SullysBlog.com

What Most New Investors Misunderstand About the Aftermarket

December 1, 2025

When I first got started in domaining, I thought I understood the aftermarket. You buy a good name, list it on a marketplace, sit back, and sell it for a profit. Simple.

Except it's not simple at all, and I spent probably three years being confused about why nothing was happening with my portfolio.

The longer you're in this industry, the more you realize how many invisible forces shape the aftermarket. And how many new investors walk right into it with the exact same wrong expectations I had.

I see it constantly. Someone buys their first couple of domains, throws them on Afternic, and decides the market is broken when nothing sells in 90 days. They assume something's wrong with the marketplace, or that their pricing is off, or worse, that the "big guys" are controlling all the action.

But here's what I think the real misunderstanding is: the aftermarket isn't a retail environment. It's a patience environment. A timing environment. It rewards people who understand that demand doesn't come from the domain industry—it comes from the business world, and businesses don't operate on your timetable.

When you buy a domain, you're not buying a product that's guaranteed to move. You're buying a lottery ticket with variable odds. The odds improve when you understand how this actually works, but there's still no guarantee.

They think the aftermarket is "fast." It isn't.

Nothing about the aftermarket is fast unless you're selling wholesale to another investor. End-user sales, the ones that make this business worthwhile, move incredibly slowly.

Businesses take time to form. Founders take time to pick a name. Legal teams take time to approve it. Budgets take time to open. Every single piece of the process happens on *their* schedule.

New investors panic when domains don't sell quickly. I did too. But velocity isn't the metric that matters—I'm still not sure what the right metric even is, honestly. Volume matters. Quality matters. I've had names sit untouched for years and then suddenly produce offers out of nowhere. That's not unusual. That's just how it goes.

They assume data tells the full story.

Ask a new investor why they bought a name and you'll hear: "It had high search volume" or "It had good CPC" or "It had a strong DA score."

None of these things hurt. But none of them drive aftermarket value by themselves. I recently posted about this on NamePros... how metrics don't really tell us what we think they do.

SEO metrics weren't built for us. CPC wasn't built for us. Ahrefs isn't building their tools for domain investors. These tools are built for advertisers, search marketers, and content teams.

What matters in the aftermarket is business demand. Brandability. Memorability. Industry relevance. A name that solves a real naming problem is going to sell even if it has zero search volume, zero SEO metrics, and no history.

I'd rather have a clean, strong, two-word brand than a five-word exact-match SEO phrase with a million searches. Only one of them will spark a founder's imagination. Maybe I'm wrong about that. I've been wrong before, but that's been my experience.

Pricing is weird and nobody really knows how it works.

New investors price based on what they think a domain is worth. Experienced investors price based on the buyer pool, the business use cases, and the likelihood that someone with money and intent will need that name in the next five years.

You don't price domains for the general public. You price them for the specific type of business that will one day see that name and think, "That's the one."

There's no formula. There's no "fair market value." There's only the right buyer at the right time with the right vision.

Could you price a name too high and scare people away? Sure. Could you price a name too low and watch it sell instantly because you left money on the table? Absolutely. That happens to every investor, including me, and it still stings every time.

The aftermarket doesn't operate like real estate or collectibles. Comparable sales matter, but they don't dictate value. They just help you recognize patterns and avoid emotional pricing. I think. Sometimes I'm still not sure about this part.

The part nobody tells beginners

Most new investors don't fail because they buy the wrong domains. They fail because they buy the right domains and quit before the aftermarket has time to work.

You can't judge your performance on your first 20 domains. Or even your first 200. The people who make it in this business treat the aftermarket like a long-term asset class, not a quick flip.

Domains move when real-world demand moves. When founders get funding. When companies rebrand. When new markets take shape. When trends shift and language comes with it.

If you understand that, the aftermarket stops being confusing and starts being what it really is: a slow-moving but incredibly profitable engine for people who think long-term.

And that's the part most new investors never get to see because they bail out before anything ever has a chance to happen.
