

**Exercise 1** Given the following  $\mathcal{ALC}$  TBox:

$$\begin{array}{lcl} A & \sqsubseteq & B \sqcup C \\ B & \sqsubseteq & \exists R.D \\ C & \sqsubseteq & \forall R.\neg D \\ A & \sqsubseteq & \forall R.E \\ D \sqcap E & \sqsubseteq & \neg B \end{array}$$

- tell whether the TBox  $\mathcal{T}$  is satisfiable, and if so, show a model for  $\mathcal{T}$ ;
- tell whether the concept  $A$  is satisfiable with respect to  $\mathcal{T}$ , and if so, show a model for  $\mathcal{T}$  where the interpretation of  $A$  is non-empty;
- tell whether the concept  $B \sqcap C$  is satisfiable with respect to  $\mathcal{T}$ , and if so, show a model for  $\mathcal{T}$  where the interpretation of  $B$  is non-empty;
- given the ABox  $\mathcal{A} = \{A(a)\}$ , tell whether the knowledge base  $\langle \mathcal{T}, \mathcal{A} \rangle$  entails the assertion  $\exists R.E(a)$ , explaining your answer.

a)

A Tbox is satisfiable if there exist a model for T. If exists an interpretation I that satisfies all axioms in the T.

$$\Delta^I = \{a\}$$

$$A^I = B^I = C^I = D^I = E^I = r^I = \text{empty set}$$

$$A^I \subseteq (B \cup C)^I \quad \text{ok}$$

$$B^I \subseteq (\exists r. D)^I \quad \text{ok}$$

$$C^I \subseteq (\forall r. \neg D)^I \quad \text{ok}$$

$$A^I \subseteq (\forall r. E)^I \quad \text{ok}$$

$$(D \sqcap E)^I \subseteq (\neg B)^I \quad \text{ok}$$

I is a model for T

b)

A concept A is satisfiable w.r.t T if there exists an interpretation I in which this interpretation is a model of T and also the interpretation  $A^I$  is non empty.

If A is non empty B or C is non empty

If B is non empty means that  $\exists r. D$  should be non empty, so there will be at least one participation of an element of D in the role r.

$$\Delta^{I'} = \{a\}$$

$$r^{I'} = \{(a,a)\}$$

$$B^{I'} = \{\}$$

$$C^{I'} = \{a\} \quad (\text{Forall } r. \text{ not } D)^{I'} = \{a\}$$

$$D^{I'} = \{\} \quad (\text{not } D)^{I'} = \{a\}$$

$$E^{I'} = \{a\} \quad (\text{Forall } r. E)^{I'} = \{a\}$$

$$A^{I'} = \{a\}$$

The interpretation  $I'$  of  $A$  is non empty, so  $A$  is satisfiable w.r.t.  $T$

c)

$B$  is non empty if there exists at least one element of  $D$  that belong to  $r$  in the second position.  $C$  is non empty if there for participation of one element in the first position of the role  $r$ , the second element should belong to  $\text{not } D$ .

There is a contradiction because we cannot have the same element that belong to  $C$  and to  $B$ , because if we cannot have the same element in  $\text{not } D$  and  $D$ . For example in  $D^{I'} = \{a\}$

The interpretation of  $(\text{not } D)^{I'} = \{b\}$ .  $r^{I'} = \{(a,a)\}$   $(\text{exists } r. D) = \{a\}$  instead  $(\text{forall } r. \text{ not } D)^{I'} = \{b\}$

d)

$\text{Not } ((\text{Exists } r. E)(a)) \rightarrow \text{NNF} : (\text{Forall } r. \text{ not } E)(a)$

$$A_0 = \{A(a), (\text{Forall } r. \text{ not } E)(a)\}$$

$$C\_GCI = (\text{not } A \text{ union } B \text{ union } C) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \text{ union exists } r. D) \text{ and } (\text{not } C \text{ union forall } r. \text{ not } D) \text{ and } (\text{not } A \text{ union forall } r. E) \text{ and } (\text{not } (D \text{ and } E) \text{ union not } B)$$

NNF:  $\text{not } (D \text{ and } E) \rightarrow \text{not } D \text{ union not } E$

$$C\_GCI = (\text{not } A \text{ union } B \text{ union } C) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \text{ union exists } r. D) \text{ and } (\text{not } C \text{ union forall } r. \text{ not } D) \text{ and } (\text{not } A \text{ union forall } r. E) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ union not } E \text{ union not } B)$$

$$(C\_GCI\text{-rule}) A_1 = A_0 \text{ union } \{((\text{not } A \text{ union } B \text{ union } C) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \text{ union exists } r. D) \text{ and } (\text{not } C \text{ union forall } r. \text{ not } D) \text{ and } (\text{not } A \text{ union forall } r. E) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \text{ union not } E \text{ union not } B))(a)\}$$

$$(\text{and-rule}) A_2 = A_1 \text{ union } \{(\text{not } A \text{ union } B \text{ union } C)(a), (\text{not } B \text{ union exists } r. D)(a), (\text{not } C \text{ union forall } r. \text{ not } D)(a), (\text{not } A \text{ union forall } r. E)(a), (\text{not } D \text{ union not } E \text{ union not } B)(a)\}$$

(or-rule)  $A_3 = A_2 \cup \{\text{not } A(a)\}$  - CLASH

$A_4 = A_2 \cup \{B(a)\}$

$A_5 = A_2 \cup \{C(a)\}$

(or-rule)  $A_6 = A_4 \cup \{\text{not } B\}$  - CLASH

$A_7 = A_4 \cup \{\text{exists } r. D\}$

(Exist-rule)  $A_8 = A_7 \cup \{D(x), r(a,x)\}$

(C\_GCI-rule)  $A_9 = A_8 \cup \{((\text{not } A \cup B \cup C) \text{ and } (\text{not } B \cup \text{exists } r. D) \text{ and } (\text{not } C \cup \text{forall } r. \text{not } D) \text{ and } (\text{not } A \cup \text{forall } r. E) \text{ and } (\text{not } D \cup \text{not } E \cup \text{not } B))(x)\}$

(and- rule)  $A_{10} = A_9 \cup \{(\text{not } A \cup B \cup C)(x), (\text{not } B \cup \text{exists } r. D)(x), (\text{not } C \cup \text{forall } r. \text{not } D)(x), (\text{not } A \cup \text{forall } r. E)(x), (\text{not } D \cup \text{not } E \cup \text{not } B)(x)\}$

(Forall- rule)  $A_{11} = A_{10} \cup \{\text{not } E(x)\}$

(or-rule)  $A_{12} = A_{11} \cup \{\text{not } A(a)\}$  - CLASH

$A_{13} = A_{11} \cup \{(\text{forall } r. E)(a)\}$

(forall-rule)  $A_{14} = A_{13} \cup \{E(x)\}$  - CLASH

(or-rule)  $A_{15} = A_5 \cup \{\text{not } C(a)\}$  - CLASH

$A_{16} = A_5 \cup \{(\text{forall } r. \text{not } D)(a)\}$

(or-rule)  $A_{17} = A_{16} \cup \{\text{not } B(a)\}$  ---> open and complete

$A_{18} = A_{16} \cup \{(\text{exist } r. D)(a)\}$

Tableau algorithm return True, and this means that  $(\text{Exist } r. E)(a)$  is false, it is not entailed by KB