-------- Forwarded Message --------

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Tiêu đề:** | IJCS-17-0536 - Decision |
| **Ngày:** | Thu, 26 Oct 2017 08:35:15 -0400 (EDT) |
| **Từ:** | International Journal of Communication Systems <onbehalfof+msobaidat+gmail.com@manuscriptcentral.com> |
| **Trả lời Tới:** | msobaidat@gmail.com |
| **Tới:** | nguyenvanduc1305@gmail.com, quangvinh1994@gmail.com, hbcho@etri.re.kr, psk@kongju.ac.kr, hoa.nguyentien@hust.edu.vn |

26-Oct-2017

Dear Prof. Nguyen,

I write regarding Manuscript ID IJCS-17-0536 entitled "Joint Fast Time Domain Channel Estimation with ICI Cancellation for LTE-R Systems" which you submitted to International Journal of Communication Systems.

In view of the comments of the referee(s) found at the bottom of this letter, your manuscript has been declined for publication in International Journal of Communication Systems.

If you feel that your paper could benefit from English language polishing, you may wish to consider having your paper professionally edited for English language by a service such as Wiley’s at http://wileyeditingservices.com. Please note that while this service will greatly improve the readability of your paper, it does not guarantee acceptance of your paper by the journal.

Thank you for considering International Journal of Communication Systems for the publication of your research. I hope the outcome of this specific submission will not discourage you from submitting future manuscripts.

Sincerely,

Prof. Mohammad S. Obaidat

Editor-in-Chief, International Journal of Communication Systems

Referee(s)' Comments to Author:

Reviewer: 1

Comments to the Author

Please refer to the attached files.

Reviewer: 2

Comments to the Author

The authors present a time domain channel estimation scheme with ICI Cancellation for LTE-R Systems. My detailed comments are listed below.

1 Where is the more concrete application scenario for LTE-R systems？You had better depict a clear system framework. For example, the train or the other else is regarded as the transmitter, the user inside the train is viewed as a receiver?

2 In my opinion, the scenario of single input single output( SISO) for LTE-R systems is not dominated. MIMO should be predominant. You are supposed to focus on MIMO rather than SISO. Moreover, most of references in the end are not in recent 3 years.

3 What does “fast” mean in your title? How to evaluate?

4 Compared with conventional OFDM, your new frame structure (one OFDM symbol including pilots) seems to have low transmission efficiency? Maybe it is one of the disadvantages of time-domain channel estimation.

5 The citations of the references and formulas in your paper are too similar to distinguish. They are all in parentheses.

6 This paper has some mistakes, for example G =?NG at the bottom on page 4 ? since the PDP ……should be modified “since the PDP does not coincide with ” in the 31th line on page 4, and so forth.

7 The procedure of ICI Cancellation is not included in this paper. This part should not be omitted.

8 The complexity of several approaches in the simulation results should be quantitatively compared.

9 I noticed that the pilot length of P is one in the vector x(i). I think it is unbelievable. It tend to be a certain sequence.

10 Your simulation figures are too few. At least, the figure MSE—Normalized Doppler spread should be added. In addition, how do you generate the figure 3, what is the basis?

Editor's Comments to the Author:

Associate Editor

Comments to the Author:

Dear Mr. Nguyen, Duc,

The review of paper IJCS-17-0536: Joint Fast Time Domain Channel Estimation with ICI Cancellation for LTE-R Systems has been completed. Attached below please find the reviewers' comments.

After careful consideration of the reviewers' comments, the decision of Reject has been made to publish this paper in the IJCS.

Thank you very much for submitting your manuscript to IJCS. We look forward to receiving your new submission in the future.

Sincerely yours,

Dr. Xiaolin Zhou

Reviewer 1: Major Revisions required

Comments to the authors:

This manuscript proposes a new pilot structure to support the channel estimation in time domain for the fast time-varying OFDM channels. I interpret the idea in the manuscript with following steps. (1) Inserting a pilot with guard intervals so to avoid the ISI which appears in time domain. (2) Using this ISI-free pilot to derive the channel coefficients of each channel tap at the pilot position. (3) Deriving the channel coefficients of each channel tap at data position by means of the proposed interpolation. Overall, the manuscript is well written. However, the method itself could be seriously faulty as descripted in followings. I suggest that the authors clarify these technological details if this manuscript is revised.

Please find the attachment for further review information.

Reviewer 2: Reject

Comments to the authors:

The authors present a time domain channel estimation scheme with ICI Cancellation for LTE-R Systems. My detailed comments are listed below.

1 Where is the more concrete application scenario for LTE-R systems？You had better depict a clear system framework. For example, the train or the other else is regarded as the transmitter, the user inside the train is viewed as a receiver?

2 In my opinion, the scenario of single input single output( SISO) for LTE-R systems is not dominated. MIMO should be predominant. You are supposed to focus on MIMO rather than SISO. Moreover, most of references in the end are not in recent 3 years.

3 What does “fast” mean in your title? How to evaluate?

4 Compared with conventional OFDM, your new frame structure (one OFDM symbol including pilots) seems to have low transmission efficiency? Maybe it is one of the disadvantages of time-domain channel estimation.

5 The citations of the references and formulas in your paper are too similar to distinguish. They are all in parentheses.

6 This paper has some mistakes, for example G =?NG at the bottom on page 4 ? since the PDP ……should be modified “since the PDP does not coincide with ” in the 31th line on page 4, and so forth.

7 The procedure of ICI Cancellation is not included in this paper. This part should not be omitted.

8 The complexity of several approaches in the simulation results should be quantitatively compared.

9 I noticed that the pilot length of P is one in the vector x(i). I think it is unbelievable. It tend to be a certain sequence.

10 Your simulation figures are too few. At least, the figure MSE—Normalized Doppler spread should be added. In addition, how do you generate the figure 3, what is the basis?