Dear Editors and Reviewers:

We would like to submit the manuscript "Maintaining Predictable Traffic Engineering Performance under Controller Failures for Software-Defined WANs" for consideration for publication in the IEEE Journal on Selected Areas in Communications - Advances in Internet Routing and Addressing. Part of this paper has been presented at the ACM The Web Conference (WWW) in 2024. The conference version can be found at https://dl.acm.org/doi/abs/10.1145/3589334.3645321.

We would like to emphasize that there are many differences between this submission and the conference version. The key differences are summarized as follows.

- We enriched Section I by discussing why the existing coarse-grained switch-controller reassignment works may lead to poor recovery performance.
- We enriched Section II-C by analyzing why multiple controller failures should be considered and why offline flows should be reassigned immediately after controller failures.
- We also discussed controller synchronization methods in SD-WANs in Section III-A to maintain a global network view for centralized control and better TE performance.
- In Section III-B, we emphasized that different failure scenarios (*e.g.*, simultaneous failures among controllers or sequential failures) would not affect the recovery performance of our proposed solution.
- We added Section V-A to provide a rigorous proof of the NP-hardness of the formulated TPFCRFR problem.
- We added Section V-C to give the time complexity analysis of the proposed heuristic algorithm.
- For better readability, we added Table 1 to introduce the table of notations used in this paper.
- We enriched Section VI-A to improve the simulation setup by introducing network topologies, SD-WAN settings, and pre-configured path-set in detail.
- To show the generalizability of our proposed solution, we further add extensive simulation results on a service provider network (*i.e.*, Sprintlink) in Section VI-C.
- Since no measured TMs are available for the service provider network for the Sprintlink network, we also used the Modulated Gravity Model (MGM) to create spatiotemporal TMs for the network.
- We also improved the background knowledge of our paper by introducing and analyzing the following recent works.

[1] S. Dou, L. Qi, and Z. Guo, “ARES: Predictable Traffic Engineering under Controller Failures in SD-WANs,” in Proc. of the ACM Web Conference (WWW), 2024.

[28] K. Thompson, G. J. Miller, and R. Wilder, “Wide-area Internet traffic patterns and characteristics,” IEEE Network, vol. 11, no. 6, pp. 10–23, 1997.

[37] D. Ongaro and J. Ousterhout, “In search of an understandable consensus algorithm,” in Proc. of the USENIX Annual Technical Conference (ATC), 2014, pp. 305–319.

[38] E. Sakic and W. Kellerer, “Impact of adaptive consistency on distributed sdn applications: An empirical study,” IEEE Journal on Selected Areas in Communications, vol. 36, no. 12, pp. 2702–2715, 2018.

[39] A. Panda, W. Zheng, X. Hu, A. Krishnamurthy, and S. Shenker, “SCL: Simplifying Distributed SDN Control Planes,” in Proc. of the USENIX Symposium on Networked Systems Design and Implementation (NSDI), 2017, pp. 329–345.

[43] S. Even, A. Itai, and A. Shamir, “On the complexity of time table and multi-commodity flow problems,” in Proc. of the IEEE Symposium on Foundations of Computer Science (SFCS). IEEE, 1975, pp. 184–193.

[44] J. Renegar, “A polynomial-time algorithm, based on Newton’s method, for linear programming,” Mathematical Programming, vol. 40, no. 1, pp. 59–93, 1988.

[46] L. A. Wolsey and G. L. Nemhauser, Integer and combinatorial optimization. John Wiley & Sons, 2014.

[47] T. L. Magnanti, P. Mirchandani, and R. Vachani, “Modeling and solving the two-facility capacitated network loading problem,” Operations Research, vol. 43, no. 1, pp. 142–157, 1995.

[49] N. Spring, R. Mahajan, and D. Wetherall, “Measuring ISP topologies with Rocketfuel,” ACM SIGCOMM Computer Communication Review, vol. 32, no. 4, pp. 133–145, 2002.

[51] P. Tune and M. Roughan, “Spatiotemporal traffic matrix synthesis,” in Proc. of the Annual Conference on ACM Special Interest Group on Data Communication (SIGCOMM), 2015, pp. 579–592.

[58] Z. Xu, F. Y. Yan, R. Singh, J. T. Chiu, A. M. Rush, and M. Yu, “Teal: Learning-Accelerated Optimization of WAN Traffic Engineering,” in Proc. of the Annual Conference on ACM Conference on Special Interest Group on Data Communication (SIGCOMM), 2023, pp. 378–393.

[63] S. Troia, F. Sapienza, L. Var´e, and G. Maier, “On deep reinforcement learning for traffic engineering in SD-WAN,” IEEE Journal on Selected Areas in Communications, vol. 39, no. 7, pp. 2198–2212, 2020.

[67] F. Altheide, S. Buttgereit, and M. Rossberg, “Increasing Resilience of SD-WAN by Distributing the Control Plane [Extended Version],” IEEE Transactions on Network and Service Management, 2024.

[68] Y. Zhang, J. Tourrilhes, Z.-L. Zhang, and P. Sharma, “Improving SD-WAN resilience: From vertical handoff to WAN-aware MPTCP,” IEEE Transactions on Network and

Service Management, vol. 18, no. 1, pp. 347–361, 2021.

We hope that you will enjoy reading our new paper.

Sincerely,
Songshi Dou and Zehua Guo