Book Scanning

Problem Specification

Problem Statement: Google has a book scanning program for libraries. Given a list of libraries, their sign up times and their books, choose the order in which they will sign up for the program, as well as the order in which their books will be scanned after sign up. Only one library may sign up at a time but the scanning process can occur in parallel for several libraries.

Objective Function: Each book is described by a score and we aim to maximize the sum of the scores of scanned books, in the alloted time, with no repeated books.

Problem Formulation

Solution representation: Array where the index is the order of sign up and the value is the library ID

Constraints:

- Only books scanned before the deadline are accounted
- Each book should only be scanned once
- Each library can only start its sign up process after all the libraries before it have finished their sign up process
- Each library can only start scanning books after finishing its sign up process

Evaluation function: Sum of all the scores of the scanned books within the allotted time (if the same book is scanned twice, the score is only awarded once)

Problem Formulation

Hill Climbing / Simulated Annealing

Initial solution:

- Random
- Greedy, ordered by libraries with highest total score first
- Greedy, ordered by libraries with smallest sign up time first

Neighborhood: Switch the order of two consecutive libraries in the solution array

Genetic Algorithm

Initial solution:

Random

Mutation: Randomly switch the order of two libraries in the solution array

Crossover: Applies the order-based crossover, that given two parent solutions, it will generate a new solution

Project Structure

- Programming language: Python 3;
- Development environment: Visual Studio Code;
- Data structures:
 - Lists;
 - Library class;
 - Solver class.

• File structure:

- input: Folder that contains the input data files;
- output: Folder that contains the output data files;
- main.py: File that contains the developed code.

Approach

Evaluation Function (Score)

For this optimization problem, we started by adopting a heuristic that obtained the real score, as described by Google. However, this approach consumed too much time. So we decided to try other approaches for the heuristic, only using this function to check the real score of the final solution.

Heuristics

We implemented three different heuristics, to check the fitness of a solution:

- Real score: obtained by going through the libraries in order of sign up, going through each book in the library and summing their score
- Real score (duplicates): obtained by calculating the sum of the N best books in each library at the beginning (saved in an array of size N) and only going through each library and getting the score directly from the array (duplicates are counted twice). Very close to the real score
- Simple Heuristic: heuristic based on a solution from a team that participated in Google Hash Code. Score
 obtained using this heuristic is not close to the real score, only a representation of the fitness of the solution

Algorithms

Hill climbing algorithm is a local search algorithm which continuously moves in the direction of increasing elevation/value to find the peak of the mountain or best solution to the problem. This way, it finishes when it reaches a peak value where no neighbour has a higher value than the current best solution.

First Accept Hill Climbing

First accept hill climbing is the simplest way to implement a hill climbing algorithm. Basically, it examines the neighbouring nodes one by one and selects the first neighbouring node that has a better score, setting it as the current state. Furthermore, this algorithm consumes less time, but, on the other hand, the optimal solution is not guaranteed.

Steepest Hill Climbing

The steepest hill climbing is a variation of first accept hill climbing. This algorithm examines all the neighbouring nodes of the current state and selects the neighbour node that has the higher score. This way, consumes more time as it searches for multiple neighbours.

Algorithms

Simulated Annealing

Knowing that the Hill Climbing algorithm tends to get stuck in local maximas, the Simulated Annealing algorithm aims to overcome this problem, accepting bad solutions with a given probability.

It starts by establishing an initial temperature and solution, based on the chosen initial approach.

At each iteration, a list of solutions neighbouring the current solution is generated, given by the neighbourhood operator, and a solution is chosen randomly from the list. If the given solution is better than the current solution, it becomes the current solution, otherwise, it can be with a given probability. Also, if the current solution is better than the best solution, that must be updated. At the end of each iteration the temperature must be decreased at a random rate (between 0.9 and 0.99). The cycle ends when the temperature reaches 0.

Genetic Algorithm

The algorithm starts by generating an initial population with solutions organized by the IDs of the libraries randomly. Based on the mechanics of biological evolution, each generation creates a new population applying the order-based crossover operator, that given two parents selected using the tournament selection method, they will generate a new solution and, with a probability of 0.05%, the mutation operator can be applied to the new solution. It was also applied an elitist approach, that with each new generation, the solution with the best fitness of the current population with size N is maintained, being necessary to generate N-1 new solutions.

Results Analysis

All input files were tested, with the exception of a_example.txt, due to its simplicity, and d_tough_choices.txt due to the excessive processing time.

All algorithms were tested with three different initial approaches, with the exception of the genetic algorithm, which is always imposed a random initial approach.

This way, we noticed that, for the **random solution**, real score (duplicates) - our first heuristic -, generally, gets better results in terms of final score (especially for the hill climbing algorithm), but consumes more time, with file *c_incunabula.txt* being the exception in terms of time and file *e_so_many_books.txt* in terms of score for the simulated annealing algorithm.

Secondly, for the **greedy score** initial approach, we had a better maximum score in files *b_read_on.txt* and *e_so_many_books.txt* for real score (duplicates). The other two registered similar scores. Once again, file *c_incunabula.txt* was the exception in terms of time consumption, being simple heuristic faster generally.

Results Analysis

For our last approach (**greedy sign up**), real score (duplicates) registered better results for the input files e_so_many_books.txt and f_libraries_of_the_world.txt. The other two had similar results. In what concerns to time consumption, file c_incunabula.txt worked faster with real score (duplicates) and the others needed basically the same time to run the algorithm (the only exception was file e_so_many_books.txt for the hill climbing algorithm which was faster with simple heuristic).

Finally, talking about the genetic algorithm, simple heuristic had better maximum scores. On the other hand, real score (duplicates) worked faster, consuming less time.

All tests are contained in the attachment slide, for a more detailed assessment.

Conclusion

For the development of this project, it was necessary to apply all the concepts given in the course of Artificial Intelligence.

We initially adopted a heuristic approach that aims to get the best possible score. However, it had an excessive processing time because it doesn't count the score of duplicated books, which led us to look for other heuristics. To overcome this problem, we implemented a heuristic that didn't take into account duplicated books. Also, we tried a simpler approach, which calculates a score for each library that is not the real one but approximated, which proved to be less effective but much faster than the others.

The project was successfully completed, covering all topics requested.

References

- Problem Statement
- Python 3 Documentation
- Stuart, R., 2010. Artificial Intelligence: A Modern Approach. Prentice Hall
- <u>IART Slides on Optimization and Local</u>
 <u>Search</u>
- <u>IART Slides on Simulated Annealing and Tabu Search</u>
- IART Slides on Optimization and Genetic
 Algorithms
- Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, Master's degree in Modelling for Science and Engineering, Lluís Alsedà on Genetic Operations
- Google Hash Code 2020 Possible Solution

Appendix

heuristic = Real sco	re (duplicates)			heuristic = Simple H	leuristic			
initial solution = ran	dom solution			initial solution = ran	initial solution = random solution			
Algorithm	Maximum Score	Average Score	Time (s)	Algorithm	Maximum Score	Average Score	Time (s	
First Accept Hill Climbing	5764700	5357070.0	29.494	First Accept Hill Climbing	4376400	4193420.0	10.673	
Steepest Hill Climbing	5625800	5469800.0	31.355	Steepest Hill Climbing	4533200	4177900.0	8.976	
Simulated Annealing	4624400	4410000.0	10.553	Simulated Annealing	4396600	4225700.0	9.115	
Genetic Algorithm	4032300	3906980.0	7.987	Genetic Algorithm	4476300	4284650.0	9.951	
initial solution = gre	edy score solu	tion		initial solution = gre	edy score solu	ion		
Algorithm	Maximum Score	Average Score	Time (s)	Algorithm	Maximum Score	Average Score	Time (s)	
First Accept Hill Climbing	5537400	5537400.0	32.19	First Accept Hill Climbing	4126100	4126100.0	9.56	
	5537400	5537400.0	33.26	Steepest Hill Climbing	4126100	4126100.0	8.34	
Steepest Hill Climbing								
Simulated Annealing	4349600	4309010.0	9.484	Simulated Annealing	4126100	4126100.0	8.806	
Genetic Algorithm	4032300	3906980.0	7.987	Genetic Algorithm	4476300	4284650.0	9.951	
initial solution = gre	edy signup sol	ution		initial solution = gre	initial solution = greedy signup solution			
Algorithm	Maximum Score	Average Score	Time (s)	Algorithm	Maximum Score	Average Score	Time (s)	
First Accept Hill Climbing	5822900	5822900.0	23.23	First Accept Hill Climbing	5822900	5822900.0	19.43	
Steepest Hill Climbing	5822900	5822900.0	17.87	Steepest Hill Climbing	5822900	5822900.0	17.98	
		5822900.0						
Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm	5822900 4032300	3906980.0	16.901 7.987	Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm	5822900 4476300	5822900.0 4284650.0	16.615 9.951	
•								
input = c_inc	inabula							
heuristic = Real sco	re (duplicates)			heuristic = Simple H	heuristic = Simple Heuristic			
	(aupilioutoo)							
				initial solution = ran	dom solution			
		Average Score	Time (s)	initial solution = ran	dom solution Maximum Score	Average Score	Time (s)	
initial solution = rar	ndom solution	Average Score 885993.1	Time (s) 11.88			Average Score 890977.4	Time (s)	
initial solution = rar	dom solution Maximum Score			Algorithm	Maximum Score			
initial solution = rar Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing	Maximum Score	885993.1	11.88	Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing	Maximum Score 955502	890977.4	302.7	
initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing	Maximum Score 1006166 976136	885993.1 886677.0	11.88 11.92	Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing	Maximum Score 955502 954544	890977.4 895913.2	302.7 176.41	
initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing	Maximum Score 1006166 976136 930544	885993.1 886677.0 877429.8	11.88 11.92 322.02	Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing	Maximum Score 955502 954544 925427	890977.4 895913.2 875936.0	302.7 176.41 321.32	
Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm	Maximum Score 1006166 976136 930544 820605	885993.1 886677.0 877429.8 795581.1	11.88 11.92 322.02	Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing	Maximum Score 955502 954544 925427 935661	890977.4 895913.2 875936.0 885344.5	302.7 176.41 321.32	
Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm	Maximum Score 1006166 976136 930544 820605	885993.1 886677.0 877429.8 795581.1	11.88 11.92 322.02	Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm	Maximum Score 955502 954544 925427 935661	890977.4 895913.2 875936.0 885344.5	302.7 176.41 321.32	
Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = green	Maximum Score 1006166 976136 930544 820605	885993.1 886677.0 877429.8 795581.1	11.88 11.92 322.02 9.53	Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre	Maximum Score 955502 954544 925427 935661 eedy score solu	890977.4 895913.2 875936.0 885344.5	302.7 176.41 321.32 143.18	
Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = green	Maximum Score 1006166 976136 930544 820605 eedy score solu Maximum Score	885993.1 886677.0 877429.8 795581.1 tion	11.88 11.92 322.02 9.53 Time (s)	Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = green	Maximum Score 955502 954544 925427 935661 eedy score solu Maximum Score	890977.4 895913.2 875936.0 885344.5 tion	302.7 176.41 321.32 143.18	
Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gree Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing	Maximum Score 1006166 976136 930544 820605 eedy score solu Maximum Score 1413940	885993.1 886677.0 877429.8 795581.1 tion Average Score 1413940.0	11.88 11.92 322.02 9.53 Time (s) 9.22	Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = green Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing	Maximum Score 955502 954544 925427 935661 eedy score solu Maximum Score 1413940	890977.4 895913.2 875936.0 885344.5 tion Average Score 1413940.0	302.7 176.41 321.32 143.18 Time (s	
initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gra Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing	Maximum Score 1006166 976136 930544 820605 eedy score solu Maximum Score 1413940 1413940	885993.1 886677.0 877429.8 795581.1 tion Average Score 1413940.0 1413940.0	11.88 11.92 322.02 9.53 Time (s) 9.22 9.18	Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = green Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing	Maximum Score 955502 954544 925427 935661 eedy score solu Maximum Score 1413940 1413940	890977.4 895913.2 875936.0 885344.5 tion Average Score 1413940.0 1413940.0	302.7 176.41 321.32 143.18 Time (s 210.74 152.01 399.25	
initial solution = rar Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gree Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Genetic Algorithm Genetic Algorithm	Maximum Score 1006166 976136 930544 820605 eedy score solu Maximum Score 1413940 1413940 820605	885993.1 886677.0 877429.8 795581.1 tion Average Score 1413940.0 1413940.0 795581.1	11.88 11.92 322.02 9.53 Time (s) 9.22 9.18 356.71	Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = green Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing	Maximum Score 955502 954544 925427 935661 eedy score solu Maximum Score 1413940 1413940 935661	890977.4 895913.2 875936.0 885344.5 tion Average Score 1413940.0 1413940.0 1413940.0 885344.5	302.7 176.41 321.32 143.18 Time (s 210.74 152.01 399.25	
initial solution = rar Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gree Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Genetic Algorithm	Maximum Score 1006166 976136 930544 820605 eedy score solu Maximum Score 1413940 1413940 820605	885993.1 886677.0 877429.8 795581.1 tion Average Score 1413940.0 1413940.0 795581.1	11.88 11.92 322.02 9.53 Time (s) 9.22 9.18 356.71	Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gree Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm	Maximum Score 955502 954544 925427 935661 eedy score solu Maximum Score 1413940 1413940 935661	890977.4 895913.2 875936.0 885344.5 tion Average Score 1413940.0 1413940.0 1413940.0 885344.5	302.7 176.41 321.32 143.18 Time (s 210.74 152.01 399.25	
initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gree Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gree Algorithm	Maximum Score 1006166 976136 930544 820605 eedy score solu Maximum Score 1413940 1413940 820605 edy signup solu Maximum Score	885993.1 886677.0 877429.8 795581.1 tion Average Score 1413940.0 1413940.0 795581.1 ution	11.88 11.92 322.02 9.53 Time (s) 9.22 9.18 356.71 9.53	Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm	Maximum Score 955502 954544 925427 935661	890977.4 895913.2 875936.0 885344.5 tion Average Score 1413940.0 1413940.0 1413940.0 885344.5	302.7 176.41 321.32 143.18 Time (s 210.74 152.01 399.25 143.18	
initial solution = rar Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gra Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gree Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing First Accept Hill Climbing Genetic Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing	Maximum Score 1006166 976136 930544 820605 eedy score solu Maximum Score 1413940 1413940 820605 edy signup solu Maximum Score 5469473	885993.1 886677.0 877429.8 795581.1 tion Average Score 1413940.0 1413940.0 1413940.0 795581.1 Jtion Average Score 5469473.0	11.88 11.92 322.02 9.53 Time (s) 9.22 9.18 356.71 9.53 Time (s) 44.26	Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing	Maximum Score 955502 954544 925427 935661 eedy score solu Maximum Score 1413940 1413940 935661 edy signup solu Maximum Score 5467966	890977.4 895913.2 875936.0 885344.5 tion Average Score 1413940.0 1413940.0 1413940.0 s85344.5 Ition Average Score 5467966.0	302.7 176.41 321.32 143.18 Time (s 210.74 152.01 399.25 143.18	
Initial solution = rar Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm Initial solution = gra Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm Initial solution = gra Algorithm Initial solution = gra Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing	Maximum Score 1006166 976136 930544 820605 eedy score solu Maximum Score 1413940 1413940 820605 edy signup solu Maximum Score 5469473 5469473	885993.1 886677.0 877429.8 795581.1 tion Average Score 1413940.0 1413940.0 1413940.0 795581.1 Jtion Average Score 5469473.0 5469473.0	11.88 11.92 322.02 9.53 Time (s) 9.22 9.18 356.71 9.53 Time (s) 44.26 41.27	Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gree Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gree Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gree Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing	Maximum Score 955502 954544 925427 935661 Redy score solution Maximum Score 1413940 1413940 935661 edy signup solution Maximum Score 5467966 5467966	890977.4 895913.2 875936.0 885344.5 tion Average Score 1413940.0 1413940.0 885344.5 Ition Average Score 5467966.0 5467966.0	302.7 176.41 321.32 143.18 Time (s 210.74 152.01 399.25 143.18 Time (s 232.64	
initial solution = rar Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gree Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gree Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing First Accept Hill Climbing First Accept Hill Climbing	Maximum Score 1006166 976136 930544 820605 eedy score solu Maximum Score 1413940 1413940 820605 edy signup solu Maximum Score 5469473	885993.1 886677.0 877429.8 795581.1 tion Average Score 1413940.0 1413940.0 1413940.0 795581.1 Jtion Average Score 5469473.0	11.88 11.92 322.02 9.53 Time (s) 9.22 9.18 356.71 9.53 Time (s) 44.26	Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing	Maximum Score 955502 954544 925427 935661 eedy score solu Maximum Score 1413940 1413940 935661 edy signup solu Maximum Score 5467966	890977.4 895913.2 875936.0 885344.5 tion Average Score 1413940.0 1413940.0 1413940.0 s85344.5 Ition Average Score 5467966.0	302.7 176.41 321.32 143.18 Time (s 210.74 152.01 399.25 143.18	

neuristic = Real sco	re (duplicates)			heuristic = Simple H	leuristic				
nitial solution = ran	dom solution			initial solution = ran	initial solution = random solution				
Algorithm	Maximum Score	Average Score	Time (s)	Algorithm	Maximum Score	Average Score	Time (s)		
First Accept Hill Climbing	1396152	1129930.6	12.899	First Accept Hill Climbing	1035610	879255.6	1.47		
Steepest Hill Climbing	1464404	1264100.4	25.23	Steepest Hill Climbing	1198217	862533.0	1.44		
Simulated Annealing	1019314	871254.2	70.58	Simulated Annealing	1206156	954573.7	74.83		
Genetic Algorithm	795214	685237.3	01.05	Genetic Algorithm	990077	870088.1	7.44		
initial solution = gre	edy score solut	tion		initial solution = gre	edy score solu	tion			
Algorithm	Maximum Score	Average Score	Time (s)	Algorithm	Maximum Score	Average Score	Time (s)		
First Accept Hill Climbing	1580357	1580357.0	19.05	First Accept Hill Climbing	1115194	1115194.0	1.3		
Steepest Hill Climbing	1580374	1580374.0	36.74	Steepest Hill Climbing	1115194	1115194.0	1.56		
Simulated Annealing	1144497	1133548.3	75.12	Simulated Annealing	1123686	1115601.7	77.09		
Genetic Algorithm	795214	685237.3	01.05	Genetic Algorithm	990077	870088.1	7.44		
initial solution = gre	edy signup soli	ution		initial solution = gre	edy signup sol	ution			
Algorithm	Maximum Score	Average Score	Time (s)	Algorithm	Maximum Score	Average Score	Time (s)		
First Accept Hill Climbing	4835131	4835131.0	255.65	First Accept Hill Climbing	4261958	4261958.0	5.79		
Steepest Hill Climbing	4834590	4834590.0	723.86	-	4261958	4261958.0	5.79		
	+			Steepest Hill Climbing	 				
Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm	4272471 795214	4268649.0 685237.3	77.63 01.05	Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm	4261958 990077	4261958.0 870088.1	79.82 7.44		
input = f_libra	ries_of_th	e_world							
-		e_world		heuristic = Simple H	leuristic				
input = f_libra heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran	re (duplicates)	e_world		heuristic = Simple H initial solution = ran					
heuristic = Real sco	re (duplicates)	ne_world	Time (s)			Average Score	Time (s)		
heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran Algorithm	re (duplicates) dom solution		Time (s) 0.18	initial solution = ran	dom solution	Average Score 720965.9	Time (s)		
heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing	re (duplicates) dom solution Maximum Score	Average Score		initial solution = ran	dom solution Maximum Score				
heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing	re (duplicates) dom solution Maximum Score 1513810	Average Score 1079063.8	0.18	initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing	dom solution Maximum Score 1339187	720965.9	01.09		
heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing	dom solution Maximum Score 1513810 1839361	Average Score 1079063.8 899945.1	0.18 0.18	initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing	dom solution Maximum Score 1339187 1393953	720965.9 781456.6	01.09		
heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm	dom solution Maximum Score 1513810 1839361 1377378 365182	Average Score 1079063.8 899945.1 849665.9 215376.4	0.18 0.18 77.0	initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing	dom solution Maximum Score 1339187 1393953 1281839 1036985	720965.9 781456.6 795145.4 668539.2	01.09 1.14 74.18		
heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm	dom solution Maximum Score 1513810 1839361 1377378 365182	Average Score 1079063.8 899945.1 849665.9 215376.4	0.18 0.18 77.0 0.66	initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre	dom solution Maximum Score 1339187 1393953 1281839 1036985 edy score solution	720965.9 781456.6 795145.4 668539.2	01.09 1.14 74.18 6.34		
heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre	dom solution Maximum Score 1513810 1839361 1377378 365182 edy score solution	Average Score 1079063.8 899945.1 849665.9 215376.4	0.18 0.18 77.0 0.66	initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre	dom solution Maximum Score 1339187 1393953 1281839 1036985 edy score solution	720965.9 781456.6 795145.4 668539.2 tion	01.09 1.14 74.18 6.34 Time (s)		
heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing	dom solution Maximum Score 1513810 1839361 1377378 365182 edy score solution Maximum Score 1210345	Average Score 1079063.8 899945.1 849665.9 215376.4 tion Average Score 1210345.0	0.18 0.18 77.0 0.66 Time (s) 0.13	initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing	dom solution Maximum Score 1339187 1393953 1281839 1036985 edy score solution Maximum Score 1210345	720965.9 781456.6 795145.4 668539.2 tion Average Score 1210345.0	01.09 1.14 74.18 6.34 Time (s)		
heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing	Maximum Score	Average Score 1079063.8 899945.1 849665.9 215376.4 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1210345.0	0.18 0.18 77.0 0.66 Time (s) 0.13 0.12	initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing	Maximum Score	720965.9 781456.6 795145.4 668539.2 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1210345.0	01.09 1.14 74.18 6.34 Time (s) 01.02 1.18		
neuristic = Real sco nitial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm nitial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing	Maximum Score 1210345 1215512	Average Score 1079063.8 899945.1 849665.9 215376.4 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1210345.0 1211378.4	0.18 0.18 77.0 0.66 Time (s) 0.13 0.12 76.65	initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing	Maximum Score	720965.9 781456.6 795145.4 668539.2 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1210345.0	01.09 1.14 74.18 6.34 Time (s) 01.02 1.18 75.4		
heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm	Maximum Score	Average Score 1079063.8 899945.1 849665.9 215376.4 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1210345.0 1211378.4 215376.4	0.18 0.18 77.0 0.66 Time (s) 0.13 0.12	initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing	dom solution Maximum Score 1339187 1393953 1281839 1036985 edy score solution Maximum Score 1210345 1210345 1210345 1036985	720965.9 781456.6 795145.4 668539.2 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1210345.0 1210345.0 668539.2	01.09 1.14 74.18 6.34 Time (s) 01.02 1.18		
heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Genetic Algorithm Initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm	dom solution Maximum Score 1513810 1839361 1377378 365182 edy score solution Maximum Score 1210345 1210345 1215512 365182 edy signup solution	Average Score 1079063.8 899945.1 849665.9 215376.4 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1211378.4 215376.4 ution	0.18 0.18 77.0 0.66 Time (s) 0.13 0.12 76.65 0.66	initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre	dom solution Maximum Score 1339187 1393953 1281839 1036985 edy score solution Maximum Score 1210345 1210345 1210345 1036985 edy signup solution	720965.9 781456.6 795145.4 668539.2 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1210345.0 1210345.0 668539.2 ution	01.09 1.14 74.18 6.34 Time (s) 01.02 1.18 75.4 6.34		
heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing	Maximum Score 1210345 1215512 365182 249 signup solution Maximum Score 1210345 1	Average Score 1079063.8 899945.1 849665.9 215376.4 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1211378.4 215376.4 ution Average Score	0.18 0.18 77.0 0.66 Time (s) 0.13 0.12 76.65	initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm	Maximum Score 1339187 1393953 1281839 1036985	720965.9 781456.6 795145.4 668539.2 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1210345.0 1210345.0 668539.2 ution Average Score	01.09 1.14 74.18 6.34 Time (s) 01.02 1.18 75.4		
heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre	dom solution Maximum Score 1513810 1839361 1377378 365182 edy score solution Maximum Score 1210345 1210345 1215512 365182 edy signup solution	Average Score 1079063.8 899945.1 849665.9 215376.4 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1211378.4 215376.4 ution	0.18 0.18 77.0 0.66 Time (s) 0.13 0.12 76.65 0.66	initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre	dom solution Maximum Score 1339187 1393953 1281839 1036985 edy score solution Maximum Score 1210345 1210345 1210345 1036985 edy signup solution	720965.9 781456.6 795145.4 668539.2 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1210345.0 1210345.0 668539.2 ution	01.09 1.14 74.18 6.34 Time (s) 01.02 1.18 75.4 6.34		
heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Genetic Algorithm Initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Genetic Algorithm Initial solution = gre Algorithm Initial solution = gre Algorithm Initial solution = gre	Maximum Score 1210345 1215512 365182 249 signup solution Maximum Score 1210345 1	Average Score 1079063.8 899945.1 849665.9 215376.4 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1211378.4 215376.4 ution Average Score	0.18 0.18 77.0 0.66 Time (s) 0.13 0.12 76.65 0.66	initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm	Maximum Score 1339187 1393953 1281839 1036985	720965.9 781456.6 795145.4 668539.2 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1210345.0 1210345.0 668539.2 ution Average Score	01.09 1.14 74.18 6.34 Time (s		
heuristic = Real sco initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre	Maximum Score	Average Score 1079063.8 899945.1 849665.9 215376.4 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1211378.4 215376.4 ution Average Score 2855552.0	0.18 0.18 77.0 0.66 Time (s) 0.12 76.65 0.66 Time (s) 0.81	initial solution = ran Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing Steepest Hill Climbing Simulated Annealing Genetic Algorithm initial solution = gre Algorithm First Accept Hill Climbing First Algorithm initial solution = gre	Maximum Score	720965.9 781456.6 795145.4 668539.2 tion Average Score 1210345.0 1210345.0 1210345.0 668539.2 Ition Average Score 2392740.0	01.09 1.14 74.18 6.34 Time (s 01.02 1.18 75.4 6.34 Time (s		