

Homework 3

Professor Cormac Flanagan
CMPS 203 - Programming Language

February 4, 2017

Exercise 1. In the WHILE language, prove or disprove the equivalence of the two commands:

$$t := x; x := y; y := t \quad (1)$$

and

$$t := y; y := x; x := t \quad (2)$$

(where x, y, and t are distinct locations).

Proof. We first define (1) to S_1 and (2) to S_2 . In the definition, S_1 and S_2 are semantically equivalent; this means that for all states s and s'

$$\langle S_1, s \rangle \rightarrow s' \text{ if and only if } \langle S_2, s \rangle \rightarrow s'$$

So we assume the first state s to be Table 1. a, b and c can be any value. After the first command of S_1 , the state s becomes s'_1 , which is Table 2. Then Table 3 and Table 4, which should be s' . However, after the first command of S_2 , the state s becomes s'_2 , which is Table 5. Then Table 6 and Table 7, which should be exactly the same as Table 4, but it is not. As a result, we disprove the semantic equivalence of these two Statements. \square

Exercise 2. In the WHILE language, prove that if

$$\langle \text{while } b \text{ do } y := y - x, s \rangle \Downarrow s' \quad (3)$$

then there exists an integer k such that

$$s(y) = s'(y) + k \times s(x) \quad (4)$$

t	a
x	b
y	c

Table 1: s

t	b
x	b
y	c

Table 2: s'_1

t	b
x	c
y	c

Table 3: s''_1

t	b
x	c
y	b

Table 4: s'

t	c
x	b
y	c

Table 5: s'_2

t	c
x	b
y	b

Table 6: s''_2

t	c
x	c
y	b

Table 7: s'

Proof. The proof is by induction on the number k. We assume (3) always terminates and k equals the height of the derivation tree (3) minus 2.

For example, if the derivation tree is

$$\frac{\langle b, s \rangle \Downarrow \text{true} \quad \langle y:=y-x, s \rangle \Downarrow s' \quad \frac{\langle b, s'' \rangle \Downarrow \text{false} \quad \langle \text{skip}, s'' \rangle \Downarrow s'}{\langle \text{while } b \text{ do } y:=y-x, s'' \rangle \Downarrow s'}}{\langle \text{while } b \text{ do } y:=y-x, s \rangle \Downarrow s'}$$

the height of the tree is 3, and k=1. If k=0, the state doesn't change because the derivation tree is

$$\frac{\langle b, s \rangle \Downarrow \text{false} \quad \langle \text{skip}, s \rangle \Downarrow s'}{\langle \text{while } b \text{ do } y:=y-x, s \rangle \Downarrow s'}$$

which corresponds to (4) when k=0

$$s(y) = s'(y) + 0 \times s(x)$$

For the induction step, we assume the exercise statement holds for $k \leq k_0$, we shall prove it for k_0+1 , so the derivation tree of (3) when $k=k_0+1$ is

$$\frac{\langle b, s \rangle \Downarrow \text{true} \quad \langle y:=y-x, s \rangle \Downarrow s_1 \quad \frac{\langle b, s_1 \rangle \Downarrow \text{true} \quad \frac{\langle b, s_k \rangle \Downarrow \text{true} \quad \langle y:=y-x, s_k \rangle \Downarrow s_{k+1} \quad \frac{\langle b, s_{k+1} \rangle \Downarrow \text{true} \quad \dots \quad \langle b, s_k \rangle \Downarrow \text{true} \quad \langle y:=y-x, s_k \rangle \Downarrow s_{k+1}}{\vdots} \quad \langle \text{while } b \text{ do } y:=y-x, s_1 \rangle \Downarrow s_{k+1}}{\langle \text{while } b \text{ do } y:=y-x, s \rangle \Downarrow s_{k+1}} \quad \left. \vphantom{\frac{\langle b, s_1 \rangle \Downarrow \text{true}}{\vdots}} \right\} k$$

,note that $s'=s_{k+1}$,

by induction hypothesis, we know that

$$s(y) = s_k(y) + k \times s(x) \tag{5}$$

and in the height k+2 of the derivation tree, we have $\langle y:=y-x, s_k \rangle \Downarrow s_{k+1}$, which equals $s_k(y)=s_{k+1}(y)+x$. Therefore, in (5), we get

$$\begin{aligned} s(y) &= s_{k+1}(y) + x + k \times s(x) \\ &= s_{k+1}(y) + (k+1) \times s(x) \end{aligned}$$

so the exercise statement is proved. □