|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Item #** | **Type** | **Page #** | **Line #** | **Section** | **Comment (with rationale)** | **Suggested Change** |
| 1 | G | v | Last sentence | **Acknowledgements** | Many of the contributors mentioned in Volume 1 never participated in meetings or conversations about Version 2—on occasion even when I reached out to them directly. The portal has been down for a year or so and for a good portion of the time devoted to Version 2. The definitions subgroup has not meet regularly for discussion of the work. Wo Chang only mentioned last week that Versions 1 and 2 were to be combined so that the contributions of those involved in Version 1 would added to Version 2 and some new contributions were added making it seem that more collaborated than did. The search function has been broken for years making it difficult to track comments and progress of the document. The specific instructions on how to submit comments has changed many times making it difficult to participate. | Insert “in part” before collaborative |
| 2 | G | 1 |  | Introduction, 1.1 Background last sentence | Insert after “out of reach”. It is not only the potential answers but the resulting financial and revenues that those answers will generate.  The value proposition the reader needs to consider is the value of the answers to which questions and in what context. | “and that holds the potential to generate vast revenues” |
| 3 | G | 4 |  | 1.5 Future Work on this Volume | For the 1500 Series to be credible and intelligible in addition to being aspirational, and it light of the recent release of the Draft NIST Special Publication 800-53 Revision 5, Security and Privacy Controls for Information Systems and Organizations along with related Risk Management guidance that makes it clear that “individuals” are a large component of Security and Privacy, it must be possible to address and locate ”individuals or data subjects ”in the definitions volume, the security and privacy volume and the reference architecture volume. | insert after metrics; “the place, safeguarding and definition of individuals or data subjects (including in light of NIST.SP.800-53r5.pdf)” |
| 4 | G | 4 |  | 1.5 Future Work on this Volume | Since both vast data and revenues are possible for the 1500 Series to be credible and intelligible in addition to being aspirational, | Insert “discuss data ownership and valuation |
| 5 | G | 4 |  | 1.5 Future Work on this Volume | While agnosticism is mentioned in the working group charter it is not clear why this agnosticism is a desirable goal | “Further identify and clarify the goal of technology-, infrastructure-, and vendor- agnosticism where system and data subject or individual anonymity has not been achieved.” |
| 6 | G |  |  | 1.5 Future Work on this Volume | Interoperability itself poses a risk to privacy, security | Insert”Address the risk of interoperability without proper api controls.” |
| 7 | G |  |  | 1.5 Future Work on this Volume | Governance has been impacted by big data | Insert ”And the movement of democratic governance from government to technologies of internet governance.1  1. DeNardis, Laura. The Global War for Internet Governance (p. 1). Yale University Press. Kindle Edition” |
| 8 | G |  |  | 1.5 Future Work on this Volume | See the work in NIST.SP.800-53r5.pdf and elsewhere | Define information systems. |
| 9 | G |  |  | 1.5 Future Work on this Volume | Many concerns including the reality of system errors, biases, discriminations and gaming. | Insert “We are not ready to cut the democratic human judgement out of the system design” |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |