

Exercise 3 Given the knowledge base (KB) $\mathcal{K} = \langle \mathcal{T}, \mathcal{A} \rangle$, where \mathcal{T} is the following TBox:

$$\begin{aligned} A &\sqsubseteq B \sqcup C \\ B &\sqsubseteq \exists r.D \\ C &\sqsubseteq \exists r.E \\ A &\sqsubseteq \forall r.F \\ D \sqcap F &\sqsubseteq G \end{aligned}$$

and \mathcal{A} is the following ABox:

$$A(a)$$

1. using the tableau method, tell whether the concept assertion $\exists r.(E \sqcap G)(a)$ is entailed by \mathcal{K} ;
2. using the tableau method, tell whether the concept assertion $(\exists r.E) \sqcap (\exists r.G)(a)$ is entailed by \mathcal{K} .

1)

NNF: $\text{not}(\text{Exist } r. (E \text{ and } G))(a) \rightarrow (\text{Forall } r. \text{not}(E \text{ and } G))(a) \rightarrow (\text{Forall } r. \text{not } E \text{ or not } G)(a)$

$A_0 = \{A(a), (\text{Forall } r. \text{not } E \text{ or not } G)(a)\}$

$C_GCI = (\text{not } A \text{ or } B \text{ or } C) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \text{ or Exist } r. D) \text{ and } (\text{not } C \text{ or Exists } r. E) \text{ and } (\text{not } A \text{ or Forall } r. F) \text{ and } (\text{not } (D \text{ and } F) \text{ or } G)$

NNF: $\text{not}(D \text{ and } F) \rightarrow \text{not } D \text{ or not } F$

$C_GCI = (\text{not } A \text{ or } B \text{ or } C) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \text{ or Exist } r. D) \text{ and } (\text{not } C \text{ or Exists } r. E) \text{ and } (\text{not } A \text{ or Forall } r. F) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ or not } F \text{ or } G)$

(C_GCI-rule) $A_1 = A_0 \text{ union } \{((\text{not } A \text{ or } B \text{ or } C) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \text{ or Exist } r. D) \text{ and } (\text{not } C \text{ or Exists } r. E) \text{ and } (\text{not } A \text{ or Forall } r. F) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ or not } F \text{ or } G))(a)\}$

(and-rule) $A_2 = A_1 \text{ union } \{(\text{not } A \text{ or } B \text{ or } C)(a), (\text{not } B \text{ or Exist } r. D)(a), (\text{not } C \text{ or Exists } r. E)(a), (\text{not } A \text{ or Forall } r. F)(a), (\text{not } D \text{ or not } F \text{ or } G)(a)\}$

(or-rule) $A_3 = A_2 \text{ union } \{\text{not } A(a)\}$ - CLASH

$A_4 = A_2 \text{ union } \{(\text{Forall } r. F)(a)\}$

(or-rule) $A_5 = A_4 \text{ union } \{\text{not } A(a)\}$ - CLASH

$A_6 = A_4 \text{ union } \{B(a)\}$

$A_7 = A_4 \text{ union } \{C(a)\}$

(or-rule) $A_8 = A_6 \text{ union } \{\text{not } B(a)\}$ - CLASH

$A_9 = A_6 \text{ union } \{(\text{Exists } r. D)(a)\}$

(or-rule) $A_{10} = A_9 \text{ union } \{\text{not } C(a)\}$

$A_{11} = A_9 \text{ union } \{(\text{Exists } r. E)(a)\}$

(or-rule) $A_{12} = A_{10} \text{ union } \{\text{not } D(a)\}$

$A_{13} = A_{10} \text{ union } \{\text{not } F(a)\}$

$A_{14} = A_{10} \text{ union } \{G(a)\}$

(Exist-rule) $A_{15} = A_{12} \text{ union } \{D(x), r(a, x)\}$

(C_GCI-rule) $A_{16} = A_{15} \text{ union } \{((\text{not } A \text{ or } B \text{ or } C) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \text{ or Exist } r. D) \text{ and } (\text{not } C \text{ or Exists } r. E) \text{ and } (\text{not } A \text{ or Forall } r. F) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ or not } F \text{ or } G))(x)\}$

(and-rule) $A_{17} = A_{16} \text{ union } \{(\text{not } A \text{ or } B \text{ or } C)(x), (\text{not } B \text{ or Exist } r. D)(x), (\text{not } C \text{ or Exists } r. E)(x), (\text{not } A \text{ or Forall } r. F)(x), (\text{not } D \text{ or not } F \text{ or } G)(x)\}$

(Forall-rule) $A_{18} = A_{17} \text{ union } \{F(x)\}$

(or-rule) $A19 = A18 \cup \{\text{not } D(x)\}$ - CLASH
 $A20 = A18 \cup \{\text{not } F(x)\}$ - CLASH
 $A21 = A18 \cup \{G(x)\}$
 (Forall-rule) $A22 = A21 \cup \{\text{not } G(x)\}$ - CLASH
 $A23 = A21 \cup \{\text{not } E(x)\}$
 (or-rule) $A24 = A23 \cup \{\text{not } A(x)\}$
 $A25 = A23 \cup \{(Forall\ r.\ F)(x)\}$
 (or-rule) $A26 = A24 \cup \{\text{not } B(x)\}$
 $A27 = A24 \cup \{(Exists\ r.\ D)(x)\}$
 (or-rule) $A28 = A26 \cup \{\text{not } C(x)\}$ - open and complete
 $A29 = A26 \cup \{(Exists\ r.\ E)(x)\}$

Tableau return true, the instance checking problem is false

2)

NNF: $\text{not } ((Exists\ r.\ E) \text{ and } (Exists\ r.\ G))(a) \rightarrow (\text{not } (Exists\ r.\ E) \text{ or } \text{not } (Exists\ r.\ G))(a) \rightarrow$
 $(Forall\ r.\ \text{not } E \text{ or } Forall\ r.\ \text{not } G)(a)$

$A0 = \{A(a), (Forall\ r.\ \text{not } E \text{ or } Forall\ r.\ \text{not } G)(a)\}$
 $C_GCI = (\text{not } A \text{ or } B \text{ or } C) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \text{ or } Exist\ r.\ D) \text{ and } (\text{not } C \text{ or } Exists\ r.\ E) \text{ and } (\text{not } A \text{ or } Forall\ r.\ F)$
 $\text{and } (\text{not } (D \text{ and } F) \text{ or } G)$

NNF: $\text{not}(D \text{ and } F) \rightarrow \text{not } D \text{ or } \text{not } F$

$C_GCI = (\text{not } A \text{ or } B \text{ or } C) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \text{ or } Exist\ r.\ D) \text{ and } (\text{not } C \text{ or } Exists\ r.\ E) \text{ and } (\text{not } A \text{ or } Forall\ r.\ F)$
 $\text{and } (\text{not } D \text{ or } \text{not } F \text{ or } G)$
 (C_GCI-rule) $A1 = A0 \cup \{((\text{not } A \text{ or } B \text{ or } C) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \text{ or } Exist\ r.\ D) \text{ and } (\text{not } C \text{ or } Exists\ r.\ E) \text{ and } (\text{not } A \text{ or } Forall\ r.\ F) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ or } \text{not } F \text{ or } G))(a)\}$
 (and-rule) $A2 = A1 \cup \{(\text{not } A \text{ or } B \text{ or } C)(a), (\text{not } B \text{ or } Exist\ r.\ D)(a), (\text{not } C \text{ or } Exists\ r.\ E)(a), (\text{not } A \text{ or } Forall\ r.\ F)(a), (\text{not } D \text{ or } \text{not } F \text{ or } G)(a)\}$
 (or-rule) $A3 = A2 \cup \{\text{not } A(a)\}$ - CLASH
 $A4 = A2 \cup \{B(a)\}$
 $A5 = A2 \cup \{C(a)\}$
 (or-rule) $A6 = A4 \cup \{\text{not } B(a)\}$ - CLASH
 $A7 = A4 \cup \{(Exist\ r.\ D)(a)\}$
 (or-rule) $A8 = A7 \cup \{\text{not } C(a)\}$
 $A9 = A7 \cup \{(Exists\ r.\ E)(a)\}$
 (or-rule) $A10 = A8 \cup \{\text{not } A(a)\}$ - CLASH
 $A11 = A8 \cup \{(Forall\ r.\ F)(a)\}$
 (or-rule) $A12 = A11 \cup \{\text{not } D(a)\}$
 $A13 = A11 \cup \{\text{not } F(a)\}$
 $A14 = A11 \cup \{G(a)\}$
 (Exist -rule) $A15 = A12 \cup \{D(x), r(a,x)\}$

(C_GCI-rule) $A16 = A15 \cup \{((\neg A \vee B \vee C) \wedge (\neg B \vee \exists r. D) \wedge (\neg C \vee \exists r. E) \wedge (\neg A \vee \forall r. F) \wedge (\neg D \vee \neg F \vee G))(x)\}$
 (and-rule) $A17 = A16 \cup \{(\neg A \vee B \vee C)(x), (\neg B \vee \exists r. D)(x), (\neg C \vee \exists r. E)(x), (\neg A \vee \forall r. F)(x), (\neg D \vee \neg F \vee G)(x)\}$
 (Forall -rule) $A18 = A17 \cup \{F(x)\}$
 (or-rule) $A19 = A18 \cup \{\neg D(x)\}$ - CLASH
 $A20 = A18 \cup \{\neg F(x)\}$ - CLASH
 $A21 = A18 \cup \{G(x)\}$
 (or-rule) $A22 = A18 \cup \{(\forall r. \neg G)(a)\}$
 $A23 = A18 \cup \{(\forall r. \neg E)(a)\}$
 (Forall-rule) $A24 = A22 \cup \{\neg G(x)\}$ -CLASH
 $A25 = A23 \cup \{\neg E(x)\}$
 (or-rule) $A26 = A25 \cup \{\neg A(x)\}$
 $A27 = A25 \cup \{(\forall r. F)(x)\}$
 (or-rule) $A28 = A26 \cup \{\neg B(x)\}$
 $A29 = A26 \cup \{(\exists r. D)(x)\}$
 (or-rule) $A30 = A28 \cup \{\neg C(x)\}$ - open and complete
 $A31 = A28 \cup \{(\exists r. E)(x)\}$

Tableau return true, so the instance checking problem is false