





Decision Analytics

Lecture 9: Logic Inference Example

- There are five houses.
- The Englishman lives in the red house.
- The Spaniard owns the dog.
- Coffee is drunk in the green house.
- The Ukrainian drinks tea.
- The green house is immediately to the right of the ivory house.
- The Old Gold smoker owns snails.
- Kools are smoked in the yellow house.
- Milk is drunk in the middle house.
- The Norwegian lives in the first house.
- The man who smokes Chesterfields lives in the house next to the man with the fox.
- Kools are smoked in the house next to the house where the horse is kept.
- The Lucky Strike smoker drinks orange juice.
- The Japanese smokes Parliaments.
- The Norwegian lives next to the blue house.
- Now, who drinks water? Who owns the zebra?







- First, we identify the predicates of the problem domain
 - colour
 - nationality
 - pet
 - drink
 - cigarette
- All of these operate on the same object domain (houses)
- The first clue reads "There are five houses.", therefore
 - $D_O = \{House \#1, House \#2, House \#3, House \#4, House \#5\}$

```
houses = ["House #1", "House #2", "House #3", "House #4", "House #5"]
```

• The attribute domain for colour is $D_A = \{red, green, ivory, yellow, blue\}$

```
colours = ["red", "green", "ivory", "yellow", "blue" ]
```

 We add the 5x5 Boolean variables corresponding to all combinations of objects and attributes

```
house_colour = {}

for house in houses:
    variables = {}

    for colour in colours:
        variables[colour] = model.NewBoolVar(house+colour)
    house_colour[house] = variables
```

• The attribute domain for *nationality* is $D_A = \{English, Spanish, Ukranian, Norwegian, Japanese\}$

 Again, we add the 5x5 Boolean variables corresponding to all combinations of objects and attributes

```
house_nationality = {}
for house in houses:
    variables = {}
    for nationality in nationalities:
        variables[nationality] = model.NewBoolVar(house+nationality)
    house_nationality[house] = variables
```

• The attribute domain for pet is $D_A = \{dog, snails, fox, horse, zebra\}$

```
pets = ["dog", "snails", "fox", "horse", "zebra"]
```

 We add the 5x5 Boolean variables corresponding to all combinations of objects and attributes

```
house_pet = {}
for house in houses:
    variables = {}
    for pet in pets:
        variables[pet] = model.NewBoolVar(house+pet)
    house_pet[house] = variables
```

• The attribute domain for drink is $D_A = \{coffee, tea, milk, juice, water\}$

```
drinks = ["coffee", "tea", "milk", "juice", "water"]
```

 We add the 5x5 Boolean variables corresponding to all combinations of objects and attributes

```
house_drink = {}

for house in houses:
    variables = {}

    for drink in drinks:
        variables[drink] = model.NewBoolVar(house+drink)
    house_drink[house] = variables
```

• The attribute domain for cigarette is $D_A = \{OldGold, Chesterfields, Kools, LuckeyStrike, Parliaments\}$

 Again, we add the 5x5 Boolean variables corresponding to all combinations of objects and attributes

```
house_cigarette = {}
for house in houses:
    variables = {}
    for cigarette in cigarettes:
        variables[cigarette] = model.NewBoolVar(house+cigarette)
    house_cigarette[house] = variables
```

- Now we go sentence by sentence and re-formulate in first-order logic
- "The Englishman lives in the red house."

```
\forall x : nationality(x, English) \Rightarrow colour(x, red)
```

We translate this into a conjunction over all houses
 nationality(House #1, English) ⇒ colour(House #1, red)
 nationality(House #2, English) ⇒ colour(House #2, red)
 nationality(House #3, English) ⇒ colour(House #3, red)

 $nationality(House #4, English) \Rightarrow colour(House #4, red)$

 $nationality(House #5, English) \Rightarrow colour(House #5, red)$

```
for house in houses:

model.AddBoolAnd([house_colour[house]["red"]]).OnlyEnforceIf(house_nationality[house]["English"])
```

- Now we go sentence by sentence and re-formulate in first-order logic
- "The Spaniard owns the dog."

```
\forall x : nationality(x, Spanish) \Rightarrow pet(x, dog)
```

• We translate this into a conjunction over all houses

```
nationality(House #1, Spanish) \Rightarrow pet(House #1, dog)
nationality(House #2, Spanish) \Rightarrow pet(House #2, dog)
nationality(House #3, Spanish) \Rightarrow pet(House #3, dog)
nationality(House #4, Spanish) \Rightarrow pet(House #4, dog)
nationality(House #5, Spanish) \Rightarrow pet(House #5, dog)
```

```
for house in houses:
    model.AddBoolAnd([house_pet[house]["dog"]]).OnlyEnforceIf(house_nationality[house]["Spanish"])
```

- Now we go sentence by sentence and re-formulate in first-order logic
- "Coffee is drunk in the green house."

```
\forall x : colour(x, green) \Rightarrow drink(x, coffee)
```

• We translate this into a conjunction over all houses

```
colour(House \#1, green) \Rightarrow drink(House \#1, coffee)

colour(House \#2, green) \Rightarrow drink(House \#2, coffee)

colour(House \#3, green) \Rightarrow drink(House \#3, coffee)

colour(House \#4, green) \Rightarrow drink(House \#4, coffee)

colour(House \#5, green) \Rightarrow drink(House \#5, coffee)
```

```
for house in houses:

model.AddBoolAnd([house_drink[house]["coffee"]]).OnlyEnforceIf(house_colour[house]["green"])
```

- Now we go sentence by sentence and re-formulate in first-order logic
- "The Ukrainian drinks tea."

```
\forall x : nationality(x, Ukrainian) \Rightarrow drink(x, tea)
```

We translate this into a conjunction over all houses
 nationality(House #1, Ukrainian) ⇒ drink(House #1, tea)
 nationality(House #2, Ukrainian) ⇒ drink(House #2, tea)
 nationality(House #3, Ukrainian) ⇒ drink(House #3, tea)
 nationality(House #4, Ukrainian) ⇒ drink(House #4, tea)
 nationality(House #5, Ukrainian) ⇒ drink(House #5, tea)

```
for house in houses:

model.AddBoolAnd([house_drink[house]["tea"]]).OnlyEnforceIf(house_nationality[house]["Ukrainian"])
```

- Now we go sentence by sentence and re-formulate in first-order logic
- "The green house is immediately to the right of the ivory house."

```
colour(House \#1, ivory) \Rightarrow colour(House \#2, green)

colour(House \#2, ivory) \Rightarrow colour(House \#3, green)

colour(House \#3, ivory) \Rightarrow colour(House \#4, green)

colour(House \#4, ivory) \Rightarrow colour(House \#5, green)

\neg colour(House \#5, ivory)

\neg colour(House \#1, green)
```

```
for i in range(4):
    model.AddBoolAnd([house_colour[houses[i+1]]["green"]]).OnlyEnforceIf(house_colour[houses[i]]["ivory"])
model.AddBoolAnd([house_colour[houses[4]]["ivory"].Not()])
model.AddBoolAnd([house_colour[houses[0]]["green"].Not()])
```

- Now we go sentence by sentence and re-formulate in first-order logic
- "The Old Gold smoker owns snails."

```
\forall x : cigarette(x, Old\ Gold) \Rightarrow pet(x, snails)
```

We translate this into a conjunction over all houses

```
cigarette(House #1, Old Gold) \Rightarrow pet(House #1, snails)
cigarette(House #2, Old Gold) \Rightarrow pet(House #2, snails)
cigarette(House #3, Old Gold) \Rightarrow pet(House #3, snails)
cigarette(House #4, Old Gold) \Rightarrow pet(House #4, snails)
cigarette(House #5, Old Gold) \Rightarrow pet(House #5, snails)
```

```
for house in houses:
    model.AddBoolAnd([house_pet[house]["snails"]]).OnlyEnforceIf(house_cigarette[house]["Old Gold"])
```

- Now we go sentence by sentence and re-formulate in first-order logic
- "Kools are smoked in the yellow house."

```
\forall x : cigarette(x, Kools) \Rightarrow colour(x, yellow)
```

We translate this into a conjunction over all houses
 cigarette(House #1, Kools) ⇒ colour(House #1, yellow)
 cigarette(House #2, Kools) ⇒ colour(House #2, yellow)
 cigarette(House #3, Kools) ⇒ colour(House #3, yellow)
 cigarette(House #4, Kools) ⇒ colour(House #4, yellow)
 cigarette(House #5, Kools) ⇒ colour(House #5, yellow)

```
for house in houses:
    model.AddBoolAnd([house_colour[house]["yellow"]]).OnlyEnforceIf(house_cigarette[house]["Kools"])
```

- Now we go sentence by sentence and re-formulate in first-order logic
- "Milk is drunk in the middle house."

```
drink(House #3, milk)
```

```
model.AddBoolAnd([house_drink["House #3"]["milk"]])
```

- Now we go sentence by sentence and re-formulate in first-order logic
- "The Norwegian lives in the first house."

nationality(House #1, Norwegian)

```
model.AddBoolAnd([house_nationality["House #1"]["Norwegian"]])
```

- Now we go sentence by sentence and re-formulate in first-order logic
- "The man who smokes Chesterfields lives in the house next to the man with the fox."

```
cigarette[House~\#1, Chesterfields] \Rightarrow pet(House~\#2, fox)

cigarette[House~\#2, Chesterfields] \Rightarrow pet(House~\#1, fox) \lor pet(House~\#3, fox)

cigarette[House~\#3, Chesterfields] \Rightarrow pet(House~\#2, fox) \lor pet(House~\#4, fox)

cigarette[House~\#4, Chesterfields] \Rightarrow pet(House~\#3, fox) \lor pet(House~\#5, fox)

cigarette[House~\#5, Chesterfields] \Rightarrow pet(House~\#4, fox)
```

- Now we go sentence by sentence and re-formulate in first-order logic
- "Kools are smoked in the house next to the house where the horse is kept."

```
cigarette[House~\#1, Kools] \Rightarrow pet(House~\#2, horse)
cigarette[House~\#2, Kools] \Rightarrow pet(House~\#1, horse) \lor pet(House~\#3, horse)
cigarette[House~\#3, Kools] \Rightarrow pet(House~\#2, horse) \lor pet(House~\#4, horse)
cigarette[House~\#4, Kools] \Rightarrow pet(House~\#3, horse) \lor pet(House~\#5, horse)
cigarette[House~\#5, Kools] \Rightarrow pet(House~\#4, horse)
```

- Now we go sentence by sentence and re-formulate in first-order logic
- "The Lucky Strike smoker drinks orange juice."

```
\forall x: cigarette(x, LuckyStrike) \Rightarrow drink(x, juice)
```

• We translate this into a conjunction over all houses cigarette(House #1, LuckyStrike) ⇒ drink(House #1, juice) cigarette(House #2, LuckyStrike) ⇒ drink(House #2, juice) cigarette(House #3, LuckyStrike) ⇒ drink(House #3, juice) cigarette(House #4, LuckyStrike) ⇒ drink(House #4, juice) cigarette(House #5, LuckyStrike) ⇒ drink(House #5, juice)

```
for house in houses:

model.AddBoolAnd([house_drink[house]["juice"]]).OnlyEnforceIf(house_cigarette[house]["Lucky Strike"])
```

- Now we go sentence by sentence and re-formulate in first-order logic
- "The Japanese smokes Parliaments."

```
\forall x : nationality(x, Japanese) \Rightarrow cigarette(x, Parliaments)
```

• We translate this into a conjunction over all houses

nationality(House #1, Japanese) ⇒ cigarette(House #1, Parliaments)

nationality(House #2, Japanese) ⇒ cigarette(House #2, Parliaments)

nationality(House #3, Japanese) ⇒ cigarette(House #3, Parliaments)

nationality(House #4, Japanese) ⇒ cigarette(House #4, Parliaments)

nationality(House #5, Japanese) ⇒ cigarette(House #5, Parliaments)

```
or house in houses:
model.AddBoolAnd([house_cigarette[house]["Parliaments"]]).OnlyEnforceIf(house_nationality[house]["Japanese"])
```

- Now we go sentence by sentence and re-formulate in first-order logic
- "The Norwegian lives next to the blue house.

```
colour[House~\#1,blue]\Rightarrow nationality(House~\#2,Norwegian) colour[House~\#2,blue]\Rightarrow nationality(House~\#1,Norwegian) \lor nationality(House~\#3,Norwegian) \lor nationality(House~\#4,Norwegian) \lor nationality(House~\#4,Norwegian) \lor nationality(House~\#4,Norwegian) \lor nationality(House~\#4,Norwegian) \lor nationality(House~\#4,Norwegian)
```

- That is all sentences of the zebra puzzle encoded, but is this all?
- There are some implicit assumptions that are not explicitly stated in the text
 - Every house has a colour/nationality/pet/drink/cigarette
 - Every house has no more than one colour/nationality/pet/drink/cigarette
 - All houses have a different colour/nationality/pet/drink/cigarette

Every house has a colour

 $\forall x \exists y : colour(x, y)$

That translates into

```
 \begin{array}{l} (colour(House\ \#1,red)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#1,green)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#1,ivory)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#1,yellow)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#2,green)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#2,ivory)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#2,yellow)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#2,blue)) \\ \land\ (colour(House\ \#3,red)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#3,green)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#3,ivory)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#3,yellow)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#3,blue)) \\ \land\ (colour(House\ \#4,red)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#4,green)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#4,ivory)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#4,yellow)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#4,blue)) \\ \land\ (colour(House\ \#5,red)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#5,green)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#5,ivory)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#5,yellow)\ \lor\ colour(House\ \#5,blue)) \end{array}
```

```
for house in houses:
    variables = []
    for colour in colours:
       variables.append(house_colour[house][colour])
    model.AddBoolOr(variables)
```

Every house has an occupant

 $\forall x \exists y : nationality(x, y)$

```
for house in houses:
    variables = []
    for nationality in nationalities:
        variables.append(house_nationality[house][nationality])
    model.AddBoolOr(variables)
```

• Every house has a pet

```
\forall x \exists y : pet(x, y)
```

```
for house in houses:
    variables = []
    for pet in pets:
       variables.append(house_pet[house][pet])
    model.AddBoolOr(variables)
```

Every house has a drink

 $\forall x \exists y : drink(x, y)$

```
for house in houses:
    variables = []
    for drink in drinks:
        variables.append(house_drink[house][drink])
    model.AddBoolOr(variables)
```

Every house has a cigarette

 $\forall x \exists y : cigarette(x, y)$

```
for house in houses:
    variables = []
    for cigarette in cigarettes:
       variables.append(house_cigarette[house][cigarette])
    model.AddBoolOr(variables)
```

Every house has no more than one colour

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z : y \neq z \Rightarrow \neg(colour(x, y) \land colour(x, z))$$

```
\forall x \forall y \forall z : y \neq z \Rightarrow (\neg colour(x, y) \lor \neg colour(x, z))
```

Every house has no more than one occupant

```
\forall x \forall y \forall z : y \neq z \Rightarrow \neg (nationality(x, y) \land nationality(x, z))
```

```
\forall x \forall y \forall z : y \neq z \Rightarrow (\neg nationality(x, y) \lor \neg nationality(x, z))
```

Every house has no more than one pet

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z : y \neq z \Rightarrow \neg(pet(x, y) \land pet(x, z))$$

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z : y \neq z \Rightarrow (\neg pet(x, y) \lor \neg pet(x, z))$$

Every house has no more than one drink

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z : y \neq z \Rightarrow \neg(drink(x, y) \land drink(x, z))$$

```
\forall x \forall y \forall z : y \neq z \Rightarrow (\neg drink(x, y) \lor \neg drink(x, z))
```

Every house has no more than one cigarette

```
\forall x \forall y \forall z : y \neq z \Rightarrow \neg(cigarette(x, y) \land cigarette(x, z))
```

```
\forall x \forall y \forall z : y \neq z \Rightarrow (\neg cigarette(x, y) \lor \neg cigarette(x, z))
```

Every house has a different colour

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z : x \neq y \Rightarrow \neg(colour(x, z) \land colour(y, z))$$

```
\forall x \forall y \forall z : x \neq y \Rightarrow (\neg colour(x, z) \lor \neg colour(y, z))
```

Every house has a different occupant

```
\forall x \forall y \forall z : x \neq y \Rightarrow \neg (nationality(x, z) \land nationality(y, z))
```

```
\forall x \forall y \forall z : x \neq y \Rightarrow (\neg nationality(x, z) \lor \neg nationality(y, z))
```

Every house has a different pet

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z : x \neq y \Rightarrow \neg(pet(x, z) \land pet(y, z))$$

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z : x \neq y \Rightarrow (\neg pet(x, z) \lor \neg pet(y, z))$$

Every house has a different drink

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z : x \neq y \Rightarrow \neg (drink(x, z) \land drink(y, z))$$

```
\forall x \forall y \forall z : x \neq y \Rightarrow (\neg drink(x, z) \lor \neg drink(y, z))
```

Every house has a different cigarette

```
\forall x \forall y \forall z : x \neq y \Rightarrow \neg(cigarette(x, z) \land cigarette(y, z))
```

```
\forall x \forall y \forall z : x \neq y \Rightarrow (\neg cigarette(x, z) \lor \neg cigarette(y, z))
```

That is all constraints, both explicit and implicit, encoded

- Who drinks water? The Norwegian.
- Who owns the zebra? The Japanese.

Thank you for your attention!