 Formulation

Let I^* denote the set of all maximal independent sets in G. Then the maximum clique problem can be formulated as the following integer program:

maximize
$$\sum_{j \in V} x_j$$

subject to $\sum_{j \in V} x_j \leq 1$, $I \in I^*$
 $x_j \in \{0, 1\}, j \in V$. (1)

The variables of the above LP for each vertex $j \in V$ take the binary values 1 if vertex is included in the maximum clique, and 0 otherwise. The constraints of this LP correspond to every maximal independent set $I \in I^*$. The constraints represent the fact that every maximal independent set can atmost have one vertex member of the set belonging to the maximum clique. We relax the model by replacing the integrality constraints with non-negativity. We obtain the following linear program yielding an upper bound $\bar{\omega} \geqslant \omega(G)$:

$$\bar{\omega}(G) = \max \sum_{j \in V} x_j$$

$$s.t. \sum_{j \in V} x_j \leq 1, \quad I \in I^*$$

$$x_j \geq 0, \quad j \in V.$$

$$(2)$$

To convert the above formulation to a column generation scheme, we consider the dual of (2):

$$\bar{\omega}(G) = \min \sum_{I \in I^*} y_I$$

$$s.t. \sum_{I \in I_j} y_I \geqslant 1, \ j \in V$$

$$x_j \geqslant 0, \ I \in I^*,$$
(3)

where I_i denote the set of all maximal independent sets containing vertex $j \in V$.

2.1 Restricted Master Problem

In the above formulation, each column represent a maximal independent set. Thus, the variables of the above LP correspond to each maximal independent set, and the number of maximal independent sets in a graph on n vertices can be as large as $3^{n/3}$. Generating all maximal independent sets is as hard as solving the maximum clique problem, therefore we use a greedy approach to generate a set of few maximal independent sets such that they cover all the vertices. The generated set $I' \subseteq I^*$ is used as the basis (column-wise) to initialize the restricted master problem (RMP).

$$\bar{\omega}(G) = \min \sum_{I \in I'} y_I$$

$$s.t. \sum_{I \in I'_j} y_I \geqslant 1, \quad j \in V$$

$$x_i \geqslant 0, \quad I \in I',$$

$$(4)$$

2.2 Column Generation Sub-Problem

The CGSP would then be:

$$w = \max_{I \in I^*} \left\{ \sum_{j \in I} d_j - 1 \right\},\tag{5}$$

where d is the dual prices of (4). Thus, the CGSP is a maximum weight independent set problem, seeking to find an independent set maximizing the sum of vertex weights in G, where the weights are given by d. Also, d is the optimal solution of the following LP, which is dual to the RMP (4):

$$\max \sum_{j \in V} x_j$$

$$s.t. \sum_{j \in I} x_j \leq 1, \quad I \in I'$$

$$x_j \geq 0, \quad j \in V.$$

$$(6)$$

The CGSP can be solved using the following IP formulation:

$$\max \sum_{j \in V} d_j x_j$$

$$s.t. \ x_i + x_j \leq 1, \ \ \{i, j\} \in E$$

$$x_j \in \{0, 1\} \ j \in V.$$

$$(7)$$

3 Implementation

The greedy algorithm used to generate the subset I' of maximal independent sets and the column generation algorithm is shown below:

3.1 Greedy generation of maximal independent sets

To find a good starting basis for the RMP (4), we generate a set of maximal independent sets such that all the vertices of G are included. The pseudo-code is given in Algorithm 1.

The algorithm works as follows. For each vertex j, starting with j, all neighbours of j are removed, and then, at each step, a minimum degree vertex is chosen from the residual graph R_G and added to the maximal independent set of vertex j. Subsequently, as vertices are added to the set, their neighbours are removed and the steps are repeated until the residual graph is empty. This algorithm thus leaves us with a set of maximal independent sets for each $j \in V$. This algorithm is implemented in C++. The complete C++ program is in section 5.

3.2 Constraint Programming - RMP & CGSP Implementation

The RMP & CGSP problems are implemented in AMPL mathematical programming language and Gurobi 8.1.0 solver is used. The .mod and .run file code is in section 5. The .dat file is generated as a matrix from the generated set I' by the C++ program. The AMPL implementation column generation approach is given in Algorithm 2.

Algorithm 1 GREEDY MAXIMAL INDEPENDENT SETS

```
1: n = number of vertices in G
2: //Let \mathbf{R}_{\mathbf{G}} be the residual graph
3: //Let set[1..n] be the set of maximal independent sets containing vertex j
4: for j = 1 to n:
         R_G = G
6:
         R_G.remove(j)
7:
         set[j].\mathbf{insert}(j)
         R_{G}.remove\_neighbours(j)
8:
         if R_G \neq \emptyset:
9:
            x = \mathbf{get\_min\_degree\_vertex}(R_G)
10:
11:
         while R_G \neq \emptyset:
              set[j].insert(x)
12:
              R_G.remove(x)
13:
              R_G.remove_neighbours(x)
14:
              if R_G \neq \emptyset:
15:
16:
                 x = \mathbf{get\_min\_degree\_vertex}(R_G)
```

Algorithm 2 COLUMN GENERATION IN AMPL

```
1: Master Problem \leftarrow formulation(4)
2: Sub-Problem \leftarrow formulation(7)
3: do:
        solve Master Problem
4:
        get Dual prices from Master Problem
5:
        solve Sub-Problem using the dual prices
6:
7:
        if CGSP objective \leq 1:
           break loop
8:
9:
        else:
           add the Optimal solution of the sub – problem as a new column to the master problem
10:
11: continue loop
```

4 Results

19 graph instances were chosen from the second DIMACS implementation challenge and ran. The results are tablulated below.

| Instance | V | E | $\bar{\omega}$ | $DIMACS \ \bar{\omega}$ | no. of columns generated |
|-------------------------------|-----|--------|----------------|-------------------------|--------------------------|
| $brock200_1$ | 200 | 14834 | 38.0161 | 21 | 362 |
| $brock200_2$ | 200 | 9876 | 21.127 | 12 | 572 |
| $brock200_3$ | 200 | 12048 | 27.2307 | 15 | 472 |
| $brock200_4$ | 200 | 13089 | 30.6283 | 17 | 450 |
| c125.9 | 125 | 6963 | 43.0567 | 34 | 128 |
| c250.9 | 250 | 27984 | 71.3746 | 44 | 333 |
| c500.9 | 500 | 112332 | 126.5030 | 57 | 328 |
| $c\hbox{-} fat 200\hbox{-} 5$ | 200 | 8473 | 66.6667 | 58 | 175 |
| hamming 6-2 | 64 | 1824 | 32 | 32 | 21 |
| hamming 6-4 | 64 | 704 | 5.33333 | 4 | 108 |
| hamming 8-2 | 256 | 31616 | 128 | 128 | 108 |
| hamming 8-4 | 256 | 20864 | 16 | 16 | 500 |
| $san 200 _0.7 _1$ | 200 | 13930 | 30 | 30 | 422 |
| $san 200 _0.7 _2$ | 200 | 13930 | 18 | 18 | 4019 |
| $san 200 _0.9 _1$ | 200 | 17910 | 70 | 70 | 100 |
| $san 200 _0.9 _2$ | 200 | 17910 | 60 | 60 | 187 |
| $san 200 _0.9 _3$ | 200 | 17910 | 44 | 44 | 690 |
| $sanr200 _0.7$ | 200 | 13868 | 33.4807 | 18 | 313 |
| $sanr 200 _ 0.9$ | 200 | 17863 | 59.8245 | 42 | 242 |

5 C++ program and AMPL code

The C++ program contains the following subroutines:

- 1. Adjacency List representaion of Graph
- 2. Adjacency Matrix representaion of Graph
- 3. MAIN routine
- 4. greedy_RMP subroutine
- $5.\ {
 m remove_neighbours\ subroutine}$
- 6. get_min_degree_vertex subroutine
- 7. Maximality check 1 subroutine
- 8. Maximality check 2 subroutine

5.1 COLUMN GENERATION IMPLEMENTATION IN AMPL

```
.MOD FILE:
# -----
# MASTER PROBLEM
set SETS_J;
param nSETS integer >= 0;
set MI_SETS;
let nSETS := 0;
set M_SETS:= 1..nSETS;
set EDGES;
set NODES;
param a{SETS_J, MI_SETS} integer >= 0;
param z{SETS_J, M_SETS} default 0;
param e{EDGES, NODES};
var y{M_SETS} integer >= 0;
minimize Independence:
     sum {j in M_SETS} y[j];
subj to Sets_Containing_j{i in SETS_J}:
     sum {j in M_SETS} z[i,j] * y[j] >= 1;
```

```
# CGSP - MAXIMUM WEIGHT INDEPENDENT SET PROBLEM
# ------
param d{SETS_J} default 0.0;
var x{SETS_J} binary;
maximize I_Set_Weight:
                           sum {i in SETS_J} d[i] * x[i];
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        #d is the vector of
dual prices of the MP
subj to Edge_Constraints{i in EDGES}:
                           \#\{j \text{ in NODES } : j = \text{'node1'}\} \times [e[i,j]] + \{k \text{ in NODES } : k = mathrix = ma
 'node2'x[e[i,k]] \leftarrow 1;
                          x[e[i,'node1']] + x[e[i,'node2']] <= 1;
.RUN FILE:
# -----
# RUN FILE
# -----
reset;
option solver gurobi;
option solution_round 6;
model clique.mod;
data clique.dat;
```

```
problem Master_Pro: y, Independence, Sets_Containing_j;
      option relax_integrality 1;
      option presolve 0;
problem Sub_Pro: x, I_Set_Weight, Edge_Constraints;
      option relax_integrality 0;
      option presolve 0;
param sub_counter integer >=0;
param breaker integer >=0;
let sub_counter := 0;
let breaker := 0;
for {q in SETS_J}{
      let nSETS := nSETS + 1;
      let {j in SETS_J} z[j, nSETS] := a[j, nSETS];
      };
repeat {
      solve Master_Pro;
      let {i in SETS_J} d[i] := Sets_Containing_j[i].dual;
      solve Sub_Pro;
      #display x;
      display I_Set_Weight;
      if I_Set_Weight > 1.001 then {
            let sub_counter := sub_counter + 1;
```

```
let nSETS := nSETS + 1;
    display nSETS;
    let {k in SETS_J} z[k,nSETS] := x[k];
    }
else {
    let breaker := -1;
    break;
    }
};
display Independence;
display sub_counter;
display breaker;
display nSETS;
```

5.2 C++ PROGRAM TO GENERATE MAXIMAL INDEPENDENT SETS & CREATE .DAT FILE

```
#include <iostream>
#include <fstream>
#include <string>
#include <set>
#include <vector>

using namespace std;

int vertex_count;
int edge_count;

struct node
{
    int value = 0;
    struct node *next = NULL;
};

typedef struct node NODE;
```

```
{
      NODE *head = new NODE();
      struct node *tail;
};
typedef struct LList LLIST;
//int v_count;
LLIST *Adj = NULL;
class Graph {
private:
      bool** adjacencyMatrix;
      int vertexCount;
      bool init;
public:
      Graph(int vertexCount, bool init) {
            this->vertexCount = vertexCount;
            this->init = init;
            adjacencyMatrix = new bool*[vertexCount];
            for (int i = 0; i < vertexCount; i++) {</pre>
                  adjacencyMatrix[i] = new bool[vertexCount];
                  for (int j = 0; j < vertexCount; j++)</pre>
                        adjacencyMatrix[i][j] = init;
            }
      }
      void addEdge(int i, int j) {
            if (i >= 0 && i < vertexCount && j >= 0 && j < vertexCount) {
                  adjacencyMatrix[i][j] = true;
                  adjacencyMatrix[j][i] = true;
            }
```

```
}
      void removeEdge(int i, int j) {
            if (i \ge 0 \&\& i < vertexCount \&\& j \ge 0 \&\& j < vertexCount) {
                   adjacencyMatrix[i][j] = false;
                   adjacencyMatrix[j][i] = false;
            }
      }
      bool isEdge(int i, int j) {
            return adjacencyMatrix[i][j];
      }
      void printG(void) {
            for (int i = 0; i < vertexCount; i++) {</pre>
                   for (int j = 0; j < vertexCount; j++) {</pre>
                         cout << adjacencyMatrix[i][j] << " ";</pre>
                   cout << endl;</pre>
            }
      }
      ~Graph() {
            for (int i = 0; i < vertexCount; i++)</pre>
                   delete[] adjacencyMatrix[i];
            delete[] adjacencyMatrix;
      }
};
vector<set<int>> greedy_RMP(LLIST *Adj, const int& vertex_count, Graph& G);
void remove_neighbours(set<int>& mset, int i);
int get_min_degree_vertex(set<int>& mset, Graph& G);
void Check_Maximality(vector<set<int>>& mxl_set, Graph& G);
```

```
void Check Maximality2(vector<set<int>>& mxl set, Graph& G);
void addEdge(const int& v1, const int& v2)
      NODE *ptr = new NODE();
      ptr->value = v2;
      if (Adj[v1 - 1].head->value == 0) //value 0 means no neighbours yet
            Adj[v1 - 1].head = ptr;
            Adj[v1 - 1].tail = Adj[v1 - 1].head;
      }
      else
      {
            Adj[v1 - 1].tail \rightarrow next = ptr;
            Adj[v1 - 1].tail = ptr;
      }
//int v count;
void printAdj(int v_count)
{
      //if zero is printed, it means no neighbours
      for (int i = 0; i < v_count; i++)</pre>
      {
            cout << "Adjacency list of " << i + 1 << " :" << endl;</pre>
            NODE *ptr = Adj[i].head;
            bool flag = 1;
            while (flag)
            {
                   cout << ptr->value;
                   if (ptr->next == NULL)
                         flag = 0;
                   else
                   {
                         ptr = ptr->next;
                         cout << ",";
                   }
            cout << endl;</pre>
      }
}
struct Graph_L {
      int *V;
      LLIST *Nei;
};
set<int> all_V;
void greedy_RMP(LLIST *Adj, const int& vertex_count);
```

```
int *edge vec;
int main(void)
      ifstream file;
      string filepath, filename, name, keyword, word, a, b, e;
      int node 1, node 2;
      filepath = "F:\\Research\\Problem sets\\Max
Clique\\DIMACS all ascii\\";
      name = "p_hat300-1.clq";
      filename = filepath + name;
      if (name[0] == 'D' | name[0] == 'M' | name[0] == 'b' | name[0] == 's' |
name[0] == 'c' | name[0] == 'h' | name[0] == 'p')
            keyword = "edge";
      else
            keyword = "col";
      file.open(filename.c str());
      while (file >> word && word != keyword);
      file >> word;
      vertex_count = stoi(word);
      file >> word;
      edge_count = stoi(word);
      cout << "No. of nodes: " << vertex count << endl;</pre>
      cout << "No. of edges: " << edge_count << endl;</pre>
      bool graph_inverted = false;
      Graph Gm(vertex_count, graph_inverted);
      //Graph L G;
      int *Vertices = new int[vertex_count];
      Adj = new LLIST[vertex_count];
      edge_vec = new int[edge_count * 2];
      int j = 0;
      for (int i = 1; i <= edge_count; i++)</pre>
      {
            file >> e >> a >> b;
            node_1 = stoi(a) - 1;
            node 2 = stoi(b) - 1;
            edge_vec[j] = node_1 + 1;
            edge_vec[j + 1] = node_2 + 1;
            j = j + 2;
            Gm.addEdge(node_1, node_2);
            addEdge(node_1 + 1, node_2 + 1);
            addEdge(node_2 + 1, node_1 + 1);
      }
```

```
for (int i = 0; i < vertex count; i++)</pre>
                                  all_V.insert(i);
                 }
                 //generate maximal Independent sets for each vertex (Greedy)
                 vector<set<int>> mxl set;
                 mxl_set = greedy_RMP(Adj, vertex_count, Gm);
                 //printAdj(vertex_count);
                 //Gm.printG();
                 //cout << "ex: " << Adj[0].head->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next->next
>next->next->next->value;
}
vector<set<int>> greedy RMP(LLIST *Adj, const int& vertex count, Graph& G)
                 vector < set<int> > mxl_set(vertex_count);
                 node *ptr;
                 set<int> set_all;
                 int x;
                 for (int i = 0; i < vertex count; i++)</pre>
                                  //initialise set with all vertices
                                  set_all = all_V;
                                  //remove the vertex for which the set is defined (first residual
graph)
                                  set_all.erase(i);
                                  mxl set[i].insert(i);
                                  //remove all neighbours for the vertex for which the set is
defined (trivial step)
                                  remove_neighbours(set_all, i);
                                  //get minimum degree vertex from the residual graph
                                  if (!set_all.empty())
                                                   x = get_min_degree_vertex(set_all, G);
                                  while (!set_all.empty())
                                                   mxl_set[i].insert(x);
                                                   set_all.erase(x);
                                                   remove neighbours(set all, x);
                                                   if (!set_all.empty())
                                                                    x = get_min_degree_vertex(set_all, G);
                                  }
```

```
cout << endl;</pre>
            //int i = 0;
            cout << "Size of independent set containing vertex " << i + 1 <<</pre>
" : " << mxl_set[i].size() << endl;
            for (auto it : mxl_set[i])
                   cout << it + 1 << "--";
            cout << endl;</pre>
      }
      //Check Maximality(mxl set, G);
      //Check_Maximality2(mxl_set, G);
      ofstream fout;
      fout.open("F:\\Research\\Problem sets\\Max Clique\\Output\\out.txt");
      for (int i = 0; i < vertex_count; i++)</pre>
            set<int>::iterator it = mxl_set[i].begin();
            fout << *it+1;
            it++;
            for (it; it!=mxl_set[i].end(); it++)
                   fout << " " << *it+1;
            fout << endl;</pre>
      fout.close();
      //struct
      //vector<vector<int> vect(vertex count, 0)> Tech matrix(vertex count);
      int *Tech_matrix = new int[vertex_count*vertex_count]();
      //cout << endl << "Tech[last element] : " <<</pre>
Tech matrix[(vertex count*vertex count)-1];
      //delete [] Tech matrix;
      int row id = 0, col id = 0;
      for (int i = 0; i < vertex_count; i++)</pre>
      {
            for (auto it : mxl_set[i])
                   row_id = i * vertex_count;
                   col id = it;
                   Tech_matrix[row_id + col_id] = 1;
            }
      }
      fout.open("F:\\Research\\Problem sets\\Max
Clique\\Output\\out_matrix.txt");
      for (int i = 0; i < vertex_count; i++)</pre>
```

```
for (int j = 0; j < vertex count; j++)</pre>
             fout << Tech_matrix[(i*vertex_count) + j] << " ";</pre>
      fout << endl;
fout.close();
fout.open("F:\\Research\\Problem sets\\Max Clique\\Test\\clique.dat");
//param e
string sEDGES, sMI_SETS, sSETS_J;
for (int i = 0; i < edge count; i++)</pre>
{
      sEDGES = sEDGES + " e" + to string(i + 1);
for (int i = 0; i < vertex_count; i++)</pre>
      sMI SETS = sMI SETS + " " + to string(i + 1);
      sSETS_J = sSETS_J + " " + to_string(i + 1);
}
fout << "set EDGES :=" << sEDGES << ";" << endl;</pre>
fout << "set NODES :=" << " node1 node2;" << end1 << end1;</pre>
fout << "set MI_SETS :=" << sMI_SETS << ";" << endl;</pre>
fout << "set SETS_J :=" << sSETS_J << ";" << endl << endl;</pre>
fout << "param e: node1 node2 :=" << endl;</pre>
int j = 0;
for (int i = 0; i < edge_count; i++)</pre>
      fout << "e" << i + 1 << " ";
      fout << edge_vec[j] << " " << edge_vec[j + 1] << endl;</pre>
      j = j + 2;
fout << ";" << endl;
fout << "param a: ";</pre>
fout << sMI_SETS;</pre>
fout << " :=" << endl;
for (int i = 0; i < vertex_count; i++)</pre>
      //fout << "sets j";
      fout.width(3); fout << left << i+1;</pre>
      for (int j = 0; j < vertex count; j++)</pre>
             fout << " " << Tech_matrix[(j*vertex_count) + i];</pre>
      fout << endl;
}
```

```
fout << ";";
      fout.close();
      delete[] Tech_matrix;
      return mxl_set;
}
void remove_neighbours(set<int>& mset, int i)
      node *ptr;
      ptr = Adj[i].head;
      while (ptr != NULL)
      {
            mset.erase(ptr->value-1);
            ptr = ptr->next;
      }
}
int get_min_degree_vertex(set<int>& mset, Graph& G)
      int deg = 0;
      int prev_deg = mset.size();
      int x;
      for (auto it_1 : mset)
      {
            deg = 0;
            for (auto it_2 : mset)
                   deg += G.isEdge(it_1, it_2);
            if (deg <= prev_deg)</pre>
                   x = it_1;
                   prev_deg = deg;
            }
      if (!(x > -1) && !(x < vertex_count))</pre>
            cout << "Uninitialised error";</pre>
      return x;
}
void Check_Maximality(vector<set<int>>& mxl_set, Graph& G)
      cout << endl;</pre>
      cout << "vec size " << mxl_set.size() << endl;</pre>
      bool b = true;
      set<int> s_all, s1_all;
```

```
for (int i = 0; i < mxl_set.size(); i++)</pre>
            s_all = all_V;
            s1_all = s_all;
            for (auto it : mxl_set[i])
                   for (auto it2 : s_all)
                         if (G.isEdge(it, it2))
                               s1_all.erase(it2);
                   s_all = s1_all;
            if (s_all!=mxl_set[i])
                   b = false;
                   break;
      }
      cout << "Maximality check: " << b;</pre>
}
void Check_Maximality2(vector<set<int>>& mxl_set, Graph& G)
{
      cout << endl;</pre>
      cout << "vec size " << mxl_set.size() << endl;</pre>
      bool b = false;
      set<int> s_all, s1_all;
      for (int i = 0; i < mxl_set.size(); i++)</pre>
      {
            s_all = all_V;
            s1_all = s_all;
            for (auto it : mxl_set[i])
                   s_all.erase(it);
            for (auto it : s_all)
                   b = false;
                   //cout << b;
                   for (auto it2 : mxl_set[i])
                         b = b || G.isEdge(it, it2);
                   //cout << b;
```