

Reviewer Recommendation and Comments for Manuscript MS_564 titled “In vitro grafting of woody species”.

For use of ‘et al.’, there should be a period placed after ‘al’. Please change throughout entire manuscript.

Line 29: ‘...before application to others’ Please be specific and list the ‘others’.

Line 31: ‘...mostly of trees species’ Please add ‘such as’ and include examples following ‘species’.

Line 37: Suggest deleting ‘initia’.

Line 130(1): Delete extra space after ‘for’ and ‘side-grafting’.

Line 162: Suggest using different term than ‘tiny’.

Line 163: Suggest using different term than ‘bigger ones’.

Line 167: Delete ‘mm’ after ‘8’.

Line 171(3): Change in font size from 11 pnt to 10 pnt.

Line 179: Change in font size from 11 pnt to 10 pnt.

Line 179: Delete extra space after ‘et’.

Line 234: Fully list IUPAC name of each chemical with abbreviation in parenthesis.

Line 234(5) 2, 4 D and 2,4-D are both used. See Previous comment.

Line 234: ‘5 to 7 mm’ is used instead of hyphen. This is an issue throughout the entire manuscript and should be corrected.

Line 262: Onay et al. published another article on Pistacia in 2004. Plant Cell, Tissue and Organ Culture Volume 77, Number 2, 215-219.

Line 288: Pseudotsuga is misspelled.

Line 295: Delete extra space after ‘unsuitable’

Line 306: ‘Senegal’ should be lower case.

Line 307: Define ‘nice’. What does this specifically mean with respect to a graft union?

Line 325: Insert ‘day’ after ‘12th’.

Line 326: Delete extra period at end of sentence.

Line 329: See comment Line 295

Line 330: ‘alond’ is misspelled.

Line 331(2): Again there is a shift in font size.

Line 334: 'spp' should be 'spp.'

Line 334: 'cv' should be 'cvs.'

Line 337: 'sp' should be 'spp.'

Line 340: 'Sodium' should come before 'Diethyldithiocarbamate' and 'Diethyldithiocarbamate' should not be capitalized.

Line 340: 'Polyvinylpyrrolidone' should be lower case not capitalized.

Line 343: Include genus and sp. of cashew if not previously stated.

Line 347: Why mention that peach is excluded in a sentence that states various fruit tree species? This is not a comprehensive list so peach does not need to be listed as an excluded sp.

Line 350: Suggest rewording 'seemed overall less recommendable'.

Line 351: Suggest replacing 'This opinion was shared also...' with 'This was also reported by...'. Articles are not about opinions.

Line 365: Delete extra space following spp.

Line 366: Delete extra comma following citation.

Line 366: Delete 'Practically'.

Line 370: Suggest changing 'grapewine' to 'wine grapes'.

Line 373: Suggest replacing 'The tinier the scion' with 'As the scion size decreases,...'.

Line 377: Delete 'view'.

Line 378: Change 'noticed' with 'reported'.

Line 389: See comment Line 370.

Line 390: 'More generally' and 'more particularly' are used in the same sentence. Suggest deleting both phrases.

Line 391: Delete 'thereby the disinfection' and replace with 'the disinfestation'.

Line 392: "Bigger" as compared to what?

Line 412: Delete extra space after 0. and before 4.

Line 412: Were these similar success rates not significantly different? 52 and 46% have the possibility of being significantly different.

Line 437: Delete ', is in this respect quite demonstrative'.

Line 440: This reference focus is with conifers and should not be used for a broad statement for woody species in general.

Line 440: Delete extra space after citation.

Line 442: Delete extra space after to.

Line 443(4): Reference needed for this statement.

Line 447: Either there is or there isn't a size limitation. There is no 'seem to be' category. What is the relevance of mentioning that 'a lot of species' are smaller than the 100 µm size limitation?

Line 448: Do not use the term 'tinier'.

Line 452(4) Sentence mentions that more proteins and mostly acid were present more in mature morphological type. Why and how does this impact micrografting?

Line 460: Space present between 'J' and '16' which is not the same format as in Line 456, be consistent.

Line 468: 'larch' should be 'European larch'.

Line 472 See previous comment.

Line 473: Do not use the term 'opinion'.

Line 473: Replace 'on' with 'with'.

Line 489: Replace ', then' with 'and'.

Line 491: Citrus is capitalized which is not consistently used, see line 489.

Line 492(3): 'original contaminated so weaker plants' is very confusing. Rewrite.

Line 502: Grafting is misspelled.

Line 608: Reference should be corrected. New Forests 24(3):239-244.