

On the Number of Groups of a Given Order

M. RAM MURTY*

*Department of Mathematics, McGill University,
805 Sherbrooke St. West, Montreal, Quebec H3A 2K6, Canada*

AND

V. KUMAR MURTY

*Department of Mathematics, Harvard University,
Cambridge, Massachusetts 02138*

Communicated by H. Stark

Received February 17, 1981

Letting $G(n)$ denote the number of nonisomorphic groups of order n , it is shown that for square-free n , $G(n) \leq \phi(n)$ and $G(n) \leq (\log n)^c$ on a set of positive density. Letting $F_k(x)$ denote the number of $n \leq x$ for which $G(n) = k$, it is shown that $F_2(x) = O(x(\log_4 x)/(\log_3 x)^2)$, where $\log_r x$ denotes the r -fold iterated logarithm.

1. INTRODUCTION

Let $G(n)$ denote the number of nonisomorphic groups of order n . Gallagher [2] has shown that

$$\log G(n) \ll n^{2/3}(\log n)^2.$$

The problem of obtaining sharp estimates, in general, seems to be very difficult. Sims [5] has conjectured that

$$\log G(n) \ll (\log n)^3, \quad (1.1)$$

and has shown that (1.1) is true if we restrict our attention to solvable groups of order n . We shall show that for square-free n ,

$$G(n) \leq \phi(n),$$

* Supported in part by NSF Grant MCS 77-18723 A03

where φ is Euler's totient function, using the well-known fact that groups of square-free order are supersolvable. Moreover, we show that for n belonging to a set of positive density,

$$G(n) \leq (\log n)^c,$$

is true.

The distribution of the values of $G(n)$ is a more intricate question. Let $F_k(x)$ denote the number of $n \leq x$ for which $G(n) = k$. Erdős [1] showed that

$$F_1(x) = \frac{(1 + o(1)) xe^{-\gamma}}{\log_3 x},$$

where γ is Euler's constant and $\log_r x = \log(\log_{r-1} x)$, $\log_1 x = \log x$. We shall show that

$$F_2(x) = O\left(\frac{x \log_4 x}{(\log_3 x)^2}\right).$$

2. GROUPS OF SQUARE-FREE ORDER

We now derive a bound for $G(n)$, when n is square-free. We refer to a group and its isomorphism class interchangeably.

THEOREM 2.1. *Let n be square-free. Then,*

$$G(n) \leq \prod_{p \mid n} (p - 1, n),$$

where (a, b) denotes the greatest common divisor of a and b .

Proof. Let q be the largest prime divisor of n , and G a group of order n . Since G is supersolvable, we have by [4, 7.2.19] that the q -Sylow subgroup S (say) is normal and G is a semidirect product of a group H of order (n/q) and S . Thus, an upper bound for $G(n)$, is obtained by counting the number of homomorphisms $\theta: H \rightarrow \text{Aut}(S)$. For each prime $p \mid n$, choose a p -Sylow subgroup of H and let x_p be a generator of this p -Sylow subgroup. As H is generated by these Sylow subgroups, θ is determined by the $\theta(x_p)$. Since $\text{Aut}(S)$ is cyclic of order $(q - 1)$, and $\theta(x_p)^p = 1$, the number of solutions for $\theta(x_p)$ is $(q - 1, p)$. Therefore, there are at most

$$\prod_{p \mid (n/q)} (q - 1, p) = \prod_{p \mid n} (q - 1, p)$$

possibilities for θ . As there are $G(n/q)$ possibilities for H , we obtain

$$G(n) \leq G\left(\frac{n}{q}\right) \prod_{p|n} (q-1, p) = G\left(\frac{n}{q}\right) (q-1, n)$$

and the result of the theorem follows by induction.

COROLLARY 2.2. *For square-free n ,*

$$G(n) \leq \varphi(n).$$

This theorem allows us to deduce that there are very “few” groups of square-free order. More precisely, Higman [3] and Sims [5] have shown that,

$$G(2^n) \geq 2^{cn^3},$$

for some constant $c > 0$. Therefore, if $t = \lceil \log x / \log 2 \rceil$, then,

$$\sum_{n \leq x} G(n) \geq G(2^t) \geq 2^{ct^3} \geq x^{c_1(\log x)^2},$$

for some constant $c_1 > 0$. Now by Corollary 2.2,

$$\sum_{n \leq x} \mu^2(n) G(n) \leq \sum_{n \leq x} \varphi(n) = O(x^2),$$

and so we deduce

COROLLARY 2.3. *Groups of square-free order are scarce.*

Let us write,

$$f(n) = \prod_{p|n} p^{v_p(n)},$$

where $v_p(n)$ is the number of primes $q | n$, with $q \equiv 1 \pmod{p}$. Then, for n square-free,

$$f(n) = \prod_{p|n} (p-1, n).$$

In the next sections, we shall determine the average orders of $\log f(n)$ and $\log^2 f(n)$. This will allow us to deduce that for n belonging to a set of positive density,

$$G(n) \ll (\log n)^2.$$

3. THE AVERAGE ORDER OF $\log f(n)$

We need some preliminary lemmas.

LEMMA 3.1. *Let p be a prime. Then*

$$\sum_{\substack{q < z \\ q \equiv 1(p)}} \frac{1}{q} = \frac{\log \log z}{p-1} + O(1),$$

where the constant implied is absolute. If furthermore, $p < (\log z)^c$ (where c is an arbitrary constant) then

$$\sum_{\substack{q < z \\ q \equiv 1(p)}} \frac{1}{q} = \frac{\log \log z}{p-1} + O\left(\frac{\log p}{p}\right).$$

Proof. The result follows easily from the Siegel–Walfisz theorem and partial summation, and the Brun–Titchmarsh theorem.

LEMMA 3.2. *Let p be a prime. Then,*

$$\sum_{\substack{q < z \\ q \equiv 1(p)}} \frac{1}{q} \leq \frac{C \log \log z}{p-1} + O\left(\frac{\log p}{p}\right),$$

where C is an absolute constant.

Proof. See Erdős [1, p. 76].

THEOREM 3.3.

$$\sum_{n \leq x} \log f(n) = cx \log \log x + O(x \log_3 x),$$

where $c = \sum_p \log p / p(p-1)$.

Proof.

$$\sum_{n \leq x} \log f(n) = \sum_{p \leq x} (\log p) T_p(x) = \Sigma_1 + \Sigma_2 + \Sigma_3 \quad (\text{say}),$$

where $T_p(x) = \sum_{n \leq x, p \mid n} v_p(n) = \sum_{q \leq (x/p), q \equiv 1(p)} \lfloor x/pq \rfloor$, and in Σ_1 , $p < \log_2 x$, in Σ_2 , $(\log_2 x) < p < \log x$, and in Σ_3 , $p > \log x$. Trivially,

$$T_p(x) \leq \sum_{t \leq (x/p^2)} \frac{x}{p(pt+1)} = O\left(\frac{x \log x}{p^2}\right).$$

Therefore,

$$\Sigma_3 = O(x).$$

For $p < \log x$, we note that,

$$\log_2 \frac{x}{p} = \log_2 x + O\left(\frac{\log_2 x}{\log x}\right),$$

So that by Lemma 3.1,

$$T_p(x) = \frac{x \log_2 x}{p(p-1)} + O\left(\frac{x}{p}\right).$$

This gives,

$$\Sigma_1 = cx \log_2 x + O(x \log_3 x),$$

where

$$c = \sum_p \log p / p(p-1).$$

Finally, using Lemma 3.2 in Σ_2 , we see

$$\Sigma_2 \ll \sum_p' x \left(\frac{\log_2 x + \log p}{p} \right) \frac{\log p}{p},$$

where the dash on the sum indicates, $(\log_2 x) < p < \log x$. It is now easily seen that

$$\Sigma_2 = O(x),$$

which completes the proof of the theorem.

4. THE AVERAGE ORDER OF $\log^2 f(n)$

Define

$$T_{p,q}(x) = \sum_{\substack{n \leq x \\ p \mid n \\ q \nmid n}} v_p(n) v_q(n).$$

LEMMA 4.1. *If $p < (\log x)^3$, then*

$$T_{p,p}(x) = \frac{x(\log_2 x)^2}{p(p-1)^2} + T_p(x) + O\left(\frac{x(\log_2 x) \log p}{p^3}\right).$$

Proof. We have, using Lemma 3.2 and the definition of $T_p(x)$, that

$$\begin{aligned} T_{p,p}(x) &= \sum_{\substack{q \equiv 1(p) \\ r \equiv 1(p)}} \left\lfloor \frac{x}{pqr} \right\rfloor - \sum_{\substack{q \equiv 1(p) \\ r \equiv 1(p)}} \left\lfloor \frac{x}{pq^2} \right\rfloor + \sum_{\substack{q \equiv 1(p)}} \left\lfloor \frac{x}{pq} \right\rfloor \\ &= \sum_{\substack{qr < x/p \\ q \equiv 1(p) \\ r \equiv 1(p)}} \frac{x}{pqr} + T_p(x) + O\left(\frac{x \log_2 x}{p^3}\right). \end{aligned}$$

Now, as

$$\left(\sum_{\substack{q < \sqrt{x/p} \\ q \equiv 1(p)}} \frac{1}{q} \right)^2 \leq \sum_{\substack{qr < x/p \\ r \equiv 1(p)}} \frac{1}{qr} \leq \left(\sum_{\substack{q < \sqrt{x/p} \\ q \equiv 1(p)}} \frac{1}{q} \right)^2,$$

we get

$$\begin{aligned} T_{p,p}(x) &= \frac{x}{p} \cdot \frac{(\log_2(x/p))^2}{(p-1)^2} + T_p(x) + O\left(\frac{x(\log_2 x) \log p}{p^3}\right) \\ &= \frac{x(\log_2 x)^2}{p(p-1)^2} + T_p(x) + O\left(\frac{x(\log_2 x) \log p}{p^3}\right), \end{aligned}$$

since $p < (\log x)^3$. This is the desired result.

LEMMA 4.2.

$$\sum_{p \leq x} T_{p,p}(x)(\log p)^2 = c_1 x(\log_2 x)^2 + O(x \log_2 x),$$

where $c_1 = \sum_p (\log p)^2 / p(p-1)^2$.

Proof. We have by Lemma 4.1,

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{p < (\log x)^2} T_{p,p}(x)(\log p)^2 &= x(\log_2 x)^2 \sum_{p < (\log x)^2} \frac{(\log p)^2}{p(p-1)^2} + O(x \log_2 x) \\ &= c_1 x(\log_2 x)^2 + O(x \log_2 x). \end{aligned}$$

Since $v_p(n) \leq \log n / \log p$, we have by a previous estimate,

$$T_{p,p}(x) \leq \sum_{n \leq x} \left(\frac{\log x}{\log p} \right) v_p(n) \leq \left(\frac{\log x}{\log p} \right) T_p(x) \leq \frac{x(\log x)^2}{p^2 \log p}.$$

Hence, as

$$\sum_{p > (\log x)^2} \frac{x(\log x)^2}{p^2(\log p)} (\log p)^2 \ll x(\log x)^2 \sum_{p > (\log x)^2} \frac{\log p}{p^2} \ll x,$$

we get the result of the lemma.

LEMMA 4.3. *If $p \neq q$, then,*

$$T_{p,q}(x) \leq x(\log x)^2/p^2 q \log q.$$

Proof. Since $v_q(n) \leq \log x / \log q$,

$$\begin{aligned} T_{p,q}(x) &\leq \sum_{\substack{n \leq x \\ q \mid n \\ p \nmid n}} \left(\frac{\log x}{\log q} \right) v_p(n) \leq \left(\frac{\log x}{\log q} \right) \sum_{\substack{r \equiv 1(p) \\ r \leq x/pq}} \left[\frac{x}{pqr} \right] \\ &\leq \left(\frac{\log x}{\log q} \right) T_p \left(\frac{x}{q} \right) T_p \left(\frac{x}{q} \right) \leq \frac{x(\log x)^2}{p^2 q \log q}, \end{aligned}$$

as desired.

Now,

$$\sum_{n \leq x} \log^2 f(n) = \sum_{p,q \leq x} T_{p,q}(x)(\log p)(\log q),$$

and by Lemma 4.3,

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{q \leq x} (\log q) \sum_{\substack{x > p > (\log x)^3 \\ p \neq q}} (\log p) T_{p,q}(x) &\leq \sum_{\substack{q \leq x \\ p > (\log x)^3}} (\log p)(\log q) \frac{x(\log x)^2}{p^2 q \log q} \\ &\leq x(\log x)^2 \left(\sum_{q \leq x} \frac{1}{q} \right) \left(\sum_{p > (\log x)^3} \frac{\log p}{p^2} \right) \\ &\ll x. \end{aligned}$$

In order to obtain the average order of $\log^2 f(n)$, we may therefore assume that $p < (\log x)^3$ and $q < (\log x)^3$. We therefore need to evaluate,

$$\sum_{\substack{p < (\log x)^3 \\ q < (\log x)^3 \\ p \neq q}} (\log p)(\log q) T_{p,q}(x).$$

LEMMA 4.4. *If $p \neq q$, $p, q < (\log x)^3$, then,*

$$\begin{aligned} T_{p,q}(x) &= \frac{x(\log_2 x)^2}{pq(p-1)(q-1)} + O\left(\frac{x \log_2 x \log pq}{p^2 q^2}\right) + O\left(\frac{x(\log p)(\log q)}{p^2 q^2}\right) \\ &\quad + v_p(q) O\left(\frac{x \log_2 x}{pq^2}\right) + v_q(p) O\left(\frac{x \log_2 x}{p^2 q}\right). \end{aligned}$$

Remark. Note that the latter two error terms do not appear unless $q \equiv 1 \pmod{p}$ or $p \equiv 1 \pmod{q}$.

Proof. We have if $p \not\equiv 1 \pmod{q}$ or $q \not\equiv 1 \pmod{p}$,

$$T_{p,q}(x) = \sum_{\substack{r \equiv 1 \pmod{p} \\ s \equiv 1 \pmod{q}}} \left[\frac{x}{pq[r,s]} \right].$$

If $q \equiv 1 \pmod{p}$, then,

$$T_{p,q}(x) = \sum_{\substack{r \equiv 1 \pmod{p} \\ s \equiv 1 \pmod{q}}} \left[\frac{x}{pq[r,s]} \right] - \sum_{s \equiv 1 \pmod{q}} \left[\frac{x}{pq^2 s} \right] + \sum_{s \equiv 1 \pmod{q}} \left[\frac{x}{pq s} \right].$$

A similar result holds if $p \equiv 1 \pmod{q}$. In these last two cases, the error is easily estimated to be

$$v_p(q) O\left(\frac{x \log_2 x}{pq^2}\right) + v_q(p) O\left(\frac{x \log_2 x}{p^2 q}\right).$$

The sum,

$$\begin{aligned} & \sum_{\substack{r \equiv 1 \pmod{p} \\ s \equiv 1 \pmod{q}}} \left[\frac{x}{pq[r,s]} \right] \\ &= \sum_{\substack{r \equiv 1 \pmod{p} \\ s \equiv 1 \pmod{q}}} \left[\frac{x}{pqrs} \right] - \sum_{\substack{r \equiv 1 \pmod{pq} \\ s \equiv 1 \pmod{pq}}} \left[\frac{x}{pqr^2} \right] + \sum_{\substack{r \equiv 1 \pmod{pq} \\ s \equiv 1 \pmod{pq}}} \left[\frac{x}{pqr} \right] \\ &= \frac{x}{pq} \sum_{\substack{r \equiv 1 \pmod{p} \\ s \equiv 1 \pmod{q} \\ rs < x/pq}} \frac{1}{rs} + O\left(\sum_{\substack{r \equiv 1 \pmod{p} \\ r < x^{1/2}}} \pi\left(\frac{x}{pqr}, q, 1\right)\right) \\ &\quad + O\left(\sum_{\substack{s \equiv 1 \pmod{q} \\ s < x^{1/2}}} \pi\left(\frac{x}{pq s}, p, 1\right)\right) + O\left(\frac{x \log_2 x}{p^2 q^2}\right). \end{aligned}$$

Using Lemma 3.1 and the Brun–Titchmarsh inequality, this becomes

$$\begin{aligned} & \sum_{\substack{r \equiv 1 \pmod{p} \\ s \equiv 1 \pmod{q}}} \left[\frac{x}{pq[r,s]} \right] \\ &= \frac{x(\log_2 x)^2}{pq(p-1)(q-1)} + O\left(\frac{x(\log_2 x)(\log pq)}{p^2 q^2}\right) + O\left(\frac{x(\log p)(\log q)}{p^2 q^2}\right), \end{aligned}$$

as desired.

We can now prove

THEOREM 4.5.

$$\sum_{n \leq x} \log^2 f(n) = c_2 x (\log_2 x)^2 + O(x \log_2 x),$$

where

$$c_2 = c^2 + \sum_p \frac{(\log p)^2}{p(p-1)^2} \left(1 - \frac{1}{p}\right).$$

Proof. We have, by Lemma 4.2,

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{n \leq x} \log^2 f(n) &= c_1 x (\log_2 x)^2 + \sum_{\substack{p \neq q \\ p, q \leq x}} T_{p,q}(x) (\log p) (\log q) \\ &\quad + O(x \log_2 x). \end{aligned}$$

We have already seen that we need only consider

$$\sum_{\substack{p, q < (\log x)^3 \\ p \neq q}} T_{p,q}(x) (\log p) (\log q).$$

By Lemma 4.4, this is

$$\begin{aligned} &\sum_{\substack{p, q < (\log x)^3 \\ p \neq q}} T_{p,q}(x) (\log p) (\log q) \\ &= \sum_{\substack{p, q < (\log x)^3 \\ p \neq q}} \frac{x (\log_2 x)^2 (\log p) (\log q)}{pq(p-1)(q-1)} + O\left(\sum_{p, q} \frac{x (\log_2 x) (\log p)^2 (\log q)^2}{p^2 q^2}\right) \\ &\quad + O\left(\sum_{p, q} v_p(q) \frac{x (\log_2 x) (\log p) (\log q)}{pq^2}\right) \\ &\quad + O\left(\sum_{p, q} v_q(p) \frac{x (\log_2 x) (\log p) (\log q)}{p^2 q}\right). \end{aligned}$$

The first error term is easily seen to be

$$O(x \log_2 x).$$

The penultimate error term is

$$\begin{aligned} &O\left(\sum_{q \equiv 1 \pmod{p}} \frac{x (\log_2 x) (\log p) (\log q)}{pq^2}\right) \\ &= O\left(\sum_p \sum_{t=1}^{\infty} \frac{x (\log_2 x) (\log p) (\log pt)}{p^3 t^2}\right) \\ &= O(x \log_2 x). \end{aligned}$$

The error term corresponding to $p \equiv 1 \pmod{q}$ is handled similarly. Finally,

$$\sum_{\substack{p,q < (\log x)^3 \\ p \neq q}} \frac{x(\log_2 x)^2 (\log p)(\log q)}{pq(p-1)(q-1)} \\ = \left\{ c^2 - \sum_p \frac{(\log p)^2}{p^2(p-1)^2} + O\left(\frac{1}{(\log x)^3}\right) \right\} x (\log_2 x)^2,$$

which completes the proof.

We deduce

COROLLARY 4.6. *Let*

$$S = \{n \leq x : n \text{ square-free}, G(n) < (\log n)^2\}.$$

Then

$$|S| \geq \frac{2}{3}x.$$

Proof. We see easily that $|S| \geq ((6/\pi^2) - (c_2/4))x$ and a simple computation gives the result.

Remark. The weaker result, $|S| \geq \frac{1}{3}x$ can be deduced from Theorem 3.3.

5. THE CASE $G(n) = 2$

In this section, we shall show that $F_2(x)$ is much smaller than $F_1(x)$. We begin with a group-theoretic lemma.

LEMMA 5.1. *$G(n) = 2$ if and only if*

- (i) $n = 2p$, p prime, or
- (ii) $n = p_1 p_2 m$, $(p_1 m, \varphi(p_1 m)) = 1$, $(p_2 m, \varphi(p_2 m)) = 1$, $p_2 \equiv 1 \pmod{p_1}$, or
- (iii) $n = p^2 m$, $(pm, \varphi(pm)) = 1$, $(p+1, m) = 1$.

Proof. Suppose first $G(n) = 2$. If n is even, then writing $n = 2^a m$, with m odd, we observe that m must be a prime power. For if p and q are distinct primes dividing m we can use the dihedral groups of orders $2p$ and $2q$ to construct two nonabelian groups of order n . This would force $G(n) \geq 3$. Writing then $m = p^b$, we note that $0 < a \leq 2$, $b \leq 2$ as $G(q^3) = 5$ for any prime q . If $a = 2$ clearly $b = 0$, for otherwise we would have two abelian groups of order n and at least one nonabelian group of order n . If $a = 1$ then $b = 1$ as $G(2q) = 2$ for any prime q . So we deduce (i).

Now suppose n is odd. If n is square-free, then it must have exactly one pair of prime divisors (p_1, p_2) such that $p_2 \equiv 1 \pmod{p_1}$. It must have at least one such pair, otherwise $(n, \phi(n)) = 1$ and by a well-known result of Burnside, this implies $G(n) = 1$. Furthermore, it cannot have more than one such pair as $G(pq) = 2$ if $q \equiv 1 \pmod{p}$. This shows that n is of the form (ii).

Finally, if n is odd and not square-free, it must clearly have exactly one squared prime factor as $G(q^2) = 2$. If $n = p^2m$, with m square-free, then $G(n) = 2$ implies all groups of order n are abelian. So by a known result (see Scott [4, p. 217]), (iii) holds.

For the converse, we note that (i) easily gives $G(n) = 2$, and the cited result in Scott [4] shows that (iii) implies all groups of order n are abelian so that $G(n) = 2$, in this case. In case (ii), we have that n is square-free. Any group G of order n must therefore be supersolvable. In particular, it has a subgroup H of order m which, by the congruence conditions, must be cyclic and normal in G . Furthermore, G is the semidirect product of H and a group of order $p_1 p_2$. Since $p_1 p_2 \nmid \phi(m)$, this semidirect product is in fact a direct product, so that $G(n) = G(p_1 p_2) = 2$.

Remark. An alternate proof can be deduced from the proof of Theorem 2.1 and by noting that $(p_1 - 1)$ homomorphisms lead to isomorphic groups.

LEMMA 5.2. *The number of $n \leq x$ satisfying (i) $n = 2p$, p is prime is $O(x/\log x)$.*

Proof. Obvious.

LEMMA 5.3. *Let $p < (\log_2 x)/(\log_3 x)$. Then the number of $n \leq x$, $n \equiv 0 \pmod{p}$ and having no prime divisor $\equiv 1 \pmod{p}$ is $\ll x/p(\log_3 x)^4$.*

Proof. We have by Brun's sieve that for $z = x^{1/2}$

the number of positive integers in question is $\ll x/p \prod_{q \equiv 1 \pmod{p}, q < z} (1 - 1/q) \ll x/p \exp(-(\log_2 z/p - 1) + O(1))$, by Lemma 3.1. As $p < (\log_2 x)/\log_3 x$, this is

$$p \ll x/p(\log_3 x)^4 \quad \text{for any } A > 0.$$

LEMMA 5.4. *The number of $n \leq x$ satisfying (iii) is $o(x/(\log_3 x)^2)$.*

Proof. First suppose $p < (\log_3 x)^3$. Then, the number of $n \leq x$ satisfying (iii) $\ll \sum_{p < (\log_3 x)^3} (x/p)(1/(\log_3 x)^3) = o(x/(\log_3 x)^2)$, by Lemma 5.3. If $p > (\log_3 x)^3$, then the number is at most $\ll \sum_{p > (\log_3 x)^3} x/p^2 \ll x/(\log_3 x)^3$.

We now focus our attention on the integers satisfying (ii). These integers have a distinguished pair (p, q) of prime divisors, with $q \equiv 1 \pmod{p}$. Let us write $A_{pq}(x)$ to be those $n \leq x$ satisfying (ii) divisible by pq , $q \equiv 1 \pmod{p}$.

LEMMA 5.5.

$$\sum_{p > \log x} A_{pq}(x) \ll \frac{x}{\log_2 x}.$$

Proof. Clearly,

$$\sum_{p > \log x} A_{pq}(x) \leq \sum_{p > \log x} \sum_{t=1}^{\lfloor x/p \rfloor} \frac{x}{p(pt+1)} \ll (x \log x) \sum_{p > \log x} \frac{1}{p^2} \ll \frac{x}{\log_2 x},$$

as desired.

LEMMA 5.6.

$$\sum_{p < \log_2 x / \log_3 x} A_{pq}(x) \ll \frac{x}{(\log_3 x)^2}.$$

Proof. The number of $n \leq x/pq$ which are not divisible by any prime $\equiv 1 \pmod{p}$ is $(x/pq) \exp(-(\log_2 x)/(p-1))$, by Brun's sieve. Therefore, summing over p in the stated range gives by Lemma 3.2,

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{p < \log_2 x / \log_3 x} A_{p,q}(x) &\ll \sum_{p < \log_2 x / \log_3 x} \sum_{\substack{q \equiv 1(p) \\ q < x}} \frac{px}{q(\log_2 x)^2} \\ &\ll x / (\log_3 x)^2, \end{aligned}$$

as desired.

LEMMA 5.7. Let $p < (\log_2 x)^{1-\varepsilon}$. Then the number of $n \leq x$, $n \equiv 0 \pmod{p}$, having no prime divisor $\equiv 1 \pmod{p}$ is $o(x/(\log_2 x)^2)$ uniformly in p .

Proof. See Erdős [1, p. 77].

THEOREM 5.8.

$$F_2(x) = O\left(\frac{x \log_4 x}{(\log_3 x)^2}\right).$$

Proof. Lemmas 5.5 and 5.6 show that we can assume

$$\frac{\log_2 x}{\log_3 x} < p < (\log x).$$

Moreover, by Lemma 5.7, we can assume that those integers satisfying (ii) have all their prime factors $> (\log_2 x)^{1-\varepsilon}$. By Brun's sieve, the number of

integers $n \leq x$ divisible by p and having all their prime factors $> (\log_2 x)^{1-\varepsilon}$ is $\ll_{\varepsilon} x/p \log_3 x$. Summing over p in the range,

$$\frac{\log_2 x}{\log_3 x} < p < \log_2 x,$$

we deduce

$$\sum_p' A_{pq}(x) \ll \sum_p' \frac{x}{p \log_3 x} \ll \frac{x \log_4 x}{(\log_3 x)^2},$$

where the dash on the sum indicates p is in the stated range. Here we have used the well-known formula,

$$\sum_{p \leq x} \frac{1}{p} = \log \log x + B + O\left(\frac{1}{\log x}\right).$$

Again, by a sieve argument it is seen that the number of $n \leq x$ divisible by pq and having all the prime factors $> (\log_2 x)^{1-\varepsilon}$ is $\ll_{\varepsilon} (x/pq) \cdot (1/\log_3 x)$. Hence,

$$\sum_{\log_2 x < p < \log_3 x} A_{pq}(x) \ll \sum_{p > \log_2 x} \frac{x \log_2 x}{p^2 \log_3 x} \ll \frac{x}{(\log_3 x)^2}.$$

This completes the proof.

6. CONCLUDING REMARKS

An examination on the proof of the upper bound for $F_2(x)$ reveals that the main contribution is coming from those primes p satisfying

$$(\log_2 x)^{1-\varepsilon} < p < \log_2 x.$$

This should not be the case, though we are unable to show it. Ignoring the primes in this range, our proof can be modified to show

Conjecture 6.1.

$$F_2(x) = \frac{(1+o(1))xe^{-\gamma}}{(\log_3 x)^2}.$$

The corresponding question for $k=3$ is more difficult. An arithmetical description of those n such that $G(n)=k$ becomes more complicated as k increases. One can show (though not easily),

$$F_3(x) = O\left(\frac{x}{\log_3 x}\right).$$

It would be important to have asymptotic formulas for both F_2 and F_3 . In the general case, we conclude by stating the following:

Problem. Determine an asymptotic formula for $F_k(x)$.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We would like to thank Professors P. Erdős and J. Dixon for their useful suggestions.

REFERENCES

1. P. ERDÖS, Some asymptotic formulas in number theory, *J. Indian Math. Soc.* **12** (1948), 75–78.
2. P. GALLAGHER, Counting finite groups of given order, *Math. Z.* **102** (1967), 236–237.
3. G. HIGMAN, Enumerating p -groups, I. Inequalities, *Proc. London Math. Soc.* **10** (1960), 24–30.
4. W. SCOTT, "Group Theory," Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs, N.J., 1964.
5. C. SIMS, Enumerating p -groups, *Proc. London Math. Soc.* **15** (1965), 151–166.