

## *Review Essay*

### **INSIDERS, OUTSIDE: THE SCOTS IRISH AND THE ENGLISH IN AMERICA**

*The People with No Name: Ireland's Ulster Scots, America's Scots Irish, and the Creation of a British Atlantic World, 1689-1764.* By Patrick Griffin. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2001. xv + 244 pp. Maps, notes, bibliography, and index. \$55.00 (cloth); \$19.95 (paper).

*Accent on Privilege: English Identities and Anglophilia in the United States.* By Katherine W. Jones. Philadelphia, Pennsylvania: Temple University Press. 2001. xii + 284 pp. Notes, bibliography, and index. \$69.50 (cloth); \$19.95 (paper).

On the face of it these two works seem to be an odd pairing for a review essay. Griffin, a historian, examines the complex nature of ethnic identity among the Northern Ireland Presbyterians who emigrated to America in the eighteenth century, while Jones, a sociologist, studies the experience of modern-day middle-class English migrants living in the northeastern United States. Griffin's work includes copious amounts of primary research in church record and private papers, while the core of Jones's book is thirty-four interviews conducted by herself in the mid-1990s. Despite the contrasts in topic and style the books have an important commonality. Both explore identities, and the fluid nature of these, among groups who usually **do** not attract the attention of ethnographers and historians. Work on the Scots Irish usually emphasizes how quickly they became American as the pioneers of the colonial backcountry and the vanguard of the American revolution. Similarly, the United States has deep English roots and, as Jones's title highlights, the only "problem" the English had to deal with was the love and admiration of the native population. These books emphasize that both stories were/are a lot more complicated.

Griffin takes up the question of identity immediately. While the Ulster Presbyterians "played a formative role in the transition from an English to a British Atlantic," he believes that this transatlantic migration of the Scots Irish, which became significant from 1718 on, did nothing to solve an identity crisis formed in Ireland (p. 1). Having lived in Ireland for generations, the title Scot no longer fit them, yet these northern dissenters were not really Irish either. They fell between the two definitions prevalent; the native dispossessed, Catholic, Jacobite

they bestow respect and prestige upon him. This exchange-of-gifts principle applies to Haitian Americans of lesser means as well.

In the book's middle chapters, Glick Schiller and Fouron identify a morality of knowledge or awareness of the Haitian and Haitian-American situation that crosses gender, generational, and international boundaries. Their discussion about women and second-generation Haitian Americans reveals not only the persistence of the kinship principle but also the diversity of voices in the language of long-distance nationalism. Georges' painful experiences with American racism and nativism underscore the immigrant's difficulties in overcoming racial and ethnic stereotypes.

In the later chapters, Glick Schiller and Fouron's analysis of transnationalism and the state in the age of globalization encounters some problems at the intersection of theory and history. Being neither an ethnohistory nor a history of immigration, this ethnographic study obscures the role that the state plays in making possible two historical processes. One process is how kinship becomes citizenship; the other is how immigrants become citizens. Since the territorial state is both a legal construct and a social force, its interaction with the corresponding population shapes political identities, values, rights, privileges, and choices. The activism of Glick Schiller and Fouron's *transborder citizens* in the "responsible state" or the "apparent state" raises unanswered questions because political awareness, or participation in a community, is not the same as having legal rights or citizenship in a state.

Despite these problems, this fascinating study offers revealing insights into the world of Haitian Americans. Some readers may find the insertion of italicized autobiographical statements distracting, but this is a work that does straddle the academic and the popular.

Lester P. Lee, Jr.  
Northeastern University