

Argument逻辑错误模板精析

陶睿



Content

a. 因果

b. 类比

C. 利润





因果关系

KMF基清分

因果错误



The arguer fails to establish the causal relationship between A and B. It's highly possible that other factors contribute to B. For instance, B might have resulted from C. It is also likely that D caused B. Lacking evidence that links A to B, it is presumptuous to suggest that A was responsible for B.



段落结构

【指出逻辑错误】Topic sentence

【原理】General description

【分析】detail Analysis

【结论】Conclusion

因果错误



The arguer fails to establish the causal relationship between A and B. It's highly possible that other factors contribute to B. For instance, B might have resulted from C. It is also likely that D caused B. Lacking evidence that links A to B, it is presumptuous to suggest that A was responsible for B.

【举例】A 167



During the past year, Alta Manufacturing had thirty percent more

on-the-job accidents than nearby Panoply Industries, where the work shifts

are one hour shorter than ours. Experts believe that a significant contributing

factor in many accidents is fatigue caused by sleep deprivation among

workers. Therefore, to reduce the number of on-the-job accidents at Alta,

we recommend shortening each of our three work shifts by one hour.

If we do this, our employees will get adequate amounts of sleep.





The arguer fails to establish the causal relationship between accidents and fatigue.

It's highly possible that other factors contribute to accidents. For instance, accidents might have resulted from inadequate equipment maintenance. It is also likely that the inherent hazards of Alta's manufacturing processes caused accidents. Lacking evidence that links fatigue to accidents, it is presumptuous to suggest that fatigue was responsible for accidents.

因果错误



The arguer fails to establish the causal relationship between A and B. It's highly possible that other factors contribute to B. For instance, B might have resulted from C. It is also likely that D caused B. Lacking evidence that links A to B, it is presumptuous to suggest that A was responsible for B.





Secondly, the author assumes that some accidents at Alta are caused by fatigue or sleep deprivation. However, the author overlooks other possible causes, such as inadequate equipment maintenance or worker training, or the inherent hazards of Alta's manufacturing processes. By the same token, Panoply's comparatively low accident rate might be attributable not to the length of its work shifts but rather to other factors, such as superior equipment maintenance or worker training. In other words, without ruling out alternative causes of on-the-job accidents at both companies, the author cannot justifiably conclude that merely by emulating Panoply's work shift policy Alta would reduce the number of such accidents.



类比错误

KMF考洁分

类比错误



The arguer's recommendation relies on what might be a poor analogy between A and B. The analogy falsely depends on the assumption that ... in both A and B is similar. However, it is entirely possible that ... In short, without accounting for such possible differences between A and B, the arguer cannot prove that B will reap the similar benefits from the proposed methods.

【举例】A 77



Two years ago, the nearby town of Ocean View built a new municipal golf course and resort hotel. During the past two years, tourism in Ocean View has increased, new businesses have opened there, and Ocean View's tax revenues have risen by 30 percent. Therefore, the best way to improve Hopewell's economy—and generate additional tax revenues—is to build a golf course and resort hotel similar to those in Ocean View.

【段落】



Finally, the mayor's argument rests on the unsubstantiated assumption that Hopewell and Ocean View are sufficiently alike in ways that might affect the economic impact of a new golf course and hotel. Hopewell might lack the sort of natural environment that would attract more tourists and new businesses to the town--regardless of its new golf course and hotel. For that matter, perhaps Hopewell already contains several resort hotels and golf courses that are not utilized to their capacity. If so, building yet another golf course and hotel might amount to a misallocation of the town's resources--and actually harm the town's overall economy.



利润问题

KMF基清分

利润问题



The author's conclusion that... is unwarranted. Profit is a factor relating to not only revenue, but also cost.

It's entirely possible that the cost of A or other costs associated with B, C will offset, even outweigh the revenue. Besides, a myriad of other unexpected occurrences, such as...

might prevent... from being as profitable as the argument predicts.

【举例】A 38



Five years ago, at a time when we had difficulties in obtaining reliable supplies of high quality wool fabric, we discontinued production of our alpaca overcoat. Now that we have a new fabric supplier, we should resume production. This coat should sell very well: since we have not offered an alpaca overcoat for five years and since our major competitor no longer makes an alpaca overcoat, there will be pent-up customer demand. Also, since the price of most types of clothing has increased in each of the past five years, customers should be willing to pay significantly higher prices for alpaca overcoats than they did five years ago, and our company profits will increase.





Even if the author can substantiate the two foregoing assumptions, the argument relies on the additional assumption that the company will obtain higher profits from selling such coat. The author fails to consider possible cost of selling such coat. The new supplier may charge higher service fee. Or perhaps the transportation has become more expensive. Furthermore, to attract more customers, the company may have to spend a lot of money in advertising. Thus withoutmore evidence related with cost, the author cannot predict that selling such coat is profitable.

