System Specification

October 18, 2021

This document is created directly from the definitions in the file Qualitative.ott, with minor modifications as listed below.

This document is intended to specify, in a readable form, the subject of the proofs of the paper as well as explain the slight differences between this rendering, the paper, and the generated Coq files Qualitative_ott.v and Qualitative_inf.v.

The reason for these slight differences is partly due to the restrictions of the Ott locally nameless backend and the LNgen theory generation tool.

- 1. All parts of the syntax must be defined concretely in the Ott source file.
- 2. All bound variables need to be explicitly determined.
- 3. All syntactic forms must bind at most one variable at a time.

The first limitation is simply to accommodate through minor manual edits of the outputs of Ott and LNgen. These edits allow us, for example, to parameterize the development on an arbitrary semiring (see grade_sig.v) instead of working with a specific, concrete semiring.

The second limitation affects our generation of the typing rules for pattern matching elimination forms, i.e. T-CASE and T-LETPAIR In these rules, we need to substitute in for the scrutinee y the result type B.

The third limitation causes difficulty for the formalization of the elimination rule for products. The usual pattern matching elimination syntactic form binds two variables, one for each component of the tuple. This is the form that is used in the submission. To accommodate Ott, in the mechanization we replace the pattern matching elimination form for Σ types with a slightly more general, but less familiar, form.

1 System Specification

1.1 Grammar

This language is parameterized over a lattice of grades, written ℓ , and a set of sorts, s, which at must be nonempty.

```
tm, a, b, c, A, B, C, u, v, t
                                                                                         terms and types
                                                          Unit
                                                                                            unit type
                                                          \mathbf{unit}
                                                                                            unit term
                                                          \Pi x : {}^{\ell} A.B
                                                                                            dependent function type
                                                          \lambda^{\ell}x:A.a
                                                                                            function
                                                          a b^{\ell}
                                                                                            function application
                                                                                            sort
                                                                                            variable
                                                          A_1 + A_2
                                                                                            sum type
                                                          \mathbf{inj}_1 a
                                                                                            injection into sum type
                                                                                            injection into sum type
                                                          inj_2 a
                                                          \mathbf{case}_{\ell} \ a \ \mathbf{of} \ b_1; b_2
                                                                                            case elimination of sum type
                                                          \Sigma x:^{\ell}A.B
                                                                                            dependent tuple type
                                                          (a^{\ell},b)
                                                                                            tuple creation
                                                          \det(x^{\ell},) = a \operatorname{in} b
                                                                                            tuple elimination
                                                          (x:^{\ell}A) \& B
                                                          (a^{\ell} \& b)
                                                          \pi_1^\ell a
                                                          \pi_2^{\ell}a
context, \Omega
                                                                                         contexts
```

1.2 Operational semantics

(Values that are types) VALUETYPE-TYPE ValueType-Pi VALUETYPE-WSIGMA $\overline{\mathsf{ValueType}\ s}$ ValueType Πx : $^{\ell} A.B$ ValueType $\Sigma x:^{\ell}A.B$ VALUETYPE-SUM VALUETYPE-UNIT ValueType A + B $ValueType\ Unit$ (Values) V-ValueType V-WPair V-TMUNIT ValueType aValueTy $\overline{\text{pe }a}$ ValueType (a^{ℓ}, b) ${\sf ValueType} \ \mathbf{unit}$ V-Inj1 V-Inj2 ValueType $inj_1 a$ $\overline{\mathsf{ValueType}\ \mathbf{inj}_2\ a}$

$$a \leadsto a'$$

(Small-step operational semantics)

$$\frac{a \leadsto a'}{a \ b^{\ell} \leadsto a' \ b^{\ell}}$$

S-Beta $\overline{(\lambda^{\ell}x\!:\!A.a)\ b^{\ell}\leadsto a\{b/x\}}$

S-Case1Beta

S-CaseCong

$$a \rightsquigarrow a'$$

 $\frac{a \rightsquigarrow a'}{\operatorname{\mathbf{case}}_{\ell} a \text{ of } b_1; b_2 \rightsquigarrow \operatorname{\mathbf{case}}_{\ell} a' \text{ of } b_1; b_2}$

 $\overline{\mathbf{case}_{\ell}\left(\mathbf{inj}_{1}\ a\right)\mathbf{of}\ b_{1};b_{2}\leadsto b_{1}\ a^{\ell}}$

S-Case2Beta

$$\overline{\mathbf{case}_{\ell}\left(\mathbf{inj}_{2}\ a\right)\mathbf{of}\ b_{1};b_{2}\leadsto b_{2}\ a^{\ell}}$$

S-LetPairCong
$$a \leadsto a'$$

$$\frac{1}{\mathbf{let}(x^{\ell},) = a \mathbf{in} b \leadsto \mathbf{let}(x^{\ell},) = a' \mathbf{in} b}$$

S-LetPairBeta

$$\overline{\text{let}(x^{\ell},) = (a_1^{\ell}, a_2) \text{ in } b \leadsto b \{a_1/x\} \ a_2^{\perp}}$$

Definitional equality

$\Phi \vdash a \equiv_{\ell} b$

(Conditional Definitional Equality)

CDefEq-Leq CDefEq-NL

$$\frac{k_0 \le k \quad \Phi \vdash a \equiv_k b}{\Phi \vdash a \equiv_k b} \qquad \frac{\neg (k_0 \le k)}{\Phi \vdash a \equiv_k b}$$

CDEFEQ-NLEQ
$$\frac{\neg (k_0 \le k)}{\Phi \vdash a \equiv_k b}$$

$$\Phi \vdash a \equiv_{\ell} b$$

(Definitional Equality)

EQ-Subst

EQ-REFL EQ-SYM
$$\Phi \vdash a \equiv_{\ell} b$$

$$\Phi \vdash a \equiv_{\ell} a$$

$$\Phi \vdash b \equiv_{\ell} a$$

$$\Phi \vdash b \equiv_{\ell} a$$

$$\Phi \vdash b \equiv_{\ell} c$$

$$\Phi \vdash b \equiv_{\ell} c$$

$$\Phi \vdash b \equiv_{\ell} a$$

$$\Phi \vdash b \equiv_{\ell} c$$

EQ-TRANS

$$\Phi \vdash a \equiv_{\ell} b$$

$$\Phi \vdash b \equiv_{\ell} c$$

$$\overline{\Phi} \vdash a \equiv_{\ell} c$$

$$\Phi, x : \ell \vdash b_1 \equiv_k b_2$$

$$\Phi \vdash a_1 \equiv_k a_2$$

$$-b_1\{a_1/x\} \equiv_k b_2\{a_2/x\}$$

EQ-BETA
$$\Phi \vdash_{\ell} a$$

$$a \leadsto b \qquad \Phi \vdash_{\ell} b$$

$$\Phi \vdash a \equiv_{\ell} b$$

$$\begin{array}{lll} \text{EQ-Beta} & \text{EQ-Pi} \\ \Phi \vdash_{\ell} \ a & \Phi \vdash_{A_1} \equiv_{\ell} A_2 \\ \underline{a \leadsto b} & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} \ b & \Phi \vdash_{R} \equiv_{\ell} B_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash a \equiv_{\ell} \ b & \Phi \vdash_{R} x \colon_{0}^{\ell} A_1 . B_1 \equiv_{\ell} \Pi x \colon_{0}^{\ell} A_2 . B_2 \\ \end{array}$$

Eq-Abs

EQ-ABS
$$\Phi \vdash A_1 \equiv_{\ell} A_2 \qquad \Phi \vdash b_1 \equiv_{\ell} b_2$$

$$\Phi \vdash \lambda^{\ell_0} x \colon A_1 \cdot b_1 \equiv_{\ell} \lambda^{\ell_0} x \colon A_2 \cdot b_2 \qquad \Phi \vdash b_1 a_1^{\ell_0} \equiv_{\ell} b_2 a_2^{\ell_0}$$

EQ-APP
$$\Phi \vdash b_1 \equiv_{\ell} b_2 \\
\Phi \vdash a_1 \equiv_{\ell} a_2$$

$$\Phi \vdash b_1 \ a_1^{\ell_0} \equiv_{\ell} b_2 \ a_2^{\ell_0}$$

1.4 Type System

As in pure type systems, this type system is parameterized by a set of axioms (**axiom** s_1 s_2) and rules (**rule** s_1 s_2 s_3) that govern the treatment of sorts.

$$\begin{array}{c|c} \square \Vdash a : ^{\ell} A \end{array} & (Conditional \ Typing) \\ & \overset{\operatorname{CT-LeQ}}{\Omega \vdash a : ^{\ell} A} \quad \ell \leq C \\ & \overset{\operatorname{CT-TOP}}{\Omega \Vdash a : ^{\ell} A} \end{array} \qquad \begin{array}{c} \overset{\operatorname{CT-TOP}}{C \land \Omega \vdash a : ^{C} A} \\ & \overset{C}{C < \ell} \\ \hline \Omega \Vdash a : ^{\ell} A \end{array} \end{array}$$

1.5 Auxiliary Judgements

$$\begin{array}{c} \operatorname{GEQ-ABF} & \bigoplus_{X:\ \ell_0 \vdash b_1 \sim_{\ell} b_2} \\ \Phi \vdash_{\ell}^{X:\ \ell_0 \vdash b_1} \wedge_{\ell} b_2 \\ \Phi \vdash_{\ell}^{X:\ \ell_0 \vdash b_1} \wedge_{\ell} b_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell}^{A_1 \sim_{\ell} A_2} \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell}^{A_1 \sim_{\ell} A_2} & \bigoplus_{\Phi \vdash_{\ell}^{b} a_1 \sim_{\ell} b_2} \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{A_1}^{\ell_0} \wedge_{\ell} \wedge_{A_1.b_1} \wedge_{\ell} \lambda^{\ell_0} x \colon A_2.b_2 \\ \hline \end{array} & \begin{array}{c} \operatorname{GEQ-WSIGMA} \\ \Phi \vdash_{A_1} \sim_{\ell} A_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\Sigma} x^{\ell_0} A_1.B_1 \sim_{\ell} \Sigma x^{\ell_0} A_2.B_2 \\ \hline \end{array} & \begin{array}{c} \operatorname{GEQ-WPAIR} \\ \Phi \vdash_{A_1} \wedge_{\ell} b_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\Sigma} x^{\ell_0} A_1.B_1 \sim_{\ell} \Sigma x^{\ell_0} A_2.B_2 \\ \hline \end{array} & \begin{array}{c} \operatorname{GEQ-WPAIR} \\ \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \sim_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} (a_1^{\ell_0},b_1) \sim_{\ell} (a_2^{\ell_0},b_2) \\ \hline \end{array} & \begin{array}{c} \operatorname{GEQ-INJR} \\ \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \sim_{\ell} b_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} (a_1^{\ell_0},b_1) \sim_{\ell} (a_2^{\ell_0},b_2) \\ \hline \end{array} & \begin{array}{c} \operatorname{GEQ-SUM} \\ \Phi \vdash_{A_1} \sim_{\ell} A_1' & \operatorname{GEQ-INJ1} \\ \Phi \vdash_{A_1} \sim_{\ell} A_2' & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \sim_{\ell} a_1' \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \sim_{\ell} a_2' & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \sim_{\ell} a_1' \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \sim_{\ell} a_2' & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \sim_{\ell} b_1' \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_2 \sim_{\ell} a_2' & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \sim_{\ell} b_1' \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_2 \sim_{\ell} a_2' & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \sim_{\ell} b_1' \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_2 \sim_{\ell} a_2' & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \sim_{\ell} b_1' \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_2 \sim_{\ell} a_2' & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \sim_{\ell} b_1' \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \sim_{\ell} a_2 & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \sim_{\ell} b_1' \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 & \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_2 \\ \hline \Phi \vdash_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_1 \rightarrow_{\ell} a_1$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{Par-AppBeta} \\ & \Phi \vdash a \Rightarrow_{\ell} (\lambda^{\ell_0} x \colon A.a') \\ & \frac{\Phi \vdash_{\ell}^{\ell_0} b \Rightarrow b'}{\Phi \vdash a \ b^{\ell_0} \Rightarrow_{\ell} a' \{b'/x\}} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{array}{c} \text{Par-App} \\ \Phi \vdash a \Rightarrow_{\ell} a' \\ \Phi \vdash_{\ell}^{\ell_0} b \Rightarrow b' \\ \hline \Phi \vdash a \ b^{\ell_0} \Rightarrow_{\ell} a' \ b'^{\ell_0} \end{array}$$

$$\frac{\Phi,x\!:\!\ell_0 \vdash b_1 \Rightarrow_\ell b_2}{\Phi \vdash_\ell^\top A_1 \Rightarrow A_2} \\ \frac{\Phi \vdash_\ell^\top A_1 \Rightarrow A_2}{\Phi \vdash \lambda^{\ell_0} x\!:\! A_1.b_1 \Rightarrow_\ell \lambda^{\ell_0} x\!:\! A_2.b_2}$$

PAR-WSIGMA

$$\Phi \vdash A_1 \Rightarrow_{\ell} A_2$$

$$\Phi, x \colon \ell \vdash B_1 \Rightarrow_{\ell} B_2$$

$$\Phi \vdash \Sigma x \colon^{\ell_1} A_1 \cdot B_1 \Rightarrow_{\ell} \Sigma x \colon^{\ell_1} A_2 \cdot B_2$$

Par-WPair

$$\begin{array}{c}
\Phi \vdash_{\ell}^{\ell_0} a_1 \Rightarrow a_2 \\
\Phi \vdash b_1 \Rightarrow_{\ell} b_2 \\
\hline
\Phi \vdash (a_1^{\ell_0}, b_1) \Rightarrow_{\ell} (a_2^{\ell_0}, b_2)
\end{array}$$

PAR-WPAIRBETA

$$\frac{\Phi \vdash a_1 \Rightarrow_{\ell} (a_1^{\prime \ell_0}, a_2^{\prime})}{\Phi, x \colon \ell_0 \vdash b_1 \Rightarrow_{\ell} b_2 \{x/x\}}$$
$$\frac{\Phi \vdash \mathbf{let} (x^{\ell_0},) = a_1 \mathbf{in} b_1 \Rightarrow_{\ell} b_2 \{a_1^{\prime}/x\} a_2^{\prime \perp}}{\Phi \vdash \mathbf{let} (x^{\ell_0},) = a_1 \mathbf{in} b_1 \Rightarrow_{\ell} b_2 \{a_1^{\prime}/x\} a_2^{\prime \perp}}$$

Par-LetPair

$$\frac{\Phi \vdash a_1 \Rightarrow_{\ell} a_2}{\Phi, x \colon \ell_0 \vdash b_1 \Rightarrow_{\ell} b_2} \\ \frac{\Phi \vdash \mathbf{let}(x^{\ell_0},) = a_1 \mathbf{in} b_1 \Rightarrow_{\ell} \mathbf{let}(x^{\ell_0},) = a_2 \mathbf{in} b_2}{\Phi \vdash \mathbf{let}(x^{\ell_0},) = a_2 \mathbf{in} b_2}$$

Par-Sum

$$\frac{\text{PAR-Inj1}}{\Phi \vdash a_1 \Rightarrow_{\ell} a'_1} \frac{}{\Phi \vdash \mathbf{inj_1} \ a_1 \Rightarrow_{\ell} \mathbf{inj_1} \ a'_1}$$

Par-CaseBeta1

$$\begin{aligned}
\Phi \vdash a \Rightarrow_{\ell} \mathbf{inj}_{1} a' \\
\Phi \vdash b_{1} \Rightarrow_{\ell} b'_{1} \\
\Phi \vdash b_{2} \Rightarrow_{\ell} b'_{2} \\
\ell_{0} \leq \ell
\end{aligned}$$

$$\frac{\ell_{0} \leq \ell}{\Phi \vdash \mathbf{case}_{\ell_{0}} a \mathbf{of} b_{1}; b_{2} \Rightarrow_{\ell} b'_{1} a'^{\ell_{0}}}$$

Par-Inj2 $\Phi \vdash a_2 \Rightarrow_{\ell} a_2'$

$$\frac{\Phi \vdash a_2 \Rightarrow_{\ell} a_2'}{\Phi \vdash \mathbf{inj}_2 \ a_2 \Rightarrow_{\ell} \mathbf{inj}_2 \ a_2'}$$

Par-CaseBeta2

$$\Phi \vdash a \Rightarrow_{\ell} \mathbf{inj}_{2} a'
\Phi \vdash b_{1} \Rightarrow_{\ell} b'_{1}
\Phi \vdash b_{2} \Rightarrow_{\ell} b'_{2}
\ell_{0} \leq \ell$$

$$\frac{}{\Phi \vdash \mathbf{case}_{\ell_0} \ a \ \mathbf{of} \ b_1; b_2 \Rightarrow_{\ell} b_2' \ a'^{\ell_0}}$$

Par-Case

$$\Phi \vdash a \Rightarrow_{\ell} a'
\Phi \vdash b_1 \Rightarrow_{\ell} b'_1
\Phi \vdash b_2 \Rightarrow_{\ell} b'_2$$

$$\overline{\Phi \vdash \mathbf{case}_{\ell_0} \ a \ \mathbf{of} \ b_1; b_2 \Rightarrow_{\ell} \mathbf{case}_{\ell_0} \ a' \ \mathbf{of} \ b'_1; b'_2}$$

$$\Phi \vdash a \Rightarrow_{\ell}^* b$$

(Parallel reduction, reflexive transitive closure)

$$\begin{array}{ll} \text{MP-Step} & & \text{MP-Step} \\ \Phi \vdash a \Rightarrow_{\ell} b \\ \hline \Phi \vdash a \Rightarrow_{\ell}^* a & & \overline{\Phi} \vdash a \Rightarrow_{\ell}^* a' \end{array}$$

 $\Phi \vdash a \Leftrightarrow_{\ell} b$

(Joinability)

JOIN
$$\Phi \vdash a_1 \Rightarrow_{\ell}^* b_1 \\
\Phi \vdash a_2 \Rightarrow_{\ell}^* b_2 \\
\Phi \vdash b_1 \sim_{\ell} b_2 \\
\hline{\Phi \vdash a_1 \Leftrightarrow_{\ell} a_2}$$