

Lecture 8: Lagrange Interpolation

Solving via linear system.

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & x_0 & x_0^2 & \cdots & x_0^n \\ 1 & x_1 & x_1^2 & \cdots & x_1^n \\ \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ 1 & x_n & x_n^2 & \cdots & x_n^n \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} a_0 \\ a_1 \\ \vdots \\ a_n \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} f(x_0) \\ f(x_1) \\ \vdots \\ f(x_n) \end{bmatrix}$$

Solving via basis polynomials. Let

$$L_k(x) = \frac{(x-x_0)\cdots(x-x_{k-1})(x-x_{k+1})\cdots(x-x_n)}{(x_k-x_0)\cdots(x_k-x_{k-1})(x_k-x_{k+1})\cdots(x_k-x_n)} \text{ for } k=0,1,\dots,n. \text{ Then } P_n(x) = y_0 L_0(x) + y_1 L_1(x) + \cdots + y_n L_n(x).$$

Error analysis.

$\forall x \in [a, b], \exists \xi \in (\min\{x, x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n\}, \max\{x, x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n\})$ such that

$$f(x) = P_n(x) + \frac{f^{(n+1)}(\xi)}{(n+1)!} (x-x_0)(x-x_1)\cdots(x-x_n)$$

Tutorial 3: Lagrange Interpolation

Example 1. Construct the LIP for $f(x) = \log_2 x$ using $x_0 = 1/2, x_1 = 1, x_2 = 2, x_3 = 4$. Find a bound of the absolute error for any $x \in [1/2, +\infty)$.

Solution. $f(0.5) = -1, f(1) = 0, f(2) = 1, f(4) = 2$. Solve using linear system to get $a_0 = -\frac{52}{21}, a_1 = \frac{7}{2}, a_2 = -\frac{7}{6}, a_3 = \frac{1}{7}$.

So $P(x) = \frac{1}{7}x^3 - \frac{7}{6}x^2 + \frac{7}{2}x - \frac{52}{21}$. To get an u.b for error, first find $f^{(4)}(x) = -\frac{6}{x^4 \ln 2}$. Note monotonicity. Hence

$$|f^{(4)}(x)| \leq \frac{6}{(1/2)^4 \ln 2} = \frac{96}{\ln 2}. \text{ Thus an u.b for absolute error}$$

$$|P(x) - f(x)| \text{ is } \frac{1}{4!} \times \frac{96}{\ln 2} |(x-1/2)(x-1)(x-2)(x-4)| = \frac{4}{\ln 2} |(x-1/2)(x-1)(x-2)(x-4)|. \square.$$

Result from Example 2. If nodes are equidistributed, the maximum value of $g(x) = |(x-x_0)(x-x_1)\cdots(x-x_N)|$ must be attained in (x_0, x_1) and (x_{N-1}, x_N) (due to the symmetry). $|g(x^*)| \leq \frac{1}{4} N! h^{N+1}$.

Error estimation for equidistributed nodes.

$$|P_N(x) - f(x)| \leq \frac{h^{N+1}}{4(N+1)} \max_{\xi \in [a, b]} |f^{(N+1)}(\xi)|, \text{ for all } x \in [a, b]$$

Exercise 2. Let $P_n(x)$ be the LIP for $f(x) = \cos x$ with

$x_k = kh, k = 0, 1, \dots, n$ where $h = \pi/(2n)$. **1.** Find a positive integer N such that $|P_N(x) - f(x)| < 0.005$, for all $x \in [0, \pi/2]$.

Solution. For $f(x) = \cos(x)$, $\max_{\xi \in [0, \pi/2]} |f^{(N+1)}(\xi)| = 1$. Hence it suffices to find $\frac{h^{N+1}}{4(N+1)} < 0.005 \implies N \geq 3$.

Lecture 9: Divided Differences

How to find the Lagrange polynomial.

$$P_n(x) = a_0 + a_1(x-x_0) + a_2(x-x_0)(x-x_1) + \cdots + a_n(x-x_0)(x-x_1)\cdots(x-x_{n-1}) \text{ where } a_k = f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_k]$$

$$\text{and } f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n] = \frac{f[x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n] - f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_{n-1}]}{x_n - x_0}.$$

$$a_0 = f(x_0).$$

Lecture 10: Cubic Spline Interpolation (CSI)

How to find μ_k and λ_k .

$$\mu_k = \frac{x_k - x_{k-1}}{x_{k+1} - x_{k-1}}, \quad \lambda_k = \frac{x_{k+1} - x_k}{x_{k+1} - x_{k-1}}, \quad k = 1, 2, \dots, n-1$$

Natural Boundary Conditions. $M_0 = M_n = 0$.

$$\begin{bmatrix} 2 & \lambda_1 & & & \\ \mu_2 & 2 & \lambda_2 & & \\ & \mu_3 & 2 & \ddots & \\ & & \ddots & \ddots & \lambda_{n-2} \\ & & & \mu_{n-1} & 2 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} M_1 \\ M_2 \\ M_3 \\ \vdots \\ M_{n-2} \\ M_{n-1} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 6f[x_0, x_1, x_2] \\ 6f[x_1, x_2, x_3] \\ 6f[x_2, x_3, x_4] \\ \vdots \\ 6f[x_{n-3}, x_{n-2}, x_{n-1}] \\ 6f[x_{n-2}, x_{n-1}, x_n] \end{bmatrix}$$

Clamped Boundary Conditions.

$$2M_0 + M_1 = 6f[x_0, x_0, x_1], \quad M_{n-1} + 2M_n = 6f[x_{n-1}, x_n, x_n].$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} 2 & \lambda_0 & & & \\ \mu_1 & 2 & \lambda_1 & & \\ & \ddots & \ddots & \ddots & \\ & & \mu_{n-1} & 2 & \lambda_{n-1} \\ & & & \mu_n & 2 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} M_0 \\ M_1 \\ \vdots \\ M_{n-1} \\ M_n \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 6f[x_0, x_0, x_1] \\ 6f[x_0, x_1, x_2] \\ \vdots \\ 6f[x_{n-2}, x_{n-1}, x_n] \\ 6f[x_{n-1}, x_n, x_n] \end{bmatrix}$$

How to find S_k .

$$S_k(x) = M_{k-1} \frac{(x-x_k)^3}{6(x_{k-1}-x_k)} + M_k \frac{(x-x_{k-1})^3}{6(x_k-x_{k-1})} + A_k x + B_k.$$

$$A_k = \frac{f(x_k) - f(x_{k-1})}{x_k - x_{k-1}} - \frac{1}{6} (M_k - M_{k-1}) (x_k - x_{k-1}).$$

$$B_k = \frac{x_k f(x_{k-1}) - x_{k-1} f(x_k)}{x_k - x_{k-1}} + \frac{1}{6} (M_k x_{k-1} - M_{k-1} x_k) (x_k - x_{k-1}).$$

Piecewise Linear Interpolation (PLI). If

$$S(x) = S_k(x), \quad \text{for } x \in [x_{k-1}, x_k], k = 1, 2, \dots, n \text{ then}$$

$$S_k(x) = f(x_{k-1}) \frac{x-x_k}{x_{k-1}-x_k} + f(x_k) \frac{x-x_{k-1}}{x_k-x_{k-1}}$$

Error analysis for PLI on equidistributed nodes. If

$$x_k = x_0 + kh, \text{ then for } x \in [x_0, x_n],$$

$$|f(x) - S(x)| \leq \frac{1}{8} h^2 \max_{\xi \in [x_0, x_n]} |f''(\xi)|$$

Tutorial 4: Divided Diff and CSI

Example 2: Quadratic spline interpolation. Given $n+1$ nodes $x_0 < x_1 < \cdots < x_{n-1} < x_n$ and a continuous function $f(x)$, find a function $S(x)$ such that **1.** $S(x)$ is first-order differentiable on (x_0, x_n) **2.** $S(x)$ is a quadratic polynomial on (x_{k-1}, x_k) for any $k = 2, 3, \dots, n$; **3.** $S(x)$ is a linear function on (x_0, x_1) . **4.** $S(x_k) = f(x_k)$ for all $k = 0, 1, \dots, n$.

$$\text{Solution. } S_1(x) = f(x_0) \frac{x-x_1}{x_0-x_1} + f(x_1) \frac{x-x_0}{x_1-x_0}.$$

$$S_k(x) = \frac{1}{2} M_k \frac{(x-x_{k-1})^2}{x_k-x_{k-1}} + \frac{1}{2} M_{k-1} \frac{(x-x_k)^2}{x_{k-1}-x_k} + C_k, \quad k = 2, 3, \dots, n.$$

$$C_k = f(x_k) - \frac{1}{2} M_k (x_k - x_{k-1}). \quad M_k = 2f[x_{k-1}, x_k] - M_{k-1}.$$

Since $M_1 = S'_1(x_1) = f[x_0, x_1]$, M_k for $k = 2, 3, \dots, n$ can be obtained iteratively.

Lecture 11: Least Squares Approximation

Proof of optimality. Suppose \mathbf{a} satisfies $X^T X \mathbf{a} = X^T \mathbf{y}$. Then for any vector \mathbf{b} with the same length as \mathbf{a} , we have $(X\mathbf{b} - \mathbf{y})^T (X\mathbf{b} - \mathbf{y}) \geq (X\mathbf{a} - \mathbf{y})^T (X\mathbf{a} - \mathbf{y})$. **Proof.**

$$\begin{aligned} & (X\mathbf{b} - \mathbf{y})^T (X\mathbf{b} - \mathbf{y}) - (X\mathbf{a} - \mathbf{y})^T (X\mathbf{a} - \mathbf{y}) \\ &= \mathbf{b}^T X^T X \mathbf{b} - 2\mathbf{b}^T X^T \mathbf{y} + \mathbf{a}^T X^T X \mathbf{a} + 2\mathbf{a}^T X^T \mathbf{y} \\ &= \mathbf{b}^T X^T X \mathbf{b} - 2\mathbf{b}^T X^T X \mathbf{a} + \mathbf{a}^T X^T X \mathbf{a} + 2\mathbf{a}^T X^T X \mathbf{a} \\ &= \mathbf{b}^T X^T X \mathbf{b} - 2\mathbf{b}^T X^T X \mathbf{a} + \mathbf{a}^T X^T X \mathbf{a} = (\mathbf{b} - \mathbf{a})^T X^T X (\mathbf{b} - \mathbf{a}) \geq 0 \end{aligned}$$

Finding the coefficients. Let

$$X = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & x_0 & x_0^2 & \cdots & x_0^n \\ 1 & x_1 & x_1^2 & \cdots & x_1^n \\ \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ 1 & x_m & x_m^2 & \cdots & x_m^n \end{pmatrix} \text{ and}$$

$$\mathbf{a} = (a_0, a_1, \dots, a_n)^T, \quad \mathbf{y} = (y_0, y_1, \dots, y_m)^T. \text{ Solve } X^T X \mathbf{a} = X^T \mathbf{y}.$$

Lecture Exercise 1. Show that the least squares approximation is unique if and only if the matrix X has full column rank, i.e., the rank of X equals its number of columns. **Proof.** Note $\text{rank}(X^T X) = \text{rank}(X)$. (\implies) If the LSA is unique, the columns are linearly independent since we can write $X\mathbf{a}$ as a unique linear combination of the columns of X . Hence the rank of the matrix is equal to the number of columns. (\impliedby) If $X\mathbf{a} = \mathbf{b}$ and $X\mathbf{a}' = \mathbf{b}$ then $X(\mathbf{a} - \mathbf{a}') = \mathbf{0}$. Since X has full rank, $X\mathbf{c} = \mathbf{0}$ iff $\mathbf{c} = \mathbf{0} \implies \mathbf{a} = \mathbf{a}'$ (only the trivial solution to the homogeneous equation of linear combination of its columns exists).

Weighted LSA. $W = \text{diag}\{w_0, w_1, \dots, w_n\}$. Solve $X^T W X \mathbf{a} = X^T W \mathbf{y}$.

Lecture 12: Newton-Cotes Formulae (NCF)

$$\text{Trapezoidal Rule. } \int_a^b f(x) dx \approx \frac{b-a}{2} [f(a) + f(b)].$$

Error for Trapezoidal Rule.

$$\int_a^b f(x) dx = \frac{b-a}{2} [f(a) + f(b)] - \frac{1}{12} (b-a)^3 f''(\xi)$$

Simpson's Rule. Given $f(a)$, $f\left(\frac{a+b}{2}\right)$ and $f(b)$, $P(x) =$

$$f(a) + \frac{f(b)-f(a)}{b-a} (x-a) + \left[2f\left(\frac{a+b}{2}\right) - f(b) - f(a) \right] \frac{2(x-a)(x-b)}{(b-a)^2}$$

$$\text{whose integral is } \left[\frac{2}{3} f\left(\frac{a+b}{2}\right) + \frac{1}{6} f(b) + \frac{1}{6} f(a) \right] (b-a).$$

Error for Simpson's Rule.

$$\int_a^b f(x) dx = \frac{b-a}{6} \left[f(a) + 4f\left(\frac{a+b}{2}\right) + f(b) \right] - \frac{1}{90} \left(\frac{b-a}{2}\right)^5 f^{(4)}(\xi)$$

Theorem 3 on Page 4. For closed Newton-Cotes formula with $n+1$ nodes, when n is odd and $f(x)$ is $(n+1)$ -th order differentiable, there exists $\xi \in (a, b)$ such that $\int_a^b f(x) dx =$

$$\sum_{k=0}^n w_k f(x_k) + \frac{h^{n+2} f^{(n+2)}(\xi)}{(n+1)!} \int_0^n s(s-1)\cdots(s-n) ds; \text{ when } n$$

is even and $f(x)$ is $(n+2)$ -th order differentiable, there exists

$$\xi \in (a, b) \text{ such that } \int_a^b f(x) dx =$$

$$\sum_{k=0}^n w_k f(x_k) + \frac{h^{n+3} f^{(n+2)}(\xi)}{(n+2)!} \int_0^n s^2(s-1)\cdots(s-n) ds.$$

Gaussian Elimination to find weights.

$$\int_a^b x^j dx = \sum_{k=0}^n w_k x_k^j, \quad j = 0, 1, \dots, n$$
$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & \dots & 1 \\ x_0 & x_1 & \dots & x_n \\ \vdots & \vdots & & \vdots \\ x_0^{n-1} & x_1^{n-1} & \dots & x_n^{n-1} \\ x_0^n & x_1^n & \dots & x_n^n \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} w_0 \\ w_1 \\ \vdots \\ w_{n-1} \\ w_n \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} \int_a^b dx \\ \int_a^b x dx \\ \vdots \\ \int_a^b x^{n-1} dx \\ \int_a^b x^n dx \end{bmatrix}$$

How to find degree of accuracy. If $\int_a^b x^j dx = \sum_{k=0}^n w_k x_k^j$ for $j = 0, \dots, n$ but $\int_a^b x^{n+1} dx \neq \sum_{k=0}^n w_k x_k^{n+1}$ then n is the degree of accuracy.

General form of NCF. $\int_a^b f(x) dx \approx \int_a^b P(x) dx = \sum_{k=0}^n f(x_k) \int_a^b L_k(x) dx = \sum_{k=0}^n w_k f(x_k)$ where $w_k = \int_a^b L_k(x) dx$

Result from Exercise 2.

$$w_k = \frac{b-a}{n} \int_0^n \prod_{j=0, j \neq k}^n \frac{x-j}{k-j} dx, \quad \forall k = 0, \dots, n.$$

Lecture 13: Composite Numerical Integration

Composite Trapezoidal Rule (CTR). Assume $x_k - x_{k-1} = h$ for all $k = 1, 2, \dots, n$. Then $\int_a^b S(x) dx = \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{h}{2} [f(x_{k-1}) + f(x_k)] = h \left[\frac{1}{2} f(x_0) + \sum_{k=1}^{n-1} f(x_k) + \frac{1}{2} f(x_n) \right]$

Error analysis for CTR. Suppose $f(x)$ is second-order continuously differentiable on $[a, b]$, and $h = \frac{b-a}{\infty}$, $x_k = kh$, $k = 0, 1, \dots, n$. There exists $\xi \in (a, b)$ such that $\int_a^b f(x) dx = h \left[\frac{1}{2} f(x_0) + \sum_{k=1}^{n-1} f(x_k) + \frac{1}{2} f(x_n) \right] - \frac{b-a}{12} h^2 f''(\xi)$.

Composite Simpson's Rule (CSR).

$$\int_a^b f(x) dx \approx \sum_{k=1}^{n/2} \frac{h}{3} [f(x_{2k-2}) + 4f(x_{2k-1}) + f(x_{2k})]$$
$$= \frac{h}{3} \left(f(a) + f(b) + 2 \sum_{k=1}^{n/2-1} f(x_{2k}) + 4 \sum_{k=1}^{n/2} f(x_{2k-1}) \right)$$

Error analysis for CSR. Suppose $f(x)$ is fourth-order continuously differentiable on $[a, b]$, and

$$h = \frac{b-a}{n}, \quad x_k = kh, \quad k = 0, 1, \dots, n$$

When n is an even integer, there exists $\xi \in (a, b)$ such that

$$\int_a^b f(x) dx = \frac{h}{3} \left(f(a) + f(b) + 2 \sum_{k=1}^{n/2-1} f(x_{2k}) + 4 \sum_{k=1}^{n/2} f(x_{2k-1}) \right) - \frac{b-a}{180} h^4 f^{(4)}(\xi)$$

Achieve abs err $< \epsilon$. Approximate $\int_0^2 \sqrt{1+x^2} dx$ such that the absolute error is less than 10^{-3} . For composite trapezoidal rule, $b = 2, a = 0$, abs.err $\leq \frac{1}{6} \left(\frac{2}{n}\right)^2 \max_{\xi \in [0,2]} |f''(\xi)| = \frac{1}{6} \left(\frac{2}{n}\right)^2$. Hence $n \geq 26 \implies n = 26$. For composite Simpson's rule, abs.err $\leq \frac{1}{90} \left(\frac{2}{n}\right)^4 \max_{\xi \in [0,2]} |f^{(4)}(\xi)| = \frac{8}{15n^4}$. Hence $n \geq 4.8 \implies n = 6$ because **we need n to be even**.

Tutorial 5: LSA and Integration

Q4. Consider the following numerical integration: $\int_{-1}^1 f(x) dx \approx w_1 f(x_1) + w_2 f(x_2)$. How to choose x_1, x_2 and w_1, w_2 to achieve maximum degree of accuracy? **Solution.** For 4 unknowns, set 4 equations: set $f(x)$ to be $1, x, x^2, x^3$ and assume that the numerical integration is exact. Then we get equations 1. $w_1 + w_2 = \int_{-1}^1 1 dx = 2$, 2. $w_1 x_1 + w_2 x_2 = \int_{-1}^1 x dx = 0$, 3. $w_1 x_1^2 + w_2 x_2^2 = \int_{-1}^1 x^2 dx = \frac{2}{3}$, 4. $w_1 x_1^3 + w_2 x_2^3 = \int_{-1}^1 x^3 dx = 0$. Solve to get $w_1 = w_2 = 1, x_1 = -x_2 = \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}}$. Degree of accuracy is found to be 3.

Miscellaneous

Figuring out the data points used in LSA. If the $p(x)$ is given but the data points are incomplete, form the $X^T X a = X^T y$ system and select rows that look very similar to eliminate as many variables at once as possible.

The Gamma function. $\Gamma(x) = \int_0^{+\infty} t^{x-1} e^{-t} dt$ and $\Gamma(n) = (n-1)!$ for any positive integer n .

Linear Algebra and Calculus.

$\frac{d}{dt} \int_{a(t)}^{b(t)} q(x) dx = q(b(t))b'(t) - q(a(t))a'(t)$. **See if I want to add LSA lemmas...**

Result from T3 Eg. 2. For $f(x) = 1/\sqrt{x}$, $f^{(N+1)}(x) = \left(-\frac{1}{2}\right)^{N+1} (2N+1)!! x^{-N-3/2}$.

Error proofs from lectures/tutorials. **See if I want to add the lecture error proofs**

Tut 4 Eg. 1. Suppose $f(x)$ is n th order differentiable and x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n are $n+1$ distinct real numbers. Show that there exists ξ between $\min\{x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n\}$ and $\max\{x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n\}$ such that $f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n] = \frac{f^{(n)}(\xi)}{n!}$. **Solution.** Since the divided difference is independent of the order of its parameters, we can assume that $x_0 < x_1 < \dots < x_n$. Let $P_n(x)$ be the Lagrange interpolating polynomial of $f(x)$ with nodes x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n . Then $P_n(x) = f[x_0] + f[x_0, x_1](x-x_0) + f[x_0, x_1, x_2](x-x_0)(x-x_1) + \dots + f[x_0, x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n](x-x_0)(x-x_1)\dots(x-x_{n-1})$.

The n th derivative of $P_n(x)$ is $P_n^{(n)}(x) = n! f[x_0, x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n]$. Now we define $g(x) = f(x) - P_n(x)$. By the definition of interpolation, we know that $g(x_0) = g(x_1) = \dots = g(x_n) = 0$. By Rolle's theorem, there exists $\xi \in (x_0, x_n)$ such that $g^{(n)}(\xi) = 0$. since $g^{(n)}(\xi) = f^{(n)}(\xi) - P_n^{(n)}(\xi) = f^{(n)}(\xi) - n! f[x_0, x_1, \dots, x_n]$ we prove the claim by equating the above equation to zero.

Tut 5 Eg. 1. Show that when f is second-order differentiable on $[a, b]$, there exists $\xi \in (a, b)$ such that

$\int_a^b f(x) dx - (b-a)f\left(\frac{a+b}{2}\right) = \frac{(b-a)^3}{24} f''(\xi)$. **Solution.** Let $\zeta = (a+b)/2$ and define

$$g(t) = \int_{\zeta-t}^{\zeta+t} f(x) dx - 2tf(\zeta), \quad h(t) = g(t) - \left(\frac{2t}{b-a}\right)^3 g\left(\frac{b-a}{2}\right).$$

It is obvious that $h(0) = h\left(\frac{b-a}{2}\right) = 0$. By Rolle's theorem, we can find $t_0 > 0$ such that $h'(t_0) = 0$, i.e.,

$$g'(t_0) = 3t_0^2 \left(\frac{2}{b-a}\right)^3 g\left(\frac{b-a}{2}\right).$$

$$g'(t_0) = f(\zeta+t_0) + f(\zeta-t_0) - 2f(\zeta) = 2t_0^2 f[\zeta-t_0, \zeta, \zeta+t_0].$$

Therefore we can find $\xi \in (\zeta-t_0, \zeta+t_0) \subset (a, b)$ such that $f[\zeta-t_0, \zeta, \zeta+t_0] = \frac{1}{2} f''(\xi)$. Do some substitutions.

Finding the set of x and y values for the lowest error LIP.

First find the lowest-error polynomial (LEP), which is $p(x) = a_0 + a_1 x + a_2 x^2 + \dots + a_m x^m$. From Homework Q3,

$$M = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{b-a}{2} & \frac{b^2-a^2}{2} & \dots & \frac{b^{m+1}-a^{m+1}}{m+1} \\ \frac{b^2-a^2}{2} & \frac{b^3-a^3}{3} & \dots & \frac{b^{m+2}-a^{m+2}}{m+2} \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ \frac{b^{m+1}-a^{m+1}}{m+1} & \frac{b^{m+2}-a^{m+2}}{m+2} & \dots & \frac{b^{2m+1}-a^{2m+1}}{2m+1} \end{pmatrix} \text{ and}$$

$b = \left(\int_a^b x^0 f(x) dx, \dots, \int_a^b x^m f(x) dx \right)^T$. Solve $Ma = b$ to get the coefficients of the LEP. Then reverse-engineer the Gaussian Elimination process for finding a when constructing the LIP to get x and y (possibly non-unique).