

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

1 THURSDAY January 31, 2019

2  
3 PRESENT: Roy Halberg A-19, Jeremy Wike A-20, Adam Copenhaver A-21, Rex  
4 Rogers A-23, K Pinkerton B-19, Ron Boehm B-20, Doug Black B-21, Dave Pacheco B-  
5 22, Jonathan Wiley B-23, Adam Johnson C-19, Doug Courter C-21, Tim Clothier C-22,  
6 Rich Schnieders C-23, Clancy Cruise—Executive Dir. 17-19, Tim Hodge, and Greg  
7 Howell Recording Sec.

8 ABSENT: Scott Avey C-20, Tom Avey Fellowship Coordinator, Roger Holl A-22, & Phil  
9 Sparling Executive Director 2020-2022

10  
11 National Organization Representatives: Liz Gates—Grace Connect, Viki Rife and Jen  
12 Avey—Women of Grace, Dave Guiles—Encompass, Ed Lewis—CE National, Mark  
13 Penfold—Chaplain Endorsing Agent, Mark Lingenfelter—Inspire, Ryan Bowell—GBIF,  
14 and Kip Cone and Freddy Cardoza—Grace Schools. And Don Shoemaker—Social  
15 Concerns.

16  
17 8:00 – Devotional (Adam Johnson)

18 Hebrews 4:12-13 He took his kids to the Big Cats Walk in his area. The Lions were  
19 alive sleeping/yawning right up against the glass. But tigers were alive and ACTIVE.  
20 When Word pierces to my marrow, my core, it impacts me, because it is ALIVE &  
21 ACTIVE. Rom 12:1 & 2, what is of utmost importance to me—His Word renews my  
22 mind and transforms me. What am I going to give an account for? We are  
23 Ambassadors, followers of Jesus wherever I am geographically. Not an American, but  
24 a Christian. Reminded as Paul did to 2 Timothy 2:22 flee...pursue...  
25 Ambassador is to be “hands and feet” of Jesus. In Ephesus, Timothy was to be “kind,  
26 able to teach, that they may repent and come to their senses...”  
27 Our Focus is to Not to be caught up in what is happening in social media. Instead we  
28 need to measure: What am I doing on a daily basis to keep my focus and activities  
29 consistent as an Ambassador for Jesus?

30  
31 8:15 – Overview of FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Agenda

32 Clancy gave public thanks to Tim for helping run the meetings, since Tom Avey is on  
33 sabbatical.

34  
35 8:30 – Executive Directors Review (Clancy Cruise)

36 Welcome new members:

37  
38 Rex Rogers—lead pastor at Ripon, CA following Glen and John. He was an  
39 electrician, enrolled in Deploy, involved in church for 17 years, really exposed to  
40 Fellowship nationally last 4 years

41  
42 Rich Schnieders, 21 years in Ft Meyers, FL, he planted the church. He retired from  
43 sheriff department as a Major 2 years ago. He is soon to be a grandparent for the first  
44 time.

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

Jonathan Wiley, GBC preacher's kid. He feels he has the benefit of growing up in the Fellowship. He said he recognizes guys in the room and is grateful to be part of the group.

Adam J, Roy, and Kevin are going off—July will be their last meeting.

Clancy's Executive Director's report  
"Why I am encouraged"

He said that he has spent a lot of time during past 10 yrs getting to know the Fellowship and pastors. In 1987 while sitting in Seminary he was wanting to know how to get into this Fellowship. BNYC, etc. "You didn't make it difficult to get in—must have been kind of desperate at the time."

He named some guys who are being mentored by him and invited to Focus Retreats to encourage them to join us.

He sees some things that are very encouraging to him. So much so that he wants to introduce these new contacts to guys in our Fellowship. "You gotta meet this guy in our Fellowship" like Ed Lewis,

There are more voices in the conversation that matter now and around the world. But we need to be ready for some pushback, ready to process. We handle God's Word pretty well—that's still our strength. But we need more clarity as to who we are. We have a ways to go, but better defined than before. We have more connections and collaborations than ever before. He described several churches helping turnarounds. We have more "grace" in our Fellowship than before—provides the safety to communicate and disagree.

Same truth, love God's Word and want to share God's Word Soon coming debates about application. Clancy says he works very hard at making things open and in safe environment. Note that in society, schools, and government for instance there is "no grace" -- one mess up and you are toast.

He is encouraged that there are more youth around—brings challenges, makes messes, but he loves it.

And there is more accountability, about behavior, etc. We are not behavior Nazis, nor do we have position statements to "out" people—but to unite us and provide clarity. That may cause some to self-selecting but should cause integrity.

More trust. I'm in for good with this group. The guys I'm training, he wants them to be connected. Independent guys find that there are lots of down-sides to being independent. We want to help them connect to us and want to be a part of us—Charis Fellowship.

Where I see some needs

- All local churches need praise, big small, new, old. They all need to know we respect what they are doing. Important that we value one another without making uninformed conclusions. Need praise, help, relational connections, accountability. Some have forgotten how hard it is to be a pastor –blessing and a burden. So it is not right to judge or envy others.
- Leadership needs more refinement, what do we mean by the term "leadership"

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

- I would like to hear more ideas about how we share the Gospel, not stories, but what has worked.
- Appreciate all you guys, you've got one more meeting with me

Memo from Phil Sparling (in Israel so unable to attend) shared several "I believes"  
Read by Clancy:

PHIL SPARLING to Fellowship Council Winter 2019

What I see coming in the next three years...

Concise response: 'taking our Charis Fellowship Core Values and pouring gasoline on each one; Biblical Truth, Biblical Relationships, Biblical Mission (Church Planting, Leadership Development, Doing Good in our communities)'

Belief: I believe that God has laid a strong framework and foundation for our Fellowship. Over the last ten years we have laid the groundwork for an exciting future. I was on the Fellowship Counsel when we adopted 'A Decade of Common Commitment'. Since then we adopted the Charis Document, the identity Initiative, and have rebranded our Fellowship. The recent Focus Retreats called 'Forward', our Access conferences to connect us have been foundational to our new culture. The hard work of the Fellowship Counsel, Bob Fetterhoff, Bartley, Clancy, and so many others has built a good footing for where we are today.

My role: I see my role as continuing and accelerating this groundwork. I see my role as continuing to cultivate a culture of movement. Let's accelerate the promotion of Biblical Truth, Biblical Relationships, and Biblical Mission! Let's accelerate Church planting, leadership development, and doing good in our communities.

Belief: I believe we need to have stronger Districts so we can have stronger churches. I believe we have local churches that have leaders who are struggling and are not connected enough to someone within their district to speak up and receive help. I believe that districts are not fully set up to truly assist, rescue, or revitalize churches within their own districts.

My Role: I see my role is to help develop a way that districts can be better equipped to strengthen local churches, pastors, and local leaders.

Belief: I believe that we need to strengthen the glue that holds the various components of our Fellowship together. I believe we need to increase loyalty, cooperation, and expectations of our National Org, Cooperating Ministries, districts, and pastors. I believe we are so autonomous that we have become too disconnected to really receive the full benefits of being part of Charis Fellowship.

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

1        My role: I see my role is to help strengthen the bond, loyalty, interaction, and  
2        commitment to our tribe's core values and common identity. I think that can be done  
3        without restructuring our Fellowship or by centralizing authority. Autonomy is not empty  
4        of loyalty, or expectations, or tribal commitment. I want to help to continue to move us  
5        from loving each other to measurably helping each other.

6  
7        T Hodge: shared about bringing a potential pastor to conference last year. On the  
8        ferry ride he took him around to meet leaders. Lots out there who need to be part of us.  
9        They just don't know about us yet.

10  
11       Sharing Encouragements in Charis Fellowship (Fellowship Council & leaders of  
12       National Organizations) Clancy invited others to share as we went around the table.

13  
14       D Pacheco: able to call, contact others in Fellowship to help talk/walk through new  
15       challenges

16  
17       K Pinkerton: learning from other guys, 5 resident pastors, helping and starting other  
18       churches somebody has done what you are doing, just ask.

19  
20       K Cone: "Access Indiana," conference for volunteers. A small version of National  
21       Conference. (hope it's okay to steal the name?) (Dr. Katip was unable to attend  
22       because of analysis team on campus this week. Kip introduced new Seminary Dean  
23       Freddy Cardoza)

24  
25       R Boehm: Attended Boot camp by Assist, encouraged by the enthusiasm and follow  
26       through helping churches put things back together.

27  
28       R Bowell: GBIF lots of big projects, but important little ones as well and Ryan gets to  
29       talk with them, very encouraged by what is happening in the Fellowship that comes to  
30       GBIF (K Seyfert unable to attend—flight canceled)

31  
32       D Black: Davidsville/Riverside when Don Rough retired it split and Doug's church came  
33       from the split. The old part of split just reached out to Doug's church and looks like they  
34       will move back into District. Part of what we do--Grace.

35  
36       R Schnieders: It looks like the age of leadership is coming down, good to see that.

37  
38       R Rogers: been in Fellowship for 17 years, but really feel connected during last 4  
39       years because of Focus retreats. We need to help others see the rest of the  
40       Fellowship. Clancy noted that we should celebrate guys like Rex who are always  
41       asking questions, mentored by John Mc and now Joel.

42  
43       D Guiles: good advice received as a young father—"make the family something they  
44       want to be a part of" Charis is like that. The nuts and bolts and policies and statements  
45       show how we function, but relationships make us want to be a part.

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

D Pacheco: truth and relationship important but Mission is what makes us complete

Welcome to National Organization Representatives

Liz Gates—Grace Connect, Viki Rife and Jen Avey—Women of Grace, Dave Guiles—Encompass, Ed Lewis—CE National, Mark Penfold—Chaplain Endorsing Agent, Mark Lingenfelter—Inspire, Ryan Bowell—GBIF, and Kip Cone and Freddy Cardoza—Grace Schools.

One Minute Questions for Reps

(1) Biggest Encouragement (2) Biggest Challenge/Need (3) Biggest Focus in 2019

L Gates—thinks of herself as “cheerleader for all of you and trumpet to rest of Fellowship” there has been a good response to platforms: e-news, stories, photos, etc. There are a lot of great stories to share. Great editorial team to help with titles for BMH books, Clancy added—BMH is working on how to leverage and encourage everyone in Fellowship to be connected by Grace Connect Liz is trying to figure out how to downsize inventory of books, which to sell and discontinue. 1½ years transition until her retirement. She said, “I want us to be even better at telling the stories. It is always a pleasure to come along side.”

V Rife— Likes that she is seeing the younger women with a passion for God and solid grounded women discipling younger women. Their caliber is very high. Women of Grace is helping them understand how to minister in our complementarian system. 15 years ago she was youngest on her board, now thinking about how to develop younger women as spiritually qualified leaders. Challenges—making sure women are qualified and aware of their role. Focus--She introduced Jen Avey and their leadership development with Jen taking the lead. They are working on how to take training to women and accelerate and facilitating their growth.

D Guiles—said he “gets to sit at this kind of table around the world, really cool.” Several “Foci” (word for the day—plural of focus) Challenge: all mission agencies are experiencing significant drop in missionary candidates—perfect storm. Big concern, where do the workers come from? Especially with so many of our churches developing regional leaders—need to connect. Focus-integrating ministries least said and not very organized. Figure out how do we do good strategically and apostolically so that it results in disciple-making and churches started and strengthened.

Ed Lewis—lots of decisions at one of largest youth conferences, and Barnabas summers. Urban Hope in Philly—Grace and Liberty tied in and other universities being training. Illustration: feel like churches aim too high and more and more people don’t know evangelism and unreached don’t even know what a Bible is, and the church is studying Ephesians in depth. “None” designation (survey of what church they attend) is growing. How do we train our churches to reach out to real people and live “on mission”? Love people and use “God talk” If we don’t train, we will not see conversion growth, just continue transfer growth. Just opened Urban Hope Los Angeles. If you

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

1 keep telling people to share, but don't give opportunities--like telling them to swim, but  
2 never have them get in the water.

3  
4 M Penfold—2018 received 2 estate gifts (\$70,000) more than all monies received since  
5 our inception 31 years ago. Partnership with Grace Seminary and Inspire. We are  
6 losing chaplains, 3 since Access –retirement. We could put dozens in ministry today if  
7 we had them. Want the Fellowship to see the military as a mission field  
8 “Foci”—1) need expanded leadership and organization 2) need written policies to help  
9 chaplains minister 3) care for current chaplains at risk could lose 3 more due to that.

10  
11 M Lingenfelter: groundwork of tools and resources almost ready for use in ordination  
12 and teaching churches how to select pastors. Greatest challenge is our focus—size of  
13 vision. Good and hard conversations as to what degree do we need to step up and  
14 lead?

15  
16 R Bowell: lots of projects, loan pipeline looks good. Ken has announced his retirement  
17 next May. Transitional challenges. Some have been there longer than I've been alive.  
18 This summer GBIF is going to get a new software because the current company is  
19 scraping what we are using and so will have to totally replace. There could be some  
20 great upgrades in what GBIF can provide.

21  
22 K Cone: President Katip can't be here. (Dr. Cone is Grace Board member, chairman of  
23 Seminary commission) Dr. Freddy Cardoza comes from Talbot, new Dean of Grace  
24 Seminary. We are gaining traction with Deploy. Enrollment up slightly-- 26 students.  
25 Kip read a note from a local volunteer reported boldness of Grace student sharing  
26 gospel with teen in line at community gathering—praising Grace for training students in  
27 practical evangelism. Challenge—drop in enrollment. Several reasons—less High  
28 School students, economic, social, etc. Pray for students and wisdom. 41 Seminary  
29 blended students. Kern foundation helping so we can recruit from other colleges.  
30 Deploy major emphasis by Freddy in the next year.

31  
32 **Group Interviews with National Organization Reps**

33 Three Groups –Four Fellowship Council members per group / Two-three Nat  
34 Orgs per group / Half hour each

35 Group 1 – Encompass and CE National & GBIF –Jeremy Wike, facilitator

36 Group 2 – Inspire, Eagle Commission, and BMH –Tim Clothier, facilitator

37 Group 3 – Grace College & Seminary & Women of Grace, USA—Doug Black, facilitator

38  
39 Relationship Review (R Boehm shared reflections on what our constitution says, etc.)  
40 How to have National Organizations more efficiently, relationally present/report to the  
41 Fellowship Council. He read from the Manual of Procedure about the Fellowship  
42 Council relationship to Nat/Orgs. It states that the Fellowship Council “may” invite reps  
43 to planning sessions and shall receive requests to be recognized as a Nat/Orgs and the  
44 Fellowship Council “may” serve as counsel to Nat/Orgs. Also, the Fellowship Council  
45 “may” consult National and Cooperating ministries as appropriate  
46 Art 6 section1 requirements –5 “harmoniously”

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

1 Not creations of Fellowship Council nor control their operations, but have a  
2 responsibility to review the above qualifications.

3  
4 Social Concerns Report (Don Shoemaker) In 70's, we were hesitant to be involved in  
5 social issues, especially sanctity of life, but under Dr. John Teevan's leadership, Social  
6 Concerns Committee formed, and Don became chair in 1985. He announced that he  
7 will conclude his involvement at end of Access 2019 after 34 years.

8 More than ever our prophetic voice is needed to speak truth into social direction—  
9 civility, immigration, sanctity of life, gender identity.

10  
11 Clancy expressed deep appreciation for his years of service the Fellowship Council  
12 responded with applause. Clancy stated that Dr. Shoemaker will be honored at  
13 Conference this summer.

14  
15 Charis Alliance Report (Dave Guiles)

16 He shared a PowerPoint presentation and stated that this is the 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the  
17 birth of the Charis Alliance

18 He showed a great video white board timeline of Charis from 1708 to 2018 (5 minutes  
19 long available at Encompass web page)

20 It takes at least 3 churches in a country in order to choose to join the Alliance. Can be  
21 an observer country if they have less than 3 churches.

22 How do the 3 documents of Charis relate to each other? Imagine soccer without goal  
23 posts=mission. Doctrine/truth= lines on the field same jerseys indicates that we relate  
24 to each other on the same team. 4<sup>th</sup> = common history. What do we learn from Mack,  
25 Holsinger, Kassel that shaped our movement?

26 Showed how the current Steering committee 2008-15 will change in 2020

27 Sub-committees – FORUMS with someone from all the areas planning 2020 6<sup>th</sup>  
28 international gathering hopefully in Africa and help them celebrate 100<sup>th</sup> anniversary of  
29 Gribble being sent to open up Africa.

30  
31 IDENTITY STATEMENTS will be reviewed every 5 years to prevent them from  
32 becoming creedal. But Charis Alliance still needs to figure out the process.

33 Note each sub-committee is led by a member from different continents

34 Mechanics (above) need to be figured out but also wrestle with other issues—list of 8  
35 which we will look at more specifically tomorrow

36  
37 Reports from group leaders about Interview with Nat/Org Reps. They shared highlights  
38 with whole Fellowship Council with some Further Q&A with Nat Org reps.

39  
40 Tim C shared from interview time with Mark Penfold (Endorsing Agent) “do you want  
41 your sons and daughters in the military influenced by Unitarian or a Charis Fellowship  
42 chaplain?”. He wants to know what the structural relationship is to the Fellowship  
43 Council. And he asked for prayer as he works on policy. Mark is very desirous of  
44 guidance.

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

1 Liz Gates (Grace Connect)—planning for the future with no one in the pipeline to  
2 replace Liz, nor money to make the transition. The value of independent press keeps  
3 Grace Connect from being the trumpet of any one Charis Fellowship ministry. Her  
4 Board is starting transition conversation.

5  
6 Mark L (Inspire)—position statements, generally need clarity as to how INSPIRE  
7 interacts especially with the gender statement. Wants to be sure of the expectations of  
8 INSPIRE with regard to clarity. Expanding credentialing. Wants to know what  
9 expectations the Fellowship Council has of him before it is too late.

10  
11 Doug B shared that Freddy and Kip (Grace College & Seminary) explained about the  
12 reverse engineering for establishment of Deploy program curriculum. It was “reverse  
13 engineered”—asked pastors what competencies are needed. Then Grace came up  
14 with 15 MA & 18 MDiv. Areas. (MDiv adds extra to some of the 15 and an addition 3  
15 more) Grace alone has created and gotten approval for accreditation for both these  
16 systems. This is truly unique. There are ways to bring this resource to underserved  
17 areas. When they get the hub sites set there may be ways to get consortium—  
18 collectively able to bring classes closer to students.

19  
20 Doug also reported that Viki Rife & Jen Avey (Women of Grace) shared their desire to  
21 organized leadership training. Requested interaction, what is a robust biblical context  
22 for training women? They want a covering from the Charis Fellowship to give guardrails  
23 and a road to run on for certification/credentials/approval of theological & leadership  
24 training.

25  
26 Jeremy—Dave/Ed/Ryan Encompass/CE/GBIF

27 Dave G (Encompass)—aha moment in the last couple days looking at history of Charis  
28 Fellowship showed that it needed to be responsive. As a movement we have no  
29 theology beyond the local church. Bible, whole and nothing but = originally meant “no  
30 authority outside local church can tell us what to do”, this was coined to speak directly  
31 at the Central Committee who were making sweeping and minute decisions affecting all  
32 of the church. That is why Holsinger got thrown out—he thought (wrote, taught, &  
33 argued) local church should be able to make own policies based on the Bible. So we  
34 still have no theology about how local churches connect together. 2<sup>nd</sup> aha is profound;  
35 we say we believe the Bible, but pragmatism almost always wins in any tension in our  
36 Fellowship Council. So the collision between local churches and leaders comes out of  
37 no way to measure/gauge healthy interaction.

38  
39 Ed L (CE National) autonomy is our (Charis Fellowship) problem. We have moved from  
40 being autonomous to independent. When our use of “autonomy” should mean  
41 interdependent. So, we need to replace “autonomy” with “interdependence” when  
42 speaking about local church governance —Dave G added that the CCI uses  
43 interdependence not autonomous. Dave also interjected that the title “Executive  
44 Director” have set them up for failure because title assumes authority, but Fellowship  
45 Council/Charis Fellowship Executive Director actually has no authority. Clancy noted  
46 that these changes need to start at the pastoral level in order for it to happen at a grass



CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

1 roots level. Lot of love for Fellowship expressed by National and Cooperative  
2 organizations.

3  
4 Ed & Dave expressed that Nat/Orgs want to collaborate and have interaction. Maybe  
5 we need gatherings for specific parts of our mission: leadership, mission, church  
6 planting—bringing the Nat/Orgs and others desiring to collaborate in the specific areas.  
7 They feel like Focus retreats have moved away from original intent of time with God,  
8 Word, alone, others.

9  
10 Friday one of the tasks will be to put together and make action points.

11  
12 Approve Housing Allowances etc.

13  
14 In October 2018 the council set (by email vote) Tom Avey's 2019 housing allowance to  
15 \$45,000 and Mark Penfold's 2019 housing allowance at \$30,000. A MOTION  
16 PREVAILED to ratified this email vote for the record.

17  
18  
19 A MOTION PREVAILED to approve minutes of July 2018 as corrected.

- 20  
21
  - P1 line 12 Sandy Barrett not Avey
  - 22 • P1 I29 Bartley Sawatsky also involved
  - 23 • P2 I6 Haitians
  - 24 • P3 I17 spent time interviewing all 8 of the other ministries
  - 25 • P6 I15 Doug Black not Dave Pacheco

26  
27 Fellowship Council Commission meetings

28 Membership—Jeremy, Chair Structures—Ron, Chair Finance—Doug C, Chair

29  
30 Clancy gave a Position Statements update. He said we “danced our way into a new  
31 season at Fremont.” Thought it would be slam dunked. 2 passed, 1 tabled 1 barely  
32 passed We published results right away. In consultation with others, we talked about  
33 what to do going forward. None of these statements will please everyone. Asked  
34 Focus Retreat participants to give feedback. Want statements that are going to unify us  
35 not cause division. Want to communicate in these statements what we believe in  
36 practice, doctrine, etc. It may take some time, 3 or 4 passes in some cases. We have  
37 to come up with statements that provide something unifying and will get approved.  
38 Might need to raise the bar to 80 or 90% for them to pass. Will talk more tomorrow.  
39 Tim H reminded that the CCI 4<sup>th</sup> cluster is to be common not promoting change.

40  
41 Commission Reports, discussions and recommendations.

42  
43 Membership – Jeremy Wike

44 Majority of time was spent on the Mosaic document. (By [clicking here](#), you can access  
45 the latest version of the Mosaic document.) It is the best expression of who we already

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

are as a Fellowship making disciples differently. The Fellowship Council has been asked by GBIF to be gatekeepers of funds they disperse to new churches annually at Conference. We are entrusted with stamping approval for new church requests. Nathan Wells says it takes 7 years to train up a leader in his church plants. The commission also had conversations concerning the amount of church planting agencies.

Jeremy gave hard copies to study and give input tomorrow about how to celebrate and create space for many different kinds of church plants. Can we move forward in identifying what to celebrate? The Commission thinks the document can do this as adopted by Fellowship Council knowing that it is still in motion  
Suggested timeline: Ratify in July, receive input thru March, email vote end of May.  
Not a specific agency sponsored lunch at conference, but Church Planting lunch highlighting all agencies. Clancy to make a video calling all agencies and systems to unite and provide space at next year's Focus Retreats to encourage individuals to be part of church planting. All agencies to have a voice—none would be THE voice. Want to celebrate adoptions, completions, finding a way to invite everyone into the conversation, and share their voice. The document helps us with the front door inviting churches and the back door trying to salvage declining churches.

K Pinkerton: how is it that Assist had a meal and not any of the others? A: Fell into it by Grace Canada assuming control of GO2 which took over for Home Missions which was a Nat/Org. Grace Canada rebranded as ASSIST in order to be more national and less regional. Mosaic is not anti-Assist, just pro all church planting groups.

C Cruise: The Membership Committee wants the Fellowship Council to look with favor on the direction of the Mosaic document with their action steps. The Mosaic document was constructed by the Membership committee. Suggest then that the Membership Committee be the team to invite all the agencies to participate at Access in a timely way in order fill the time slots—meal, etc.

T Hodge: specific outcomes of these Fellowship Council meetings need to result in some action steps before we leave. This would be part of that. We can use video meetings, calls etc., after our meetings here.

D Black: The Mosaic Document serves many functions. It is an aspirational document as well as a measurement doc.

R Rogers: It gives the outline of what we are already doing

Structures – Ron Boehm

Asked can Fellowship Council members serve consecutive terms? A: Manual of Procedure says: off one year before on again. Discussion – consecutive prevents others from serving. Specific concern is for Adam Johnson who is filling out Larry Orme's unexpired term (one more year)

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

1 T Hodge: A partial term can have additional own term ie Adam for Larry Orme, then  
2 Adam can be nominate/elected to his own without 1 year in between.

3  
4 D Pacheco: are some districts neglected when choosing Fellowship Council nominees?

5  
6 G Howell: how system works—Districts suggest nominees, Tom Avey and/or  
7 Nominating Committee narrows to 2-3 from each region, asking other individuals  
8 directly if not enough nominees come from any region. Tom prefers to just have 2  
9 names from each region, which prevents the need for run-off ballots.

10  
11 R Boehm how do the Chaplaincy Endorsing Agent & the Eagle Commission interact  
12 with the Fellowship? A: Endorsing agent does not have a board. We treat them like a  
13 Nat/Org, but they are not. Asked M Penfold what he would like—heading in direction of  
14 donor base and becoming a Cooperating Ministry. But he needs to be at Fellowship  
15 Council because he needs to report to us. He is connecting with INSPIRE and just  
16 elected to their board. He is going to put down in writing some of what he thinks might  
17 work.

18  
19 D Guiles But we don't want a proliferation of organizations. Could he operate under  
20 one of the other orgs? Recently both Encompass and Grace have moved back to  
21 churches, not individuals as donors. Probably there is no positive added red tape in  
22 making a new organization. It is good that he is asking questions. Structures Asked —  
23 what would be best structure to best vet candidates and recruit new prospects? Mark  
24 was encouraged to set up a group for council whether it becomes a cooperating ministry  
25 or not, but he needs to have a trusted group to bounce things off of. GBIF is the  
26 financial part, but probably not the consulting/policy group.

27  
28 D Guiles: encourage him to speak with those who live in a world that is not a church.  
29 He is an amazing guy, but can't just figure it out without help (from Fellowship Council  
30 or his consulting group)

31  
32 D Pacheco: asked him to propose what he thinks will help him succeed in his role. Let  
33 us know what he would like. The Fellowship Council has his back.

34  
35 R Boehm: encouraged him to partner with D Shoemaker about civilian chaplains.

36  
37 C Cruise: is it possible since Mark answers legally to the Fellowship Council, could it be  
38 for the time being that volunteers from this board would act as a sounding board for him  
39 to give the cover that he needs right now? Until there is a better way. Mentioned in his  
40 report about wanting policy documents. Ask him to find documents from other groups  
41 like what he wants, and we can help tweak.

42  
43 Structures Commission is empowered to help however he needs. May need to appoint  
44 a point person from Fellowship Council to help him walk thru this reorganizing time.

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

1 K Pinkerton: other chaplains are not same and don't have government required  
2 oversight of Endorsing Agent. Can other chaplains be connected to Eagle Commission  
3 Board?  
4

5 R Boehm: however, documents are written up, we, Fellowship Council, are his final  
6 back up. We want to provide whatever help he needs and/or desires.  
7

8 Restructure of the Fellowship Council—is there something better than 3 committees we  
9 currently have? A lot more discussion about future, who is replacing Tom? Do we  
10 really need a Finance Committee? Maybe we need an Identity Team—might help with  
11 process and connection with Charis Alliance and Identity statement review.

12 Discussion included: we should Include INSPIRE to help wording of Position  
13 Statements. There were positive comments on having a Conference Team and a Focus  
14 team. Maybe need a Fellowship wide “word of advice” group.  
15

16 Ended for the day, 4:58, Dinner at Claim Jumpers  
17

18 **Friday Feb 1, 2019 Fellowship Council at Seal Beach**

19 PRESENT: : Roy Halberg A-19, Jeremy Wike A-20, Adam Copenhaver A-21, Rex  
20 Rogers A-23, K Pinkerton B-19, Ron Boehm B-20, Doug Black B-21, Dave Pacheco B-  
21 22, Jonathan Wiley B-23, Adam Johnson C-19, Doug Courter C-21, Tim Clothier C-22,  
22 Rich Schnieders C-23, Clancy Cruise—Executive Dir. 17-19, Tim Hodge, and Greg  
23 Howell Recording Sec.

24 Devotions by Roy He told about how his bike ride started with him being anemic from  
25 giving double red cells before he set out. He had maps, but had constant concern  
26 where he was going to find food, water, and shelter. He was traveling the side roads,  
27 which is not where fast foods were. His wife challenged him before he left to read  
28 Oswald Chambers, *My Utmost for His Highest*. First few days was about not being  
29 worried about what to eat and drink and wear. Mt. 6 Yet your heavenly Father will take  
30 care of you. On the 3<sup>rd</sup> day he was out of water, and nothing around until house with  
31 hose in front of house, Judy welcomed and made him come in, gave him ice. 5<sup>th</sup> day at  
32 a church, Wayne filled up his water bottle and invited to stay the weekend. Jesus  
33 repeated all these things 3x. His experience of riding in Virginia made Mt 6:33 really  
34 come to life. Whatever my (your) situation is covered by “all these things”

35 **FINANCE COMMITTEE**  
36

37 Recommend increase Tom's salary 2%.  
38

39 A MOTION PREVAILED to increase Tom Avey's salary 2%  
40

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

Roger Holl not here because of non-Hodgkin's lymphoma. He almost died, but now recovering. Sends apology for not being present.

D Guiles -- presented information about Charis Crisis Response, Barb Wooler is the coordinator. Encompass has overseen since 1960's. He showed a video about crisis response in North America. Several things to celebrate, including that 35 churches provided 65-70 responses.

Charis Alliance updating every 5 years and international gathering. Next gathering 2020 in Africa. Listed 8 issues: no blueprints, creating as we go

1. Transition and continuities in leadership
2. Financing (Encompass has shouldered the bulk thus far) Thailand cost \$100,000 thanks for Fellowship Council help
3. Developing appropriate pathways for the ongoing renewal of CCCM and CCCi
4. Internal discipline for maintaining a viable membership list
5. Creating concrete pathways to foster more meaningful regional partnerships
6. Increasing a sense of "ownership" of Charis among church leaders and Charis 'identity' among church members
7. Creating appropriate leadership role and ministry opportunities for women in both the International and Regional Charis Networks
8. Fostering a genuine sense of being 'a movement for God in our generation.'

Folks on the Steering Committee appointed in 2008 and 2015 working on these and may be replaced at 2020. Selecting delegates is extremely important—will they be just symbolic or really up to speed.

Preparing for CHARIS2020

**Representatives;** Each Member Association is encouraged to appoint representatives to the Charis Alliance forum according to this formula: 3-10 Churches – one representative; 11-99 churches – two representatives; 100 or more churches – three representatives. Each representative is entitled to voice and vote.

**The Charis Alliance forum:** the Forum is responsible 1) to promote the purposes and goals of the Charis Alliance, 2) to establish and maintain requirements for membership, and 3) to appoint the Executive Committee. Assuming that the Charis Alliance is successful in raising funds, the Charis Alliance Forum will meet every five years.

Who will be the 10 people + 1 from Encompass who will oversee Charis Alliance for next 5 years. And funding for gatherings, mostly transportation. Each will be a delegate to 2020 then serve for next 5 years.

Action item—choose 3 US and one Canadian delegate by winter 2020 Fellowship Council meeting.

2019 location for Access is Auburn, California, Pastor Phil & Ruth Sparling, hosts.

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES** JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019

2020 location--will check with Tom when he is back. Tim H mentioned his district would like to have us consider Lancaster Bible College campus, good tourist area, lots of hotels.

Review things we need to do today

AROUND THE ROOM SUGGESTIONS about business that needs to be handled yet today.

J Wike—clarity on Mosaic

R Boehm—Response on change in handling Nat/Org reporting

--Sunset clause needed for ministries? If we are interviewing, will that care for us knowing if they are still on mission?

T Clothier—how does Mosaic document become living

R Rogers—affirmation/integration of Mosaic document

A Copenhaver—Position statements and steps forward

R Schnieders—encouraged by Nat/Org interviews

K Pinkerton—clean up some of the follow through of decisions, doing what we said and not changing after Fellowship Council

R Halberg—give Phil Sparling direction about how to do Focus Retreats Give Mark Penfold more guidance and direction as Endorsing Agent and agree with K Pinkerton about processes and follow through

D Black—approve Mosaic discussion about transitions and big shifts in our “young” organization

D Pacheco—struck by and agree with Ed Lewis’ concern for training people to do evangelism in everyday life. Can we as the Fellowship Council shepherd that and provide resources?

A Johnson—Tom’s transition

J Wiley—position statements and transitions, strategic, streamlined, more efficient structure?

D Courtier—is there a better way to set up our committees pondering “we have no theology beyond our local churches”

T Hodge—Dave Guiles has some suggestions that connect a lot of these together.

D Guiles—theology beyond local church. We belong loosely to a grouping of churches in North America that reacted against authority outside the local church. Number of Baptist groups started this way; reacting against other forms of authority (Presbyterian) affirmed that the primary expression of “church” is local church. Autonomy = no one outside local church—except Jesus-- has authority over local church. Reality is that local churches have always found ways to cooperate with other local churches. Might be unique to North America. We came at it a little different than Baptist groups because of our Anabaptist and pietistic roots. The motto “The Bible, the Whole Bible and Nothing but the Bible” was to tell the old German Baptist Central Committee that they could not tell local churches what to do.

1982-91 splits came about because conflict between Conference telling churches how to determine membership. Tension between autonomy and cooperation. Can’t go back to New Testament because they were not wrestling with same issues. But we can

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

1 establish rules as to how we relate to one another now. Once we determine and have  
2 shared agreement, then decisions like who to replace Tom with will be clearer. We  
3 need a stronger mooring. Decisions will flow out of our understanding of Scriptural  
4 principles. It will have a North American flavor, but have to start with Biblical principles  
5 rather than American philosophy.

6  
7 Refer Mark Penfold to INSPIRE and have them get back to Fellowship Council.  
8 Structures will follow up in a couple months.

9  
10 Adam Johnson could also finish out Scott's term.

11  
12 A MOTION PREVAILED to appoint Adam Johnson to finish out Scott Avey's term  
13 (Region C ending 2020)

14  
15 Volunteer to reach out to Nat/Org leaders to ask feedback on how we interviewed them  
16 this year. Dave P will follow-up. Sharmion will provide contact info.

17  
18 2020 delegates for Charis Alliance. T Hodge requested volunteers to work on this list.  
19 Structures already have a list of suggested roles for delegates. Interact with D Guiles  
20 about including a female? Fellowship Council appoints our North American delegates.

21  
22 T Hodge Reminded to us to make the most of conference calls between Feb-July  
23 together times.

24  
25 Mosaic next steps based on recommended timeline. Membership Commission wants  
26 Fellowship Council approval/blessing. Jeremy wants feedback or comments if  
27 something is missing or extra. Thoughts about how to present to Conference and  
28 celebrate. Soften "all" churches. "Consider" "apostolic" overall is was well received.  
29 The objective is to affirm all of the paradigms.

30  
31 Need to officially say that the Fellowship Council looks with favor on the document and  
32 encourages the Membership committee moving forward with the steps in the binder.

33  
34 Discussion about how Assist got to have a lunch at Conference. Maybe we should not  
35 have any Church planting lunch. Should examine all of the lunches to make sure there  
36 is balanced involvement. Assist is not going to have a lunch this year because they are  
37 not a Nat/Org, but we want to celebrate church planting. Jeremy will help with lunch  
38 decisions with Tom, Clancy, and Phil.

39  
40 K Pinkerton: it is too easy for Assist to look like it is the parent of Mosaic. Maybe we  
41 should have a lunch each for "leadership", "doing good", and "church planting." And  
42 then put Nat/Orgs back on the Conference schedule. Being a Nat/Org. does not help  
43 with fundraising. Take all of the lunches back—Grace Connect and Assist and give  
44 opportunity for others. Have to start thinking what is best for the Fellowship, not  
45 specifically about a specific leader or ministry. We are just trying to reconstruct the  
46 guide rails. Not wanting to be bullies, but trying to include all church planting groups

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

1 and styles. Mosaic will be fully revealed at Conference and some of course leading up  
2 to. We should us the lunch to share the rational of the Mosaic plan and have GBIF  
3 hand out new church checks. Thus celebrating all churches.

5 A MOTION PREVAILED to affirm the process outlined in the Mosaic document and  
6 authorize the membership team to implement it.

8 **POSTION STATEMENTS**

9 The Positions Statements team has followed the Process document and took the first  
10 four to conference 2018. 2 passed strongly, 1 barely passed and 1 was tabled. And we  
11 quickly published the results. This is a new thing for our Fellowship, so might take as  
12 long as it took to formulate the Identity Statement. The team has met a few times, but  
13 has not gone into any new issues. But they have been assessing the process. As it  
14 relates to more loaded issues, they will take a different tack. By the vote and feedback,  
15 Ordinance and Elder will take a bit different, vigorous process. We may need to present  
16 future Statements with more support, etc. Does it unify us? Is there evidence to  
17 support that it is presenting disharmony, disunity? Yes, pretty strong at Focus retreats.  
18 Some of those voting against would like it more conservative. There is an automatic  
19 Sunset clause after 5 years. Should we reconsider all of the Position Statements up to  
20 the point of each Common Identity 5 year review?

22 Language about how binding these Position Statements are on individuals and  
23 churches. Review percentages. Grace bylaws tie them to Identity Statement and  
24 Position Statements so there are ramifications beyond just the Charis Fellowship. The  
25 vote is the law of the land. We can't change Statements after the fact. But we might  
26 need to change the percentage in the future. Would be a mistake to call any woman  
27 "pastor" in our Fellowship—there are negative US and Foreign ramifications. But it is  
28 hard to link the office of Elder automatically with the gift of pastor. Elders are called to  
29 pastor, but not all have the gifting. Just as all gifted pastor may not hold office of Elder.  
30 4<sup>th</sup> cluster technically applies to a geographical region. Technically, but not relationally.  
31 Could cause a disaster. Do we need a step "run it past international check"?  
32 Purpose is to describe what unites us.

34 C Cruise completely fine leaving as it. Handful strongly requesting take "pastor" out.

36 D Guiles but it did pass. Need a mechanism for possible change.  
37 Need to give clarity about process in advance so that we don't provide or project  
38 uncertainty.

40 Defer changes to the sunset clause.

41 Just not have a position statement on ordinances—not necessary, let cluster 3 cover it.  
42 What does "encourage" mean? Highly value, affirming the practice. Never intent to  
43 proscribe "have to"

44 Are we prepared to deal with the aftermath—church no longer doing 3 fold at all. Back  
45 to before statements. Back to the broken wheel—running on the broken wheel. Case  
46 of what hill to die on. Affirm the value of what ordinances we practice. Some saw



CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019**

1 statement as weapon to force all churches to do the “right” way. Leave it on the table.  
2 Rick Nuzum’s church wondered if it was going to be enforced. Instead handling the  
3 void with resources—(Inspire is working on some for all of the Identity Statement).  
4

5 D Pacheco: can we do a review of the process of position statements? Not today, but  
6 how do we gauge importance, how to word them, and when is Inspire involved?  
7

8 C Cruise: Look at the current process document, let Clancy know if you want to be  
9 included in the conversation next time. Adam C and Ron B advocate for a one page  
10 explanation of the statement with supporting references. By July we should have a lot  
11 of clarity. Not anticipating the next statements soon, need to iron out the process first.  
12 How it was handled at Conference was not great, I take responsibility for that. Need to  
13 restructure—maybe release well before Conference and then 1<sup>st</sup> reading with breakout  
14 time to speak into the topic and final vote of approval the following Conference?  
15 In a perfect world INSPIRE would have been the agency to start the process. As it  
16 revives from being a maintenance organization to proactive, they may well be able to  
17 lead the charge in the future.  
18 Have some topics in the pipeline.  
19

20 G Howell gave history. 1984 unanimously received unanimous report of 2/3 year  
21 committee report on three-fold communion with mandates to not practice parts and call  
22 it “communion” and leave “only” in the constitution. 2006 and 2012 constitution/Manual  
23 of Procedure revisions took “only” out of three-fold communion and triune immersion  
24 with explanation that they were still protected by the Statement of Faith. But Identity  
25 Statement removed “only”s and replaced with “encourage”. It is lamentable that 1985  
26 Conference did not codify report by making Constitutional notations, but also at this  
27 juncture we seem to be ignoring the men who labored to bring the committee to unity  
28 and the delegates who “overwhelmingly” approved it. I’m not sure anyone thought there  
29 was more to do to preserve the decision. My opinion is that those practicing bread and  
30 cup alone are ignorant of this history.  
31

32 There was a long discussion about how practice and communion affects new churches  
33 and entry into Fellowship  
34

35 Membership Commission will pursue development of associate membership as entry  
36 point for existing church wanting to join—will bring to July meeting.  
37

38 Tom would like to stay on employed for another couple years. Need a transition plan.  
39 Clancy formed a team –Adam J, Doug B, Tim H authorized Tom’s sabbatical and will  
40 receive his report. Transition team will consider things like will Tom and/or his  
41 replacement continue running Focus retreats, Conference, etc. Broader Questions:  
42 what is role of Fellowship Coordinator and Executive Director, who brings vision?  
43 Need to refine. And need to evaluate what that new job will be. 1 full time, 2 full time,  
44 several part time?  
45

CHARIS FELLOWSHIP COUNCIL Seal Beach GBC, Seal Beach, Calif.  
**MINUTES** JANUARY 31 & FEBRUARY 1, 2019

1 Thoughts from Structures-- need task force to work along with Structures and join with  
2 some who are working on Tom's transition also.  
3 Doug C, Dave P, Doug B, volunteered to be the task force with Structures & Tim H &  
4 Phil.

5  
6 Is there a document that explains the purpose of Fellowship Coordinator and Tom's job  
7 description? Yes, Tom presented a PPT last year.

8  
9 Adam J: Just to clarify, if asked to baptize a candidate once backward and agrees then  
10 I am proving that I don't fully believe triune immersion and demonstrate it by my action,  
11 right?. Yes

12  
13 CCI is reflection who we currently are.  
14 History is the strongest proof of triune immersion as the preferred method. Not a  
15 salvation issue.

16  
17 K Pinkerton asked for Straw poll about who does part of communion on occasion.  
18 Majority raised hands

19  
20 K Pinkerton Also asked how many accept non-triune immersed members Majority  
21 raised hands.

22  
23 Adjourned by the Chair (Executive Director, Clancy Cruise) at 2:25pm

24  
25  
26 Respectfully submitted,

27  
28 Gregory M. Howell,  
29 Recording Secretary