| Study | Measure | Tonal Sample | Non−tonal Sample | Power | Estimate | Weight |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Ngo et al. (2016) | Melody combined | 8 Vietnamese | 8 English | 15% | 1.71 [ 0.56, 2.86] | 4% |
| Chen et al. (2016) | Musical Ear Test | 42 Mandarin | 42 Dutch | 62% | 0.96 [ 0.51, 1.41] | 9% |
| Choi (2021) | Melodic subset | 30 Cantonese | 30 English | 48% | 0.94 [ 0.41, 1.47] | 8% |
| Alexander et al. (2008) | Melodic discrimination | 14 Mandarin | 14 English | 25% | 0.90 [ 0.13, 1.68] | 6% |
| Hove et al. (2010) | Relative pitch recognition | 10 'Chinese'; 14 Hmong | 14 'Caucasian US students' | 30% | 0.68 [ 0.00, 1.35] | 7% |
| Swaminathan et al (2021) | Melody test | 104 Chinese languages; 3 Vietnamese | 366 English; 42 various non−tonal languages | 100% | 0.54 [ 0.32, 0.75] | 12% |
| Wong et al. (2012) | Out−of−key detection | 408 Cantonese | 154 English/French | 100% | 0.51 [ 0.32, 0.70] | 12% |
| Bradley (2016) | Melodic comparison | 26 Mandarin; 15 Yoruba | 26 English | 50% | 0.49 [−0.01, 1.00] | 9% |
| Chen et al. (2016) | Melody combined | 42 Mandarin | 42 Dutch | 62% | 0.44 [ 0.01, 0.88] | 9% |
| Stevens et al. (2013) | Interval discrimination | 24 Thai | 24 English | 40% | 0.20 [−0.37, 0.76] | 8% |
| Zheng & Samuel (2018) | Melody comparison | 24 Mandarin | 24 English, 24 Korean | 51% | −0.13 [−0.62, 0.36] | 9% |
| Peretz et al. (2011) | Melody combined | 18 Mandarin; 4 Vietnamese; 2 Cantonese | 25 'non−tonal' (likely French/English) | 40% | −0.48 [−1.05, 0.09] | 8% |
| | | | | | 0.50 | |
| Pfordresher & Brown (2009), Study 1 | Interval discrimination | 6 Vietnamese; 4 Mandarin; 2 Cantonese | 12 English | 22% | 1.16 [ 0.30, 2.03] | 4% |
| Bidelman et al. (2013) | F0 difference limens | 18 Cantonese | 18 English | 31% | 1.01 [ 0.31, 1.70] | 5% |
| Bidelman et al. (2011), Study 2 | Chordal detuning discrimination | 5 Mandarin | 5 English | 11% | 0.92 [−0.39, 2.23] | 2% |
| Pfordresher & Brown (2009), Study 2 | Interval discrimination | 11 Mandarin | 10 English; 1 Portuguese | 20% | 0.84 [−0.03, 1.71] | 4% |
| Hutka et al. (2015) | F0 difference limens | 18 Cantonese | 21 English | 33% | 0.80 [ 0.15, 1.45] | 5% |
| Giuliano et al. (2011) | Pitch discrimination | 16 Mandarin | 16 'Non−tonal' | 29% | 0.65 [−0.05, 1.35] | 5% |
| Bent et al. (2006) | Nonspeech pitch discrimination | 13 Mandarin | 13 English | 22% | 0.59 [−0.21, 1.39] | 4% |
| Tong et al. (2018) | Pitch height discrimination task | 15 Cantonese | 15 English | 26% | 0.56 [−0.17, 1.29] | 5% |
| Bidelman et al. (2013) | Melody discrimination | 18 Cantonese | 18 English | 31% | 0.44 [−0.23, 1.12] | 5% |
| Wong et al. (2012), Study 2 | Mistuning detection | 22 Cantonese | 26 English/French | 39% | 0.42 [−0.15, 1.00] | 5% |
| Jasmin et al. (2021) | Pitch Discrimination | 31 Cantonese | 36 English; 26 Spanish | 61% | 0.41 [−0.03, 0.84] | 6% |
| Bidelman et al. (2011) | F0 discrimination | 11 Mandarin | 11 English | 20% | 0.37 [−0.48, 1.21] | 4% |
| Stevens et al. (2013) | Frequency discrimination | 24 Thai | 24 English | 40% | 0.35 [−0.22, 0.92] | 5% |
| Giuliano et al. (2011) | Interval discrimination | 16 Mandarin | 16 'Non−tonal' | 28% | 0.27 [−0.43, 0.98] | 5% |
| Zheng & Samuel (2018) | Pitch precision | 24 Mandarin | 24 English, 24 Korean | 51% | 0.12 [−0.37, 0.62] | 6% |
| Wong et al. (2012), Study 1 | Mistuned detection | 408 Cantonese | 154 English/French | 100% | 0.00 [−0.19, 0.19] | 7% |
| Pfordresher & Brown (2009), Study 2 | Note discrimination | 11 Mandarin | 10 English; 1 Portuguese | 20% | −0.18 [−1.02, 0.66] | 4% |
| Pfordresher & Brown (2009), Study 1 | Note discrimination | 6 Vietnamese; 4 Mandarin; 2 Cantonese | 12 English | 22% | −0.21 [−1.02, 0.59] | 4% |
| Tong et al. (2018) | Pitch interval discrimination task | 15 Cantonese | 15 English | 26% | −0.37 [−1.09, 0.35] | 5% |
| Peretz et al. (2011) | Pitch change detection | 18 Mandarin; 4 Vietnamese; 2 Cantonese | 25 'non−tonal' (likely French/English) | 40% | −0.48 [−1.05, 0.09] | 5% |
| Chang et al. (2016) | Melodic tone discrimination | 17 Mandarin | 19 English | 31% | −1.64 [−2.40, −0.88] | 4% |
| | | | | | 0.26 | |
| Ngo et al. (2016) | Rhythm | 8 Vietnamese | 8 English | 15% | 0.80 [−0.22, 1.82] | 1% |
| Peretz et al. (2011) | Rhythm | 18 Mandarin; 4 Vietnamese; 2 Cantonese | 25 'non−tonal' (likely French/English) | 40% | 0.24 [−0.32, 0.81] | 5% |
| Choi (2021) | Rhythm subset | 30 Cantonese | 30 English | 48% | 0.03 [−0.47, 0.54] | 6% |
| Swaminathan et al (2021) | Rhythm test | 104 Chinese languages; 3 Vietnamese | 366 English; 42 various non−tonal languages | 100% | 0.01 [−0.20, 0.22] | 33% |
| Wong et al. (2012), Study 1 | Off−beat detection (Study1) | 408 Cantonese | 154 English/French | 100% | −0.02 [−0.21, 0.16] | 43% |
| Wong et al. (2012), Study 2 | Off−beat detection (Study2) | 22 Cantonese | 26 English | 39% | −0.20 [−0.77, 0.37] | 5% |
| Jasmin et al. (2021) | Duration Discrimination | 31 Mandarin | 62 English and Spanish | 61% | −0.22 [−0.65, 0.22] | 8% |
| | | | | | −0.01 | |