

CISC351 Winter 2020 Project Paper Review Requirements

Within your group, each member should pick a unique related work to review. If you don't have paper review experience, please read the following guide:

<https://misq.org/skin/frontend/default/misq/pdf/EditorialInfo/LeeReviewing.pdf>

Question 1: What's should be included in the paper review report?

Student id and name

Project id and title: you should use the same title given in your proposal.

Information of paper: list paper name, published venue, authors, and published year. Avoid picking unpublished work (e.g., those only available on arxiv.org).

Why you pick this paper: give a short description on why you believe this work is related to your group project. E.g., this paper contains the state-of-the-art solution for your project, can be used as a baseline approach, etc.

A short summary of the paper: within 150 words, your summary should describe what the paper did.

Sample: "This paper represents a major effort to test two competing theories about user satisfaction with electronic mail... The methodology of the paper consists of... The data were gathered from two field sites... The major finding was that... The contributions to theory and practice would appear to be..."

A summary containing 2 Pros and 2 Cons of the paper:

The pros should talk about the major strengths of the paper. For instance “The major asset of this manuscript is that it presents a new approach to...This, in turn, raises interesting general issues such as: (1)...(2)...(3)...”

At least 4 detailed comments:

Each detail comment should give a specific location of the comment, e.g., line 10 of page 8. You could question about an unclear statement or problems in methodology/table/image. Avoid trivial comments, e.g., typos, not enough dataset, etc.

2 potential improvements:

Given two potential improvements for the paper, e.g., adding what kind of new experiments, more types of data, more feature engineering, etc. Avoid repeating the idea mentioned in the future work section of original paper.

Question 2: What’s the format of this proposal?

Your paper review should be a PDF document. Please submit your report via onq.

Question 3: How will project proposal be marked?

The paper review task is mainly intended to make sure you read potential solutions and domain knowledge related to your project. Your proposal will be marked by the TA assigned to your group project.