Title: Recovery of Myotis in Michigan’s Upper Peninsula

# **Introduction:**

Understanding the environmental conditions and suitable habitats that support wildlife is crucial for effective management, particularly for species like bats that are facing significant population declines in North America. Bats in the northeastern United States are limited by a scarcity of hibernacula, leading to congregations in locations that provide optimal conditions for hibernation, typically lasting approximately six months (Davis & Hitchcock 1965). These hibernacula are often underground sites such as caves and mines, characterized by high humidity and temperatures ranging between 0-10C (Heldmaier et al. 2004).

The emergence of *Pseudogymnoascus destructans* (Pd), the pathogen responsible for White-nose Syndrome (WNS), has further complicated habitat assessments and bat populations dynamics (Lorch et al., 2011; Warnecke et al. 2012). First identified in New York during the winter of 2006-2007, WNS has since spread across North America, leading to the death of up to 90% of hibernating bat populations in eastern United States (Meteyer et al., 2009; Hout et al., 2021). This disease has had devasting effects on several bat species, leading to many being listed as endangered or threatened (Turner et al., 2011; Frick et al., 2015; Hoyt et al., 2021).

Research has shown that Pd thrives in cold temperatures, with active growing beginning at 3 C and optimal growth occurring between 12.5-15.8 C in laboratory settings (Verant et al., 2012). The fungus invades the skin of bats during hibernation, causing erosions and frequent arousals that deplete fat reserves and often lead to mortality (Frick et al., 2016). Notably, higher fungal loads correlate with increased mortality rates, particularly in bats hibernating closer to the fungus’s optimal growth range (Langwig et al., 2012; Johnson et al., 2014, 2016; Hayman et al., 2016).

However, recent studies have identified remnant populations of bats in colder hibernacula, suggesting that microclimate selection may play a crucial role in bat survival post-WNS (Johnson et al., 2016; Loeb & Winters, 2022). For example, *Myotis lucifugus* hibernated at an average temperature of 2 C in New York, surviving despite being Pd-positive (Lilley et al., 2016). This finding indicates that wildlife management strategies focused on promoting cooler hibernacula could help mitigate the impacts of Pd and reduce mortality rates.

In the Upper Great Lakes Region, suitable hibernacula are scarce, yet the western Upper Peninsula of Michigan is notable for its numerous

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Wildlife managers need a clear understanding of the environmental conditions and suitable

habitats crucial for the species they manage. For bats, this includes identifying the biotic and abiotic factors that influence suitable hibernacula. In the northeastern US, limited hibernacula sites force bat species to congregate in large numbers at locations providing optimal conditions for hibernation, typically lasting six months (Davis & Hitchcock 1965). These sites are usually underground, such as caves or mines, with high humidity and temperatures between 0-10°C (Heldmaier et al., 2004).

The emergence of *Pseudogymnoascus destructans* (Pd), the pathogen responsible for White-nose syndrome (WNS), has further complicated habitat assessments (Lorch et al. 2011; Warnecke et al. 2012). First identified in New York during the winter of 2006-2007, WNS has spread across North America, causing the death of 90% of hibernating bat populations in the eastern United States (Meteyer et al. 2009; Hout et al. 2021). Several bat species are now listed as endangered or threatened due to WNS (Turner et al. 2011; Frick et al. 2015; Hoyt et al. 2021).

Pd thrives in cold temperatures, with active growing beginning at 3°C and optimal growth between 12.5-15.8 in a laboratory setting (Verant et al., 2012). The fungus grows on exposed skin when bats enter torpor, causing erosions and frequent arousals, which deplete fat reserves and often lead to death (Frick et al. 2016). Higher fungal loads are associated with increased mortality; consequently, bats hibernating closer to the fungus optimal growth range have higher mortality rates (Langwig et al. 2012; Johnson et al. 2014, 2016; Hayman et al. 2016).

Recent studies have found remnant populations of bats in colder hibernacula, supporting the hypothesis that microclimate selection may play a role in bat survival post-WNS (Johnson et al. 2016; Loeb & Winters 2022). For example, in New York, Myotis lucifugus hibernated at an average temperature of 2°C, surviving despite being Pd-positive (Lilley et al. 2016). This suggests that wildlife management strategies focusing on promoting colder hibernacula could slow fungal growth and reduce mortality.

In the Upper Great Lakes region, suitable hibernacula are scarce. However, the western Upper Peninsula of Michigan is notable for its hundreds of mines excavated since the 1840s (Kurta & Smith 2014). Before WNS arrived, Kurta and Smith (2014) surveyed 119 subterranean sites, finding that Myotis species – predominantly Little Brown Bats (Myotis lucifugus) and Northern Long-Eared Bats (Myotis septentrionalis) – comprised over 99% of the bat population. These bats were concentrated in a few, large, complex mines, with temperatures and the presence of warm air traps identified as key factors in sites selection.

White-nose syndrome reached Michigan’s Upper Peninsula in the winter of 2013-2014, resulting in a 90% decline in bat populations by 2020, from 138,068 to 13,988 (Kurta & Smith 2020). This study investigates three hypotheses:

Hypothesis 1). Population decline (crash rate) caused by WNS will be correlated with Myotis population recovery rates at each site, so the sites with higher population declines will have slower population growth and vice versa.

Hypothesis 2). Cooler microclimates within hibernacula will exhibit slower crash rates and faster recovery.

Hypothesis 3). Myotis populations pre-WNS surveys will show a preference for relatively warmer hibernacula, while post-WNS surveys will indicate a shift toward cooler sites in response to the disease.

## **Methods:**

## **Data collection**

This study utilized 598 surveys of 205 hibernacula across Michigan, with the majority conducted in the western Upper Peninsula. Mine characteristics, environmental conditions, and biological data were recorded at each site.

Mine Characteristics:

Data included the geological composition (ore type), the length of the main passage (passage length), and the number of levels and shafts accessible to humans. These factors were recorded to explore their relationship with hibernacula selection and bat population dynamics.

Environmental Conditions:

Environmental conditions were recorded intermittently, depending on survey equipment availability. These included the presence of standing water at the entrance of shaft bottom (standing water), external temperature, internal temperature, and relative humidity. Between 1980 and 2013, internal temperatures were recorded using mercury thermometers to measure air temperature. In 2014, laser infrared thermometers were introduced, measuring surface and rock temperatures. Due to inconsistencies in temperature measurement methods and equipment, a mean temperature was calculated for each site and used as the primary temperature variable. Internal relative humidity was inconsistently recorded and therefore excluded from the analysis.

Biological Data:

During each survey, we recorded the total number of bats and identified species. The focus was on Myotis species, which included Little Brown Bats and Northern Long-Eared Bats. Eptesicus fuscus (Big Brown Bats) and *Perimyotis subflavus* (Tri-colored Bats) were also noted but removed from the analysis because Eptesicus fuscus does not experience high mortality from WNS (CITE) and *Perimyotis subflavus* is historically rare in our study area. Due to the lack of differentiation between Myotis species in some surveys, total Myotis counts were used as the response variable.

The first survey was conducted in 1980, but regular and consistent surveys began in 1996. To ensure that data reflected significant hibernacula, we excluded sites that were surveyed only once or had fewer than five bats recorded. This filtering resulted in 375 surveys and 60 sites, which were included in the analysis.

All surveys were conducted under approved wildlife protection regulations, and the protocol was designed to minimize any disturbance to the hibernating bats by limiting time spent within the mines.

## Data analysis

### Hypothesis 1:

To investigate our first hypothesis, we used data from 41 sites that have adequate data showing the population declines caused by WNS of which 23 of those sites have recovering populations of Myotis. We calculated population crash rate for each site using the formula:

Population Crash Rate = 1 – (Minimum Survey Count / Mean Survey Count Before WNS).

This captures the overall population decline from a “steady state” before WNS to the minimum number of bats surveyed after the introduction of Pd. We calculated the slope of recovery by first normalizing bat counts at each site to a range of [0, 1] using the formula:

Normalized Count = (count – minimum count) / (maximum count / minimum count).

This ensures that the maximum count at each site is standardized to 1 and the minimum count to 0. We then fit a linear regression of normalized count against relative year (where year 0 corresponds to the year of the minimum survey count) to derive the slope of recovery.

**LM:** normalized count ~ relative year.

To investigate our first prediction that population crash rates caused by WNS are correlated with Myotis population recovery rates (N=23), we fit the following model:

**LM:** slope of recovery ~ population crash.

### Hypothesis 2:

After processing the data, we constructed two separate set of models. One we used a Bayesian hierarchical regression model with a Beta family distribution for the likelihood to model crash intensity (crash\_mean) as a function of mean temperature, log transformed passage length, and the presence of standing water.

The second, we used the Gamma family distribution for the likelihood to model the weighted recovery rate (recovery rate \* sqrt(last survey count) as a function of mean temperature, the log transformed passage length, presence of standing water, and an offset variable for the number of years of recovery to account for the difference in the duration of recovery between the sites.

We fit models using the `brm` function in R package (brms). We assumed weakly informative priors (Normal (0,1)) for the intercept and slope. We ran 4000 iterations each with 1000 warmup iterations and an adapt\_delta of 0.99. All models showed convergence with R-hat values close to 1.

We used leave-one-out cross-validation (LOO-CV) to compare model performance. Leave-one-out cross-validation provides a more robust estimate of predictive accuracy in Bayesian models. It is especially useful when handling small sample sizes or influential observations, as it avoids the biases inherent in other criteria such as AIC or WAIC.

### Hypothesis 3:

To investigate our third hypothesis that Myotis species selected different habitat post-WNS infection we used 375 surveys from 60 sites, 195 surveys were conducted before WNS caused mortalities and 180 surveys were conducted after WNS caused mortalities.

We calculated the proportions of bats in each mine to the totals in each period (before and after). We then subtracted the proportions (period after – period before), therefore a positive number indicated that site held a higher relative proportion of bats post-WNS and a negative number indicated that site held a lower relative proportion of bats pre-WNS. We then fit the models

**LM1:** proportions ~ mean\_temp

**LM2:** proportions ~ mean\_temp + mean\_temp2

These results indicated habitat selection compared to habitat availability. We removed unimportant sites (sites < 300 bats) from our final analysis. The sites that were unimportant before WNS were still unimportant after WNS because of other habitat or microclimate conditions that the larger population of Myotis were not selecting.

## RESULTS:

### Hypothesis 1

Our results support our hypothesis that sites with environmental conditions conducive to Pd growth will exhibit a correlation between the rates of population decline and subsequent recovery. The sites with higher population declines had slower recovery rates of species because they are persistently dealing with Pd (adjusted R2 = 0.427).

A graph of a crash

Description automatically generated

Figure . Population crash rates (1 - (minimum count after WNS/mean pop count before WNS) compared to recovery rates of myotis bats in mines in Michigan’s upper peninsula.

Hypothesis 2

Table comparing population crash intensity models

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Model** | **ELPD** | **ELPD Difference** | **ELPD standard error** |
| Null Model | 3.734 | -3.913 | 2.104 |
| Model 1 (base) | 7.647 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Model 2 | 5.969 | -1.678 | 0.576 |
| Model 3 | 5.519 | -2.128 | 1.034 |

Model 1 was selected as the final model due to its higher predictive accuracy (as shown by LOO-CV) and simpler structure compared to model 2 and model 3, which included additional covariates without improving predictive performance.

Model 1 included mean temperature as the sole predictor, while model 2 and 3 added log transformed passage length and presence of standing water as additional covariates. However, the inclusion of these extra covariates did not significantly improve predictive performance, as indicated by the small ELPD differences between the models and their standard errors. This suggests that mean temperature alone is a sufficient predictor of population crash intensity.

The posterior mean estimate for the effect of mean temperature on crash rate was 0.06 (95% credible interval: 0.02 to 0.09), suggesting that higher mean temperatures are associated with an increase in crash rate (Table 2). Each additional degree of temperature is expected to increase the crash rate by 6%.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Coefficients** | **Estimate (mean)** | **Est. Error** | **l-95%** | **u-95%** |
| Intercept | 0.50 | 0.12 | 0.27 | 0.74 |
| Mean temp | 0.06 | 0.02 | 0.02 | 0.09 |

A graph of a recovery rate

Description automatically generated with medium confidence

Figure . The relationship between population crash rates (1 - (Minimum count / Maximum count)) and mean temperature. Colder sites had significantly smaller population crashes compared to warmer sites. The green line represents the posterior mean estimate from the final Bayesian model (Model 1). The size of the points represent the mean population size for each site before WNS.

Table comparing recovery slope models

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Model** | **ELPD** | **ELPD Difference** | **ELPD standard error** |
| Null model | -55.754 | -1.886 | 7.755 |
| Model 1 (base model) | -53.868 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Model 2 | -53.905 | -0.037 | 1.429 |
| Model 3 | -54.275 | -0.407 | 1.665 |

Model 1 was selected as the final model due to its higher predictive accuracy (as shown by LOO-CV) and simpler structure compared to model 2 and model 3, which included additional covariates without improving predictive performance.

The posterior mean estimate for the effect of mean temperature on recovery rate was -0.65 (95% credible interval: -1.15 to -0.14), suggesting that higher mean temperatures are associated with a decrease in recovery rate.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Coefficients** | **Estimate (mean)** | **Est. Error** | **l-95%** | **u-95%** |
| Intercept | 1.52 | 1.61 | -1.64 | 4.64 |
| Mean temp | -0.65 | 0.26 | -1.15 | -0.14 |

A graph of a normal curve

Description automatically generated with medium confidence

CAN MAKE THE SLOPE ~ MEAN TEMP BECAUSE THOSE FIT THE FREQUENTIST MODELS

### Hypothesis 3.

The best model was proportion of bats ~ mean temperature + mean temperature2. We found that on average sites that had colder mean temperatures held a higher proportion of bats after the introduction of WNS (adjusted R2 = 0.466). Because of the low reproductive rate of bats this must be due to some migration to colder sites rather than purely reproduction.

A graph of a graph

Description automatically generated

Discussion

Since the emergence of Pd, cave-dwelling bat populations have declined by as much as 90%. This devastating impact has prompted scientists and wildlife managers to develop strategies aimed at mitigating the disease’s effects and promote the recovery of affected populations.

Various techniques have been explored, including fumigation, inoculation, and UV treatment, each showing various degrees of success. Our findings show that bats in cooler hibernacula tend to more resilient to Pd infection. This is likely due to the temperature-dependent growth rate of the fungus, as temperatures around 4 C inhibit its growth while still supporting bat hibernation. The relationship between cooler microclimate selection and increased survival has likely exerted strong evolutionary pressures, driving bats to hibernate in cooler conditions. Understanding these adaptive responses, while simultaneously developing methods to manipulate hibernacula temperatures to enhance overwintering survival, represents a pressing line of inquiry.

# APPENDIX