

Exercise 1 Given the following \mathcal{ALC} TBox:

$$\begin{array}{lcl} A & \sqsubseteq & B \\ A \sqcap C & \sqsubseteq & D \\ \forall R.D & \sqsubseteq & \neg E \\ \exists R.\neg D & \sqsubseteq & \neg E \\ D & \sqsubseteq & \neg B \end{array}$$

- (a) tell whether the TBox \mathcal{T} is satisfiable, and if so, show a model for \mathcal{T} ;
- (b) tell whether the concept E is satisfiable with respect to \mathcal{T} , and if so, show a model for \mathcal{T} where the interpretation of E is non-empty;
- (c) given the ABox $\mathcal{A} = \{A(a)\}$, tell whether the knowledge base $\langle \mathcal{T}, \mathcal{A} \rangle$ entails the assertion $\exists \neg E(a)$, explaining your answer;
- (d) given the ABox $\mathcal{A} = \{A \sqcap C(a)\}$, tell whether the knowledge base $\langle \mathcal{T}, \mathcal{A} \rangle$ is satisfiable (consistent), explaining your answer.

a)

$$\Delta^I = \{a\}$$

$$A^I = C^I = D^I = B^I = E^I = r^I = \text{empty set}$$

All axioms are satisfied, I is a model for \mathcal{T}

b)

It is not possible to have E satisfiable, so an interpretation that it is a model of \mathcal{T} and E is non empty because if E is non empty also $(\forall r. \neg D)$ and $(\exists r. D)$ should contain the same elements and this is not possible.

c)

$$A = \{A(a)\}$$

$$\text{NNF: } \neg(\exists r. \neg E) \rightarrow \forall r. E$$

$$A_0 = \{A(a), (\forall r. E)(a)\}$$

$$C_GCI = (\neg A \text{ or } B) \text{ and } (\neg (A \text{ and } C) \text{ or } D) \text{ and } (\neg (\forall r. D) \text{ or } \neg E) \text{ and } (\neg (\exists r. \neg D) \text{ or } \neg E) \text{ and } (\neg D \text{ or } \neg B)$$

NNF:

$$\neg (A \text{ and } C) \rightarrow \neg A \text{ or } \neg C$$

$$\neg (\forall r. D) \rightarrow \exists r. \neg D$$

$$\neg (\exists r. \neg D) \rightarrow \forall r. D$$

$$C_GCI = (\neg A \text{ or } B) \text{ and } (\neg A \text{ or } \neg C \text{ or } D) \text{ and } (\exists r. \neg D \text{ or } \neg E) \text{ and } (\forall r. D \text{ or } \neg E) \text{ and } (\neg D \text{ or } \neg B)$$

$$(C_GCI\text{-rule}) A_1 = A_0 \text{ union } \{((\neg A \text{ or } B) \text{ and } (\neg A \text{ or } \neg C \text{ or } D) \text{ and } (\exists r. \neg D \text{ or } \neg E) \text{ and } (\forall r. D \text{ or } \neg E) \text{ and } (\neg D \text{ or } \neg B))\}$$

$D \text{ or not } E) \text{ and } (\text{Forall } r. D \text{ or not } E) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ or not } B))(a)\}$
 (and-rule) $A2 = A1 \text{ union } \{(\text{not } A \text{ or } B)(a), (\text{not } A \text{ or not } C \text{ or } D) (a), (\text{Exist } r. \text{ not } D \text{ or not } E)(a), (\text{Forall } r. D \text{ or not } E)(a), (\text{not } D \text{ or not } B)(a)\}$
 (or-rule) $A3 = A2 \text{ union } \{\text{not } A(a)\}$ - CLASH
 $A4 = A2 \text{ union } \{B(a)\}$
 (or-rule) $A5 = A4 \text{ union } \{\text{not } B(a)\}$ - CLASH
 $A6 = A4 \text{ union } \{\text{not } D(a)\}$
 (or-rule) $A7 = A6 \text{ union } \{D(a)\}$ - CLASH
 $A8 = A6 \text{ union } \{\text{not } A(a)\}$ - CLASH
 $A9 = A6 \text{ union } \{\text{not } C(a)\}$
 (or-rule) $A10 = A9 \text{ union } \{\text{not } E(a)\}$ - CLASH
 $A11 = A9 \text{ union } \{(\text{Forall } r. D)(a)\}$
 (or-rule) $A12 = A11 \text{ union } \{\text{not } E(a)\}$ - CLASH
 $A13 = A12 \text{ union } \{(\text{Exist } r. \text{ not } D)(a)\}$
 (Exist-rule) $A14 = A13 \text{ union } \{\text{not } D(x), r(a,x)\}$
 (C_GCI-rule) $A15 = A14 \text{ union } \{((\text{not } A \text{ or } B) \text{ and } (\text{not } A \text{ or not } C \text{ or } D) \text{ and } (\text{Exist } r. \text{ not } D \text{ or not } E) \text{ and } (\text{Forall } r. D \text{ or not } E) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ or not } B))(x)\}$
 (and-rule) $A16 = A15 \text{ union } \{(\text{not } A \text{ or } B)(x), (\text{not } A \text{ or not } C \text{ or } D) (x), (\text{Exist } r. \text{ not } D \text{ or not } E)(x), (\text{Forall } r. D \text{ or not } E)(x), (\text{not } D \text{ or not } B)(x)\}$
 (Forall-rule) $A17 = A16 \text{ union } \{D(x)\}$ - CLASH

All Aboxes are closed, so tableau return false so the instance checking is true

d)

$A = \{(A \text{ and } C)(a)\}$

(and-rule) $A0 = \{A(a), C(a)\}$

$C_GCI = (\text{not } A \text{ or } B) \text{ and } (\text{not } (A \text{ and } C) \text{ or } D) \text{ and } (\text{not } (\text{Forall } r. D) \text{ or not } E) \text{ and } (\text{not } (\text{Exist } r. \text{ not } D) \text{ or not } E) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ or not } B)$

NNF:

$\text{not } (A \text{ and } C) \rightarrow \text{not } A \text{ or not } C$

$\text{Not } (\text{forall } r. D) \rightarrow \text{Exist } r. \text{ not } D$

$\text{Not } (\text{Exists } r. \text{ not } D) \rightarrow \text{Forall } r. D$

$C_GCI = (\text{not } A \text{ or } B) \text{ and } (\text{not } A \text{ or not } C \text{ or } D) \text{ and } (\text{Exist } r. \text{ not } D \text{ or not } E) \text{ and } (\text{Forall } r. D \text{ or not } E) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ or not } B)$

(C_GCI-rule) $A1 = A0 \cup \{((\text{not } A \text{ or } B) \text{ and } (\text{not } A \text{ or not } C \text{ or } D) \text{ and } (\text{Exist } r. \text{ not } D \text{ or not } E) \text{ and } (\text{Forall } r. D \text{ or not } E) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ or not } B))(a)\}$
 (and-rule) $A2 = A1 \cup \{(\text{not } A \text{ or } B)(a), (\text{not } A \text{ or not } C \text{ or } D)(a), (\text{Exist } r. \text{ not } D \text{ or not } E)(a), (\text{Forall } r. D \text{ or not } E)(a), (\text{not } D \text{ or not } B)(a)\}$
 (or-rule) $A3 = A2 \cup \{\text{not } A(a)\}$ - CLASH
 $A4 = A2 \cup \{B(a)\}$
 (or-rule) $A5 = A4 \cup \{\text{not } B(a)\}$ - CLASH
 $A6 = A4 \cup \{\text{not } D(a)\}$
 (or-rule) $A7 = A6 \cup \{\text{not } A(a)\}$ - CLASH
 $A8 = A6 \cup \{\text{not } C(a)\}$ - CLASH
 $A9 = A6 \cup \{D(a)\}$ - CLASH

Tableau return false, KB is unsatisfiable