

Journal Review Form

Manuscript # _____

Reviewer: _____

I. Describe the manuscript with just *a sentence or two* under each factor below.

1) What is the primary **focus or topic** of the manuscript?

2) What is the **primary objective** of the manuscript (e.g. algorithm development, experimental verification, comparison of technique/method with other groups, improvement on prior work, characterization of device or other physical item, etc.)?

3) What **method** was used to reach the manuscript's objective?

4) What **conclusion** was ultimately drawn in the manuscript?

5) The major **strengths** of the manuscript are . . .

6) The major **weaknesses** of the manuscript are . . .

II. Rate the manuscript.

Place an X on the line next to each factor to rate the manuscript. An X close to “SD” is taken to mean that you strongly disagree with the statement, and an X close to “SA” is taken to mean that you strongly agree with the statement. If a factor is not applicable, then put a line through it. You may add comments to justify your answer or modify the measure.

Strongly
Disagree

Strongly
Agree

SD:__:__:__:__:__: SA The objectives of the manuscript were clear.

SD:__:__:__:__:__: SA The manuscript topic is important.

SD:__:__:__:__:__: SA The manuscript should be of interest to a large audience.

SD:__:__:__:__:__: SA The literature review was thorough given the objectives.

SD:__:__:__:__:__: SA References were complete and were appropriate.

SD:__:__:__:__:__: SA The methodology was appropriate for the conclusions drawn.

SD:__:__:__:__:__: SA The analysis was done correctly.

SD:__:__:__:__:__: SA The results of analysis were correctly interpreted and/or conclusions were sound.

SD:__:__:__:__:__: SA Tables and figures were appropriate and adequate.

SD:__:__:__:__:__: SA Formatting and structure was appropriate.

SD:__:__:__:__:__: SA Writing was clear and concise.

SD:__:__:__:__:__: SA The manuscript was relatively free of issues of grammar, punctuation, and such.

III. Recommended disposition of the manuscript: *check one*.

_____ Do not accept for publication.

_____ Ask for major revisions and allow to again be reviewed if re-submitted.

_____ Ask for revisions and continue with a second review.

_____ Accept with minor revisions.

_____ Accept as written with no need for any revisions.

IV. Additional questions (including technical), comments, or suggestions to be sent to the author(s):