

**(3.1.5)** Let  $A \subset S$ . Show that if  $c$  is a cluster point of  $A$ , then  $c$  is a cluster point of  $S$ .  
*Note the difference from Proposition 3.1.15*

*Proof.* A point  $c$  is a cluster point of a set  $A$  if every neighborhood of  $c$  contains a point of  $A$  that is distinct from  $c$ . Similarly,  $c$  is a cluster point of  $S$  if every neighborhood of  $c$  contains a point of  $S$  distinct from  $c$ . Assume that  $c$  is a cluster point of  $A$ . This means that for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , there is some  $x \in A$  with  $x \neq c$  such that  $|x - c| < \epsilon$ . More specifically it means that  $x \in (c - \epsilon, c + \epsilon) \cap [S \setminus \{c\}]$ . Since  $A \subset S$ , every point  $a \in A$  must also be a point in  $S$  by definition. Therefore, for every  $x \in (c - \epsilon, c + \epsilon) \cap [S \setminus \{c\}]$ , we know that  $x \in A \subset S$ . This implies that every  $\epsilon$  yields an  $x$  abiding by the previous description such that  $x \in S \setminus \{c\}$ , meaning that  $c$  must be a cluster point of  $S$ .  $\square$

**(3.1.12)** Prove Proposition 3.1.17, that is, Let  $S \subset \mathbb{R}$  be such that  $c$  is a cluster point of both  $S \cap (-\infty, c)$  and  $S \cap (c, \infty)$ , let  $f : S \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be a function, and let  $L \in \mathbb{R}$ . Then  $c$  is a cluster point of  $S$  and

$$\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) = L \quad \text{if and only if} \quad \lim_{x \rightarrow c^-} f(x) = \lim_{x \rightarrow c^+} f(x) = L$$

*Proof.* We begin with the forward direction. Assume that  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) = L$ . By the definition of the limit, for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists some  $\delta > 0$  such that  $|f(x) - L| < \epsilon$  whenever  $0 < |x - c| < \delta$ . We can split this into two parts:

1. For the left-hand limit,  $x \rightarrow c^-$ : If  $x < c$  and  $0 < c - x < \delta$ , then  $|f(x) - L| < \epsilon$ . Thus,  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c^-} f(x) = L$ .
2. For the right-hand limit,  $x \rightarrow c^+$ : If  $x > c$  and  $0 < x - c < \delta$ , then  $|f(x) - L| < \epsilon$ . Thus,  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c^+} f(x) = L$ .

Since both limits equal  $L$ , we conclude that  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c^-} f(x) = \lim_{x \rightarrow c^+} f(x) = L$ .

Now we must prove the reverse direction. Suppose that  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c^-} f(x) = \lim_{x \rightarrow c^+} f(x) = L$ . By the definition of left- and right-hand limits, we have:

1. For the left-hand limit, given  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists some  $\delta_1 > 0$  such that  $|f(x) - L| < \epsilon$  whenever  $0 < c - x < \delta_1$ .
2. For the right-hand limit, given the same arbitrarily chosen  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists some  $\delta_2 > 0$  such that  $|f(x) - L| < \epsilon$  whenever  $0 < x - c < \delta_2$ .

We must connect  $\delta_1$  and  $\delta_2$ . Let  $\delta = \min(\delta_1, \delta_2)$ . This ensures that for all  $x$  sufficiently close to  $c$ , the function values  $f(x)$  are close to  $L$  as this  $x$  satisfies  $0 < |x - c| < \delta$  (as it was said to be sufficiently close). Here,  $x$  will either fall into the interval  $(c - \delta, c)$  (for  $x < c$ ) or  $(c, c + \delta)$  (for  $x > c$ ). Therefore for such  $x$  we can say  $|f(x) - L| < \epsilon$ . By definition this shows that  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) = L$ , as required.  $\square$

**(3.2.2)** Using the definition of continuity directly prove that  $f : (0, \infty) \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  defined by  $f(x) := \frac{1}{x}$  is continuous.

*Proof.* To directly prove that the function  $f : (0, \infty) \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  given by  $f(x) := \frac{1}{x}$  is continuous, we must show that at any point  $c \in (0, \infty)$ , the epsilon-delta definition of continuity holds. That is, we need to show that for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists some  $\delta > 0$  such that if  $0 < |x - c| < \delta$ , then  $|f(x) - f(c)| < \epsilon$ .

We begin by computing  $|f(x) - f(c)| = \left| \frac{1}{x} - \frac{1}{c} \right|$ . We can simplify this by finding a common denominator as  $\left| \frac{1}{x} - \frac{1}{c} \right| = \left| \frac{c-x}{xc} \right| = \frac{|c-x|}{|xc|}$ . Now we must show that this expression is less than  $\epsilon$ , or that  $\frac{|c-x|}{|xc|} < \epsilon$ . We can rewrite the previous inequality as  $|c-x| < \epsilon |xc|$ .

We must now find  $\delta$ , which requires controlling both  $|x-c|$  and  $|xc|$ . As  $c > 0$ , set  $|x-c| < \delta$ . We can expand this to be  $-\delta < x-c < \delta \implies c-\delta < x < c+\delta$ . If we take  $\delta \leq \frac{c}{2}$ , then this ensures that  $x$  remains close to  $c$ . Thus we have  $c-\frac{c}{2} < x < c+\frac{c}{2} \implies \frac{c}{2} < x < \frac{3c}{2}$ . As this  $x$  must be greater than  $\frac{c}{2}$ , we can bound  $|xc|$  as  $|xc| > \left(\frac{c}{2}c\right) = \frac{c^2}{2}$ . We can substitute these back into  $|c-x| < \epsilon |xc|$  to yield  $|c-x| < \epsilon \frac{c^2}{2}$ . This allows us to choose  $\delta = \min\left(\frac{c}{2}, \frac{\epsilon c^2}{2}\right)$ .

We can now proceed by verifying this choice of  $\delta$ . We know from above that if  $|x-c| < \delta$ , then  $|c-x| < \frac{\epsilon c^2}{2}$ . We also have that  $|xc| > \frac{c^2}{2}$ , so

$$|f(x) - f(c)| = \frac{|c-x|}{|xc|} < \frac{\frac{\epsilon c^2}{2}}{\frac{c^2}{2}} = \epsilon.$$

and hence  $f(x) := \frac{1}{x}$  is continuous at every  $c \in (0, \infty)$ , as required.  $\square$

**(3.2.13)** Let  $f : S \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be a function and  $c \in S$ , such that for every sequence  $\{x_n\}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  in  $S$  with  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n = c$ , the sequence  $\{f(x_n)\}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  converges. Show that  $f$  is continuous at  $c$ .

*Proof.* We know that  $f$  satisfies the property that for every sequence  $\{x_n\}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  in  $S$  with  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n = c$ , the sequence  $\{f(x_n)\}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  converges. We must show continuity at  $c$ , meaning that  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) = f(c)$ .

Assume for contradiction that  $f$  is not continuous at  $c$ . By definition of continuity, it must consequently be the case that  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) \neq f(c)$ . This implies that there exists some sequence  $\{x_n\}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  in  $S$  such that  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n = c$ , but that the corresponding sequence  $\{f(x_n)\}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  does not converge to  $f(c)$ . However, we have assumed that for every sequence  $\{x_n\}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  with  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n = c$ , the corresponding sequence  $\{f(x_n)\}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  does, in fact, converge. Thus we arrive at a contradiction indicating that our assumption of  $f$  not being continuous is false. Therefore  $f$  is continuous at  $c$ , as required.  $\square$

**(3.2.15)** Suppose  $g : \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is a continuous function such that  $g(0) = 0$ , and suppose  $f : \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is such that  $|f(x) - f(y)| \leq g(x - y)$  for all  $x$  and  $y$ . Show that  $f$  is continuous.

*Proof.* We are given that  $|f(x) - f(y)| \leq g(x - y)$ , and letting  $y = c$ , we have  $|f(x) - f(c)| \leq g(x - c)$ . We can do this as this inequality is given to hold true for all  $x, y \in \mathbb{R}$ , and we know  $c \in \mathbb{R}$ . We proceed by analyzing the behavior of  $g$  as  $x \rightarrow c$ . In other words, we must see the behavior of  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} g(x - c)$ . Since  $x \rightarrow c$  implies that  $x - c \rightarrow 0$ , we have that  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} g(x - c) = g(0) = 0$ .

We will proceed with the use of the squeeze theorem. Since  $|f(x) - f(c)| \leq g(x - c)$ , we have that  $-g(x - c) \leq f(x) - f(c) \leq g(x - c)$ . We take the limit of this expression as:

$$\lim_{x \rightarrow c} (-g(x - c) \leq f(x) - f(c) \leq g(x - c)) = -\lim_{x \rightarrow c} g(x - c) \leq \lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) - f(c) \leq \lim_{x \rightarrow c} g(x - c).$$

Therefore we have that  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} f(x) - f(c) = 0$  by the squeeze theorem as  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} g(x - c) = g(0) = 0$ .

We thus conclude that  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} |f(x) - f(c)| = 0$ . As  $f(c)$  is not dependent on  $x$ , we can rewrite this expression as  $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} |f(x)| = |f(c)|$ . This shows that  $f$  is continuous at  $c$ , and since  $c$  was chosen arbitrarily, we therefore have that  $f$  is continuous everywhere on  $\mathbb{R}$ .  $\square$