Header

Voting Methods Working Group (VMWG), NIST Interoperability Working Group	
Modeling Subgroup for Voting Method Tabulation Methods 07/27	/2018 DRAFT
Authors: H. Deutsch, George Gilbert et. al (wtih contributions from the members)	
Lauren Lochridge, John Wack, Philip Stark, Editors	
DRAFT NIST SP 1500-10X Voting Methods , Section 3.1.3 Tabulation Methods	
The tabs in	
this	
spreadsheet	
define the	
Test	
Conditions	
and Expected	
Outcomes	
for each	
named	
Tabulation	
Method.	
Tabulation Method tests and outcomes specification do not include the election conte	st decision rules, by design.
For tests and outcomes specification of election tests and contest outcomes, see the s	preadsheet corresponding to Section 3.1.4 Voting Methods .

NIST Interoperability 2018-07-28

Plurality_NofM (aka Regular Contests)	Exan	nple 1	Exan	nple 2	Exan	nple 3	Exar	nple 4	Exan	nple 5	Exan	nple 6
·	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated
Contest A (vf 1) (1 of 4)												
Candidate 1	Х	1			Х				Х			
Candidate 2									Х			
Candidate 3			Х		Х				Х			
Candidate 4			Х		Х				Х			
overvote				1 (=vf)		1 (=vf)				1 (=vf)		
undervote								1 (vf-#sel)				
Total		1		1		1		1		1		
rule	any 1	# sel = vf	any 2	# sel > vf	any 3	# sel > vf	none	# sel < vf	all	# sel > vf		
Contest B (VF 2) (2 of 5)												
Candidate 5	Х	1			Х				х			
Candidate 6			Х		Х				х		Х	1
Candidate 7			Х						Х			
Candidate 8	Х	1			Х				Х			
Candidate 9			Х		Х				Х			
Candidate 10												
overvote				2 (=vf)		2 (=vf)				2 (=vf)		
undervote								2 (vf-#sel)				1
Total		2		2		2		2		2		2
rule	any 2	# sel = vf	any 3	# sel > vf	any 4	# sel > vf	none	# sel < vf	all	# sel > vf	any 1	# sel < vf

Example 1			ection with																
Example 2	Straight	Party sele	ection with	selection t	or other	candidate	when pa	rty has a f	ull slate. I	No differe	ence inclu	sive & exc	clusive.						
Example 3	Straight	Party sele	ection with	selection t	or other	candidate	when pa	rty has an	incomple	ete slate.	Inclusive	& exclusi	ve differ	ent in vf>	1.				
Example 4	Straight	Party sele	ection with	contest se	lection in	same pai	rty. Inclus	ive & excl	usive diff	erent in v	/f>1.								
Example 5	Straight	Party ove	rvoted. Co	ntests Tab	ulated re	gularly ex	cept in In	diana.											
Example 6	No Strai	ght Party.	Contests	use regula	r tabulatio	on													
Contest		Example	1		Example 2	2		Example 3	3		Example 4	4		Exa	mple 5		E	xample 6	
	Choices	Incl Tab	Excl Tab	Choices	Incl Tab	Excl Tab	Choices	Incl Tab	Excl Tab	Choices	Incl Tab	Excl Tab	Choices	Incl Tab	Excl Tab	IN Tab	Choices	Incl Tab	Excl Ta
Straight Party																			
Selection																			
Republican	х	1	1	х	1	1													
Democratic										х	1	1	х						
Libertarian							х	1	1				х						
overvote														1	1	1			
undervote																		1	1
Total		1	1		1	1		1	1			1		1	1	1		1	
rule	any 1						inc slate						ovrvt				No str pty		
Contest A (vf 1)	Ī			Ī															
(1 of 4)																			
Candidate 1 (Rep)		1 (pv=R)	1 (pv=R)														х	1	
Candidate 2 (Dem)							х	1	1	х	1	1	х	1	1				
Candidate 3 (Lib)				х	1	1													
Candidate 4 (Non)																			
overvote																1 (=vf)			
undervote																			
Total		1	1		1	1		1	1		1	1		1	1			1	
rule	sp sel			dir sel									reg tab				reg tab		
Contest B (VF 3)	Ì			İ			İ			İ							İ		
(3 of 8)																			
Candidate 5 (Rep)		1 (pv=R)	1 (pv=R)										х	1	1				
Candidate 6 (Rep)			1 (pv=R)														х	1	
Candidate 7 (Rep)		1 (pv=R)	1 (pv=R)				х	1	1				х	1	1				
Candidate 8 (Dem)	1										1 (pv=D)						х	1	
Candidate 9 (Dem)	1			х	1	1				х	1	1							
Candidate 10											1 (pv=D)	-							
(Dem)											′								
Candidate 11 (Lib)								1 (pv=L)											
Candidate 12							х	1	1								х	1	
(Non)																			
overvote																3(=vf)			
undervote					2	2			1			2		1	1				
Total		3	3		3	3		3	3		3	3		3	3	3		3	

Example 1	Straight	Party sele	ction with	no other s	elections	- No diffe	rence incl	usive & e	xclusive										
Example 2	Straight	Party sele	ction with	selection f	or other	candidate	when par	ty has a f	ull slate. I	No differe	nce inclu	sive & exc	lusive.						
Example 3	Straight	Party sele	ction with	selection f	or other	candidate	when par	ty has an	incomple	ete slate.	Inclusive	& exclusi	ve differe	ent in vf>:	l.				
Example 4	Straight	Party sele	ction with	contest se	lection in	same pai	rty. Inclusi	ve & exc	usive diff	erent in v	rf>1.								
Example 5	Straight	Party ove	rvoted. Co	ntests Tab	ulated re	gularly ex	cept in In	diana.											
Example 6	No Strai	ght Party.	Contests (use regular	tabulation	on													
Contest		Example	1	E	xample 2	1	I	Example 3	3		Example 4	1		Exa	mple 5		E	xample 6	
	Choices	Incl Tab	Excl Tab	Choices	Incl Tab	Excl Tab	Choices	Incl Tab	Excl Tab	Choices	Incl Tab	Excl Tab	Choices	Incl Tab	Excl Tab	IN Tab	Choices	Incl Tab	Excl Tab
rule	none		# sel = vf				pty cross			same pty	incl	excl	reg tab			IN SP ov	reg tab		
													Š						

Example 1	Standard Open Primary ballot voted as a Republican. (No Party Preference contest)
Example 2	Open Primary ballot with unvoted Party Preference contests voted as a Democratic.
Example 3	Open Primary ballot with Party Preference contest voted as Nonpartisan.
Example 4	Same as Example 1 with extra dem vote (crossover) No Party Preference contest.
Example 5	Same as Example 4 with unvoted Party Preference Contest
Example 6	Same as Example 4 with Rep voted in Party Preference Contest
Example 7	Same as Example 4 with overvoted Party Preference Contest

Ballot Statistic	Rep	ublican	Dem	ocratic	Nonp	artisan	NonParti	san (xover)	NonParti	san (xover)	Rep	ublican	NonPartis	san (xover)
Contest		mple 1	Exai	nple 2		mple 3		mple 4		mple 5		mple 6		nple 7
								Tabulated						Tabulated
Party	N/A						N/A							
Preference														
Selection														
Republican											х	1	х	
Democratic													Х	
Libertarian														
overvote														1
undervote				1		1				1				
Total				1						1		1		1
rule	N/A		std		std		N/A		std		std		ov	
Contest A - REP														
(vf 1) (1 of 4)														
Candidate 1	х	1					х		Х		Х	1	Х	
Candidate 2														
Candidate 3														
overvote														
undervote														
Total		1										1		
rule	std						xover		xover		PP		xover	
Contest B - REP														
(VF 3) (3 of 8)														
Candidate 4	Х	1					Х		Х		Х	1	Х	

Example 1	Standard Open Primary ballot voted as a Republican. (No Party Preference contest)
Example 2	Open Primary ballot with unvoted Party Preference contests voted as a Democratic.
Example 3	Open Primary ballot with Party Preference contest voted as Nonpartisan.
Example 4	Same as Example 1 with extra dem vote (crossover) No Party Preference contest.
Example 5	Same as Example 4 with unvoted Party Preference Contest
Example 6	Same as Example 4 with Rep voted in Party Preference Contest
Example 7	Same as Example 4 with overvoted Party Preference Contest

Ballot Statistic	Repu	ublican	Dem	ocratic	Nonp	artisan	NonParti	san (xover)	NonParti	san (xover)	Repu	ublican	NonPartis	san (xover)
Contest	Exar	mple 1	Exar	nple 2	Exar	nple 3	Exar	nple 4	Exar	mple 5	Exar	nple 6	Exan	nple 7
	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated
Candidate 5														
Candidate 6	х	1					х		Х		х	1	Х	
Candidate 7														
Candidate 8														
Candidate 9	Х	1					х		х		Х	1	Х	
Candidate 10														
Candidate 11														
overvote														
undervote														
Total		3										3		
rule	std						xover		xover		PP		xover	
Contest C -														
DEM (vf 1)														
(1 of 4)														
Candidate 12														
Candidate 13			Х	1			Х		Х		Х		Х	
Candidate 14														
overvote														
undervote														
Total				1										
rule			std				xover				PP			

Example 1	Standard Open Primary ballot voted as a Republican. (No Party Preference contest)
Example 2	Open Primary ballot with unvoted Party Preference contests voted as a Democratic.
Example 3	Open Primary ballot with Party Preference contest voted as Nonpartisan.
Example 4	Same as Example 1 with extra dem vote (crossover) No Party Preference contest.
Example 5	Same as Example 4 with unvoted Party Preference Contest
Example 6	Same as Example 4 with Rep voted in Party Preference Contest
Example 7	Same as Example 4 with overvoted Party Preference Contest
-	

Ballot Statistic	Repu	ublican	Dem	ocratic	Nong	artisan	NonParti	san (xover)	NonParti	san (xover)	Repi	ublican	NonPartis	an (xover)
Contest		mple 1		nple 2		mple 3		nple 4		mple 5		nple 6		nple 7
		Tabulated												
Contest D -														
DEM (VF 3)														
(3 of 8)														
Candidate 15														
Candidate 16														
Candidate 17														
Candidate 8			х	1										
Candidate 9														
Candidate 10			х	1										
Candidate 11														
Candidate 12														
overvote														
undervote				1										
Total				3										
rule			std											
Contest F -	Ī								İ					
NON														
Referendum														
For	х	1	х	1	х	1	х	1	х	1	х	1	Х	1
Against														
overvote														
undervote														
Total		1		1		1		1		1		1		1

std

rule

std

std

Example 1	Standard Open Pr	mary ballot voted as	a Republican. (No Pa	arty Preference conte	est)		
Example 2	Open Primary ball	ot with unvoted Party	Preference contests	voted as a Democra	tic.		
Example 3	Open Primary ball	ot with Party Prefere	nce contest voted as	Nonpartisan.			
Example 4	Same as Example	1 with extra dem vote	(crossover) No Part	y Preference contest	t.		
Example 5	Same as Example	4 with unvoted Party	Preference Contest				
Example 6	Same as Example	4 with Rep voted in Pa	arty Preference Cont	est			
Example 7	Same as Example	4 with overvoted Part	y Preference Contes	t			
Ballot Statistic	Republican	Democratic	Nonpartisan	NonPartisan (xover)	NonPartisan (xover)	Republican	NonPartisan (xover)
Contest	Example 1	Example 2	Example 3	Example 4	Example 5	Example 6	Example 7
	Choices Tabulate	d Choices Tabulated	Choices Tabulated	Choices Tabulated	Choices Tabulated	Choices Tabulated	Choices Tabulated

std

std

std

std

Example 1	No select	ion in Reca	ll Controlli	ng contest	with votes	s in the con	trolled cor	ntest				
Example 2	Selection	in Controll	ing contes	t with no se	election in	controlled	contest					
Example 3	Normal v	ote pattern	. Selectio	ns in both c	ontests							
Example 4	Controllin	g contest o	overvoted	with votes	in controll	ed contest						
	_		_		_		_		_		_	
Contests		nple 1		nple 2		nple 3		nple 4		nple 5		nple 6
	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated
Recall Control												
For Recall			Х	1	Х				Х			
Against Recall					Х				Х			
overvote						1 (vf-#sel)				1 (=vf)		
undervote		1 (vf-#sel)										
Total		1		1		1		1		1		
rule	unvoted	# sel = vf										
Linked												
Contest (VF												
2)						1						
Candidate 5	Х				Х	1			Х			
Candidate 6									X		Х	1
Candidate 7					.,	1			X			
Candidate 8	Х				Х	1			Х	2 (-, 4)		
overvote								2 / 4 #!\		2 (=vf)		1
undervote				2				2 (vf-#sel)				1
Total	. 1:			2		2		2		2		2
rule	not elig	No tab	uv	# sel > vf	not elig		none	# sel < vf	all	# sel > vf	any 1	# sel < vf

Example 1	Pres vote	for Cand B	. Only Can	d B Delega	ites voted.	Male Dele	egates fully	/ voted. Or	nly 2 Fema	le Delegate	es voted ca	using unde	rvote.	
Example 2	Pres vote	for Cand A	. Only Can	d A Delega	ates consid	ered. B3 8	k Uncom1	Male and [01 Female	Delegates i	ignored cau	using unde	rvotes	
Example 3			mitted. On ates causin			egates con	isidered. A	ll 3 B Male	Delegates	s ignored ca	ausing und	ervotes. O	nly 2 Fema	ale
Example 4	Pres. Sele	ction over	oted. No	delegate v	ote will be	counted. I	Both Male	& Female	Delegates	fully under	voted.			
Example 5	No vote fo	or Pres. Sel	ection. No	delegate	vote will be	e counted.	Both Mal	e & Female	Delegates	fully unde	rvoted.			
Example 6	Pres vote	for cand B	. Male dele	egate, eve	n though a	ll cand B, it	is overvo	ted. Femal	e delegate	counted si	ince all can	d B		
Example 7	Pres vote	for Cand A	. Only Can	d A Delega	ates consid	ered. Ever	n though N	1ale Delega	ate overvo	ted, extra v	ote is igno	red since C	and B.	
Contests	Exam	ple 1	Exam	ple 2	Exam	nple 3	Exan	nple 4	Exan	nple 5	Exam	nple 6	Exam	ple 7
			Choices					Tabulated		Tabulated		Tabulated		Tabulated
Party 1 Presidential Selection														
Candidate A			Х	1			Х						Х	1
Candidate B	Х	1									Х	1		
Candidate C														
Candidate D														
Uncommitted					Х	1	Х							
overvote								1						
undervote										1				
Total		1		1		1		1		1		1		1
rule	Any 1 ok		Any 1 ok		Any 1 ok		ov		uv		any 1 ok		Any 1 ok	
Delegate Cong nn Male (vf 3)														
Candidate A1													Х	1
Candidate A2			Х	1			х		Х					
Candidate A3							х		х				х	1
Candidate A4							х		х				х	1
Candidate B1	Х	1			Х						х			
Candidate B2					х						Х			
Candidate B3	Х	1	Х		Х						х		х	
Candidate B4											х			
Candidate B5	Х	1												
Candidate C1														

Candidate C2

Candidate C3					1									
Candidate			х											
UnCom1														
Candidate														
UnCom1														
overvote												3		
undervote				2		3		3		3				
Total		3		3		3		3		3		3		3
rule	All B can		only A can		no Uncom	1	no pres		no pres		ov		only A can	
Delegate Cong nn														
Female (vf 3)														
Candidate A1							Х		Х		Х	1	х	1
Candidate A2			х	1			х		х		Х	1	Х	1
Candidate A3			х	1			х		Х		Х	1	Х	1
Candidate B1	х	1												
Candidate B2	х	1												
Candidate B3														
Candidate C1														
Candidate C2														
Candidate C3														
Candidate D1			Х											
Candidate D2														
Candidate D3														
Candidate D4														
Candidate					х	1								
UnCom1														
Candidate					х	1								
UnCom1														
overvote										2				
undervote		1		1		1		3		3		_		
Total		3		3		3		3		3		3		3
rule	1 uv B		only A can		2 sel		no pres		no pres		normal		normal	

Ballot selection designated all allowed votes to one candidate.

Example 1	Single ballot selection credits all allowed votes to selected candidate.														
Example 2	Selection of 2 candiates credits half of allowed votes to each candidate. (may be fractional)														
Example 3	Selection of 3 candidates credits 1/3 of allowed votes to each candidate. (may be fractional)														
Example 4	Selection of 4 candidates credits 1/4 of allowed votes to each candidate. (may be fractional)														
Example 5	Selection of a number of candidates equal+B5 to allowed votes credits 1 vote to each candidate.														
Example 6	Selection of more candidates than allowed creates an overvote as with any other contest.														
Example 7	Selection of no candidate fully undervotes the contest and is the only way an undervote can be created.														

Contest	Exar	nple 1	Exa	mple 2	Exa	mple 3	Exa	mple 4	Ex	ample 5	Exar	nple 6	Exai	mple 7
Proportional	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated
Contest														
(vote for 5)														
Candidate 1	X	5			х	1 & 2/3			х	1				
Candidate 2							х	1 & 1/4	х	1	х			
Candidate 3			х	2 & 1/2	х	1 & 2/3			х	1	х			
Candidate 4							х	1 & 1/4			х			
Candidate 5														
Candidate 6							х	1 & 1/4			х			
Candidate 7							х	1 & 1/4	х	1	х			
Candidate 8			х	2 & 1/2	х	1 & 2/3			Х	1	х			
overvote												5 (=vf)		
undervote														5
Total		5		5		5		5		5		5		5
rule	any 1	All votes	any 2	ea = 1/2 vf	any 3	ea = 1/3 vf	any 4	ea = 1/4 vf	any 5	each = 1/5 vf	ov		uv	

Example 2	Ballot selection split all allowed votes between 2 candidates, 3 to one and 2 to the other. (always whole number of votes)													
Example 3	Ballot selection split all allowed votes between 3 candidates, 2 each with 2 votes and a third with 1 vote. (always whole number of votes)													
Example 4	Ballot selection split all allowed votes between 4 candidates, 3 each with 1 vote and a third with 2 votes. (always whole number of votes)													
Example 5	Ballot selection split all allowed votes between 5 candidates, each with 1 vote. (voted like a regular contest)													
Example 6	The total vote allocation to the selected candidates exceeds the votes allowed. (4 votes to 1 candidate and 2 to a second candidate exceeds the 5 allowed votes)													
Example 7	Selection of no candidate fully undervotes the contest.													
Example 8	Ballot selection split all allowed votes between 2 candidates, 4 to one and 1 to the other, a variation of example 2. (illustrates the ability to determine the desired number of votes to allocate													
Example 9														

Contest	Exai	mple 1	Exai	mple 2	Example 3		Example 4		Exa	ample 5	Exar	nple 6	Example 7		Example 8		Exan	nple 9
Cumulative	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated
Contest (vote for 5)																		
Candidate 1	5	5			2	2			1	1								
Candidate 2					1	1	1	1	1	1	4							
Candidate 3			2	2					1	1					1	1	1	1
Candidate 4					2	2	1	1										
Candidate 5										·	2						·	
Candidate 6							1	1										

Candidate 7							2	2	1	1								
Candidate 8			3	3					1	1					4	4	2	2
overvote												5 (=vf)						
undervote														5				2
Total		5				5		5		5		5		5		5		5
rule	All to 1	as voted	Split 2can	as voted	split 3car	as voted	splt 4 can	as voted	splt 5can	# sel > vf	ov		full uv		large split	as voted	partial uv	·

Ballot Description	Ballot contains a full group, 2 incomplete groups, candidates running out outside a group and write-ins. This illustrates the different ballot conditions that may be encountered although not all actual ballots have multiple groups. Tabulation of group selects is optional and is not included in total contests votes. It is shown in the table as an "o" to indicate recognition but not necessarily results tabulation. Note that any group selection is equivalent to selecting all candidates in the group inidvidually.												
Example 1	Selection of a full group only. All candidates in the group receive a vote.												
Example 2	Selection of an incomplete group plus additional individual candidates for fill the available votes. The additional candidates may not be in a group, may be a write-in or even in another group.												
Example 3	Selection of a full group and an additional candidate. The additional candidate creates an overvote when added to the candidates selected by the group select.												
Example 4	Selection of a group plus selection of some of the individual candidates within the group. The individual selections are inconsequention as all group candidates are always selected by the group selection.												
Example 5	Selection of an incomplete group only that shows undervote tabulation.												
Example 6	Selection of individual candidates without any group selections.												
Example 7	Selection of 2 groups that result in an overvote												
Example 8	Selection of 2 groups that do not result in an overvote												

Contest		nple 1		nple 2		mple 3		nple 4		nple 5		nple 6		mple 7		ple 8
	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated	Choices	Tabulated
Town Committee (vote for 15)																
Group A Select	Х	0			х		х	0					х			
Candidate 1-GA		1						1								
Candidate 2-GA		1						1			х	1				
Candidate 3-GA		1					х	1								
Candidate 4-GA		1					х	1								
Candidate 5-GA		1					х	1								
Candidate 6-GA		1						1								
Candidate 7-GA		1						1			х	1				
Candidate 8-GA		1						1								
Candidate 9-GA		1	х	1			х	1			х	1				
Candidate 10-GA		1					х	1			х	1				
Candidate 11-GA		1					х	1			х	1				
Candidate 12-GA		1					х	1								
Candidate 13-GA		1						1								
Candidate 14-GA		1						1			х	1				
Candidate 15-GA		1						1								
Group B Select			х	0					х	0					х	0
Candidate 1-GB				1						1	х	1				1
Candidate 2-GB				1						1						1
Candidate 3-GB				1	Х					1	х	1				1

I			1		1	1					
Candidate 4-GB			1			1	Х	1			1
Candidate 5-GB			1			1	Х	1			1
Candidate 6-GB			1			1					1
Candidate 7-GB			1			1					1
Candidate 8-GB			1			1	х	1			1
Candidate 9-GB			1			1					1
Candidate 10-GB			1			1					1
Candidate 11-GB			1			1	х	1			1
Candidate 12-GB			1			1					1
Group C Select									х	Х	0
Candidate 1-GC											1
Candidate 2-GC		х	1				х	1			1
Candidate 3-GC											1
Ungrouped Cand											
Candidate 1-											
UnGr											
Candidate 2-		Х	1				х				
UnGr								1			
Candidate 3-											
UnGr											
Candidate 4-							х				
UnGr								1			
Candidate 5-											
UnGr											
Candidate 6-											
UnGr											
Write-in 1		Х	1								
Write-in 2											
Write-in 3											
Write-in 4											
Write-in 5											
Write-in 6											
Write-in 7											
Write-in 8											
Write-in 9										 	
Write-in 10											
Write-in 11											
Write-in 12											
Write-in 13											
Write-in 14											
Write-in 15											

overvote						15								15		
undervote										3		1				
Total		15		15		15		15		15		15		15		15
rule	vt grp		grp + ind		grp+ov		GrpA+CA		Inc grp		Ind sel		ov grp		vt 2 grps	