

CSC384 Summer 2020 Take Home

1 a) $M_1 = \{A, B, C\}$

A	x
B	z
C	y

above^{M1} = $\{ \langle B, C \rangle, \langle A, C \rangle, \langle A, B \rangle \}$

under^{M1} = $\{ \langle C, B \rangle, \langle C, A \rangle, \langle B, A \rangle \}$

clear^{M1} = $\{ A \}$

ontable^{M1} = $\{ C \}$

consider under^{M2}(C, A) where C is under A. A is above C or better put C is under A but ^{A is} not immediately above C, also A is above B and C and $A \neq C$ hence under(C, A) would equate false but in reality is true.

1 b) Add to existing set following sentences

$\Rightarrow \forall x \exists y (\text{clear}(x) \vee \text{above}(y, x))$

$\Rightarrow \forall x \exists y (\text{ontable}(x) \vee \text{under}(y, x))$

$\hookrightarrow \forall y \forall x \forall z ((\neg \text{under}(z, x) \wedge \neg \text{above}(z, y) \wedge (x \neq z \neq y)) \vee (\text{ontable}(x) \wedge (y = x)) \rightarrow \text{under}(y, x))$

No element below/under x and no element above y hence y must be directly under it.

#2 Let M_1 be a structure such that

$$M_1 = \{A, B\}$$

$$P_1^{M_1} = \{\langle A, A \rangle, \langle A, B \rangle\}$$

$$P_2^{M_1} = \{B\}$$

$$P_3^{M_1} = \{A\}$$

Part 1

$$\forall x [(\forall y (P_1(x, y) \rightarrow (P_2(y) \vee P_3(y))) \rightarrow ((\forall z (P_1(x, z) \rightarrow P_2(z))) \wedge \exists w (P_1(x, w) \rightarrow P_3(w))))]$$

part 3

if $x = A$ and $y = A/B$

then $P_1(x, y)$ holds

and if $y = A$ then P_3 holds and if $y = B$ then P_2 holds
hence Part 1 holds. The first part of the outer implication holds and hence, the latter must hold for tautology.

Part 2. $x = A$ and $z = A$

then Part 2 does not hold since $P_1(A, A)$ holds but $P_2(A)$ does not.

Part 3. $x = A$ and $w = B$

then Part 3 also does not hold since $P_1(A, B)$ holds but $P_3(B)$ does not hold hence implication fails.

Since Part 2 AND Part 3 return false \exists a structure, M_1 which disproves that this formula is a tautology.

3

a) Φ is not satisfiable. due to the fact
 if $x=A$, $y=A$, and $z=A$ or $x=y=z$ generally.
 then (4) results in True
 but (5) states $\forall x \forall y \forall z (\text{between}(A, A, A) \rightarrow \neg \text{between}(A, A, A))$
 which is never True hence not satisfiable.

2 sets of sentences

$\Phi_1 - \forall x \forall y \forall z (\text{between}(x, y, z) \rightarrow \text{between}(z, y, x))$
 $- \forall x \forall y \forall z \forall w (\text{between}(y, x, z) \rightarrow \text{between}(y, x, w) \vee \text{between}(z, x, w))$

$\Phi_2 - \forall x \forall y \forall z ((\text{between}(x, y, z) \wedge \text{between}(y, x, z)) \rightarrow (x=y))$
 $- \forall x \forall y \forall z ((\text{between}(y, x, z) \vee \text{between}(z, y, x) \vee \text{between}(x, z, y))$

4 Convert to Clausal form.

$$(1) \forall a_1, \forall a_2 \forall o \exists s (\neg(\text{permuted}(a_2) \wedge \text{subactivity}(a_1, a_2) \wedge \text{occurrence_of}(o, a_2)) \vee \text{occurrence_of}(s, a_1))$$

$$\forall a_1, \forall a_2 \forall o \exists s ((\neg \text{permuted}(a_2) \vee \neg \text{subactivity}(a_1, a_2) \vee \neg \text{occurrence_of}(o, a_2)) \vee \text{occurrence_of}(s, a_1))$$

$$\forall a_1, \forall a_2 \forall o ((\neg \text{permuted}(a_2) \vee \neg \text{subactivity}(a_1, a_2) \vee \neg \text{occurrence_of}(o, a_2) \vee \text{occurrence_of}(g_1(a_1, a_2, o), a_1))$$

$$\forall a_1, \forall a_2 \forall o (\neg \text{permuted}(a_2) \vee \neg \text{subactivity}(a_1, a_2) \vee \neg \text{occurrence_of}(o, a_2) \vee \text{occurrence_of}(g_1(a_1, a_2, o), a_1))$$

Clause ① $\neg \text{permuted}(a_2) \vee \neg \text{subactivity}(a_1, a_2) \vee \neg \text{occurrence_of}(o, a_2) \vee \text{occurrence_of}(g_1(a_1, a_2, o), a_1)$

$$(2) \forall a_1, \forall a_2, \forall a_3 (\neg(\text{subactivity}(a_1, a_2) \wedge \text{subactivity}(a_2, a_3)) \vee \text{subactivity}(a_1, a_3))$$

$$\forall a_1, \forall a_2, \forall a_3 ((\neg \text{subactivity}(a_1, a_2) \vee \neg \text{subactivity}(a_2, a_3)) \vee \text{subactivity}(a_1, a_3))$$

$$\forall a_1, \forall a_2, \forall a_3 (\neg \text{subactivity}(a_1, a_2) \vee \neg \text{subactivity}(a_2, a_3) \vee \text{subactivity}(a_1, a_3))$$

Clause ② $\neg \text{subactivity}(a_1, a_2) \vee \neg \text{subactivity}(a_2, a_3) \vee \text{subactivity}(a_1, a_3)$

$$(3) \forall o, \forall f \exists s (\neg \text{falsifies}(o, f) \vee \text{occurrence_of}(o, s))$$

$$\forall o, \forall f \exists s (\neg \text{falsifies}(o, f) \vee \text{occurrence_of}(o, s))$$

$$\forall o, \forall f (\neg \text{falsifies}(o, f) \vee \text{occurrence_of}(o, g_2(o, f)))$$

Clause ③ $\neg \text{falsifies}(o, f) \vee \text{occurrence_of}(o, g_2(o, f))$

(4) $\forall o \forall f (\text{falsifies}(o, f) \rightarrow \text{State}(f))$

$\forall o \forall f (\neg \text{falsifies}(o, f) \vee \text{State}(f))$

Clause (4) $\neg \text{falsifies}(o, f) \vee \text{State}(f)$

(5) $\forall o (\text{occurrence_of}(o, A_1) \vee \text{falsifies}(o, F_1))$

Clause (5) $\neg \text{occurrence_of}(o, A_1) \vee \text{falsifies}(o, F_1)$

(6) $\forall o (\neg \text{occurrence_of}(o, A_3) \vee \text{falsifies}(o, F_1))$

Clause (6) $\neg \text{occurrence_of}(o, A_3) \vee \text{falsifies}(o, F_1)$

(7) $\forall s (\neg \text{falsifies}(s, F_2) \vee \text{occurrence_of}(s, A_4))$

Clause (7) $\neg \text{falsifies}(s, F_2) \vee \text{occurrence_of}(s, A_4)$

(8) $\forall o (\neg \text{occurrence_of}(o, A_4) \vee \text{falsifies}(o, F_2))$

Clause (8) $\neg \text{occurrence_of}(o, A_4) \vee \text{falsifies}(o, F_2)$

Clauses (9 \rightarrow 15) = (9) \rightarrow (15) from Kb

Negation of Query.

$\neg (\forall o_1 (\text{occurrence_of}(o_1, B) \rightarrow (\exists o_2 \text{falsifies}(o_2, F_2))))$

$\exists o_1, \neg [\neg \text{occurrence_of}(o_1, B) \vee (\exists o_2 \text{falsifies}(o_2, F_2))]$

$\exists o_1 (\text{occurrence_of}(o_1, B) \wedge (\forall o_2 \neg \text{falsifies}(o_2, F_2)))$

$\text{occurrence_of}(c, B) \wedge \neg \text{falsifies}(o_2, F_2)$

\uparrow constant.

Clause (16) $\text{occurrence_of}(c, B)$

Clause (17) $\neg \text{falsifies}(o_2, F_2)$

Clause 16 \rightarrow Clause 17 = (16) \rightarrow (17)

Resolution Proof from clauses

1. $(\neg \text{permuted}(a_2), \neg \text{subactivity}(a_1, a_2), \neg \text{occurrence_of}(o, a_2), \text{occurrence_of}(g(a_1, a_2, o), a_1))$

2. $(\neg \text{subactivity}(a_1, a_2), \neg \text{subactivity}(a_2, a_3), \text{subactivity}(a_1, a_3))$

3. $(\neg \text{falsifies}(o, f), \text{occurrence_of}(o, g_2(o, f)))$

4. $(\neg \text{falsifies}(o, f), \text{state}(f))$

5. $(\neg \text{occurrence_of}(o, A), \text{falsifies}(o, F_1))$

6. $(\neg \text{occurrence_of}(o, A_3), \text{falsifies}(o, F_1))$

7. $(\neg \text{falsifies}(s, F_2), \text{occurrence_of}(s, A_4))$

8. $(\neg \text{occurrence_of}(o_2, A_4), \text{falsifies}(o_2, F_2))$

9. $\text{occurrence_of}(\text{Occ}, A)$

10. $\text{subactivity}(A_1, A)$

11. $\text{subactivity}(A_1, A_2)$

12. $\text{subactivity}(A_3, A)$

13. $\text{subactivity}(A_4, B)$

14. $\text{permuted}(A)$

15. $\text{permuted}(B)$

Query { 16. $\text{occurrence_of}(C, B)$

17. $\neg \text{falsifies}(o_2, F_2)$

18. $R[8b, 17] \{o = o_2\} (\neg \text{occurrence_of}(o_2, A_4))$

19. $R[1d, 18] \{g(a, a_2, o) = o_2, a_1 = A_4\} (\neg \text{permuted}(a_2), \neg \text{subactivity}(A_4, a_2), \neg \text{occurrence_of}(o, a_2))$

20. $R[19a, 15] \{a_2 = B\} (\neg \text{subactivity}(A_4, B), \neg \text{occurrence_of}(o, a_2))$

21. $R[20b, 16] \{o = C\} (\neg \text{subactivity}(A_4, B))$

22. $R[21, 13] ()$

□