

Exercise 1 Given the following  $\mathcal{ALC}$  TBox:

$A$	$\sqsubseteq$	$\neg F$
$B \sqcap F$	$\sqsubseteq$	$\exists R.H$
$C$	$\sqsubseteq$	$D \sqcup E$
$D$	$\sqsubseteq$	$F \sqcap \forall R.A$
$E$	$\sqsubseteq$	$\exists R.G$
$H$	$\sqsubseteq$	$F$

- (a) tell whether the TBox  $\mathcal{T}$  is satisfiable, and if so, show a model for  $\mathcal{T}$ ;  
 (b) tell whether the concept  $C$  is satisfiable with respect to  $\mathcal{T}$ , and if so, show a model for  $\mathcal{T}$  where  $C$  is satisfiable;  
 (c) tell whether the concept  $B \sqcap D$  is satisfiable with respect to  $\mathcal{T}$ , and if so, show a model for  $\mathcal{T}$  where  $B \sqcap D$  is satisfiable;  
 (d) given the ABox  $\mathcal{A} = \{B(a), C(a)\}$ , tell whether the knowledge base  $\langle \mathcal{T}, \mathcal{A} \rangle$  entails the assertion  $E(a)$ , explaining your answer.

a)

$$\Delta^I = \{a\}$$

$$A^I = F^I = B^I = H^I = C^I = D^I = E^I = G^I = r^I = \text{empty set}$$

$I$  is a model for  $\mathcal{T}$ ,  $\mathcal{T}$  is satisfiable

b)

$C$  is satisfiable, if  $I$  is a model for  $\mathcal{T}$  and  $C^I$  is non empty

$C^I$  is non empty if  $D^I$  or  $E^I$  non empty

$$\Delta^{I'} = \{a\}$$

$$D^{I'} = F^{I'} = A^{I'} = H^{I'} = \text{empty set}$$

$$C^{I'} = \{a\}$$

$$E^{I'} = \{a\}$$

$$G^{I'} = \{a\}$$

$$r^{I'} = \{(a, a)\}$$

$$(\text{Exists } r. G)^{I'} = \{a\}$$

$I'$  is a model for  $\mathcal{T}$  and  $C^{I'}$  is non empty,  $C$  is satisfiable

c)

If  $D$  is non empty means that  $F$  should be non empty and Forall  $r. A$  is non empty.

$A$  is non empty if not  $F$  is non empty.

Then If  $B$  is non empty, also  $B$  and  $F$  should be non empty, and this means that Exists  $r. H$  should be non empty but  $H$  is non empty if  $F$  is non empty

So at the end we need to have Forall  $r. \text{not } F$  and Exists  $r. F$  that should be non empty. They are non empty but the problem is that the intersection between them should be always empty because we cannot have an element of Forall  $r. \text{not } F$  that is equal to element of Exists  $r. F$  because in  $F$  and not  $F$  there are opposite elements.

For example we have

$$\Delta^I = \{a, b\}$$

$$F^I = \{a\}$$

$$(\text{Not } F)^I = \{b\}$$

$$r^I = \{(a, b), (b, a)\}$$

$$(\text{Exists } r. F)^I = \{b\}$$

$$(\text{Forall } r. \text{not } F)^I = \{a\}$$

$$((\text{Exists } r. F) \text{ and } (\text{Forall } r. \text{not } F))^I = \text{empty set}$$

d)

$$A_0 = \{B(a), C(a), \text{not } E(a)\}$$

$$C\_GCI = (\text{not } A \text{ or } \text{not } F) \text{ and } (\text{not } (B \text{ and } F) \text{ or } \text{Exists } r. H) \text{ and } (\text{not } C \text{ or } D \text{ or } E) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ or } (F \text{ and } \text{Forall } r. A) \text{ and } (\text{not } E \text{ or } \text{Exists } r. G) \text{ and } (\text{not } H \text{ or } F))$$

$$\text{NNF: } \text{not}(B \text{ and } F) \rightarrow \text{not } B \text{ or } \text{not } F$$

$$C\_GCI = (\text{not } A \text{ or } \text{not } F) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \text{ or } \text{not } F \text{ or } \text{Exists } r. H) \text{ and } (\text{not } C \text{ or } D \text{ or } E) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ or } (F \text{ and } \text{Forall } r. A) \text{ and } (\text{not } E \text{ or } \text{Exists } r. G) \text{ and } (\text{not } H \text{ or } F))$$

$$(C\_GCI \text{-rule}) A_1 = A_0 \text{ union } \{((\text{not } A \text{ or } \text{not } F) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \text{ or } \text{not } F \text{ or } \text{Exists } r. H) \text{ and } (\text{not } C \text{ or } D \text{ or } E) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ or } (F \text{ and } \text{Forall } r. A) \text{ and } (\text{not } E \text{ or } \text{Exists } r. G) \text{ and } (\text{not } H \text{ or } F)))(a)\}$$

$$(\text{and-rule}) A_2 = A_1 \text{ union } \{(\text{not } A \text{ or } \text{not } F)(a), (\text{not } B \text{ or } \text{not } F \text{ or } \text{Exists } r. H)(a), (\text{not } C \text{ or } D \text{ or } E)(a), (\text{not } D \text{ or } (F \text{ and } \text{Forall } r. A)(a), (\text{not } E \text{ or } \text{Exists } r. G)(a), (\text{not } H \text{ or } F)(a)\}$$

$$(\text{or-rule}) A_3 = A_2 \text{ union } \{\text{not } B(a)\} \text{ -CLASH}$$

$$A_4 = A_2 \text{ union } \{\text{not } F(a)\}$$

$$A_5 = A_2 \text{ union } \{(\text{Exists } r. H)(a)\}$$

$$(\text{or-rule}) A_6 = A_4 \text{ union } \{(F \text{ and } \text{Forall } r. A)(a)\}$$

$$A_7 = A_4 \text{ union } \{\text{not } D(a)\}$$

$$(\text{and-rule}) A_8 = A_6 \text{ union } \{F(a), (\text{Forall } r. A)(a)\} \text{ - CLASH}$$

$$(\text{or-rule}) A_9 = A_7 \text{ union } \{\text{not } C(a)\} \text{ - CLASH}$$

$$A_{10} = A_7 \text{ union } \{D(a)\} \text{ - CLASH}$$

$$A_{11} = A_8 \text{ union } \{E(a)\} \text{ - CLASH}$$

$$(\text{or-rule}) A_{12} = A_5 \text{ union } \{\text{not } C(a)\} \text{ - CLASH}$$

$$A_{13} = A_5 \text{ union } \{E(a)\} \text{ - CLASH}$$

$$A_{14} = A_5 \text{ union } \{D(a)\}$$

$$(\text{or-rule}) A_{15} = A_{14} \text{ union } \{\text{not } D(a)\} \text{ - CLASH}$$

$$A_{16} = A_{14} \text{ union } \{(F \text{ and } \text{Forall } r. A)(a)\}$$

$$(\text{and-rule}) A_{17} = A_{16} \text{ union } \{F(a), (\text{Forall } r. A)(a)\}$$

$$(\text{or-rule}) A_{18} = A_{17} \text{ union } \{\text{not } F(a)\} \text{ - CLASH}$$

$A_{19} = A_{17} \cup \{\neg A(a)\}$

(Exists-rule)  $A_{20} = A_{19} \cup \{r(a,x), H(x)\}$

(C\_GCI -rule)  $A_{21} = A_{20} \cup \{((\neg A \text{ or } \neg F) \text{ and } (\neg B \text{ or } \neg F \text{ or } \exists r. H) \text{ and } (\neg C \text{ or } D \text{ or } E) \text{ and } (\neg D \text{ or } (F \text{ and } \forall r. A) \text{ and } (\neg E \text{ or } \exists r. G) \text{ and } (\neg H \text{ or } F)) (x))\}$

(and-rule)  $A_{22} = A_{21} \cup \{(\neg A \text{ or } \neg F)(x), (\neg B \text{ or } \neg F \text{ or } \exists r. H)(x), (\neg C \text{ or } D \text{ or } E)(x), (\neg D \text{ or } (F \text{ and } \forall r. A)(x), (\neg E \text{ or } \exists r. G)(x), (\neg H \text{ or } F)(x)\}$

(or-rule)  $A_{23} = A_{22} \cup \{\neg H(x)\}$  - CLASH

$A_{24} = A_{22} \cup \{F(x)\}$

(or-rule)  $A_{25} = A_{24} \cup \{\neg F(x)\}$  - CLASH

$A_{26} = A_{24} \cup \{\neg A(x)\}$

(Forall-rule)  $A_{27} = A_{26} \cup \{A(x)\}$  - CLASH

All Aboxes are closed, tableau return false, the instance checking problem is true