by Barnaby Brown

A map of the pibroch landscape, 1760–1841

THE survey presented on these six pages is a tidy-up operation. For twenty years, I have worked around usability issues with existing tables of data, including my own. I frequently found myself bamboozled, unable to find a particular setting, or discovering that inherited data didn't correspond with reality. Given the complexity produced by several generations of oral transmission, it is unsurprising that the task of mapping this material has been challenging. The deficiencies of previous surveys, however, are small compared to the debt I owe to those who worked under harder conditions, drawing connections between sources for the first time. It is thanks to the generosity of previous explorers, taking the trouble to share their discoveries, that I have been able to produce a map which is more powerful and user-friendly.

AIMS AND PREVIOUS WORK

THE principal 'cartographers' whose work I have built on are General Thomason, Archibald Campbell (Kilberry), Frans Buisman and Roderick Cannon. Like me, they corrected and updated previous work, producing a framework on which to hang ideas and knowledge. The result is Table 1, which flows onto six pages. This is not a satellite view, but a simplified representation designed to make orientation easier. It deletes most of the detail, enabling us to see the wood for the trees. Adapted for the human brain, it helps us navigate unfamiliar territory and plan routes of exploration. Pibroch is a vast ocean of intermingling material. More can be achieved with a good map.

General Thomason's *Ceol Mor* (1893–1905) was the first comprehensive survey, but he was quick to correct material which didn't conform to his understanding and he didn't have access to the Campbell Canntaireachd. Kilberry's achievement (1925–1961) was to take much more source material into account, but most of it was buried in critical apparatus, editorial policy, or his file on each tune, accessible only to determined scholars. Buisman and Cannon have produced magnificent critical editions (1994–2014) of five early sources containing in-depth analyses of what each conveys individually. My focus, however, is on what this material conveys collectively: the unwritten craft behind different renditions of the same tune. Only by looking at the sources collectively can we learn what the limits of performer autonomy were, or what might differentiate the craft of a master from the craft of an apprentice. Rather than viewing the material anachronistically — from a culture in which music is writ-

TABLE 1. 311 tunes ordered by palette and pitch height

4-pitch tunes (6%)

Pitches	№	Title	
G **A** *B* *C* - - - - *(A)*	12	Square Rea's March	WW
G **A** *B* *C* - - - - *(A)*	16	The Gordons' Salute	W
G **A** **B** *C* - - - - -	215	MacLeod of Gesto's Gathering	P
G **A** *B* **C** - *(E)* - - -	314	*Hindo hindo hindo rõdin*	W
G **A** **B** - *D* (*E* - *GA*)	170	Glengarry's March	W
G *A* **B** - *D* - - - -	285	Lament for Allan Og	RL
G **A** **B** - **D** - - - -	104	O Face so Fair	W
G *A* **B** - **D** - - - -	107	The Tune of Strife	O
- **A** **B** **C** *D* - - - *(A)*	153	White Wedder Black Tail	I
- **A** **B** *C* - **E** - - -	9	The MacNabs' Gathering	RL
- **A** **B** *C* - **E** - - *(A)*	13	The Rout of Glenfruin	W
- *A* **B** **C** - **E** - - -	301	MacLeod of Tallisker's Salute	W
- *A* **B** **C** - *E* - *(GA)*	36	One of the Cragich: *Hiharin hiodreen*	P
- **A** **B** *C* - **E** - - *(A)*	74	Lament for Lord Breadalbane	I
- **A** **B** *C* - **E** - - *(A)*	89	Good health to you, Donald	P
- **A** *B* **C** - **E** - - *(A)*	62	Mary's Tune	WW
- **A** **B** - *D* **E** - - *(A)*	5	The Red Ribbon	W
- *A* **B** - **D** **E** - - -	232	The Mackenzies' Gathering	P

5-pitch tunes (32%)

Pitches	№	Title	
G **A** **B** *C* *d* - - - -	19	The Frasers' March	W
G **A** **B** *C* **D** - - - -	196	Lady Margaret MacDonald's Salute	WW
G **A** *B* **C** **D** - - - -	304	Catherine's Salute	W
G **A** *B* **C** **D** - - - -	204	War or Peace	I
G **A** **B** **C** **D** - - - -	226	The MacLeans' Gathering	WW
G *A* **B** **C** **D** - - - -	164	The MacDonalds' Gathering	O
G **A** *B* **C** **D** - - *(A)*	6	The MacIntyres' Salute	W
G *A* *B* **C** **D** - - - -	245	Lament for the Son of King Aro	P
G **A** **B** *C* - *e* - - -	274	MacKenzie of Gairloch's Salute	P
G **A** **B** **C** - *e* (*F* - *A*)	11	MacLean of Coll's Galley	W
G **A** **B** *C* - **E** - - -	77	The MacLeans' March	WW
G **A** **B** *C* - **E** - - *(A)*	73	Chisholm of Strathglass's Salute	I
G **A** *B* *C* - **E** - - *(A)*	298	Cluny MacPherson's Salute	W
G **A** *B* **C** - **E** - *(GA)*	151	All the old men paid but Rory	W
G **A** *B* **C** - **E** - *(GA)*	76	Clan Chattan's Gathering	WW
G **A** **B** - *d* *e* - - *(A)*	28	Pibroch of One Knoll	W
G *A* **B** - **D** *e* - - -	244	The MacDonalds' Salute	I
G **A** *B* - **D** *e* - - -	240	The Little-Finger Tune	WW
G **A** **B** - *d* **E** - - -	311	The Sauntering	W
G **A** *B* - **D** **E** - - -	174	The MacDonalds of Clanranald's Gathering	W
G **A** **B** - *D* **E** - - -	132	The Finger Lock	P
G *A* **B** - *D* **E** - - -	181	The Bells of Perth	W
G **A** *B* - **D** **E** - - -	46	A Flame of Wrath for Patrick Caogach	I
G **A** *B* - **D** **E** - - -	112	The Rout of the Lowland Captain	I
G **A** *B* - **D** **E** - - -	235	The Vaunting	P
G **A** *B* - **D** **E** - - *(A)*	55	Young George's Salute	I
G **A** *B* - **D** **E** - - *(A)*	144	Ewan's Crònan	W
G **A** **B** - **D** **E** - - -	47	Lament for MacKinnon	W
G *A* **B** - **D** **E** - - -	115	My King has landed in Moidart	WW
G *A* **B** - **D** **E** - - -	186	Murray of Abercairney's Salute	WW
G **A** *B* - **D** **E** - *(A)*	218	The Menzies' Salute	W

Tonality	PS	Title	Cycle
G A B - D E - - (G A)	4	The Blue Ribbon	W
G A B - D E - - (A)	69	*Hindre cheen*	W
G A B - D E - - (A)	70	Glencoe's March	W
G A B - D E - - (A)	211	Mackintosh of Borlum's Salute	WW
G A B - D E - - -	119	Grain in Hides and Corn in Sacks	WW
G A B - D E - - -	171	The End of the Great Bridge	W
G A B - D E - - -	199	You're welcome, Ewen Locheil	WW
G A B - D E - - -	159	The Groat	W
G A B - D E - - -	99	Sobieski's Salute	P
G A B - D E - - -	221	The Battle of Waternish	W
G A B - D E - - -	167	The Camerons' March	W
G A B (C D) E - - -	169	The End of the Little Bridge	W
G A B - D E (F G A)	214	Leaving Kintyre	W
G A B - D E - - -	141	Dead's Lament	W
G A B - D E - - -	173	The Prince's Salute	P
G A B - D E - - -	251	Lady Doyle's Salute	RL
G A B - D E - - (A)	206	Clan Campbell's Gathering	W
G A B - D E - - (A)	140	Weighing from Land	W
G A B - D E - - -	264	The Battle of Balladruishaig	W
G A B - D E - - -	231	The MacLeods' Salute	P
G A B - D E - (G) -	85	Lament for the Duke of Hamilton	W
G A B - D E - - (A)	71	*Hindre harôdin*	FL
G A B - D E - - (A)	208	MacDonald of Staffa's Salute	W
G A B - D E - - (A)	108	The Stewarts' White Banner	I
G A B - D E - - -	312	*Himto cherede*	W
g A B - D E - - -	130	Lament for Campbell of Airds	WW
g A B - D E - - -	294	The Hen's March o'er the Midden	W
g A B - D E - - (A)	56	Salute to Inveraray	W
(G) A B C D e - - -	124	Lament for Brian O'Duff	WW
- A B C D e - - (A)	142	The Duke of Perth's March	W
- A b C D E - - -	97	The Battle of Strome	WW
- A B C D E - - -	295	We will take the highway	P
- A B C D E - - -	281	The Battle of the Inch of Perth	W
- A B C D E - - -	246	MacKinnon's Salute	P
- A B C - e f - (A)	237	The Red Speckled Bull	W
- A B C - E f - -	249	Lament for Glengarry	W
- A B C - E f - -	217	The Rout of Bendoig	I
(G) A B C - E F - (A)	225	The Old Men of the Shells	I
- A B C - E F - (A)	209	The MacKays' Banner	W
- A B C - E F - (A)	158	The Battle of Athole	W
- A B C - E F - (A)	157	The Marquis of Argyll's Salute	P
- A B C - E F - -	268	*Hindre hindre*	W
- A B C - E F - -	224	Clan MacNab's Salute	P
- A B C - E F - -	67	Mary's Praise	W
- A B C - E F - -	266	The MacKays' Short Tune	WW
- A B C - E F - (A)	297	The MacDuffs' Gathering	W
- A B C - E F - (A)	308	The Middling Spree	W
- A B C - E F - -	216	MacLeod of Raasay's Salute	WW
- A B C - E F - -	82	Lament for MacDonald of Kinlochmoidart	RL
- A B C - E F (G A)	195	Lament for MacKenzie of Gairloch	W
- A B C - E F - (A)	212	The MacKenzies' March	W
(g) A B C - E F - -	230	The Big Spree	WW
- A B C - E F - (A)	177	Black Donald's March	WW
- A B C - E F - -	284	Lachlann MacNeill Campbell of Kintarbert's Salute	W
- A B C - E F - (A)	58	The Glen is Mine	W
- A B C - E F (g) -	279	Lament for Mary MacLeod	P
- A B C - E F - (A)	166	Lament for the Laird of Cross	I
- A B C - E F - (A)	75	Maol Donn	W
- A B - D E F - -	118	The Earl of Ross's March	I
- A B - D E F - (A)	65	Lament for Iain Ciar	W
(g) A B - D E F - -	265	Lament for Captain Donald MacKenzie	RL
- A B - D E F - (A)	59	The Tutor of Clanranald's March	W
- A B - D E F - (A)	241	The men went to drink	W
- A B - D E F - (A)	32	Isabel Mackay	RL
- A B - D E F - -	40	*Hiharindare chedareche*	FL
- A B - D E - G -	41	Lament for Carwhin	W
- (a) B C - E F - A	131	Salute on the Birth of Rory Mor MacLeod	FL
- - B - D E F - A	63	The Left Hand Tune	LW

ten down, originality is paramount, the roles of composer and performer are divided, and piping is a low-status ethnic music — I want to view it from the elite professional environment that shaped it. I am particularly interested in the craft of Highland piping's greatest composer, Iain MacAoidh, Am Pìobaire Dall (John MacKay, The Blind Piper), whose dates are rationalised as 1656–1754. His music is only accessible through this source material.

DEVELOPMENT

THIS navigational chart began life in 1994 as my undergraduate dissertation. Previous versions were distributed to a few scholars in 1995 and 1999 and I am grateful to them all for valuable comments, but particularly to Frans Buisman and Roderick Cannon who shared their concordances, and to William Donaldson who led the effort of making source facsimiles available online. These actions considerably facilitated its development. One of the problems I faced was that the concordances of Buisman and Cannon did not agree; another was that I found myself confronting subjective areas as well as clear-cut mistakes. I have hopefully eliminated errors and made the softer decisions with consistency and transparency.

Presentational aspects have been shaped by a desire to produce something that people will find pleasant to use. If any aspect of it frustrates you, or if you would like to test-drive an online version, please write to me at barnaby@pibroch.net. The data is available as a spreadsheet at www.barnabybrown.info/publications (the spreadsheet permits re-ordering by any column).

I have limited this survey to every tune transcribed by 1841. This cut-off point has the benefit of producing some semblance of stylistic coherence. Musical ideas have been evolving continuously and later material has a higher proportion of tunes that never had to pass the test of oral transmission. The sequence of Piobaireachd Society (PS) catalogue numbers could, and I believe should, be extended in the future to include more recent compositions and a handful of anonymous works which potentially have a pedigree of transmission stretching back before 1841.

The rows in Table 1 present information in the order: tonality, PS number, edited English title, and closest archetypal cycle. This information is a 'headline', reducing detail in a consistent manner, drawing out what is relevant for musical orientation.

Now that I have given a general background, I will explain how each element of the headline was produced.

TONALITY

HOW many pitches are there? Which pitches are used? Which pitches are strong or weak? Answers to these questions determine both the synopsis of each tune's tonality (e.g. G A B - D E f - -) and the way tunes are ordered. Tonal contours are provided by lowercase and boldface type (Table 2 provides the key). Colour is applied spar-

TABLE 2. Key to the tonal synopses

- -	pitches not present
g a	pitches scarcely present
B C	pitches moderately present
D E	pitches strongly present
(G A)	pitches not present in the Urlar but introduced in a later cycle
F	last note of the Urlar is underlined

ingly to make the contrasts between one tonality and another clearer, leaving **A–E–A** black because these pitches are omnipresent: they ring out in every tune through the ornaments *hi, darid* and *bandre,* in sympathy with the strongest drone harmonics.

Under each heading (e.g. '6-pitch tunes'), the tunes are grouped by 'pitch collection', a subset of the pipe scale which I will call the composer's palette. Tunes which use the same palette are ordered by 'pitch height', or centre of tonal gravity (starting low, ending high). This way, tunes which use the same pitches in a similar way appear near each other. This has helped me to eliminate errors and inconsistencies which did not show up when the material was arrayed by source, by title, or by archetypal cycle.

Each synopsis of tonality is a reduction of the earliest setting. Sometimes, later settings have slightly different tonalities. This is often due to the inclusion or exclusion of a thumb variation. Occasionally, however, a 'chromatic' note appears in one setting but not in another, such as high G in *'Lament for Mary MacLeod'* (PS 279) or D in *'The Sutherlands' Gathering'* (PS 72). Pitches like these stand out for their scarcity, but they do not alter the tune's identity.

A degree of subjectivity has been allowed here because an artistic impression of the tonal contours is more helpful than a flat map. The diversity of the notation would make encoding for an empirical survey a monumental task, far beyond the scope of this study. My method was to survey by eye the proportion of time spent on each pitch, giving more weight to pitches which fell on strong beats and more weight again to pitches which opened syntactical units. E cadences were ignored and syntactical positions were identified whenever the transcriber used no bar lines or made a meal of the metrical structure.

PIOBAIREACHD SOCIETY NO.

A unique catalogue number has been given to everything which can loosely be called a 'pibroch'. This PS number reduces visual clutter. Detailed source information can be found on the online gateway for each tune (see below). The number sequence roughly follows the chronological order in which these tunes were transcribed by Highland pipers (see Table 3), but discoveries since Roderick Cannon assigned these catalogue numbers have upset the rationale.

6-pitch tunes (32%)

Synopsis	PS	Title	
G A B C D e - - -	278	*Hiharinõdin hiharindro himbanõdin*	WW
G A B C D E - - -	182	Hector MacLean's Warning	W
G A B C D E - - -	263	Lament for Prince Charles	W
G A B C D E - - -	244	MacDonald's Salute, or Duntroon's Salute	WW
G A B C D E - - -	163	The Gathering of the Clans	W
G A B C D E - - -	22	Lament for the Lady of Arnaboll	RL
G A B C D E - - -	17	MacLeod of Gesto's Salute	WW
G A B C D E - - -	184	The Highland Society of Scotland's Salute	W
G A B C D E - - -	163	The Battle of Worcester	RL
G A B C D E - (G A)	78	Lament for John Garve MacLean of Coll	W
G A B C D E - (A)	49	Lament for Hugh	LW
G A B C D E - (A)	87	*Cherede cherede*	P
G A B C D E - - -	162	Clan Cameron's Gathering	I
G A B C D E - (A)	15	Lament for the Only Son	W
G A B C D E - - -	14	King James VI's Salute	W
G A B C D E - (A)	33	*Hiharin hodin*	WW
G A B C D E - - -	276	MacKenzie of Millbank's Salute	RL
G A B C D E - (A)	139	Fair Honey	W
G A B C D E - (A)	148	The Black Wedder's White Tail	WW
G A B C D E - - -	290	The Fairy Flag	W
G A B C D E - (A)	93	Lament for MacDonald's Tutor	W
G A B C D E (f G A)	117	*Chehotrao hodro*	W
G A B C D E - (A)	91	I am proud to play a pipe	I
g A B C D E - (G a)	18	*Hiharintra hotradre*	P
G A B C - E F - -	8	The Pride of Barra	RL
G A B C - E F - -	252	The Red Hand in the MacDonalds' Arms	WW
G A B C - E F - -	213	I got a Kiss of the King's Hand	WW
G A B C - E F - -	242	Coolin [? Cuillin or Coulin]	W
G A B C - E F - (A)	307	The Battle of Bealach nam Brog	O
G A B C - E - G	81	Sutherland's March / The Bicker	RL
G A B - D E f - -	309	In Dispraise of MacLeod	O
G A B - D E f - -	310	The Waking of the Bridegroom	W
G A B - D E f - -	257	The Battle of Waterloo	WW
G A B - D E f - (A)	60	Eòghainn nan Cath sang like that	W
G A B - D E f - -	227	The Parading of the MacDonalds	W
G A B - D E f - -	253	Davidson of Tulloch's Salute	WW
G A B - D E f - -	289	Cluny MacPherson's March	RL
G A B - D E F - -	138	Graham's March	W
g A B - D E F - (A)	95	Alasdair Mor MacDonald of Boisdale's Salute	W
G A B - D E F - (A)	203	Clan Ranald's Salute	W
G A B - D E F - (A)	66	McIvor's March	W
G A B - D E F - -	292	Mrs MacLeod of Tallisker's Salute	W
G A B - D E F - -	303	*Hindre cheemtra*	W
G A B - D E F - (A)	96	MacDonald of Keppoch's March	W
G A B - D E F - (A)	61	Lament for Sir James MacDonald of the Isles	WW
G A B - D E F - -	315	Lament for Abercairney	P
G A B - D E F - (A)	302	A Gathering	W
G A B - D E F - (A)	229	The Battle of Sheriffmuir	W
G A B - D E F - -	185	Lament for Catherine	RL
G A B - D E F - -	286	The Boat Tune	W
G A B - D E F - (A)	57	MacCrimmon will never return	W
G A B - D E F - (A)	86	Lament for the Laird of Contullich	W
G A B - D E - G -	260	MacKenzie of Applecross's Salute	RL
G A B - D E - G -	44	L. for Captain Archibald Campbell of Glenyon	W
G A B - D E - G -	45	Pipers' Meeting	W
G A B - D E (f) G -	282	The King's Taxes	LW
G A B - D E - G -	120	Campbell of Airds' March	W
G A B - D E - G (A)	123	Maclean of Kingairloch's March	W
G A B - D E - G -	134	MacNeil is Lord there	W
G A B - D E - G -	43	Melford's March	W
G A B - D E - G -	155	Lament for MacSwan of Roaig	I
G A B - D E - G -	137	Lament for Patrick Og MacCrimmon	RL
G A B - D E - G -	259	Lament for MacLeod of MacLeod	RL
G A B - D E - G -	154	Mac Mhic Alister's Dead Lament	W
- A B C D E f - -	84	MacNeil of Barra's March	I
- A B C d E f - -	160	The Blind Piper's Obstinacy	WW

	No.	Title	Src
- **A** B C D E f - -	94	The Rout of the MacPhees	W
- **A** B C D E f - -	317	*Hiharin droo dro*	P
- **A** B C D E F - (A)	102	Donald Gruamach's March	WW
- **A** B C D E F - -	109	Lament for Lochnell	W
- **A** B C D E F (GA)	202	The MacGregors' Salute	WW
- **A** B C D E F - (A)	189	Lament for Lord MacDonald	W
(G)A **B** C D E F - -	178	The Little Spree	W
- **A** B c D E F - (A)	92	Lord Breadalbane's Welcome to Scotland	W
- **A** B C - **E** F - a	283	Lament for Captain MacDougall	W
- **A** B C - E F - A	147	Little Prince, you are my joy	LW
- **A** B C - E F(g)A	51	The Old Woman's Lullaby	LW
- **A** B C - E F - A	161	Too Long in this Condition	WW
- A B C - E **F** - A	1	March for a Beginner	FL
- A **B** C - E F - A	258	Lament for King George III	RL
- A **B** C - E F - A	288	Lament for the Earl of Antrim	W
- A B C - E **F** - A	88	The Massacre of Glencoe	W
- A B C - E F - A	300	Lament for Red Hector of the Battles	FL
- A **B** C - E F - A	39	Lament for Donald Duaghal MacKay	RL
- A B C - **E** F - **A**	305	The Battle of the Birds	P
- **A** B - D E F - A	296	The Frisky Lover	RL
- A **B** - D E F - A	277	Mr MacNeill Campbell's Favourite	I
- A B - D E F - A	236	Sir Ewin Cameron of Locheil's Salute	LI
- **A** B - D E F - a	200	Lament for Mackintosh	P
- **A** B - D E F - A	223	Lament for MacLean of Lochbuie	FL
- A **B** - D E F - A	23	The Sister's Lament	FL
- A B - D E F - A	26	Lament for Donald of Laggan	P
- A **B** - D E F - A	220	Lament for Donald Ban MacCrimmon	WW
(g) A B - D E F (g)A	21	The Park Pibroch	O
- a B - D **E** F - A	188	The Brothers' Lament: *Hihararao haen*	LW
(g) a **B** - D E F - A	239	Lament for the Children	LI
- - **B** - D E **F** G a	126	*Hihorodotra cheredeche*	FL
(G A)B - **D** E F G A	128	*Hihorodo hiharara*	FL

7-pitch tunes (17%)

	No.	Title	Src
G **A** B C D E f - -	179	*Hinotrao hobaindreho*	W
G A **B** C D E f - -	180	Beinn a Ghriaim	W
G **A** B C D E F - -	101	The MacDonalds are Simple	WW
G A B C D E F - -	287	*Hiharerin dehindo*	W
G A B C D E F - -	83	In Praise of Morag	LW
G **A** B C D E F - -	306	Lament for Sir James MacDonald of the Isles	LI
G A B C D E F - -	270	Duntroon's Warning	W
G A B C D E F - -	34	Duntroon's March	RL
g A B C D E F - (A)	233	Angus MacDonald's Attack on the MacDougalls	W
g **A** B C D E F - (A)	271	Lament for Duncan MacRae of Kintail	P
g **A** B C D E F - (A)	100	Lament for Alasdair Dearg	FL
G **A** B C D E - g -	98	The Half-Finished Pibroch	P
G A **B** C D E - g -	205	Young Neil's Salute	W
G A B C D E - G -	105	Slanfuive	I
G A B C D E - G -	248	The first tune in piping	W
G A **B** C - E F G(A)	10	*Hiharinōdin hiharindro hiharinōdin*	O
g **A** B C - E F G -	269	The Highland Society of London's Salute	RL
g A B C - E F **G** -	38	*Hiharin hioen hodroeo hoen*	FL
G A B C - E F - a	302	The MacRaes' March	W
G A B C - E F - a	52	The Grants' Gathering	WW
G **A** B C - E **F** - A	222	Scarce of Fishing	WW
G A B C - E **F** - A	261	Lament for Lord Lovat	P
G A **B** C - E **F** - A	247	Lament for Colin Roy MacKenzie	WW
G **A** B C - E **F** - A	135	Lament for the Harp Tree	O
G **A** B - D E f g -	42	Lochend's March	W
G **A** B - D E F G -	255	The Pretty Dirk	LI
G a **B** - D E F G -	299	Eòghainn nan Cath	W
g A B - D E F G -	175	Lament for the Departure of King James	RL
G **A** B - D E F - A	201	The Piper's Warning to His Master	RL
G A B - D E F - A	113	A Taunt on MacLeod	FL
G A B - D E F - A	2	The Carles with the Breeks	RL
G A B - D E **F** (G)A	172	Lament for the Sword	RL
G A B - D E - G a	121	Harrow's March	RL
G A B - D **E** - **G** a	228	Lament for Finlay: *Himbam hiedre*	RL

The first phase of effort making the pibroch sources available online dealt with them individually. The resulting lack of connectivity made it difficult, if not impossible, to bring up on screen all the different 'witnesses' of the same tune. These can now be found easily by anyone with an internet connection. Here is how: type **www.altpibroch.com/tunes/ps#**, replacing # with the PS number ('ps2', 'ps22', etc.). This takes you to a gateway for the tune with links to facsimiles of all concordant source material before 1855.

I have been assisted by David Hester in this operation, linking up the existing facsimiles and filling some remaining gaps. This 'phase two' was only possible thanks to the work of William Donaldson, Steve Scaife, Jim McGillivray, Ross Anderson, Roderick Cannon, Robert Wallace, Jack Taylor and the staff at the National Library of Scotland. Making the sources universally accessible has been a collective effort — like the tunes themselves, the handiwork of many individuals.

In 2003, Roderick Cannon published a table of source data at www.piobaireachd.co.uk. This formed the foundation of the online counterpart to this map. Revising his catalogue numbering, I have made eleven mergers and one deletion, reducing 323 items to 311. This brings the mapping of settings closer to Frans Buisman's unpublished concordance. Details can be found in the spreadsheet available at barnabybrown.info/publications. Unidentified fragments consisting of only one or two bars were excluded; these could be catalogued with tuning preludes of similar length — neither can be regarded as 'tunes'. With the variant settings, I aimed for consistency over where to draw the line between sameness and difference on a neutral musical level, allowing for the fact that different renditions of the same tune can end up in the same manuscript.

EDITED ENGLISH TITLE

TITLES are a bewildering aspect of this source material. They migrate to unrelated tunes, many tunes possess multiple names, and several titles are confusingly similar. The only fail-safe means of identifying a tune is by its catalogue number. Numbers are not memorable, however, so I provide an English title, selected with the aim of reducing confusion, lightly edited for consistency. In the case of nameless tunes, I give the first few notes in Campbell notation, whether or not they were notated by Colin Campbell. When the meaning of a Gaelic title is unclear, I give the source spelling.

To see the diversity of ways in which titles are rendered in the sources, in Gaelic and in English, and which titles compete for attachment to the same tune, visit that tune's gateway using the PS number (as described above).

CLOSEST ARCHETYPAL CYCLE

I have limited the categories of structure to nine — a number that our brains can handle comfortably. Every tune has been assigned to one of these nine categories. This does not mean that it follows the category archetype (shown in Table 4), simply that it is closer to that archetype than any other. The creative ways in which settings develop or depart from an archetype vary enormously and this diversity, or musical confidence, is one of the main differences between pibroch before 1841 and pibroch today. Table 4 is not a rule book, waving a didactic finger at composers, telling them what to do; it is a survey of cultural habits established over generations. The archetypes are patterns which were imitated by composers, consciously or unconsciously. A change of mindset is required to avoid further acts of editorial vandalism, amending this source material into line with simplistic thinking. Table 4 is only a 'birds-eye' view; on closer inspection, the cycles are much more varied and inventive. Musically and culturally, this diversity is a sign of health. Over time, pibroch became less adventurous.

TABLE 3. The chronological sequence of transcription by pipers		
SOURCES	**TRANSCRIBER**	**DATE**
J	Joseph MacDonald	c.1760
C_0 C_1 C_2 C_K	Colin Campbell	c.1782 – c.1819
G_1 G_2 G_B	Neil MacLeod of Gesto	1815, 1816, 1828
H	Anon. ('Hannay-MacAuslan' MS)	c.1815
D_1	Donald MacDonald (vol. 1)	1818–20
A	John MacGregor ('MacArthur' MS)	1820
D_R D_2	Donald MacDonald (vol. 2)	1826
Dj	Donald MacDonald junior	1826, copied c.1912
R	Peter Reid	1826
K_B K_1 K_2 K_K	Angus MacKay	c.1835 – c.1841

Since arguing for and naming these categories in 2004 (in 'The Design of It: Patterns in Pibroch' available at barnabybrown.info/publications), I have experimented with different combinations of letters and numbers to represent each pattern. The representations in Table 4 have been road-tested through memory work with students on the BA Scottish Music (Piping) course and with players of the wire-strung harp, the other high-status instrument of Gaelic culture. Through teaching activities, I found that these particular combinations of digits and letters served the memory better than other solutions which were tried and rejected. **1**s and **O**s are used for the more 'geometrical' cycles which have equal and opposite halves; **A**s and **B**s for the more 'lyrical' cycles which do not have any symmetrical pattern.

The orange elements emphasize the pitch B, conveying to the eye a sonic dissonance which

TABLE 4. Nine archetypal cycles					
W	Woven	I I O I O O I O	*or vice versa*	39%	122
WW	Well-woven	IO II OO II OI OO II OO	*or vice versa*	13%	40
LW	Lyrical Well-woven	IO II IO II OI OO II OO	*or vice versa*	3%	8
O	Ornate	IIII OIOO IIII OOII OIOO IIOO IOII OOII	*2nd half* = **WW**	5%	14
I	Interlaced	I O I **B** O I O **A**		6%	20
LI	Lyrical Interlaced	A B A B C A B A		2%	7
FL	Free Lyrical	A B A B C D E F		9%	28
RL	Rounded Lyrical	A_0 A_1 A_0 A_1 B_0 B_1 B_0 A_1	**B** is higher than **A**	12%	36
P	Progressive	Q_1 Q_2 Q_3 Q_4	Q = Quarter	12%	36

occurs most frequently at phrase endings. The pattern of interplay between a more consonant sonority (**1**) and a more dissonant counter-sonority (**O**) is what defines the cycle. This harmonic understanding allows tunes which are formulaic (every **1** identical) to be seen as relatives of tunes which are through-composed (every **1** slightly different). A higher resolution map would indicate which tunes were more formulaic, which tunes less so, reducing detail on another spectrum of creativity.

CONCLUSION

THIS is not the ultimate map of pibroch. I look forward to developing it in response to user feedback, harnessing technology so that one can sort the data for different purposes, and including other features of the landscape. Formulaic tunes are not the only landmarks I would introduce in a higher-resolution map. I would also give some impression of metre, show the number of cycles (as a range), and point out double-length grounds (these stand out from the norm of 16 bars and are more demanding to memorise). There could be four metrical landmarks: the use of triple time (3/4 or 9/8, standing out from the norm of 4/4, 6/8 or 12/8); metre which flexes predictably with the cycle, e.g. **4.4.5.4.5.5.4.5** (Woven) or **4.4.4.4.6.6.6.4** (Rounded Lyrical); metre which flexes irregularly within the cycle; and metre which flexes from cycle to cycle, as in 'The End of the Little Bridge' (PS 169).

In 1995, when the first version of this map

G *A* B - D E - **G** A	37	MacLeod's Controversy	FL
G **A** B - D E - **G** A	207	Lament for John Garve MacLeod of Raasay	RL
G A B - D E - **G** A	168	MacNeil's March	FL
G *(a)* **B** - D E - **G** A	190	The Daughter's Lament	P
g *A* **B** - D E - **G** a	176	Lament for Ronald MacDonald of Morar	FL
- **A** **C** D E F *g* (**A**)	146	Lament for the Castle of Dunyveg	I
- A B C *D* E **F** **G** (a)	35	One of the Cragich: *Hiharin hōdin*	FL
(G)**A** **B** C D E F - A	53	One of the Cragich: *Hindorōdin*	W
- **A** B C D E F - **A**	80	*Hindro hintro*	W
- *A* B C D **E** F - A	125	The Brother's Lament: *Hihorodo hihorodo*	RL
- *A* B C D **E** F - A	152	Salute to Donald	LI
- A B C *d* E **F** - A	272	The Company's Lament	P
- **A** B C D E - **G** A	150	Lament for the Old Sword	RL
- **A** **B** C - E **F** *G* a	25	Castle Menzies / The Frasers' Salute	W
- A **B** *C* - E **F** *G* a	267	*Hiharin hioen hodroen hioen*	FL
- A **B** **C** - E **F** **G** a	136	Lament for Cameron of Dungallon	P
(g) **A** B C - E F *G* A	273	Lament for the Great Supper	P
(**G**) a **B** - D **E** F *G* a	64	Lament for Rory MacLeod	P
(G)**A** B - D **E** F *G* A	293	Lament for the Little Supper	FL
(g) *A* **B** - D E F *G* A	275	MacDonald of Kinlochmoidart's Salute	RL

8-pitch tunes (11%)

G **A** **B** C *d* E *f* **G** -	79	*Hindro hindro hiotrodin himto*	WW
g **A** *B* C D **E** *f* G -	316	Farewell to the Laird of Islay	P
G **A** B C D E *f* G -	313	*Hindorōdin cherede*	P
g **A** B C D E F *g* (A)	156	One of the Cragich: *Hōdin hiotra*	W
G A B C D E F G -	116	*Hiōtrotraho hiobabem*	LI
G A B C **D** E F G -	110	One of the Cragich: *Hioemtra haentra*	W
G A **B** C D E *F* - a	256	The Munros' Salute	W
G A **B** *C* D E F - A	165	The End of Inchberry Bridge	W
G **A** B C D **E** - **G** a	29	*Hiharin himtra hodrodrodro*	FL
g A **B** C D **E** - **G** A	30	*Hiharin himtra hodrodrooche*	FL
g *A* **B** C - **E** F *G* a	143	Lament for Queen Anne	FL
G **A** B - D E *f* **G** A	280	Mrs Smith's Salute	P
G **A** B - D E **F** **G** A	122	*Hinotrao hinotra*	WW
G *A* B - **D** E **F** **G** A	133	One of the Cragich: *Hiotrotro*	W
G *A* B - **D** E **F** **G** A	291	The Battle of Glensheil	RL
G A B - **D** E *f* **G** A	234	The Lament for the Union	P
G **A** **B** - D E *f* **G** A	20	The Ùrlar Tune	O
G **A** B - **D** E *f* **G** A	106	Salute to Drunkenness	W
G **A** B - **D** E *f* **G** A	103	The man with the weak pipe	FL
G A B - D **E** **F** *G* A	191	*Hihorodo hao*	LI
G **A** B - **D** E F *G* A	243	The Earl of Seaforth's Salute	W
G **A** B - **D** E F *G* A	50	A Prelude: *Hioemto hinem*	FL
G **A** B - **D** E F *G* A	254	Struan Robertson's Salute	RL
G **A** B - **D** E F *G* A	198	The MacDougalls' Gathering	O
g A *B* - **D** E *f* **G** A	31	Lament for the Cleric	FL
g a B - **D** E *f* **G** A	197	Lament for the Laird of Arnaboll	FL
g **A** B - **D** E F *G* A	194	Lament for Lady MacDonald	RL
g **A** B - **D** E F *G* A	210	Sir James MacDonald of the Isles' Salute	RL
g *A* B - **D** E F *g* a	127	A Prelude: *Hihorodo hioenoem*	FL
g a *B* - **D** E **F** *G* a	192	A Lament	RL
(g) **A** B *c* **D** E F *G* a	90	*Cherede darievea*	RL
- **A** B *c* D E F *g* A	24	Lament for Finlay: *Hiharin hinotra*	FL
- **A** B C D E F G A	27	The Battle of Auldearn	W
- A **B** C *d* E F *g* A	72	The Sutherlands' Gathering	P
- A **B** C *D* E *f* **G** A	149	*Hōdinbain hodre*	W

9-pitch tunes (2%)

G **A** B C D E F *g* a	54	The Comely Tune	O
G **A** B C D E F G a	145	Oh Johnny, may you return safely	O
G **A** B C D E *F* G a	187	Beloved Scotland	O
G **A** B C D **E** F *G* a	114	Lament for the Viscount of Dundee	LW
G **A** B C D **E** *f* **G** a	3	The Unjust Incarceration	P
G **A** B C D **E** F **G** A	7	Taviltich	O
g *A* B C **D** **E** **F** **G** **A**	48	Lament for Robert Sinclair's Wife	FL

was shared with a few scholars, my object was to make sure that I had everything in view before selecting which tunes to learn. Revising it since March of this year, my motivation was to have a better map as a research tool — something more consistent, comprehensive and reliable. I hope the result will help other players, researchers and teachers to locate material outside their knowledge and to zoom in and out from the woods to the trees, weighing up and selecting material for their current purpose. It is not just for pipers, but for any musician who might be interested in expanding their horizons with something exotic from Scotland's past.

However, I particularly hope it serves pipers who would like to go the extra mile, opening up a musical inheritance which is still largely unexplored and overlooked. Pibroch competitions are thankfully entering a new age of open-mindedness and musical intelligence. Competitors who take the effort to present something more sensitive to the early sources are increasingly being rewarded and, inevitably, those who play safe — for example, by limiting themselves to *The Kilberry Book* of 1948 — will make less impact. This is because judges have been hearing the same thing for over fifty years. Kilberry would surely despair if he knew that his lifetime effort to enrich pipers' knowledge, publishing this source material, was now an impediment and excuse for not rediscovering forgotten treasure. But the major excitement for me, now, is homing in on the craft of a master musician like Am Pìobaire Dall working in a completely notionless environment. This map marks the beginning of that adventure. ●

To zoom in on the detail, visit
www.altpibroch.com/tunes/ps#
replacing # with the PS number
('ps2', 'ps22', etc.)

Barnaby Brown is currently writing a PhD thesis at the University of Cambridge focusing on the Campbell Canntaireachd. His research forms part of a larger project funded by the UK's Arts and Humanities Research Council, 'Bass culture in Scottish musical traditions' (bassculture.info). In June 2014, Delphian released a CD, 'In Praise of Saint Columba: The Sound-world of the Celtic Church', on which Barnaby plays triplepipes with the Choir of Gonville & Caius College.