Annotation Guide
Transition Marker Use in L2 English High-Stakes Essay Writing
Sophia Minnillo
October 29, 2021
Revised: December 30, 2021

Contents:

1. Identifying TMs
    a. TM definition
    b. Current list
    c. Ensuring that our list is complete: IRR
    d. Determining whether a form is being used as a TM
2. Classifying TMs by function
    a. Addition (Hyland, 2005):
        i. "adds elements to an argument"
    b. Comparison (mix between Hyland, 2005 and Halliday & Hasan, 1976)
        i. "marks arguments as **similar**"
    c. Contrast (Adversative in Halliday & Hasan, 1976)
        i. Marks arguments as different
    d. Causal (Halliday & Hasan, 1976)
        i. "tell readers that a conclusion is being drawn or justified or that an argument is being countered"
    e. Temporal (Halliday & Hasan, 1976)
        i. Establishes pragmatic connection relative to temporality in the discourse
3. Appropriateness/accuracy judgments
    a. Form
    b. Semantics

    c. Scale

1- Identifying Transition Markers (TMs)

TM definition

==**Transition markers** are mainly <u>conjunctions and adverbial phrases</u> which help readers <u>interpret pragmatic connections</u> between steps in an argument...It is unimportant whether items here contribute to syntactic coordination or subordination but to count as metadiscourse they must perform a role internal to the discourse rather than the outside world, helping the reader interpret links between ideas (Hyland, 2005, p.50).==

Hyland (2005): transition markers are a type of **metadiscourse** marker. Metadiscourse is a way of **understanding language in use, representing a writer or speaker's attempts to guide a receiver's perception of a text.** Transitional markers are **interactive metadiscourse resources**, as they are used to organize propositional information in ways that a projected target audience is likely to find coherent and convincing.

Halliday and Hasan (1976) provide a similar definition of 'conjunctions,' which we take into our definition of TMs. They describe a conjunction: "it normally has first position in the sentence and has as its domain the whole of the sentence in which it occurs...It has the effect of repudiating any other conjunction that has occurred previously in the sentence-initial position.

Current list (80 total)

[Google sheet](#) with list, 3 tabs
   1. List by source
   2. List in alphabetical order
   3. List in order by the function of the TM (addition, comparison, contrast, etc.)

Sources:
   1. **Hyland (2005, p.218-224)**
      a. Appendix: Metadiscourse items investigated.
      b. I considered Hyland's list of 48 TMs, but I considered the list to not be comprehensive enough. Hyland himself included other TMs in his discussion of transition markers in Ch. 4, "Metadiscourse and Rhetoric" (e.g., "admittedly, p.50). I also included other interactive metadiscourse markers listed in the appendix, including some Code Glosses and Frame Markers, as they fit the operational definition of TMs that Hyland established on p.50.
   2. **Halliday & Hasan (1976, p.242)**
      a. Table of Conjunctive Relations
      b. Within their framework of text cohesion, Halliday and Hasan discussed conjunctions, which largely overlap with TMs. They provided a list of 110 TMs, categorized within their 4 categories of "conjunctive relations": additive, adversative, causal, and temporal. I included the TMs from this list that fit our working definition.

3. **Han & Gardner (2021, p.6)**
    a. Table 4: Frequencies of transitions in the Han CH-EN corpus
    b. Han and Gardner started off with Hyland's (2005) list, and then compiled their own list of TMs. They did this through a query of their corpus, which was syntactically tagged through the Penn Treebank, to find all adverbs, conjunctions, and prepositions at the beginning of a sentence or following a semicolon. Their list of 46 TMs is included in our baseline list.

Ensuring that our list is complete: IRR

- Number of essays analyzing
    - 7 essays/prompt/level = 7 * 8 * 3 = **168 total essays**
    - **IRR**: 168 * 0.2 = 37 essays for IRR
        - About 12 per score level; need to make sure to include all prompts

Steps:
1. In this excel sheet, go through the 'essays' tab to find the next essay to annotate
2. Rename one of the 'template' tabs with the Filename of the essay you're annotating
3. In this google doc, find the text of the essay with the corresponding Filename
4. Go through each text and write a number in parentheses in front of all of the transition markers
    a. e.g. (1) However,
    b. (2) Nonetheless
5. Add each transition marker next to its number in order on the excel sheet

Determining whether a form is being used as a TM

When deciding whether something is a TM, ask yourself:
- Is it on the list of TMs previously treated in the literature? If not, is this a conjunction or adverbial phrase?
- Does it help readers interpret pragmatic connections between steps in an argument?
- Is its role primarily at the discourse level, not the syntactic level (e.g., not coordination or subordination)?

If yes to all, include. If yes to fewer than all, come up with rationale for including in notes.

Revision December 2021:
- For the following TMs, we are only counting those that occur sentence-initially or following a semicolon:
    a. But
    b. And
    c. Because
    d. So
    e. Since

2- Classifying TMs by function

This classification is commonly practiced in the literature (e.g., Yang & Sun, 2012), and it will help us better understand how the functional use of TMs differs by proficiency level and prompt. For TMs to be considered metadiscourse, "they must perform a role internal to the discourse rather than the outside world, helping the reader interpret links between ideas" (Hyland, 2005, p.50). We are using 5 categories based on a synthesis of Hyland and Halliday and Hasan's work.

Functions

Classification	Description	Source
Addition My client says he does not know this witness. **Further**, he denies having seen her or spoken to her Halliday & Hasan (1976, p.244)	Adds elements to an argument Potentially consist of items such as and, furthermore, moreover, by the way	Hyland (2005, p.50) Equivalent to Halliday & Hasan (1976, p.244) notion of **additive** conjunctions, which the example is from
Comparison In studies of university textbooks, Hyland (2005:102) found that transitions accounted for around 40% of all items and almost 60% of all interactive items. **Similarly**, Biber (2006:70) found that...	Marks arguments as similar Comparing arguments and evidence Similarly, likewise, equally, in the same way, correspondingly	Adaptation of Hyland (2005, p.50), who conceived of comparison as including 'comparing and contrasting arguments and evidence.' We are splitting up the category for greater nuance.
Contrast In other words, only good health can bring happiness because a rich man cannot buy health and life.... **In contrast** to these opinions, some people keep the different ideas that all the happiness mentioned above is physical happiness.... (Yang & Sun, p.39).	Marks arguments as different Contrasting arguments and evidence Tell readers that an argument is being countered In contrast, however, but, on the contrary, on the other hand admittedly, nevertheless, anyway, in any case, of course	Adaptation of Hyland (2005, p.50) and Halliday & Hasan's (1976, p.250) notion of **adversative** conjunctions as expressing a relation that is 'contrary to expectation.' These were classified within the causal (consequence) category by Hyland, but I think they fit better within our notion of contrast.

Causal Your selection of food at breakfast, **therefore**, can prevent or produce fatigue throughout the day (Halliday & Hasan, 1976, p.257).	Tell readers that a conclusion is being drawn or justified Marks arguments as causing or being caused by one another. Thus, therefore, consequently, in conclusion,	Adaptation of Hyland's (2005, p.50) notion of 'consequence' (see above note) and Halliday & Hasan's (1976, p.256) notion of 'causal conjunctions.'
Temporal 'There's no sort of use in knocking,' said the Footman, 'and that for two reasons. **First**, because I'm on the same side of the door as you are; **secondly**, because they're making such a noise inside, no one could possibly hear you' (Halliday & Hasan, 1976, p.264)	Express successivity in the process of communication (e.g. expressing 'next in the course of discussion' through the TM 'next') Order arguments in the text (Hyland)	Halliday & Hasan (1976, p.261) Similar to Hyland's (2005, p.51) frame markers

Steps:

→ Write the classification in the 'Function' column on the excel sheet
- Capitalize the first letter of each word and make sure spelling is correct
- If you have any concerns or think that the TM might be serving multiple functions, write it in the notes

3- Appropriateness/Accuracy Judgements

Scale:

0= inappropriate
1 = appropriate
Ambiguous = can't determine because context is so unclear

Categories:

1) **<u>Form</u>**
    a) How well-formed is this TM?
        i) Orthographic errors and transformed collocations count here.
    b) Example of a 1
        i) today as education developing, there are more and more people can choose what they want to learn and when they want to learn, **however** (1) where, in various situations , I think what kind of knowledge we recived should be depond on which subject we want to learn.
    c) Example of a 0
        i) we must choose the speci , **one hand** (5) the college or university will seprate different departments. such as, for the college student first need to decide what kind of subject he wants to learn, and then dicide which specific subject for his further study.
        ii) Why? Missing "on" for "on one hand"
2) **<u>Semantics</u>**
    a) Given the meaning of this TM, is it appropriate to use this TM in the given context?
    b) Example of a 1
        i) **firstly**, (2) when we are in basic aducation,such as in primary school. in that time, we should get broad knowlege and learn as such as we can, no matter where and when.
    c) Example of a 0
        i) we must choose the speci , **one hand** (5) the college or university will seprate different departments. such as, for the college student first need to decide what kind of subject he wants to learn, and then dicide which specific subject for his further study.
        ii) Why? Not clear what contrasting

Steps:
- Write scores in the X Accuracy columns
- If the score is less than 1, write a justification in the XA_notes column
- Do this for every ™

4- Example analysis

Prompt 1: avg. 357 words
Do you agree or disagree with the following statement?

==**It is better to have broad knowledge of many academic subjects than to specialize in one specific subject.**==

Low, P1, 432334.txt

today as education developing, there are more and more people can choose what they want to learn and when they want to learn, **however** (1) where, in various situations , I think what kind of knowledge we recived should be depond on which subject we want to learn.

firstly, (2) when we are in basic aducation,such as in primary school. in that time, we should get broad knowlege and learn as such as we can, no matter where and when. we can get knowlege from broad areas. there are a lot of interesting for children at that time. **for example**, (3) we will be learn math,music, history, and genernal knowledge. more knowledge we get more telent we are look like. and there will become a bai

but (4) when we are in high education, such as college or unveristy. we must choose the speci , **one hand** (5) the college or university will seprate different departments. such as, for the college student first need to decide what kind of subject he wants to learn, and then dicide which specific subject for his further study. **and** (6) some of them do the specific researches about their subject. such as scientists, or doctors.

Appropriateness/Accuracy
0 = not at all appropriate
1= partially appropriate
2 = appropriate

Number	Marker	Function	Form	Semantics
1	however	contrast	1	0 Contrasting statement difficult to follow
2	firstly	temporal	1	1
3	For example	addition	1	1

4	but	contrast	1	1
5	(on) one hand	contrast	0 Missing on	0 Not clear what contrasting
6	and	addition	1	1