Policy Frames Codebook

Updated 27 October 2014

Amber Boydstun University of California, Davis aboydstun@ucdavis.edu

Justin Gross University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill jhgross@unc.edu

This coding scheme outlines a structure for coding frame cues (i.e., information signaling a frame in a given text) according to frame categories that transcend policy issues, similar to how the Policy Agendas Codebook <www.policyagendas.org> employs topic categories that transcend agendas. The premise here is that policy issues are multi-dimensional; each issue can be talked about, or framed, from different perspectives. Frame cues can come in many forms and can be categorized in many ways. This codebook offers a set of 'general' dimensions that, at least in theory, is a near-exhaustive list of dimensions that could be used to frame any policy issue. The four layers identified below overlap, meaning the same bit of text might receive codes from multiple layers. Additionally, categories within each layer may not be mutually exclusive, meaning the same bit of text might receive multiple codes within that layer.

The purpose of this codebook is to present our approach in the hopes that other researchers might make use of it, and to document for our own coders the coding decisions we have made.

Layer 1: Generalizable Substantive Frame Dimensions

1) Economic 2) Capacity & Resources

3) Morality & Ethics

4) Fairness & Equality

5) Legality, Constitutionality & Jurisdiction

6) Crime & Punishment (Retribution)

7) Security & Defense

8) Health & Safety

9) Quality of Life

10) Cultural Identity

11) Public Sentiment

12) Political Factors & Implications

13) Policy Description, Prescription & Evaluation

14) External Regulation & Reputation

15) Other

Layer 2: Tone

Explicit Pro Neutral Implicit Anti Implicit Pro **Explicit Anti**

Yet to be developed (and not spelled out here):

Layer 3: Causal attributions

Layer 4: Heuristic cues, including: race, gender, emotion

Layer 5: Actors/groups

Preliminary Notes (notes for coders designated in blue)

Should I code this article?

- O Does it refer to an issue in the United States?
 - o If article is about an issue in a foreign country, code as IRRELEVANT
- o Is the article a newspaper correction? (e.g. correction of an error)
 - o If so, code as IRRELEVANT
- o Is the article text at least 4 complete lines in the QDA viewer?
 - If article is less than 4 complete lines, code as IRRELEVANT
- Are there multiple stories in a given QDA case? (E.g. News in Review, Letters to editor)
 If so, execute the following four steps:
 - 1. The article about the relevant topic **must** still meet the four line requirement
 - 2. If there is more than one article, then code the **first** relevant full article
 - 3. For any text that is <u>not</u> part of the first relevant article, code as irrelevant using the body of text irrelevant code. This is the only time you will use this body code.
 - (*Not the "O or 1" IRRELEVANT variable found between P_CON &
 RECODE... entering "1" marks the entire case as irrelevant, regardless of
 any body coding you may do).
 - 4. Be sure to not grab the word "PRIMARY" as irrelevant. Be sure to code the primary as you normally would, but just for the story you coded.

Layer 1: Generalizable Substantive Frame Dimensions

As we have employed this codebook in our research, within Level 1 a given text (e.g., newspaper story, Congressional floor speech, party manifesto quasi-sentence) can receive multiple codes. Additionally, each text receives a *primary* code to represent the dominant frame being cued. If a text contains multiple frame cues, the primary frame is simply the one that comes across most strongly. If a text contains two or more frame cues used equally, default to the headline frame.

Notes: While the primary frame is typically the one that "comes across most strongly" in the article, an exception occurs when the context or venue drives the article's primary frame.

- An article pertaining to a sanction, penalty, punishment would normally fall under "crime and punishment" code
- When a priest is sanctioned by the church for same-sex marriage support. The primary frame would be Morality because the punishment is more or less contained to the church domain.
- Likewise, a politician being censured/sanctioned by Congress (or legislative body: council, boards) is clearly a punishment, but again one that is both contained and specific to a political realm.
- In these relatively rare instances the context trumps the substance. In all other cases, the primary frame is the most dominant frame in the article.

1) Economic frame cues:

- · In general, the costs, benefits, or any monetary/financial implications of the issue (to an individual, family, organization, community or to the economy as a whole).
- · Can include the effect of policy issues on trade, markets, wages, employment or unemployment, viability of specific industries or businesses, implications of taxes or tax breaks, financial incentives, etc.

- i) Stories on *marijuana* emphasizing the cost of the drug war and the potential for revenue through legalization/regulation of the market.
- ii) Stories on *cigarette* bans in bars focusing on the loss of tips for waiters and bartenders from smokers who no longer spend as much time inside spending money.
- iii) Stories on *immigration* discussing the debate over whether regularization of status for unauthorized immigrants will be a net positive or negative for public expenditure (spending on services vs. new tax revenue).
- iv) Stories on *guns* discussing an increase in gun purchases as a result of proposed gun control laws.
- v) Stories on the *environment* discussing the cost of new regulations to businesses in the area.
- vi) Stories on *same sex marriage* discussing the revenue state can gain or the cost to the state, or growth in wedding-related industries.
- vii) Stories on *abortion* discussing the economic status of women/families seeking abortion services, insurance costs vs out of pocket expenditures, public funding.

2) Capacity and Resources frame cues:

- · In general, the lack of—or availability of—time, physical, geographical, space, human, and financial resources, or the capacity of existing systems and resources to implement or carry out policy goals. May also include the capacity or availability of resources to deal with a new issue for which there are no established policy goals—in this case capacity or resources could be an impediment to solving a problem or adequately addressing an issue.
- · Capacity and resources frames may overlap with economic frames in some cases, but deal specifically with the limitations or availability of resources as they relate to policy objectives. Physical resources include farmland, office space, classroom space, prisons, mental health institutions, housing, highways and infrastructure, natural resources (such as aquifers, open space, forests) and public parks. Human resources include law enforcement, IRS or other state agency officers, professionals such as doctors, teachers, mental health workers, military troops, paper pushers, engineers, or any other type of qualified worker or service provider. Financial resources include availability of credit, funding, capacity to raise funds, available foreign currency, availability of commercial items as a result of sanctions, etc. (and will usually count as economic frames, too).
- The easiest way to think about this frame dimension is in terms of there being "not enough" or "enough" of something. If tobacco sales to minors are straining a local police department's ability to patrol all high-target areas; if tobacco farmers are running out of farmland; if schools don't have enough trained personnel to staff quit-smoking seminars; if there's not enough time to implement/carry out a policy, etc. And if a story talks about there not being enough money to fund something related to smoking, then both the capacity and resources dimension (2) AND the economic dimension (1) would get tagged.

Notes:

 In contrast to Economic, these articles should stress that there is a LIMITATION (or adequate capacity) of funding/time/resources/etc. So while these may be economic in nature (and cross coded with Economic or other codes), this code stresses a clash over a finite amount of resources.

- i) Stories on *immigration* examining the strain on local resources in town with rapid surge in immigrant population: school overcrowding, housing shortage, and traffic.
- ii) Stories on *tobacco* that consider the crowding out of farmland for less lucrative food crops by tobacco farming.
- iii) Stories on *gun* violence looking at the strain on Chicago's ERs due to high number of gunshot wounds.
- iv) Stories about *marijuana* growers that focuses on the additional energy needs created by indoor growers, and the ability of energy producers to meet higher demand.
- v) Stories on *immigration* focusing on the inadequate number of border patrol officers.

- vi) Stories on *marijuana* focusing on the inability of law enforcement to police marijuana farms on public lands due to lack of funding to hire enough officers (also coded economic).
- vii) Stories on *same sex marriage* discussing the county clerk not having enough time to process all the marriage licenses.

3) Morality frame cues:

- · In general, any perspective that is compelled by religious doctrine or interpretation, duty, honor, righteousness or any other sense of ethics or social or personal responsibility (religious or secular).
- · Morality is sometimes presented from a religious perspective, as in "eye for an eye," "do unto others," "thou shalt not kill," "judge not, lest ye be judged," or "Adam and Eve, not Adam and Steve." Non-religious morality frames can also be used. For example, the general moral imperatives to help others can be used to justify military intervention or foreign aid, social programs such as Medicare, welfare, and food stamps. Appeals that a policy move "is just the right thing to do" or "would indicate a recognition of our shared humanity" may reflect humanistic morality. Environmental arguments that focus on responsible stewardship or "leaving something for our children" are based in a sense of responsibility or morality. Lawbreakers, including illegal immigrants, can be presented as fundamentally immoral, conversely breaking a law that is bad or unjust can be presented as moral (e.g., Rosa Parks). Enacting protective legislation, such as laws that protect children from pedophiles, guns, violence, poverty, or failure to do so can also be presented using moral frames.
- · Claims of judgment will be coded under this frame dimension

- i) On *immigration*: The mayor of Cambridge, MA writes an op-ed defending the city council's vote to declare Cambridge a "Sanctuary City" by saying that "we cannot in good conscience participate in tearing families apart by cooperating with ICE on deportations. A local pastor applauds the decision by citing Matthew 25:33-40, in which Jesus says, "Whatever you did for the least of these..."
- ii) A story on the *national debt* discusses the immorality of "spending our grandchildren's money."
- iii) On *guns*: "The Executives claimed not to know if their guns had ever been used in a crime. They eschewed voluntary measures to lessen the risk of them falling into the wrong hands. And they denied that common danger signs -- like a single person buying many guns at once or numerous "crime guns" that are traced to the same dealer -- necessarily meant anything at all."
- iv) Stories about *cigarettes* may discuss the morality of selling a product that is known to cause cancer.
- v) Stories about *smokers* lacking personal integrity.
- vi) A story concerning the "Sanctity of Marriage," or the morality of same-sex marriages.
- vii) Any discussion of religious leaders or member of a congregation being punished for supported same sex marriage.
- viii) Any reference that marriage is a union between a man and a woman.

4) Fairness and Equality frame cues:

- · In general, the fairness, equality or inequality with which laws, punishment, rewards, and resources are applied or distributed among individuals or groups. Also the balance between the rights or interests of one individual or group compared to another individual or group.
- · Fairness and equality frame cues often focus on whether society and its laws are equally distributed and enforced across region, race, gender, economic class, etc. Many gender and race issues in particular, including equal pay, access to resources such as education, healthcare and housing. Another example: fairness considerations about whether punishments are proportional to crimes committed.
- · In most cases, when there is any mention of civil rights it will be linked to fairness and equality, but it is often linked with legality and/or morality as well.

- Stories on marijuana mentioning how much more likely an African-American is to receive a prison sentence despite similar levels of marijuana use and low-level drugdealing among Whites.
- ii) A story that contrasts the experience of a *same-sex couple* in completing bureaucratic paperwork with that of a heterosexual couple.
- iii) A talk radio personality insists that tough restrictions on *abortion* will only affect poor people, while wealthier people will still be able to obtain safe abortion service.
- iv) On *immigration*: "The senators said women in foreign countries often do not have the same educational and career opportunities as men. We should not cement those inequalities into our immigration laws," Ms. Hirono said.
- v) Stories on *immigration* addressing the fairness of punishing undocumented immigrants who were brought to the country as children.
- vi) Stories talking about the fairness of gay men and women not being offered benefits from businesses/corporations that do not recognize same sex marriage.
- vii) Notes:
 - Fairness frame cues are often used in discussing issues related to social justice.
 - See the coder tips below.

5) Legality, Constitutionality and Jurisdiction frame cues:

- · In general, the legal, constitutional, or jurisdictional aspects of an issue, where legal aspects include existing laws and court cases; constitutional aspects include all discussion of constitutional interpretation and/or potential revisions; and jurisdiction includes any discussion of which government body should be in charge of a policy decision and/or the appropriate scope of a body's policy reach.
- The use of—or reference to—legal reasoning in discussion of a policy area or problem, especially foundational/fundamental rights broadly recognized.
- · Court cases.
- · All aspects of <u>jurisdiction</u>: U.S. vs. United Nations, states vs. federal, voters vs. courts, military tribunal vs. civilian courts, etc.
- · Of special note are constraints imposed on or freedoms granted to individuals, government, and corporations via the Constitution, Bill of Rights and other amendments, or judicial interpretation. This dimension deals specifically with the authority of government to regulate, and the authority of individuals/corporations to act independently of government.
- · This dimension includes arguments about the right to bear arms, equal protection, free speech and expression. The constitutionality of restricting individual freedoms, imposing taxes, and conflicts between state, local or federal regulation and authority. Also: certain references to court cases (especially precedent-setting court cases), questions of judicial authority, conflict between different branches of government as they relate to the authority to regulate.

- i) Opponents of laws targeting undocumented immigrants in Arizona and Alabama are quoted as saying only the federal government, not individual states, are entitled to regulate immigration and enforce *immigration* laws.
- ii) The notion of a "well regulated militia" is referenced in a debate over how the Second Amendment should be understood in the contemporary *guns* policy.
- iii) Speculation abounds on whether the interstate commerce clause can be used to defend the Affordable Care Act (*Obamacare*).
- iv) Stories concerning the constitutionality of medical *marijuana* or legalization of marijuana, especially as it relates to conflicting federal and state regulation.
- v) Stories discussing legal challenges, from the federal government, to Arizona's *immigration* laws.
- vi) Stories about *same sex marriage* addressing the legality of Prop 8.
- vii) Notes:
 - See the coder tips below.

6) Crime and Punishment (Retribution) frame cues:

- · In general, the violation of policies in practice and the consequences—retribution—of these violations.
- This dimension includes stories about enforcement and interpretation of civil and criminal laws by individuals and law enforcement.
- · When laws are broken, sentencing and punishment, including punishment by the courts. Also fines imposed for breaking laws (but fines would also be coded as economic).
- · Increases or reductions in crime.
- · Often, punishment of a particular group (or member of that group) will be coded as crime and punishment, but may also be dually coded as something else. For example, if an article discusses clergy being punished for performing same-sex marriage then it will get coded as morality for the religious aspect of it and crime and punishment for the punishment part of it.

- i) Stories on *immigration*: "Illegal immigrants broke the law and should be punished, not rewarded."
- ii) Stories on *smoking* discussing the ramifications for selling cigarettes to minors under 18.
- iii) On zero-tolerance laws, including for marijuana: "A little graffiti might not seem like a big deal, and some people say cops shouldn't waste their time and energy on it, but when you ignore blatant disregard for the law—whether it's writing on a wall or littering or carrying an ounce of marijuana—you are giving license to criminality and sending a signal that only emboldens criminals."
- iv) A discussion about increased *gun violence* in a city would be coded as Crime and Punishment. However, discussion about how to solve the problem of increased gun violence or how effective existing policies are would be coded as Policy Prescription and Evaluation.

7) Security and Defense frame cues:

- · In general, any threat to a person, group, or nation, or any defense that needs to be taken to avoid that threat.
- Security and Defense frames differ from Health and Safety frames in that Security and Defense frames address a preemptive action to stop a threat from occurring, whereas Health and Safety frames address steps taken to ensure safety in the event that something happens.
- This dimension can include efforts to build a border fence or "secure the borders," issues of national security including resource security, efforts of individuals to secure homes, neighborhoods or schools, and efforts such as guards and metal detectors that would defend children from a possible threat.

- i) In the debate over *immigration* reform: "Rep. Buck McKeon (R-Calif.), the chairman of the House Armed Services Committee, suggested that Arab terrorists could disguise themselves as Hispanics in order to cross into the United States. 'And if you get an Arab that's trained, that's coming into this country to be a terrorist, they can mingle in and they can get in here. Then they could do damage.'
- ii) Stories on *same-sex marriage* discussing the possibility that legalizing same-sex marriage would give radical terrorist another reason to attack the US.
- iii) Stories on *gun* ownership looking at statistics on attempted break-ins when there is a gun in the home.
- iv) On *immigration*: Stories that look at citizen militia groups such as the Minutemen, who engage in activities to "secure the borders." Or a story about citizens acting in a law enforcement capacity to secure a neighborhood, such as a neighborhood watch group.
- v) The threat language of a threat to traditional marriage/values in a *same-sex marriage* article.
- vi) Stories about *gun* violence near schools, safe routes to school, gun-free zones around schools.
- vii) A story about mentally ill individuals accessing *guns*, or threats that individuals pose to themselves.

8) Health and Safety frame cues:

- · In general, the potential health and safety outcomes of any policy issue.
- This dimension can include, but is not limited to, health care access and effectiveness, illness, disease, sanitation, obesity, mental health effects, infrastructure and building safety.
- · Issues that involve gun safety will fit in this category but issues involving steps taken to avoid gun violence would be considered Security and Defense.
- · Policies taken to ensure safety should a tragedy occur would fit under this, as well. Can include emergency preparedness kits, lock down training in schools, disaster awareness classes for teachers, etc.

- i) Stories on the prevalence of hit-and-runs by undocumented *immigrants* who are unable to obtain driver's licenses.
- ii) A commentator says allowing *same-sex marriage* is an endorsement of unsafe sexual practices and will contribute to the spread of disease.
- iii) Lou Dobbs claims that *immigrants* from Mexico bring leprosy and tuberculosis to this country.
- iv) Stories that discussing *gun safety* features such as gun locks, child-proofing, safety and training classes, prevention of accidental shootings.
- v) A story about limiting minors' access to *abortion* services, birth control, morning after pills etc. or parental consent restrictions.
- vi) Stories on the *environment* discussing the health effects from breathing polluted air.
- vii) Notes:
 - Often used in conjunction with Quality of Life.
 - See the coder tips below.

9) Quality of Life frame cues:

- · In general, the benefits and costs of any policy on quality of life.
- The effects of a policy on people's wealth (would also be coded as Economic), mobility, access to resources, happiness, social structures, ease of day-to-day routines, quality of community life, etc.
- This dimension includes any mention of people receiving generic "benefits," anything to do with adoptions, details of weddings in stories about same-sex marriage, etc.

- i) Stories on the day-to-day stress that undocumented *immigrants* face, such as fear of being deported, losing their jobs, being stopped by an officer, or the inability to participate in normal social activities or acquire resources.
- ii) Stories on *smoking* talking about the effects on smokers of being shunned, or forced to smoke in designated areas/outside. What it feels like to be s smoker in an anti-smoking culture.
- iii) Stories on *gun control* discussing stress or other quality of life issues among people who live in areas with high rates of gun violence.
- iv) Stories describing the benefits/detriments of being a child of a same-sex marriage.
- v) Notes:
 - Often used in conjunction with Health & Safety.
 - See the coder tips below.

10) Cultural Identity & Pop Culture frame cues:

- · In general, the social norms, trends, values and customs constituting any culture(s) (American or otherwise), as they relate to a specific policy issue.
- · Includes discussion of the patriotism of a given group, American gun culture, culture of violence, the history of an issue or the significance of an issue within a group or sub-culture.
- · Includes the feelings of religious and political groups, references to famous people, notable politicians, leaders or representatives of a sub-culture, and their tastes, preferences, relationships with a specific issue.
- · Organizations, individuals associating themselves with a notable person or invoking their words, beliefs, including Reagan, Lincoln, FDR, Camelot, MLK etc. in relation to a policy issue. May also include stereotypes or assumed preferences and reactions of a group, or endorsements related to a policy issue.

- i) On *immigration*: White Non-Hispanics who grew up in a town that is now 60% Latino are quoted in an article talking about how they don't recognize the town anymore, can walk into a convenience store and not hear any English, and were shocked to discover that their elementary school was just renamed for Cesar Chavez.
- ii) On *guns*: People in Western Pennsylvania talking about how urban-dwellers have no understanding of or appreciation for hunting, wouldn't know how to survive in the wilderness, and think meat just grows at the supermarket.
- iii) On *immigration*: "What do the actress Julianne Moore, the funnyman John Leguizamo, the supermodel Christy Turlington Burns and the director George C. Wolfe have in common? They're among the 15 celebrities brought together by We Belong Together, a new national initiative to promote immigration reform."
- iv) On *Same-sex marriage*: Conservative blacks object to comparisons between civil rights movement and same-sex marriage.
- v) On *Same-sex marriage*: Headline "Civil rights march divides Dr. King followers". Story about tension between two interpretations of MLK legacy. Conservative-religious blacks vs. anti-discrimination blacks. Article qualifies twice since it features two identities and group leaders prominently (MLK).
- vi) An article describing a Tea Party rally, and that group's shared sense of identity.
- vii) Discussion of Marco Rubio's relationship to Latino voters, President Obama's relationship to African American voters, Hillary Clinton's/Sarah Palin's relationship to women voters, etc.
- viii) Celebrity endorsements for any policy issue.

11) Public Sentiment frame cues:

- · In general, the public's opinion.
- · Includes references to general social attitudes, polling and demographic information, as well as implied or actual consequences of diverging from or "getting ahead of" public opinion or polls. References to a party's base or constituency (would usually overlap with Politics).
- · Includes any public passage of a proposition/law (i.e. "California voters passed Prop 8).
- · Examples:
 - i) Stories on *same-sex marriage* stressing the rapid shift in public sentiment on the issue recently, saying this seems to be a "turning point."
 - ii) A segment on the evening news points out that subtle changes in survey questions make a big difference in apparent levels of support for *Obamacare*.
- iii) On immigration: "Polls that describe the many requirements immigrants may have to meet to gain citizenship for example, paying fines and back taxes, undergoing a criminal background check and waiting many years have found much higher Republican support than polls that do not mention the obstacles to citizenship or refer generally to "requirements."
- iv) Bar patrons are interviewed about *smoking* bans in bars.
- v) On *guns*: Stories involving polling about Second Amendment issues.
- vi) Notes:
 - How many people constitute a public? An editorial with one person's opinion does
 not constitute public sentiment. But the opinion of groups of people—or a single
 person interviewed in a story as representing broader opinion—does count. For
 example, most news stories including interviews of laypeople / civilians would mark
 public sentiment, because those interviews are being used to represent public
 sentiment.

12) Political frame cues:

- · In general, any political considerations surrounding an issue.
- · Includes issue actions or efforts or stances that are political, such as partisan filibusters, lobbyist involvement, bipartisan efforts, deal-making and vote trading, appealing to one's base. Explicit statements that a policy issue is good or bad for a particular political party.
- · Includes mentions of political maneuvering. Mention of a political entity (e.g., Democrats, Republicans, the House, The Senate, Clinton, Bush, Gore, etc.) get marked as political.

- i) On *immigration*: "The Growers Association has the committee chair in its pocket, so there's no way the bill will include harsher punishments for companies hiring undocumented immigrants."
- ii) On *poverty*: "The only reason the Senate can't pass the bill is that Democrats consider anti-poverty efforts their area and don't want Republicans to get credit for what they expect to be a popular law."
- iii) In *immigration* articles, includes references to "gang of eight," discussion of changing demographics in relation to a party's base, and the difference between primary and general election goals/ talking points.
- iv) Explicit discussion of running a black/white/brown/female/gay/Christian candidate for the expressed purpose of capturing a specific demographic.
- v) Notes:
 - Whenever a political vote is mentioned, e.g., the new smoking ban passed 11-3, the political code should be used.

13) Policy Prescription and Evaluation frame cues:

- · In general, policies already in place OR policies proposed for addressing an identified problem, as well as analysis of whether hypothetical policies will work or existing policies are effective.
- This dimension deals with what currently is or isn't allowed, as well as with what should or should not be done, or assessment of the existing policy.
- · Includes debate over best practices. Thus, this frame dimension—perhaps more than any other—is likely to appear frequently across texts. Yet care should be given to only use this code category as the primary frame when the main thrust of an article is really about policy; otherwise use it as a tool to indicate specific discussion of policy goals or analysis that appear with other major frames.
- · "Policy" encompasses formal government regulation (e.g., federal or state law) as well as regulation by businesses (e.g., sports arenas not allowing the sale of alcohol).
- · This dimension type stresses the practical: specifically, what should or shouldn't be done and why? A story describing ways existing policies have been successful or failed, or proposed policy solutions to a problem.
- · Includes discussion of any legislation that <u>will be voted on</u> as long as there is some discussion of the proposed bill (description, evaluation, prescription of what the bill should have been, etc.). For example, in the case of a story about Senator Smith proposing Bill S-239 that discusses only the political implications of his move, only the political code would be used. But more likely, even if the political implications of his move are discussed (coded Political), there would likely also be discussion of the bill itself (coded Policy).
- · In short, everything about laws have been/are being/or will be passed by <u>Congress</u> go under Policy, not Legality, although there may be some overlap in some cases.
- · If an article discusses a policy change with a church then it will be coded as both Morality (for the religious aspect of it) and as Policy for the new policy.
- · Examples:
 - i) Stories on *smoking* looking at a proposal for adding a small new tax on cigarettes and using the generated revenue subsidize hospital care for uninsured sufferers of smoking-related illness.
 - ii) Story discussing *NAFTA* 20 years later: How well did the trade agreement work in accomplishing its declared goals?

- iii) Stories on *immigration* discussing a proposed border fence is a policy prescription, or proposed solution, to the issue of illegal immigration. The main frame would likely be security.
- iv) Stories on *gun control* discussing proposed waiting periods for gun buyers to address the problem of felons or people with mental illness accessing guns is a policy prescription within a health and safety frame.
- v) Stories discussing the outcomes of stricter/more lax *environmental* regulations.
- vi) Stories discussing a *smoking* ban at a sports arena, at the workplace, or a city, federal or state ordinance or measure.
- vii) Notes:
 - Phrases such as "comprehensive immigration reform" should not be coded unless they are followed by specific policy prescriptions.
 - Everything can be about policy, so be careful to not use this code everywhere.
 - See the coder tips below.

14) External Regulation and Reputation frame cues:

- · In general, the United States' external relations with another nation; the external relations of one US state with another; or relations between groups.
- · Includes trade agreements and outcomes, comparisons of policy outcomes or desired policy outcomes between different groups or regions.
- · Includes the perception of one nation/state/group by another (for example, international criticisms of the United States maintaining capital punishment; influence of California's medical marijuana industry on bordering states).
- Border relations, interstate or international efforts to achieve policy goals, the availability of visas; alliances or disputes between groups.
- · Examples:
 - i) On immigration: "The Mexican President sharply criticized elements of the reform bill that would place enormous resources toward what he called 'further militarization' of the border."
 - ii) Stories on *incarceration* discussing a recent report by a human rights group, which places the U.S. near the very bottom of modern industrialized nations for criminal justice system, prisons, and the use of the death penalty.
- iii) Stories discussing the attitude of the UN/EU toward US *military actions* around the world.
- iv) Stories discussing changing international perceptions of American *economic* stability following the government shutdown.
- v) Notes:
 - This code isn't very common. It should really be the reputation of a group by outsiders or the regulations/agreements between states.

15) Other frame cues:

Any frame cue that does not fit in the first 14 dimensions

- · Example:
 - i) On *smoking*: Human-interest story about a tobacco shop.

Quick Rules (notes for student coders):

Coding Articles Irrelevant

Stories (articles) should be coded as relevant and with a primary code whenever the article is directly relevant to the issue at hand. However, if the issue is just listed in passing, the story should be coded as irrelevant. Here are some examples of articles irrelevant to *smoking/tobacco*:

- i) The article is about a school drug policy and states that it doesn't pertain to alcohol or tobacco.
- ii) The article compares the issue of immigration to tobacco, and is primarily about immigration.
- iii) The article mentions the Bureau of Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives.
- iv) The article is about the political debate between two candidates and a smoking ban is mentioned in passing, but the article is entirely about something else. However, if there are a few sentences about the smoking ban, it should be coded as political.
- v) The article is about a business that relates to tobacco in some way, but the article is not about tobacco or the tobacco industry.

As a general note, only code the headline as one code. The byline that appears immediately after the reporting city is to be coded as body of text.

Example:

Primary

"Headline" Methodist ministers decide Creech's Fate

KEARNEY, Neb - A Methodist minister from North Carolina...

In this situation you will begin coding "A Methodist minister" as body of text. Ignore the city/state and just begin coding as you normally would.

Variable Codes for Youth, Statistics, and Confidence

There should be variable codes that should be updated along with codes.

- **YOUTH**: Should be coded as a 1 if the article is specifically about youth. For example, code 1 if the article is about smoking rates among teens, about health effects for children of smokers, advertising around schools, etc.
- **STATISTICS**: Unlike the general frames codebook, code 1 any time the article lists statistics. This can be coded in conjunction with other frames. However, if there is no other clear frame, use a primary code of other. For example, if the article lists statistics about smoking rates across age and racial groups, code a 1. If there is also a primary code (such as Health & Safety, or Fairness & Equality), code it appropriately. If it is just a list of statistics with no commentary from which to draw a primary code, use a primary code of other.
- **CONFIDENCE**: Coders should code how confident they are that their primary code is accurate, with higher values indicating more confidence. For example, if the coder is certain about their primary code the coder should mark a 5. If the coder is feels

very uncertain, it should be coded as a 1. The values in between represent other levels of ambiguity.

Picking a Primary Frame

If there are many frames in an article that seem to be <u>equally</u> primary, the coder should default to using the headline code as the primary frame.

Notes on Deciding Between Related Frames

1. Policy vs. Legality vs. Crime

Coders should continue to consult the full descriptions of each frame dimension below, but here are short-hand keywords for thinking about the **three dimensions** that can be most confusing:

- Policy Description, Prescription & Evaluation = rules ("rules" include federal law, state law, business policy, and any other regulation; thus, includes discussion of Congressional bills)
 - i. What the rules are
 - ii. What the rules will be
 - iii. What the rules should be
 - iv. How well or poorly the rules are working
- ii) Legality, Constitutionality & Jurisdiction = legality and Constitutionality of the rules, and court cases on whether the rules were upheld
 - i. Issues of constitutionality
 - ii. Questions of legality
 - iii. Jurisdiction (e.g., state vs. federal)
 - iv. Court cases or other legal discussion
- iii) Crime & Punishment (Retribution) = breaking the rules and getting punished
 - i. Crime
 - ii. Having to pay a fine
 - iii. Sentence delivered in a court case (would also be coded as legality!)

Additional Notes on Policy vs. Legality vs. Crime:

- There will often be overlap between these three frames, meaning that the same article (or even sentence) would receive two or more frames, with whichever frame is most dominant counting as the primary frame.
 - o Examples:
 - Proposed laws are framed as a jurisdictional issue from the outset (can states regulate immigration?, can the federal government regulate smoking?, etc.), and such discussion would be tagged as both Policy and Legality/Constitutionality.
 - A story about a court case involving a fine or jail time would get tagged as both Legality/Constitutionality and Crime/Punishment.
- The difference between Policy and Crime is mainly "hypothetical/analytical versus practical." Put simply, Policy relates to how a policy should work, Legality relates to

deciding whether or not a law was broken, and Crime relates to the actual application of a law (the breaking of it, and the punishment).

- Policy: May talk about a new policy, where it regulates, and what the punishments are for violation (e.g., effective policies to keep minors from purchasing cigarettes).
- Legality: May talk about if the policy is constitutional or not. May talk about the legal precedent, or about a court case that pertains to the violation of a law (e.g., someone convicted in court for selling cigarettes to minors).
- Crime: The policy was violated, and this article talks about the arrest or punishment (e.g., arrests made for selling cigarettes to minors).
- Congressional legislation should be coded as Policy only, not Legality. This keeps
 Legality/Constitutionality category cleanly in the domain of the courts and discussion
 of Constitutionality, jurisdiction, whether or not something is legal, etc.
- In short, everything about laws have been/are being/or will be passed by Congress go under policy, not legality, although there may be some overlap in some cases.
- Most discussion involving Congress or the president will be Political, but if there is a discussion a specific policy then it will be dually coded as Policy

2. Quality of Life vs. Health & Safety

These two often are coded in tandem. Quality of Life may reference health concerns, but often in a more general and less specific way. On the other hand, Health & Safety will be more explicit about what the health concerns.

3. Morality & Ethics vs. Fairness & Equality

Morality & Ethics relates to social responsibility. Fairness & Equality has more to do with social justice.

4. Health & Safety vs. Security & Defense

- In short, active threat provoke security frames, while accidental gun injuries are related to health and safety. A threat provokes more security (metal detectors, guards, etc.) while accidental/non-threatening gun use (gun locks and gun safes) are about preventing unintended personal injuries.
- One way to look at it is that the security frame is taking a defensive stance towards
 preventing gun violence from ever happening, whereas the safety frame is taking an
 offense stance in order to ensure safety should something happen.

5. External Regulation/Reputation vs. Jurisdiction

- In short, if an article is talking about how one state's decision may impact a different state's policy, it would be external regulation. However, if an article is talking about whether or not a law from one state is applied in another it would be a jurisdiction frame.
- Ex:
- An article talking about whether or not a same-sex marriage in California is recognized in Nevada is coded as jurisdiction.

 An article that talks about the repercussions in Nevada because California has legalized same-sex marriage it would be coded as external regulation.

Notes on Deciding Between Related Frames

- 1. If an article is very difficult to code: Proceed as normal by selecting the body-of-article codes, then code the headline and primary to the best of your ability, and when you are finished code the confidence variable as a "1".
- 2. If the article is not really an article: if the article is made up of several short sentences that are summaries of other articles or short press releases code the irrelevant variable as a "1".
- 3. If the article is off topic: if the article is not really about the topic code the irrelevant article as a "1".
- 4. If there is an article covering a topic that is not already included in the codebooks please use the "note" function in Provalis and tag the article as "add to codebook".
- 5. Obituaries of random individuals will most often be coded as irrelevant, exception: if there was an actual article written about the person's life and their crusade to help with a policy issue, etc.
- 6. Crime or violence along the border (immigration articles), if the article discusses the actual crimes or violations then it would be tagged as Crime and Punishment. The violence on the border would only be tagged as security and defense if it related to issues of national security or defense.
- 7. In articles about smoking, discussion of quitting smoking constitutes a Quality of Life framework. In many cases, discussion of quitting smoking will trigger additional codes as well. For example, discussion of how you will live longer or be healthier because you quit constitutes a Health and Safety frame; discussion of the cost of replacement products and the marketplace for these products constitutes an Economic frame.
- 8. Two similar types of articles, (1) counting people in the census/immigration, and (2) reporting on the number of people who smoke. It might seem like these articles are just a factual reporting of statistics. Look carefully at the context of the article to code, it could be: capacity and resources (how will we deal with all of these new immigrants in schools or hospitals), or health and safety (what happens when more teenagers start smoking), or economic (if more immigrants are coming to the U.S. will they take jobs). However, the lone discussion of statistics should be coded under Other and tagged as a binary Statistics frame (upper left-hand corner).
- 9. If you are unsure of your coding just code confidence = 1.

Layer 2: Tone

Texts can be coded for two types of tone, or directionality, that direct the reader towards pro, anti, or neutral attitudes toward the policy issue, relative to a pre-identified "side" of the issue.¹

1. Explicit Directional Arguments

- Opinions expressed directly in support for one side of the issue at hand; in the context of news coverage, explicit polarity arguments usually appear in the form of an editorial or in a quotation appearing within a news report.
- Examples:
 - · Smokers have rights that need to be respected (explicit pro smoking)
 - · Taxes on tobacco sales are a good idea (explicit anti-smoking)

2. Implicit Directional Cues

- Information presented that reflects positively or negatively on one side of the issue at hand; implicit polarity cues are at work any time a text presents information that advocates on one side of an issue would be glad to see printed or would wish had not been printed.
- Examples:
 - The smokers' advocacy group gained ground yesterday on Capitol Hill (implicit prosmoking)
 - · Tobacco company provides jobs for local community (implicit pro-smoking)
 - · Taxes on tobacco sales are expected to bolster the state's economy (implicit anti
 - · New study links smoking to additional forms of cancer (implicit anti-smoking)

Quick Rules (notes for student coders):

- Sympathetic or humanizing views get coded as pro. On the whole, code the sympathetic part as implicit pro. But code the primary as neutral if it's just stating facts.
- When you are coding for tone, be sure to take the context of the article into consideration.
- If an article has half anti and half pro, then code the primary as neutral.
- Make sure you code based on the tone of the person speaking: either the author of the article or the person being quoted.
- Make sure to code all cues, pro and anti, but when one cue is nested inside another cue, then use overlapping codes.
- Keep in mind the "Litmus Test" when coding for implicit tone. (i.e., would an anti or pro issue reader be happy to see the article?)

¹ For consistency, we suggest identifying the conservative side of the policy issue as the "pro" side (e.g., pro capital punishment, pro smokers' rights, pro restrictions on immigration, pro-gun ownership rights), though in some cases it may be more intuitive to identify the liberal side as such (e.g., pro-gay marriage).