X

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK	USDC SERVY DOCUMENT ELECTRONIC ALEX FILE) DOC # DATE HILED 2/21/14
OUMOU BAH, AS THE ADMINISTRATOR OF THE ESTATE OF MOHAMED BAH,  Plaintiff,	STIPULATION AND PROTECTIVE ORDER
-against-	
THE CITY OF NEW YORK, ET AL.,	13-CV-6690-PKC-KNF
Defendants.	13-C v-0090-3 RC-IMIT

WHEREAS, the parties herein intend to produce certain documents pursuant to Rule 26 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure that they deem to be confidential or otherwise inappropriate for public disclosure; and

WHEREAS, the parties will only produce these documents if appropriate protection for their confidentiality is assured; and

WHEREAS, good cause exists for the entry of an order pursuant to Rule 26(c) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure;

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and between the attorneys for plaintiff and defendants, as follows:

- 1. As used herein, "Action" shall mean the above stated action.
- 2. As used herein, "Confidential Materials" shall mean a) New York City Police Department ("NYPD") personnel records, b) decedent's financial records or social security numbers; c) decedent's criminal history, if any, including but not limited to, arrests, indictments, and police reports; d) decedent's medical records; e) medical records for Members of the Service for treatment relating to the underlying incident; f) records of investigations

regarding the conduct of Members of the Service conducted by the NYPD or any other agency; g) documents that the parties agree are subject to this Order; and h) any document that the Court directs to be produced subject to this Order. Such documents and information shall not be deemed "Confidential Materials" to the extent, and only to the extent, that they are: (a) obtained by plaintiff from sources other than defendants, or (b) are otherwise publicly available.

- 3. As used herein, "Producing Party" shall mean the party requesting that a particular document or the information contained therein be deemed confidential, and "Receiving Party" shall mean any party who is not the "Producing Party," as defined herein, for that document or information.
- 4. A Receiving Party and that party's attorneys shall not use Confidential Materials produced in discovery in the Action for any purpose other than the evaluation, preparation, presentation or settlement of claims or defenses in the Action.
- 5. Attorneys for a Receiving Party shall not disclose the Confidential Materials to any person other than a party, an attorney of record for that party, or any member of the staff of that attorney's office, except under the following conditions:
  - a. Disclosure may be made only if necessary to the preparation or presentation of a party's claims or defenses in the action.
  - b. Disclosure before trial may also be made to an expert or consultant who has been retained or specially employed by party's attorney in this action in anticipation of litigation or preparation for this action, to a witness at deposition or in preparation for testimony at a deposition or trial, or to the Court.
  - c. Defendants' attorneys may also disclose the Confidential Materials to the New York City Police Department, the New York City Comptroller's Office, and the New York City Mayor's Office, solely in connection with the defense or settlement of this Action.
  - d. Before any disclosure is made to a person listed in subparagraph (b) above (other than to the Court or to a witness at a deposition), the

Receiving Party's attorney shall provide each such person with a copy of this Stipulation and Protective Order, and such person shall consent in writing, in the form annexed hereto as Exhibit A, not to use the Confidential Materials for any purpose other than in connection with the prosecution, defense, or settlement of this case and not to further disclose the Confidential Materials, except in testimony taken in this case. The attorneys for a Receiving Party making such disclosures shall retain the signed consent and furnish a copy to the Producing Party's attorney upon request at a deposition or immediately before trial, although the name of an expert that the Receiving Party does not intend to call as a trial witness may be redacted from such a consent before it is produced.

- e. Disclosure of medical records deemed "Confidential" under this Protective Order may also be made to any individual who provided the treatment described in the records or to a member of the staff of the hospital, doctor's office, or medical provider where the treatment was rendered.
- 6. The Producing Party or its counsel may designate deposition exhibits or portions of deposition transcripts as Confidential either by: (a) indicating on the record during the deposition that a question relates to Confidential Materials, in which event the reporter will bind the transcript of the designated testimony in a separate volume and mark it as "Confidential Information Governed by Protective Order;" or (b) notifying the reporter and all counsel of record, in writing, within 30 days after a deposition has concluded, of the specific pages and lines of the transcript that are to be designated "Confidential," in which event all counsel receiving the transcript will be responsible for marking the copies of the designated transcript in their possession or under the control as directed by the Producing Party or that party's counsel.
- 7. If a Receiving Party objects to the designation of any Confidential Materials as confidential, he or she shall state such objection in writing to counsel for the Producing Party, and counsel shall in good faith attempt to resolve such conflict. If the conflict cannot be resolved among counsel, the objecting party shall, within 45 days of the initial objection, request the Court to remove the designation. Any such materials or information shall

be treated as Confidential until the parties resolve the conflict or the Court issues its ruling regarding the conflict.

- 8. Any party seeking to file papers with the Court that incorporate Confidential Materials or reveal the contents thereof shall first make an application to the Court for permission to file under seal the specific portions of those papers disclosing Confidential Materials and shall indicate whether any other party objects to that request. No materials shall be filed under seal unless the Court has issued an order approving the filing, in which event the filing shall follow the District Court rules applicable to filing under seal.
- 9.\* Nothing in this Stipulation and Protective Order shall be construed to limit a Producing Party's use of its own Confidential Materials in any manner, or to limit the use of Confidential Materials or their contents to the extent that they are publicly available or have been provided to a party through other lawful means, such as a FOIL request.
- 10. This Protective Order will survive the termination of the litigation and will continue to be binding upon all persons to whom Confidential Materials are produced or disclosed. All documents or information that have been deemed confidential pursuant to this order, including all copies and non-conforming copies thereof, shall remain confidential for all time. Once the Action has been resolved, including all appeals, the Confidential Materials, including all copies and non-conforming copies thereof, shall not be used by the Receiving Party for any purpose without prior Court approval.
- 11. The Court will retain jurisdiction over all persons subject to this Protective Order to the extent necessary to enforce any obligations arising hereunder or to impose sanctions for any contempt thereof. Additionally, the Court reserves the right, in its sole discretion, to modify this Protective Order at any time.

12. Nothing in this Stipulation and Protective Order shall be construed to limit the producing parties' use of their respective Confidential Materials in any manner.

Dated: February 19, 2014 New York, New York

NEWMAN FERRARA LLP Attorney for Plaintiff 1250 Broadway, 27<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, NY 10001 (212) 619-5400

Ву:

Randolph McLaughlin

FRANCISCUS L. DIABA Attorney for Plaintiff 375 Park Ave., Suite 2607 New York, New York 10125 (212) 634-9974

Franciscus L. Diaba

MAYO BARTLETT Attorney for Plaintiff 81 Main Street, Suite 118 White Plains, New York, 10601 (914) 2243086

By: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_Mavo Bartlett

ZACHARY W. CARTER
Corporation Counsel of the City of New York
Attorney for Defendants
THE CITY OF NEW YORK, JOSEPH
MCCORMACK, MICHAEL LICITRA,
ROBERT GALLITELLI, BRIAN STANTON,

ESMERALDA SANTANA and VINCENT
JOHNSON

100 Church Street, Room 3-162 New York, New York 10007 (212) 356-2324

By:

Barry Myrvold/Ashley Garman

Kay ufel

,	Protective Order shall be construed to limit the	
producing parties' use of their respective Confidential Materials in any manner.		
Dated: February, 2014 New York, New York		
NEWMAN FERRARA LLP  Attorney for Plaintiff 1250 Broadway, 27th Floor New York, NY 10001 (212) 619-5400  By: Randelph McLaughlin  FRANCISCUS L. DIABA Attorney for Plaintiff 375 Park Ave., Suite 2607	ZACHARY W. CARTER Corporation Counsel of the City of New York Attorney for Defendants THE CITY OF NEW YORK, JOSEPH MCCORMACK, MICHAEL LICITRA, ROBERT GALLITELLI, BRIAN STANTON, ESMERALDA SANTANA and VINCENT JOHNSON 100 Church Street, Room 3-162 New York, New York 10007 (212) 356-2324	
New York, New York 10125 (212) 634-9974	By: Barry Myrvold/Ashley Garman	

MAYO BARTLETT Attorney for Plaintiff 81 Main Street, Suite 118 White Plains, New York, 10601 (914) 2243086

Franciscus L. Diaba

By: May Portly

ABDULWALI MUHAMMAD

Attorney for Plaintiff 81 Main Street, Suite 118 White Plains, New York, 10601 (914) 2243086

By: Abdulwali Muhammad

SO ORDERED: 2 121114

KEVIN N. FOX, SKHEF & S.M.J.

## EXHIBIT A

The undersigned hereby acknowledges that he has	read the Stipulation and Protective
Order entered in the United States District Court for the	Southern District of New York dated
February, 2014 in the action entitled <u>Oumou Bah</u> ,	as Administrator of the Estate of
Mohamed Bah v. The City of New York, et. al., 13 CV 60	690(PKC)(KNF) and understands the
terms thereof. The undersigned agrees not to use the Conf	idential Materials defined therein for
any purpose other than in connection with the prosecution	on of this case, and will not further
disclose the Confidential Materials except in testimony take	n in this case.
Date	Signature

Print Name

Occupation