

Max Shi
Essay 2 Peer Review
Alexandria Tao's Essay 2

Formatting Checklist

- ☒ ~~Writer's name in upper left corner~~
- ☒ ~~Professor's Name~~
- ☒ ~~Course number and section~~
- ☒ ~~Today's date~~
- ☒ ~~Original Title~~
- ☒ ~~Times New Roman 12-pt font~~
- ☒ ~~Double Spaced~~
- ☒ ~~One inch margins~~
- ☒ ~~Each paragraph indented~~
- ☒ ~~At least 3 pages~~
- ☒ ~~Page Numbers~~

1. Does the introduction introduce the thesis of the paper? If it's not in the introduction, can you identify it anywhere else in the essay? If the paper presents a thesis, a main idea, or a point that the writer wants to express, please identify it and write, in your own words.

The introduction properly introduces the thesis in two parts. The first part of the thesis is in the first half of the introduction, explaining that Gregor is isolated in physical, social, and mental ways. The second half of the thesis is at the end of the paragraph, where the author asserts that the cause of Gregor's isolation is the inability for Gregor to communicate with his family.

2. Does the thesis answer the assignment question?

Yes, the thesis answers the assignment question. It sets up an exploration of Gregor's isolation and alienation in physical, social, and mental ways, as well as linking that isolation to communication by stating that the inability to communicate is the true cause of the isolation and alienation.

3. Reverse outline your friend's paper. Briefly explain how each paragraph is relevant to the main thesis?

The introduction paragraph outlines the main thesis, and sets up the essay. It also asserts that it is not the transformation of Gregor, but his inability to communicate his true desires that causes his isolation.

The next paragraph delves into the physical isolation that Gregor experiences. It draws on examples from the text such as the reactions of his father, his mother, his sister, and the tenants, to show how he is physically isolated. Furthermore, the author shows how communication played into this isolation, as Gregor's inability to communicate the rotting apple on his back showed how he felt physically isolated.

The next paragraph goes into the mental alienation that Gregor experienced. The author examines the actions of Grete, who, as the strongest link to the family that Gregor has, is pivotal in the mental alienation Gregor experiences when she severs his bond to

him. Again, the author also connects this isolation back to communication, quoting text from the father.

The next paragraph goes on to examine a detail from the beginning of the story to push the idea that his isolation began before his transformation. This idea goes on to support that Gregor is the one most responsible for his isolation, rather than his family. It is Gregor's lack of communication that prevents him from being connected, and not his family who refuses to reach out to him, as seen by his family's efforts to open the door at the beginning of the story.

The second to last paragraph moves on to build on the idea that Gregor is at fault, analyzing the speech at the beginning of the story where Gregor is unfazed by his transformation, but more concerned about how he is going to work and complaining about his social status. This makes it clear that his transformation is not the sole cause of his isolation.

Finally, the final paragraph wraps the ideas together, and reiterates the thesis, stating that Gregor's lack of ability to communicate caused his isolation, rather than his transformation into a bug.

4. Are the paragraphs organized in an effective order? How could it be further improved?

I think the paragraphs are in an effective order, exploring the different ways he is isolated and always linking them back to communication. I would have liked better continuity in the paragraphs, though, as the first three body paragraphs explore a type of isolation, while the next two analyze two specific points in the story.

5. Look for places that the writer is summarizing the assigned text rather than analyzing it. As you read through the essay, identify the parts where you think the writer is analyzing the text or developing an original idea. Also identify the parts that provide summary.

The author does a good job here of consistently developing original ideas using the text, rather than summarizing it. All references to the text are developed into how communication is related to the isolation, as well as emphasizing how the isolation happened before the transformation. However, I believe the fourth body paragraph where the author brings in the secondary source is a lot of summary about what that secondary source says about the text, and I would like more original ideas coming from that secondary sources' opinions.

6. How does your friend's paper engage with the assigned text? How do you think he/she/they can improve the level of engagement?

The paper engages with the assigned text very well. She takes many different areas of the text, and shows how throughout the story the constant theme of inability to communicate plays a role in Gregor's isolation and alienation. I believe the paragraph about Gregor's initial speech is a very strong indicator of how Gregor's isolation is not a result of the transformation, which really helps the thesis statement.

7. Look at the quotations used in your peer's paper and check if the quotes were introduced, quoted, cited and discussed properly. If any of the quotes is not properly introduced, quoted, cited, or discussed, identify them and explain which element is not handled properly

Many of the quotes in the paper are introduced well, but the discussion and connection aspects could be better. For example, the quote regarding Grete's violin does

not have much discussion or connection afterward, directly jumping to the father's quote to connect the idea back to communication.

8. Do all the quotations fit with the paper? If not, please mark them and explain why

All quotations used in the paper make sense in the context of the thesis.

9. Are the citations proper? [Author's name either in the sentence or in the in-text citation; page number in the in-text citation]

Yes, all citations are proper.

10. Is the secondary source scholarly?

Yes, the secondary source is scholarly.

11. How does the secondary source contribute to the argument?

The secondary source brings in a second analysis of Gregor's actions and the isolation it creates before the transformation, supporting the idea that Gregor's physical transformation is not solely to blame for the isolation that Gregor feels.

12. Identify what you consider to be your partner's most successful paragraph in terms of textual analysis? Why?

I consider the second to last paragraph to be the most successful in terms of textual analysis. The paragraph introduces brand new ideas to the meaning of Gregor's speech at the beginning of the story that is not obvious to the reader, and appropriately contributes to the support of the thesis.

13. Identify what you consider to be your partner's least successful paragraph in terms of textual analysis? Why?

I consider the second paragraph on the third page bringing in the secondary source to be the least successful. This paragraph, while supporting the thesis, seems to just summarize what the secondary source said about the significance of the door locking, and does not contribute many new ideas.

14. Are there places where you lose the writer's train of thought, where the meaning is unclear? Identify them and discuss them with the writer.

There are no areas where I lose the writer's train of thought.

15. Are there moments that display reading comprehension problems? If there is any, please identify them.

There are no moments that display reading comprehension problems. Overall, the engagement with the text is very good.

16. Make a list of action points for the writer to improve his/her/their draft.

Greater parallel structure over the paragraphs would help the reading of the paper flow a bit more smoothly, but I understand what you're trying to do with the last two body paragraphs.

More discussion of the quotes after you copy the quotation will help emphasize your points and create a stronger argument.

Combining in some way the last two body paragraphs would help integrate the secondary source better, as they talk about similar regions of the text. You might be able to combine this under the umbrella of "pre-transformation" as they have the same idea.

17. Is there a Works Cited Page?

- Does it have the title Works Cited? [Do not italicize the words Works Cited or put them in quotation marks and center the words Works Cited at the top of the page.]

Only the title should be centered. The citation entries should be aligned with the left margin]

The title needs to be centered.

- Does it follow alphabetical order? Yes
- Is the page double-spaced? [Also, do not skip spaces between entries] Yes
- Are the second and subsequent lines indented? Yes
- Do the entries begin with the last name of the author? Yes
- Are the titles italicized or put into quotation marks correctly? [if the source is a book or a movie, the title should be italicized; if it's an article, poem, encyclopedia or dictionary entry or the episode of a TV series, then it should be in quotation marks.] Yes
- Are punctuation marks used correctly? Yes