

# Microbial invasion of the Caribbean by an Indo-Pacific coral zooxanthella

D. Tye Pettay<sup>a,b,1</sup>, Drew C. Wham<sup>a</sup>, Robin T. Smith<sup>c,d</sup>, Roberto Iglesias-Prieto<sup>c</sup>, and Todd C. LaJeunesse<sup>a,e,1</sup>

<sup>a</sup>Department of Biology, The Pennsylvania State University, University Park, PA 16802; <sup>b</sup>College of Earth, Ocean, and Environment, University of Delaware, Lewes, DE 19958; <sup>c</sup>Unidad Académica de Sistemas Arrecifales (Puerto Morelos), Instituto de Ciencias del Mar y Limnología, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, CP 77500 Cancún, Mexico; <sup>d</sup>Science Under Sail Institute for Exploration, Sarasota, FL 34230; and <sup>e</sup>Penn State Institutes of Energy and the Environment, University Park, PA 16802

Edited by Nancy A. Moran, University of Texas at Austin, Austin, TX, and approved April 28, 2015 (received for review February 11, 2015)

Human-induced environmental changes have ushered in the rapid decline of coral reef ecosystems, particularly by disrupting the symbioses between reef-building corals and their photosymbionts. However, escalating stressful conditions enable some symbionts to thrive as opportunists. We present evidence that a stress-tolerant “zooxanthella” from the Indo-Pacific Ocean, *Symbiodinium trenchii*, has rapidly spread to coral communities across the Greater Caribbean. In marked contrast to populations from the Indo-Pacific, Atlantic populations of *S. trenchii* contained exceptionally low genetic diversity, including several widespread and genetically similar clones. Colonies with this symbiont tolerate temperatures 1–2 °C higher than other host–symbiont combinations; however, calcification by hosts harboring *S. trenchii* is reduced by nearly half, compared with those harboring natives, and suggests that these new symbioses are maladapted. Unforeseen opportunism and geographical expansion by invasive mutualistic microbes could profoundly influence the response of reef coral symbioses to major environmental perturbations but may ultimately compromise ecosystem stability and function.

invasive species | climate change | reef corals | calcification | symbiosis

**B**iological invasions and global climate change are drastically altering the diversity, distribution, and ecology of all biota on the planet (1–4), which negatively affects human well-being (5). Although the body of literature on invasive plants and animals is voluminous, invasions by nonpathogenic microbes and their impacts on ecosystem functions are poorly documented (6). Microbial invasions are difficult to detect, especially among free-living or mutualistic species, and their introduction and proliferation into new regions proceed without recognition. These invasions may alter the composition of a host community and affect the functional capacity of ecosystems (6, 7). Additional climate warming and ecosystem degradation will likely facilitate increasing numbers of successful invasions, which may further exacerbate negative ecological impacts (8).

Global change, especially ocean warming, continues to diminish the functional importance of reef corals by reducing their productivity, biodiversity, and capacity to precipitate calcium carbonate (9). The symbiotic dinoflagellates found in reef-building corals (*Symbiodinium*) are crucial to the maintenance and photosynthetic productivity of coral reef ecosystems, thus underscoring the importance of microbes and symbioses to ecosystem viability. Anomalous episodes of warm ocean temperatures destabilize these mutualistic partnerships, resulting in mass coral “bleaching” (i.e., symbiont expulsion) and mortality over broad geographic expanses (10). Predicting the response of present day host–symbiont combinations to increasing anthropogenic warming and environmental degradation is a matter of considerable debate and involves broad speculation on whether stress-tolerant symbionts might emerge to facilitate a rapid eco-physiological response to changing conditions (11–14). However, it is unclear how symbiont replacement, or displacement (referred to as “switching” or “shuffling”), will progress in diverse

coral communities distributed across broad geographic areas over the decadal ecological timescales that are necessary to keep pace with the current rate of warming.

Research on the diversity and ecology of coral symbionts suggests that episodes of stressful warming may facilitate the spread of ecologically rare or opportunistic species (13). The severe mass bleaching and mortality of eastern Caribbean corals in 2005 corresponded with an increased prevalence and abundance of *Symbiodinium trenchii* (formerly *D1a*, or *D1-4*) (15), a species in Clade D. This group is distantly related to other lineages of *Symbiodinium* and is primarily known for occurring in animals at the margins of their environmental tolerance (15). Before, during, and after this bleaching event, *S. trenchii* spread to many coral species, especially among those ultimately showing the greatest signs of physiological trauma (i.e., bleaching). Colonies with high densities of this symbiont seemed to tolerate significant thermal stress. Indeed, photosynthetic rates of *S. trenchii* (in hospite) remain unaffected at temperatures that are typically stressful to other *Symbiodinium* spp. (16–18). When environmental conditions stabilized, however, *S. trenchii* was inexorably displaced (requiring months or years) by host-typical symbionts (13, 19). Therefore, the persistence of *S. trenchii* within a coral colony may depend on chronic, or acute, stressors.

We suspected, for several reasons, that *S. trenchii* populations in the northwestern tropical Atlantic (i.e., Greater Caribbean)

## Significance

This research documents the spread of an opportunistic coral endosymbiont, *Symbiodinium trenchii*, from the Indo-Pacific into the Greater Caribbean, a region afflicted by human-related impacts including climate warming and environmental degradation. As a symbiont, it increases the resilience of photosynthetic corals to environmental perturbation but may diminish the animal's capacity to calcify and build reefs. This work exposes a critical need to better understand the consequences of microbial introductions (even mutualistic species) on ecosystem stability and function and raises questions about the long-term impact of new, but maladapted, symbioses on the productivity of reef coral communities in the Atlantic Ocean.

Author contributions: D.T.P., D.C.W., R.T.S., R.I.-P., and T.C.L. designed research; D.T.P., D.C.W., R.T.S., and T.C.L. performed research; D.C.W., R.I.-P., and T.C.L. contributed new reagents/analytic tools; D.T.P., D.C.W., R.T.S., and T.C.L. analyzed data; and D.T.P., D.C.W., R.I.-P., and T.C.L. wrote the paper.

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

This article is a PNAS Direct Submission.

Data deposition: Source codes and data files for the analysis of observed pairwise genetic difference (PWD), expected pairwise genetic difference under panmixia, and permutation test for departure from expected pairwise genetic difference among MLGs from datasets for *S. trenchii* populations in the Indian, Pacific, and Atlantic Oceans, as well as for *S. “glynni”* (type D1), type B7, type A3, and C7 reported in this paper have been deposited in the Dryad database, [www.datadryad.org](http://www.datadryad.org) (doi: 10.5061/dryad.d4152).

<sup>1</sup>To whom correspondence may be addressed. Email: [tlc3@psu.edu](mailto:tlc3@psu.edu) or [tpettay@udel.edu](mailto:tpettay@udel.edu).

This article contains supporting information online at [www.pnas.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10.1073/pnas.1502283112/-DCSupplemental](http://www.pnas.org/lookup/suppl/doi:10.1073/pnas.1502283112/-DCSupplemental).









globally through the ballast water of cargo ships (36), and shipping traffic through the Panama Canal alone may be the source of this introduction. Recent Caribbean-wide surveys have detected *S. trenchii* at background concentrations in numerous coral genera (37–39), and, as environmental conditions worsen, its prevalence and persistence may increase, especially in corals that are the most sensitive to stress (13, 16).

Under stressful conditions *S. trenchii* can displace native symbiont populations and dominate a host colony for periods of time lasting a few years, or more (13, 19). It remains unknown what biotic or abiotic factors ultimately drive this competitive outcome. When native symbiont populations decline in hospite during coral bleaching, increases in inorganic nitrogen from partial tissue necrosis may promote the proliferation of low abundance background populations of *S. trenchii* (40). Therefore, it may be a better competitor when inorganic nitrogen concentrations are high (41). Conversely, its resilience to thermal stress may allow it to assimilate available nitrogen when other dominant symbiont species have physiologically lost this capacity, leading to increased proliferation of this species while other symbionts decline.

**Ecosystem Implications.** The long-term effect of a nonnative symbiont on native coral communities may have significant consequences (42). The introduction of *S. trenchii* to a distinct Atlantic fauna with no coevolutionary history generates associations that are probably suboptimal (i.e., maladapted). Although colonies with this symbiont may cope with increasingly unstable environmental conditions, significant physiological trade-offs may persist that diminish functional performance (43–47). Indeed, our measurements showed that calcification rates were affected in colonies of *Orbicella* harboring *S. trenchii* in comparison with native *Symbiodinium* spp. (when subjected to the environmental conditions of our experiment).

Coral reef accretion requires positive carbonate budgets in which constructive processes, mainly by coral calcification, are larger than the destructive processes of physical, chemical, or biological erosion (48). Some heat-tolerant symbionts have depressed rates of CO<sub>2</sub> fixation (44) and may limit the relative amount of photosynthates translocated to the host, which are necessary for calcification (49). Our P<sub>max</sub> and calcification data indicate that *S. trenchii* may fix amounts of carbon similar to native symbionts (Fig. 3B) but retain a larger portion of these photosynthetic products for its own use. Reduced nutrient translocation in symbioses with *S. trenchii* would ultimately deprive the host of energy and therefore limit maximum rates of calcification. If extrapolated across large numbers of coral colonies, severe reductions in calcification may be sufficient to influence a coral's ability to compete successfully for space and ultimately affect reef growth (43, 50). However, additional investigations are needed to determine whether the presence

of *S. trenchii* also imposes limitations in calcification when occurring in other species of Caribbean coral.

The establishment of *S. trenchii* in the Greater Caribbean highlights a critical need to better understand the consequences of microbial introductions on ecosystem stability and function (6). The responses of coral–dinoflagellate symbioses to climate change are often discussed from the standpoint of the host controlling its partnerships with thermally tolerant symbionts. The behavior of *S. trenchii* counters such host-centric perspectives by indicating that ecological opportunism and the range expansion by only a few, or one, symbiont species can drive the dynamic response of reef coral symbioses to climate change. These *de novo* mutualisms open another dimension of research into the functional ecology and evolutionary genetics of coral–dinoflagellate symbioses (51). The ecological opportunism of *S. trenchii*, for better or worse, will likely affect the regional response of Atlantic coral communities to continued ocean warming.

## Materials and Methods

**Sample Collections.** Samples of *S. trenchii* (initially called type D1a, or D1–4) (15) analyzed in this study were originally obtained during large regional investigations of *Symbiodinium* diversity in the Atlantic (e.g., ref. 52) (Dataset S1), the eastern Indian Ocean, and the western Pacific Ocean (e.g., ref. 20). Small specimens obtained from Cnidarians (mostly scleractinians) were collected by self-contained underwater breathing apparatus (SCUBA) from reefs at eight locations around the Greater Caribbean and included Barbados, Belize, Curaçao, Florida Keys, Flower Garden Banks, Mexico, Panama and St. Croix. *S. trenchii* was also obtained from two locations in the eastern Indian Ocean (Andaman Sea, Thailand) and two locations in the western Pacific Ocean (Palau) (Fig. 1B and C). Small (1–2 cm<sup>2</sup>) fragments with tissue were preserved in either a high salt, 20% DMSO buffer (53) or 95% ethanol and stored at –20 °C until DNA extraction. Collection totals and range of dates for each location are as follows: Greater Caribbean (GC; n = 112, recovered from the screening of over 1,500 samples) from 1999 to 2013, Andaman Sea in the Indian Ocean (IND; n = 57) in 2007, and Palau in the west Pacific (PAC; n = 76) in 2009 (Dataset S1).

**Genetic and Physiological Analyses.** Additional methods, along with supporting tables, figures, and access to source codes, are available in [Supporting Information](#).

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.** We thank the numerous colleagues who helped with collections of specimens used in the analysis of *S. trenchii* genetics, including Mark Warner and Dustin Kemp, who provided samples from Curaçao; Kemp provided additional samples from Belize, and Jorge Pinzón collected samples from Panama. We also appreciated the constructive suggestions and criticisms provided by anonymous reviewers, which helped improve the manuscript. This work was funded in part by Pennsylvania State University, Florida International University, and National Science Foundation Grants OCE-0928764 and IOS-1258058, -1258065, and -1258063, the Canon Foundation (Japan), and Programa de Apoyos a Proyectos de Investigación e Innovación Tecnológica Grant IN206413 (to R.I.-P.), and a Professional Association of Diving Instructors (PADI) grant (to D.T.P.).

- Dukes JS, Mooney HA (1999) Does global change increase the success of biological invaders? *Trends Ecol Evol* 14(4):135–139.
- Mack RN, et al. (2000) Biotic invasions: Causes, epidemiology, global consequences, and control. *Ecol Appl* 10:689–710.
- Walther GR, et al. (2002) Ecological responses to recent climate change. *Nature* 416(6879):389–395.
- Parmesan C (2006) Ecological and evolutionary responses to recent climate change. *Annu Rev Ecol Syst* 37:637–669.
- Pejchar L, Mooney HA (2009) Invasive species, ecosystem services and human well-being. *Trends Ecol Evol* 24(9):497–504.
- Litchman E (2010) Invisible invaders: Non-pathogenic invasive microbes in aquatic and terrestrial ecosystems. *Ecol Lett* 13(12):1560–1572.
- Vellinga EC, Wolfe BE, Pringle A (2009) Global patterns of ectomycorrhizal introductions. *New Phytol* 181(4):960–973.
- Walther GR, et al. (2009) Alien species in a warmer world: Risks and opportunities. *Trends Ecol Evol* 24(12):686–693.
- Hoegh-Guldberg O, et al. (2007) Coral reefs under rapid climate change and ocean acidification. *Science* 318(5857):1737–1742.
- Fitt WK, Brown BE, Warner ME, Dunne RP (2001) Coral bleaching: Interpretation of thermal tolerance limits and thermal thresholds in tropical corals. *Coral Reefs* 20: 51–65.
- Baker AC, Starger CJ, McClanahan TR, Glynn PW (2004) Coral reefs: Corals' adaptive response to climate change. *Nature* 430(7001):741.
- Berkelmans R, van Oppen MJ (2006) The role of zooxanthellae in the thermal tolerance of corals: A 'nugget of hope' for coral reefs in an era of climate change. *Proc Biol Sci* 273(1599):2305–2312.
- Lajeunesse TC, Smith RT, Finney J, Oxenford H (2009) Outbreak and persistence of opportunistic symbiotic dinoflagellates during the 2005 Caribbean mass coral 'bleaching' event. *Proc Biol Sci* 276(1676):4139–4148.
- Jones AM, Berkelmans R, van Oppen MJ, Mieog JC, Sinclair W (2008) A community change in the algal endosymbionts of a scleractinian coral following a natural bleaching event: Field evidence of acclimatization. *Proc Biol Sci* 275(1641):1359–1365.
- Lajeunesse TC, et al. (2014) Ecologically differentiated stress-tolerant endosymbionts in the dinoflagellate genus *Symbiodinium* (Dinophyceae) Clade D are different species. *Phycologia* 53:305–319.
- Grottoli AG, et al. (2014) The cumulative impact of annual coral bleaching can turn some coral species winners into losers. *Glob Change Biol* 20(12):3823–3833.
- Kemp DW, Hernandez-Pech X, Iglesias-Prieto R, Fitt WK, Schmidt GW (2014) Community dynamics and physiology of *Symbiodinium* spp. before, during, and after a coral bleaching event. *Limnol Oceanogr* 59:788–797.
- Silverstein RN, Cunning R, Baker AC (2014) Change in algal symbiont communities after bleaching, not prior heat exposure, increases heat tolerance of reef corals. *Glob Change Biol* 21(1):236–249.

19. Thornhill DJ, Lajeunesse TC, Kemp DW, Fitt WK, Schmidt GW (2006) Multi-year, seasonal genotypic surveys of coral-algal symbioses reveal prevalent stability or post-bleaching reversion. *Mar Biol* 148:711–722.
20. Lajeunesse TC, et al. (2010) Long-standing environmental conditions, geographic isolation and host-symbiont specificity influence the relative ecological dominance and genetic diversification of coral endosymbionts in the genus *Symbiodinium*. *J Biogeogr* 37:785–800.
21. Toller WW, Rowan R, Knowlton N (2001) Repopulation of Zooxanthellae in the Caribbean corals *Montastraea annularis* and *M. faveolata* following experimental and disease-associated bleaching. *Biol Bull* 201(3):360–373.
22. Pettay DT, Wham DC, Pinzón JH, Lajeunesse TC (2011) Genotypic diversity and spatial-temporal distribution of *Symbiodinium* clones in an abundant reef coral. *Mol Ecol* 20(24):5197–5212.
23. Baums IB, Devlin-Durante MK, Lajeunesse TC (2014) New insights into the dynamics between reef corals and their associated dinoflagellate endosymbionts from population genetic studies. *Mol Ecol* 23(17):4203–4215.
24. Nei M, Chakraborty R, Fuerst PA (1976) Infinite allele model with varying mutation rate. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 73(11):4164–4168.
25. Luikart G, Allendorf FW, Cornuet JM, Sherwin WB (1998) Distortion of allele frequency distributions provides a test for recent population bottlenecks. *J Hered* 89(3):238–247.
26. Gardner TA, Côté IM, Gill JA, Grant A, Watkinson AR (2003) Long-term region-wide declines in Caribbean corals. *Science* 301(5635):958–960.
27. Mora C (2008) A clear human footprint in the coral reefs of the Caribbean. *Proc Biol Sci* 275(1636):767–773.
28. Wootton JC, et al. (2002) Genetic diversity and chloroquine selective sweeps in *Plasmodium falciparum*. *Nature* 418(6895):320–323.
29. Lajeunesse TC, Lee S, Bush S, Bruno JF (2005) Persistence of non-Caribbean algal symbionts in Indo-Pacific mushroom corals released to Jamaica 35 years ago. *Coral Reefs* 24:157–159.
30. Lajeunesse TC, Loh W, Trench RK (2009) Do introduced endosymbiotic dinoflagellates 'take' to new hosts? *Biol Inv* 11:995–1003.
31. Thornhill DJ, Xiang Y, Pettay DT, Zhong M, Santos SR (2013) Population genetic data of a model symbiotic cnidarian system reveal remarkable symbiotic specificity and vectored introductions across ocean basins. *Mol Ecol* 22(17):4499–4515.
32. Lajeunesse TC, et al. (2010) Host-symbiont recombination versus natural selection in the response of coral-dinoflagellate symbioses to environmental disturbance. *Proc Biol Sci* 277(1696):2925–2934.
33. Lessios HA, Robertson DR, Cubitt JD (1984) Spread of *diadema* mass mortality through the Caribbean. *Science* 226(4672):335–337.
34. Hines A, Acero P, Orti G, Wilbur AE, Freshwater DW (2011) Reconstructing the lionfish invasion: Insights into Greater Caribbean biogeography. *J Biogeogr* 38:1281–1293.
35. Toller WW, Rowan R, Knowlton N (2001) Zooxanthellae of the *Montastraea annularis* species complex: Patterns of distribution of four taxa of *Symbiodinium* on different reefs and across depths. *Biol Bull* 201(3):348–359.
36. Hallegraeff GM (1998) Transport of toxic dinoflagellates via ships' ballast water: Bio-economic risk assessment and efficacy of possible ballast water management strategies. *Mar Ecol Prog Ser* 168:297–309.
37. Smith RT (2008) Specificity, stability and comparative physiology of coral-Symbiodinium mutualisms: Evaluating the potential for acclimation and/or adaptation in reef corals. PhD dissertation (Florida International University, Miami, FL).
38. Correa AM, McDonald MD, Baker AC (2009) Development of clade-specific *Symbiodinium* primers for quantitative PCR (qPCR) and their application to detecting clade D symbionts in Caribbean corals. *Mar Biol* 156:2403–2411.
39. Kennedy EV, Foster NL, Mumby PJ, Stevens JR (2015) Widespread prevalence of cryptic *Symbiodinium* D in the key Caribbean reef builder, *Orbicella annularis*. *Coral Reefs* 34:519–531.
40. Fitt WK, Spero HJ, Halas J, White MW, Porter JW (1993) Recovery of the coral *Montastraea annularis* in the Florida Keys after the 1987 Caribbean "bleaching event". *Coral Reefs* 12:57–64.
41. Baker DM, Andras JP, Jordán-Garza AG, Fogel ML (2013) Nitrate competition in a coral symbiosis varies with temperature among *Symbiodinium* clades. *ISME J* 7(6):1248–1251.
42. Ortiz JC, González-Rivero M, Mumby PJ (2013) Can a thermally tolerant symbiont improve the future of Caribbean coral reefs? *Glob Change Biol* 19(1):273–281.
43. Little AF, van Oppen MJ, Willis BL (2004) Flexibility in algal endosymbioses shapes growth in reef corals. *Science* 304(5676):1492–1494.
44. Cantin NE, van Oppen MJ, Willis BL, Mieog JC, Negri AP (2009) Juvenile corals can acquire more carbon from high-performance algal symbionts. *Coral Reefs* 28:405–414.
45. Abrego D, Ulstrup KE, Willis BL, van Oppen MJ (2008) Species-specific interactions between algal endosymbionts and coral hosts define their bleaching response to heat and light stress. *Proc Biol Sci* 275(1648):2273–2282.
46. Mieog JC, et al. (2009) The roles and interactions of symbiont, host and environment in defining coral fitness. *PLoS ONE* 4(7):e6364.
47. Jones A, Berkelmans R (2010) Potential costs of acclimatization to a warmer climate: Growth of a reef coral with heat tolerant vs. sensitive symbiont types. *PLoS ONE* 5(5):e10437.
48. Adey WH (1978) Coral reef morphogenesis: A multidimensional model. *Science* 202(4370):831–837.
49. Colombo-Pallotta MF, Rodríguez-Román A, Iglesias-Prieto R (2010) Calcification in bleached and unbleached *Montastraea faveolata*: Evaluating the role of oxygen and glycerol. *Coral Reefs* 29:899–907.
50. Kennedy EV, et al. (2013) Avoiding coral reef functional collapse requires local and global action. *Curr Biol* 23(10):912–918.
51. Lee CE (2002) Evolutionary genetics of invasive species. *Trends Ecol Evol* 17:386–391.
52. Finney JC, et al. (2010) The relative significance of host-habitat, depth, and geography on the ecology, endemism, and speciation of coral endosymbionts in the genus *Symbiodinium*. *Microb Ecol* 60(1):250–263.
53. Seutin G, White BN, Boag PT (1991) Preservation of avian blood and tissue samples for DNA analyses. *Can J Zool* 69:82–92.
54. Lajeunesse TC, et al. (2003) Low symbiont diversity in southern Great Barrier Reef corals, relative to those of the Caribbean. *Limnol Oceanogr* 48:2046–2054.
55. Lajeunesse TC (2002) Diversity and community structure of symbiotic dinoflagellates from Caribbean coral reefs. *Mar Biol* 141:387–400.
56. Lajeunesse TC, Trench RK (2000) Biogeography of two species of *Symbiodinium* (Freudenthal) inhabiting the intertidal sea anemone *Anthopleura elegantissima* (Brandt). *Biol Bull* 199(2):126–134.
57. Pettay DT, Lajeunesse TC (2009) Microsatellite loci for assessing genetic diversity, dispersal and clonality of coral symbionts in 'stress-tolerant' clade D *Symbiodinium*. *Mol Ecol Resour* 9(3):1022–1025.
58. Wham DC, Pettay DT, Lajeunesse TC (2011) Microsatellite loci for the host-generalist "zooxanthella" *Symbiodinium trenchi* and other Clade D *Symbiodinium*. *Conserv Genet Resour* 3:541–544.
59. Pettay DT, Lajeunesse TC (2013) Long-range dispersal and high-latitude environments influence the population structure of a "stress-tolerant" dinoflagellate endosymbiont. *PLoS ONE* 8(11):e79208.
60. Pettay DT, Lajeunesse TC (2007) Microsatellites from clade B *Symbiodinium* spp. specialized for Caribbean corals in the genus *Madracis*. *Mol Ecol Notes* 7:1271–1274.
61. Thornhill DJ, Lewis AM, Wham DC, Lajeunesse TC (2014) Host-specialist lineages dominate the adaptive radiation of reef coral endosymbionts. *Evolution* 68(2):352–367.
62. Peakall R, Smouse PE (2006) GENALEX 6: Genetic analysis in Excel. Population genetic software for teaching and research. *Mol Ecol Notes* 6:288–295.
63. Waits LP, Luikart G, Taberlet P (2001) Estimating the probability of identity among genotypes in natural populations: Cautions and guidelines. *Mol Ecol* 10(1):249–256.
64. R Core Team (2014) R: A language and environment for statistical computing (R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna).
65. Anthony KRN, Hoegh-Guldberg O (2003) Kinetics of photoacclimation in corals. *Oecologia* 134(1):23–31.
66. Smith JM, Smith NH, O'Rourke M, Spratt BG (1993) How clonal are bacteria? *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 90(10):4384–4388.
67. Felsenstein J (2004) PHYLIP: Phylogeny Inference Package (Department of Genome Sciences, University of Washington, Seattle, WA), Version 3.6.
68. Rodríguez-Román A, et al. (2006) Photosynthesis and light utilization in the Caribbean coral *Montastraea faveolata* recovering from a bleaching event. *Limnol Oceanogr* 51:2701–2710.
69. Abramoff MD, Magalhaes PJ, Ram SJ (2004) Image processing with ImageJ. *Biophoton Int* 11:36–42.
70. Yao W, Byrne RH (1998) Simplified seawater alkalinity analysis: Use of linear array spectrometers. *Deep Sea Res Part I Oceanogr Res Pap* 45:1383–1392.
71. Smith SV, Kinsey DW (1978) Calcification and organic carbon metabolism as indicated by carbon dioxide. *Coral Reefs: Research Methods* (Monographs on Oceanographic Methodology), eds Stoddart DR, Johannes RE (UNESCO, Paris), Number 5, pp 469–484.
72. Bates D, Maechler M, Bolker BM, Walker S (2014) Fitting linear mixed-effects models using lme4. [arxiv.org/abs/1406.5823](https://arxiv.org/abs/1406.5823).
73. Kuznetsova A, Brockhoff PB, Christensen RHB (2014) lmerTest: Tests in Linear Mixed Effects Models. [cran.r-project.org](https://cran.r-project.org).
74. Thornhill DJ, Lajeunesse TC, Santos SR (2007) Measuring rDNA diversity in eukaryotic microbial systems: How intragenomic variation, pseudogenes, and PCR artifacts confound biodiversity estimates. *Mol Ecol* 16(24):5326–5340.