MALLE'S CONJECTURE FOR FROBENIUS GROUPS

ABSTRACT. We attain upper bounds for the conjecture of Malle for groups of the form $G = C_m \rtimes C_t$ where $1 \neq t|(m-1)$ with m odd and square free, and all subgroups of C_m are normal in G. In certain cases above, we show that under the assumption of the Cohen Lenstra heuristic, Malle's conjecture holds.

1. INTRODUCTION

Let k be a number field and let K/k be a finite extension. If the Galois closure $\tilde{K}$ of K/k has Galois group isomorphic to G, we say (by abuse of notation), $\mathrm{Gal}(K/k) \cong G$. We assume that $1 \neq G \leq S_n$ is a transitive subgroup of a permutation group. We are interested in the asymptotics of the following quantity as $x \to \infty$

$$N_d(k, G; x) = |\{N/k : \mathrm{Gal}(N/k) \cong G, [N : k] = d, \text{and } \mathcal{N}_{k/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{N/k}) \leq x\}| \tag{1.1}$$

where $\mathcal{N}_{k/\mathbb{Q}}$ is the relative norm of $k/\mathbb{Q}$ and all the extensions N/k lie in a fixed algebraic closure of $\mathbb{Q}$.

Gunter Malle made a conjecture [5] on what the asymptotics of (1.1) should be, and in order to state it, we need to introduce notation. Note, when computing $N_d(k, G; x)$, we view G as a subgroup of S_d.

Definition 1.1. Let G be a non-trivial, transitive subgroup of S_d that acts on the set of d elements, $[d] := \{1, 2, \ldots, d\}$. Let $g \in G$, then,

1. The index of g, is $\mathrm{ind}(g) := d-$ the number of orbits of g on $[d]$.
2. $\mathrm{ind}(G) := \min\{\mathrm{ind}(g) : 1 \neq g \in G\}$.
3. $a(G) := 1/\mathrm{ind}(G)$.

Notation 1.2. We say $f(x) \ll g(x)$ when there exist positive constants C, N such that for all $x > N$, $|f(x)| \leq C|G(x)|$. Also, we say that $f(x) = O(g(x))$ if and only if $f(x) \ll g(x)$.

Conjecture 1.3. *(Malle's conjecture)*
For any non-trivial permutation group G acting on $[d]$, and any number field k,

$$x^{a(G)} \ll N_d(k, G; x) \ll x^{a(G)+\epsilon} \tag{1.2}$$

holds for all $\epsilon > 0$ as $x \to \infty$.

For a more precise formulation of this conjecture please refer to [6].

Example 1.1. Let $G = D_\ell$ be the dihedral group of size 2ℓ, with ℓ being an odd prime. If G acts on $[\ell] = \{1, \ldots, \ell\}$ then the rotations r have one orbit, hence $\mathrm{ind}(r) = \ell - 1$. The reflections s fix one point and other orbits have 2 elements, implying there are a total of $1 + (\ell-1)/2$ orbits. Hence $a(G) = 2/(\ell-1)$. If $G = D_\ell$ acts on $[2\ell]$, the action is the same as the action of G on itself, hence $a(G) = 1/\ell$.

Jurgen Klüners attained upper bounds for $N_\ell(k, D_\ell; x)$ and $N_{2\ell}(k, D_\ell; x)$ in [7] where ℓ is an odd prime. Under the assumption of the conjecture of Cohen and Lenstra [9], he was able to show that his upper bounds are exactly the asymptotic predicted by Malle. Here we generalize his result to a larger set of groups. The set of groups we look at is described below.

Definition 1.4. Let $\mathcal{F}$ be a set of Frobenius groups of the form $C_m \rtimes C_t$ such that

1. m is odd and square free,
2. Every subgroup of C_m is normal in $C_m \rtimes C_t$,
3. $t|(m-1)$.

Example 1.2. The set contains dihedral groups of the form D_ℓ where ℓ is an odd prime. It contains groups of the form $C_\ell \rtimes C_{\ell-1}$, and more generally, any group of the form $C_\ell \rtimes C_t$ where t is any divisor of $\ell - 1$. This set also contains groups where m is not prime, for instance $C_{77} \rtimes C_4$ and $C_{133} \rtimes C_6$.

Notation 1.5. Let M/k be a Galois extension with Galois group C_t. Let $\mathrm{Cl}_M[m]$ the m torsion elements of the ideal class group of M. We let $\mathfrak{H}$ be the smallest constant such that $|\mathrm{Cl}_M[m]| \leq d_{M/\mathbb{Q}}^{\mathfrak{H}}$.

We attain upper bounds for $N_m(k, G; x)$ and $N_{mt}(k, G; x)$ where k is any finite extension of $\mathbb{Q}$ and $G \in \mathcal{F}$. In particular we show the following:

Theorem 1.6. *Let k be a number field, and $G = C_m \rtimes C_t$ be a group in $\mathcal{F}$. Let Q be the smallest prime divisor of t and let p be the smallest prime divisor of m. Then we have*

$$N_m(k, C_m \rtimes C_t; x) \ll (\log(x))^{Q-2} x^J \tag{1.3}$$

2. Preliminaries

One of the conjectures in the direction of Malle's conjecture that seems to hold based on limited computational evidence is that

$$N_d(k;x) = O(x).$$

The upper bounds in this conjecture are independent of the Galois group. The best upper bound we have in this direction is due to Ellenberg and Venkatesh [1], where they show for $d > 3$ and a positive constant C,

$$N_d(k;x) \ll x^{\exp(C\sqrt{\log d})}.$$

For the groups we study in $\mathcal{F}$, upper bounds for $N_\ell(k, D_\ell; x)$, with ℓ an odd prime, were first attained by Klüners. These were improved upon by Cohen and Thorne (Theorem 1.1, [2]) in the case that $k = \mathbb{Q}$. Cohen and Thorne improved the result of Klüners by attaining non trivial bounds for averages of ℓ torsion of the class group for quadratic extensions. The result of (1.6) does not improve the upper bounds in these cases, it only matches them. Here we use the non trivial upper bound on the size of certain class groups to match the result of Cohen and Thorne. In particular, Pierce, Turnage-Butterbaugh and Wood have recently shown that for almost all Galois extensions $M/\mathbb{Q}$ with Galois group C_p, where p is a prime, for any $n \in \mathbb{N}$, any $\epsilon > 0$,

$$|\mathrm{Cl}_M[n]| \ll_{p,n,\epsilon} d_{M/\mathbb{Q}}^{\frac{1}{2} - \frac{1}{2n(p-1)} + \epsilon}.$$

The case of $C_5 \rtimes C_4$ has been looked at in a paper by Bhargava, Cojocaru and Thorne, [3] and they show that

$$N_5(k, C_5 \rtimes C_4(5); x) \ll x^{39/40+\epsilon}.$$

This is a better bound then the one established here.

Conditionally, for F_ℓ, Klüners assumed a weak form of the Cohen-Lenstra heuristic, to show that the upper bounds are those predicted by Malle's conjecture. We use a slightly stronger implication of the Cohen-Lenstra heuristic here to show the result in (1.9), namely we assume:

Conjecture 2.1. *(ℓ−torsian conjecture) Let $K/\mathbb{Q}$ be a number field of degree n. Then for every $m \in \mathbb{N}$*

$$|Cl_K[m]| \ll_{n,m,\epsilon} d_{K/\mathbb{Q}}^{\epsilon} \tag{2.1}$$

for every $\epsilon > 0$.

2.1. **Frobenius group.** A Frobenius group $G \leq S_n$ is a transitive permutation group on a finite set, such that no non-trivial element fixes more than one point and some non-trivial element fixes a point. Frobenius groups have form $G = F \rtimes H$ where F is a normal subgroup of G and is known as the *Frobenius Kernel*, H is the *Frobenius complement.*

We now compute $a(G)$ when $G = C_m \rtimes C_t$ acts on the set of m elements. The elements T_j that have order $j \neq 1$ such that $j|t$ fix one point, and all other orbits have j elements in them. Hence

$$\mathrm{ind}(T_j) = m - \left(1 + \frac{m-1}{j}\right).$$

If an element $M_{j'}$ has order $j' \neq 1$ where $j'|m$, then when it acts on the set of m elements, it does not fix any point and hence has orbits of length j', and

$$\mathrm{ind}(M_{j'}) = m - \frac{m}{j'}.$$

Hence, if Q is the smallest prime divisor of t and p is the smallest prime divisor of m,

$$a(C_m \rtimes C_t) = \frac{1}{m - \max\left(\frac{m}{p}, 1 + \frac{m-1}{Q}\right)}. \tag{2.2}$$

Similarly, when G acts on $[tm]$,

$$a(C_m \rtimes C_t) = \frac{1}{tm} \max\left(\frac{Q}{Q-1}, \frac{p}{p-1}\right). \tag{2.3}$$

One of the main tools in attaining upper bounds to $N_m(k, G; x)$ is making use of a Brauer relation. By a result of Klüners and Fieker [8], Theorem 4:

Theorem 2.2. *Fix an algebraic number field k. Let G be a Frobenius group with $G = F \rtimes H$. Let N/k be a normal extension with $Gal(N/k) = G$. Let K be the fixed field of H and M be the fixed field of F. Then*

$$d_{K/k} = d_{M/k}^{(|F|-1)/|H|} N_{M/k}(d_{N/M})^{1/|H|}. \tag{2.4}$$

conjugates of $\mathfrak{B}$ divide c_{J_{i+1}/J_i}. In particular this implies that, when $\mathfrak{p}$ is unramified, $\mathfrak{p}^{[J_i:k]} | \mathcal{N}_{J_i/k}(c_{J_{i+1}/J_i})$. Since the only rational primes that are wildly ramified in M divide mt, they divide at most finitely many $\mathcal{N}_{M/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{N/M})$. This implies that for all but finitely many primes $\mathfrak{p}$, we have

$$\nu_{\mathfrak{p}}(\mathcal{N}_{M/k}(d_{N/M})) \geq \frac{m}{p_1 \cdots p_{i+1}}(p_{i+1}-1)[J_i:k] = \frac{m(p_{i+1}-1)t}{p_{i+1}}.$$

Note we have the $\geq$ sign since it is possible that $\mathfrak{p}$ divides more than one term of the form

$$\mathcal{N}_{J_i/k}\left(\left(c_{J_{i+1}/J_i}^{p_{i+1}-1}\right)^{m/(p_1 \ldots p_{i+1})}\right).$$

Since $\mathcal{N}_{M/k}(d_{N/M})$ is at least a $mt(1-p_1^{-1})$-th power in k, $\mathcal{N}_{M/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{N/M}) = \mathcal{N}_{k/\mathbb{Q}}(\mathcal{N}_{M/k}(d_{N/M}))$ is also at least a $mt(1-p_1^{-1})$-th power in $\mathbb{Q}$.

□

We now make more precise the definition of $\mathfrak{H}$ that was defined in Notation(1.5).

$$\mathfrak{H} := \sup_{d_{M/\mathbb{Q}}} \log_{d_{M/\mathbb{Q}}}(|\operatorname{Cl}_M[m]|) \tag{3.5}$$

Lemma 3.4. *With the field extensions $N/M/k$ (and when $k \neq \mathbb{Q}$, $N/M/k/\mathbb{Q}$) as defined earlier, the number of abelian extensions N/M in this extension tower with a fixed discriminant $d_{N/M}$ is bounded above by*

$$O_{k,t,C}\left(C^{\omega(\mathcal{N}_{M/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{N/M}))}\mathcal{N}_{k/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{M/k})^{\mathfrak{H}}\right).$$

Here $\omega(j)$ is the number of prime divisors of j in $\mathbb{N}$, C is some positive constant.

Proof. Every abelian extension N/M with discriminant supported on a modulus $\mathfrak{m}$ is a subfield of the ray class field of $\mathfrak{m}$. The number of ray class fields is bounded above by the size of the ray class group of modulus $\mathfrak{m}$. By the exact sequence for ray class groups, we have that the size of the ray class group in question is bounded above by

$$(\mathcal{O}_M/\mathfrak{m})^{\times} \times |\operatorname{Cl}_M|.$$

Since N/M is a degree m extension, the possible extensions N/M correspond to subfields of the m torsion of the ray class group of $\mathfrak{m}$, hence the number of such fields is bounded above by the size of

$$(\mathcal{O}_M/\mathfrak{m})^{\times} \times |\operatorname{Cl}_M[m]|.$$

And hence by equation(3.5)

$$\begin{aligned} |\operatorname{Cl}_M[m]| &\ll d_{M/\mathbb{Q}}^{\mathfrak{H}} \\ |\operatorname{Cl}_M[m]| &\ll (d_{k/\mathbb{Q}}^{t}\mathcal{N}_{k/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{M/k}))^{\mathfrak{H}} \\ |\operatorname{Cl}_M[m]| &\ll_{k,t} \mathcal{N}_{M/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{N/M})^{\mathfrak{H}} \end{aligned}$$

Let M be a dimension C extension over $\mathbb{Q}$, then $(\mathcal{O}_M/\mathfrak{m})^{\times} \ll C^{\omega_M(\mathfrak{m})}$. Here $\omega_M(\mathfrak{m})$ represents the number of prime divisors of $\mathfrak{m}$ in $\mathcal{O}_M$ and clearly $\omega_M(\mathfrak{m}) = \omega_M(d_{N/M})$. We know that $\omega_M(\mathfrak{m})$ is bounded above by $[M:\mathbb{Q}]\omega(\mathcal{N}_{M/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{N/M}))$ where ω now counts the number of prime divisors in $\mathbb{Z}$. This holds because each rational prime splits into at most $[M:\mathbb{Q}]$ primes in $\mathcal{O}_M$. Hence we have

$$C^{\omega_M(\mathfrak{m})} \ll C^{[M:\mathbb{Q}]\omega(\mathcal{N}_{M/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{N/M}))} \ll_{C,t,k} C_1^{\mathcal{N}_{M/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{N/M})}$$

for some other positive constant $C_1 = C^{[M:\mathbb{Q}]}$

□

Let w_A be the number of extensions M/k that are Galois with $\operatorname{Gal}(M/k) \cong C_t$, and with $\mathcal{N}_{k/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{M/k}) = A$. Let $w_B = 1$ if it is possible for $\mathcal{N}_{M/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{N/M})$ to be B, else let $w_B = 0$. We want to study how $\mathcal{N}_{k/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{K/k})$ grows and by equation(3.2) and the fact that norms are totally multiplicative, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{N}_{k/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{K/k}) &= \mathcal{N}_{k/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{M/k})^{(m-1)/t}\mathcal{N}_{M/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{N/M})^{1/t} \\ &= A^{(m-1)/t}B^{1/t} \\ \mathcal{N}_{k/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{N/k}) &= \mathcal{N}_{k/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{M/k})^{m}\mathcal{N}_{M/\mathbb{Q}}(d_{N/M}) \\ &= A^m B. \end{aligned} \tag{3.6}$$

Now using the above results, we have

$$\begin{aligned} N_m(k, C_m \rtimes C_t; x) &\ll_{C,k,t,\mathfrak{H}} \sum_{A^{(m-1)/t}B^{1/t} \leq x} w_A w_B A^{\mathfrak{H}} C^{\omega(B)} \\ N_{mt}(k, C_m \rtimes C_t; x) &\ll_{C,k,t,\mathfrak{H}} \sum_{A^m B \leq x} w_A w_B A^{\mathfrak{H}} C^{\omega(B)} \end{aligned} \tag{3.7}$$

3.1. **Results on $\mathfrak{H}$.** Unconditionally, we always have that $\mathfrak{H} = 1/2 + \epsilon$, though in some cases, we can do better. In the case that t is a prime number, ie, $t = Q$, we have non-trivial bounds on the $\mathfrak{H}$. This section addresses the precise statements and consequences of these bounds. First we need to establish terminology.

Definition 3.6. ($\delta-$exceptional field)
A field $K \in Z_n(\mathbb{Q}, G)$ is called a $\delta-$exceptional field for $0 < \delta < 1/2$ precisely when the Dedekind zeta function of the Galois closure $\overline{K}$ of K over $\mathbb{Q}$ has the property that $\zeta_{\overline{K}}(s)/\zeta(s)$ has a zero in the region

$$[1-\delta] \times [-(\log d_{\overline{K}/\mathbb{Q}})^{2/\delta}, (\log d_{\overline{K}/\mathbb{Q}})^{2/\delta}].$$

Under GRH, no field is δ exceptional, however, we do not assume GRH. Recently, M. Wood, C. Turnage-Butterbaugh and L. Pierce showed non-trivial bounds for $|\mathrm{Cl}_K[\ell]|$ for field extensions with cyclic Galois groups of prime degree (and many other families of fields), under certain conditions of the zero free regions of the concerning Dedekind zeta function. To be precise, they show that

Theorem 3.7. *(Theorem 1.19) Fix a group C_p where p is prime and fix $0 < \epsilon_0 < 1/(4(p-1))$. Define*

$$\delta = \frac{\epsilon_0}{5p + 2/(p-1) + 4\epsilon_0}.$$

Then we have that there are at most $O_{p,\epsilon_0}(x^{\epsilon_0})$ $\delta-$exceptional fields $M/\mathbb{Q}$ with $[M:\mathbb{Q}] = p$, $Gal(M/\mathbb{Q}) = C_p$ and $d_{M/\mathbb{Q}} \leq x$. Aside from the $\delta-$exceptional fields, every field in $N_p(\mathbb{Q}, C_p, x)$ satisfies the following, for every $\ell \in \mathbb{N}$:

$$|\ Cl_M[\ell]| \ll_{p,\ell,\epsilon} d_{M/\mathbb{Q}}^{\frac{1}{2} - \frac{1}{2\ell(p-1)} + \epsilon} \tag{3.13}$$

This implies that $\mathfrak{H} = 1/2 - 1/(2mQ - 2m)$ when $t = Q$ for almost all field extensions $M/\mathbb{Q}$ that are Galois with Galois group C_p. We can make use of this as follows. Let $\Delta_{\epsilon_0}(x)$ be the set of δ-exceptional fields $M/\mathbb{Q}$, with $M/\mathbb{Q}$ being a Galois extension with Galois group C_Q where Q is some prime and $d_{M/\mathbb{Q}} \leq x$. Then, in equation(3.7) we have

$$N_m(\mathbb{Q}, C_M \rtimes C_p; x) \ll \sum_{B^{1/Q} \leq x} w_B C^{\omega(B)} \sum_{A \leq x^{Q/(m-1)} B^{-1/(m-1)}} w_A A^{\mathfrak{H}}$$

$$\ll \sum_{B^{1/Q} \leq x} w_B C^{\omega(B)} \left(\sum_{\substack{A \leq x^{Q/(m-1)} B^{-1/(m-1)} \\ M \notin \Delta(x^{Q/(m-1)} B^{-1/(m-1)})}} w_A A^{\mathfrak{H}} + \sum_{\substack{A \leq x^{Q/(m-1)} B^{-1/(m-1)} \\ M \in \Delta(x^{Q/(m-1)} B^{-1/(m-1)})}} w_A A^{\mathfrak{H}} \right).$$

In the second inner sum above, we have $\mathfrak{H} = 1/2 + \epsilon$ and $\sum_{A \leq x} w_A = O(x^{\epsilon_0})$ and hence will contribute

$$(1 + o(1)) \frac{x^{\frac{t}{2m-2} + \frac{Q\epsilon_0}{(m-1)(Q-1)}}}{B^{\frac{1}{2m-2} + \frac{Q\epsilon_0}{(m-1)(Q-1)}}} (\log(x))^{Q-2}$$

and this will not contribute to the mail term because we can take ϵ_0 to be quite small. Going through the rest of the preocedure similarly as above, we get results like those in the cases $t = Q$ in Corollary(1.8).

4. Acknowledgements

The author would like to thank F. Thorne for ...

References

[1] J. Ellenberg, A. Venkatesh, *The number of extensions of a number field with fixed degree and bounded discriminant*, Annals of Mathematics 163 (2006), 723-741
[2] H. Cohen, F. Thorne *On D^{ℓ}-extensions of odd prime degree ℓ*,
[3] M. Bhargava, A. Cojucaru, F. Thorne, *The number of non S_5 quintic extensions of bounded discriminant*, To be completed
[4] D. Wright, *Distribution of discriminants of Abelian extensions*, Proc. London Math. Soc., 58:17-50, 1989.
[5] G. Malle, *On the distribution of Galois groups*, J. Number Theory, 92:315-219, 2002.
[6] G. Malle, *On the distribution of Galois groups II.* , Experiment. Math., 13:129-135, 2004.
[7] J. Klüners, *Asymptotics of number fields and the Cohen-Lenstra heuristics*, Journal de thorie des nombres de Bordeaux, 18 no. 3 (2006), p. 607-615
[8] C. Fieker,and J. Klüners, *Minimal discriminants for fields with small Frobenius groups as Galois groups*, Journal of Number Theory, April 2003
[9] H. Cohen and H. W. Lenstra, Jr., *Heuristics on class groups of number fields*, Number theory, Noord- wijkerhout 1983 (Noordwijkerhout, 1983), volume 1068 of Lecture Notes in Math., pages 33?62. Springer, Berlin, 1984.