

## MA 225 Problem Set 11

**exercises** 1. Write three blueprints for a proof that *If blah blah and so on, then A is finite.*: each blue print should use a different approach. Consider  $\phi : A \rightarrow \mathbb{N}_k$

...

Since if  $\phi(a) = \phi(b)$  means  $a = b$ ,  $\phi$  is injective.

...

Since  $\forall g \in \mathbb{N}_k, \exists a \in A : \phi(a) = g$ ,  $A$  is surjective. So  $A$  is finite.

Consider  $\phi : A \rightarrow \mathbb{N}_k$ .

...

So there exists a  $\phi^{-1} : \mathbb{N}_k \rightarrow A$ . So there exists a bijection between  $A$  and  $N_k$ ,  $A$  is finite.

Consider the set  $A$  with the rule blah blah blah

...

So  $A = \emptyset$ , so  $A$  is finite.

2. Write two blueprints for a proof that *If blah blah and so on, then A is infinite.*

Let  $A$  be finite.

Blah blah blah...

So  $x \in A$ . By the original definition,  $x \notin A$ . So  $A$  is infinite by contradiction.

Consider  $x \in B$  where  $B$  is an infinite set.

Since  $x \in A$ ,  $B \subseteq A$ . So  $A$  is infinite.

3. Why does problem 11 make the assumption that  $S$  has at least two elements? Because if it has less than 2, then there are no numbers,  $c$  which  $a < c < b$  as there is no  $b$ .

**proofs** Write a complete proof for each of the following statements.

1. Long ago, we gave a bit of a handwavey argument that the product of two finite sets was finite. Let  $A$  be a finite set (say, with cardinality  $n$ ) and  $B$  be a finite set (say, with cardinality  $m$ ). Give a concrete proof that  $A \times B$  is finite by explicitly constructing a bijection between  $A \times B$  and some  $\mathbb{N}_k$ .

**Claim 1.**  $A \times B$  is finite if  $A$  and  $B$  are finite.

*Proof.*  $A \approx \mathbb{N}_n$  and  $B \approx \mathbb{N}_m$ . By proof 3,  $A \times B \approx \mathbb{N}_n \times \mathbb{N}_m$ . Since there are  $n * m$  objects in  $\mathbb{N}_n \times \mathbb{N}_m$ ,  $\mathbb{N}_n \times \mathbb{N}_m \approx \mathbb{N}_j$ . So  $A \times B \approx \mathbb{N}_j$  (Transitivity) and therefore is finite.  $\square$

2. If  $A_1, \dots, A_p$  are each finite sets, then  $\bigtimes_{k=1}^p A_k = \{(x_1, \dots, x_p) | x_i \in A_i\}$  is finite.

**Claim 2.** If  $A_1, \dots, A_p$  are each finite sets, then  $\bigtimes_{k=1}^p A_k = \{(x_1, \dots, x_p) | x_i \in A_i\}$  is finite.

*Proof.* Base Case( $p = 1$ ):  $A_1$  is finite (by def)

Inductive hypothesis( $p = r$ ):  $\bigtimes_{k=1}^r A_k$  is finite.

Inductive step( $r + 1$ ): We'll show  $\bigtimes_{k=1}^{r+1} A_k$  is finite:

$$\begin{array}{c} r+1 \\ \bigtimes \\ k=1 \\ A_k \\ r \\ \bigtimes \\ k=1 \\ A_k \times A_{r+1} \end{array}$$

Since  $A_{r+1}$  and  $\bigtimes_{k=1}^r A_k$  are finite,  $\bigtimes_{k=1}^r A_k \times A_{r+1}$  is finite (proof 1). So by PMI,  $\bigtimes_{k=1}^p A_k = \{(x_1, \dots, x_p) | x_i \in A_i\}$  is finite.  $\square$

3. Write out in detail the proof that if  $A \approx X$  and  $B \approx Y$ , then  $A \times B \approx X \times Y$ .

**Claim 3.** *If  $A \approx X$  and  $B \approx Y$ , then  $A \times B \approx X \times Y$ .*

*Proof.* Consider the bijections  $\psi : A \rightarrow X$  and  $\phi : B \rightarrow Y$ .

Let  $\psi \times \phi : A \times B \rightarrow X \times Y$  which  $(a, b) \mapsto (\psi(a), \phi(b))$  where  $a \in A$  and  $b \in B$ .

Injectivity: Let  $\psi \times \phi((a_1, b_1)) = \psi \times \phi((a_2, b_2))$ . In particular,  $\psi(a_1) = \psi(a_2)$ , so  $a_1 = a_2$  (injectivity of  $\psi$ ). Also  $\phi(b_1) = \phi(b_2)$ , so  $b_1 = b_2$ . Therefore  $\psi \times \phi$  is injective.

Surjectivity: Let  $(x, y) \in X \times Y$  where  $x \in X$  and  $y \in Y$ . So  $\exists a \in A$  such that  $\psi(a) = x$  and  $\exists b \in B$  such that  $\phi(b) = y$ . So  $\psi \times \phi((a, b)) = (x, y)$ , so  $\psi \times \phi$  is bijective. Therefore  $A \times B \approx X \times Y$ .  $\square$

4. ( $\star\star$ ) It's a fact of arithmetic that for any natural numbers  $b, m, n$ ,  $b^{m+n} = b^m b^n$ . State, and prove, the set equivalence which reduces to this fact if the three sets involved happen to be finite.

*Proof.*  $\square$

5. ( $\star\star$ ) It's a fact of arithmetic that for any natural numbers  $b, m, n$ ,  $b^{mn} = (b^m)^n$ . State, and prove, the set equivalence which reduces to this fact if the three sets involved happen to be finite.

6. Let  $A$  be an infinite set and  $R$  an equivalence relation on  $A$  with the property that each equivalence class  $[a]_R$  is finite. Show that  $A/R$  is infinite.

**Claim 4.** *If  $A$  is an infinite set and  $R$  an equivalence relation on  $A$  with the property that each equivalence class  $[a]_R$  is finite, then  $A/R$  is infinite.*

*Proof.* Assume  $A/R$  is finite. So  $\bigcup_{x \in A/R} x = A$ . Since  $\bigcup_{x \in A/R} x$  is finite (Proof 9 Problem set 10) and  $A$  is not. So by contradiction,  $A/R$  cannot be finite, and therefore must be infinite.  $\square$

7. Show that the union of any collection of finitely many denumerable sets is denumerable; that is, for any  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , if  $A_1, \dots, A_n$  are each denumerable, then  $\bigcup_{k=1}^n A_k$  is denumerable.

(Hint.  $n$  is a natural number.)

**Claim 5.** *The union of any collection of finitely many denumerable sets is denumerable; that is, for any  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , if  $A_1, \dots, A_n$  are each denumerable, then  $\bigcup_{k=1}^n A_k$  is denumerable.*

*Proof.* Base case( $n=1$ ):  $\bigcup_{k=1}^n A_k = A_1$  (denumerable by definition)

Inductive Hypothesis( $r = n$ ):  $\bigcup_{k=1}^r A_k$  is denumerable.

Inductive Step:

$$\bigcup_{k=1}^{r+1} A_k \qquad \bigcup_{k=1}^r A_k \cup A_r$$

So  $\bigcup_{k=1}^r A_k \approx \mathbb{N}$  (inductive hypothesis). Since adding a denumerable number keeps a set

denumerable,  $\bigcup_{k=1}^r A_k \cup A_r$  is denumerable. By PMI,  $\bigcup_{k=1}^n A_k$  is denumerable.  $\square$

8. Let  $A$  be a countable set and  $R$  an equivalence relation on  $A$ . Show that  $A/R$  is countable.

**Claim 6.**  $A/R$  is countable.

*Proof.* Assume  $A/R$  is not countable and  $A$  is countable. So  $\bigcup_{a \in A} [a]_R = A$ . However we earlier established  $A$  is countable, and  $\bigcup_{a \in A} [a]_R$  isn't, this is a contradiction and so  $A/R$  is countable.  $\square$

9. Show that the set of all lines in the plane with rational slope and rational intercept is denumerable. (*Hint.* Write each line in slope-intercept form.)
10. ( $\star$ ) No powerset is denumerable.

**Claim 7.** No powerset is denumerable.

*Proof.* Let  $A$  be a set.

Case  $A$  is finite: Then  $\text{card}(2^A) = 2^{\text{card}(A)}$ . Since this is finite,  $2^A$  is not denumerable.

Case  $A$  is denumerable: Assume  $2^A$  is denumerable. So  $2^A = A_1, A_2, \dots$  for infinite sets. Let  $B = b_1, b_2, \dots$  be a subset of  $A$ . Consider  $A_n$  term. Change the  $n$ th element to  $k$  in  $A_n$  and define  $b_n = k$ . Since  $b_n \notin 2^A$  (since it differs by definition from every element in  $2^A$ ), this is a contradiction, as by definition  $b_n \in 2^A$ . So  $2^A$  isn't denumerable in this case.

Case  $A$  is uncountable: Since  $2^A$  is not smaller than  $A$ ,  $2^A$  is not denumerable.

So no powerset is denumerable.  $\square$

b

11. ( $\star\star$ ) Let  $S \subseteq \mathbb{R}$  be a set with the property: given any  $a, b \in S$  with  $a < b$ , there is some  $c \in S$  with  $a < c < b$ . Assume  $S$  has at least two elements.

- (a) Show that  $S$  is infinite.

**Claim 8.**  $S$  is infinite.

*Proof.* Assume  $S$  is finite. Then  $S = s_1, \dots, s_n$  where  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $s_1 < s_2 < \dots < s_n$ . Consider  $c = \frac{s_1 + s_2}{2}$ . Since  $s_1, s_2 \in S$  and  $s_1 < c < s_2$ . So  $c \in S$ . However we claimed to have a complete list, and since there were no elements between  $s_1$  and  $s_2$ , this is a contradiction. So  $S$  is infinite.  $\square$

- (b) Show that between any two distinct elements of  $S$ , there are infinitely many elements of  $S$ .

**Claim 9.** *Between any two distinct elements of  $S$ , there are infinitely many elements of  $S$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $a, b \in A$ . Consider the set  $C$  where  $a, b \in C$  where  $C = a, c_2 \dots b$  and  $a < c_2 < \dots < b$ . So  $C$  is infinite (previous proof). Since all elements of  $C$  are  $< a$  and  $> b$ , there exists an infinite amount of elements between any two distinct points in  $A$ .  $\square$