

Exercise 1 Given the following  $\mathcal{ALC}$  TBox:

$$\begin{aligned} A &\sqsubseteq \exists R.C \\ B &\sqsubseteq \forall R.D \\ D &\sqsubseteq \neg C \\ E &\sqsubseteq A \sqcup \forall R.G \\ F &\sqsubseteq B \sqcup \exists R.C \\ G &\sqsubseteq D \end{aligned}$$

- tell whether the TBox  $\mathcal{T}$  is satisfiable, and if so, show a model for  $\mathcal{T}$ ;
- tell whether the concept  $E$  is satisfiable with respect to  $\mathcal{T}$ , and if so, show a model for  $\mathcal{T}$  where  $E$  is satisfiable;
- tell whether the concept  $E \sqcap F$  is satisfiable with respect to  $\mathcal{T}$ , and if so, show a model for  $\mathcal{T}$  where  $E \sqcap F$  is satisfiable;
- given the ABox  $\mathcal{A} = \{E(a), R(a, b)\}$ , tell whether the knowledge base  $\langle \mathcal{T}, \mathcal{A} \rangle$  entails the assertion  $C(b)$ , explaining your answer.

a)

$A^I = B^I = C^I = D^I = E^I = F^I = G^I = r^I = \text{empty set}$   
 $I$  is a model for TBox because it satisfies all axioms

b)

$E$  is satisfiable if there is a model  $I$  for  $\mathcal{T}$  and the interpretation  $I$  of  $E$  is non empty

If  $E$  is non empty  $A$  or  $\text{Forall } r. G$  should be non empty. So either  $A$  is non empty or  $\text{Forall } r. G$  is non empty.

$A$  is non empty if there is at least one participation of element  $C$  in the role  $r$ .

$\text{forall } r. G$  is non empty if  $\text{forall } r. D$  is non empty, so if  $\text{forall } r. \neg C$  is non empty

We can have a model for  $\mathcal{T}$  because I cannot see any contradictions

$$\Delta I^I = \{a\}$$

$$A^I = \{a\}$$

$$C^I = \{a\}$$

$$r^I = \{(a, a)\}$$

$$E^I = \{a\}$$

$$B^I = D^I = F^I = G^I = \text{empty set}$$

$I$  is a model for  $\mathcal{T}$  and  $B^I$  is non empty so  $B$  is satisfiable.

c)

If the interpretations of  $E$  and  $F$ ,  $E^I$  and  $F^I$ , should be non empty and the interpretation  $I$  is a model for  $\mathcal{T}$  then  $E$  and  $F$  is satisfiable

If  $E$  is non empty  $A$  or  $\text{Forall } r. G$  should be non empty. So either  $A$  is non empty or  $\text{Forall } r. G$  is non empty.

$A$  is non empty if there is at least one participation of element  $C$  in the role  $r$ .

$\text{forall } r. G$  is non empty if  $\text{forall } r. D$  is non empty, so if  $\text{forall } r. \neg C$  is non empty

If  $F$  is non empty  $B$  or  $\text{Exist } r. C$  should be non empty. So either  $B$  is non empty or  $\text{Exists } r. C$  is non empty.

$B$  is non empty if  $\text{Forall } r. D$  is non empty, so  $\text{forall } r. \neg C$ .

We can see that there is an interpretation that it is also a model for T in which F and E are non empty because in both concepts we need that there is at least one participation of element C in the role r

$$\Delta^{\mathcal{I}''} = \{a\}$$

$$A^{\mathcal{I}''} = \{a\}$$

$$C^{\mathcal{I}''} = \{a\}$$

$$r^{\mathcal{I}''} = \{(a,a)\}$$

$$E^{\mathcal{I}''} = \{a\}$$

$$F^{\mathcal{I}''} = \{a\}$$

$$B^{\mathcal{I}''} = D^{\mathcal{I}''} = G^{\mathcal{I}''} = \text{empty set}$$

E and F is satisfiable

d)

$$A_0 = \{E(a), r(a,b), \text{not } C(b)\}$$

$$C\_GCI = (\text{not } A \text{ or } \text{Exists } r. C) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \text{ or } \text{Forall } r. D) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ or } \text{not } C) \text{ and } (\text{not } E \text{ or } A \text{ or } \text{Forall } r. G) \text{ and } (\text{not } F \text{ or } B \text{ or } \text{Exist } r. C) \text{ and } (\text{not } G \text{ or } D)$$

$$(C\_GCI\text{-rule}) A_1 = A_0 \text{ union } \{((\text{not } A \text{ or } \text{Exists } r. C) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \text{ or } \text{Forall } r. D) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ or } \text{not } C) \text{ and } (\text{not } E \text{ or } A \text{ or } \text{Forall } r. G) \text{ and } (\text{not } F \text{ or } B \text{ or } \text{Exist } r. C) \text{ and } (\text{not } G \text{ or } D))(a)\}$$

$$(\text{and-rule}) A_2 = A_1 \text{ union } \{(\text{not } A \text{ or } \text{Exists } r. C)(a), (\text{not } B \text{ or } \text{Forall } r. D)(a), (\text{not } D \text{ or } \text{not } C)(a), (\text{not } E \text{ or } A \text{ or } \text{Forall } r. G)(a), (\text{not } F \text{ or } B \text{ or } \text{Exist } r. C)(a), (\text{not } G \text{ or } D)(a)\}$$

$$(\text{or-rule}) A_3 = A_2 \text{ union } \{\text{not } E(a)\} - \text{CLASH}$$

$$A_4 = A_2 \text{ union } \{(\text{Forall } r. G)(a)\}$$

$$A_5 = A_2 \text{ union } \{A(a)\}$$

$$(\text{Forall-rule}) A_6 = A_4 \text{ union } \{G(b)\}$$

$$(\text{or-rule}) A_7 = A_6 \text{ union } \{\text{not } F(a)\}$$

$$A_8 = A_6 \text{ union } \{B(a)\}$$

$$A_9 = A_6 \text{ union } \{(\text{Exist } r. C)(a)\}$$

$$(\text{or-rule}) A_{10} = A_7 \text{ union } \{\text{not } G(a)\}$$

$$A_{11} = A_7 \text{ union } \{D(a)\}$$

$$(\text{or-rule}) A_{12} = A_{10} \text{ union } \{\text{not } A(a)\}$$

$$A_{13} = A_{10} \text{ union } \{(\text{Exists } r. C)(a)\}$$

$$(\text{or-rule}) A_{14} = A_{12} \text{ union } \{\text{not } B(a)\}$$

$$A_{15} = A_{13} \text{ union } \{(\text{Forall } r. D)(a)\}$$

$$(\text{or-rule}) A_{16} = A_{14} \text{ union } \{\text{not } D(a)\}$$

$$A_{17} = A_{14} \text{ union } \{\text{not } C(a)\}$$

$$(C\_GCI\text{-rule}) A_{18} = A_{17} \text{ union } \{((\text{not } A \text{ or } \text{Exists } r. C) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \text{ or } \text{Forall } r. D) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ or } \text{not } C) \text{ and } (\text{not } E \text{ or } A \text{ or } \text{Forall } r. G) \text{ and } (\text{not } F \text{ or } B \text{ or } \text{Exist } r. C) \text{ and } (\text{not } G \text{ or } D))(b)\}$$

$$(\text{and-rule}) A_{19} = A_{18} \text{ union } \{(\text{not } A \text{ or } \text{Exists } r. C)(b), (\text{not } B \text{ or } \text{Forall } r. D)(b), (\text{not } D \text{ or } \text{not } C)(b), (\text{not } E \text{ or } A \text{ or } \text{Forall } r. G)(b), (\text{not } F \text{ or } B \text{ or } \text{Exist } r. C)(b), (\text{not } G \text{ or } D)(b)\}$$

$$(\text{or-rule}) A_{20} = A_{19} \text{ union } \{\text{not } A(b)\}$$

$$A_{21} = A_{19} \text{ union } \{(\text{Exist } r. C)(b)\}$$

$$(\text{or-rule}) A_{22} = A_{20} \text{ union } \{A(b)\} - \text{CLASH}$$

$$A_{23} = A_{20} \text{ union } \{\text{not } E(b)\}$$

$$A_{24} = A_{20} \text{ union } \{(\text{Forall } r. G)(b)\}$$

$$(\text{or-rule}) A_{25} = A_{23} \text{ union } \{\text{not } B(b)\}$$

$A_{26} = A_{23} \cup \{( \forall r. D)(b) \}$

(or-rule)  $A_{27} = A_{25} \cup \{B(b)\}$  - CLASH

$A_{28} = A_{25} \cup \{\text{not } F(b)\}$

$A_{29} = A_{25} \cup \{( \exists r. C)(b) \}$

(or-rule)  $A_{30} = A_{28} \cup \{\text{not } G(b)\}$  - open and complete

$A_{31} = A_{28} \cup \{D(b)\}$

Tableau return true, instance checking problem is false