

# Positively generated subgroups of free groups and the Hanna Neumann conjecture

Bilal Khan

ABSTRACT. The *Hanna Neumann conjecture* states that if  $F$  is a free group, then for all subgroups  $H, K \leq F$ ,

$$\text{rank}(H \cap K) - 1 \leq [\text{rank}(H) - 1][\text{rank}(K) - 1]$$

Previous research on the conjecture has proceeded largely by “translating” the group-theoretic properties of subgroups of free groups into the graph-theoretic properties of their corresponding foldings or finite automata. This paper attempts to elaborate the reverse.

In particular, in this paper we give group-theoretic interpretation of the well-known graph-theoretic property of strong connectivity. Specifically, we show that strong connectivity of a subgroup’s folding corresponds exactly to the property that the subgroup is *positively generated* (i.e. is generated by a set of words containing no negative exponents). To accomplish this, we present the notion of a strong directed trail decomposition of a directed graph; this decomposition provides a useful computational tool, and facilitates inductive arguments about the properties of positively generated subgroups of free groups.

As an example application of directed trail decomposition techniques, we prove that if a subgroup  $H \leq F$  is positively generated, or if its associated folding  $\Gamma_H$  has no source or sink vertices, then for all subgroups  $K \leq F$ , the Hanna Neumann conjecture holds for the pair  $(H, K)$ . We also show that if a subgroup of a free group is positively generated, then it has a positive basis. Finally, we describe an algorithm which decides whether an arbitrary finitely generated subgroup of a free group is positively generated, and if so, outputs a positive basis for the subgroup.

## 1. Introduction

Improving Howson’s earlier bound [5] on the rank of intersections of finitely generated (f.g.) subgroups of free groups, H. Neumann proved in [9] that any  $H, K \leq_{\text{f.g.}} F$  must satisfy

$$\text{rank}(H \cap K) - 1 \leq 2[\text{rank}(H) - 1][\text{rank}(K) - 1]$$

The stronger assertion obtained by omitting the factor of 2 has come to be known as the Hanna Neumann conjecture. In [1], Burns improved H. Neumann’s bound

---

1991 *Mathematics Subject Classification*. Primary 20E05; Secondary 20F10.

18. Robert Tarjan, *Depth-first search and linear graph algorithms*, SIAM J. Computing **Vol. 1** (June 1972), 146–160.
19. H. Whitney, *Congruent graphs and the connectivity of graphs*, Amer. J. Math. **54** (1932), 150–168.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK, 365 FIFTH AVENUE, NEW YORK, 365 FIFTH AVENUE, NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10016-4309  
*E-mail address:* `grouptheory@hotmail.com`